

Reactions to Labour Mobility in Small and Medium Organisations in Nigeria

Larry Izamoje

From DBA Thesis: Business School.Lausanne, Switzerland

E-mail: larry@brila.net

Abstract

This paper examines the causes, consequences and control of labour mobility in small and medium organisations (SMOs) in Nigeria, using a triangulation of quantitative and qualitative data with Rational Action and Work Adjustment Theories. Data were collected through administration of 500 copies of a structured questionnaire, 40 in-depth interviews and 10 focus group discussions in ten local government areas of Lagos State, Nigeria. Data from the questionnaire were subjected to descriptive and inferential statistics, while data from the in-depth interviews and focus group discussions were processed through content analysis. Findings revealed that the respondents' monthly income was relatively low, as their mean monthly income was ₦30, 103.50. Most of the respondents exhibited tendency towards labour mobility. More than half of the respondents mentioned their prior experience of labour mobility. A combination of several factors significantly predict tendency towards labour mobility among the respondents in SMOs. Higher salary and better positions elsewhere could motivate many workers to quit their jobs in SMOs in Nigeria. Employees in SMOs in Nigeria are generally less fulfilled due to poor reward systems. Employers of labour in small and medium organisations should therefore provide adequate rewards with enough opportunities for job enrichment.

Keywords: Informal Sector Organisations, Job Dissatisfaction, Labour, Nigeria, Turnover

1. Introduction

Labour mobility otherwise known as labour turnover or staff wastage is largely unavoidable in an organisation; it refers to voluntary resignation or involuntary loss of job. The persistence of labour mobility is disturbing employers in Nigeria, especially in small and medium organisations (SMOs). A typical Nigerian youth presently wants to get rich quick unlike the situation in the colonial era (1900-1960); this attitude appears to reinforce the incidence of labour mobility in SMOs. Decisions on labour mobility are usually based on subjective interpretation of a range of factors some of which are external to the workplace (Kirton and Greene, 2009). The external factors usually comprise the social environment, educational experiences, family responsibilities, religious beliefs and changing work values (Izamoje, 2011). Also, internal factors which have traditionally provided a basis for the incidence of labour mobility include job satisfaction, organisational commitment, age and tenure (García-Serrano, 2009). A combination of internal and external factors can provide impetus for adequate understanding of labour mobility in organisations.

As reported in the previous study by Chen (2003), labour mobility could depend on a number of factors such as age, ethnicity, gender, education, skill levels, seniority and industry. For instance, labour mobility among female employees would be expected to have quite different characteristics

from that of male employees due to family commitments, children and other social factors. Situational factors such as relationship with supervisor, work–family conflict and overall life satisfaction have also contributed to the explanation of sources and correlates of labour mobility (McDonald and Hite, 2005).

The influence of a plethora of factors on labour mobility has been demonstrated in literature but its persistence has not been adequately investigated (Palmer, 2009). Unfortunately, the menace of labour mobility remains astronomically high in various organisations in Nigeria, especially in SMOs, which are characterized by neglect and poor socio-economic conditions. Most SMOs are handicapped owing to low capacity for competition, inadequate resources and the top ten problems noted by Onugu (2005). The problems are paraphrased as follows: poor management, inadequate access to finance, inadequate infrastructure, failure of policies, bureaucracy, high taxes and levies, inadequate access to modern technology, unethical competition and poor marketing. Attempts to address these problems have been thwarted by the growing spate of labour mobility.

There is a general belief in Nigeria that working with multinationals is more rewarding than working in SMOs. Thus, SMOs in Nigeria appear to be incapable of attracting and retaining suitable personnel. In light of this situation, many SMOs in Nigeria recruit cheap labour, thereby building a foundation for poor performance and low productivity. Unfortunately, the interests of many employees are at variance with the expectations of their employers in SMOs in Nigeria. The mismatch between the interests of employees and expectations of their employers usually reflects in attitudes to work and the level of commitment of both parties. Employers in SMOs usually complain of their employees' lackadaisical attitudes to work, while their employees usually perceive their emoluments as inadequate, thereby providing a context for labour mobility (Izamoje, 2011). Essentially, labour mobility could be very costly for organisations, given the inevitability of expenses on recruitment, selection and training for replacement of ex-employees. Labour mobility could also have adverse effects on business opportunities and cost of production. Furthermore, labour mobility can adversely affect the motivation of existing employees and clienteles of the affected organisations. In this context, the reputation of the affected organisations could be at stake, thereby making it difficult for them to attract quality employees. This situation suggests the need for an empirical investigation on reactions to labour mobility in SMOs in Nigeria. The fact that labour mobility is an integral part of the process of career development underscores the relevance of an empirical study on the subject.

Added to the foregoing discussions is the fact that human attitude towards career development is changing. McDonald and Hite (2005) observed that individuals and organisations are viewing career development differently, thereby recognising the need to expand the frontiers of knowledge on emerging reactions to organisational issues such as labour mobility. Employers' failure to align employees' talents and strengths with strategic direction of an organisation may contribute to the growth of labour mobility. The alignment can be accomplished more effectively with knowledge of the rationale behind individuals' desire for career change.

