UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

## NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES INVENTORY -- NOMINATION FORM

FOR NPS	USE OF	VLY	
RECEIVE	Q		

SEE	INSTRUCTIONS IN HOW T	<i>O COMPLETE NATIONA</i> COMPLETE APPLICABL		•
1 NAME	THE ALL LIVINGS	JOINT ELTE ALT ETOABLE	LUCUTONO	
HISTORIC	Grace Church			
AND/OR COMMON	Grace Gitureii			
2 LOCATIO	N			
STREET & NUMBER				
800 Broadwa	y (Broadway, Tenth and	Fourth Streets)	NOT FOR PUBLICATION	
CITY, TOWN	_		CONGRESSIONAL DISTR	СТ
OTATS.	New York	VICINITY OF CODE	18th	CODE
STATE	New York	CODE	COUNTY	CODE
CLASSIFI	CATION			
CATEGORY	OWNERCHIE	STATUS	DDEC	ENT LICE
CATEGORYDISTRICT		STATUS X_OCCUPIED		ENTUSE
$X_{\text{BUILDING(S)}}$	PUBLIC ${f X}$ PRIVATE	UNOCCUPIED	AGRICULTURE COMMERCIAL	MUSEUM PARK
STRUCTURE	BOTH	WORK IN PROGRESS	EDUCATIONAL	PRIVATE RESIDENCE
SITE	PUBLIC ACQUISITION	ACCESSIBLE	ENTERTAINMENT	X_RELIGIOUS
OBJECT	IN PROCESS	XYES: RESTRICTED	GOVERNMENT	SCIENTIFIC
	BEING CONSIDERED	YES: UNRESTRICTED	INDUSTRIAL	TRANSPORTATION
		NO	MILITARY	_OTHER.
OWNER C	F PROPERTY			
NAME	A TROLENT			
MAINE	Grace Church in New Y	ork, Mr. Karl L. D	owhic. Business N	Manager
STREET & NUMBER				
	802 Broadway			
CITY, TOWN			STATE	
	New York —	VICINITY OF	New York	10003
LOCATIO	N OF LEGAL DESCR	IPTION		
COURTHOUSE,				
REGISTRY OF DEED	S,ETC New York County	Hall of Records		
STREET & NUMBER				
CITY, TOWN	31 Chambers Street		STATE	
CITT, TOWN	New York		New York	
REPRESE	NTATION IN EXIST	ING SURVEYS	100 101K	
TITLE				
	New York City Landmar	ks Commission/Nation	onal Register	
DATE	•		TATE $X$ COUNTY LOCAL	
DEPOSITORY FOR	1966, 1974		= COUNTYLUCAL	
SURVEY RECORDS	305 Broadway			
CITY, TOWN			STATE	
	New York		New York	

### 7 DESCRIPTION

 $X_{GOOD}$  (houses)

\_\_FAIR

CONDITION

XEXCELLENT (church) \_\_DETERIORATED

\_\_RUINS

\_\_UNEXPOSED

**CHECK ONE** 

XALTERED

CHECK ONE

\_\_UNALTERED

XORIGINAL SITE

\_\_MOVED DATE\_\_\_\_\_

#### DESCRIBE THE PRESENT AND ORIGINAL (IF KNOWN) PHYSICAL APPEARANCE

Grace Church occupies the southern half of a long, narrow, trapezoidal block bounded by 10th, Fourth Avenue and Broadway, where Broadway turns and commences its westward slant across Manhattan. With its dramatic spire the church effectively dominates the northward vista at this turn in Broadway.

Constructed of marble, Grace Church (800 Broadway), is rectangular in plan, arranged behind a square tower set on the longitudinal axis. The main entrance, located at the base of the tower is surmounted by a gable and a rose-window followed, above the roof level, by the high traceried openings of the belfry. Rising above the belfry, the tower, embellished by corner pinnacles makes a transition from square to octagonal, terminating ultimately in a slender spire. The marble side walls of the nave consist of a rhythm of pointed-arch windows interspersed by buttresses surmounted by pinnacles. Behind the tower, a crenellated parapet forms the top of the church's bearing walls. The dramatically vertical, vaulted, interior space is adorned by 46 English stained glass windows of which the exceptionally large ones in the transcepts and over the altar are particularly striking.

