

MINUTES OF MEETING State Heritage Register Committee

Wednesday November 5th, 2008
Commencing at 9:30 am

Heritage Branch – Department of Planning
Heritage Branch Library
3 Marist Place
Parramatta



1.0 Attendance

PRESENT	Sharon Sullivan (Chair) Michael Clarke Jason Ardler Gabrielle Kibble Rosemary Annable Ross Fitzgerald Tina Jackson
----------------	--

APOLOGIES	Nil
------------------	-----

ALSO IN ATTENDANCE (Heritage Branch)	Cameron White Graham Williams Patricia Hale Lucy Moore Mary Ann Hamilton Tim Smith Stewart Watters
---	--

Opening – Welcome

The Chair opened the meeting at 9.30 am

2.0 Declarations of Interest

Nil

3.0 Confirmation of Minutes

It was brought to the Members notice that the previous meeting minutes made reference to the State Mine, Lithgow being of state significance rather than local significance.

At the meeting on the 6th August, the nomination of Auckland Garage, Manly was deferred for further research into the thematic study by Ian Kirk and Megan Martin. After the research

was conducted, the information was presented to the October meeting and the Committee recommended that the item was of local significance.

With these amendments, the minutes of the previous meeting of October 2008 were noted and adopted by the Committee.

4.0 Action Report

Cameron White updated members on several recent actions, noting that the Minister's approval of the Whites Creek Aqueduct curtilage variation had been gazetted.

Cameron White also advised members that it has been arranged for Mr Hector Abrahams Chair of the Religious Property Advisory Panel to address the Heritage Council at the December 2008 meeting.

The action report was noted and adopted by Committee Members. It was proposed that the Action Report could be simplified, with Liverpool Council's Action Report being suggested as a possible example. It was also suggested that only those items that required to be resubmitted to the Committee's attention be included in the Action Report.

5.0 Minutes, reports and matters arising from HC Advisory Panels

Nil

6.0 Presentations

Nil

7.0 State Heritage Register – Notice of intention to list - Draft Nominations

7.1 Draft Nominations for Review

The following five items for which draft nominations have been received were introduced by Lucy Moore.

Colinroobie, 1202 Pacific Highway, Pymble

Colinroobie is a large circa 1900 Queen Anne/Federation style residence. Its nomination is one of a number of nominations in the Ku-ring-gai Council area. The Committee was advised that Colinroobie is listed as a local heritage item on the Ku-ring-gai Local Environmental Plan and was nominated as a potential State item by the National Trust of Australia (NSW). The property is both individually listed and as part of an Urban Conservation Area by the National Trust in its listing system.

It was suggested and agreed by the Committee that nominations for items in the Ku-ring-gai Council area be grouped together for an overall review. A meeting with Ku-ring-gai Council on these nominations was also suggested.

Members considered that Colinroobie appeared to be of local significance.

Wivenhoe, Macquarie Grove Road, Camden

Members noted the information that Wivenhoe is an excellent surviving example of an early 19th century rural estate. The property includes the Regency-style villa, attributed to colonial architect John Verge, the villa garden and the Verge-attributed stables, which in itself is a rare example of an early colonial architect-designed estate building. As an ensemble these items are considered to be of State significance. Wivenhoe is also associated with Sir Charles Cowper, who served as Premier of NSW on five occasions and lived at the property from 1834-70, and the order of the Sisters of the Good Samaritan who continue to occupy the site after almost 100 years. The 1920s constructed chapel and orphanage and subsequent additions demonstrate the Sisters' occupation and use of the property to the present.

Members considered that Wivenhoe was of State heritage significance. It was noted that discussions with the Sisters of the Good Samaritan is required relating in particular to identifying an appropriate curtilage for the property that would recognise the ongoing use of the property by the Sisters of the Good Samaritan and possible site specific exemptions.

Temple Emanuel Synagogue and associated buildings, Ocean Street, Woollahra

Constructed in 1941, the Temple Emanuel Synagogue is an excellent and rare example of a religious building designed in the Modern style. It was designed by the noted Inter-War avant-garde architect Samuel Lipson and it is an early example of a synagogue in the Eastern suburbs of Sydney.

The Committee was advised that the owners do not support the listing proposal.

It was noted that the future use of the building as a place of Hebrew worship is in doubt and it would be appropriate to investigate exemptions applicable to the adaptive reuse of a religious building. It was agreed that it may be useful for the Chair of the Heritage Council to meet with the owners.