The changing nature of career is recognized by employers who recruit individuals with attitudes that fit with the organisational culture (Palmer, 2009). Employers are also aware of the increasing freedom of choice among their employees, particularly those with rare skills. Adequate understanding of how and why career decisions are made would promote an organisation's ability to achieve its goals. However, it is usually difficult to predict the incidence of labour mobility in an organisation with diverse human resources. With careful use of data from empirical research, employers can grasp the circumstances in which labour mobility is likely to occur.

This study therefore examines reactions to labour mobility in SMOs in Nigeria, focusing on the following specific objectives: analysis of organisational commitment in relation to job enrichment, investigation of tendency towards labour mobility and discussion of strategies for ensuring job stability. These objectives are addressed in the light of this study, which proceeds from introduction to other sections.

2. Updates on Labour Mobility and SMOs

Labour mobility is a major attribute of work environment in Africa. The existence of labour mobility dates from antiquity and it has gathered momentum since the advent of industrial revolution, which reinforces radical changes in production techniques with far reaching implications for industries worldwide. African experience of the slave trade and industrial revolution coupled with urbanisation, colonialism and globalisation resulted in increase in the pace of labour mobility, which Olaniyan and Rashidi (2009) attributed to several pull and push factors including urbanisation, industrialisation, unemployment and poverty. Industrial revolution provides a basis for labour mobility, especially in the context of globalisation.

A report by Campbell (2007) showed that several workers from sub-Saharan Africa relocated to Ghana due to its political independence from Britain in 1957 and economic prosperity in the 1960s. Most of the workers were however evicted from Ghana in 1969 as a result of economic downturn in the country. The evicted migrant workers and some Ghanaians were employed in Nigeria in the 1970s, a period of the Nigerian oil boom and economic prosperity during which the demand for skilled workers exceeded their supply. That period was followed by economic recession and political instability in the 1980s. Many organisations especially SMOs in Nigeria have witnessed a large number of cases of labour mobility, particularly since the 1990s, following Nigeria's return to multi-party democracy with implementation of neoliberal reforms.

The outcomes of labour mobility are diverse ranging from positive to negative outcomes depending on specific experience of individuals and organisations. Campbell (2007) recalled that some workers in Ghana and Nigeria had bitter experience in 1969 and 1983 respectively. The Ghanaian government expelled about 2 million workers including over 1 million Nigerians in 1969 following the enactment of Aliens Compliance Order occasioned by economic predicaments and increasing crimes in Ghana. Similarly, as a result of adverse effects of economic recession in Nigeria, the Nigerian government enacted an Act to expel migrant workers including over 1 million Ghanaians from the country in the early 1980s.

The incidence of labour mobility has skyrocketed among SMOs in Nigeria especially with the development of an urban-based economy and increasing dependence on wage employment. There is no universally acceptable definition for SMOs. The Nigerian National Council of Industries defines SMOs as business enterprises whose total costs excluding land is not more than two hundred million naira (₦200, 000,000.00) and/or a staff strength of not more than two hundred (200) full-time workers and/or with an annual turnover of not more than twenty million naira (₦20,000,000.00) (Onugu, 2005). SMOs in Nigeria largely revolve around one person or family, thereby operating as sole proprietorships or partnerships, although they may be registered as limited liability companies (Izamoje, 2011).

The domain of SMOs in Nigeria largely lies in the informal economy, which has gained international recognition since the 1970s. SMOs contribute to the growth of labour force worldwide. Over 80 percent of job creation in Latin America occurred in SMOs during the 1980s and 1990s. However, the majority of the workers in SMOs are affected by unfavourable work environment and this explains their experience of high incidence of labour mobility. The domain of SMOs in Nigeria largely lies in the informal sector, which has gained international recognition since the 1970s. This sector is widely used in all countries but there is no universal consensus on its definition. Its use has different connotations or nuances. The concept of informal sector was modified and christened "the informal economy" during the ILO Resolution in 2002 where it was described as all economic activities not covered or insufficiently covered by formal arrangements. An earlier official description of informal sector as economic activities which are carried out outside the institutionalised economic structures was recorded in paragraph 27 of the ILO Employment Policy Recommendation 169 of 1984 (Daza, 2005).

The experience of successful SMOs shows that the state plays an extensive role in the provision of infrastructure, business services, technical upgrading and export assistance (Deyo *et al.*, 2001). In

her study of SMOs in Nigeria, Meagher (2007) also recognised the role of the state in catalysing co-operation in times of economic stress, providing infrastructural and technical support for small firms development, and fostering optimal linkages with national and global production systems. Meagher (2007) discovered a state of precipitous decline in the SMOs under her study, showing high magnitude of labour mobility in the SMOs.

There is general agreement among scholars that SMOs have contributed immensely to socio-economic development across the world (Martinez-Costa and Jimenez-Jimenez, 2009; Ekanem and Smallbone, 2007; Miller et al, 2007; Onugu, 2005). Unfortunately, most SMOs in Nigeria face some setbacks such as inadequate resources and low capacities for competition. Martinez-Costa and Jimenez-Jimenez (2009) argued that SMOs have to compete with fewer resources to survive. Nigeria's governments have not provided adequate infrastructure and social welfare that would promote SMOs in the country as inadequate supply of electricity and regular power outages lasting for days, weeks and months in some cases remain unabated. Many SMOs have embarked on private arrangement for alternative sources of power generation, which raises costs of production and lower the quality of production (Akinwale, 2010).

