


# Heart of the South West Local Transport Board

## Scheme Prioritisation Proforma

<b>Option Name: Marsh Barton and Edginswell Rail Stations</b>																				
<b>Date:</b> 8 <sup>th</sup> May 2013	<b>Location:</b> 																			
<b>Capital Cost:</b> £9.0 million Q1 2015																				
<b>Funding Proposal:</b> £7.1 million																				
<b>Delivery Programme:</b>																				
<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Project Stage</th> <th>Status</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Project Initiation</td> <td>Complete</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Feasibility</td> <td>Complete</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Option Selection</td> <td>Marsh Barton - Complete Edginswell - Underway</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Preliminary/Outline Design</td> <td>Underway</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Statutory Powers</td> <td>2013/14 &amp; 2013/14</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Detailed Design</td> <td>2013/14 &amp; 2014/15</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Contractor Procurement and Mobilisation</td> <td>2014/15 &amp; 2015/16</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Construction and Commissioning</td> <td>2015/16 &amp; 2016/17</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Project Close</td> <td>2016/17 &amp; 2017/18</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Project Stage	Status	Project Initiation	Complete	Feasibility	Complete	Option Selection	Marsh Barton - Complete Edginswell - Underway	Preliminary/Outline Design	Underway	Statutory Powers	2013/14 & 2013/14	Detailed Design	2013/14 & 2014/15	Contractor Procurement and Mobilisation	2014/15 & 2015/16	Construction and Commissioning	2015/16 & 2016/17	Project Close
Project Stage	Status																			
Project Initiation	Complete																			
Feasibility	Complete																			
Option Selection	Marsh Barton - Complete Edginswell - Underway																			
Preliminary/Outline Design	Underway																			
Statutory Powers	2013/14 & 2013/14																			
Detailed Design	2013/14 & 2014/15																			
Contractor Procurement and Mobilisation	2014/15 & 2015/16																			
Construction and Commissioning	2015/16 & 2016/17																			
Project Close	2016/17 & 2017/18																			
<b>Description:</b>																				
The delivery of two new rail stations to serve the strategic employment area at																				

Marsh Barton (including 6,000 jobs planned to increase to 8,000 jobs), and the strategic residential and employment area at Edginswell on the edge of Torbay (1,500 houses and 3,500 jobs). Through the walking and cycling network, other key residential and employment areas in Exeter east and west of the River Exe will also be served by the station at Marsh Barton. Similarly the walking and cycling network will allow the station at Edginswell to serve Torbay Hospital, The Willows retail park, Torquay Gateway development area, as well as large areas of existing housing development. The stations will improve commuting options on the A376, A379 and A380 corridors, and reduce the need to travel by private car. The two stations, in combination with new stations at Newcourt and Cranbrook, will improve opportunities for cross city travel, including from the East of Exeter, for travel between Exeter and Torbay, and around Torbay itself.

The stations will each consist of an unstaffed station with two platforms, linked by bridges, stairs and ramps. Marsh Barton will be located on the Great Western main line just to the south of Clapperbrook Lane. Edginswell will be located on the Newton Abbot to Paignton line on the edge of Torbay.

The stations are both included in the joint Devon and Torbay Local Transport Plan<sup>1</sup>, the Exeter Local Development Framework<sup>2</sup> and the Torbay emerging Local Plan<sup>3</sup> and form important pieces of infrastructure to reduce the need to travel by private car and increase the range of available alternatives. The stations support the aspiration to increase the local train service frequency between Exeter and Paignton to 2 trains per hour, in accordance with the recommendations contained in the RUS, which has been given early support through INTERREG funding.

The option is designed with considerable flexibility so that if the Local Transport Board (LTB) wished to support only one of the two stations it could do so by supporting the station best placed for delivery by the LTB.