Evatt House, 51 Finlay Road, Warrawee

Constructed in 1959, this house was the first to be designed by Bruce Rickard for his family in Sydney. The design represents Rickard's application of organic architecture theory to the Australian bush landscape and the house played a significant role in launching his career and cementing the Sydney School architectural style in NSW.

Members considered that Evatt House was of State heritage significance.

Meadowvale, Appin Road, Campbelltown

Meadowvale is an early farm that forms an important estate along the significant, cultural landscape of Appin Road, Campbelltown. Constructed c1814-35, the general layout, configuration of farm buildings, setting and views on this site are still remarkably intact.

Members considered that Meadowvale was of potential State heritage significance. Further detailed history of the property is needed in the context of the Camden and Campbelltown vicinity to assist in assessing its significance.

Careel House, Whale Beach Road, Whale Beach

Mary-Ann Hamilton introduced the Careel House proposal and the following four items.

The Nomination was made by the Royal Australian Institute of Architects (RAIA).

The property is possibly of State heritage significance and is one of three surviving examples of Alexander Stewart Jolly's "organic" architecture set within a landscaped garden setting. It was built in 1934 and is constructed of natural rocks, boulders, timber and sandstone hewn from the site. It contains one of Jolly's distinctive and intricately designed and crafted stone fireplaces and inglenooks and innovative 'Hollywood' style fold out beds in the main living area.

The property owners have been advised of the nomination but their views are not currently known. Members considered Careel House was of State heritage Significance.

Glen Davis Shale Oil Works and Refinery

The Committee was advised that a listing consideration for the site could include the Shale Oil Works site, the Refinery site and the workers village. Such a listing would involve both private and Crown land in that the works site is in private ownership, with the former mine is within Crown land, whilst the sections of the village site is in both Crown and private ownership. Site owners have not been contacted to date and curtilage and site condition areas were yet to be fully investigated. It was noted that as the shale oil site was used during WWII consideration could be given to including the listing proposal in the WWII listing theme.

Members considered Glen Davis was of State heritage significance. It was agreed that listing issues for the site were potentially complex in view of the mixed site ownership, curtilage and the ruinous state of the site.

The Committee was advised that the Engineering Heritage Committee (EHC) had organised a site inspection for Saturday, 22 November 2008 and the invitation was extended to Heritage Council members to join the inspection.

Hillview, Bindogundra Road, Bindogundra near Parkes

The Hillview Homestead is highly intact representative example of a 1890s pise building and one of a diminishing number of pise buildings constructed before the turn of the 20th Century. The property has been owned by the White family since construction. The nomination for listing was made by the National Trust of Australia (NSW).

The Committee agreed that further investigation and comparative analysis was needed with other pise structures in NSW to better assess the significance of Hillview.

Parkes Radio Telescope, Newell Highway, near Parkes

It was noted by the Committee that 2009 is to be celebrated as the International Year of Astronomy and that this would form a focus of the National Trust of Australia heritage week events in 2009.

Members considered Parkes Radio Telescope to be of State heritage significance and that the nomination and listing proposal should be reviewed in conjunction with the Anglo-Australian Telescope, Siding Spring.

It was noted that the proposed State Heritage Register listing of the Parkes Radio Telescope would involve a State listing on Commonwealth land.

North Bourke Bridge, Mitchell Highway, Darling River, Bourke

The North Bourke Bridge is first of a pair of bridges with a central lifting span introduced in NSW to cater for the passage of paddle steamers and wool barges on NSW rivers. It is the only one of these two original lift bridges still surviving. Its significance is enhanced by association with important colonial bridge engineers, JH Daniels and EM De Burgh.

The bridge is now used as a pedestrian bridge, having been superseded by a new road bridge nearby. The owner of the bridge, Bourke Shire Council, which is responsible for maintenance, is supportive of the State Heritage register listing proposal. A suitable curtilage needs to be determined in negotiation with the Bourke Shire Council and the Roads and Traffic Authority.

Members considered North Bourke Bridge to be of State heritage significance, that the nomination should be considered in conjunction with other Bourke listings and further consultation with Bourke Council is required.

Hampden Bridge, Murrumbidgee River, Wagga Wagga

Patricia Hale addressed the Committee on the proposal for State Heritage Register listing of the Hampden Bridge.

The Hampden Bridge was built in 1895 and is a rare, early Allan truss bridge, of composite timber and iron construction. It is one of only 3 surviving overhead-braced Allan truss bridges remaining in NSW

The bridge is owned by Wagga Wagga City Council, which made a preliminary nomination for the bridge for SHR listing. A detailed nomination has yet to be completed by council.

