

INTER-AMERICAN DEFENSE COLLEGE

REPORT TO THE COMMITTEE ON HEMISPHERIC SECURITY

SEMINAR ON SMALL ARMS TRAFFICKING



**FORT LESLEY J. McNAIR
WASHINGTON, DC 20319-5066**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

INTRODUCTION

This academic seminar was organized by the Inter-American Defense College (IADC), in coordination with the Committee of Hemispheric Security (CHS) and the Secretariat of Multidimensional Security of the Organization of American States (OAS). The event responded to Resolution AG/RES 2627 (XLI-O/11) of the General Assembly, which seeks to promote an agenda for reducing illicit small arms trafficking in the Americas. Accordingly, the General Assembly resolved to invite the IADC to organize a “Seminar on Small Arms Trafficking” for its students, the CHS, and other associated OAS offices. The seminar’s events and outcomes complemented and contributed to the OAS-based annual meeting of the Inter-American Convention Against Illicit Manufacturing of and Trafficking in Firearms (CIFTA), which shared invited participants, experts, and ideas.

SEMINAR OVERVIEW

The 3-day seminar was divided into two parts: 1) an official meeting of the CHS; and 2) structured panel and working group discussions hosted by the IADC that operated according to College standards of non-attribution. Expert panels were comprised of diverse institutional perspectives, and working groups critically examined the multifaceted priorities for addressing challenges of illicit arms trafficking. Themes analyzed, with embedded expert support, included:

1. Marking and Tracing of Firearms;
2. Stockpile Management and Destruction of Firearms and Munitions;
3. Strengthening Ballistic and Forensic Identification;
4. Coordinating Mechanisms for Regional and Sub-regional Enforcement;
5. Promoting Implementation of Firearms Agreement and Strengthening Legislation;
6. Dismantling Transnational Criminal Organizations Involved in Arms Trafficking;
7. Interrupting Unregulated Arms Flows Across Borders; and
8. Strengthening Regional Exchange of information on Arms Trafficking and Transnational Criminal Organizations.

SUMMARY OF WORKING GROUP STRATEGIC OBSERVATIONS

- Need for regional approaches, accords and coordinated security responses;
- Distinct challenges of ratifying regional agreements and implementation in the field;
- Importance of sharing national, bi-national and subregional “best practices”;
- Prerequisite of shared information access/ databases for other initiatives;
- Need for purposeful engagement between relevant stakeholders;
- Importance of a multi-dimensional security approach, with social programming;
- Potential for support from the Inter-American Defense Board (IADB);

- Comprehensive multi-lateral border security policies that address all types of trafficking.

FULL REPORT

INTRODUCTION

This academic seminar was organized by the Inter-American Defense College (IADC), in coordination with the Committee of Hemispheric Security (CHS) and the Secretariat of Multidimensional Security, and in particular the Department of Public Security, of the Organization of American States (OAS). The event responded to Resolution AG/RES 2627 (XLI-O/11) of the OAS General Assembly, which seeks to promote an agenda for reducing illicit small arms trafficking in the Americas. Accordingly, the General Assembly resolved to invite the IADC to organize a “Seminar on Small Arms Trafficking” for its students, the CHS, and other associated OAS offices.

As a joint planning process with the OAS (and with funding support of USSOUTHCOM), the seminar complemented and contributed to the annual OAS-based meeting of the Inter-American Convention Against Illicit Manufacturing of and Trafficking in Firearms (CIFTA), which shared many of the seminar’s invited participants, experts, and ideas. The seminar’s rapporteur, Ambassador Pablo Macedo (of Mexico), shared key lessons learned in the closing session of the CIFTA meetings on the afternoon of 10 February.

SEMINAR OVERVIEW

The 3-day seminar was divided in two parts: 1) an official meeting of the Committee on Hemispheric Security hosted by the OAS; and 2) structured panel and working group discussions hosted by the IADC that utilized diverse learning modalities (including expert panels, question and answer sessions, thematic working groups, and rotating group briefings) to deepen participants’ engagement with relevant themes. Appendices offer details on the seminar agenda (Appendix 1), profiles of invited subject matter experts (Appendix 2), and listings of working group participants (Appendix 3).