**Documents:**

<sup>1</sup> Devon and Torbay Local Transport Plan 3 <http://www.devon.gov.uk/ltp3>

<sup>2</sup> Exeter LDF <http://www.exeter.gov.uk/index.aspx?articleid=9482>

<sup>3</sup> Torbay emerging Local Plan <http://www.torbay.gov.uk/newlocalplan>

# Strategic

## Identified problems and objectives

Marsh Barton is one of the largest employment sites in the region (including 6,000 jobs planned to increase to 8,000 jobs), with a large number of commuters in the peak periods, but has poor transport links. In particular alternatives to the private car are extremely limited meaning the estate attracts considerable numbers of car trips through congested corridors including the A376, A379, Topsham Road, Alphington Road and the junction at Countess Wear.

In addition around 6,000 houses are planned in strategic allocations at South West Exeter and Newcourt, which will further increase the pressure on these corridors. Further growth is planned elsewhere along these corridors in South and East Devon which will provide additional pressure on primary routes outside the city.

Edginswell, on the edge of Torbay, is a developing business park surrounded by residential properties to the east of Hamelin Way. Torbay Hospital and The Willows retail and employment complex are also located in this area and make it a key production and attraction area, producing a large number of trips on the A380 corridor. Despite this and high frequency bus services on local routes, access to the area by alternative modes of transport from further afield is poor.

The Torquay Gateway strategic development area will see more than 1000+ additional houses and 3,500 jobs provided in the Edginswell area in sites close to the railway. A further 6,000 houses will be provided in the Newton Abbot and Kingsteignton area. These will place further pressure on corridors into Torbay, particularly east of Kerswell Gardens, which will remain a constraint on capacity following the completion of the SDLR.

There are considerable numbers of trips to and from the A376, A379 and A380 corridors, into Marsh Barton and Edginswell respectively, which are well served by rail lines. Research has shown that where rail stations are close to both origins and destinations, travel by rail can be more attractive than the private car.

By providing new stations at Marsh Barton (close to destinations at Marsh Barton) and Edginswell (close to origins and destinations including Torbay Hospital) commuting by rail will become an attractive alternative to the private vehicle reducing trips through the congested highway corridors. This is in accordance with the Exeter Transport Strategy<sup>1</sup> which aims to increase access to the city centre and key employment sites by sustainable modes, to relieve congested highway corridors and stimulate economic growth.

### Documents:

<sup>1</sup> Exeter Transport Strategy

[http://www.devon.gov.uk/index/transportroads/devon\\_local\\_transport\\_plan/transplan-exeter-ldf.htm](http://www.devon.gov.uk/index/transportroads/devon_local_transport_plan/transplan-exeter-ldf.htm)

### Scale of Impact

1	2	3	4	5
		X		

The option will provide an attractive alternative to the private car for travel to or from Marsh Barton and Edginswell from major areas of commuting origins and

destinations. Marsh Barton, in particular has no effective public transport access with no bus routes from outside the city serving the area.

It will have a significant impact on travel to Marsh Barton, including South West Exeter, and Edginswell from congested highway corridors. It is expected that at Edginswell the benefits will be focused on the A380 but, at Marsh Barton, the diverse range of origins and destinations, on congested corridors, will disperse the benefits across a number of routes.

The Devon Metro Appraisal Report<sup>1</sup> assessed demand at each station, with around 360,000 annual trips forecast at Marsh Barton and 350,000 at Edginswell on opening. These will grow to around half a million passengers per annum at each station. This translates to around 150 passengers in the peak hour at each station.

**Documents:**

<sup>1</sup>Devon Metro Appraisal Report <http://www.devon.gov.uk/eldf-devonmetroappraisal.pdf>

<b>Fit with wider transport and government objectives</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>
<p>The new stations will be required to conform to European Interoperability Regulations. The stations will complement the European Regional Development Fund INTERREG project between Exeter and Paignton which recently commenced. INTERREG seeks to benchmark growth in demand as a result of improved train services and investment in stations and marketing. In addition, it will complement the long term Devon Metro strategy of a 30 minute Exeter – Paignton local service frequency, as well as further new stations at Newcourt and Cranbrook.</p> <p>The stations would not negatively impact on other transport modes. The impact on rail freight has been considered in the train timetabling and capacity analysis and will be assessed again during the Network Change and timetable implementation process.</p> <p>The new stations will make better use of the local rail network by serving destination areas and opening up new travel opportunities. This will increase demand, reduce subsidy and work towards better use of under used rail infrastructure.</p>					<b>X</b>
<b>Documents:</b>					

