

Notice: The following material is drawn from material assembled by the Curriculum Commission, but is not an official document of that commission. Included here are the comments of Dr. Shiva Bajpai to the proposed edits of the Content Review Panel chaired by Prof. Witzel. Most of these CRP edits were ultimately rejected by the Commission at their Dec. 2 meeting. Dr. Bajpai's comments below were not submitted to the Commission for that meeting.

Edits and Corrections Process

On October 14 and 21, 2005, the Chair and Vice Chair of the Curriculum Commission, along with Content Review Panel (CRP) members and California Department of Education (CDE) staff, met with publishers to resolve the edits and corrections that had been noted in the IMAP/CRP Reports of Findings and which had been approved by the Curriculum Commission at its meeting on September 30, 2005.

At the meeting on October 14, the edits and corrections panel met with six publishers who had a total of 366 edits and corrections. The panel reviewed sample pages from the publisher indicating how each edit and correction would look in the final version of the text. On October 21, the panel met with four publishers who had a total of 126 edits and corrections.

Ad Hoc Committee

Due to the volume of public comments containing suggested edits and corrections received prior to its meeting on September 28-30, 2005, the Curriculum Commission at that meeting voted to create an Ad Hoc Committee consisting of three Commissioners, one former Commissioner, and four Content Review Panel (CRP) experts who would review this material and select specific edits and corrections to add to the Commission's recommendation to the State Board of Education (SBE).

Lengthy submissions were received from the Institute for Curriculum Services (ICS), the Council on Islamic Education (CIE), the Hindu Education Foundation (HEF), and the Vedic Foundation (VF). The submissions were sent to contracted CRP members to evaluate the material and recommend specific edits and corrections to the Ad Hoc Committee. The Ad Hoc Committee also reviewed edits and corrections that had been submitted by CRP members subsequent to the completion of the IMAP/CRP Reports of Findings, but which had not been recommended to the Commission due to an absence of specific language that would constitute an edit or correction. Several of the groups submitted citations that highlighted alleged errors in the instructional materials but did not suggest corrective language. Others suggested the addition of lengthy passages or new content that would have comprised a content change under the edits and corrections policy adopted by the Curriculum Commission and approved by the SBE. Only specific edits and corrections were entertained by the Ad Hoc Committee.

The Ad Hoc Committee met on October 31, 2005, to review the list of edits and corrections recommended by the CRP members and CDE staff. Some of the non-recommended edits were added to the recommended list and approved by the Committee as well. Several of the advocacy groups submitted additional edits and corrections on the day of the meeting, but due to the length of these documents and the limited time available these edits were not addressed by the Committee. All of the advocacy group submissions have been forwarded to the SBE as public comment.

In all, the Ad Hoc Committee reviewed 684 edits, of which 499 were approved and added to the Curriculum Commission’s recommendation to the SBE. This number approved represents 73 percent of the total.

State Board Action

The State Board of Education took action on the 2005 History–Social Science Adoption on November 9, 2005, and directed the Commission to reexamine the Ad Hoc edits and corrections at its next meeting. The Board directed that the Commission should approve only edits that “improve the factual accuracy of materials,” and do not contradict the Commission’s requested edits and corrections as approved on September 30, 2005. The Board also stated that no further edits and corrections would be accepted. Following the Board action, CDE staff met with several additional CRP members with expertise in Ancient India, and sought their feedback on that portion of the Ad Hoc list dealing with that period. These experts reviewed the edits submitted by HEF and the VF in detail. Their recommendations are listed under “CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation” in the tables below.

A list of edits from the Ad Hoc Committee is attached to this memorandum. Those edits which are not being recommended have the number column of the table shaded gray for rapid identification.

Following the Commission meeting, a final edits and corrections meeting will be held with publishers on December 14-15, 2005, at the CDE building in Sacramento.

Attachments

Attachment 1: Edits and Corrections Approved by the Ad Hoc Committee, and Final CFIR/CRP Recommendations (117 pages)

Non-Recommended CRP Edits

The following edits were originally included in the Commission packet for the September 28-30, 2005, Curriculum Commission meeting. These edits were submitted by members of the CRP after the IMAP/CRP Reports of Findings were completed. The edits and corrections were not recommended by CDE staff for inclusion in the Curriculum Commission’s report to the State Board. However, at the September 29 meeting of the History–Social Science Subject Matter Committee (SMC), the SMC directed staff to include a review of these edits in the work of the Ad Hoc Committee. Most of these edits were not recommended because they lacked specific language from the CRP to rectify a problem highlighted in a given text.

Teachers’ Curriculum Institute

Number	Group’s Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action
--------	-------------------------	-------------------------

Hindu Education Foundation: CRP-Recommended Edits
CRP: Michael Witzel, Harvard University
James Heitzman, University of California, Davis
Stanley Wolpert, University of California, Los Angeles

The Hindu Education Foundation submitted a detailed report with numerous suggested edits for each of the programs under consideration for adoption. Those edits approved by the Ad Hoc Committee on October 31, 2005, are listed below. The State Board of Education took action on the 2005 History–Social Science Adoption on November 9, 2005, and directed the Commission to reexamine the Ad Hoc edits and corrections at its next meeting. The Board directed that the Commission should approve only edits that “improve the factual accuracy of materials,” and do not contradict the Commission’s requested edits and corrections as approved on September 30, 2005. Following the Board action, CDE staff met with additional CRP experts listed above and sought their feedback on the Ad Hoc list. These experts reviewed the edits submitted by Hindu Education Foundation and the Vedic Foundation in detail. Their recommendations are listed under “CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation” in the tables below.

Recommendations to accept the text as originally written by the publisher are shaded in light gray.