The Committee meeting, hosted by the OAS at the Hall of the Americas on 6 February, exposed seminar participants to official discourses and diplomatic protocols related to hemispheric arms trafficking regimes. The session began with a high level overview of regional threats associated with illicit small arms trafficking and the regimes established to respond to them. Discussion followed from the invited representatives of prominent international organizations and they identified major issues and challenges facing anti-trafficking agendas from global, regional, and sub-regional perspectives.

Upon conclusion of the formal Committee meeting, the IADC initiated the academic portion of the seminar, which operated according to College standards of non-attribution and academic freedom. Select speakers from the formal session comprised an expert panel and responded to audience questions in open plenary. A reception immediately followed at the OAS Patio Azteca, a brief networking session hosted by the IADC.

Days 2 and 3 of the event (7 and 8 February) shifted the seminar locale to the IADC, where participants engaged the moderated discussion of an expert panel, comprised of academic, diplomatic, defense, and NGO perspectives, and built on plenary insights from Day 1 in subsequent working group sessions. With support from IADC facilitators and invited subject matter experts (SMEs), thematic working groups critically examined multifaceted priorities for addressing challenges of illicit arms trafficking in the Americas. Group discussion emphasized roles of international and domestic actors, compliance and enforcement with international laws and treaties, and security risk assessments of diverse regional actors. Group presentations underscored the regional progress on assigned themes, assessed relevant challenges and regional capacities, and provided strategic observations/ recommendations to support the OAS regional security agenda.

SEMINAR OBJECTIVES AND WORKING GROUP THEMES

The general objective of the seminar was an analysis of diverse regional priorities related to the trafficking of illicit firearms (in particular "small arms"), and contribute strategic insights and recommendations to the OAS and IADB that reflect national and regional objectives of member states and support enhanced coordination among those actors charged with oversight of security and defense matters in the Americas.

More specifically, the seminar sought to address these desired learning objectives:

- *Analyze regional and national lessons learned regarding the marking and tracing of firearms and the destruction of arms stockpiles.*
- *Discuss challenges of negotiating, implementing, and enforcing national legislation and regional agreements related to trafficking in illicit firearms.*
- *Learn and explain varied regional attempts to coordinate operational initiatives to effectively dismantle criminal organizations, to gather and share relevant information, and to limit cross-border illicit arms flows.*
- *Provide strategic recommendations to OAS committees and its member states to support a regional security agenda that effectively manages threats tied to illicit firearms trafficking.*

Themes analyzed in seminar working groups, with embedded expert support, included:

1. Marking and Tracing of Firearms;
2. Stockpile Management and Destruction of Firearms and Munitions;
3. Strengthening Ballistic and Forensic Identification;
4. Coordinating Mechanisms for Regional and Sub-regional Enforcement;
5. Promoting Implementation of Firearms Agreement and Strengthening Legislation;
6. Dismantling Transnational Criminal Organizations Involved in Arms Trafficking;
7. Interrupting Unregulated Arms Flows Across Borders; and
8. Strengthening Regional Exchange of information on Arms Trafficking and Transnational Criminal Organizations.

SUMMARY OF WORKING GROUP STRATEGIC OBSERVATIONS

Seminar working group analysis generated a number of relevant strategic observations. These observations are summarized below:

1. ***There is a need to foster and strengthen regional approaches, accords and coordinated security responses to address illicit trafficking of small arms.*** Despite the difficulty of implementing effective global and hemispheric regimes (due to the diversity of regional perspectives, legal frameworks, and political-economic interests), the working groups agreed that the threats associated with illicit arms trafficking merited regional-level responses. They highlighted the need for more robust legal frameworks, standardized processes, and a common use of terms at the regional level to assist in overcoming regional political differences and to serve as a mechanism for consensus building and critical engagement.
2. ***There are distinct challenges in the ratification of regional agreements and in the implementation of these agreements in the field.*** Whereas ratification depends on diplomatic and legislative capacities, effective implementation goes far beyond the letter of formal agreements. It requires the development of a more comprehensive security infrastructure within and across nations.
3. ***There is great value in sharing “best practices” implemented at the national, bi-national and subregional levels.*** Localized approaches can be effective and timely substitutes for hemisphere-wide accords, especially in the short term. Small steps towards a more comprehensive goal can help nations immediately and provide useful templates for future treaty implementation on a broader basis.
4. ***Access to information technology and shared databases is a prerequisite to other types of implementation and can provide a good first step for other initiatives.*** For example, in the Americas, there is currently no hemispherically accepted way to share ballistic information among countries in a reliable, legal, and timely manner. A single coordinating body – or unified set of standards across multiple bodies – would be useful in ensuring rapid and comprehensive information dissemination.
5. ***There is need for purposeful debate on the issues of illicit arms trafficking to be initiated and sustained with a wide array of relevant stakeholders.*** The varied perspectives and interests of security officials, diplomats, political leaders, non-governmental organizations, and the private sector create implicit challenges in building consensus. However, cross-network dialogue may create the requisite trust to find creative and more sustainable policy solutions. Such dialogue can be carried out in a variety of environments, and the IADC offers a unique diplomatic and civil-military forum to address complex issues in a non-attribution academic setting.

6. ***There is a need to take a multi-dimensional security approach, with a focus on social programming.*** Strategies to reduce the demand for illicit weapons should consider the broad social, cultural and political-economic influences that contribute to the creation of an illegal arms market. Social inclusion of marginalized populations and targeted development planning in realms of health, education, and employment are crucial for creating a sustainable regional security infrastructure.
7. ***There is potential for the Inter-American Defense Board (IADB) to play a key role in regional coordination efforts related to illicit arms trafficking.*** The IADB could be leveraged to promote information exchange mechanisms and to establish greater standardization in the management and destruction of weapons stockpiles and in the marking and tracing of small arms.
8. ***Border security is key to addressing the trafficking of small arms as well as illegal trafficking of all kinds.*** It was observed that, throughout the Americas, illegal trafficking occurs across air, land, maritime and river borders because transnational criminal organizations take advantage of the porosity of borders and poor state controls. There are many contributing factors, including: corruption, market demand, and limited cooperation among key stakeholders. Several groups highlighted the theme of border security as a critical topic for future IADC-OAS joint seminars.

APPENDIX 1: SEMINAR AGENDA

MONDAY, 6 FEBRUARY 2012

Day 1 Location:

Organization of American States

Hall of the Americas

200 17th St NW; Washington DC 20006

13:45 – 14:00 (1:45 - 2:00)	PARTICIPANT ARRIVAL AT THE OAS
14:00 – 14:30 (2:00 - 2:30)	<p>INAUGURAL SESSION / WELCOMING REMARKS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Giovanni Snidle, Vice-Chair of the Committee on Hemispheric Security and Alternate Representative of the United States to the OAS • José Miguel Insulza, Secretary General of the OAS • Rear Admiral Jeffrey A. Lemmons, Director, Inter-American Defense College
14:30 – 15:15 (2:30 - 3:15)	<p>HISTORICAL OVERVIEW</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Samuel Logan, Director, Southern Pulse
15:15 - 16:30 (3:15 - 4:30)	<p>NEW DEVELOPMENT AND TRENDS: REGIONAL APPROACHES</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ambassador Pablo Macedo, General Director, Matías Romero Institute, Secretary of Foreign Affairs - Mexico; Chair of Fourth Biennial Meeting of States on Small Arms and Light Weapons (“BMS4”) for the United Nations • Myriam Vasquez, Principal Advisor, Central American Small and Light Weapon Program (CASAC) • Callixtus Joseph, Regional Crime and Security Strategy Coordinator, CARICOM Implementation Agency for Crime and Security (IMPACS) • Comments by Member States
16:30 - 17:30 (4:30 - 5:30)	<p>DAY 1 SUMMARY/ PLENARY QUESTION AND ANSWER PERIOD</p> <p>IADC OVERVIEW OF DAYS 2 & 3 ACTIVITIES</p>
17:30 - 18:45 (5:30 - 6:45)	<p>RECEPTION – OAS PATIO AZTECA (HOSTED BY THE INTER-AMERICAN DEFENSE COLLEGE)</p>