Located immediately north of the church but recessed further on the lot, the essentially square Rectory (804 Broadway), despite the symmetry of its basic shape and its gables, owes its asymmetrical appearance to the differentiating treatment of bay windows. The ecclesiastical character of the church has been carried over into this residence in the use of pinnacled corner buttresses, gables ornamented by crockets and finials, pointed arch windows and fine tracery. Projecting forward to form a vestibule, the main entrance, located in the central bay of the west (front) elevation, is crowned by a richly decorated gable and flanked by pinnacled, miniature, corner buttresses.

The Chantry, adjoining the south elevation of the church, and Grace House, connecting the church with the Rectory on the north, are both irregularly shaped additions skillfully designed at a later date in the same style. The narrow front (west) elevation of Grace House, dominated by a spired 3-story projecting bay, blends so subtly into the asymmetrical pattern established in the Rectory that it appears to be inherently part of the residence.

This description was provided by Lynn A. Beebe, New York State, Division for Historic Preservation.

#### 8 SIGNIFICANCE

PERIOD	AF	REAS OF SIGNIFICANCE CH	IECK AND JUSTIFY BELOW	
PREHISTORIC	ARCHEOLOGY-PREHISTORIC	COMMUNITY PLANNING	LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTURE	X_RELIGION
1400-1499	ARCHEOLOGY-HISTORIC	CONSERVATION	LAW	SCIENCE
1500-1599	AGRICULTURE	ECONOMICS	LITERATURE	SCULPTURE
1600-1699	XARCHITECTURE	EDUCATION	MILITARY	SOCIAL/HUMANITARIAN
1700-1799	ART	ENGINEERING	MUSIC	THEATER
<u>X</u> 1800-1899	COMMERCE	EXPLORATION/SETTLEMENT	PHILOSOPHY	TRANSPORTATION
1900-	COMMUNICATIONS	INDUSTRY	POLITICS/GOVERNMENT	OTHER (SPECIFY)
		INVENTION		
SPECIFIC DAT	FS	BUILDER/ARCH	HITECT	
0. 20. 10 5/11	1843-1846		James Renwick.	Jr. (1818-1895)

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

Grace Church is the first masterpiece of James Renwick, Jr., who would become, after Richard Upjohn, one of the foremost practitioners of the Gothic Revival style. As the new Medievalism eclipsed the Greek mode James Renwick was creating Grace Church and then Saint Patrick's Cathedral--two of the most impressive examples of this mid-century style in America.

Renwick's reputation was firmly established with this commission when he was only 25 years old. English in taste, based on the theories and designs of A. W. Pugin, Grace reflected those high moral values so typical of a romantic era. One contemporary critic wrote of "the architecture of Christianity, the sublime, the glorious Gothic." Perhaps the purest expression of these theories was ecclesiastical, the churches made a valiant attempt at archaeological accuracy—the "Gothick" houses and castles with cusps, crockets and turrets were confections that no medieval man would ever recognize.

Writing in the North American Review in 1844, architect Arthur Gilman stated that Richard Upjohn's nearly completed Trinity Church "surpasses any church erected in England since the revival of the pointed style." Grace Church, began two years later on October 30, 1843, was under construction at the same time--in the opinion of contemporary Philip Hone destined to be "second only to the magnificent Trinity." According to historian Phoebe Stanton,

Comparison of the two shows how rapidly competence in the Gothic style developed in the United States, for even if the difference between the tastes and personal styles of Upjohn and Renwick are acknowledged, Grace Church is more tightly knit, uniform, and less dry than Trinity...(The) major difference between the two lies in the way in which Renwick developed the ornamental possibilities of the style and reduced the amount of inert masonry in the elevation. It is tempting to link Renwick's design with the drawing in (Pugin's book) True Principles, but, though there are similarities between them they are not as obvious as in the case of Trinity...Grace Church is...too brilliant and too free to derive its character solely from the Pugin illustration.

IStanton, Phoebe, The Gothic Revival and American Church Architecture, John Hopkins Press, Baltimore, p. 56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Hone, Philip, The Diary of Philip Hone 1828-1851, Dodd Mead & Co., N.Y. 1910, p. 252.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Stanton, pp. 65-68.