Shiva Bajpai’s response in bold italics in CFIR/CRP... column

Glencoe/McGraw-Hill

Number	Group’s Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
14	Page 235, Section 1: current text, “...They [Aryans] created a new social system that determined how people lived.” Replace with, “A social system that determined how people lived evolved.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree. Perpetuates AIT/Migration-based explanation. Edit takes a neutral stance while endorsing the statement. Additionally, many scholars find the presence of the Class/Caste system in the Harappan civilization as well.</i>
15	Page 236, Inset: current text, “It [Hinduism] began with the religion of the Aryans, who arrived in India in 1500 B.C. Replace with, “The basic principles of what is known today as	Approve edit as written. The same edit will have to be made on page 247.	Approve edit without the phrase “under the collective name of Sanatana dharma.” <i>Disagree:</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	Hinduism were already formulated by 1500 <u>B.C.</u> under the collective name of Sanatana dharma. They are to be found in the four Vedas.”	247.	<i>Keep the edit but add: “under the <u>later</u> name of Sanatana ... Vedas”</i>
16	Page 238, Second bullet under “Focusing on the Main Ideas”: current text, “The Aryans introduced...” Replace with, “New ideas and technology <u>were</u> developed in India. (page 242)”	Approve edit. Minor grammatical correction underlined.	The statement is NOT Correct, Chariots came from the outside (steppes earlier than Mesopotamia, ca. 2000 BCE). Do not change original text. <i>Disagree. No evidence whatsoever of Steppes Chariots ever coming to India. Third millennium evidence of Spoked Wheel from Rakhigarhi suggests both wheeled carts and chariots. (B.B. Lal.1.pp.74-75)</i>
17	Page 238, <u>Third</u> bullet under “Focusing on the Main Ideas”: “The Aryans created a caste system...” Replace with, “During Vedic times, people were divided into different social groups (varnas) based on their capacity to undertake a particular profession. Membership in a group was not hereditary. In medieval times the varna system crystallized into a more rigid caste system.”	This is supposed to be a summary. Just use the first sentence in the proposed edit.	Approve the following edit only: “During Vedic times, people were divided into different social groups (varnas).” <i>OK. But explanation aids the understanding of the character of social order.</i>
18	Page 242, entire page: current text, “They [Aryans] were part of a larger group of people historians refer to as the Indo-Europeans.” Remove this statement.	Approve edit as written.	Do NOT remove this statement. <i>OK</i>
19	Page 245, second paragraph: “Men had many more rights than women.” Replace with, “Men had different	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree. The edit clarifies the non –specific usage of</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	duties (dharma) as well as rights than women. Many women were among the sages to whom the Vedas were revealed.”		<i>‘more’ and added sentence helps in forming a perspective on women’s condition.</i>
20	Page 255, 256, bottom of page, illustrations of Brahman. Replace illustrations.	Replace illustrations of the Brahman with something more historically appropriate.	<p>The illustration is no worse than anything one sees in <i>Amar Chitra Katha</i>. It is impossible to imagine where something more historically appropriate would be found. We suggest that the illustrator simply remove the beard and change the dress to a dhoti.</p> <p><i>This Is a gratuitous remark. One can create plausible portraits based on figures on art objects, frescoes and literary descriptions in the works of ancient India. There are illustrated manuscripts of later periods, which can inform an illustrator about the culture- specific illustrations. Of course, these will not be historical photographs but surely authentic illustrations compared to the ludicrous and insensitive ones in the text.</i></p>
21	Page 262, second column, second paragraph: “[Ashoka’s] tolerance was unusual for the time.” Replace with “His tolerance was usual for the time.”	Approve edit as written.	<p>It is best simply to remove this sentence.</p> <p><i>Disagree. The edit is intended to underscore the fact that there was <u>no state religion in ancient India</u> despite the rulers’ own personally</i></p>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
			<i>preferred religion and preferential patronage.</i>
95	Page 238, Timeline: current text, "3000 B.C. – India's first civilization begins." Astronomical evidence in the Rig Veda suggests a date earlier than 3000 B.C. for the Rigveda.	Replace "first" with "early". This was initially edit #95 in the non-recommended list (original numbering kept for consistency).	Do not include the phrase "Astronomical evidence in the Rig Veda suggests a date earlier than 3000 B.C. for the Rigveda." Replace "first" with "early". <i>Disagree: It is simply a reference to the antiquity of the Rigveda according to the astronomical data in the text itself. It is no different than saying something according to the internal evidence of the Bible, the Quran, or Virgil's Aeneid.</i>
96	Page 240, first paragraph, second column: current text, "India's first civilization in the Indus River valley began about 3000 B.C...." Astronomical evidence in the Rig Veda suggests a date earlier than 3000 B.C. for the Rigveda.	Replace "first" with "early".	Do not include the phrase "Astronomical evidence in the Rig Veda suggests a date earlier than 3000 B.C. for the Rigveda." Replace "first" with "early". <i>Disagree. See the note above for #95</i>
97	Page 243, second paragraph: current text, "Because Aryans were skilled ironworkers, they improved farming in India." Remove "Aryan (sic)"	Replace with, "Aryan technology improved farming in India."	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree. Simply state: "The iron technology developed indigenously around 1200 BC improved weapons of war and farming in India." (See Kenoyer.pp74-75)</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
22	Pages 362-363, 388: depictions of kings Chandragupta and Asoka, depiction of four classes. Provide authentic illustrations of these personages based on Indian symbols and dress code. Women belonging to each class did not wear the kind of attire shown in the illustration on page 388.	Approve edit as written.	<p>The images of these people could not possibly come from any known historical source. They should be removed. The attached image of Banaras (p. 388) is a poor choice for a section on ancient history, since the boat that dominates the image includes an advertisement for urea on its side!</p> <p><i>This is a gratuitous and unprofessional remark. One can create plausible portraits based on figures on art objects, coins (esp. the Imperial Gupta gold), frescoes and literary descriptions of the post-Mauryan periods both before and immediately after the common era as for instance the World famous Aajnta frescoes and sculptures on Sanchi and Bharhut stupas. Of course, these will not be historical photographs but surely authentic illustrations compared to the ludicrous and insensitive ones in the text.</i></p> <p>..</p>

23	Page 367, fourth paragraph: current text, “Hindi is written with the Arabic alphabet, which uses 18 letters that stand for sounds.” Replace with “Hindi is written with the Devnagari alphabet, which uses 52 letters that stand for sounds.	Approve edit as written.	Use the following text: “Hindi is written with the Devanagari alphabet, which uses 49 letters that stand for sounds.” OK
24	Page 386, paragraph 3: current text, “Compiled between 1500 B.C. and 800 B.C., the Vedas are based on oral tradition...” The group provides a suggested 130+ word passage for inclusion in the text.	An inclusion of the suggested length would definitely constitute additional content rather than an edit/correction. Revise the dates provided to “between 2000 B.C. and 1000 B.C.”	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: see previous notes. The composition of major portions of the Rigved must antedate 2000 BC and the compilations at different times upto 1000 BC.</i>
25	Page 386, paragraph 5: current text, “The Vedas came to form the major beliefs of the religion called Brahmanism.” Replace with, “The Vedas constitute the source of Hinduism.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not make this editorial change. We suggest the following sentence: “The Vedas are the earliest textual sources for the religion that became Hinduism.” Drop all reference to a religion called Brahmanism. OK
26	Page 386, first paragraph: current text, “The <i>Bhagavad Gita</i> describes a discussion between a god and a Vedic warrior...” Replace with, “The <i>Bhagavad Gita</i> describes a discussion between Krishna and Arjuna...”	Approve edit as written.	No recommendation from CRP; approve edit as written.

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
27	Page 141, Timeline: "c.1250 BC Hinduism begins to develop in India. Replace with, "c.1250 BC Central tenets of Hinduism take shape."	Approve edit as written. Use "BC" rather than "BCE" for consistency. On the timeline, substitute c. 2600 BC for c. 2300 BC and caption, "Urban Harappan civilization reaches maturity."	The mature Harappan/Indus Valley Civilization is now put at 2600-1900 B.C.E. Before that they only had irregularly laid out VILLAGES. The edit should reflect that. <i>This is only partially correct. See: Kenoyer pp.160-161 TIMELINE. 2800-2600—EH period; first city walls built. 1900-1300 Indus cities decline</i>
28	Page 147, first paragraph: current text, "The greatest sources of information we have about Harappan civilization are the ruins of two large cities, Harappa and Mohenjo Daro..." Replace with, "The greatest sources of information we have about <u>Harappan civilization</u> are the ruins of two large cities of Harappa and Mohenjo Daro. The two cities lay on the Indus more than 300 miles apart but were remarkably similar. More recent sources include the ruins discovered at Kalibangan, Dholavira and the port of Lothal, in addition to the 2600 rural settlements excavated in <u>northwest India.</u> "	Approve edit as written. Changed "IVC" to "Harappan civilization" for consistency with the rest of the text. Changed "Northwest" to lower-case.	There is no reason to mention Kalibangan, Dholavira and Lothal if they are not on the map. We suggest the following wording: "The greatest sources of information we have about Harappan civilization are the ruins of two large cities of Harappa and Mohenjo Daro. The two cities lay more than 300 miles apart but were remarkably similar. They were part of a large distribution of towns and 2,600 rural settlements known from the northwestern part of modern India, Pakistan, and Afghanistan." The key to the map should say, "Major settlement". <i>Disagree: Add names of Dholavira, Kalibangan and Lothal on the map. It</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
			<i>corrects an outdated perspective of the Indus-Sarasvati civilization by a reference to some of the major archaeological excavations of the last 50 and more years.</i>
29	Page 148, "Invaders from the West", second paragraph: current text, "Though they are mostly religious, some of the Vedas describe Aryan victories during their invasion of India." Drop this statement.	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
30	Page 149, "Language", second paragraph, last line: "Sanskrit is no longer spoken today, but it is the root of many modern South Asian languages." Replace with, "Sanskrit is no longer widely spoken today, but it is the root of many modern South Asian languages."	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: The Indian census records thousandsof people as Sanskrit Speakers. There used to be a Radio news-broadcast in Sanskrit in the 1980s. The literary production in Sanskrit including dramas, novels, short stories and other forms of creative writing continues to be substantial and significant. I had such data in 2001 when I participated in an International Sanskrit Conference In New Delhi in April 2001.</i>
31	Page 151, "The Caste System", third paragraph: remove entire paragraph.	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
32	Page 152, "The Vedas": current text, "The oldest of the Vedas, the <i>Rigveda</i> , was probably written before 1000 BC." Replace with, "The oldest of the Vedas, the <i>Rigveda</i> , was redacted in the form it	Instead of "redacted", use "collected and arranged". Use BC instead	Do not change original text, except substituting "composed" for "written". <i>Disagree. Nobody can be absolutely certain about</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	is known to this day by 1500 <u>BC</u> .”	of BCE for consistency.	<i>the period of the composition of the Rigveda. Various authors have different dates as for example Kenoyer p.160.TIMELINE 1700-1500 BC Rigveda...compiled. However, based on the archaeological and geological evidence for the drying up of the Rigvedic mighty, perennial Sarasvati River, the Rigveda's composition must antedate 2000 BC</i>
33	Page 152, “Later Vedic Texts,” all four paragraphs. Identify all four sections of the Veda: (1) Samhita, (2) Brahmana, (3) Aranyaka, and (4) Upanishad.	Delete the word “later”.	Let's not burden students with unnecessary terminology. Do not make any of these changes. <i>This is quite a cavalier way of treating a serious issue. The suggestion to drop the word ‘ Later’ was meant to correct a mistake. The relevant write-up is based on the Vedic rather than Later Vedic texts. The edit only informs students about the Vedic texts.</i>
34	Page 154, “Hinduism and the Caste System,” current text, “A person with bad karma will be reborn into a lower caste or as a lesser creature, such as a pig or an ant.” Replace with, “A person with good or bad karma will be born into a higher or lower life form.”	Replace with “A person with bad karma will be born into a lower caste or life form.” The following paragraph already details what happens to	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
		a person with good karma after death.	
35	Page 154, "Hinduism and Women": current text, "However, Hinduism also taught that women were inferior to men. As a result, Hindu women were not allowed to read the Vedas or other sacred texts." Delete these sentences.	Make edit as directed. Deletion leaves only one sentence under "Hinduism and Women". It might be better for flow to just add this remaining sentence to the end of the previous section, or remove it altogether.	Do not change original text <i>Disagree: The description of the condition of Hindu women in ancient India is inaccurate because it does not reflect the high respect and privileges they enjoyed. Just take into account eight forms of marriage and many other legal and social privileges and safeguards accorded to women, notably of the upper classes. The great emperor Chandragupta II (376-414) married the widow of his elder brother and Rajyashri, the widow sister of the emperor Harsha-wardhan (606-647) attended the court as witnessed by the Chinese Buddhist pilgrim Xuan Zang (travel yrs. 629-644). Smriti literature gives many rights and privileges to women while also recommending certain restrictions. The text must be balanced in order to be historically accurate.</i>
36	Page 164, "Gupta Society", second and third paragraphs. Delete these paragraphs.	In the second paragraph, delete the word "strict". Delete the entire third paragraph.	Approve edit of the Group.
37	Page 169, "Religious Epics," current	Approve edit as	Who in Sixth Grade cares

