

The Study of Christian Cabala in English

Don Karr

© Don Karr 1995-2007; revised, enlarged, and updated 2007-2016. Email: dk0618@yahoo.com.

All rights reserved.

License to Copy:

This publication is intended for personal use only. Paper copies may be made for personal use.

With the above exception, no part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, without permission in writing from the author.

Reviewers may quote brief passages.

Part 1

ANYONE WHO HAS read a few books concerning the Western esoteric tradition has encountered, at the very least, references to *cabala*. The spelling varies: In this paper, *kabbalah*, for the most part, refers to Jewish doctrine; *cabala* refers to Christian developments. The trend among academics, however, seems to favor *Christian kabbalah* for references to the latter.¹

Cabala figures into many tenets and methods central to Western esoteric thought and practice. Unfortunately, what is meant by term is not always clear and may vary from one reference to another. Those readers who enter an investigation of (Christian) *cabala* after having studied (Jewish) *kabbalah* may well become impatient at the outset with the misreadings and deformations characteristic of “Christian developments.”²

Perhaps even more frustrating, after co-opting such *kabbalah* as was desired, virtually all Christian Cabalists sought to transform it into a dogmatic weapon to turn back against the Jews to compel their conversion—starting with Ramon Llull (ca. 1232-1316), “the first Christian to acknowledge and appreciate *kabbalah* as a tool of conversion.”³ In his book, *The Art of Conversion*, Harvey Hames demonstrates, however, that Llull was “not a Kabbalist, nor was he versed in any particular Kabbalistic approach.”⁴

¹ On “the background of variant orthographies, including origins, definitions, and usages,” see Anthony J. Elia, “An Historical Assessment of the Narrative Uses of the Words ‘Kabbalah,’ ‘Cabala,’ and ‘Qabala/h’: Discerning the Differences for Theological Libraries,” in *Theological Librarianship: An Online Journal of the American Theological Library Association*, Volume 2, Number 2 (Chicago: American Theological Society, 2009), at THEOLOGICAL LIBRARIANSHIP: <https://journal.atla.com/ojs/index.php/theolib/article/view/111/386>.

² For a summary of the differences between Jewish *kabbalah* and Christian *cabala*, especially in the latter’s earliest stages, see

- (1) Joseph Dan, “Christian Kabbalah: From Mysticism to Esotericism,” in *Western Esotericism and the Science of Religion*, eds. Antoine Faivre & Wouter J. Hanegraaff [GNOSTICA 2] (Leuven: Peeters, 1998); this paper is reprinted in Dan’s *Jewish Mysticism*, Volume III: THE MODERN PERIOD (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 1999);
- (2) the first several sections of Dan’s article, “The Kabbalah of Johannes Reuchlin and Its Historical Significance,” in *The Christian Kabbalah: Jewish Mystical Books and Their Christian Interpreters*, ed. Joseph Dan (Cambridge: Harvard College Library, 1997), also in Dan’s *Jewish Mysticism*, Volume III.

³ Harvey J. Hames, *The Art of Conversion: Christianity and Kabbalah in the Thirteenth Century* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2000): p. 27.

⁴ Refer, in particular, to Hames’ CHAPTER THREE: “Into the Gates of Wisdom.” On Llull, see ADDENDUM A, ITEMS OF INTEREST: “Goodrick-Clarke,” “Herrera,” “Llull,” “*Man, Myth & Magic*,” “Rossi,” and “Vega.”

The strand of *cabala* which has become best known began in Renaissance Florence with Giovanni Pico della Mirandola (1463-1494). Pico sought to harmonize Christian beliefs with *kabbalah*, which he considered a primal form of Jewish doctrine which originated with Moses and thus long presaged the teachings of Jesus. This parallels the treatment of the *Hermetica* by the circle around Ficino, namely the movement to recover the *prisca theologia*, the ancient theology, thought to be the fountainhead of religion and philosophy.⁵

There was, however, an earlier expression of *cabala* among the Spanish *conversos* in the late 1200s which continued until the expulsion of the late 1400s. There is not a whole lot on these early Spanish Cabalists, e.g., Abner of Burgos (b. ca. 1270) and Pablo de Heredia (140?-1486), in the English literature available. On Burgos and de Heredia (as well as Pico and his contemporary Abraham Farissol), see Gershom Scholem, “The Beginnings of the Christian Kabbalah,” in *The Christian Kabbalah: Jewish Mystical Books and Their Christian Interpreters*, ed. Joseph Dan (Cambridge: Harvard College Library, 1997); this article was originally published in German: “Zur Geschichte der Anfänge der Christlichen Kabbala” in *Essays Presented to Leo Baeck in the Occasion of His Eightieth Birthday* (London: East and West Library, 1954), then in French: “Considerations sur l’Histoire des debuts de la Kabbale chretienne” in *Kabbalistes Chretiens* (Paris: Albin Michel, 1979).⁶

Two Hebrew letters, purportedly written by Tanna Nehuniah ben Hakanah, were “discovered”—more likely forged—, translated into Latin, and commented upon by Pablo de Heredia: THE EPISTLE OF SECRETS [*Iggeret ha-Sodot* OR *Epistola de secretis*] and THE DECLARATION OF TRUTH (1487 or 1488). The letters were put into English from de Heredia’s Latin by Rodney G. Dennis (Oxford: The Jericho Press, 1998); regrettably, de Heredia’s commentary is not included in Dennis’ translation. *The*

Llull was further associated with *cabala* through the work *De auditu cabbalistico*, which was erroneously attributed to him.