TUESDAY, 7 FEBRUARY 2012

Day 2 Location:

Inter-American Defense College (IADC)

Auditorium and Breakout Rooms / Lunch at NDU Officer's Club

210 B Street SW Building 52, Fort McNair

Washington DC 20319

08:00 – 08:30	<p>RECEPTION</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Registration Confirmation; Refreshments
08:30 – 09:00	<p>WELCOMING REMARKS AND COORDINATOR INTRODUCTION OF SEMINAR ACADEMIC PORTION</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Director of the Inter-American Defense College• Seminar Coordinators
09:00 – 10:15	<p>SUMMARY OF DAY 1 AND PANEL ROUNDTABLE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Moderators: Ambassador Pablo Macedo, General Director, Matías Romero Institute, Secretary of Foreign Affairs - Mexico; Chair of Fourth Biennial Meeting of States on Small Arms and Light Weapons (“BMS4”) of the United Nations Professor Mark Hamilton, Academic Consultant and Instructor, IADC and American University School of International Service• <i>Academic Perspectives:</i> Dr. Natalie Goldring, Senior Fellow, Center for Peace and Security Studies and Adjunct Full Professor, Security Studies Program, for the Edmund A. Walsh School of Foreign Service at Georgetown University Prof. Aaron Karp, Instructor of Political Science, Old Dominion University and Senior Consultant, Small Arms Survey• <i>Diplomatic Perspectives:</i> Myriam Vasquez, Principal Advisor, Central American Small and Light Weapon Program (CASAC) Alison August Treppel, Deputy Director, OAS Department of Public Security; Tech. Secretary, Inter-American Convention Against Illicit Manufacturing of & Trafficking in Firearms (CIFTA)

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Defense Perspectives:</i> Col. JesúsMaríaLorduy, IADC Academic Advisor, and Former Administrative Section Chief, Department for Control of Trade in Arms, Ammunition & Explosives (Armed Forces, Colombia) Brett Wise, SOUTHCOM Specialist in Small Arms and Light Weapons, US Defense Threat Reduction Agency (DTRA) • <i>NGO Perspectives:</i> Hector Guerra, Survivors Network Coordinator (Mexico City), International Action Network on Small Arms (IANSA),
10:15 – 10:30	BREAK
10:30 – 11:15	<p>QUESTION AND ANSWER SESSION WITH PANELISTS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Panel Summary / Synthesis by Moderator • Open Q & A from Participants
11:15 – 12:30	LUNCH
12:30 – 12:45	OVERVIEW OF GROUP ASSIGNMENTS
12:45 – 13:00	BREAK / TRANSFER

13:00 – 16:00 (1:00 - 4:00)	<p>WORKING GROUP SESSION IN BREAKOUT ROOMS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Introductions of Participants and Group-Assigned Theme• Group Feedback on Panel in Context of Theme• Analysis of Theme According to Presentation Criteria <p><i>Responsibilities: Group Dynamics Moderated by Facilitator; Theme Support Offered by Embedded Experts; Posted Responses Prepared by Participants</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Facilitator Wrap Up of Day 2; Brief Preview of Day 3
--------------------------------	---

WEDNESDAY, 8 FEBRUARY 2012
 Day 3 Location:
 Inter-American Defense College (IADC)
 Auditorium and Breakout Rooms
 210 B Street SW Building 52, Fort McNair
 Washington DC 20319

08:00 – 08:30	RECEPTION <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Registration Confirmation; Refreshments
08:30 – 11:00	WORKING GROUP SESSION IN BREAKOUT ROOMS <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Facilitator Review: Day 2 Progress; Overview of Day 3 • Analysis of Theme According to Presentation Criteria <p style="text-align: center;"><i>Responsibilities: Group Dynamics Moderated by Facilitator; Theme Support Offered by Embedded Experts; Posted Responses Prepared by Participants</i></p>
11:00 – 12:15	WORKING LUNCH / FINALIZATION OF RESPONSES
12:15 – 12:30	INSTRUCTIONS FOR ROTATING THEMATIC REVIEW
12:30 – 14:00 (12:30 - 2:00)	ROTATIONS TO OTHER GROUPS' SEMINAR ROOMS
14:00 – 14:30 (2:00 - 2:30)	HOME ROOM: REVIEW OF OTHER GROUPS' COMMENTS
14:30 – 14:45 (2:30 - 2:45)	BREAK / TRANSFER
14:45 – 15:30 (2:45 - 3:30)	SUMMARY COMMENTS ON GROUP RECOMMENDATIONS <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Comparative Analysis of Thematic Recommendations and Synthesis/ Constructive Critique of Initial Group Response • Plenary Discussion of Lessons Learned