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	text, "The Ramayana, written later than the Mahabharata..." Replace with, "The Ramayana, written prior to the Mahabharata..."	written.	which epic was "written" first? Use the following phrase: "The <i>Ramayana</i> tells about..." <i>It is not the question of who cares but who cares for historical accuracy. One can be silent about many issues, but if one mentions something it better be historically accurate.</i>
38	Page 170, "Mathematics and Other Sciences": current text, "The ancient Indians were also very skilled in the medical sciences." Replace with, "The ancient Indians were also very skilled in the medical science known as the Ayurveda. Ayurveda is derived from Sanskrit <i>ayus</i> , meaning long and healthy life span, and <i>veda</i> , meaning theory and practice. The psychosomatic dimension of ayurveda incorporates significant input from the tradition of yoga. Though principally a pathway to spiritual liberation, yoga as a discipline of breathing and bodily functions finds a place of honor in most medical and healing traditions of India."	Replace with the following language: "The ancient Indians were also very skilled in the medical science known as the Ayurveda. Ayurveda incorporates significant input from the tradition of yoga. Though principally a pathway to spiritual liberation, yoga as a discipline of breathing and bodily functions finds a place of honor in most medical and healing traditions of India."	Do not change original text <i>Disagree: the edits actually improve the quality of the content and enhance the understanding of the students who have heard about Yoga and some might even know about Ayurveda.</i>

Macmillan/McGraw-Hill

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
39	Page 233, Venn diagram: replace "Worship many gods" with "Worship many deities".	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
40	Page 234, Timeline: "circa 3000 B.C. First Indian civilization begins." Replace with "circa 3000 B.C. Evidence for composite Indian civilization."	Make edit, but delete the word, "composite".	See comment on # 27 above. The mature Harappan Civilization = 2600-1900 BCE. OK
41	Page 235, Timeline: "circa 1500 B.C. Aryan songs become foundation of Hinduism." Replace with "circa 1500 B.C. Vedas were redacted into the form in which we know them today."	Make edit but replace "redacted" with "collected and arranged".	Use the following wording: "around 1500-1000 B.C. Vedas were composed and circa 1000 B.C. the Vedas were collected in the form in which we know them today." <i>Disagree: Dates are problematic. Suggested dates are in fact out-of-date. See the note #32.</i> <i>Composition of the Rigveda must antedate 2000 BC; of other Vedas in later times, and their compilations on more than one occasion.</i>
42	Page 242: current text, "Because the Harappans left no written records, we do not know much about their society or government." Replace with, "The Harappans left behind inscriptions on a variety of objects such as seals, potsherds, and axes, as well as an occasional signboard."	Add after suggested revision, "Because the Harappan script has not been deciphered, we do not know much about their society or government."	Approve edit of Group. Change wording of Ad Hoc Committee as follows: "Because the Harappans left no deciphered written sources, we do not know much about their society or government." OK
43	Page 242, last paragraph: current text, "In the years that followed, a group of	Approve edit as written.	(1) The mature Harappan complex

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	<p>people called the Aryans began settling in the region. Soon a new civilization emerged.” Replace with, “In the years that followed, a group of people from other regions of India began settling in the region, enriching the Harappan civilization.”</p>	<p>written.</p>	<p>was in decline by about 1900 B.C., not 1500 as claimed here; pushing the decline later in time is simply a crude attempt to create a linkage with the Aryans. (2) The map on p. 242 should show the MATURE Harappan civilization between 2600-1900 B.C., which should include Gujarat in green.</p> <p><i>There is no attempt, whether crude or sophistic here; only a simple statement of one of the possibilities of the movement and settlement of groups of people, including the Aryans, in different localities in the aftermath of the tectonic movements that caused the drying up of the mighty Sarasvati River in c.2000 BC and the resulting chaos.</i></p>
44	<p>Page 243, last paragraph: current text, “Sanskrit was...” Replace paragraph with, “Sanskrit was the language of ancient India (to some extent it is so even today). Hindi, the most widely used language in India today (and other regional languages) evolved out of Sanskrit. The earliest example of</p>	<p>Approve edit as written. Use “A.D.” in lieu of “C.E.” for consistency.</p>	<p>Rewrite the Group's edit as follows: “Sanskrit became the most important language for public affairs in much of ancient India. Hindi, the most widely used language in India today (and other regional</p>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	written Sanskrit is the four <i>Vedas</i> , the oldest writings of the Hindu religion. Sanskrit was used until about A.D. 1100.		<p>languages) evolved out of Sanskrit. The earliest example of orally transmitted, ancient Sanskrit is the four Vedas. Sanskrit was in common usage until about A.D. 1100, and was used in some official communications until A.D. 1830.”</p> <p><i>Qualified OK. Sanskrit was not only the most important language of public affairs, but also of history and culture, including religious worship.</i></p>
45	Page 244, second paragraph: current text, “Men had many more rights than women. Unless there were no sons in a family, only a man could inherit property. Only men could go to school or become priests.” Replace first sentence with, “Men had different rights and duties than women,” and add after last sentence, “Women’s education was mostly done at home.”	Approve edit as written.	<p>Do not change original text.</p> <p><i>Disagree: edit addresses the complex relationship between men and women; upper class women were educated at home and there are certain sources that indicate that there were some educational establishments for women as well. One should not ignore the role of Hindu women-sanyasins, and Buddhist and Jain nuns. We have evidence of Queen regents and, of course, of queens in courts, donative records, coins, in many other areas that suggest that all women were not uneducated or illiterate.</i></p>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
			<i>Women did have special property rights. The term is Stridhana, woman's property, which was legally protected.</i>
46	Page 244, fourth paragraph: current text, "In ancient India..." Replace "at an early age—12 or 13," with "after education."	Approve edit as written.	Let's compromise here with the following wording: "In ancient India, individuals were considered ready for marriage at an early age, but ideally after the completion of education." OK
47	Page 245, "Review": current text, "Describe some of the ways in which men enjoyed more rights than women in ancient India." Replace with, "...enjoyed different rights."	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. Disagree: see note # 45. The usage of the term "more" is misleading apart from being non-specific.
48	Page 249, second paragraph: current text, "Hinduism began with the religion of the Aryans, who arrived in India around 1500 B.C. The Aryans believed in many gods and goddesses who controlled the forces of nature. We know about Aryan religion from their ancient hymns and poetry, especially their epics." Replace with, "Hindus believe in many gods and goddesses. We know about Hindu religion from ancient Vedic hymns and poetry, especially Hindu epics."	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text, except as follows: "Hinduism began with the religion of the Aryans, who arrived in India around 1500 B.C. The Aryans believed in many gods and goddesses who controlled the forces of nature and governed society. We know about Aryan religion from ancient Vedic hymns and poetry, especially their epics." Disagree: (a) Hinduism did not begin with the arrival of the Aryans; and (b) Aryans did not arrive in 1500 B.C. If they did migrate into ancient

