



Health Education Thames Valley

Board meeting	20 March 2014
Report title	Innovation Challenge 2023 – 2014 proposal
Paper number	200314/3
Report author	Alison Jennings Tina Deaney Alexander Finlayson Edward Maile
Responsible director	Caroline Chipperfield, Director Thames Valley & Wessex Leadership Academy
FOI and/or confidentiality status	For public release
Report summary	The purpose of this paper is to; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To provide a short review of the 2023 Challenge which ran in 2013 • To give an outline of the proposed 2014 Challenge. • To decide the Governance for the next Challenge in 2014. • To request funding for the 2014 Challenge
Purpose (delete those not relevant)	Approval
Recommendation	The board is asked to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Approve funding for 2014. • Support the recommendations and next steps.
Strategic objective links (delete those not relevant)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Sustaining our staff and shaping the workforce 2. Harnessing technology 3. Improving training quality and values
Identified risks and risk management actions (delete those not relevant)	As outlined in this paper
Resource implications (delete those not relevant)	As outlined in this paper
Support to NHS Constitution	The 2023 Challenge has the concept of improving patient care at the very core of its design. Patient benefit was the main criteria when scoring ideas.
Legal implications and Equality and diversity assessment	Intellectual property and commercial sensitivity issues need to be taken into account when organising this competition. Non-disclosure agreements and ESCROWs are in place.

Innovation Challenge 2023 – 2014 proposal

1.0 Background

1.1 An Innovation Challenge for Doctors in Training was proposed in 2012 by the Oxford Deanery's Trainee Advisory Committee (TAC). The 2023 Challenge was supported by Health Education Thames Valley (HETV) and the Thames Valley and Wessex Leadership Academy (TVWLA) who both provided funding and support to develop the idea from concept to a viable competition. It received some additional limited funding from the Oxford Academic Health Science Network (AHSN). The Challenge final was held in November 2013 where 6 finalists, shortlisted from 57 applicants, pitched their ideas to a panel of judges. An investment fund of £100,000 has been shared between the 6 finalists who are now working with NHS Innovations South East to progress their projects.

1.2 The full background and lessons learned from the 2013 iteration of the 2013 Challenge are included in appendix A.

1.3 Whilst it is too early to say what the potential impact will be on patient care; we know that there has been a huge impact motivationally not only of the six finalists but across all applications. We believe that the evaluation will be able to initially look at the process and the motivational aspects over time we will be able to measure impact of patient care either directly through the success of the projects and /or through improved staff satisfaction impacting on patient care.

2.0 Proposal and recommendations

It is generally agreed that the 2023 Challenge was a significant success. In order to build on this momentum and to reflect HETV's status as a multi-professional organisation the following is proposed for a second Challenge to be supported in 2014:

1. Run a second year with a wider cohort, the 2014 the Challenge to also include all healthcare trainees; Nurses, Doctors and Allied Health Professionals for the second year we should encourage applications from both teams and as individuals.
2. Multi professional healthcare trainees should have a central role in organising the Challenge, to reflect the aim of improving trainee satisfaction and empowerment and to ensure that the Challenge remains relevant to its target audience.
3. Governance and lines of accountability will be provided by, and clarified by a programme board.
4. Set up a programme board with immediate effect, consisting of:
 - Chair – recommend a board member of HETV