⁵ See D. P. Walker, *The Ancient Theology* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1972); Jerome Friedman, *The Most Ancient Testimony: Sixteenth-Century Christian-Hebraica in the Age of Renaissance Nostalgia* (Athens: Ohio University Press, 1983); and my “Ésotérisme et Kabbale chrétienne,” in *Histoire comparée des littératures de langues européennes*, SOUS-SÉRIE RENAISSANCE, Volume II: *La Nouvelle Culture – 1480-1520*, ed. Eva Kushner (Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó/Amsterdam: John Benjamins B. V., forthcoming).

⁶ On Burgos and Heredia, see also ADDENDUM A, ITEMS OF INTEREST: “Grätz” and “Sirat.”

Refer also to Shalom Sadik’s article “Abner of Burgos” in the *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (2014) at <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/abner-burgos/>, especially ¶ 2 of § 1, “Life,” and notes 2, 3, and 4.

On Abraham Farissol, see David B. Ruderman, *The World of a Renaissance Jew: The Life and Thought of Abraham ben Mordecai Farissol* [MONOGRAPHS OF THE HEBREW UNION COLLEGE, no. 6] (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College, 1981—distributed by Ktav Publishing House, New York).

The promising title, *Spanish Christian Cabala* by Catherine Swietlicki (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1986), worthy as it is, deals with later (namely, sixteenth-century) manifestations of Christian *cabala* in Spain. While Swietlicki’s book might not generally be thought of as a primer on *cabala*, it does contain a good overview of the Renaissance period as its opening chapter, which could help those approaching this subject for the first time to get their bearings. Swietlicki goes on to summarize “The Diffusion of the Christian Cabala in Renaissance Culture” in Chapter 2, giving a country-by-country account, covering Italy, France, England, and Spain. She then details the *cabala* of Santa Teresa de Jesus (of Avila, 1515-1582), Fray Luis de Leon (1528?-1591), and San Juan de la Cruz (1542-1591).

For more on Teresa of Avila, see ADDENDUM A, ITEMS OF INTEREST: “Burgeson” and “Green.”

Regarding early Spanish Christian-Jewish cross influence, see Elliot R. Wolfson, “The Tree That is All: Jewish-Christian Roots of a Kabbalistic Symbol in *Sefer ha-Bahir*,” in *Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, volume 3, issue 1, eds. Elliot Wolfson and Paul Mendes-Flohr (Harwood Academic Publishers GmbH, 1993); also in *Along the Path: Studies in Kabbalistic Myth, Symbolism, and Hermeneutics* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995). Wolfson speculates that the motif of the cosmic tree combines Jewish and Christian influences. While doing so, he calls into question traditional lines of inquiry into certain subject matter (namely, the ten *sefirot*) as the major indication of the origins of *kabbalah*. Wolfson says, in effect, that if *Sefer ha-Bahir* is the earliest known work which can properly be called kabbalistic, its own contents suggest that something more—if not something other—than the *sefirot* comprises *kabbalah*’s primal swirlings.

Refer also to Yehuda Liebes, “Christian Influences on the Zohar” in *Studies in the Zohar* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993), and Peter Schäfer, *Mirror of His Beauty: Feminine Images of God from the Bible to the Early Kabbalah* (Princeton – Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2002), especially Part II. THE QUEST FOR ORIGINS.

Epistle represents “the first recognizable work of Christian kabbalah” and got wide exposure through being quoted in the works of Franciscan theologian Petrus Galatinus (1460-1540), which, in turn, influenced Athanasius Kircher (see below, §§ PETRUS GALATINUS and ATHANASIUS KIRCHER). It is worth noting, though, that Heredia’s *cabala* consists largely of (1) quotes from non-existent kabbalistic works (e.g., *Galerazaya*, which Heredia attributed to “Rabbi Haccados,” namely Rabbi HaKadosh⁷) and (2) distorted or fake quotes from real kabbalistic sources, such as the *Zohar*.

Ideally, we would find sources which led us in a nice straight line from the Renaissance to the present day. Alas, the material available on the subject and the history of *cabala* itself conspire to make our effort one fraught with cuts and detours, though a certain shape to it all does emerge.