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
			<i>India, it was before 4500 BC according to available hard historical evidence. Vedic texts and the corpus of ancient Indian historical tradition maintain that the Aryans were indigenous to India.</i>
49	ADDITIONAL EDIT FROM CDE: in the TE, SE page 241 is reproduced on TE page 249.	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
50	Page 249, Timeline: current text, "1000 B.C. <i>Rig Veda</i> created." Replace with, "1500 B.C. Rigveda was redacted."	Make edit but replace "redacted" with "collected and arranged".	Use the following phrase: "1500-1000 B.C. Rig Veda created" <i>Disagree: "1500-1000 BC Rigveda compiled."</i>
51	Page 252, picture: remove picture of the "Untouchable."	Remove picture.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
52	Page 252, last paragraph: "There was one group that did not belong to any varna. Its members were called untouchables. They performed work other Indians thought was too dirty, such as collecting trash, skinning animals, or handling dead bodies." Delete.	Replace text with, "There was one group that did not belong to any varna. Its members were called untouchables because they performed dirty work such as skinning animals or handling dead bodies."	Approve deletion suggested in the Group's edit.
53	Page 253, "Gods and Goddesses": current text, "I honor the light within you." Replace with, "I recognize and honor the divine within you."	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
54	Page 255, "Daily Religion": "A temple	Replace	Approve edit of Ad Hoc

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	or house of worship is not the..." Replace with, "A temple or house of worship is not the only center of Hindu religious life."	sentence as indicated.	Committee.
55	Page 255, second paragraph: "Instead, a Hindu home..." Drop the word "Instead".	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
56	Page 255, "What You Learned": Delete, "The Aryans introduced Hinduism to India."		Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
57	Page 264, under "Jainism": Add after Gautama (end of first paragraph), "Jains believe that Mahavira is the 24 th Tirthamkara (literally ford-maker) who like his 23 predecessors retold how to cross over from the material and phenomenal world of existence to spiritual liberation."	Add the following sentence in lieu of the suggested edit: "Jains believe that Mahavira is the 24 th Tirthamkara (pathfinder) who like his predecessors retold how to achieve spiritual liberation."	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
58	Page 268: current text, "Although he was a Buddhist, Asoka allowed his Hindu subjects to practice their religion. His tolerance was unusual for the time." Replace with, "Although he was a Buddhist, Asoka allowed his Hindu subjects to practice their religion. His tolerance was usual for the time."	Approve edit as written.	It is best to drop entirely the reference to tolerance. <i>Disagree: Edits underscore the fact that there never was a State religion in ancient India despite many rulers' own preferred religion or deity, and preferential, but not exclusive, patronage to their chosen religion or sect.</i>
59	Page 269: second column, "Ram's enemies have banished him from the kingdom." Replace with, "Ram's	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	stepmother has banished Ram from his kingdom.”		
60	Page 269, current text, “As in many Indian epics, the couple then lives happily ever after.” Delete.	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
61	Page 270, “Medicine”: additional language, “Ayurveda is derived from Sanskrit <i>ayus</i> , meaning long and healthy life span, and <i>veda</i> , meaning theory and practice. The psychosomatic dimension of ayurveda incorporates significant input from the tradition of yoga. Though principally a pathway to spiritual liberation, yoga as a discipline of breathing and bodily functions finds a place of honor in most medical and healing traditions of India.”	Replace with the following: “Ayurveda incorporates significant input from the tradition of yoga. Though principally a pathway to spiritual liberation, yoga as a discipline of breathing and bodily functions finds a place of honor in most medical and healing traditions of India.”	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: The edit contributes to a better understanding of Ayurveda and Yoga, which are becoming popular worldwide.</i>

Houghton Mifflin/McDougal Littell

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
62	Page 229: depicts untouchables as the fifth Varna. Remove this.	Approve edit as written. The text at the bottom of p.228	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
		will also have to be edited.	
63	Page 229: current text, "As time passed, Indians began to question how the world came into being. These questions led to changes in Brahmanism." Replace with, "As time passed, Indians began to question how the world came into being. These questions led to changes in contemporary religious ideas."	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
64	Page 230: current text, "For that reason, many Hindus are vegetarians. They will not eat animals." Add after second sentence, "Many other Indians do eat fish, goat, and chicken."	Approve edit as written.	This editing is unnecessary. Saying that many Hindus are vegetarians covers all bases OK.
65	Page 230: current text, "Evil deeds cause a person to be reborn as a lower being, such as an insect." Replace with "Deeds (good or evil) cause a person to be reborn in a higher or lower life form."	Approve edit as written. Also delete the previous sentence, which states, "Good deeds allow a person to be reborn as a higher being."	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
66	Page 236: current text, "The popularity of Buddhism meant that fewer people were worshipping Hindu gods. Early Hinduism had a set of complex sacrifices that only priests could perform. They conducted the rites in Sanskrit, which few people spoke any more. This caused people to feel distant from the gods. Many people turned to Buddhism instead. Rulers who had come under the influence of Buddhism encouraged this shift."	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text.

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	Add at a suitable point the following: "As a result of Asoka's patronage, Buddhism attracted the elites to its monastic order. Asoka and the Buddhist rulers that followed him sent missionaries to bring new converts to Buddhism."		

Oxford University Press

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
67	Page 76, first and second paragraphs: current text, "People from the countryside and highlands who spoke the Indo-Aryan language..." Replace with, "Indians from the countryside..."	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text.
68	Page 76, second paragraph: current text, "The language and traditions of the Indo-Aryan speakers replaced the old ways of the Harappans..." Replace with "People from elsewhere in India replaced..."	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: perpetuates the AI/migration Theory and the Vedic-Harappan dichotomy while the edit takes a neutral stance.</i>
69	Page 79, third paragraph: "If Ketu even brushed against a Shudra, he had to bathe and purify himself right away." Omit this sentence.	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
70	Page 81, second paragraph: "The Vedic peoples discriminated against the Dasa, a group of people who spoke a different language that did not sound at all like Sanskrit. The Brahmins sometimes made fun of the Dasa and said that they spoke as if they had no noses. (Pinch your nose and see what you would sound like.) Omit these sentences.	Approve edit as written.	If one omits these sentences, the last sentence of the paragraph makes no sense. Delete only the following: "The Brahmins sometimes made fun of the Dasa and said that they spoke as if they had no noses (Pinch your nose and see what you would sound

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
			like.)” <i>It is a contentious issue. The proponents of Dasa identity have tortured the Vedic text to extract a meager evidence. The Dasas probably spoke a corrupt language and had different beliefs than the Vedic Aryans did. (see Trautmann: <u>Aryans and British India</u> for a sober evaluation.)</i>
71	Page 87, last paragraph: current text, “The monkey king Hanuman loved Rama so much that it is said that he is present every time the Ramayana is told. So look around—see any monkeys?” Delete “The monkey king” from the first sentence, and the entirety of the second sentence.	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
72	Page 88, first paragraph: “If you had earned bad karma, you might come back as a chicken, a fish, or a pig.... Even a mosquito had a soul.” Omit these sentences.	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
73	Page 155, second paragraph: current text, “Some, like most Nepalis, are Buddhist.” 89% of Nepalese are Hindu.	Use Sri Lanka as the example.	Use the following sentence: “Many people in Sri Lanka, Bhutan, and Nepal are Buddhists.”