3. Theoretical Framework

A theory is a set of ideas that provides an explanation for a phenomenon. However, the ideas in a single theory cannot explain everything, hence the need for a combination of theories to capture the nuances of a social reality. This study is anchored on two theories, namely Rational Action Theory (RAT) and Work Adjustment Theory (WAT). RAT provides a basis for the explanation of an individual's ability to make informed decision in a given situation. This theory assumes that individuals are independent in any decision-making process. The theory is popular in the social sciences (SurrIDGE, 2005). It is a micro-theory which describes individuals as rational actors with abilities to act in different ways in managing the constraints and opportunities that may face them.

Within the context of RAT, labour mobility could be described as a voluntary action, based on the appreciation of some better chances for survival or self-advancement. Thus, in light of labour mobility, workers can calculate rationally their chances and benefits within various sectors of modern organisations. Some workers may decide to change jobs in cities at the expense of the work they might otherwise have pursued within their traditional occupations. Similarly, WAT focuses on issues associated with work including choice of a career, job stability, career progression, employee performance, and job satisfaction. WAT was developed at the University of Minnesota since 1964 and has resulted in the popularity of the Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire (MSQ), the Minnesota Satisfactoriness Scales (MSS), the Minnesota Importance Scales (MIS), and the Minnesota Job Description Questionnaire (MJDQ). These scales have been used to measure different aspect of work and employees behaviour in an organisation (Dawis et al, 1968).

As argued in WAT, satisfaction is central to work adjustment. Dawis and Lofquist (1984: 237) stated that work adjustment is a "continuous and dynamic process by which a worker seeks to achieve and maintain correspondence with a work environment." Therefore, a dimension of satisfaction is realized when both the employee and employer are satisfied with employee's performance. In other words, satisfaction is the extent that an individual's needs are met through work and that the employer evaluates the individual's performance as meeting the needs of the workplace.

4. Hypotheses

In light of gaps indentified in literature, the following hypotheses were presented and tested in this study.

H1: Job satisfaction and organisational commitment are significantly associated among employees in small and medium scale organisations.

H2: The higher the employees' level of job enrichment the higher their frequency of labour turnover

5. Research Method

This study is based on a survey research design, involving triangulation of qualitative and quantitative research techniques. Data were collected from employees and employers in selected SMOs in Lagos State, the commercial headquarters of Nigeria. A multi-stage sampling technique was adopted in the process of selecting the sample for this study. Only 10 local government areas (LGAs) were randomly selected from a list of 20 available LGAs in Lagos State. Two streets were randomly selected from each of the selected LGAs, while five SMOs were randomly selected from each of the selected streets. Five respondents were randomly selected from each of the selected SMOs. This process resulted in selection of 10 SMOs in each of the selected LGAs. In all, a total of 100 SMOs were selected with five respondents including four employees and an employer from each SMO. Thus, a total of 500 respondents including 400 employees and 100 employers or managers were selected across 10 LGAs, 20 streets and 100 SMOs in Lagos State.

Both secondary and primary instruments of data collection were used for the study. The secondary data were gathered from scholarly publications and other relevant records while the primary data were obtained through a structured questionnaire, 40 in-depth interviews and 10 focus group discussions. To establish its validity and reliability, the structured questionnaire was pretested for comprehension and clarity. A sample of 20 respondents was selected randomly from the study population for the pretest and the results of the pretest were based on an appropriate reliability coefficient. The study was guided by various ethical codes including honesty, beneficence, justice, safety, respect for persons, informed consent, anonymity, privacy and confidentiality. Data from the structured questionnaire were subjected to descriptive and inferential statistical techniques, while the analysis of interviews and focus discussion was based on content analysis.

6. Findings and Discussions

Findings are presented in line with the study objectives and hypotheses for clarity. The presentation commenced from analysis of backgrounds of the respondents in the selected SMOs in Nigeria. The backgrounds of the respondents could provide a basis for analysis of labour mobility and other substantive findings of the study. Necessary inferences were drawn from some of the findings in conjunction with the theoretical framework of the study, while observed similarities and differences between this study and extant literature were reconciled appropriately.

6.1. Backgrounds of the Respondents

The backgrounds of the respondents are presented in Table 1. The male respondents were 11.8% more than the female respondents. The educational qualifications of the respondents were relatively low. Only 38.9% had completed secondary schools. This group was followed by 28.2% with either the Ordinary National Diploma (OND) or the National Certificate of Education (NCE). This implies that individuals with higher education may not seek employment in SMOs. Contrary to popular perception in Nigeria, the importance of SMOs has been recognised by various international organisations such as the World Bank, the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and the United Nations (Painter-Morland and Spence, 2009). The mean age of the respondents was 27.1 years with Standard Deviation of 4.1 years. This implies that the majority of the respondents were relatively young. Specifically, 63.0% of the respondents disclosed that they were in the age brackets of 16-25 years, while the remaining 37.0% were in the middle age categories. This finding is a pointer on the analysis of labour mobility in the selected SMOs in Nigeria.

Regarding the current working experience of the respondents, those who indicated that they had currently worked for up to five years constitute the majority (76.4%) followed by those who indicated that they had currently worked for up to ten years (18.0%). However, the proportions of the respondents with longer current working experience (3.7% and 1.9%) constitute a significant minority. The Mean current working experience was 6.6 years with 3.2 years as Standard Deviation. The relatively low current working experience was attributed to several factors such as the relatively young age of most of the respondents, struggle for higher education and high rate of labour mobility.