Fit with other objectives		1	2	3	4	5
						X
Policy Document	Objectives	Scheme Fit				
Joint Local Transport Plan	Deliver and support new development and economic growth	Improving access to key employment areas				
	Make best use of the transport network and protect the existing transport asset by prioritising maintenance	Make better use of the local rail network by improving access to it, increasing demand and opening up new travel opportunities				
	Work with communities to provide safe, sustainable and low carbon choices	Increase the sustainable choices available in areas with poor public transport accessibility				
	Strengthen and improve the public transport network	Strengthen and improve public transport along key corridors into Exeter and Torbay				
	Make Devon the 'Place to be naturally active'	Encouraging walking or cycling to the stations and providing access to the Riverside Valley Park in Exeter for recreation and leisure.				
Exeter City Local Development Framework	Objective 1: Mitigate and adapt to climate change	Marsh Barton Rail Station improves access to a strategic employment area. Facilities will allow long distance trains to stop during disruption on the sea wall.				
	Objective 5: Achieve a step change in the use of sustainable transport	Provides improved public transport to key employment areas. As part of Devon Metro initiative it will help achieve step change in use of local rail network.				
	Objective 10: Provide infrastructure to deliver high quality development	Marsh Barton Rail Station is required to support development under Policy CP9 (Transport)				
Torbay Local Plan (A Landscap for Success) Consultation Draft September 2012	Aspiration 1 A better connected, accessible Torbay	Increasing accessibility throughout the Bay and beyond. Improving rail links to reduce congestion and environmental impact.				
	Aspiration 2 Secure economic recovery and success	Support achievement of economic growth and deliver new jobs and housing to the area.				
	Policy SD1 Growth Strategy for a prosperous Torbay	Providing the high quality infrastructure to support the step change in Torbay's economic performance.				

	Policy E1 Employment	Provision of access to sites which will contribute to the creation of at least 15,000 full time equivalent additional jobs by 2032, in Torbay.
	Policy TA1 Transport and Accessibility	Contribution towards the development of a sustainable and high quality transportation system which makes sustainable travel the first choice for travelling.
	Policy TA2 Strategic Transport Improvements	Maintenance and enhancement of the rail network serving the Bay will support strategic improvements to the transport system which improve the connection between the three towns, between Torbay and the rest of the sub-region, and between Torbay and national or international markets.
	Policy SDT3 Torquay Gateway	Delivery of improved rail services to the Gateway area.

**Documents:**

**Key uncertainties**

There are few uncertainties. The new stations fit well with local and national objectives, by improving the quality of alternatives to the private car, by making better use of existing transport assets, and by supporting economic growth. In addition recent announcements from the Department for Transport, including a new stations development fund, have indicated support for the development of new stations.

The stations benefit from the support of key stakeholders within the rail industry, as a result of its alignment with industry objectives and the attraction of additional rail passengers.

**Documents:**

**Degree of consensus over outcomes**

<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>
				<b>X</b>

There have been lots of presentations and stakeholder engagement with much enthusiasm for scheme. The original Exeter Transport Strategy consultation specifically included Marsh Barton in the rail investment section. Since then, further consultation was undertaken on Marsh Barton in autumn 2012 through the local member, media and Alphington residents group. The local member also met the Marsh Barton business forum. Positive responses have been received following press releases and coverage in the media.

The stations are also key parts of respective LDF/draft Local Plan documents and supported by the respective District and Unitary Authorities. The stations have been well received by Councillors, and that at Marsh Barton has received approval from Devon County Council (DCC)'s Cabinet for the submission of a detailed planning application. A Planning application has now been submitted for Marsh Barton and

there have been no objections from the public.

Torbay is to undertake similar consultation soon on Edginswell.