- The Dean or a representative from Health Education Thames Valley
 - A representative from TVWLA team
 - Alexander Finlayson (2023 Challenge Co-Founder) or TAC Chair
 - Edward Maile (2023 Challenge Co-Founder)
 - Healthcare Trainees minimum two from nursing and AHP background
 - Project Manager
5. It is the view of the project team that the project board will have equal voting and decision making rights between organisational representatives and trainees.
 6. The board needs to be small enough to meet regularly and make quick decisions. The board will be supported by a Task and Finish group including a project manager, innovation support, trainees and 'Innovation Fellows'.
 7. Support the Challenge with a number of fellowships which will focus on promoting the event, identifying barriers and enablers to greater innovation from the developing workforce.
 8. Run the Challenge from August to November 2014 to fit around all developing workforce trainee calendars.
 9. It is the view of the Project Team that the Programme Board report to the HETV Board and TVWLA Board.
 10. Use the same format as last year. Specifically, a call for applications, an initial judging stage to select finalists, with mentoring for the finalists and a final event with a judging panel.
 11. By opening up to all healthcare trainees for year two provides a real opportunity for spread and adoption. We would then recommend a year to fully evaluate the challenge and at this time there is no expectation of a third consecutive year. This is because whilst we can evaluate the process and impact on individuals, we need a longer time to really evaluate the impact on patient care.
 12. Funding is required to support: the innovation investment fund; expert innovation mentoring and support for applicants; a Project Manager and multi-professional fellows; additional costs such as publicity and the final event.
 13. The costs outlined in this paper represent the full costs of running a Challenge (Appendix B) which is a projected total cost of £241,800. TVWLA is directly investing £62,000.
 14. HETV is asked to approve an investment figure of £179,800 from the £1,045,000 it has already set aside for TVWLA in the 14/15 budget. Depending on the investment offered by HETV additional funding will need to be sought from other sources to make up the balance. If the investment from HETV is not for the full remaining balance of £179,800 and other potential contributors are required HETV is asked to offer a view on potential suitable sponsors.

3.0 Potential Benefits

3.1 Improved Patient Care: The innovations funded are expected to have a positive impact on patient care. A summary of the projects with a brief progress update is included in appendix C.

There will be a motivational multiplying factor benefit as more NHS staff will share their ideas for improving patient care and innovating current practice. Already the other 51 applicants from the 2013 iteration of the challenge are receiving follow up support and advice on how to improve their ideas and take these forward locally within their employing organisations. There is a correlation between staff satisfaction and motivation and patient care.

3.2 HEE Mandate: The Challenge fulfils the Department of Health's Mandate to HEE, specifically: "Excellent Education", "Flexible Workforce Receptive to Research and Innovation" and "Supporting Research and Innovation". In particular, the 2023 Challenge is a programme that meets a number of the objectives within the HEE draft Research and Innovation Strategy which is out for consultation at the moment.

3.3 Multi – Professional Trainee Empowerment and Satisfaction: Health Education Thames Valley has the second lowest GMC Survey satisfaction survey for trainees. Initial feedback from the applicants was extremely positive, appreciating the opportunity for their ideas to be listened to and receive support. We therefore see the Challenge as an opportunity to significantly improve satisfaction and engagement amongst healthcare trainees, and to reposition the Thames Valley as a national leader in healthcare innovation and trainee empowerment.

4.0 Further Options:

4.1 In preparation for this Board Paper the existing 2023 project team have met with representatives from a number of related trainee initiatives and representatives from other professions outside of medicine.

4.2 Following these discussions we suggest there are opportunities to engage with the following networks to make an even greater impact:

- Agents of Change Conference, This is organised by the National Director's Clinical Fellows and members of the team are submitting an abstract to the conference.
- Midwifery Innovation Challenge
- Oxford Faculty of Medical Leadership and Management.
- Funding opportunities from other sources. Whilst the Agents for Change Conference is partly funded by Health Education England it also receives funds from the BMJ. Could the 2023 Challenge look at bidding for funds from other organisations/commercial sponsors?

5.0 Risks and challenges

5.1 The challenge brand needs to be looked at immediately before any promotional activity can commence. Whilst the current branding is strong in may not be appropriate for a competition that reflects a shifting timeframe (a decade to change the NHS).

5.2 The paper proposes opening the competition up to medical, nursing and allied health professional trainees. The total number of eligible trainees may be up to 20,000, covering a large geographical area. Therefore, the proposed challenge is significantly larger and more organisationally complex than the 2023 Challenge, and thus requires significantly more support and funding.

5.3 By widening the scale and scope of participation to doctors, nurses and allied health professionals there is also an impact on how entries are assessed (breadth of expertise) and the resources required to do this.

5.4 A risk may include that more Drs will apply than other professions. The Programme Board will need to agree how they will award equably and transparently for example it may be awarded by % against responses i.e. if 500 apply; 50% Drs they would be allocated 50% of finalist places; this will need to be considered by the programme board.