Data on employment status of the respondents showed that over two-third of the respondents were employees, while 11.4% were supervisors. Also, employers constitute 19.0%. This finding reflects the reality in the selected SMOs in Nigeria where employees greatly outnumbered their employers or employers' representatives such as supervisors. The clear significant disparities found in the respondents' employment status are not far from expectation.

The respondents' monthly income ranged from ₦10, 000.00 to over ₦80, 000.00. Most of the respondents (83.5%) mentioned that their monthly income was within ₦10, 000.00 to ₦40, 000.00. Only 16.5% of the respondents were identified with a relatively higher monthly income ranging from ₦50, 000.00 to over ₦80, 000.00. The Mean monthly income was ₦30, 103.50, while the Standard Deviation was ₦19, 806.90. However, given the relatively high cost of living in the study areas of Lagos State, all categories of the respondents' monthly income are relatively low. The cost of living on the Lagos Island is generally more expensive compared to that of the Lagos Mainland. The majority of political leaders, bureaucrats and other high income groups in Lagos State live in Lagos Island and its environs, while the majority of low income groups in Lagos State live on the mainland areas.

Table 1 depicts that more than half of the respondents (56.1%) mentioned that they had up to five dependants despite their relatively low level of monthly income and long daily working hours. Only 38.1% of the respondents mentioned that they did not have any dependant. The average number of dependants among the respondents was 1.9 while the Standard Deviation was 2. This finding reflects the continued relevance of extended family in Nigeria where workers are expected to assist their immediate or distant relatives.

Table 1: Backgrounds of the Respondents

Backgrounds	Frequency N = 483	Percent (%)
Gender		
Female	213	44.1
Male	270	55.9
Education		
Primary	15	3.1
Secondary	188	38.9
Diploma/Technical	136	28.2
University Degree/Higher Diploma	117	24.2
Masters	27	5.6
Age (Years)		
16 – 20	37	7.7
21 – 25	267	55.3
26 – 30	134	27.7
31 – 35	35	7.2
36 and Above	10	2.1
Current Working Experience (Years)		
0-5	369	76.4
10-Jun	87	18
15-Nov	18	3.7
16-20	9	1.9

Table 1: Backgrounds of the Respondents - continued

Employment Status		
Employer	92	19
Supervisor	55	11.4
Employee	336	69.6
Monthly Income (₦)		
10000 – 19000	93	19.3
20000 – 29000	184	38.1
30000 – 39000	51	10.6
40000 – 49000	75	15.5
50000 – 59000	22	4.6
60000 – 69000	14	2.9
70000 – 79000	6	1.2
80000 and Above	38	7.9
Number of Dependants		
None	184	38.1
1 – 5	271	56.1
10-Jun	28	5.8

6.2. Tendency Towards Labour Mobility in SMOs

Various dimensions of labour mobility are outlined in Table 2. Most of the respondents (74.9%) declared that they would embrace an opportunity to quit their jobs if such opportunity could translate into higher salary for them. Similarly, 71.8% of the respondents indicated they would quit their jobs to accept higher positions elsewhere if they had the opportunity to do so. This implies that either higher salary or better positions could motivate many workers to embrace labour mobility in the selected SMOs in Nigeria.

Most of the selected SMOs in Nigeria had records of labour mobility as demonstrated by 66.9% of the respondents, indicating that labour mobility is not far from expectation in the study area. Practically, 63.8% of the respondents clearly expressed their intention to quit their jobs in the selected SMOs in Nigeria due to various reasons including biting socio-economic conditions and inadequate opportunities for job enrichment in Nigeria. High magnitude of the respondents (62.7%) strongly believed that labour mobility could be attributed to monetary reasons. This finding points to the Theory of Rational Action, indicating the possibility of labour mobility in the context of opportunity for earning higher salary, which could enable the affected worker to acquire higher socio-economic status in the society.

The actual experience of labour turnover was moderate, as only 56.3% of the respondents disclosed their experience of labour mobility since the beginning of their career. More than half of the respondents (55.7%) reported their prior experience of labour mobility. In the course of interaction among the respondents in the selected SMOs in Nigeria, 54.2% revealed their awareness of labour turnover mobility among their colleagues in the same organisations. However, some respondents (40.2% and 27.1%) expressed low level of accessibility to income generating opportunities outside the selected SMOs in Nigeria. In the light of an overall picture of the dimensions of the labour mobility in the selected SMOs in Nigeria, it is evident that most of the respondents (74.7%) demonstrated tendency towards labour mobility.

Table 2: Tendency towards labour mobility among the respondents in SMOs

Labour Turnover Dimensions	Reaction (%)	
	N = 483	
	Yes	No
Labour Turnover Intention	63.8	36.2
Labour Turnover Prior Experience	56.3	43.7
Labour Turnover Frequency	55.7	44.3

Table 2: Tendency towards labour mobility among the respondents in SMOs - continued

Labour Turnover Given Higher Salary Elsewhere	74.9	25.1
Labour Turnover Given Higher Position Elsewhere	71.8	28.2
Labour Turnover for Monetary Reasons	62.7	37.3
Labour Turnover Records in the Organization	66.9	33.1
Labour Turnover Intention Awareness	54.2	45.8
Accessibility to Income Outside the Organization	40.2	59.8
Working Beyond the Organization	27.1	72.9

A number of factors that could affect the respondents' tendency towards labour mobility are presented in Tables 3 and 4, respectively. Employment status significantly associates with tendency towards labour mobility. Employees constitute the majority (71.2%) of the respondents who exhibited tendency towards labour mobility. In contrast, entrepreneurs constitute the least number (7.2%) of the respondents with tendency towards labour mobility.