The Hampden Bridge was previously nominated for SHR listing in 2004 by Engineering Heritage Committee as one of 15 engineering items submitted as part of the Engineering Heritage Database project grant. That nomination lapsed due to insufficient information.

The Hampden Bridge is no longer used for road traffic, having been replaced by a modern bridge.

The Hampden Bridge has deteriorated considerably in recent years. Wagga City Council is engaged in restoring the bridge to enable its use as a pedestrian and cyclist bridge.

The Committee was advised that Wagga City Council, in its proposal to restore the bridge, has proposed the total removal of deteriorated pedestrian walkway. It has been estimated that the walkway would require \$350,000 to restore to safe condition in a proposal that would provide the main bridge deck for pedestrian use. There is inconclusive evidence as to whether the walkway was part of the original bridge structure.

The Engineering Heritage Committee (EHC) has considered Council's request for the walkway removal. The EHC formed the view that the walkway is of lesser heritage significance than

other elements of the bridge and would involve a depletion of scarce restoration funds that would be better applied to the central features of the bridge. No objection was accordingly raised by the EHC to the walkway removal, provided appropriate recording is first undertaken. Heritage Branch has advised Council of its support of the EHC view.

The State Heritage Register Committee considered that Hampden Bridge is of State heritage significance and that listing action proceed.

Resolved

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

- 1. Advises the Heritage Branch about the likely level of heritage significance for each of the nominated items.**

8.0 State Heritage Register – Recommendations to Minister

Nil

9.0 State Government Heritage

9.1 Heritage Asset Management Strategies (HAMS) submitted for acceptance – Department of Education and Training and Parramatta Park Trust

Tim Smith advised the Committee that the HAMS document submitted by the Department of Education and Training at this stage represented a “snapshot” of the heritage building and property assets in the custodianship of the Department.

The Department of Education & Training HAMS was prepared in-house using elements of the Heritage Branch HAMS model. The HAMS is minimalistic, but incorporates a commitment to heritage conservation, minimum standards of maintenance and repair for the agency’s 8 SHR listed items, commitment to Burra Charter principles, and delivery of an initial S170 Heritage & Conservation Register by the December 2009 deadline. The Heritage Branch feels the content is sufficient to accept as a step by the agency in the right direction in embracing its heritage management responsibilities. The commitment by DET to engage with completion of a s170 Heritage & Conservation Register is noted, and welcomed.

The Parramatta Park Trust HAMS was submitted as a draft but is considered to meet the standard. The document was peer reviewed and prepared in consultation with staff of the Heritage Branch. The HAMS incorporates the major requirements of the State Agency Guide. It includes a staged completion for their heritage works program, particularly completion of S.170 Register by March 2009, ahead of the Dec 2009 deadline. A finalised s.170 Register is currently under development. The document clearly articulates the Parramatta Park Trust’s commitment to heritage management, TAM, s.170 of the Heritage Act 1977, and minimum standards for the SHR-listed precinct.

The State Heritage Register Committee agreed with the approach taken for both agencies and adopted the HAMS documents.

Resolved

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

- 1. accepts the two (2) tabled HAMS documents submitted by the Department of Education & Training (DET) and Parramatta Park Trust (PPT), in accordance with the State Owned Heritage Management Principles and Heritage Asset Management Guidelines, issued under Section 170A(3) of the Heritage Act, 1977;**
- 2. directs the Director, Heritage Branch, Department of Planning, write to those agencies advising of same, and noting identified editorial comments for inclusion in final documents, to the satisfaction of the Director (Annexure B).**
- 3. congratulates these agencies for their HAMS submission;**

9.2 Endorsement of the Australian Technology Park (ATP) s.170 Heritage & Conservation Register

Tim Smith tabled the ATP Heritage & Conservation Register at the meeting advised the Committee that it is the wish of the ATP to retain the bulk of the heritage assets. A proportion of the collection currently stored at the ATP site has originated at other former railway workshop sites.

The State Heritage Register Committee agreed with the approach taken and adopted the s.170 Register.

