



For immediate release

Challenges to books and policies continue in Canadian libraries

(Ottawa, December 1, 2011) The Canadian Library Association's Intellectual Freedom Advisory Committee has released the results of its annual survey of challenges to library resources and policies in Canada for 2010.

For the first time in five years, no challenges were reported to *And Tango Makes Three*, the children's picture book published in 2005 by Peter Parnell and Justin Richardson.

Altogether, 92 challenges were reported in the 2010 survey that is conducted annually by the Canadian Library Association (CLA) Intellectual Freedom Advisory Committee. Of these, 87 were to library resources and five involved library policies.

The survey revealed 85 unique titles were challenged. Only two items were challenged twice, the LGBTQ weekly newspaper *Xtra! West*, and the Punjabi and English versions of the Sikh religious text *Guru Granth Sahib* (also called *Adi Granth*). Author Neil Gaiman's works received two challenges, for *American Gods* and *M is for Magic*.

Challenges were multi-layered, almost always involving more than one rationale and altogether totalling 142 grounds for objections to the 87 titles targeted in 2010. The many-pronged justification offered by a public library complainant about *The Waiting Dog*, a picture book by Carolyn and Andrea Beck published in 2003, illustrates this phenomenon: "violence; offensive language; age inappropriate; obscene content, language and pictures."

The vast majority of both resource and policy challenges, more than 80%, occurred in public libraries, and all but one of the other challenges took place in school libraries. By far the majority of concerns were initiated by patrons in general (65%) or by parents and guardians (24%). In all but two of the 87 challenges to library resources, targeted items remained on library shelves. Three-quarters of retained materials were unchanged in status. However, 16% resulted in restricted access and 9% in relocation or reclassification.

Five policy challenges were reported in 2010, involving a range of requests: to ban restricted movies from those under 18 years of age; to allow family members to pick up materials on hold for spouses; to extend library hours for an afterschool homework program for all students; to relocate college library print resources related to sexual satisfaction in marriage from the general collection to the teacher resource section in the back room; and to ban offensive material of a graphic nature.

Findings of the 2010 survey provide clear evidence that attention to the core value of intellectual freedom remains central to the advocacy work of Canadian librarians and their allies. As CLA President

Karen Adams observes: "Libraries have a basic responsibility to maintain access to the right of all persons in Canada to have access to all expressions of knowledge, creativity, and intellectual activity."

With the high number of challenges reported to entire series of titles over the last two years, a recommendation is made encouraging library decision-makers to adopt a policy of requiring complainants to fill out a separate reconsideration form for each and every individual title in a series, if that is not already the practice.

The full report of the survey with a complete list of challenges can be found at:

http://www.cla.ca/Content/NavigationMenu/CLAAatWork/Committees/2010_cla_if_survey-report-finalAug15.pdf

The Canadian Library Association is Canada's largest national and broad-based library association, representing the interests of public, academic, school and special libraries, all who work in libraries, and all those concerned about enhancing the quality of life of Canadians through information and literacy. Information about CLA and its programs and services is available at: www.cla.ca.

- 30 -

Media Contact: Judy Green, (613) 232-9625 ext 322 or jgreen@cla.ca

Challenges to Canadian Library Resources and Policies in 2010:
*Report of the Annual Survey of the
Intellectual Freedom Committee, Canadian Library Association*

Alvin M Schrader, Donna Bowman, and Toni Samek
August 2011

For the first time in five years, no challenges were reported in the 2010 annual survey of challenges to library materials and policies in Canadian libraries to *And Tango Makes Three*, the children's picture book published in 2005 by Peter Parnell and Justin Richardson. Even so, another LGBTQ-positive picture book was challenged for the first time in 2010, *Uncle Bobby's Wedding*, a 2008 publication by Sarah S Brannen.

Altogether, 92 challenges were reported in the 2010 survey that is conducted annually by the Canadian Library Association (CLA) Intellectual Freedom Committee. Of these, 87 were to library resources and five involved library policies.

A resource challenge is an attempt to remove or restrict materials based on objections of a person or group, in order to prevent or limit access. A policy challenge is an attempt to change access standards for library resources.

The survey revealed 85 unique titles were challenged. Only two items were challenged twice, the LGBTQ weekly newspaper *Xtra! West*, and the Punjabi and English versions of the Sikh religious text *Guru Granth Sahib* (also called *Adi Granth*). Author Neil Gaiman's works received two challenges, for *American Gods* and *M is for Magic*.

Two series were challenged, once each, the Dark Horse manga series of 14 titles based on four of the *Star Wars* movies, and the seven titles in the *Harry Potter* movie series. (A challenged series is counted as the total number of individual titles.)

Challenges were multi-layered, almost always involving more than one rationale and altogether totalling 142 grounds for objections to the 87 titles targeted in 2010. The many-pronged justification offered by a public library complainant about *The Waiting Dog*, a picture book by Carolyn and Andrea Beck published in 2003, illustrates this phenomenon: "violence; offensive language; age inappropriate; obscene content, language and pictures."

Three major reasons accounted for 60% of all complaints: "sexually explicit," mentioned 33 times; "age inappropriate," mentioned 31 times; and "violent," mentioned 23 times. There were 10 complaints about offensive language, and another four or fewer complaints on the grounds each of racism, nudity, insensitivity, sexism, homosexuality, anti-ethnicity, inaccuracy,

drugs/drug use, political viewpoint, religious viewpoint, sex education, or “does not support curriculum.”

Some two-thirds of all challenges to library materials involved books (38 titles) and graphic novels (21 titles), and 26% of the others were to DVDs. Two challenges were lodged to a newspaper, two to magazines/journals, and one to a sound recording.

Of the 21 challenges to graphic novels, 15 titles (70%) were for children’s publications in that genre. There were also 12 other challenges to children’s picture books and three to children’s fiction. Four challenges were reported to young adult fiction and nine each to adult fiction and adult non-fiction.

The vast majority of both resource and policy challenges, more than 80%, occurred in public libraries, and all but one of the other challenges took place in school libraries. By far the majority of concerns were initiated by patrons in general (65%) or by parents and guardians (24%). Two challenges each were initiated by grandparents, library administrators, and library staff members, and one challenge each by a school student, a school administrator, an educational assistant, a chief librarian, a chief and council, and an elected official.

In all but two of the 87 challenges to library resources, targeted items remained on library shelves. Three-quarters of retained materials were unchanged in status. However, 16% resulted in restricted access and 9% in relocation or reclassification. Most challenges were resolved quickly, within a month, but a few took six months or longer.