### 9 MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

(See continuation sheet).

10 GEOGRAPHICAL D  ACREAGE OF NOMINATED PROPERT  UTM REFERENCES		one acre	
A 1 18 5 8 5 2 0 d  ZONE EASTING C	NORTHING	D	EASTING NORTHING  Broadway; on the north by Lot 9
a/k/a Fourth Avenue), the Avenue South, a/k/a Fourt a/k/a Fourth Avenue); on the south-west corner; no west 152.8'.	e rear of the lot th Avenue) and Lo the south by Eas orth 240.4'; then	s of Grace ( ts 37-39 and t 10th Street east 150';	98 and 94 Park Avenue South, Church Houses (92, 90 and 88 Park d 41 (86, 84, 80-2 Park Avenue South et. Building lots, together, from then south approximately 245'; then
	COUNTIES FOR PROPERT	IES OVERLAPPIN	G STATE OR COUNTY BOUNDARIES
STATE	CODE	COUNTY	CODE
STATE	CODE	COUNTY	CODE
NAME/TITLE  Carolyn Pitts, Architector ORGANIZATION  National Park Service - STREET & NUMBER  1100 L Street, NW. CITY OR TOWN Washington, D. C.  12 STATE HISTORIC F	Historic Sites		TELEPHONE 202 523-5464 STATE
	ATED SIGNIFICANCE OF		
NATIONAL	STAT	E	LOCAL
_	nclusion in the National F the National Park Service.		eservation Act of 1966 (Public Law 89-665). I y that it has been evaluated according to the
TITLE			DATE
FOR NPS USE ONLY I HEREBY CERTIFY THAT THIS P	PROPERTY IS INCLUDED	IN THE NATIONAL	
DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF ARCHEO ATTEST:	LOGY AND HISTORIC PE	RESERVATION	DATE
KEEPER OF THE NATIONAL REG	SISTER		

Form No. 10-300a (Rev. 10-74)

### UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

# NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES INVENTORY -- NOMINATION FORM

FOR NPS	HCE	ONI	V			
i on in o	JUL	U112	•			
RECEIVE	)					
	*					
DATE EN						

2

PAGE

**CONTINUATION SHEET** 

ITEM NUMBER 8

In Stanton's opinion Grace Church is "less monumental than Trinity and more elegant in its wealth of decorative detail."

"Upjohn was a man of modest parentage, and his early training was as a cabinetmaker and as an apprentice in an English architect's office. Renwick, on the other hand, was the son of a Columbia College professor who had married into the Brevoort family, and, brought up in luxurious surroundings, he took the diversions of the rich for granted. His contemporary as an undergraduate at Columbia, George Templeton Strong, a remarkable diarist with a sharp eye for the arts and a sharper tongue, thought him the "most windy of all the bags of conceit and coxcombry that every dubbed themselves Architect." If St. Patrick's Cathedral is Renwick's most conspicuous ecclesiastical edifice, Grace Church in New York (it was completed when Renwick was only twenty-eight in 1846) is his most conspicuous architectural accomplishment, a moody and picturesque Gothic structure with a handsome parish house and rectory adjoining it. Most of Renwick's contemporaries were greatly impressed by it, though Mayor Hone was shocked at the prices for which pews were sold and the pew rents that (Owning a pew in those days was like owning a were charged. cooperative apartment now; a family paid for its pew and then had to pay the equivalent of "maintenance" to retain if for its private use.) "The new church at the head of Broadway is nearly finished and ready for consecration," Hone wrote in his diary.

This is to be a fashionable church, and already its aisles are filled...with gay parties of ladies in feathers and "mousseline-delaine dresses" and dandies with moustaches and high-heeled boots; the lofty arches resound with astute criticisms upon "Gothic architecture" from fair ladies who have had the advantage of foreign travel, and scientific remarks upon "acoustics" from elderly millionaires who do not hear quite as well as formerly.