15:30 – 16:00
(3:30 - 4:00)

FINAL COMMENTS BY OAS AND IADC LEADERSHIP

- Reflections on Value-Added of Joint OAS-IADC Seminar
- Initial Draft of Thematic Recommendations

APPENDIX 2: PROFILES OF PANELISTS AND SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS

1. Pablo Macedo(SeminarRapporteur)

- General Director, Matías Romero Institute, Secretary of Foreign Affairs – Mexico
- General Director of the United Nations of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (SRE),
- Has served as High Mexican Representative to the United Nations (Ambassador since 2001)
- President/Chairperson, Fourth Biennial Meeting of States (related to the UN Programme of Action) on Small Arms and Light Weapons (“BMS4”) – 2010
- Vice-President, Diplomatic Conference adopting the Convention on Cluster Munitions, Dublin -2008
- Panel of Experts of the Secretary General on the question of verification in all its aspects, including the role of the United Nations in the field, New York and Geneva – 2006
- President, Conference on Disarmament, Geneva – 2004
- Relevant Academic Experience:
 - Academic Professor of International Organizations and of “Law and War” at the Geneva School of Diplomacy and International Relations, Geneva
 - Professor of International Humanitarian Law at the Law School of Universidad La Salle, Mexico City

2. Myriam Vásquez

- Senior Technical Advisor, Central American Small and Light Weapon Program (CASAC)
- Specialist in public international law, democratic security, defence policy, integration law and security in Latin America
- Director of Democratic Security of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Nicaragua 2003-2006.
- Sub Director General of sovereignty, territory and international legal Affairs, (1993-2003)
- Adviser to the Commission of security of Central America. (2000-2006)
- Negotiator at various international conferences under the sponsorship of the United Nations.
- Senior representative in the institutional reforms of SICA.

3. **Samuel Logan**

- Founder of Southern Pulse - Networked Intelligence, an independent human intelligence organization focused on security, politics, and energy in Latin America.
- Senior writer for the International Relations and Security Network, and has written for *Jane's Intelligence Report*, *Americas Quarterly*, and *The Counter Terrorist Magazine*.
- Author of *This is for the Mara Salvatrucha: Inside the MS-13, America's Most Violent Gang* (Hyperion), and has a forthcoming book on Los Zetas, Mexico's most sophisticated organized criminal enterprise.
- Addressed US Intelligence Agencies and their senior analysts, members of US Congress, the Parliamentary Forum on Small Arms and Light Weapons, the Overseas Advisory Council, the RAND Corporation's Insurgency Board, federal and state law enforcement agencies, conferences on private security, NGOs, and universities around the United States
- Has written extensively on organized crime in Colombia, Venezuela, Brazil, Central America, and Mexico.

4. **Callixtus Joseph**

- Regional Crime and Security Strategy Coordinator for the Caribbean Community Implementation Agency for Crime and Security (CARICOM IMPACS)
- Representative for IMPACS on CARICOM Preparatory Steering Committee towards an Arms Trade Treaty.
- A past lecture of International Security at the University of the West Indies, Trinidad and Tobago.
- Lead coordinator for the development and drafting of a CARICOM Crime and Security Strategy.

5. **Brett Wise**

- SOUTHCOM/PACCOM Specialist in Small Arms and Light Weapons, US Defense Threat Reduction Agency
- Institutional experience in the Physical Security and Stockpile Management of Arms, Ammunition and Explosives
- Roles in assessing, advising, and orienting the work of international partners through seminars and site assessments.