Prentice Hall

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
74	Page 160, “What You Will Learn”: current text, “Hinduism evolved from a system of beliefs and practices called	Approve edit. Small addition for grammatical	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	Brahmanism.” Replace with, “Hinduism evolved from a pluralistic code of conduct centered in Vedas. It developed over <u>a long period of time</u> and even today, it is an evolving system.”	clarity underlined.	
75	Page 161, Map: replace “Ceylon” with “Sri Lanka”.	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
76	Page 162, Chapter Standards, Section 3: current text, “A group of people known as the Indo-Aryans arrived in the Indus Valley about 1500 B.C. These people developed a social structure called a caste system.” Add a sentence informing students that there is a lot of controversy concerning the category of people known as “Indo-Aryans” and their origin. Use BCE, not BC.	Approve edit as written. BC is used in the content standards and <i>Framework</i> and should be used for consistency across all programs.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: suggested edit draws attention to the contentious position rather than endorsing the one-sided view of history.</i>
77	Page 163, Timeline: current text, “700 B.C. Northern India is home to 16 Aryan kingdoms.” Replace with, “700 BCE Northern India is home to 16 kingdoms.”	Historically correct statement should be: “700 BC India is home to 16 major states.” Use BC for consistency with standards and the <i>Framework</i> .	Change wording as follows: “ca.500 B.C. Northern India is home to 16 kingdoms and oligarchies.” <i>Disagree: The Sanskrit/Pali word Mahajanapada can best be translated in English as “16 Major States”; 14 major states had monarchic and two had oligarchic polity. A janapada is a state; it can be a kingdom or a republic, whether oligarchic or democratic. The date 500 BC is too late. It can be c.600 BC or the 6th century BC. The Achaemenid/Persian conquest of Gandhara Mahajanapada was an accomplished fact by 513</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
			<i>BC.</i>
78	Page 179, second paragraph: current text, "Like most nomads, Indo-Aryans did not create a written language.... The Vedas are poems that tell the story of the Indo-Aryan people and their gods." Replace second sentence with, "The Vedas are poems that record and narrate the story of the people of India and their deities—male and female. Vedas also reveal significant achievements in the fields of mathematics, science, agriculture, and many other disciplines."	Approve edit as written.	Do NOT change anything in these sentences except "gods" to "deities". <i>Disagree: The edit is a definite improvement on an outdated view of the Vedic people. Rhetorically speaking, how many nomads in history have anything that can come even close to the Vedas in those remote millennia.</i>
79	Page 181, "Main Idea": current text, "The social structure known as the caste system was an important characteristic of Aryan society." Replace with, "The social structure known as the Varna system was an important characteristic of the ancient Indian society."	Add clarifying note "(social class)" when the term Varna is first used.	Do not change original text. Define varna as class, and jati as caste. <i>Disagree: The edit is an improvement since the references to the Aryan Varna system are meager in ancient sources. Moreover, Aryan is not an ethnic or racial term, and all social systems do denote a certain degree of civilizational advance. However, how awkward would the repetitious use of the term "civilized society" be, which is what the term Aryan society means in this context.</i>
80	Page 181, second paragraph: current text, "Once their society had merged with the local population, a late hymn of the <i>Rig Veda</i> described the four castes." Replace with, "A late hymn of the <i>Rig Veda</i> describes the interrelationship and interdependence of	Approve edit as written. Note that this line is actually on page 182.	Do not change original text, except substitution of "four classes" for "four castes". <i>Disagree: The edit is a definite improvement. We do not know how and</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	the four social classes.”		<i>where the social merger of peoples took place . The suggested text stays clear of the unknown as well as of the scholarly controversy on the Vedic Aryans.</i>
81	Page 181, “Origins of Caste”: “When Indo-Aryans arrived in the Indus River valley, their society already had three social classes: priests, rulers, and common people. They soon added a fourth caste for the native peoples who already lived in the area.” Omit these sentences.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text.
82	Page 181, table, “The Caste System”: replace table header with, “The Varnas”.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Inconsistent position on the Varna system. See previous notes.</i>
83	Page 181, table, last row (“Sudras”): current text, “Native peoples; performed services for members of the three higher castes.” Replace with, “Performed services for all classes and did more labor-intensive work.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: the people included in the Shudra class were not all non-Aryans. In fact, texts, such as the Kautiliya Arthashastra (4th century BC), call the Shudras Aryans. The edit is a definite improvement.</i>
84	Page 182, first paragraph: “For the first few hundred years after the arrival of the Indo-Aryans in India, the castes had not yet become hereditary. Once their society had merged with the local population, a late hymn of the <i>Rig Veda</i> described the four castes.” Omit these sentences.	Approve edit as written.	Begin this paragraph with the following sentence: “The social system of the Indo-Aryans, as known from the Vedas, included four main groups.” OK
85	Page 182, third paragraph: current text,	Approve edit as	Do not change original

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	"At the bottom of the caste system stood the native peoples known as Sudras." Replace with, "At the bottom of the caste system stood the Sudras."	written.	text. <i>Disagree: see note #83.</i> <i>Edit is an improvement.</i>
86	Page 182, fourth paragraph: current text, "In modern India, these people are now called Dalits, and treating someone as an untouchable is a crime against the law." Replace with, "In modern India, treating someone as an untouchable is a crime against the law."	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: Dalit is a Marxist term and an ideology. It is not caste/class specific. Gandhi called some of them, esp. the untouchables, Harijans</i>
87	Page 191, title above illustration: replace "Hindu street shrine," with, "One of the Hindu objects of veneration."	Approve edit as written.	Use the following label: "A linga, one of Shiva's forms". OK
88	Page 197, second paragraph, "Dharma": current text, "For a Hindu, dharma means fulfilling as well as possible the duties that are assigned to one's caste, or position in life." Replace with, "For a Hindu, dharma means (among other things) fulfilling to the extent possible the duties that are assigned to one's caste, or position in life."	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
89	Page 198, second paragraph: current text, "Hinduism teaches that a person may be reborn as a human being of a higher or lower caste." Replace with, "Hinduism teaches that a person may be reborn as a human being of a higher or lower caste (or another life form) depending upon the quality of one's deeds."	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: The edit is a definite improvement and helps an understanding of the belief in karma and rebirth.</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
90	Page 144, second paragraph: current text, "Around 1500 B.C.E., invaders called Aryans conquered northern India." Replace with, "Around 1500 B.C.E., invaders called Aryans came to northern India."	Publisher is directed to add a clarifying note that the "Aryan invasion theory" has been contradicted by scholarly evidence.	We can make the changes projected in the Group's edit, and do what the Ad Hoc Committee wants, by using the following wording: "Around 1500 B.C.E., groups calling themselves the Aryans began migrating into northern India." <i>Disagree: It perpetuates the invasion/Migration theory which has no hard historical evidence. Therefore, the texts ought to note the other position.</i>
91	Page 144, second paragraph, last sentence: current text, "Hinduism is a blend of the Aryan beliefs and the beliefs of the people they conquered." Replace with, "Hinduism is a blend of the Aryan beliefs and the beliefs of the people living in the <u>Indus-Saraswati</u> civilization."	Approve edit as written. Minor corrections underlined. The text uses, "Indus-Sarasvati civilization" throughout.	Solve the problem: Delete the entire sentence. OK
92	Page 144, third paragraph, replace current text, "Early Aryan religion..." with "Early Hindu religion..."	Approve edit as written.	We solve this problem by rewording the first two sentences of this paragraph: "We can learn about religion in the time of the Aryans by studying the Vedas , a large collection of sacred verses, hymns, prayers, and teachings composed in Sanskrit." See also the comments of the Vedic Foundation below, #44.
93	Page 145, last paragraph: "The caste system is just one example of how Hinduism was woven into the fabric of daily life in India." Delete this part.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: Even the Buddhist and Jains as</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
			<p><i>well as the Muslims subscribed to the caste-system in every-day life. Statements like these ones prevent an accurate understanding of Hinduism and help perpetuate old stereotypes.</i></p>

Vedic Foundation: Recommended Edits**CRP: James Heitzman, University of California, Davis****Michael Witzel, Harvard University****Stanley Wolpert, University of California, Los Angeles**

The edits approved by the Ad Hoc Committee on October 31, 2005, are listed below. The State Board of Education took action on the 2005 History–Social Science Adoption on November 9, 2005, and directed the Commission to reexamine the Ad Hoc edits and corrections at its next meeting. The Board directed that the Commission should approve only edits that “improve the factual accuracy of materials,” and do not contradict the Commission’s requested edits and corrections as approved on September 30, 2005. Following the Board action, CDE staff met with additional CRP experts listed above and sought their feedback on the Ad Hoc list. These experts reviewed the edits submitted by Hindu Education Foundation and the Vedic Foundation in detail. Their recommendations are listed under “CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation” in the tables below.