A Memorandum of Understanding is in place with First Great Western (FGW) and Network Rail (NR) to develop projects through the Devon Metro initiative, including Marsh Barton and Edginswell. DCC has worked jointly with both FGW and NR and consulted other operators through a Value Management Workshop exercise. DCC has also engaged with Devon and Cornwall Rail Partnership and Rail User Groups. There is consensus that providing new stations for strategic employment areas, and principle trip production and attraction areas, is a key part of developing the local rail network.

**Documents:**

# Economic

<b>Economic growth</b>				
<b>Connectivity</b>	What impact on end to end journey time?			<b>X</b>
	Does it impact cost of travel?			<b>X</b>
<b>Reliability</b>	Impact on journey time variability or average delay?			<b>X</b>
	Impact on number of incidents?			<b>X</b>
<b>Resilience</b>	Impact on the resilience of our infrastructure?			<b>X</b>
<b>Delivery of Growth</b>	Will the option facilitate new housing / employment / retail?			<b>X</b>
<p>The option will improve connections to the Marsh Barton and Edginswell areas (particularly for non car modes) by providing an alternative to congested highway corridors and, by removing vehicle trips, also reduce delay and travel cost on these corridors. Local rail travel has low average fares so it will also result in cheaper travel for public transport captive users who at present are limited to more expensive bus connections.</p> <p>There is the potential for some wider economic benefits as part of the wider investment in the local rail network. The option should provide increased resilience by providing an alternative to highway corridors. It is also designed to allow longer distance trains to stop if necessary to ensure that a service can be maintained during times of severe weather disruption on the sea wall.</p> <p>It will help facilitate new housing and jobs in South West Exeter and Torquay Gateway by providing relief to congested highway corridors, and is required within the Exeter Core Strategy<sup>1</sup> and Draft Torbay Local Plan<sup>2</sup> to support development in these areas.</p>				
<p><b>Documents:</b>  <sup>1</sup>Exeter Core Strategy <a href="http://www.exeter.gov.uk/index.aspx?articleid=10103">http://www.exeter.gov.uk/index.aspx?articleid=10103</a>  <sup>2</sup>Draft Torbay Local Plan <a href="http://www.torbay.gov.uk/newlocalplan">http://www.torbay.gov.uk/newlocalplan</a></p>				

<b>Wider Economic Benefits</b>			
		<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>WITA Assessment</b>	Assessment of the move to more / less productive jobs		<b>x</b>
	Agglomeration – Is the scheme located within a FUR?	<b>x</b>	
	Labour supply impacts	<b>x</b>	
	Output supply in imperfectly competitive markets	<b>x</b>	
<p>The schemes will improve access to key employment areas and have the potential to have some labour supply impacts in these areas.</p>			
<p><b>Documents:</b></p>			



<b>Carbon emissions</b>				
		<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	
<i>Embedded Carbon</i>	Is significant construction work required?			
<i>Carbon Content</i>	Does the option involve a lower carbon fuel?			<b>X</b>
		<b>+</b>		<b>-</b>
<i>Efficiency</i>	Does fuel per vehicle-km change?			<b>X</b>
<i>Activity</i>	Does vehicle-km change?			<b>X</b>
<p>Carbon emissions will be reduced by reducing car trips, and replacing these with travel by rail, which is a more fuel efficient mode. In addition the stations will be served by existing local services, and so there will be marginal emissions from the new station but considerable reductions from the reduced number of car trips.</p>				
<b>Documents:</b>				

<b>Socio-distributional impacts and the regions</b>			
		<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<i>Regeneration</i>	Does it impact on accessibility to key locations?	<b>X</b>	
	Does it impact on connectivity to central business districts?	<b>X</b>	
	Does it impact on a Regeneration Area(s)?	<b>X</b>	
	Assessment of Regeneration required? (If Yes to any of the above or scheme cost > £5m)	<b>X</b>	
<p>The option will improve access to strategic employment areas and to the Acute Hospitals for East, South and Mid Devon. This is particularly important for less affluent socio-economic groups, where car ownership is lower. Low average rail fares will assist these groups by ensuring that the new travel opportunities are affordable and provide an alternative to relatively expensive bus services on some routes. The rail network provides excellent connections to Central Business Districts (CBD) particularly in Exeter, and the new stations will therefore improve access to CBD's from the Edginswell and South West Exeter areas.</p>			
<b>Documents:</b>			