6. **Monique Randall**

- Assistant Director for the Violent Crimes Division at INTERPOL-US

- Assistant Director for the Violent Crimes Division at U.S. Department of Justice/ATF
- International Affairs background at the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives (ATF), Department of Justice
- Small arms lecturer at the International Law Enforcement Academy in Lima, Peru in 2010

7. Bill Kullman

- Deputy Chief of International Affairs at US Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF), Department of Justice
- Expert in efforts to combat illicit arms trafficking internationally and involved in the initial and ongoing negotiations and engagements of CIFTA.
- Adjunct professor of Legal Writing and Research at The George Washington University School of Law.
- Former attorney with the Office of Chief Counsel at the ATF

8. Natalie Goldring

- Senior Fellow at the Center for Peace and Security Studies and an Adjunct Full Professor in the Security Studies Program in the Edmund A. Walsh School of Foreign Service at Georgetown University.
- Serves on the advisory boards of Women In International Security and 20-20 Vision and the editorial board of The Nonproliferation Review.
- Member of the International Association of University Presidents/UN Commission on Disarmament Education, Conflict Resolution, and Peace, and is a former chair of the board of the Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists.
- Former Executive Director of the Program on Global Security and Disarmament at the University of Maryland.
- Has written extensively on conventional and nuclear weapons, the international arms trade, non-proliferation, and small arms and light weapons.

9. Adam Isacson

- Senior Associate for Regional Security Policy at the Washington Office on Latin America.
- Frequently consulted on issues like Colombia's conflict, violence in Mexico, arms transfers, drug policy, regional diplomatic relations, Venezuela's foreign policy, Brazil's emergence, and human rights.
- Former Director of Programs; Coordinator, Latin America Security Program Previously Center for International Policy Washington, D.C.
- Program Officer, Arias Foundation for Peace and Human Progress San José, Costa Rica. Participated in administration and execution of projects advocating demilitarization, conflict prevention, and democratization in Central America and Haiti.
- Publications include:
 - Tackling Urban Violence in Latin America: Reversing Exclusion through Smart Policing and Social Investment, by Ashley Morse,

Adam Isacson and Maureen Meyer, Washington Office on Latin America, June 2011

- Why Latin America is Rearming, Current History, February 2011
- Preach What You Practice: The Separation of Military and Police Roles in the Americas, by George Withers, Lucila Santos and Adam Isacson, WOLA, November 2010

10. **Aaron Karp**

- Professor of Political Science in the Department of Political Science and Geography at Old Dominion University in Norfolk, Virginia, where he teaches international relations, American foreign policy, technology and war, and weapons proliferation.
- Contributed to the creation of the 1987 Missile Technology Control Regime.
- Former consultant to the United Nations, he is the author of several reports of the UN Secretary-General.
- Senior Consultant to the Small Arms Survey, an independent institute in Geneva, Switzerland, where he concentrates on statistical assessment of global small arms proliferation
- Co-editor of the journal Contemporary Security Policy.
- Publications include: Ballistic Missile Proliferation:
 - The Politics and Technics 1996, Global Insurgency and the Future of Armed Conflict 2007;
 - Articles in professional journals including Arms Control Today, International Security, International Studies Quarterly, SIPRI Yearbook, Small Arms Survey, Strategic Survey, Survival, and Washington Quarterly

11. **Hector Guerra**

- Member of International Action Network on Small Arms (IANSA), Survivors Network Coordinator, Mexico City, Mexico
- Links to Control Arms
- Has worked with Amnesty International, Mexico

12. **Col. Andrés Santos Melo**

- Deputy Director of the Directorate of Intelligence of the Ministry of the Armed Forces, Dominican Republic.
- Delegate for the Biennial Meeting of States to consider the implementation of the Programme of Action (of the UN) on the illicit trade of arms (BMS4) in 2010.
- Delegate to the armed forces session of the Inter-American Committee against terrorism - CICTE (2009).

13. **Col Jesus Lorduy Dales**

- Advisor at the Inter-American Defense College (IADC)
- Held command positions in Colombian Army specializing in logistics.

- Held senior staff positions on the Colombian General Staff.
- Former Chief of the Department of Commercial Control of Arms, Munitions, and Explosives for the Colombian Armed Forces.
- Represented Colombia in numerous International Arms Symposia.