Recommendations to accept the text as originally written by the publisher are shaded in light gray.

Glencoe/McGraw-Hill

Number	Group’s Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
4	p. 233: “The Hindu temple of Devi Jagadambi in Khajuraho, India.” Misspelled - replace with either Jagadamba or Jagadambika.	Approve edit as provided.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
5	p. 243: “...the four Vedas – the oldest writings of the Hindu religion.”	Replace “writings” with “scriptures”.	Replace “writings” with “texts”. OK
6	p. 254-257: Incorrect use of the term Brahman to refer to a Brahmin.	Correct the reference.	Do not change original texts.
7	p. 244: The photograph of a Muslim man offering prayer is wrongly captioned as “A Brahman (corrected spelled Brahmin).”	Correct the reference. If the picture indeed depicts a Muslim, replace the illustration with an appropriate picture of a Brahmin.	Delete the inserted circular image entirely, leaving us with a powerful picture of the scavenging lifestyle associated with untouchability. Disagree: Replace the picture. Untouchability in ancient India was not

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
		Brahmin.	<i>such a huge social phenomenon as modern scholars have made it out to be. It was definitely tied to unclean professions and conduct, not to blood.</i>

Holt, Rinehart and Winston

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
9	p. 145: The statement, "Several major rivers flow out of the Himalayas," should be appended to read, "such as Ganga, Sindhu, Yamuna, and Brahmaputra." The subsequent statement reading, "The valley of one of them..." should be changed to "The valley and fertile plains of these rivers were the locations of India's early civilizations."	Approve edit as provided.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: Edit is a definite improvement. Historically we now know that several river- valleys were locations of early civilizations, such as the Indus, Sarasvati, Ganga.</i>
10	p. 146-148: The text under the heading 'India's First Cities' inaccurately describes Harappa and Mohenjo-Daro as 'first' cities. The heading should read, "India's Early Cities."	Approve edit as provided.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: Edit corrects the old view of first cities because we now have excavated other contemporaneous ones.</i>
11	p. 147: The word 'think' should be replaced with 'currently estimate' in the statement, "From studying these ruins, archaeologists think..." Acknowledge the fact that most of Indus valley civilizations' ruins, including its major cities, remain to be excavated.	Approve edit as provided.	Do not change original text.
12	p. 148: The statement, "Harappans also developed India's first writing system," should be removed. There is no evidence supporting this claim.	Approve edit as provided.	Do NOT delete the entire statement. Insert the wording: "Harappans also developed India's first

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
			known writing system.” OK
13	p. 148: “Historians think that the Harappans.... but they aren’t sure . As in Egypt, the people may have worshipped the king as a god.” The statements are confusing and inference is invalid. They should be removed.	Approve edit as provided.	Remove the two sentences, and insert instead: “Unlike Mesopotamia or Egypt, for example, there are no large religious monuments or palaces, so the relationship between the people and their government is less clear. On the other hand, the remarkable similarity of material culture from widely scattered Harappan sites suggests a high level of central control.” OK
14	The introduction to the passage from Bhagwad Gita (p. 172-173) states, “Krishna tells Arjuna how a person might find peace...” and asks the students to, “ Try to sum up what each sentence says in your own words. ” In comparison, the Sermon on the Mount (p. 390) introduces that, “Jesus taught that people who love God will be blessed when they die,” and asks the student to “ Note who Jesus says are blessed ” and “ Think about the lesson Jesus is trying to teach. ” In the case of Hinduism, the use of might introduces uncertainty in the minds of students. Whereas, the presence of will in the words of Jesus is affirmative. Furthermore, students can sum up the teachings of Gita in their own words , but they are given direct instructions of what to note and think about Jesus’ teachings . In order to present a balanced and unbiased view of Hinduism to the student, the material should be treated with the same	Substitute new language as directed. “Krishna” and “Arjuna” are appropriate.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: The substitute language is an improvement and meets the requirements of the California state standards.</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	<p>affirmative statements used for Judeo-Christian religions.</p> <p>The sentence could be written as follows: "Lord Krishn explains to Arjun how a soul can find peace and eternal happiness," and "Think about the meaning behind Lord Krishn's advice to Arjun."</p>		
15	<p>p. 162-165: Chandragupt is spelled incorrectly as "Candragupta" in these pages. One instance of "Chandra Gupta" (p. 169) is found.</p>	<p>Ensure consistency in spelling across section.</p>	<p>Retain final "a" in all names as currently written, i.e. Ashoka, etc. Use "Chandragupta"</p> <p>OK.</p>
16	<p>In this section the word gods is used in several instances. Furthermore, it describes the statues of gods. The word statue should be replaced with deity (meaning divinity or God). The discussion on word gods is mentioned in Section 6.5.3.</p>	<p>CDE: no page numbers were provided by the group, but see for example the citation for the picture on the top of page 168. Confirm with CRP that "deity" is appropriate. Statements like, "Many individual sculptures are images of important Hindu gods, like the deity of Vishnu above," might be confusing to students without context.</p>	<p>CRP: This text uses the terms "god" and "goddess" when discussing the religions of ancient Greece and Rome in respectful ways. There is no reason why a similar level of respect should not continue when using these terms in discussions of Hinduism. The term "deity" is always preferable, however. CDE: current text is acceptable.</p>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
18	Grade 6, p. 216: "Some researchers have developed the theory that sometime about 2000 to 1500 BC, a major river in India called the Saraswati dried up." The teacher's edition states, "For many years, the Saraswati River existed only in myth. Recently, however, scientists have traced its historic path and begun to unlock the secrets of its decline." The statement in the teacher's edition should replace the student's edition text.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: The drying up of the mighty Saraswati that once flowed from the mountains to the sea in c.2000 BC, is now a geological and scientific fact. The two versions need to be reconciled.</i>
19	Grade 6, p. 229: Under the title ' Aryan Beliefs and Brahmanism ,' "The early religion of the Aryans is now called Brahmanism , after the name of the Aryan priests, or Brahmans . The Aryans worshipped many gods . The Brahmans made sacrifices to those gods by offering animals to a sacred fire. Over time, the ceremonies became more and more complexThe rituals of the Aryan religion and many hymns to their gods are found in ancient Sanskrit texts called the Vedas ." Spelling errors: The spelling of 'Brahmans' in the text that of 'Brahmana' and in the pyramid figure of caste system. Brahmin is the correct spelling for this <i>varn</i> .	Correct the spelling error throughout.	Retain "brahman" throughout. OK
20	Grade 6, p. 231: Internet Activity – "Use the Internet to learn about Hindu customs concerning one of these topics : the Ganges River, cows, funerals, diet." The book directs the student to learn more about such non-illuminating topics as those listed above. For example, the text could have asked the student to learn about <i>ahimsa</i> (non-violence), and how it is practiced in daily life, to discover why Hindus practice vegetarianism, or to learn more	Existing passage is not inaccurate.	Do not change original text.