Expectedly, working experience significantly associates with tendency towards labour mobility, as most of the respondents with tendency towards labour mobility had barely five years working experience in the selected SMOs. The fact that none of the respondents with over 20 years working experience exhibited tendency towards labour turnover reinforces the assumption that employees' tendency towards labour mobility is more likely to occur within the first ten years of their assumption of career responsibilities in an organisation. The above findings indicate that employees with low level of working experience have greater tendency towards labour mobility compared to other categories of workers in the SMOs.

Table 3: Cross Tabulation of Factors within Tendency Towards Labour Mobility

Factors	Tendency Towards Labour Mobility			
Employment Status	Yes	No	χ^2	Sig.
Entrepreneur	7.2	16.4	10.3	0.02
Manager	9.1	10.7		
Supervisor	12.5	8.2		
Employees	71.2	64.8		
Experience (Years)				
5-Jan	78.4	70.5	16.3	0.003
10-Jun	18.3	17.2		
15-Nov	2.5	7.4		
16-20	0.8	3.3		
21+	0	1.6		
Job Satisfaction				
Yes	36.3	49.2	6.3	0.01
No	63.7	50.8		
Moonlighting				
Yes	30.7	16.4	9.5	0.001
No	69.3	83.6		
Adequate Motivation				
Yes	32.1	50.8	13.7	0.001
No	67.9	49.2		
Promotion				
Yes	48.5	57.4	2.9	0.05
No	51.5	42.6		
Job Enrichment				
Yes	34.9	54.9	15.2	0.001
No	65.1	45.1		
Job Security				
Yes	80.1	69.7	5.6	0.01
No	19.9	30.3		

Table 3: Cross Tabulation of Factors within Tendency Towards Labour Mobility - continued

Changing Work Value				
Yes	83.7	74.6	4.9	0.02
No	16.3	25.4		
Prior Mobility				
Yes	66.5	23.8	67.4	0.001
No	33.5	76.2		

Moreover, a number of factors that significantly associate with the respondents' tendency towards labour mobility include job security, lack of job satisfaction, inadequate motivation, lack of job enrichment, prior experience of labour mobility, intention to embark on labour mobility and changing work values. These factors can be regarded as proximate determinants of labour mobility in the SMOs in Nigeria. Surprisingly, a very high level (80.1%) of tendency towards labour mobility significantly associates with the respondents' knowledge of job security in the SMOs under study. This implies that only job security is insufficient for the promotion of employees' retention in SMOs.

Table 4 shows the regression coefficients of the extent to which a combination of factors can influence the tendency towards labour mobility among the respondents in the selected SMOs. It was found that level of income alone could not significantly predict the respondents' predisposition to labour mobility. Alternatively, the observed tendency towards labour mobility among the respondents was significantly influenced by a combination of factors comprising prior experience of labour mobility, intention to embark on labour mobility, moonlighting, lack of job enrichment, lack of opportunity for promotion, and changing work values.

The above mentioned variables were found to be collectively significant predictors of tendency towards labour mobility in the SMOs under study. Thus, it can be deduced that both male and female respondents with different levels of income in the SMOs equally displayed tendency towards labour mobility, although significant variations in their tendency for labour mobility were observed in the affirmation and denial of tendency towards labour mobility through a number of factors such as prior experience of labour mobility, moonlighting, lack of job enrichment, lack of opportunity for promotion and changing work values.

Table 4: Predictors of Tendency Towards Labour Mobility among the Respondents

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	0.579	0.018		32.36	0.001
	Income	0.002	0.005	-0.016	-0.348	0.728
	(Constant)	0.77	0.073		10.511	0.001
	Income	-0.002	0.004	-0.018	-0.509	0.611
	Position	0.007	0.007	0.032	0.914	0.361
	Experience	-0.014	0.011	-0.043	-1.339	0.181
	Prior Mobility	0.096	0.007	0.433	14.534	0.001
	Intention for Mobility	-0.23	0.014	-0.512	-16.433	0.001
	Job Satisfaction	0.005	0.015	0.012	0.364	0.716
2	Moonlighting	-0.141	0.013	-0.321	-10.807	1
	Motivation	0.028	0.018	0.052	1.529	0.127
	Job Enrichment	-0.052	0.016	-0.117	-3.283	0.001
	Job Satisfaction	-0.021	0.016	-0.047	-1.323	0.186
	Job Security	-0.012	0.017	-0.024	-0.721	0.471
	Promotion	-0.029	0.014	-0.066	-2.065	0.04
	Work Values	0.273	0.056	0.236	4.874	0.001

Surprisingly, some interviewees revealed that labour mobility had not occurred in their organisations. This implies that the crisis of labour mobility is not applicable to all the SMOs in

Nigeria. In this context, an employer in a bakery recalled that he had not recorded any case of labour mobility since the established of his organisation in 2005. An owner of a pharmaceutical organisation also mentioned that she had not really experienced labour mobility as most of her workers are close or distant relatives. Several lessons can be learnt from the SMOs that have not recorded cases of labour mobility since their establishments. The observable reasons for their experience include friendly management styles, staff recruitment from the extended family networks and capacity building. These measures may however not be suitable for all the SMOs in Nigeria, hence the need for caution in the adoption of innovative measures for the prevention of labour mobility.