Resolved

That the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee:

- a. Endorses the current *Heritage and Conservation Register* prepared for the Australian Technology Park (ATP), dated September 2008, and subject to the conditions identified at Annexure A";**
- b. Notes the intent of ATP that the majority of the identified movable heritage collections be retained within the site and made available for future public interpretation;**
- c. Notes that the Machinery Collection specifically, is included in an existing State Heritage Register listing under the *Heritage Act*, but that 1999 listing did not specify any individual items, location or condition within ATPs holdings;**
- d. Supports, in principle, the proposed disposal strategy for those identified non-core or significant items;**
- e. Agrees that these items should be removed from the draft s170 Heritage and Conservation Register and be subject to a measured disposal program. That disposal program should be transparent; and**
- f. Writes to the Managing Director, Australian Technology Park (ATP), congratulating the entity on its initiatives in implementing key strategic heritage actions under the NSW *Heritage Act* 1977, and in its proposed approach to integrated heritage management.**

10.0 Interim Heritage Orders

Nil

11.0 Environmental Planning Instruments & Heritage Studies

Nil

12.0 Matters for Consideration

12.1 Heritage Agreements for Harrington Park and Orielton

Louise Thom introduced the issue of heritage agreement negotiations for Harrington Park and Orielton, both of which are in the ownership of Dandaloo Pty Ltd.

At its meetings of March 2004 and December 2005 the State Heritage Register Committee resolved to advise the Minister that, respectively, Orielton and Harrington Park are properties of State Heritage significance. At each of the above meetings the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee also directed the Heritage Branch to commence negotiations with the owner of Orielton and Harrington Park for the preparation of Heritage Agreements for each place in order to assist their long term conservation. The two properties were gazetted as State Heritage Register listed items on 22 December 2006.

Negotiations have since been undertaken with Harpak Developments Pty Ltd, which has acted on behalf of Dandaloo Pty Ltd, to ensure the conservation of the two colonial properties in association with subdivision of the former estates for residential development.

Resolved

That the Heritage Council:

- 1. In accordance with section 39 of the Heritage Act, recommend the Minister enter into the Heritage Agreements for Orielton and Harrington Park as amended according to the Legal Branch recommendations contained in Annexure D on condition that the owner must engage the heritage conservation architect appointed under section 4.1.5 of the Agreements to prepare conservation construction specifications for each property and to supervise their undertaking as part of the Conservation Works; and**
- 2. Recommend the owner engage a landscape conservation specialist to undertake Landscape Conservation Management Plans for Orielton and Harrington Park as specified in the Scope of Works and Landscape Specifications and undertake all work as specified.**
- 3. Bring to the attention of the owner their obligations under the Heritage Act 1977 for areas of archaeological significance as defined in the Orielton and Harrington Park Conservation Management Plans by Tropman and Tropman August 2006, during the undertaking of excavation and construction of the subdivision development.**
- 4. Recommend Camden Council amend Camden Development Control Plan 2006 to incorporate the Conservation Policy and recommendations regarding significant views, landscape features, archaeology and interpretation contained in the Conservation Management Plans for Harrington Park and Orielton by Tropman and Tropman Architects August 2006 for lands being developed under Camden LEP 138.**

13.0 General Business

13.1 Redstone (The Winter House), 34 Adderton Road, Dundas. Proposed SHR Curtilage

At the August 2008 the Committee agreed that the Walter Burley Griffin designed house Redstone is of State Heritage Significance and that the listing process should commence, under delegation.

Patricia Hale advised the committee that the public submission period for comment on the nomination commenced on 5 November for a period of 14 days. The timeframe will enable the SHR listing of Redstone to be considered by the Heritage Council at the 3 December 2008 meeting.

Members were advised that the family which owns the property is supportive of their late mother's wish for SHR listing and is eager for listing before they seek to sell the property. The Family has requested that the previously considered listing curtilage (of lot 7) be extended to include a triangular portion of the adjoining lot 8 which is also in the family's ownership and also proposed to be sold.

The basis of the curtilage extension is that the lot 7 boundary runs along the wall of the house's garage and would provide insufficient curtilage to protect the heritage significance of Redstone's eastern boundary.

The Committee viewed an aerial cadastral of lots 7 & 8 showing the revised curtilage for the listing proposal.

Resolved

The Committee concurred with the revised curtilage to include lot 7 and part of the adjoining portion of lot 8.

There being no further business the Chair closed the meeting closed at 11:45 am.

Next Meeting of the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee

Wednesday 3rd December 2008
Heritage Branch – Department of Planning
Heritage Branch Library
3 Marist Place
Parramatta

Minutes endorsed by the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee.	<hr/> Chair, State Heritage Register Committee Date:
--	---