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	about <i>ayurved</i> , the ancient and advanced system of medicine which is still the most popular form of medical care in India today.		
21	Grade 6, p. 229: "Indian society divides itself into a complex structure of social classes based particularly on jobs. This class structure is called the caste system ." This sentence, written in the present tense in a textbook describing ancient history, is out of place. It presumes that the caste system is present in India today. According to the Indian Constitution, under the section, Fundamental Rights, the Right to Equality is guaranteed to all citizens, just as the U.S. has enacted Equal Employment Opportunity Laws to prevent discrimination.	Change "divides" to "divided."	Do not change original text, except as follows: "Indian society was and still is divided into a complex structure of social classes based particularly on jobs. This class structure is called the caste system." OK
22	Grade 7, p. R66: "Hinduism...developed out of the rituals and philosophy set forth in many ancient sacred texts....Many Hindus worship Brahman in the form of other gods and divine beings. They believe that these gods can grant followers wisdom...But, above all, Hindus believe that their faith can liberate their souls...Once free, their souls can achieve a heavenlike state of bliss – the ultimate goal of Hinduism." Rewrite this introductory passage as follows, "Hinduism is one of the oldest religions in the world. It developed in India thousands of years ago. The beliefs of Hinduism are based on the teachings of ancient sacred texts such as the Vedas or the Bhagvad Gita. Hindus believe that everything in the world is a power of God and that the many forms of God represent His various powers. This is why Hindus worship God in many forms. Hindus	Extensive editing would constitute a content change.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee, and do not change original text.

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	believe that the hope of finding perfect happiness in the world is an illusion and that an individual experiences only temporary happiness in the world. According to Hindu scriptures, the perfect happiness that people are searching for lies only in God. So God realization is the ultimate goal in Hinduism.”		
24	p. R66: “They also keep jars of the river’s water in their homes to bless the dead and the dying .” This statement has no basis and should be removed. A description of a Hindu festival such as Diwali or worship at a Hindu temple would be a suitable replacement in order to present Hinduism with the same favorable treatment as Judeo-Christian religions.	Delete statement. An alternative description would constitute a content addition.	Do not change original text.
25	p. R66: “Today, many gurus reach their followers through Internet sites that broadcast their sermons and songs .” Replace with “...broadcast their teachings.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text <i>Disagree: Teaching is a better substitute for sermons in the context of Hinduism.</i>
26	p. R67: Rewrite the caption to read, “When Hindus worship God in a female form, they refer to her as Goddess. Shown below is one form of Goddess called Lakshmi.”	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
27	p. R67: Rewrite Symbol description as follows, “The syllable <i>Om</i> (or <i>Aum</i>) is often recited at the beginning of Hindu prayers. <i>Om</i> is the most sacred sound in Hinduism because it is believed to contain all other sounds. The syllable is represented by the symbol shown below.”	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
28	p. R67: Rewrite the Primary source interpretation as follows, “Yet, my dear boy, from a subtle essence which one cannot see, this great fig tree has grown. Have faith, my dear, for that	Revise passage as directed. Replacing with a new passage would	The suggested wording from the Group’s edit seems to be a completely different passage from the one in the text. Do not

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	subtle essence is the soul which is a power of God, the Soul of the whole universe. <i>You</i> are a soul.” Even with a rewrite, it may be difficult for students at this level to understand the science of soul. The passage should be replaced with a passage from the Gita that teaches Hindu beliefs in simple terms.	would constitute a content change.	one in the text. Do not change original text.
29	p. R76: Replace “no one founder” with “no founder.”	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
30	p. R76: “The soul never dies but is continually reborn until it becomes enlightened.” Replace “enlightened” with “God realized.”	Approve edit as written.	The Group is attempting to replace the language with a term from more recent devotional, theistic paths. This is a major content innovation. Change only “enlightened” to “released”. <i>Hinduism in practice has been predominantly devotional and theistic for the last 1500, if not 2000, years. The edit change reflects it.</i>
31	p. R76: “Persons achieve happiness and enlightenment after they free themselves from their earthly desires.” Replace with “Persons achieve perfect happiness only after God realization.”	Approve edit as written.	As in the comments on 30 above, do not change original text.
32	p. R76: “Freedom from earthly desires comes from many lifetimes of worship, knowledge, and virtuous acts. Replace with “God realization is achieved through continuous practice of loving and surrendering to God and receiving His Grace upon complete surrender.”	Approve edit as written.	As in the comments on 30 and 31 above, do not change original text.

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
34	Grade 6, page 123: "The first walled towns appeared on the Indian subcontinent in about 2500 B.C.E." Replace "The first" with "ancient" or "early".	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text, except substitution of "2600" for "2500" <i>OK but replace first with 'early'.</i>
35	Grade 6, page 129: "A wide variety of fish live in the river. Fish and shrimp are caught to sell or eat." This statement is irrelevant and out of context. It should be removed.	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
36	Grade 6, page 131: "India's first settlers lived among the Indus..." Replace "first" with "ancient" or "early".	Approve edit as written.	India's first settlers lived all over the subcontinent many thousands of years ago. Replace "first settlers" with "early townspeople". <i>OK</i>
37	Grade 6, page 133: "You learned that the first settlements..." Replace "first" with "ancient" or "early".	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
38	p. 144: "Around 1500 BCE, invaders called Aryans conquered northern India. Some historians credit the Aryans with bringing Hinduism to India." p. 144: "Most likely, Hinduism is a blend of Aryan beliefs and the beliefs of the people they conquered . Early Aryan religion is called Vedism , after the Vedas." Both statements should be deleted from the text.	CDE: consult with CRP; text does highlight debate over origins of Hinduism and disagreement among historians.	Edits suggested for HEF edits #90-92 (i.e. using terminology of "migration" rather than "conquest" or "invasion") above should clear up these problems. <i>Disagree: Migration is a substitute for Invasion. The text needs to change and reflect the conflict of opinion and interpretation.</i>
39	p. 143: "Hinduism...has affected how people worship, what jobs they do ,... And it has helped to determine the status of people in Indian society." Remove.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: The process is a complex one. Hinduism does not prescribe a deterministic way of</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
			<i>life.</i>
40	p. 143: "Dharma stands for law, obligation, and duty." Replace with " <i>Dharm</i> means actions, thoughts and practices that promote happiness in the world and ensure God realization."	CRP confirmed that "dharma" is acceptable. Otherwise, apply the listed correction.	Do not change original text. See comment on Vedic Foundation suggestions #30 above OK.
41	p. 143: "One of the most famous Hindu stories is the <i>Ramayana</i> . The <i>Ramayana</i> tells about life in ancient India and offers models in dharma." Replace with "...Hindu scriptures is the <i>Ramayana</i> . The <i>Ramayana</i> describes the divine actions of Bhagwan Ram when he appeared in ancient India. Through His righteous living He set an example of how to live by dharm."	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. Disagree: Millions of Hindus regard Ramayana as a scripture similar to the Bible. The edit conveys religious sentiment and ethical commitment.
42	p. 143: Paragraph beginning "The hero of the <i>Ramayana</i> , Rama, lives his whole life by the rules of dharma." Remove.	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
43	p. 143: "...you'll learn about dharma and the other basic Hindu beliefs: Brahman, multiple gods , karma, and samsara." Replace with "...Hindu beliefs: Bhagwan, Forms of God, karma and <i>maya</i> ."	CDE: are Bhagwan and maya explained in the text? If group's edit introduces new terminology without context, this may be confusing for students.	Do not change original text. See comment on Vedic Foundation suggestions #30 above. OK
44	p. 144: "The Vedas are a large collection of sacred songs, poems ,..." Replace with "The Vedas are a collection of sacred verses, hymns, prayers, and teachings..."	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee. See comments for HEF edit #92 above.
45	p. 144: Paragraph beginning "Vedic rituals and sacrifices honored a	CDE: does the removal of this	Change first sentence as follows: "Vedic rituals and