Five policy challenges were reported in 2010, involving a range of requests: to ban restricted movies from those under 18 years of age; to allow family members to pick up materials on hold for spouses; to extend library hours for an afterschool homework program for all students; to relocate college library print resources related to sexual satisfaction in marriage from the general collection to the teacher resource section in the back room; and to ban offensive material of a graphic nature. Four of the five challenged policies were revised in compliance with expressed concerns; one policy was unchanged.

Two items were reported in both the 2009 and 2010 surveys, the DVD documentary *Islam: What the West Needs to Know*, and the children’s book *My Mom's Having a Baby!: A Kid's Month-to-Month Guide to Pregnancy*, by Dori Hillestad Butler.

Findings of the 2010 survey provide clear evidence that attention to the core value of intellectual freedom remains central to the advocacy work of Canadian librarians and their allies.

As CLA President **Karen Adams** observes: "Libraries have a basic responsibility to maintain access to the right of all persons in Canada to have access to all expressions of knowledge, creativity, and intellectual activity."

With the high number of challenges reported to entire series of titles over the last two years (four challenges to a series of 10 books and one challenge each to series of variously 15 books, 29 books, 2 items, 7 DVDs, and 14 manga), a recommendation is made encouraging library decision-makers to adopt a policy of requiring complainants to fill out a separate reconsideration form for each and every individual title in a series, if that is not already the practice.

The *Annual Challenges Survey*, initiated in 2006 by Toni Samek who was then convenor of the CLA Intellectual Freedom Committee, has now been conducted for five years (bilingually since 2009). The Canadian survey was inspired by two precursors, the Edmonton Public Library's challenged materials spreadsheet, and the confidential database maintained since 1990 by the American Library Association (ALA). ALA's online challenge reporting form can be found at:

<http://www.ala.org/ala/issuesadvocacy/banned/challengeslibrarymaterials/challengereporting/onlinechallengeform/index.cfm>. The form can also be printed as a pdf.

The goal of the CLA *Annual Challenges Survey* is to document complaints about materials and policies in publicly-funded Canadian libraries with a view to informing the Association's policy and advocacy work for intellectual freedom on behalf of the CLA membership. An innovation in the Canadian approach was the inclusion on the 2007 survey of questions about challenges to library policies related to intellectual freedom or access to resources.

The Survey is voluntary, and the self-reports forwarded to the Committee represent only a fraction of all challenges that occur during any calendar year. The American Library Association's estimate is that for every challenge reported in their Web database, four to five go unreported.

**List of Challenges to Resources and Policies
Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2010**

(bibliographic descriptions are primarily reproduced as reported by library officials)

Series – 1 challenge each:

Harry Potter (DVDs), series of 7 titles

Star Wars manga series, Volume 3, Dark Horse Comics (series of 14 manga), by George Lucas and illustrated by Hisao Tamaki and Tom Orzechowski, translated from the Japanese

Individual item – 2 challenges each:

Guru Granth Sahib (also called *Adi Granth*)

Xtra! West

Individual item – 1 challenge each:

The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-Time Indian by Sherman Alexie

Akeelah and the Bee (DVD) written and directed by Doug Atchison, produced by Laurence Fishburne, Sidney Ganis, Nancy Hult, Daniel Llewelyn, and Michael Romersa

Alice on Her Way by Phyllis Reynolds Naylor

Alice the Brave by Phyllis Reynolds Naylor

American Gods by Neil Gaiman

Beauty's Punishment by Anne Rice

Big Bad Bun by Jeanne Willis and illustrated by Tony Ross

The Bigness Contest by Florence Parry Heide

Black Hole by Charles Burns

The Boys: Herogasm, Volume 5

Breakdowns: Portrait of the Artist as a Young %@&!* by Art Spiegelman

Bruno written by Sacha Baron Cohen and others

Calf Roping by Roy Cooper

Catwoman: Crime Pays by Will Pfeifer

Certain People: A Book of Portraits by Robert Mapplethorpe

CFA: 100 Success Secrets – 100 Most Asked Questions by Howard Cohen

Chicken Soup for the Unsinkable Soul by Jack Canfield et al.

Cold Feet by Cynthia DeFelice

The Complete Fairy Tales of Charles Perrault translated by Neil Philip and Nicoletta Simborowski

Dear Dumb Diary: Never Underestimate Your Dumbness by Jim Benton
Dino Dinners by Nick Manning and Brita Granstorm
Don't Be That Guy by Colin Nissan and Sean Farrell
The Dumb Bunnies Go to the Zoo by Dav Pilkey
Eastern Promises by David Cronenberg (writer/director)
Egg Drop by Mini Grey
Fanny Hill: Memoirs of a Woman of Pleasure (DVD) directed by James Hawes, produced by Nigel Marchant
Gardens of the Night
Good Evening Vietnam by Brian McNally, *Vanity Fair Magazine*, April 2008
Grace (DVD) written and directed by Paul Solet (screenplay)
The Great Mouse Detective (Disney)
Guru Granth Sahib
Hot City by Barbara Joosse
Huckleberry Finn by Mark Twain
In the Realm of the Senses directed by Nagisa Oshima
Islam: What the West Needs to Know (DVD)
Jay Wiseman's Erotic Bondage Handbook by Jay Wiseman
Lost Song (DVD)
M is for Magic by Neil Gaiman
Man Bites Dog (DVD)
The Man Handler by Cairo
Maria Monk by Sylvie Ouellette (French)
The Muppets Wizard of Oz
Murphy's Law by Colin Bateman
My Mom's Having a Baby by Dori H Butler
The New Adventures of Jesus Christ: The Second Coming by Frank Stack
Outside Over There by Maurice Sendak
Pir by Vladimir Sorokin
Real Outlaws (DVD)
Rolling Stone Magazine (specifically September 2010 cover)
See Inside Pirate Ships by Rob Lloyd Jones
Slocum and the Lucky Lady by Jake Logan

Stars by Jordan Ladd, Samantha Ferris and Gabrielle Rose

Swans in the Mist by D E Athkins

The Third Woman: The Secret Passion that Inspired "The End of the Affair" by William Cash

Tintin in the Congo by Hergé

Trick 'r Treat (DVD)

Uncle Bobby's Wedding by Sarah S Brannen

Victim Six by Gregg Olson

Voices of Iraq

A Voyage Long and Strange: Rediscovering the New World by Tony Horwitz

The Waiting Dog written and illustrated by Carolyn and Andrea Beck

War Stories (Volume 1) by Garth Ennis

Zift (DVD)

[title unreported], by Paul Kropp

Policies – 1 challenge each:

Policy request to change "Restricted" rating to disallow borrowing to those under 18 years of age.

Policy request to allow family members to pick up materials on hold for spouse.

Policy request to extend library hours for an afterschool homework program for all students.