In the words of employers in the SMOs in Nigeria, labour mobility had resulted in several undesirable consequences such as low patronage, excess workload for available employees and reduction in organizational potentials for profit making. For instance, an employer in a private school submitted that the major problem of labour mobility was that parents sometimes change the school of their children to the new school of the teachers who resigned their appointments. A similar trend occurred in some car wash organisations where it was disclosed that labour mobility frequently resulted in a situation whereby former employees directed customers away from the organisations to their new workplace. In a car wash organisation, it was also mentioned that shortage of staff that resulted from labour mobility could affect the number of cars cleaned in a day and this inevitably affects total incomes that could be made for the organisation daily, weekly and monthly. This observation resonates with the belief of an employer in a restaurant, where movement of workers had created some problems such as loss of customers and low sales arising from the exit of a cook with the taste of the food that the customers preferred.

All the interviewees and discussants unanimously agreed on the need for prevention of labour mobility. Their opinions were however divided concerning effective strategies for prevention of labour mobility. Some argued that labour mobility could be prevented through referral system including a situation in which to employees are asked to come with guarantors. Some employers also expressed their beliefs in prayer and fasting as effective strategies for the prevention of labour mobility. Other reported the need for counseling and adequate motivation.

The qualitative data show diversity in the strategies for improving employees' commitment in the selected SMOs in Nigeria. This indicates lack of a universal perspective for the understanding of employees' commitment in the SMOs in Nigeria. Different shades of opinions were expressed in the narratives from the in-depth interviews and focus group discussions. The discussants generally agreed that the SMOs in Nigeria operate in hostile business environment characterised by unemployment, poverty and corruption. They expressed concerns over lack of adequate legal measures to curb unethical behaviour of employees and employers in the SMOs in Nigeria. It was noted that finding solutions to labour mobility in the SMOs in Nigeria would be very difficult due to the fact that many small and medium organisations have chosen to function informally. It was agreed that SMOs were different from large organisations and as such they are more prone to uncertainty and vulnerability, which would require active engagement in innovation with change of attitude from unethical to ethical conducts.

In their discourse on the strategies for improving employees' commitment in the selected SMOs in Nigeria, more than two-third of the interviewees recognised the relevance of monetary and non-monetary rewards, as they mentioned different strategies such as prompt payment of salary, regular increase in salary, the use of bonuses, provision of transport allowance, opportunity.

6.3. Test of Hypotheses

Appropriate statistical tools such as correlation and regression were used in the process of testing the hypotheses. Both correlation and regression are parametric inferential statistics; they are used to test degree and magnitude of relationship between various variables, usually the dependent and independent variables. They can also be used for the analysis and interpretation of the parametric properties of several variables. The result of the first hypothesis is shown in Table 5. Relevant

variables were combined and computed in the process of testing the relationship between job enrichment and organizational commitment.

Thus, Table 5 shows the results, which indicate a significant relationship between job enrichment and organizational commitment ($R^2 = 0.367$, $F = 279.2$, $t = 8.325$, $\beta = 0.606$, $P < 0.001$). The R square (R^2) implies that 37% of the variance in organizational commitment can be traced to job enrichment, while the F with 279.2 suggests that a regression model containing a scale of job enrichment is better than a model without predictor variables. Also, the magnitude of t-statistic (8.3) for regression model is large enough to uphold the alternative hypothesis, showing that job enrichment is significantly related to organizational commitment among employees in SMOs in Nigeria. This finding reflects and transcends previous studies in the areas of job enrichment, job satisfaction and organizational commitment (Padala, 2011; Raukko, 2009; Mohr and Zoghi, 2006). With reference to Mohr and Zoghi (2006), employees' psychological and social needs can be satisfied through job enrichment practices such as variety, autonomy, job rotation, information sharing, team work, responsibility, recognition and rewards. This submission provides a basis for the aforementioned statistically significant relationship between job enrichment and organizational commitment. Also, Padala (2011) reported that employees' sense of duty and loyalty determined organizational commitment.

Table 5: Regression model for using job enrichment to predict organizational commitment among employees in the selected SMOs

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	F	R^2	Sig.	HI Results
		B	Std. Error	Beta					
1	(Constant)	.253	.030		8.325	279.2	.367	.001	Accept
	Job Enrichment	.056	.003	.606	16.708			.001	Accept

The second hypothesis focuses is stated as follows: the levels of employees' job enrichment the lower their frequency of mobility. Table 6 shows a statistically significant positive correlation between employees' levels of job enrichment and frequency of labour mobility in the SMOs in Nigeria ($r = .162$, $P < 0.001$). Thus, it can be deduced that the more the levels of employees' job enrichment the higher their frequency of mobility in SMOs in Nigeria. This finding suggests that a high level of job enrichment could increase the likelihood of labour mobility, although it negates the conclusion reached by Jayawardana and O'Donnell (2009) in their study of job enrichment and workplace performance in Sri Lanka garment industry where it was observed that high level of experimentation with job enrichment resulted in increased productivity and reduction in levels of labour turnover and absenteeism. The Sri Lanka finding can be attributed to good human resource management, which is relatively scarce in the SMOs in Nigeria.

