The Fight Against MRSA, Flu, and Other Bacteria & Viruses: Hand Washing Versus Hand Sanitizers

METHOD	PROs	CONs
Hand Washing	- Proper hand washing is 'the' best	- Sinks and soap are not available everywhere
(non-antimicrobial	approach for personal hygiene and	(sports fields, field trips, etc.).
soaps)	decreasing the spread of bacteria and	- Anti-microbial/anti-bacterial soaps: The
	viruses (NYSED).	implication that use of anti-microbial soap for
	- Good hand hygiene includes frequent	general hand washing is a significant factor in
	hand washing (NYSDOH & NYSED).	controlling community-acquired infections or
	- Removes visible soil, bacteria and	"public health threats" is not supported by
	viruses from hands.	evidence.
	- Plain soap (without antibacterial	
	chemicals such as triclosan) removes bad	
	bacteria from your hands, but leaves	
	enough good bacteria to protect you.	
	- Schools are required to provide ready	
	access to sinks and soaps; they are already	
	available in schools.	
	- School hand soap is required to be	
	OGS Green Certified, ensuring the least	
Hand Sanitizer	toxic products are used. - When soap and water are unavailable	- Not effective when hands are visibly soiled.
(alcohol-based)	(sports fields, field trips, etc.), alcohol-	- Not antiviral.
(alconor-based)	based hand sanitizers for MRSA are	- Not a substitute for hand washing.
	recommended by CDC, NYSDOH and	- Flammable; a gob of it thrown on a bathroom wall
	NYSED.	can be ignited and will burn.
	- Portable.	- Potential alcohol poisoning if ingested, especially
	- Consultation with the school district	for toddlers.
	medical director and proper supervision	- Need to keep out of reach of children or to
	are needed when using alcohol-based	provide adult supervision.
	hand sanitizers with children (NYSED).	- May contain triclosan, a chemical that kills both
	,	bad and good bacteria
		- If always used, students and adults never learn to
		wash their hands.
		- Added budget expense; schools still have to
		purchase soap.
		- These are not hand cleaners per se and are not
		covered under the OGS Green Certified Guidelines.
		- There are no populations outside of a healthcare
		setting in which consumer antiseptic use has been
		demonstrated to be more effective than plain soap
		in reducing infection rates (US FDA).
Hand Sanitizer	- When soap and water are unavailable	- Not effective when hands are visibly soiled.
(non-alcohol-based)	(sports fields, field trips, etc.) hand	- Not antiviral.
	sanitizers kill bacteria Portable.	- Not a substitute for hand washing.
		- Need to keep out of reach of children or to
	- Not alcohol-based.	provide adult supervision. May contain tricks an a chamical that kills both
		- May contain triclosan, a chemical that kills both
		bad and good bacteria
		- If always used, students and adults never learn to wash their hands.
		- Added budget expense; schools still have to
		purchase soap.
		- These are not hand cleaners per se and are not
		covered under the OGS Green Certified Guidelines.