Policy request to relocate college library print resources related to sexual satisfaction in marriage from the general collection to the teacher resource section in the back room.

Policy request to ban offensive material of a graphic nature.

List of Challenges to Resources and Policies Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2010

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
1	Adult graphic novel	The New Adventures of Jesus Christ: the Second Coming by Frank Stack	Other "An offensive joke book about God whose purpose is to degrade and insult Christianity." "The book should be removed."	Patron	Public	Material retained The book targets contemporary American society, not Christianity. It exemplifies the counter-culture mood of the 60's and the book was well reviewed and the author/artist well-known. It is understood that material purchased to meet the needs and interests of some customers may be offensive to others.	Ontario	October 4, 2010; resolved Jan. 3, 2011
2	Book Adult nonfiction intended to help readers prepare for the CFA exam	CFA: 100 Success Secrets by Howard Korbin	Does not support curriculum Other The customer found that the content is worthless and does not provide useful information. The customer wanted the book removed from the collection.	Patron	Public	Material removed Information was out-of-date and unreliable and the book was poorly written. It is not useful for its intended audience.	Ontario	Sept. 23, 2010, resolved Jan. 3, 2011
3	Book Children's picture book about a dog waiting for a mailman and fantasizing about eating him.	The Waiting Dog by Carolyn and Andrea Beck	Violence Offensive language Age inappropriate The customer found that the book had obscene content, language and pictures. The customer wanted it removed from the collection.	Patron	Public	Material retained The picture book is targeted at older readers and has a large label on the cover warning of scary content. It is popular and has circulated well. The Library recognizes that parents and guardians have different view on appropriate material for children and depends on them to make decisions regarding their children.	Ontario	Aug 25, 2010, resolved Oct 29, 2010
4	Book An adult graphic novel - a collection of four stories about WWII	War Stories Volume 1 by Garth Ennis	Sexually explicit Age inappropriate The customer found that the book has sexual content and visually explicit pictures - no value for students or youth. The customer wanted the book removed.	Patron	Public	Material retained The book contains adult content and is shelved in the adult collection. The author and artists are well known and the book is popular. Customers have the right to reject material for their own use but cannot restrict the freedom of others to have access to it.	Ontario	June 18, 2010, resolved Sept 3, 2010
5	DVD A comedy film, purported to be a documentary about a gay Austrian journalist who comes to America to become famous.	Bruno, written by and starring Sacha Baron Cohen	Sexually explicit The customer found the film pornographic and shocking. The customer wanted the DVD removed from the collection.	Patron	Public	Material retained Bruno is a satire which mocks homophobia and celebrity culture. It is a popular mainstream movie with an 18A rating, which means that it cannot be borrowed by anyone under 18. It is understood that some material the Library acquires to meet the needs and interest of some customers may be offensive to others.	Ontario	May 7, 2010, resolved Aug 4, 2010
6	Book Adult novel in urban fiction/street lit genre	The Man Handler by Cairo	Sexually explicit The customer felt that the book was pornography and customers should buy it for themselves. The customer did not want any more books purchased by the author.	Patron	Public	Material retained The urban fiction genre is very popular - novels are set in the inner city and may feature explicit profanity, violence and sex. Most mainstream publishers have an urban fiction imprint - this title is from a Simon & Shuster imprint and Cairo is a well-known author. It fits with the Library's goal of providing a diverse public with a collection that reflects their needs and interests. It is understood that some material selected for some users may be offensive to others. The book was retained and titles by Cairo will continue to be acquired.	Ontario	June 11, 2010, resolved July 7, 2010

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
7	Book Graphic novel/comic book in the children's collection, first published in 1934	Tintin in the Congo by Herge.	Racism The customer found that the book depicts Africans in a grossly stereotypical way that may have been acceptable when the book was published but is no longer. The author made revisions to the book and the 2005 edition owned by the Library contains a foreword explaining the colonial attitudes that prevailed when it was written The customer wanted the book removed from the children's collection, if not completely from the system.	Patron	Public	Material retained Material relocated/reclassified The Tintin series continues to be popular so the title was retained. However, staff did not think that children would either read the foreword or place the book in its historical context. It was moved to the adult graphic book collection - it will still be accessible to customers of all ages but its location signifies its adult content.	Ontario	Jan. 4, 2010, resolved May 11, 2010
8	Magazine/journal Article in the "Letters from..." series in Vanity Fair describing the author's experiences in Vietnam.	"Good Evening Vietnam" by Brian McNally in Vanity Fair magazine	Racism Sexism The customer found that the article bordered on hate literature in its description of Vietnamese women and the poor. [The City's] ethnic communities' tax money should not be supporting this magazine. The customer wanted staff to write a letter to Vanity Fair objecting to the article and to remove the magazine from the collection if a second similar article was published.	Patron	Public	Material retained Vanity Fair was retained in the collection. The Library stated that the article reflected the author's personal views, not the magazine's publishers. Vanity Fair is covered by the Materials Selection Policy - contemporary material of current interest that represents varying points of view. Regarding the letter - as a public institution dedicated to intellectual freedom, the Library does not express opinions on the content of material.	Ontario	Jan. 7, 2010, resolved March 18, 2010
9	Book Teen mass market paperback	Swans in the Mist by D. E. Athkins	Violence Age inappropriate The villain had a sadistic nature and might give a teen reading the book might have violent ideas. Customer wanted the book withdrawn or moved to the adult collection.	Patron	Public	Material retained The book was retained in the teen fiction collection.	Ontario	Jan. 14, 2010, resolved March 18,2010
10	DVD	Trick 'r Treat DVD	Sexually explicit pornographic scene	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC	November 4, 2010 December 10, 2010
11	Policy linked to Trick 'r Treat DVD		Sexually explicit pornographic scene request change to Restricted rating; disallow borrowing to those under 18 years of age	Patron	Public	Material retained [and policy/]	BC	
12	DVD Bulgarian language DVD	Zift DVD	Violence extremely dark	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC	November 26, 2010 resolved December 10, 2010
13	Magazine/journal specifically September 2010 cover (Trueblood)	Rolling Stone magazine specifically September 2010 cover	Sexism Violence images of sexual victimization promotes discrimination, contempt; pornographic patron viewed material as pornographic; requested that library cancel subscription to magazine	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC	October 28, 2010 - not yet resolved