Table 6: Correlation between employees' levels of job enrichment and frequency of labour mobility in SMOs

		Job Enrichment	Frequency of Labour Mobility
Job Enrichment	Pearson Correlation	1	.162(**)
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.001
	N	483	483
Frequency of Labour Mobility	Pearson Correlation	.162(**)	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.001	
	N	483	483

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Similarly, in their studies of several cases of labour mobility in the Canadian plastics sector, Lochhead and Stephens (2004) indicated that labour mobility could decline with high level of job

enrichment if organisations considered the needs and interest of their employees. Experience from Canada shows that labour mobility has become a critical human resource issue in all sectors of the economy due to its influence on productivity and profitability. Lochhead and Stephens (2004) added that the cost of replacing workers is high and finding skilled employees can be difficult. In light of this situation, employers in Canada are conscious of the need for good human resource management. The situation of employees in Nigeria is however different from the experience of their counterparts in other countries. Unlike the reported difficulty and high cost of replacing workers in Canada, employers in the Nigerian informal sector can easily recruit new employees due to rising trends of unemployment in Nigeria. For instance, the Nigerian unemployment rates increased from 11.9% in 2005 to 14.9% in 2008 and 19.7% in 2009 respectively (National Bureau of Statistics, 2010). The rising spate of unemployment in Nigerian justifies the observed relationship between job enrichment and organizational commitment on one hand, and high levels of job enrichment and labour turnover on the other hand.

7. Summary and Concluding Remarks

This study has provided different perspectives concerning reactions to labour mobility in SMOs in Nigeria. It is evident that most of the respondents (74.7%) demonstrated tendency towards labour mobility, which was influenced by a number of factors such as working experience, income and inadequate opportunities for career development. While 62.7% of the respondents linked tendency towards labour mobility to monetary factors such as low income and inadequate motivation, the remaining proportion of the respondents (37.3%) attributed the tendency to non-monetary factors including lack of job satisfaction, prior experience of labour mobility, intention to embark on labour mobility and changing work values. In this context, employees with low level of working experience have greater tendency towards labour mobility compared to other categories of workers in SMOs.

The regression coefficients of the extent to which a combination of factors can influence the tendency towards labour mobility among the respondents in SMOs showed that level of income alone could not significantly predict the respondents' predisposition to labour mobility. Surprisingly, a very high level (80.1%) of tendency towards labour mobility significantly associates with the respondents' knowledge of job security in the SMOs under study. This implies that only job security is insufficient for the promotion of employees' retention in SMOs. In the words of employers and managers in SMOs in Nigeria, labour mobility had resulted in several undesirable consequences such as low patronage, excess workload for available employees and reduction in organizational potentials for profit making. Many SMOs in Nigeria have encountered difficulties in their attempts to promote employees' commitment. The emerging prevalence of labour mobility in SMOs in Nigeria has implications for entrepreneurial development.

Generally, Nigeria's SMOs are characterized by their inability to revolutionise production, thereby discouraging workers and entrepreneurs from realising their dreams. A key outcome of this situation is the incidence of labour mobility, which has become worrisome in most organisations, particularly in SMOs in Nigeria. As such, the goals of most of the SMOs have not been met, despite their relevance to socio-economic development. This situation has contributed to underdevelopment of the Nigerian society.

Job enrichment would translate into employees' commitment if actions are taken towards ensuring job satisfaction and adequate motivation of employees in the selected SMOs. This conclusion is based on the discovery of a significant relationship between job enrichment and organizational commitment on the one hand, and a positive correlation between job enrichment and labour mobility on the other hand. The likely transition from job enrichment to organizational commitment in the SMOs requires a considerable attention in the areas of employees' retention. With reference to previous study by Mohr and Zoghi (2006), employees' psychological and social needs can be satisfied

through job enrichment practices such as variety, autonomy, job rotation, information sharing, team work, responsibility, recognition and rewards.

Contrary to expectation, the result of the third hypothesis suggests that a high level of job enrichment could increase the likelihood of labour mobility, thereby negating the conclusion reached by Jayawardana and O'Donnell (2009) in their study of job enrichment and workplace performance in Sri Lanka garment industry where it was observed that high level of experimentation with job enrichment resulted in increased productivity and reduction in levels of labour mobility and absenteeism. The Sri Lanka's finding can be attributed to good human resource management, which is relatively scarce in the SMOs in Nigeria.

Therefore, the primary responsibility for successful management of tendency towards labour mobility lies within the socio-economic climate, organisational structure, and employees' ability to combine positive traditional values with emerging modern work values. Employers and employees in SMOs are expected to develop the right attitude towards work and understand the intricacy of commercial practice in maintaining working contracts. All the employees in the SMOs should comply with work ethics expected for the development of the Nigerian economy. The need for positive work ethics requires input from private and public institutions including the family, community and the state. These institutions must be integrated and channeled towards development of positive work ethics in the SMOs.

The Nigerian government must ensure provision of adequate infrastructure to enhance indigenous capacities for entrepreneurial development in the SMOs. Entrepreneurship has become the main driver of the Nigerian economy but critical infrastructure required to promote it is clearly lacking in the country.