6.0 Summary

The 2023 Challenge was a significant success with a good momentum and hugely motivational to all of those involve with the potential to benefit patients, trainees and all stakeholder organisations. We are keen to build on this momentum with a competition in 2014. We believe that the competition can be a key component in placing Thames Valley at the forefront of innovation, training and patient care.

7.0 Next Steps

Once this proposal has been approved we plan to set up a programme board to agree the design and deliver the next Challenge.

Appendices

Appendix A Background and lessons learned from 2023 Challenge in 2013

Appendix B High level finances

Appendix C 2023 Finalist Project Progress Summary

Appendix A

1.0 Background

An Innovation Challenge for Doctors in Training was proposed in 2012 by the Oxford Deanery's Trainee Advisory Committee (TAC). The 2023 Challenge was supported by Health Education Thames Valley (HETV) and the Thames Valley and Wessex Leadership Academy (TVWLA) who both provided funding and support to develop the idea from concept to a viable competition. It received some additional limited funding from the Oxford Academic Health Science Network (AHSN).

The 2023 Challenge was open to any medical trainee within the Oxford Deanery who had an innovative idea with the potential to improve patient care from across technology, service delivery, education and research. Trainees were invited to submit their idea to the competition for the chance to receive funding and support to make their idea a reality. The broad aim of the Challenge was to drive innovation, and encourage greater empowerment of junior healthcare workers. Specifically, to support innovations which embraced the core values of the NHS, were sustainable and had the potential to improve patients' lives.

The Challenge opened in August 2013 and attracted 57 applications. 6 finalists were short-listed and received mentoring from NHS Innovations South East (NISE) to develop their ideas. The final was held on November 12th 2013 and the finalists presented their idea to a panel of judges. A total of £100,000 was awarded to the 6 finalists who are now working to implement their ideas with the continuing support of NISE.

2.0 Outcomes and Lessons Learned

The Challenge was a unique collaboration between new organisations during a year of transition and uncertainty, driven by a desire to demonstrate a joined up approach to the common challenge of driving innovation in healthcare.

TVWLA approached NISE and the AHSN early on to ensure that the competition had both rigour and credibility to distinguish it from other innovation competitions which purely award financial cash prizes. The project team worked in an agile way to drive the competition forward when organisational processes, bases and structures were still being determined. The services of a project manager were acquired by TVWLA in recognition of the scope of work involved in delivering the Challenge.

Feedback from all the contestants has been extremely positive with them stating that the Challenge has provided an opportunity for them to be heard and have their ideas taken forward. The Challenge has received both local and national interest and presentations have been made to Health Education England and the Department of Health. The University of Southampton is currently in the process of conducting an exhaustive evaluation of the impact of the Challenge. This evaluation includes qualitative interviews with the 6 finalists over the next 12 months exploring the impact of the Challenge in the

progression of their projects. The evaluation also includes a survey of the 57 applicants and 2200 medical trainees to ascertain the impact of the competition in promoting innovation and trainee engagement.

The lessons learned from the 2023 Challenge are as follows:

What worked well?

- Produced a successful innovation competition during a transition year with high calibre entries with the potential make quality improvements impact on patient care.
- Easy application process to enter the competition and clear design of process.
- Highly effective branding and marketing which resulted in an unprecedented level of entries.
- Finalists received excellent mentoring support and ongoing innovation expertise from NISE – this element was seen as a unique factor from other innovation competitions.

What could have been improved or were challenges which emerged:

- The project was more complex than first thought – issues of intellectual property required expertise outside of the initial project team.
- The project straddled a major change in the structure of the NHS. The emerging organisational structure of the NHS was initially confusing and difficult to navigate.
- There was a lack of organisational buy in/ awareness from the employing organisations – these organisations will ultimately benefit from potential improvements to service and/ or potential income generation. Need to engage more fully for 2014.
- The full cost of the Challenge was more than originally forecast due to the need for innovation expertise and additional project management resource. TVWLA provided further considerable investment to meet additional resource, innovation expertise and evaluation costs.