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
14	DVD documentary film	Islam; What the West need to Know DVD	Anti-ethnicity Inaccuracy Racism Political viewpoint Other lack of evidence, analysis, authority; inflammatory	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC	October 14, 2010 Resolved November 15, 2010
15	DVD	Lost Song DVD	Nudity Sexually explicit patron requested rating change and keeping out of public view	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC	July 19, 2010 Resolved July 29, 2010
16	DVD	Man Bites Dog DVD	Nudity Sexually explicit Violence MPAA NC-17 rating (equivalent to 18A) concern about loaning to children or teens	Patron	Public	Material retained Library does not allow borrowing of adult DVDs by children, or of 18A or restricted DVDs by minors	BC	June 4, 2010 June 10, 2010
17	Book Russian language novel	Pir by Vladimir Sorokin	Violence Political viewpoint Offensive language objected to cannibalism, infanticide in one short story	Patron	Public	Material retained Author is recognized as deliberately provocative and 'outrageous', challenging many societal norms; uses literature to attack totalitarianism in thought and practice	BC	May 18, 2010 Resolved June 10, 2010
18	Book Adult novel	"Victim Six" by Gregg Olson	Insensitivity Sexism Sexually explicit Offensive language The book's plot was very similar to the Homolka/Bernardo tragedy. The serial rapist/killer character uses extremely demeaning, sexually offensive language with female characters in the book. Upon returning the novel, "Victim Six," the patron, an avid reader, suggested that we remove the book from our shelves as she found it brutally offensive due specifically to the attitude, behaviour, and language the main character inflicts on various female characters.	Patron	Public	Material retained Material relocated/reclassified Material restricted I am in the process of ordering spine labels for books that are of a graphic nature. They will be available only to patrons above legal age.	Manitoba	November 2, 2010 Resolved January 11, 2011
19	Policy linked to <i>Victim Six</i> novel challenge	We are in the course of creating a system, beyond what is provided by way of information through our cataloguing system, that will identify graphic/sexually explicit materials. We do not wish to censor any publications; that is against all protocol.	The patron thought our policy should be changed to ban any such offensive material.	Patron	Public	Material retained Material relocated/reclassified Material restricted I am in the process of ordering spine labels for books that are of a graphic nature. They will be available only to patrons above legal age.	Manitoba	November 2, 2010 Resolved January 11, 2011

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
20	Book	Huckleberry Finn: Mark Twain.	Racism The author describes the "African American" character, Jim, as a "nigger." There was, near to that same date, in the "Financial Post," an editorial/letter to the editor decrying the upcoming republishing of the novel which will replace the word "nigger," which is used some 200+ times, with the word "slave." While we agree that the word "nigger" has no place in ANY society; it was used commonly in the era the novel was written. It is not simply a word for "slave." Prejudice :	Library administrator	Public	Material retained While it is unacceptable in today's society- and I recall correcting my elders in the '60's- people who were not knowingly using the word as an intentional slight; they just knew it as the word that then became: "blacks" and then "coloured" and then "African American." We had a great discussion about how the slaves who built the pyramids were NOT "niggers" - nor were the Irish slaves that the English forced to develop the sugar cane industry in the Caribbean. Are "negroes" who reside in Canada "African Canadians" and in England, and so on. We were challenged to learn the scientific terminology for all races: Caucasian, Asian, etc. It Caucasians are known as "whites" and that is not considered derogatory, why do we feel that "black" IS derogatory? This is an endless issue, and certainly won't be resolved among one small group in a library! I was going to use the novel to read to a group - and had prepared a full presentation about the use of the word, and how at various times, we adapt to the growing awareness of society. I decided against the presentation, as the editorial and republishing of the novel was drawing more attention to it than I felt prepared to deal with. As mentioned above, we did not remove the existing novel, as we see it as an opportunity to teach the reader the history of the time, and we will likely not purchase the republished work. One should NOT mess with literature.	Manitoba	January 24, 2011.
21	Book Kids' picture book	Butler, Dori H. My Mom's Having a Baby	Sex education Patron felt content was too sophisticated for a child.	Patron	public	Material retained	Ontario	Nov. 26, 2009, resolved Jan. 28, 2010
22	DVD	Gardens of the Night	Sexually explicit Violence Viewer felt that prostitution & rape scenes were too graphic Patron felt content was too graphic	Patron	public	Material retained	Ontario	April 30, 2010, resolved June 2, 2010
23	Book YA short stories	M is for Magic by Neil Gaiman	Sexually explicit Offensive language Age inappropriate First short story has sexuality; p. 30 - lewd expressive language; p. 63 language and themes mature. Should be in teen collection.	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified We agreed that while the artwork on the cover might suggest it is for a younger audience, it is better suited for teens and was moved to our teen collection.	Ontario	September 30, 2010 Response October 14, 2010

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
24	Book Sound recording Other Audiobook download via OverDrive database: "In the erotic sequel to The Claiming of Sleeping Beauty, Beauty is sold into sexual slavery and forced to obey the orders of the Captain and Mistress Lockley."	Beauty's Punishment by Anne Rice	Sexually explicit Violence Violence towards women, associated with sex. Patron felt reading the material would result in harm to the human mind and soul.	Patron	public	Material retained Because the Overdrive database is a region-wide system, a committee with representatives from various member libraries was convened, and the material was reviewed. A collection development policy specifically for Overdrive was drafted, and ultimately, the material was retained.	Alberta	Challenged: Dec 4, 2010 Resolved: Dec 20, 2010
25	Book Genre Western paperback: ""Twenty years ago, Slocum sent the outlaw Durango to prison. Released by a bought pardon, Durango goes back to his outlaw ways, terrorizing folks in the village of Antonio. With the help of Doña, a spunky border woman in need of an escort home, Slocum journeys into Mexico in search of the ruthless bandit. Now Slocum has to outwit Durango, before the outlaw from his past puts an end to his future..."--p. [4] of cover.	Slocum and the Lucky Lady by Jake Logan	Sexually explicit Patron felt material was pornographic and did not belong in a public library.	Patron	public	Material retained	Alberta	Challenged: November 22nd, 2010 Resolved: December 16th, 2010
26	DVD, feature film. "After losing her unborn child, Madeline Matheson insists on carrying the baby to term. Following the delivery, the child miraculously returns to life with an appetite for human blood. Madeline is faced with a mother's ultimate decision."	Grace - DVD Director: Paul Solet Writer: Paul Solet (screenplay) Stars: Jordan Ladd, Samantha Ferris and Gabrielle Rose	Violence Other Disturbing, offensive Patron felt the film was visually offensive, disturbing, especially to young mothers/women, and cautioned that it should not be watched by pregnant women. Requested that material be labeled with a warning of its contents.	Patron	Public	Material retained	Alberta	Challenged: Sept 20, 2010 Resolved: Oct 17, 2010
27	Book Children's picture book. "A young hippopotamus worries that he is too big to be good at anything, but with the help of Aunt Emerald he learns that "You can always find something to be good at, you just have to find out what it is."	The Bigness Contest by Florence Parry Heide	Insensitivity References to fatness associated with laziness. Patron felt that the book created negative associations and judgments about weight	Patron	Public	Material retained Material was returned to circulation	Alberta	Challenged: June 8, 2010 Resolved: June 17, 2010