References

- [1] Akinwale, A. A. 2010. "The menace of inadequate infrastructure in Nigeria", *African Journal on Science, Technology, Innovation and Development*, 2 (3), pp. 208-229.
- [2] Campbell, E. K. 2007. "Reflections on illegal immigration in Botswana and South Africa", *African Population Studies* 21(2), pp. 23-44.
- [3] Chen, M. 2008. "Informality and social protection: Theories and realities", *IDS Bulletin*, 39(2), pp. 18-27.
- [4] Dawis, R. V. and Lofquist, L. H. 1984. "A psychological theory of work adjustment: An individual difference model and its applications", *University of Minnesota Press*, Minneapolis, MN.
- [5] Dawis, R. V., Lofquist, L. H., and Weiss, D. J. 1968. "A theory of work adjustment (a revision). Minnesota studies in vocational rehabilitation", *University of Minnesota Press*, Minneapolis, MN.
- [6] Daza, J. L. 2005. "Informal economy, undeclared work and labour administration", *International Labour Office*, Geneva.
- [7] Deyo, F. C., Doner, R. F. and Hershberg, E. 2001. "Economic governance and the challenge of flexibility in East Asia", *Rowman & Littlefield Publishers*, Lanham, MD.
- [8] Ekanem, I. and Smallbone, D. 2007. "Learning in small manufacturing firms: The case of investment decision-making behavior", *International Small Business Journal*, 25, pp. 107-129.
- [9] Ekanem, I. and Smallbone, D. 2007. "Learning in small manufacturing firms: The case of investment decision-making behavior", *International Small Business Journal*, 25(2), pp. 107-129.
- [10] García-Serrano, C. and Malo, M. A. 2009. "The impact of union direct voice on voluntary and involuntary absenteeism", *The Journal of Socio-Economics*, 38(2), pp. 372-383.
- [11] Hitlin, S. and Piliavin, J. A. 2004. "Values: Reviving a dormant concept", *Annual Review of Sociology*, 30, pp. 359-393.

- [12] Izamoje, L. 2011. "Changing work values in small and medium organisations in Nigeria", *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Review*, 2(2), pp.
- [13] Jayawardana, A. and O'Donnell, M. 2009. "Devolution, job enrichment and workplace performance in Sri Lanka's garment industry", *Economic and Labour Relations Review*, 19 (2), pp. 210-220.
- [14] Kirton, G. and Greene, A. 2009. "Diversity management in the UK: Organizational and Stakeholder Experience", *Routledge, New York*.
- [15] Lochhead, C. and Stephens, A. 2004. "Employee retention, labour turnover and knowledge transfer: Case studies from the Canadian plastics sector", *Canadian Labour and Business Centre*, Canada.
- [16] Martinez-Costa, M. and Jimenez-Jimenez, D. 2009. "The effectiveness of TQM: The key role of organisational learning in small businesses", *International Small Business Journal*, 27(1), pp. 98-125.
- [17] McDonald, K. S. and Hite, L. M. 2005. "Ethical issues in mentoring: The role of HRD", *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 7(4), pp. 569-582.
- [18] Meagher, K. 2007. "Manufacturing disorder: Liberalization, informal enterprise and economic 'ungovernance' in African small firm clusters", *Development and Change*, 38(3), pp. 473-503.
- [19] Miller, N. J.; Besser, T. and Malshe, A. 2007. "Strategic networking among small businesses in small us communities", *International Small Business Journal*, 25(6), pp. 631-665.
- [20] Mohr, R. D. and Zoghi, C. 2006. "Is job enrichment really enriching?" *Bureau of Labour Statistics Working Paper*, 389, pp.
- [21] National Bureau of Statistics 2010. "Labour force survey", *NBS*, Abuja.
- [22] Olaniyan, A. 2009. "Standing history on its head: Deconstructing African encounter with the fourth epoch", In T. Babawale, A. Alao, F. A. Omidire and T. Onwumah, eds., *Teaching and Propagating African and Diaspora History and Culture*, Lagos: CBAAC, pp. 41-54.
- [23] Onugu, B. A. N. 2005. "Small and medium enterprises (SMEs) in Nigeria: Problems and prospects", PhD Thesis, St. Clements University.
- [24] Padala, S. R. 2011. "Employees' job satisfactions and organizational commitment in Nagarjuna Fertilizers and Chemicals Limited, India", *International Research Journal of Management and Business Studies*, 1(1), pp. 017-027.
- [25] Painter-Morland, M. and Spence, L. J. 2009. Introduction: Business ethics in small and medium enterprises. *African Journal of Business Ethics*, 4(2), pp. 1-6.
- [26] Palmer, R. 2009. "Formalising the informal: Ghana's national apprenticeship programme", *The Journal of Vocational Education and Training* 61(1), pp. 67-83.
- [27] Rashidi, R., 2009. "The Global African presence – African roots of humanity and civilization", In T. Babawale, A. Alao, F. A. Omidire and T. Onwumah, eds., *Teaching and Propagating African and Diaspora History and Culture*, Lagos: CBAAC, pp. 5-39.
- [28] Raukko, M. 2009. "Key persons' organizational commitment in cross-border acquisitions", PhD Thesis, Turku University of Economics.
- [29] Surridge, P. 2005. "The sociological pied-piper: Moving forward without RATs", *International Journal of Social Research Methodology* 5(1), pp. 41-50.