At the outset, the limitations of an English-only bibliography should be noted, for any short list of books on Christian *cabala* consists largely of works in other languages. A selection of standard works—listed chronologically—would include

- Benz, Ernst. *Die christliche Kabbala: Ein Stiefkind der Theologie* (Zurich: Rhein-Verlag, 1958)—now available in English from New Grail Publishing⁸ at www.grailbooks.org. See below, § 17th & 18th CENTURIES: KEMPER – OETINGER.
- Secret, François. *Le Zohar chez les kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Durlacher, 1958).
- _____ . *Les Kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Dunod, 1964).
- Wirszubski, Chaïm. *Sheloshah perakim be-toldot ha-Kabalah ha-notsrit* [THREE CHAPTERS IN THE HISTORY OF CHRISTIAN KABBALAH] (Jerusalem: Mosad Bialik, 1975).
- Gorny, Leon. *La Kabbale: Kabbale juive et cabale chrétiennes* (Paris: Pierre Belfond, 1977).
- Wirszubski, Chaïm. *Mekubal be-Notsri Kore ba-Torah* [A CHRISTIAN KABBALIST READS THE LAW] (Jerusalem: Mosad Bialik, 1977). The “Christian Kabbalist” here is Giovanni Pico della Mirandola.
- Faivre, Antoine (ed). *Kabbalistes chrétiens* [series CAHIERS DE L’HERMÉTISME], a collection which includes articles by Gershom Scholem (as mentioned above on page 2), Jacques Fabry, Geneviève Javary, Ernst Benz, Serge Hutin, Hermann Greive, Chaïm Wirszubski, Wolf-Dieter Müller-Jahncke, Anna Morisi, Pierre Deghaye, and Geneviève Javary (Paris: Albin Michel, 1979).
- Wirszubski, Chaim. *Ben ha-shtin : Kabalah, Kabalah Notsrit, Shabta’ut* [BETWEEN THE LINES: KABBALAH, CHRISTIAN KABBALAH, AND SABBATEANISM] (Jerusalem: The Magnes Press/Hebrew University, 1990).
- Secret, François. *Hermetisme et Kabbale* [LEZIONI DELLA SCUOLA DI STUDI SUPERIORI IN NAPOLI 15] (Naples: L’Istituto Italiano per gli Studi Filosofici, 1992).

Two more recent works might be added to this list:

- Kilcher, Andreas. *Die Sprachtheorie der Kabbala als ästhetisches Paradigma: Die Konstruktion einer ästhetischen Kabbala seit der Frühen Neuzeit* [THE LINGUISTIC THEORY OF KABBALAH AS AN AESTHETIC PARADIGM: THE CONSTRUCTION OF AN AESTHETIC KABBALAH SINCE THE EARLY MODERN PERIOD] (Stuttgart - Weimar: Verlag J. B. Metzler, 1998). For an English summary of *Die Sprachtheorie der Kabbala...*, see Elke Morlok’s review in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume 7, eds. Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2002).
- *Christliche Kabbala*, ed. Wilhelm Schmidt-Biggemann (Ostfildern: Jan Thorbecke Verlag, 2003), which contains papers in French (1), German (13), and English (2). The English articles are Sarah Hutton’s “From Christian Kabbalism to Kabbalistic Quakerism: The Kabbalistic Dialogues of Anne Conway, Henry More, and George Keith,” and Moshe Idel’s “Jewish Thinkers versus Christian Kabbalah.”

⁷ Heredia’s *Galerazaya* should not be confused with the mid-sixteenth-century work, *Galya Raza*, “written under the influence of dreams, visions, and illuminations possessing the power of celestial revelation” by an anonymous author.

See Rachel Elior, “The Doctrine of Transmigration in *Galya Raza*,” in *Essential Papers on Kabbalah*, ed. Lawrence Fine (New York – London: New York University Press, 1995).

⁸ New Grail has apparently become part of New Cultures Press at <http://www.newcultures.org/> [Oct 2010].

Standard works in English include the following, all of which are discussed in greater detail below:⁹

- Blau, Joseph L. *Christian Interpretation of the Cabala in the Renaissance* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1944).
- Yates, Frances. *Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1964).
- _____. *Occult Philosophy in the Elizabethan Age* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1979).
- Joseph Dan (ed.) *The Christian Kabbalah: Jewish Mystical Books and Their Christian Interpreters* (Cambridge: Harvard College Library, 1997). Contributors include Gershom Scholem, Joseph Dan, Giulio Busi, Klaus Reichert, Allison Coudert, and Hillel Levine.
- Beitchman, Philip. *Alchemy of the Word: Cabala of the Renaissance* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1998).

USEFUL INTRODUCTORY BOOKS, ARTICLES & CHAPTERS

LISTED CHRONOLOGICALLY

- Schuchard, Marsha Keith. “The Christian Interpretation of the Cabala in the Renaissance, and the Development of the Syncretic Occult Tradition,” = CHAPTER II of *FREEMASONRY, SECRET SOCIETIES, AND THE CONTINUITY OF THE OCCULT TRADITIONS IN ENGLISH LITERATURE* (Ph.D. diss. University of Texas at Austin, 1975).
- Swietlicki, Catherine. “Christian Cabala in the Renaissance” and “The Diffusion of Christian Cabala in Renaissance Culture” = CHAPTERS 1 and 2 of *Spanish Christian Cabala* (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1986)—based primarily on François Secret, Frances Yates, and Gershom Scholem.
- Manuel, Frank E. *The Broken Staff: Judaism through Christian Eyes* (Cambridge – London: Harvard University Press, 1992).
- Masters, G. Mallery. “Renaissance Kabbalah,” in *Modern Esoteric Spirituality*, eds. Antoine Faivre and Jacob Needleman (New York: Crossroad Publishing, 1995).
- Wouter J. Hanegraaff’s historical outline of “traditional esotericism” (CHAPTER 14, especially § C, “The Components of Western Esotericism”) in *New Age Religion & Western Culture* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996).
- Dan, Joseph. “Christian Kabbalah: From Mysticism to Esotericism,” in *Western Esotericism and the Science of Religion*, eds. Antoine Faivre & Wouter J. Hanegraaff [GNOSTICA 2] (Leuven: Peeters, 1998); reprinted in Dan’s *Jewish Mysticism*, Volume III: THE MODERN PERIOD (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 1999).
- Faivre, Antoine. “Renaissance Hermeticism and the Concept of Western Esotericism” in *Gnosis and Hermeticism*, eds. Roelof van den Broek and Wouter J. Hanegraaff (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1998).
- Idel, Moshe. “Reflections on Kabbalah in Spain and Christian Kabbalah,” in *Hispania Judaica Bulletin*, #2 (Jerusalem: Hebrew University of Jerusalem, 1999).

