

RBL 02/15/1999

**Smith, Mark S.**  
***The Pilgrimage Pattern in Exodus***

JSOTSup 239

Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1997. Pp. 355, Cloth, \$66.00, ISBN 185075652X.

James W. Watts  
Hastings College  
Hastings, NE 68902

Mark Smith addresses both descriptive and normative concerns in this book. On the one hand, he describes how ancient Israel's experience of pilgrimage has been used to shape the themes and structures of Exodus. On the other hand, he uses the example of Exodus to argue that law requires more serious attention in Christian theology and liturgy than it has usually received.

The Introduction sets out Smith's theological and personal reasons for his normative agenda through discussions of a wide range of topics, including the interactions between law and liturgy, law and story, law and the New Testament, the history of Christian interpretation of pentateuchal law, and ritual and secularism. The first four chapters then describe liturgical aspects of pilgrimage in ancient Israel on the basis of a variety of biblical texts, supplemented occasionally from the Mishnah. This survey includes the furnishings of the Jerusalem Temple, postures for prayer and sacrifice, and pilgrimage language in the Psalms and prophetic literature.

The next five chapters contains Smith's analysis of the priestly redaction of Exodus. Since this redaction is one of the few compositional features of the Pentateuch still widely acknowledged, Smith's survey of source and redactional theories (chap. 5) turns out to be largely inconsequential for his study. Smith argues in chap. 6 that "the priestly redaction arranged Exodus as a double journey to, and sojourning at, the holy place of Sinai" so that "pilgrimage constitutes the basic pattern of the book" (p. 191). The book then divides into two parts (chaps. 1-14, 15:22-40:38) with the Song of the Sea as the fulcrum at the center (p. 190):

- A. Chapters. 1-2: Moses movement from Egypt to Midian
- B. Two calls and two confrontations
  - i. 3:1-6:1: Moses' first call and confrontation with Pharaoh

- i'. 6:2-14:31: Moses' second call and Yahweh's confrontation with Pharaoh.
  - The conflict between the powers of Egypt and Sinai
  - 15.1-21: Victory at the sea.
- A'. 15.22-18.27: Israel's movement from Egypt to Midian
- B'. Two covenants and two sets of tablets
  - i. Chapters. 19-31: Israel's first covenant with Yahweh; the first tablets
  - i'. Chapters 32-40: Israel's second covenant with Yahweh; the second tablets.

Smith's discussion contains an enlightening comparison of the two commissions of Moses (chap. 7) and an excellent survey of the many issues surrounding the Song of the Sea (chap. 8). His structural analysis of Exodus 19-40 (chap. 9) engages redactional debates: he argues against any substantive Deuteronomistic redaction in chapters 19 and 24, which together with chapters 32-34 were incorporated by P "in a new schema consistent with the priestly legislation involving the tabernacle in Exodus 25-31, 35-40" (p. 257). The larger structure of Exodus makes Moses' experience in Exodus 34 paradigmatic for a pilgrimage theophany (p. 255).

The last two chapters return to the thematic concerns of the introduction, emphasizing the necessary unity of law and narrative (chap. 10) and the place of Exodus as a mirror for Numbers within the literary structure of the whole Pentateuch (chap. 11).

This book makes an important contribution towards understanding the literary structure of Exodus. It establishes the significance of pilgrimage in shaping the Moses story, as well as the exodus and Sinai texts. It also adds Smith's voice to recent calls for the interpretation of law and narrative together as they are found in the text of the Pentateuch.

Smith's exhaustive engagement with critical interpretations of Exodus, however, hinders the fulfillment of his descriptive and normative goals. Despite his wish to interpret stories and laws together, Smith focuses his structural analysis almost entirely on narrative. Furthermore, the crucial narratives often turn out to be pre-priestly, despite his wish to describe the priestly redaction of the whole. For example, his analysis of the latter half of Exodus focuses almost entirely on small P glosses in non-priestly narrative chapters (19, 24 and 32-34). This approach was dictated by Smith's adoption of two historical assumptions: (1) the priestly redactor structured earlier material primarily through the use of geographical and temporal notices; (2) the legal and instructional collections were originally separate from the narratives. Thus the hand of the redactor must be found only in short notices attached to stories or legal collections. As a result, thematic structure becomes dependent on the plot sequenced by these notices, which inevitably subordinate legal concerns to the dictates of the stories.

A purely literary analysis would have made the case for both the pilgrimage pattern and the unity of law and narrative more fully and efficiently. Smith notes on the basis of Isa 2:3 that instruction plays a vital role in pilgrimage, but then applies it only to Exodus 33-34 (pp. 107-8). Yet the whole legal and instructional corpus (Exodus 20-31) fulfills the pilgrim's goal of receiving instruction in the holy place. Again, he notes that another goal of pilgrimage is to tour the holy site (pp. 73-75), but he makes nothing of the literary double tour of the Tabernacle provided by the instructions of Exodus 25-31 and their fulfillment in Exodus 35-40. It is in the book of Exodus as it now stands that the pilgrimage motif and the reciprocity of law/instruction and narrative are most fully displayed. This conclusion is implicit in Smith's arguments, but his engagement in the intricacies of redactional analysis obscure it.

Smith's parallelistic structural analysis sometimes seems to dictate how he reads particular texts, rather than vice versa. For example, in order to preserve the parallelism of two covenants in chapters 19-40 Smith argues that the account of "Israel's first covenant" ends with 31:18, in which Moses receives the stone tablets first mentioned in 24:12 (p. 244), rather than in chapter 34, when the (second set of) tablets actually make it down the mountain. The pilgrimage motif does not depend on so precise an analysis of parallel patterns. The book nevertheless makes valuable contributions both in its larger claims and in many of its specific observations about a wide variety of texts.