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
28	Newspaper This is a free monthly publication focusing on gay and lesbian news.	Xtra West	Sexually explicit Patron asked that this free publication be moved into a less visible location in the branch library due to the perceived sexually explicit cover.	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC	December 2010 [no resolution date given, but appears to have been resolved]
29	Book Adult non-fiction	A Voyage Long and Strange: Rediscovering the New World / Tony Horwitz	Inaccuracy Patron disagreed with the historical perspective of the author. Patron felt that the book perpetuates an outdated idea (Europeans are the only people who "discovered" North America) and that it ignores the culture and presence of First Nations in North America.	Patron	Public	Material retained The Manager, Collections discussed the patron's concerns with her and noted that we try to provide collections that include works with other points of view, rather than suppress single works. This didn't turn into a formal challenge.	BC	Fall 2010
30	Book Adult non-fiction	Jay Wiesman's erotic bondage handbook / Jay Wiseman.	Sexually explicit Patron complained in person to staff and had a discussion with the Director responsible for the branch. The patron considered it inappropriate for the collection.	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC	May 2010 [no resolution date given, but appears to have been resolved]
31	Book Adult graphic novel	Breakdowns: portrait of the artist as a young %&*! by Art Spiegleman	Sexually explicit Explicit sexual images "Little signs of passion". Patron had flipped through the graphic novel before giving to son to read. Thinks it should be for adults (18+) only.	Patron/parent	Public	Material retained Material is already located in the Adult Graphic Novel area. Cover art on the book clearly states "Adults Only" and that information is reflected in the catalogue record.	Ontario	January 28, 2010 response February 2, 2010
32	Book Children's picture book	Outside Over There by Maurice Sendak	Age inappropriate "To the goblins (nearly every page); to goblins marrying a baby (p. 11); the useless parents" Patron said "It's very disconcerting as an adult; hard to know the effect on children, but it could be scary and unsettling for younger audiences too". Wanted it removed from collection.	Patron	Public	Material retained Response took a while as all children's staff looked at the book. Well-respected author. Won an award (Caldecott). Not intended to frighten, but to explore feelings. Goblins revealed as babies at end of book.	Ontario	October 5, 2010 Responded November 17, 2010
33	DVD Children's movie	The Great Mouse Detective (Disney)	Sexually explicit Drugs/drug use Age inappropriate Patron referenced "a lot of smoking, bar scene - sexuality". Recommended it be for those 12 and over.	Patron	Public	Material retained It is in our "Family Video" collection which is for ages 5 and above. Older movies like this (1986) may have smoking that does not appear in more recent films. This could provide an opportunity for discussion with a child (noted that villain smoked throughout). One cabaret scene provided historical atmosphere, but was not sexually explicit.	Ontario	November 15, 2010 Response on November 29, 2010
34	Book Children's picture book	Cold Feet by Cynthia DeFelice	Violence Age inappropriate too gory for young children	[patron/parent]	Public	Material retained Patron reminded that parents are responsible for "screening" library materials selected for their children but that Library staff would be pleased to help select books should they be asked.	Ontario	letter sent September 29, 2010 reply sent October 7, 2010

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
35	Book YA novel	The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-Time Indian Sherman Alexie	Anti-ethnicity Inaccuracy Insensitivity Racism Age inappropriate Not age appropriate; depicts Aboriginals inaccurately or poorly; will make Aboriginals in the class feel bad if the book is taught	Other Educational Assistant	K-12 school	Challenge hasn't been resolved	Manitoba	October, 2010 Not resolved
36	Book Religious text sacred to the Sikh religion	Guru Granth Sahib	Other Customer objected to the placement of a religious text, Guru Granth Sahib, within the collection. In customer's view, these sacred texts should not be in the open public area and should be reference, not circulating. The Library holds the text in both English and Punjabi. As above ... customer objected to placement of the texts on the open shelves along with other materials and suggested they should be wrapped in cloth and placed in a separate cupboard. The customer indicated a preference for reference over circulating.	Patron The customer wrote to his alderman who in turn forwarded the objection to the Library for response.	Public	Material retained The Library wrote to the customer thanking him for his interest; the letter was copied to the alderman. The Library described the role its collections have in enhancing knowledge and understanding, and in serving all parts of the community. Many customers like to find materials on their own and prefer circulating over reference books. The Library endeavours to provide easy access to collection resources. The Library applies the same process to all religious texts.	Alberta	Challenge received June 24, 2010 Challenge resolved within the week following
37	Book Adult novel	American Gods by Neil Gaiman	Sexually explicit Patron felt the content was too sexually explicit and asked that a warning be placed on the book that it was unsuitable for youth.	Patron	Public	Material retained The book was already in the adult collection. The library does not affix warning labels on its material. The patron was informed that the book was a multiple-award winner that had received rave reviews in many places and was in the collections of most public libraries.	Ontario	March 2010. Resolved at the same time.
38	DVD Adult documentary	Voices of Iraq	Violence the patron said that while watching it, she realized the brutal violence it contained. there was actual footage of people having their hands cut off, tongues cut out, execution style killings, beheadings, etc. She wondered whether the library was aware it owned and rented out such a violent movie and wanted us to be aware of it.	Patron	Public	Material retained Upon reading descriptions and reviews of the film and viewing it ourselves, we realized it had been made by U.S. filmmakers who sent out 150 video cameras to Iraqi citizens who were asked to film themselves, their neighbors and their surroundings. Most of the scenes of violence were actually second-hand clips taken from Iraqi TV, showing what Saddam Hussein had perpetrated on the Iraqi citizens. The film received generous reviews. We saw no good reason to remove it.	Ontario	October 2010; resolved Oct/10
39	Book Adult graphic novel.	"Black Hole" by Charles Burns	Nudity Sexually explicit Drugs/drug use Age inappropriate patron indicated that "themes and imagery are mature and disturbing". Asked for the book not to be pulled, but reclassified as an adult title (from YA). Again, patron felt that imagery (genitalia) and scenes of drugs and drug-taking, and sex were "mature and disturbing".	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified Youth Collections Librarian and Adult Collections Librarian looked at book, reviews and other titles by this author. Decided to move this item to the adult collection.	BC	March 8th 2010; letter sent to patron with decision on March 22nd 2010