Suggestion for improvements in 2014:

- Governance in 2013 initially sat with the Postgraduate Medical Dean and the Director of TVWLA. To reflect the complexity of the project it is suggested that a programme board be formed to provide governance and clear accountability in 2014.
- Run the final event over 2 days, split into the “*Dragons Den*” and the awards ceremony.
- Assign a project board which has executive control of the project.
- Host a smaller final event with greater involvement from employer organisations.
- Distinctions need to be clear on the different roles partner organisations play – partner; sponsor or lead organisation.

Appendix B

Projected Costs of the 2023 Challenge 2014

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Cost</u>
Venue for ' <i>Dragons Den</i> ' and event evening	£10,000
Innovation expertise, support and management pre and post competition to secure successful projects	£60,000
Interim project management support	£31,800
Event production costs (audio visual support ,videoing Dragon's Den, and other production costs for event final)	£12,000
Branding and marketing	£3,000
Communications Support	£3,000
Investment fund	£60,000
Total	£179,800
<u>TVWLA funded input to project</u>	
Dedicated TVWLA management support – contracted additional hours from Marion Lynch	£10,000
Fellowships (1XGP, 1XST2, 1XAHP)	£37,000
Innovation and leadership workshops	£15,000
TVWLA Funding Total	£62,000
2014 Project Total	£241,800

- This is a projected cost based on last year's estimates and the proposed managed extension of the competition to other professionals
- TVWLA will fund input into the project of £62,000 which does not include senior team time costs.
- HETV is asked to determine the contribution to the remaining £179,800 required to deliver this project from the allocation made to TVWLA. Agreement is also sought on whether other contributors are required and who would be viewed as appropriate partners. HETV staff time costs are also not included but input would be essential from a number of key HETV staff and teams to ensure success.

Appendix C

2023 Finalist Project Progress Summary:

The following report provides an overview of the first 3 months of the six finalist's projects. It should be recognised that considerable progress has been made by the 6 finalists as this work is being completed in their free time as each is progressing a full-time medical career. Please note that there are IP and commercial sensitivities around a number of these projects hence a lack of detail at this time.

- Dr Angus Goodson, Milton Keynes Hospital NHS Foundation Trust – Portable Drug Delivery Device. This is a very complex project, currently in the process of scoping out the project management.
- Dr Asli Kalin, Oxford University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust - “How to APP” a mobile app for junior doctors to help to navigate hospital systems and procedures. Have met with Deputy Medical Director and Professor Sullivan, Director of Medical Education at the (OUH) and has hospital buy in - In process of obtaining 3 quotes to create an app. Meet with Junior Doctors at OUH to discuss content of application.
- Mr Samuel Folkard, Oxford University Medical School - Novel Shunt (a medical device). In process of obtaining a CAD drawing, and quotes from 3 patent attorneys to carry out a detailed patent search. If patent search proves positive the intention is to file for a patent.
- Dr Rachel Clarke, Oxford University Hospital NHS Foundation Trust- “iBlood” is an innovative teaching website combining patient interviews, interactive tutorials, self-assessment materials and consultant podcasts to bring haematology alive for a non-specialist audience. The target is medical students and junior doctors many of whom have limited contact with haematology in-patients and hence little opportunity to appreciate the human consequences of a haematological diagnosis. This is already under development and will be showcased at The Royal Society of Haematology conference on the 28 – 30 April in Birmingham due to be completed in September 2014.
- Dr Charlotte Somerville, Heatherwood and Wexham Park NHS Foundation Trust – Surgi Consent a mobile app to improve doctor/patient communication regarding surgery. Has appointed a developer to create a beta version of the app.
- Miss Abbie Taylor, Oxford University Medical School - High Impact Medical Careers Network, will be an online platform to facilitate research and advise on high impact careers in healthcare. This will build a network of people with similar interests, and conduct outreach work to increase awareness amongst doctors and other healthcare professionals about maximising the possible impact of their careers. Progress includes the creation of a website

requirement document, discussion of the project with several web development companies and is in process of obtaining 3 quotes for creating the website.