<b>Local environment</b>
<p>Both stations will largely be built within the existing railway boundary and are expected to have a low impact on the local environment. There is unlikely to be a significant noise impact as existing trains pass both sites and Marsh Barton will not be near residential houses. However, additional stopping of trains at Edginswell may cause some additional noise for local properties depending upon the final location.</p> <p>Environmental and ecological surveys have been undertaken at Marsh Barton and identified no significant issues, although there will be some loss of trees. An EIA scoping opinion from DCC Development Management team confirmed that no EIA was required for Marsh Barton. Any loss of trees can be mitigated by replanting. The visual impact at Marsh Barton is minimal due to the location adjacent to the new Energy from Waste plant and screening from existing tree planting. Similarly visual impact at Edginswell will be minimised by the location adjacent to Riviera Way.</p>

The combination of the two stations will remove vehicle trips from Air Quality Management Areas In Kingskerswell, Newton Abbot, Teignmouth, Dawlish and Exeter. The option will therefore have a positive impact on air quality in a number of locations.

**Documents:**

**Well being**

Both Marsh Barton and Edginswell stations will be well served by walking and cycling routes and access to the stations by these modes will be encouraged, having a positive impact on physical activity. In particular Marsh Barton will have excellent links to the Riverside Valley Park encouraging walking and cycling to the station and leisure trips from the station. Within Torbay there are high levels of deprivation and so encouraging travel by rail in this area, particularly by walking and cycling to stations, will have a notable positive impact on physical activity and health.

Rail travel is the safest form of land based transport and so encouraging travel by rail will have a positive impact on the number of deaths and injuries. Each station is required to have a Trespass and Vandalism Risk Assessment, which identifies the risk of crime such as trespass and vandalism and measures to mitigate this at new facilities. This will minimise the possibility of additional crime resulting from new stations.

Providing access to rail travel for these areas is expected to improve access to basic services by reducing journey time and increasing the reliability of travel. Neither station is expected to have any impact on levels of severance for pedestrian movement.

**Documents:**

**Expect Value for Money Category**

<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>
				<b>X</b>

A TUBA assessment has been undertaken for each station site. Travel time savings were calculated using the Exeter HQPT and South Devon Link Road highway assignment models respectively for Marsh Barton and Edginswell.

Capital cost at Marsh Barton includes 15% risk and contingency and 6% optimism bias. The optimism bias applied in line with WebTAG guidance for a station at GRIP4.

Capital cost at Edginswell includes 15% risk and contingency and 40% optimism bias. The optimism bias applied is in line with WebTAG guidance for a station at GRIP2.

The levels of optimism bias have not been adjusted for the VfM assessment

WebTAG recommends the following:

1. **Building Projects** (Stations and Terminal Buildings) - 51% OB at GRIP1

(Scheme Definition) and 4% at GRIP5 (Detailed Design).

2. **Rail** (Metro, Light Rail, Guided Buses, Conventional Rail, High Speed Rail) – 66% at GRIP1, 40% at GRIP3 (Option Selection) and 6% at GRIP5.

Clearly stations and terminal buildings provide the correct guidance for new stations. However, the estimates for Marsh Barton and Edginswell are at GRIP4 and GRIP2 respectively. Therefore a profile was developed for stations to estimate OB at each GRIP stage. This assumed the profile for rail schemes could be applied to building projects to estimate the GRIP3 OB for stations and that GRIP2/4 represented the mid Points between GRIP1/3/5.