⁹ In spite of its “assertive title” (the author’s term—p. ii), *The Rape of Jewish Mysticism by Christian Theologians* by Robert Wang (Columbia [MD]: Marcus Aurelius Press, 2001) is a rather drab summary of well-known—and well-worn—sources. Moreover, Wang does not really engage his thesis (*i.e.*, the *rape* of Jewish mysticism) except fleetingly anywhere through the book save the preface and the brief conclusion. The book comes to an anticlimactic halt with “Christian Kabbalah becomes Rosicrucianism,” “The Fama Fraternitas,” and “Robert Fludd.” Wang’s omission of developments through the 17th-19th centuries is all the more puzzling given the book’s subtitle, *How the Modern Occult Movement Grew out of Renaissance Attempts to Convert the Jews*.

See my detailed discussion of Wang’s *Rape of Jewish Mysticism* in ADDENDUM F, Reviews, at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>, and, in a less clear format and, it seems, purposefully buried, at *Esoterica: The Journal of Esoteric Studies*, Volume VI, ed. Arthur Versluis (East Lansing: Michigan State University, 2004), at <http://www.esoteric.msu.edu/VolumeVI/Wang.html>.

Christian Kabbalists: John Donne, Giordano Bruno, Ramon Llull, Paracelsus, Athanasius Kircher, Robert Fludd, Giovanni Pico della Mirandola... (Memphis: Books LLC, 2010) offers incomplete reprints of Wikipedia articles with an index. The articles are sketchy and inconsistent, some showing no connection with *cabala* whatsoever. The same description could apply to *The Esoteric Codex: Christian Kabbalah* by Sarai Kasik (Lulu.com, 2015), though this book offers numerous illustrations.

- Laenen, J. H. “Popular Literature on ‘Kabbalah’” = CHAPTER 8 of *Jewish Mysticism: An Introduction* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2001).
- *Dictionary of Gnosis & Western Esotericism*, ed. Wouter Hanegraaff in collaboration with Antoine Faivre, Roelof van den Broek, and Jean-Pierre Brach (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2005), VOLUME II: § “Jewish Influences,”¹⁰ especially PART III: “‘Christian Kabbalah’ in the Renaissance,” PART IV: Enlightenment / Romanticism,” and PART V: Occultist Kabbalah.”
- von Stuckrad, Kocku. “Esotericism in the Confessional Age,” = CHAPTER 5 of *Western Esotericism: A Brief History of Secret Knowledge* (London – Oakville: Equinox Publishing Ltd, 2005); CHAPTER 3 outlines major developments in *Jewish* Kabbalah.
- Dan, Joseph. “Modern Times I: The Christian Kabbalah” = CHAPTER 6 of *Kabbalah: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford – New York: Oxford University Press, 2006).
- Smoley, Richard. “The Sages of the Renaissance” = CHAPTER 6 of *Forbidden Faith: The Gnostic Legacy from the Gospel to the Da Vinci Code* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 2006).
- Bogdan, Henrik. *Western Esotericism and Rituals of Initiation* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2007); see in particular CHAPTER 3, “Historical Background,” and the last section of CHAPTER 4 (pp. 89-93).
- Goodrick-Clarke, Nicholas. “Italian Renaissance Magic and Cabala” = CHAPTER 2 of *The Western Esoteric Traditions: A Historical Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008).
- Levenda, Peter. “Christian Kabbalah and the Esoteric Orders” = CHAPTER 10 of *Stairway to Heaven: Chinese Alchemists, Jewish Kabbalists, and the Art of Spiritual Transformation* (New York – London: Continuum, 2008).
- von Stuckrad, Kocku. “The Secrets of Texts: Esoteric Hermeneutics” = CHAPTER FIVE of *Locations of Knowledge in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Esoteric Discourse and Western Identities* [BRILL’S STUDIES IN INTELLECTUAL HISTORY 186] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2010), especially § *Linguistic Ontologies in Christian Kabbalah*, pp. 103-110.
- Coudert, Allison P. “Christian Kabbalah,” in *Jewish Mysticism and Kabbalah: New Insights and Scholarship*, ed. Frederick E. Greenspahn (New York – London: New York University Press, 2011).
- Idel, Moshe. “Jewish Kabbalah in Christian Garb” = CHAPTER 19 of *Kabbalah in Italy, 1280-1510: A Survey* (New Haven – London: Yale University Press, 2011).
- *Rosicrucian Digest*, Vol. 90, No. 2: KABBALAH (San Jose: Rosicrucian Order AMORC, 2012); contains a mix of Jewish and Christian occult *kabbalah* with articles from a broad spectrum of authors: from Papus and Ralph M. Lewis to Nicholas Goodrick-Clarke and Daniel C. Matt.
- Karr, Don. “Ésotérisme et Kabbale chrétienne: 1480-1520” (= “Esotericism and Christian Kabbalah”), in *Histoire comparée des littératures de langues européennes*, Sous-série Renaissance, Volume II: *La Nouvelle Culture – 1480-1520*, ed. Eva Kushner (Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó/Amsterdam: John Benjamins B. V., forthcoming).