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	number of gods associated with nature . A class of priests... only they knew...became the dominant class in India. Later Vedism is often called Brahmanism ." Remove.	passage limit understanding of this chapter? Consult with CRP.	sacrifices honored a number of gods associated with nature and social order." OK
46	p. 144: "Modern day Hinduism is very complex . Many beliefs , many forms of worship, and many gods exist side by side." Remove.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>The sentence is misleading since many deities are different forms of the One God, a meaning not at all conveyed. So either improve or delete.</i>
47	p. 146: " <i>Brahman</i> is the Hindu name for a supreme power or a divine force , that is greater than all the other gods ." Replace with " <i>Bhagwan</i> is a word for God in Hinduism."	CDE: consult with CRP as to which is more appropriate term.	Do not change original text. See comment on Vedic Foundation suggestion #30 above OK
48	p. 146: "To Hindus, only Brahman exists forever." Inaccurate. Souls and <i>maya</i> (cosmic manifestation, material world) are also eternal existences. Remove the word 'only' and replace Brahman with God.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. See comment on Vedic Foundation suggestion #30 above <i>Disagree: The edit is correct and complements contrary positions.</i>
49	p. 146: "Hinduism sees time going around in a circle,... The same events return...follows winter" Remove.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. Disagree: <i>Either delete or improve the sentence since Hindus have both cyclical and linear concepts of time.</i>
50	p. 146: "Hindus believe Brahman is ...cycle never ends." Replace with "Hindus believe God creates, dissolves, and re-creates the universe in a never-	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text <i>Disagree: The edit</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	ending cycle. Hindus refer to this cycle of creation and dissolution as <i>Sanatan</i> , something that does not have a beginning or an end.”		<i>corrects the simplistic statement of the text and conforms to the textual meaning and popular beliefs.</i>
51	p. 146: “According to Hindu belief, everything in the world is a part of Brahman...It is a part of Brahman...” Replace ‘a part’ with ‘the power’ and ‘Brahman’ with ‘God’.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. OK
52	p. 146: “Through their own souls, people are connected to Brahman. The other gods and goddesses in Hinduism...” Replace connected with related and Brahman with God.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text.
53	p. 146: “To connect with their gods , ancient Hindus...” Replace with “To worship God, ancient...”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text.
54	p. 146: “...show gods and goddesses from popular Hindu stories .” Replace with “...show various forms of God from Hindu scriptures.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: Edit is an improvement as well as an authentic interpretation.</i>
55	p. 146: “Modern Hindus continue to visit temples to express their love of the gods .” Replace with “...visit temples to worship and express their love for God.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: Edit is an improvement and it is correct.</i>
56	p. 146: The photograph should be replaced with one of hundreds of beautiful Hindu temples with a caption “Modern Hindus visit temples such as this to worship God.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original photo.
57	p. 147: The heading “Hindu Beliefs About Multiple Gods”. Replace with “Hindu Beliefs About Various Forms of God.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: The edit is theologically correct as well as warranted by popular beliefs and</i>

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
			<i>practices.</i>
58	p. 147: Paragraph beginning “There are many gods and goddesses ...quality of Brahman.” Replace with “Hindu scriptures describe that God represents the various aspects of His unlimited blissful personality through many forms.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: see the previous note. One of the early names of the God is Sachchid-ananda</i>
59	p. 148: “Dharma is a very important idea in Hinduism.” Replace idea with belief.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. OK
60	p. 148: “Dharma stands for law, obligation, and duty.” Replace with “ <i>Dharm</i> means actions, thoughts and practices that promote happiness in the world and ensure God realization.”	CRP confirmed that “dharma” is acceptable; otherwise change passage as directed.	Do not change original text. OK
61	p. 148: “As you have already read, in the Vedas... duties. These duties usually involved a certain type...Each class ...” Replace with “The Vedas describe four categories of society in four <i>varnas</i> . Each category was involved in a certain type... Each category...”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. OK
62	p. 148: “Hindus believed...dharma of their class, society would be in harmony.” Replace class with <i>varna</i> .	Approve edit as written.	Approve edit of Ad Hoc Committee.
63	p. 148: Paragraph beginning “In addition to the dharma of their class ,...For example, Hinduism values...” Replace class with <i>varna</i> ,... “For example, Hindus value marriage, helping others in need and respecting and caring for their elders.” Add to this paragraph “Above all <i>varna dharm</i> , Hindus believe in following the most important dharm by lovingly worshipping God in order to achieve their ultimate goal of God realization.”	Approve edit as written. CRP confirmed that “dharma” is acceptable.	Change “class” to “varna”. Do not insert any additional textual changes. This change repeats change done in # 62. OK

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
64	p. 148: "Hindus believe that all life is connected, so part of ...people or animals." Replace with "Hindus believe that all life forms have a soul, so Hindus respect all forms of life and avoid doing harm to them."	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text.
65	p. 148: Passage beginning "This reverence for life...feed people who were starving." Remove or revise per following: It is stated earlier that Hindus respect all life forms so there is no reason to single out cows. Because of their importance in Indian agricultural life, cows were and continue to be loved as part of the family just as pet dogs are loved in Western society. It does not mean that cows are sacred ; they are simply loved and respected in India.	CDE: Develop exact language in consultation with CRP.	Do not change original text.
66	p. 148: "They were used for transportation." Remove. Bulls were used for transportation, not cows.	Approve edit as written.	Change "cows" to "cattle" in this paragraph.
67	p. 148: "Because cows were viewed...feed people who were starving." Remove.	Overlaps with edit #67 above.	Do not change original text.
68	p. 148: Remove the picture and caption. It is a random photograph that is not representative of reality. Cows aren't allowed to just help themselves otherwise they would be healthy and not skinny as the cow shown in the picture. To suit the theme, a beautiful picture of Lord Krishn or Lord Ram would be much more appropriate.	Approve edit as written.	Replace the cow picture with one showing a major festival. One could use Dusserah in Calcutta (or Kathmandu), the Jagannath chariot procession in Puri, the Ganesha festival in Pune, Pongal in Tamil Nadu, etc. <i>OK: Excellent suggestion</i>
69	p. 149: "The idea of dharma...Another idea , <i>karma</i> , explains why living well is important." Replace with "The belief of dharm...Another belief, <i>karm</i> , explains the importance of living	CRP confirmed that "karma" and "dharma" are acceptable.	Agree with retention of "karma", "dharma", etc. OK

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
	according to dharm.”		
70	p. 149: “From ancient times, Hindus believed that souls had many lives .” Replace with “Hindus believe that souls have had uncountable lives.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. OK
71	p. 149: Replace photograph with one having a temple in the background. This photo is of a mosque.	Replace photo or crop out the mosque in the background.	The building in the background is the Taj Mahal in Agra, which is flanked by two mosques. Publisher must find a better, close-up photograph of a sannyasin (See p. 151 of the book).
72	p. 151: “...devote their entire lives to uniting with Brahman.” Replace “...devote their entire lives to attaining God realization.”	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Disagree: Edit is extremely helpful for understanding the goal of life-long devotion. It is consistent with religious beliefs and practices.</i>
73	p. 151: “They useto focus on Brahman .” Replace Brahman with God.	Approve edit as written.	Do not change original text. <i>Suggest adding Brahman/God uniformly in the entire text</i>
74	p. 151: “Yoga is a type of ...slow breathing.” Replace with “The word <i>yog</i> in Sanskrit language means to join. It means to join the mind in thoughts of God. Reference Master Document, Section 6.5.3 for a description of <i>yog</i> .”	May be confusing to students. Adding lengthy material from the Master Document would constitute a content change. Consult with CRP whether existing content	Do not change original text. OK

Number	Group's Edit/Correction	Ad Hoc Committee Action	CFIR/CRP Final Recommendation
		is inaccurate.	
75	p. 151: "They are belief in Brahman,...samsara." Replace with "Bhagwan, Forms of God, karma and <i>maya</i> ."	CDE: are Bhagwan and maya explained in the text? If group's edit introduces new terminology without context, this may be confusing for students.	Do not change original text. OK
76	p. 151: Photo caption – "A member of the Brahmin caste reads aloud from the sacred Vedas." Replace with "A ceremonial worship performed according to the Vedas."	Approve edit as written.	Change to "Fire sacrifice accompanied by reading from the Veda." OK
77	p. 173: "Sculptures created statues out of stone... Many of these statues portrayed the Buddha or Hindu gods ...A temple statue of Buddha." Statue is a derogatory word to describe a Hindu deity. Deity means divinity and aptly describes the Hindu conception of the representations of divinity.	CDE: consult with CRP to determine if "statue" should be replaced with "deity" throughout.	Do not change original text. OK