Stage	Building Projects (Stations and Terminals)	Rail Schemes	New Stations OB Profile
GRIP1	51%	66%	51%
GRIP2			41%
GRIP3		40%	31%
GRIP4			17%
GRIP5	4%	6%	4%

	<i>Marsh Barton</i>	<i>Edginswell</i>
<b>Costs (2002 prices)</b>		
Investment Costs	£2.355m	£2.316m
Operating Costs	£2.444m	£2.712m
Indirect Tax Revenues	£2.655m	£10.334m
PVC	£7.454m	£15.362m
<b>Benefits (2002 prices)</b>		
Net Consumer Benefits	£9.929m	£21.840m
Net Business Benefits	£22.714m	£63.540m
Carbon	£0.268m	£0.926m
PVB	£32.911m	£86.306m
<b>NPV</b>		
	<b>£25.457m</b>	<b>£70.944m</b>
<b>BCR</b>		
	<b>4.41</b>	<b>5.62</b>

BCR rating: MEDIUM

The completed SDLR is assumed in the Do Minimum and Do Something models. The SDLR Saturn model was used to derive travel time benefits from the new station at Edginswell. Most economic benefit results from non-user time savings on the highway network and although rail passenger forecasts are similar, time savings for Marsh Barton are lower as most of the car trip reductions are in the non-peak direction in contrast to Edginswell where time savings in the peak direction are high. In addition, a review of the Edginswell modelling has identified high time savings and economic benefit in the 2016 PM peak due to high levels of congestion. The models converged properly so there should be minimal risk of large benefits resulting from an unstable model.

**Documents:**

# Managerial

<b>Implementation timetable</b>	1. 0-1 months	
	2. 1-6 months	
	3. 6-12 months	
	4. 1-2 years	
	5. 2-5 years	<b>X</b>
	6. 5-10 years	
	7. 10+ years	
	Don't Know	
		<b>Completion Dates</b>
<b>Marsh Barton</b> - Outline Design Approval in Principle - Detailed planning application and approval - Network change application and approval <b>Edginswell</b> - Option Selection Completion		2013/14
<b>Marsh Barton</b> - Procure Detailed Design and Construction. - Detailed Design <b>Edginswell</b> - Outline Design Approval in Principle - Detailed planning application and approval - Network change application and approval		2014/15
<b>Marsh Barton</b> - Construction, commissioning and testing - Station opening <b>Edginswell</b> - Procure Detailed Design and Construction.		2015/16
<b>Edginswell</b> - Detailed Design - Construction, commissioning and testing - Station opening		2016/17
<b>Documents:</b>		

<b>Public acceptability</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>
					<b>X</b>

The principle of investment in the local rail network, including Marsh Barton and Edginswell stations, received strong support in Local Transport Plan consultations. In fact investment in local rail received strong support from 84% of respondents. Just 5% of respondents were opposed to investment in local rail with the remainder unsure either way. Recent consultation on Marsh Barton station specifically has also received strong support. Both the concept of investment in local rail and the plans for new stations has also been very well received by councillors at District and County

levels including DCC's Cabinet.

Formal consultation will form part of the planning application for each station but there should be no further consultation requirement. The option will necessitate behavioural change in the form of mode shift. However, this is expected to follow established relationships, based on the generalised cost of travel, where evidence elsewhere has shown that rail can be extremely competitive if stations are close to both origins and destinations.

Consultation on Edginswell Station through the Draft Local Plan has also received positive feedback.

**Documents:**

<b>Practical feasibility</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>
					<b>X</b>

Demand forecasting has identified strong demand at each station. A timetable study has confirmed that Marsh Barton can be served by local train services. Further work is required to demonstrate the same for Edginswell. Either way, the timetable will need adjustment to facilitate the two stations, and this will need to be led by First Great Western during the Network Change application process for each station (which is a statutory requirement of the Office of Rail Regulation).

Design work is underway for both stations following the GRIP project management process. Outline designs are almost complete for Marsh Barton and await safety verification and sign off. Once this is complete the station will have Approval in Principle from Network Rail which will, in combination with Network Change Approval and Planning Permission, allow procurement of detailed design and construction contracts. A detailed planning application for Marsh Barton is due to be submitted early in 2013. Edginswell is currently undergoing the Option Selection stage and is approximately a year behind Marsh Barton.