¹⁰ The debt that the early Christian cabalists owe to Jewish teachers should not be overlooked. In a discussion of the Renaissance period, Eisig Silberschlag writes:

Many outstanding teachers who taught some eminent Christians were in the forefront of their age: Muele da S. Miniato, the erudite banker and teacher of the Florentine statesman Giannozzo Manetti; the philosophical scholars Elijah del Medigo and Yohanan Alemanno, teachers of Giovanni Pico della Mirandola; Obadiah Sforno, the physician, the commentator on the Pentateuch and the teacher of Johannes Reuchlin; Elijah Levita, the itinerant scholar, grammarian and teacher to such eminent personalities as Edigio da Viterbo, the General of the Order of the Hermits of Saint Augustine, who became cardinal in 1517, Mario Grimani, the patriarch of Aquila, George de Selve, bishop of Lavaur, Sebastian Münster, the humanist of Basle and Paul Fagius, the reformed minister; Leone Modena who taught Giovanni Vislingo, professor of anatomy in Padua, Vincenzo Noghiera, the scholarly Theologian.

—From *Renaissance to Renaissance* (New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1973)—pp. 3-4.

SOME HISTORIANS

ARTHUR EDWARD WAITE (1857-1942)

Though written from within the Western esoteric/Golden Dawn tradition, Arthur E. Waite's *Holy Kabbalah* (London: Williams & Norgate, Ltd, 1929¹¹) offers a remarkably clear-minded, critical survey of its topic. Waite's analysis is limited and occasionally skewed, however, by his reliance on the Latin, French, and English sources available to him.

BOOK X of *The Holy Kabbalah* is entitled "Some Christian Students of the Kabbalah." Therein Waite gives spot-on sketches of Ramon Llull, Pico della Mirandola, Johannes Reuchlin, Paracelsus, Cornelius Agrippa, Guillaume Postel, Robert Fludd, Henry More, Thomas Vaughan, Knorr von Rosenroth, Ralph Cudworth, Thomas Burnet, Louis Claude de St. Martin, Éliphas Lévi, Papus (Gerard Encausse), Stanislas de Guita, H. P. Blavatsky, and a few others. Waite's survey is quite useful, for its parade of names connected with *cabala*—whether by fact or fancy—takes us from the Renaissance to the end of the nineteenth century. This collection of characters gives some idea of the range of *cabala*'s seepage into occult and theosophic endeavor, including the symbolism of the Freemasons and the Rosicrucians.

For more information on the components of Waite's *Holy Kabbalah*, see below, Part 2: "**1902** Waite."

JOSEPH LEON BLAU (1909-1986)

Reliable (even if not unbiased) scholarship on *cabala* might be said to have begun in the 1940s with Joseph L. Blau's *Christian Interpretation of the Cabala in the Renaissance* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1944; rpt. Port Washington: Kennikat Press, 1965; rpt. Brampton: Ballantrae Reprints, 1998). Subsequent writers on the subject, while often disagreeing with Blau on many key points, freely use such words as "groundbreaking," "essential," and "pioneer" when referring to his study.

To provide a brief outline of Christian *cabala*, the contents of Blau's work are summarized here: The first chapter recapitulates the history of the *kabbalah* within Judaism, following Gershom Scholem. The second chapter takes up the beginnings of Christian interest in the *kabbalah*, stating that Ramon Llull "did not write of the Cabala in the thirteenth century" and that the pseudo-Llullian *De auditu kabbalístico* is somewhat *kabbalah*-like, but not kabbalistic; Blau then considers Pico in some detail. The third chapter discusses those whom Pico influenced, directly or from a distance. The fourth chapter focuses on Pico's most important follower, Johannes Reuchlin. Chapter Five summarizes Paolo Ricci's *De coelesti agricultura* and from it offers a translation of "Introduction to the Lore of the Cabalists or Allegorizers." This fifth chapter finishes with a survey of others who "followed the path of cabalism to Christianity." The sixth chapter, "The Fantastic Cabala," discusses how *cabala* became entangled with magic, referring to, among others, Agrippa and Paracelsus. Chapter Seven treats Jean Thénau and his work, *The Holy and Very Christian Cabala* (Appendix D of Blau's study contains selections from this work in the original French). The continued diffusion of "the Christian interpretation of the cabala" by a range of relatively obscure 16th- and 17th-century expositors is discussed in Chapter Eight, "The Erudites." Finally, Chapter Nine offers Blau's conclusions, namely that *cabala* was treated and shaped in many ways for many different purposes by many Christian

¹¹ Reprinted New Hyde Park: University Books, 1960, and subsequently; rpt. Carol Publishing Group, 1992; Dover Publications, 2003; Cosimo Classics, 2007.

interpreters, none of whom knew very much about *kabbalah*. Several appendices follow: A, on Moses Cordovero; B, on whether Ramon Llull was a cabalist; C, on the identity of Archangelus of Burgo Nuovo; and D, selections from Thenaud. An impressive bibliography lists Jewish and Christian primary and secondary sources.