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
40	Book [adult] Book of photographs	Certain People: A Book of Portraits by Robert Mapplethorpe	Nudity Sexually explicit Patron objected to a particular photo of a child which he perceived as child pornography. Patron does not want his tax dollars paying for "this obviously illegal material being in the public library".	Patron	Public	Material retained Controversy often surrounds Mapplethorpe's work but nonetheless he is thought to be a brilliant photographer and a cultural force of the twentieth century. Reply was sent to patron referring to the Canadian Library Association Statement of Intellectual Freedom and the Ontario Library Association Statement on the Intellectual Rights of the Individual	Ontario	Challenged: March 23, 2010 Resolved: March 25, 2010.
41	Book Adult French novel	Maria Monk by Sylvie Ouellette (French)	Religious viewpoint Patron perceived the writing as "pure vitriolic anti-Catholic hate"	Patron Other	Public	Material retained The book received good reviews. We explained our Materials Selection Policy to the patron.	Ontario	Date of Challenge: August 24, 2010 Date resolved: September 1, 2010. A letter explaining the reasons for keeping the book in the collection was sent to patron.
42	Book Children's picture book	Hot City by Barbara Joesse	User objected to the language and found the book "patronizing, racially stereotypical, faux empowering"	Patron	Public	Material retained The book was recommended by the School Library Journal, Publisher's Weekly and The Horn Book Guide. It is in Public Libraries in Vancouver, Toronto, Halifax and New York City.	Ontario	Original challenge: February 12, 2010 Resolved: February 19, 2010. A letter explaining the reasons for keeping the book in the collection was sent to patron.
43	[Policy]	Policy is to not allow any individual, regardless of marital status or any other status, to check-out materials without [with] the other patron's library card. Phoning individual for permission was not acceptable.	Individuals were upset when their spouse would send them to the library to pick up materials on hold for their spouse, only to find staff would not allow their family member to take the materials on their behalf.	Library administrator Chief Librarian	Public	Policy revised Written note with both individuals present could be presented and kept on file, with a note written on individual's ILS account indicating permission is granted.	BC	Ongoing

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
44	DVD Adult thriller	"Eastern Promises" - feature film by David Cronenberg (writer/director)	Sexually explicit Violence Offensive language Patron felt that the "extreme and graphic violence", swearing and "graphic sexual scenes" in this film were inappropriate for a public library collection, and thought that its' inclusion in the ORL collection did not fit with the library's mission statement Patron objected to the library circulating this film which has several scenes of violent struggles and deaths (stabbings) and a man having sex with a young sex trade worker. Also, patron objected to the amount of swearing in the movie.	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC	December 18th, 2010; letter sent to patron on January 21st, 2011.
45	Book Adult mystery	"Murphy's Law" by Colin Bateman	Offensive language Patron suggested that the frequency of profanity, particularly the words "fuck" and "fucking", in this rather gritty story about a dysfunctional Northern Irish police officer working in London was excessive. Patron's objection was solely on the type of language used by the characters in this book	Patron	Public	Material retained Adult Collections Librarian read the book and reviews; sent a letter to patron about her decision to retain the book in the [...] Library collection.	BC	March 20th, 2010 ; resolved (letter to patron) April 13th 2010.
46	Book Adult non-fiction	"The Third Woman: the secret passion that inspired 'The End of the Affair'" by William Cash	Homosexuality Offensive language Patron particularly objected to a limerick by Norman Douglas quoted in the book, which she felt was both offensive and promoted pedophilia. Patron picked up the book on a recommended reading shelf and checked it out. Patron did not object to the main storyline analyzing the reputed adulterous affair between Greene and Catherine Walston. Rather, her objection focused on a limerick by Norman Douglas (who was an Italian neighbour and friend of Walston and Greene) which is quoted in the book in a section considering whether Douglas had "a sexual appetite for Italian children".	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC	March 12th, 2010; reply to patron on April 15th, 2010
47	Book Children's non-fiction picture book	Dino Dinners / Nick Manning and Brita Granstorm	Age inappropriate Other objected to references to eating poo, nieces, nephews and the eating of other dinosaurs	No answer	Public	Material retained	Ontario	letter September replied October 7
48	Book Adult non-fiction book - describes and illustrates (with cartoons) many examples of inappropriate behavior for men.	Don't Be That Guy, by Colin Nissan and Sean Farrell	Other Gross situations and illustrations. Staff member felt the book was gross.	Library staff member Branch circulation supervisor.	Public	Material relocated/reclassified Email discussion by collections manager with staff member about likely intent of book - to improve male behavior. The book was reclassified from sociology to humour, where being gross seems more acceptable.	BC	May 2010 [no resolution date given]

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
49	Book Adult graphic novel	The Boys, Volume 5: Herogasm	Sexism Sexually explicit Plot concerns a large group of superheroes hiring call girls and having an orgy. Staff member felt this graphic novel would offend community standards in Surrey. Librarians managing the Collections Services department agreed.	Library staff member Library technician working as a cataloguer	Public	Material removed This graphic novel was returned to the vendor.	BC	June 2010 [no resolution date given]
50	Book Children's picture book	Uncle Bobby's Wedding, by Sarah S. Brannen	Homosexuality Customer was not expecting the book to have a homosexual theme. She would like to have some warning.	Patron/grandparent Customer was reading this book to her grandchild.	Public	Material retained A library branch manager explained to the customer that she could check the CIP subject headings in most books before reading them aloud to her grandchild.	BC	January 2010 [no resolution date given]
51	DVDs Kids/YA 7 DVDs	Harry Potter series	Sexually explicit Violence Customer cited adolescent sexuality and murder in Harry Potter DVDs. Customer wrote a comment card to request that Harry Potter DVDs should be kept in teen or adult section, rather than children's section of the library.	Patron	Public	Policy [material?] retained Branch children's librarian consulted with the manager of youth services, and decided to keep the series together in the children's area, as most other library systems do.	BC	August 2010 [no resolution date given]
52	Book Children's picture book	Title: Egg Drop Author: Mini Grey	Age inappropriate The concept of life and death is just too difficult for a three year old to comprehend in this format. The story implies the egg dies before the chick can live. My granddaughter is three and a half and was very upset about the egg. The illustrations of the eggs bandaged and "fixed" were disturbing to her.	Patron/grandparent	Public	Material retained Careful consideration is given to the materials added to the library's collections. Reviews of this book in library selection journals indicate that Egg Drop is appropriate for children of preschool age. This book has been described by School Library Journal as a "wonderfully subversive reinterpretation of a Humpty-Dumpty-like tale" and by Booklist "as a cautionary tale about rushing to undertake something for which one is not quite ready". While the Library acknowledges your personal response to this title, it does fall within the guidelines for inclusion in the picture book collection. The Library also recognizes that others may have different reactions to the book's content and placement within its collections.	Alberta	Challenge: July 22, 2010 Resolved: July 30, 2010
53	Policy	Previously the Bible college taught courses on marriage, however it is no longer teaching these classes. It was requested that those print resources directly related to sexual satisfaction in marriage be removed from the general collection and be placed in the teacher resource section in the back room.	A student approached the principal asking why we had texts on the "how to" side of sex in marriage. The administrator and I discussed together and agreed that there was no longer any need for these texts on the shelves as the courses that would use such resources are no longer being taught and the library is now being used primarily by high school students rather than college students.	Patron/student School administrator	Other We are both a 9-12 private high school AND a small private Bible college.	Material relocated/reclassified As our library primarily serves Grade 9-12 students, I agreed with this change.	Saskatchewan	Spring, 2010.