A requirement was included in the Greater Western franchise Invitation to Tender (ITT) for bidders to serve the station. First Great Western has committed to continuing to work with DCC to deliver the stations, including supporting the Network Change process, if they are awarded a franchise extension (even if only short term). The future train operator will act as Station Facility Operator.

**Documents:**

<b>What is the quality of the supporting evidence</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>
				<b>X</b>	

Demand forecasting undertaken (but is not WebTAG compliant) and Transport User Benefit Analysis undertaken for Marsh Barton. The Devon Metro Appraisal Report<sup>1</sup> is publicly available and formed a key part of the Exeter City Core Strategy Examination in Public supporting evidence base. Forecasting and economics has recently been updated using up to date cost information and reflecting better the likely demand build up. A TUBA has also recently been undertaken for Edginswell.

Appraisal of the Marsh Barton and Edginswell station schemes was designed to be proportionate to the scale of development and risks with regard to rail patronage forecasts. It utilises rail mode shares and trip rates derived from data for the Exeter and Torbay area, and the non-user economic benefits of reduced traffic congestion estimated using local traffic models. Recent discussions with the DfT and Network Rail regarding the New Stations Bid for Newcourt, which used the same modelling approach, seems likely to confirm that the modelling approach is acceptable and only a limited amount of further work was required to provide additional information, carry out sensitivity tests and update the economics. This was completed in a few weeks and a similar process will commence shortly to provide the same level of appraisal for the Marsh Barton and Edginswell station schemes.

**Documents:**

<sup>1</sup>Devon Metro Appraisal Report <http://www.devon.gov.uk/eldf-devonmetroappraisal.pdf>

**Key risks**

Risk: Network Rail approval of outline designs.

Probability: Low risk.

Mitigation: Value Management workshop during GRIP3 (undertaken for Marsh Barton/to be undertaken for Edginswell).

Score: 4

Risk: Safety verification and application of European Interoperability Regulations.

Probability: Low risk (medium risk of delay)

Mitigation: Engagement with Network Rail

Score: 4

Risk: Objections from train and freight operating companies to Network Change application.

Probability: Low risk

Mitigation: Robust timetable capacity analysis.

Score: 4

Risk: Failure to agree final timetable to be implemented by Great Western franchisee.

Probability: Low risk

Mitigation: Early engagement of current Train Operating Company (TOC), and inclusion of Marsh Barton within franchise Invitation to Tender.

Score: 4

**Documents:**

# Financial

<b>Affordability</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>
					<b>X</b>
LTP funds available to ensure schemes are ready for delivery.					
<b>Documents:</b>					

<b>Capital Cost (£m)</b>	<b>£ 9.0m</b>
<p>Risk and optimism bias are included in the cost estimates for each station. The level of risk assumed is considered robust as it is based on a Quantified Risk Assessment undertaken for a new station at Newcourt, which is at the same stage of design as Marsh Barton. The level of optimism bias applied is considered compliant with WebTAG being based on the recommended values for “Stations and Terminal Buildings” and using the OB profile for Rail projects to derive values for new stations at GRIP2 and GRIP4.</p>	
<b>Documents:</b>	