In addition to *Christian Interpretation...*, see Blau's article, "The Diffusion of the Christian Interpretation of the Cabala in English Literature," in *The Review of Religion*, volume VI, number 2 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1942). Here Blau concludes,

This study has shown few actual Cabalists among the writers of English literature, but many writers to whom Cabalism was familiar. ... For Cabalism, specifically, it can be said in summary, that Fludd, Thomas Vaughan, and Henry More were the only Christian Cabalists who wrote in English. ... Cabalism was an intellectual fad, a day's fashion. (—pages 167 and 168)

Blau's first statement is accurate: There were "few actual Cabalists among the writers of English literature." For the undoing of Blau's statement regarding Fludd, Vaughan, and especially More, see ADDENDUM B of the current paper: "Seventeenth-century Printed Works on Christian Cabala in English" (at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>). Certainly, the third statement has proven untrue, not just by this paper but even in the scant evidence Blau provides at the close of "Diffusion..." § VII, where he mentions Madame Blavatsky, Anna Kingsford, Edward Maitland, and Wynn Westcott.

DAME FRANCES AMELIA YATES (1899-1981)

The "classic" English-language resource for our subject is Frances Yates' *Occult Philosophy in the Elizabethan Age* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1979 and 2001; rpt. London: Ark Paperbacks, 1983), which is divided into three parts: PART 1 covers the Renaissance and Reformation periods, discussing Llull, Pico, Reuchlin, Francesco Giorgi (*or* Zorzi), and Agrippa; PART 2 takes up the Elizabethan period, treating, most significantly, John Dee and Shakespeare; PART 3 moves into *cabala's* connections with Rosicrucianism, occult philosophy and Puritanism (John Milton), and the return of the Jews to England in the seventeenth century. From reading Yates, we see how *cabala* got smeared together with other pressing religious and philosophic concerns of the day (Hermetism, alchemy, astrology, and magic), and how the term "cabala" came to be used quite loosely, referring at times to stuff which no Jewish kabbalist would recognize as such.

Other books and articles by Frances Yates are of great value to us here:

- *Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1964; rpt. 1991).

Yates paraphrases the Hermetic writings which were most important to Ficino and company, treats Pico's "Cabalist Magic" in some detail, and summarizes the contents of Agrippa's *De occulta philosophia*. This all leads to a discussion of Bruno's *cabala*, which, according to Yates, was derived primarily from Agrippa and remained rather dilute, being far less important to Bruno than his "Egyptianism." See below, § GIORDANO BRUNO.

- *The Art of Memory* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966; rpt. 1994).

Art... follows the methods of "artificial memory" from the ancient Greek rhetoricians to the seventeenth-century scientific philosophers. Of particular interest to us here are Yates' chapters on Giulio Camillo's *Memory Theatre*, which fused the Hermetic-Cabalist tradition to the art of memory. There are also chapters on the Art of Ramon Llull as a memory method, the memory systems of Giordano Bruno, and the Memory Theatre of Robert Fludd.

- “The Hermetic Tradition in Renaissance Science,” in *Art, Science, and History in the Renaissance*, ed. Charles S. Singleton (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1967); reprinted in *Articles on Witchcraft, Magic and Demonology*, Volume 11: RENAISSANCE MAGIC, ed. Brian P. Levack (New York – London: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1992).
- *Theatre of the World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1969).
Theatre... picks up where *Art of Memory* leaves off concerning Robert Fludd and John Dee, considering both as perpetuators and propagators of “the Renaissance revival of Vitruvius.” As with *Giordano Bruno* and *Art of Memory*, *Theatre of the World* “carries” Yates’ series on Renaissance thought “in the direction of the English theatre, and another step towards Shakespeare.”
- *The Rosicrucian Enlightenment* (London: Routledge, 1972; rpt. 1993 and 1996).
 Yates discusses the Rosicrucian Manifestos of the early seventeenth century and the reactions which they stirred; the whole commotion was quite well entangled with the Hermetic-Cabalist tradition. In this work, Yates further emphasizes (or, as some think nowadays, exaggerates) the importance of John Dee. See the comments of Didier Kahn: “Even if the many works of Frances Yates have often shown themselves to be beneficial, and even if several of these works are now considered classics, there is no choice but to accept that *The Rosicrucian Enlightenment*, published in 1972, has scarcely done anything but add to the reigning confusion on the topic”—“The Rosicrucian Hoax in France (1623-24),” § PRESENT STATE OF RESEARCH ON THE ROSICRUCIAN MOVEMENT, in *Secrets of Nature: Astrology and Alchemy in Early Modern Europe*, eds. William R. Newman and Anthony Grafton (Cambridge – London: MIT Press, 2001).