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
54	Book Adult non-fiction	Title: Calf Roping Author: Roy Cooper	Other Cruelty Calf roping, to put it simply, is cruel. Because it is, the library, I believe, shouldn't have a book that details how to do it. Pages 87-88, and 95, for example, show how to "roll" the calf in the air and throw it down. Please do not promote cruelty to helpless animals.	Patron	Public	Material retained The book Calf Roping was acquired in 2005 to support the Library's collection of materials on rodeos. While much of this collection is biographical or historical in nature, some of the items, such as this one, are handbooks to specific events. Statistics show that rodeos still have a significant role in western culture and the Library has collected material on this topic as part of its mandate to support the cultural and recreational interests of its citizens. The Library acknowledges your personal response to this book and to issues related to the welfare and treatment of rodeo animals. You have suggested that our collections should include materials that detail the cruelty of rodeos. You may be interested to know that we have many titles in our collection under the subjects of "animal rights" and "animal welfare" and a number of these books, such as The PETA Practical Guide to Animal Rights, speak directly to the subject of rodeos. In addition, many of our magazine databases are excellent sources of information on this topic.	Alberta	Challenge: July 27, 2010 Resolved: August 26, 2010
55	Book Children's novel	Dead [Dear] Dumb Diary: Never Underestimate Your Dumbness, by Jum [Jim] Benton	Insensitivity Offensive language Customer completed a comment card to object to the use of "dumb" and "dumbness" in this book, as being insensitive to those with intellectual disabilities.	Patron	Public	Material retained The manager of youth services found various book reviews. She left a detailed telephone message for the customer, explaining that the author did not intend to put down intellectual disabilities in this humorous book for middle school children.	BC	October 12th, 2010 [no resolution date given]
56	DVD Adult feature film	Title: In the Realm of the Senses Director: Nagisa Oshima	Sexually explicit This movie is very disturbing - deals with and shows explicit sex acts. It should be labeled Adults Only. I am aware of the awards this film has won. I have been a fan of Japanese films for some time. I have watched a lot of Japanese films and have admired the famous directors such as Akira Kurosawa, Mizoguchi, Fukasaku Kinji, etc. The problem I have with this movie, and you would agree if you watched it, is the disturbing scenes including autoerotic asphyxia, penile mutilation, sadomasochism, etc. I believe that the library should carry all types of material for all ages, but this movie should be placed behind the desk and only given out when requested by an adult. With the automated checkout system you have in place, any person could check this movie out, adult or child.	Patron	Public	Material retained This movie is catalogued as adult material and is housed in the adult section of the Library. The policy of the Library is to provide young customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. This responsibility is accepted by parents when they authorize a child's borrower's card.	Alberta	Challenge: May 7, 2010 Resolved: May 28, 2010

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
57	Book Adult short stories	Title: Chicken Soup for the Unsinkable Soul Author: Jack Canfield, et al.	Anti-ethnicity Racism Racist/ethnocentric content in one of the short stories in this book ("The Birthday Present", pages 176-177, by Mavis Burton Ferguson). Racist/ethnocentric content in one of the short stories in this book ("The Birthday Present", pages 176-177, by Mavis Burton Ferguson). This story at first appears innocuous and even uplifting. However, the author's racist attitudes come out in her dismay over her son being paired with a child of another ethnicity ("Unless you were born and reared in the deep south you cannot know what this means") (was her reaction). My concern is that others will read this and internalize the values that a child of another ethnicity is "different" in a detrimental way, or that it is appropriate to treat people of other heritages as inferior. The author in the story pats herself on the back for her superiority in allowing her child to be paired with this other child. However, the real truth of the matter is that she was very troubled by the pairing. She went as far as scheduling an appointment with her son's teacher to have the pairing broken. It was only when she ran into the other child's mom who was also visiting the teacher that she lost her courage to make the request for change. Nonetheless, she discouraged her child from actively befriending the child. This type of racism can be even more dangerous than very overt racism, because it's subtle parlaying of racist values in the guise of an innocent story sneaks these values into our society's mores and consciousness. I am not a person who makes a fuss about many things. However, I truly believe that this story dangerously infiltrates its beliefs in a way that can negatively impact those who read it. I do not read every story on my own before reading it to my child. I would have been well into this story before I would have realized its underlying message (it is tucked so neatly between other very good and encouraging stories).	Patron	Public	Material retained The Chicken Soup books have been a long-standing and popular series with customers and have received wide acclamation by reviewers for years. While the Library acknowledges your personal response to a story in this Chicken Soup title, it does fall within the [.....] Public Library's guidelines for inclusion in our adult collections. With the exception of specific Chicken Soup titles such as Chicken Soup for the Kid's Soul, Chicken Soup for the Teen's Soul or Chicken Soup for the Preteen Soul, all the books in the series are considered part of the adult collection.	Alberta	Challenge: January 12, 2010 Resolved: February 16, 2010
58	Book Children's picture book	"Big Bad Bun" by Jeanne Willis and [illustrations by] Tony Ross. --	Offensive language Age inappropriate Challenge that language not appropriate for young children.	Patron	Public	Material retained Book retained in children's picture book collection.	Ontario	Challenged May 2010 Resolved May 20, 2010