<b>Revenue Costs (£m)</b>	<b>£0</b>																		
<p>Minor station operating costs exist relating to the operation and maintenance of the station facility, long term access charge and fuel cost of additional acceleration and deceleration of trains calling at the station.</p> <p>At Q2015 these are estimated at:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Marsh Barton (£ per annum)</th> <th>Edginswell (£ per annum)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Operation and Maintenance (taken as 4% of revenue)</td> <td>£52k</td> <td>£61k</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Long term station access charge</td> <td>£32k</td> <td>£32k</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Train service fuel cost</td> <td>£82k</td> <td>£73k</td> </tr> <tr> <td><b>Total Operating Cost</b></td> <td><b>£166k</b></td> <td><b>£166k</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cost to LTB</td> <td>£0</td> <td>£0</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>However, this cost will fall to the Train Operating Company and there will be no cost to the public purse. No subsidy will be required for these costs either as revenue is expected to more than cover operating costs.</p>			Marsh Barton (£ per annum)	Edginswell (£ per annum)	Operation and Maintenance (taken as 4% of revenue)	£52k	£61k	Long term station access charge	£32k	£32k	Train service fuel cost	£82k	£73k	<b>Total Operating Cost</b>	<b>£166k</b>	<b>£166k</b>	Cost to LTB	£0	£0
	Marsh Barton (£ per annum)	Edginswell (£ per annum)																	
Operation and Maintenance (taken as 4% of revenue)	£52k	£61k																	
Long term station access charge	£32k	£32k																	
Train service fuel cost	£82k	£73k																	
<b>Total Operating Cost</b>	<b>£166k</b>	<b>£166k</b>																	
Cost to LTB	£0	£0																	
<b>Documents:</b>																			

<b>Development Contributions (£m)</b>	<b>£1.9m</b>
Possible funds from S106, CIL or New Homes Bonus	

<b>Documents:</b>
-------------------

<b>Cost Profile</b>				
---------------------	--	--	--	--

<b>Earliest Start Date</b>				
----------------------------	--	--	--	--

<b>Expenditure Source</b>	<b>2013/14</b>	<b>2014/15</b>	<b>2015/16</b>	<b>2016/17</b>
Local Authority				
Developer	£0.1m	£0.3m	£1.4m	£0.1m
LTB			£3.7m	£3.4m
Total	£0.1m	£0.3m	£5.1m	£3.5m

Marsh Barton station will be ready to commence construction early in the LTB funding period. Edginswell will be approximately one year behind.

<b>Documents:</b>
-------------------

<b>Cost Risk</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>
------------------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------

<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>
X				

The designs for Marsh Barton are well developed and there is low risk of capital cost increase, especially given the robust risk and optimism bias applied. At Edginswell the designs are in an earlier stage of development but the scheme costs allow a suitable level of risk and optimism bias which is expected to reduce as the designs are developed further.

<b>Documents:</b>
-------------------



## Commercial

Flexibility of option	1	2	3	4	5
<p>The option is designed with considerable flexibility so that if the Local Transport Board wished to support only one of the two stations it could do so by supporting the station best placed for delivery by the LTB.</p> <p>In addition there is scope for scaling down at each station. In particular one option at Edginswell is expected to be less complex to construct and have limited parking and this could be selected to scale back the facilities at Edginswell. Other changes to the designs are limited by the design standards. Any opportunities for value engineering are also already being pursued.</p> <p>However, there may be opportunities to scale each station up with further platform extensions and enhanced passenger facilities. In addition, Marsh Barton is currently intended to have very limited parking facilities, which could be replaced by more extensive parking facilities.</p>			X		
<b>Documents:</b>					

<b>Where is funding coming from?</b>
<p>Capital cost to be funded through LTB with contributions from a combination of LTP and/or CIL/S106/New Homes Bonus</p> <p>Operating costs will be financed by train operator and station facility operator.</p>
<b>Documents:</b>

<b>Any income generated (£m)</b>	Y
<p>Revenue from new rail passengers generated by each station. An estimate of revenue for Marsh Barton was included in the Devon Metro Appraisal Report<sup>1</sup> and used in the TUBA assessment. An estimate of revenue from Edginswell has been prepared based on the Marsh Barton information. Both these estimates have been updated recently based on new information.</p> <p>Annual revenue: Marsh Barton: £1.2m Edginswell: £1.5m</p> <p>This additional revenue will cover station and train operating costs and reduce the level of subsidy required by the train operator.</p>	
<p><b>Documents:</b> <sup>1</sup>Devon Metro Appraisal Report <a href="http://www.devon.gov.uk/eldf-devonmetroappraisal.pdf">http://www.devon.gov.uk/eldf-devonmetroappraisal.pdf</a></p>	