For recent reviews of Yates’ works, along with Didier Kahn’s comments mentioned above, see

- Feingold, Mordechai. “The Occult Tradition in the English Universities of the Renaissance: A Reassessment,” in *Occult & Scientific Mentalities in the Renaissance*, ed. Brian Vickers (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984).
- Farmer, S. A. § PROBLEMS IN YATES’S VIEW OF PICO’S MAGIC (pp. 118-132) in *Syncretism in the West: Pico’s 900 Theses (1480): The Evolution of Traditional Religious and Philosophical Systems* (Tempe: Medieval & Renaissance Texts and Studies, 1998).
- Idel, Moshe. “Kabbalah and Hermeticism in Dame Frances Yates’s Renaissance,” in *Ésotérisme, Gnosés & Imaginaire Symbolique: Mélanges offerts à Antoine Faivre* [GNOSTICA 3], eds. Richard Caron, Joscelyn Godwin, Wouter J. Hanegraaff, and Jean-Louis Viellard-Baron (Leuven: Peeters, 2001).
- Gatti, Hilary. “Frances Yates’s Hermetic Renaissance in the Documents Held in the Warburg Institute Archive,” in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, volume 2, number 2 (Leiden-Boston-Köln: Brill, 2002)
- Hanegraaff, Wouter. *Lodovico Lazzarelli*: introductory chapter (discussed below, § LODOVICO LAZZARELLI)
- Hanegraaff, Wouter. “How Hermetic Was Renaissance Hermetism?” in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, volume 15, number 2 (Leiden-Boston-Köln: Brill, 2015)

For a “full-length biography,” see *Frances Yates and the Hermetic Tradition* by Marjorie G. Jones (Lake Worth: Ibis Press, 2008). Jones’ book is reviewed by Allison Coudert in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, Volume 12, Number 1 (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2012), pp. 165-169.

DANIEL PICKERING WALKER (1914-1985)

Inevitably cited along with Yates' studies is D. P. Walker's *Spiritual and Demonic Magic: From Ficino to Campanella* (London: Notre Dame Press, 1958, rpt. 1975; rpt. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2000). Between Ficino (1433-99) and Campanella (1568-1639) occurred developments of crucial importance to our line of inquiry, namely, the mixing of the demonic and the astrologic (as derived from Ficino), a mixture which turns up in one form in Agrippa's synthesis of Medieval magic, *De occulta philosophia*, but in quite another in Francesco Giorgi's *De harmonia mundi totius*. In the first section of *Spiritual and Demonic Magic*, Walker focuses on Ficino, in the second on what became of his magic in the sixteenth century, and in the third on the "Telesians" (named for Bernardo Telesio, philosopher and scientist, noted less for his ideas than for his methods of empirical science) and Tommaso Campanella.

Note also Walker's work, *The Ancient Theology: Studies in Christian Platonism from the Fifteenth to the Eighteenth Century* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1972).

PHILIP BEITCHMAN (1939-)

Criticisms of Joseph Blau's conclusions are sprinkled through one of the more recent books given notice here, *Alchemy of the Word: Cabala of the Renaissance* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1998) by Philip Beitchman, who draws on the research of the last 150 years, making full use of scholars ranging from Heinrich Grätz to Arthur Waite to Harold Bloom. Most of the contentious comments regarding Blau are derived from François Secret, whose works were among the most important sources for Beitchman. Indeed, from Beitchman's book one gets a sense of how much the English-only reader is missing in not having Secret's studies available.

Alchemy of the Word is presented in four sections: The first, "In the Beginning," traces *kabbalah* and its influence from the Renaissance to the present-day. Beitchman puts some emphasis on the *kabbalah* of the *Zohar*, treating a range of this central text's concepts and difficulties. Included are arresting discussions of *kabbalah*'s sexual symbolism and of the stress between (and attempted resolutions of) the notions of God's immanence and transcendence.

The second section, "The Secret of Agrippa," begins with Pico, even while calling attention (relying on Secret) to cabalistic developments which predate Pico; it goes on to Reuchlin, as one would expect. Then to Agrippa; however, Beitchman does not dwell so much on *De occulta philosophia* as on Agrippa's apparent self-refutation in *De certitudine et vanitate omnium scientiarum declamatio inuectiva* (ON THE UNCERTAINTY AND VANITY OF THE ARTS AND SCIENCES), which Beitchman considers a manner of further cabalistic development on Agrippa's part.

The third section, entitled "Bibliographica Kabbalistica," lists and, to one extent or another, describes a number of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century works which treat *cabala*, whether sympathetically or otherwise. The promise of the chapter is undermined somewhat by Beitchman's inconsistent treatment of the items included and his veering off the subject-at-hand so frequently.

The final section, "The Kiss of the Spouse," deals with (as the subheading suggests) "Cabala in England (1497-1700)," discussing Shakespeare, John Dee, and Thomas Vaughan, among others.