(Continued)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Ibid., p. 60

Form No. 10-300a (Rev. 10-74)

### UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

### NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES INVENTORY -- NOMINATION FORM

	FOR NPS USE ONLY RECEIVED			
RECEIVED	RECEIVED	FOR NPS	USE ONLY	
RECEIVED	RECEIVED			
NECEIVED	RECEIVED	DECENTE	n	
		DECEIVE	U	

**CONTINUATION SHEET** 

**ITEM NUMBER** 

PAGE

3

There was a competition for Grace Church, though it appears that family position and favoritism got Renwick the job. His only qualifications as an architect were training as an engineer and employment on the building of the Erie Railroad and the Croton Aqueduct. He was, in a sense, part of the tradition of the gentleman amateurs who had built (or initiated) the buildings in the Nation's capital and the great mansions on the James. Strong, who could not find it in his heart to say a good word for Renwick, wrote of a conversation about Grace Church with its architect:

"If the infatuated monkey showed the slightest trace or germ of feeling for his art, one could pardon and pass over blunders and atrocities so gross as to be palpable even to my ignorance; but nature cut him out for a boss carpenter and the vanity and pretension that are endurable in an artist are not be endured in a mechanic, and especially not in one who is a mechanic in spite of his ennobling vocation, and degrades, vulgarizes, and pollutes every glorious idea of form of the successive eras of Christian art that he travesties and tampers with, as a sacrifice to the stolidity of building committees and his own love of fat jobs and profitable contracts.

He had many fat jobs. He designed hotels and stores, asylums and hospitals, apartment houses, row houses, and a workhouse for prisoners. He designed the main building for Vassar College, basing it on the Tuileries. But as a young man he was caught up in the prevailing romantic preoccupation with keeps and dungeons illuminated by flashes of lightning and ringing with the clash of sword on sheild."

Later in the century (1877-79) the property on the Fourth Avenue side was developed by Renwick's firm and after his death by the Architects Heins and LaFarge, who designed St. John the Divine. The structures included a Chantry (1879), Grace House (1880), Grace Memorial House (1882-83), Clergy House (1902), and a Choir School. History has been kinder to Renwick than his critics. Grace Church is as much a masterpiece as his Smithsonian Castle on the Mall in the Nation's capital.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

FOR NPS USE ONLY	
RECEIVED	
DATE ENTERED	

### NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES INVENTORY -- NOMINATION FORM

Grace Church

#### **CONTINUATION SHEET**

ITEM NUMBER 9

PAGE 1

- Andrews, Wayne. Architecture, Ambition and Americans: A Social History of American Architecture. New York: The Free Press, 1964.
- Hitchcock, Henry Russell. Architecture, Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries. Baltimore: Pugin, 1958.
- Hone, Philip. The Diary of Philip Hone, 1828-1851. Bayard Tuckerman, ed., New York: Dodd, Mead and Company, 1910.
- King's Handbook of New York City, 1893. New York: Benjamin Blom Inc., 1972 (Re-issue). pp. 248-350.
- Landmarks Designation Reports. New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission, 305 Broadway, New York, New York, 1966, 1974.
- Loth, Calder and Sadler, Julius. The Only Proper Style, New York Graphic Society, Boston, 1975.
- Lynes, Russell. The Art Makers of 19th Century America, Athenaeum, Boston, 1970.
- Stanton, Phoebe. The Gothic Revival and American Church Architecture: An Episode in Taste, 1840-1856. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1968.
- Whitney, Henry F. and Elsie Rathburn Whitney. <u>Biographical Dictionary of American Architects (Deceased)</u>. Los Angeles: Hennessey and <u>Ingalls</u>, Inc., 1970, pp. 501-502.

Form No. 10-300a (Rev. 10-74)

### UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

## NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES INVENTORY -- NOMINATION FORM

RECEIVED	FOR NPS	USE (	NLY			
	RECEIVE	D				
		TEREC				

**CONTINUATION SHEET** 

**ITEM NUMBER** 

**PAGE** 

#### Photographs and Their Descriptions

Location: Grace Church, New York, New York

Photo credit: Sidney Bradford, NPS; N. Y. Landmarks Commission

Photo description: 1. Side View

- 2. Same as above
- 3. Same as above
- 4. Same as above
- 5. Side windows
- 6. Front facade
- 7. Chancery-Grace House
- 8. Same as above
- 9. Same as above
- 10. Same as above
- 11. Same as above