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
59	Book	Title: The Complete Fairy Tales of Charles Perrault Translated by Neil Philip and Nicoletta Simborowski	Age inappropriate I object to the location as to where I found this particular book. This book is full of disturbing and cruel content. As a mother I strongly oppose to having any parent think it's an "appropriate" kid friendly book, only to find out its content should be rated PG of PG13.	Patron/parent	Public	Material relocated/reclassified Recently, the [.....] Public Library reviewed its children's collections to ensure that all service points had comparable collections. In doing so, some titles were relabeled and/or moved to new collections in error. The copy in question was one of those titles, as it was incorrectly labeled for the picture book collection. This copy will be relabeled as a juvenile nonfiction book and removed from the picture book area. Reviews in reviewing journals such as Booklist and Kirkus indicate an audience of grades four to six, reinforcing the placement of this book in the juvenile nonfiction and not the adult nonfiction collection as you suggest.	Alberta	Challenge: August 24, 2010 Resolved: August 27, 2010
60	DVD Adult feature film	Fanny Hill [DVD] : memoirs of a woman of pleasure / a Sally Head Production for BBC ; Fremantle Media ; produced by Nigel Marchant ; directed by James Hawes	Sexually explicit Request that a warning about sexual content be affixed to DVD to ensure that children do not view this DVD.	Patron	Public	Material retained DVD retained in adult DVD collection with no warning affixed.	Ontario	Challenged March 2010 Resolved April 6, 2010
61	DVD Adult documentary	Real outlaws [DVD] / Revolver Entertainment	Violence Customer requested warning label be added to DVD about violent content	Patron	Public	Material retained DVD retained in adult DVD collection, with no additional warning affixed to DVD.	Ontario	Challenged October 2010 Resolved October 28, 2010
62	DVD "family" feature film	Akeelah and the bee [DVD] / Spelling Bee Productions, Inc. ; 2929 Productions ; Cinema Gypsy Productions ; Lions Gate Films ; Out of the Blue Entertainment ; Reactor Films ; Starbucks Entertainment ; produced by Laurence Fishburne, Sidney Ganis, Nancy Hult, Daniel Llewelyn, Michael Romersa ; written and directed by Doug Atchison	Offensive language Age inappropriate	Patron	Public	Material retained DVD retained in children's DVD area of library.	Ontario	Challenged February 2010 Resolved March 4, 2010
63	Book Children's novel (middle school)	"Alice the Brave" by Phyllis Reynolds Naylor	Age inappropriate	Patron	Public	Material retained Book retained in children's area of library.	Ontario	Challenged September 2010 Resolved October 1, 2010

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
64	Book YA novel	"Alice on Her Way" by Phyllis Reynolds Naylor	Age inappropriate Teen title incorrectly catalogued for children.	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified Other copies of this title were already catalogued for teens. Re-processed copy identified by customer to move it from children's area to teen area.	Ontario	Challenged January 2010 Resolved January 21, 2010
65	Policy	The policy states: The hours available to be open were only 24 and for safety reasons the library closes at 6:00pm.	Challenge: The library has to be open during the evening hours only, till 9:00pm if possible, so that the students could have access to the computers. The Education department had purchased 4 new computers for student use and the Chief and Council wanted them available for those students. The policy was regarding programming offered by the library were following the contracted hours that the library was funded for. The hours of the library being open were perceived as not being accessible for an afterschool homework program for all students. The current agreement with the Brighter Futures program coordinator was that she had an afterschool program and I was available for research and printing of material. Her program was run from 3:00 - 5:00pm. The hours that had been available were Saturday - Tuesday Noon - 6:00. These hours were for teens on the weekend so they would be able to socialize with friends and to do homework. It also helped those people who were doing their EI stuff. I had been trying to find a way to add the "online Ojibwe Lessons" that were held on Wednesday evenings. I don't know what occurred with the BF program but it fell to me to have a space available students.	Elected official Chief and Council	Public	Policy revised I still retained one of my weekend dates, Sunday, and have included Wednesday. The Chief and Council have agreed with my arrangement. I am open Sunday - Tuesday Noon - 6:00pm and on Wednesday 2:00-7:00pm for the public and from 7:00-8:00pm the "online Ojibwe Lessons" are available on all the computers.	Ontario	September 2010 challenged. Resolved by October 15, 2010.
66	Newspaper A newspaper with a focus on the LGBTQ community.	Xtra West newspaper	Homosexuality Sexually explicit We have had 3 complaints within two years about this newspaper. It is one of the publications offered in our "Free Materials" area in the foyer of the main library. All complaints have centered around suggestive language or images on the covers - and the potential impact on young children.	Patron Comment Card - responded by letter.	Public	Material retained Material relocated/reclassified The newspaper remains in the free materials area but has been moved to a location where it is somewhat less visible to young children.	BC	December 15, 2010 December 31, 2010
67	Book [Adult] graphic novel	Cat Woman- Crime Pays by Will Pfeifer	Sexually explicit Concerned about Cat woman's cleavage as well as her nipples showing.	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained	BC	Original date of challenge: May 1, 2010 Date it was resolved: May 5, 2010

	Material type	Bibliographic info/ Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/ Territory	Dates of challenge & resolution
68	42 Graphic novels/comics 42 listed in amazon.com Manga of all 6 movies; Amazon rates them ages 9-12	Dark Horse Comics Star Wars Series, translated from the Japanese, George Lucas credited with authorship, illustrators Hisao Tamaki, and Tom Orzechowski. Volume 3 is ISBN 1-56971-364-2	Age inappropriate one illustration of Princess Leia shows her scantily dressed, in the midst of some battle or other, her breasts coming close to falling out of her dress. Father found the material too suggestive. Father came to talk to library clerk and asked to remove the series from the shelves.	Parent/guardian Child in grade one had been directed numerous times by teacher and library staff to the primary section of the library, and yet he insisted on borrowing this Star Wars series. Father found the material inappropriate.	K-12 school	Material restricted a red dot was placed beside the barcode so that any staff checking the book out could exercise their own judgment as to whether the student concerned was of a sufficient maturity to view images in context. staff were advised of this "restriction"	BC	October 2010, was about 2 weeks.
69	Book[s] paperback chapter book[s] (junior novel[s]) ? titles – amazon.com lists 14 titles in the "Encounters" series, and lists some as for ages 9-12, some as YA	Author: Paul Kropp	Drugs/drug use Violence Age inappropriate questioned if the book was age appropriate for elementary school	Parent/ guardian	K-12 school	the complaint was anonymous, the books remained on the shelf	BC	June 2010 [no resolution date given, although the challenge appears to have been resolved]
70	Book Children's picture book	The Dumb Bunnies Go to the Zoo by Dav Pilkey	Other The parent thought the bunnies were too dumb, and she did not like the improper spelling in the book.	Parent/ guardian	Public	Material retained	BC	Date of original challenge: April 1, 2010 Date resolved: April 6th, 2010
71	Book This was an easy picture book for children that had flaps.	See inside Pirate Ships by Rob Lloyd Jones	Violence The parent was concerned about the amount of blood in different scenes, the images of sawing through legs, and the acts of hacking and stabbing people.	Parent/ guardian	Public	Material retained	BC	Date of Original Challenge: Feb 7th, 2010 Date of resolution: Feb 15th, 2010
72	DVD Children's/family feature film	The Muppets Wizard of Oz	Violence A parent was concerned about a scene where a muppet was being sawed in half. She thought the violence to be too extreme for young children to view.	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained	BC	Original challenged date: April 27, 2010 Date resolved: May 6, 2010