Throughout the book, themes and methods of *kabbalah/cabala* (which is spelled "cabala" through the text, yet, peculiarly, "kaballah" through the bibliography and index) are set against the notions of modern thinkers, philosophers, and writers (Freud, Kierkegaard, and Kafka, to name a few).

Beitchman freely and effectively draws on Gershom Scholem, Frances Yates, (as mentioned) François Secret, Harold Bloom, Lynn Thorndike (see below, ADDENDUM A: ITEMS OF INTEREST) and others to compose this ranging view of *cabala* and its diffusion.

Alchemy of the Word is not a good introductory book; it would be best to have been through some of the other studies before engaging this one, *i.e.*, Blau's *Christian Interpretation...*, and Yates' *Occult Philosophy*. It is something of a shame that Beitchman's keen observations, insights, and humor are buried in such cumbersome prose, strained with interjections and qualifiers. (I do hope that he doesn't feel that there is some form of *ars cabbalistica* in his over-interrupted sentences.) Moreover, there is Beitchman's infatuation with the word *ineluctable*, which seems to appear at least once on nearly every page of the book. All the same, there is a wealth of valuable information and fine synthesis here. In the end, the book is well worth the discomfort.¹²

Further, see

- Beitchman's collection, *The View from Nowhere: Essays in Literature, Mysticism, and Philosophy* (Lanham – New York – Oxford: University Press of America, 2001), in particular Chapter 1, "Milton and Cabala Reconsidered," and Chapter 2, "Cabala and Literature." Portions of *The View...*, CHAPTER 1, appear as "Following Lucifer: Miltonic Evil as Gnostic Cabala," in *Esoterica: The Journal of Esoteric Studies*, Volume I, ed. Arthur Versluis (East Lansing: Michigan State University, 1999), at www.esoteric.msu.edu/Beitchman.html, pp. 61-78.
- Beitchman's engaging book, *The Play of the World and the Expiation of the Real: Acts, Approaches and Inebriations* (Bethesda – Dublin – PaloAlto: Academica Press, 2015), especially Chapter VIII, "Jewish Kabbalah and Christian Cabala," pp. 227-244, which takes up issues surrounding the image of the female in *kabbalah* (addressing in particular Elliot Wolfson's notion of the *male androgyne*) and how Jewish/Christian cross-influence may have played a role in forming this image.

ADDENDUM F reproduces my extended reviews from *Esoterica: The Journal of Esoteric Studies* (volumes V and VI, respectively—online at <http://www.esoteric.msu.edu/>) of Sheila Spector's companion volumes, "Wonders Divine": *The Development of Blake's Kabbalistic Myth / "Glorious Incomprehensible": The Development of Blake's Kabbalistic Language*, and Robert Wang's *Rape of Jewish Mysticism by Christian Theologians...*

Also included in ADDENDUM F are descriptions submitted to *E-IDRA*:

- *Menahem Recanati – Commentary on the Daily Prayers: Flavius Mithridates' Latin Translation, the Hebrew Text, and an English Version*, edited with introduction and notes by Giacomo Corazzol [THE KABBALISTIC LIBRARY OF GIOVANNI PICO DELLA MIRANDOLA 3 – Giulio Busi, general editor] (Torino: Nino Aragno Editore, 2008).
- *Yosef Gikatilla – The Book of Punctuation: Flavius Mithridates' Latin Translation, the Hebrew Text, and an English Version*, edited with introduction and notes by Annett Martini [THE KABBALISTIC LIBRARY OF GIOVANNI PICO DELLA MIRANDOLA 4 – Giulio Busi, general editor] (Torino: Nino Aragno Editore, 2010).

Go to <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>.

¹² "A survey of Christian Cabala that could supersede the books by Joseph L. Blau (1944) and François Secret (1958) is desirable, but *Alchemy of the Word* is not that book. Discussion of dozens of authors requires a great deal of connecting historical narrative, and in this narrative stream the short passages of explanation and evaluation rush past too rapidly. The book offers many provocative statements, many informative ones, and many that are avoidably erroneous or obscurely brief. To undertake such an ambitious task without access to Hebrew for primary sources and modern scholarship; to characterize Kabbalah by relying heavily on the old studies of A. E. Waite, Adolph Franck, and Blau; and to ignore such important recent scholarship as *Pico della Mirandola's Encounter with Jewish Mysticism*, is to attempt too much on an insufficient foundation. The learning, energy and wit that the book displays could have achieved more if directed towards a more modest goal." Arthur M. Lesley, REVIEW ESSAY: "Jews at the Time of the Renaissance" in *Renaissance Quarterly*, Volume 62, Issue 3, The Renaissance Society of America, Fall 1999) pages 845-846.

CHRISTIAN INTERPRETERS OF THE CABALA

DANTE ALIGHIERI (1265-1321)

In *From the Tree to the Labyrinth: Historical Studies on the Sign and Interpretation* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2014), Umberto Eco concludes CHAPTER 7, “Dante between Modistae and Kabbalah” (pp. 286-308),

Before its rehabilitation by the Humanists, Christian notions of the Kabbalah were hazy, and it tended to be lumped together with the black arts. On the other hand, it has been suggested (Gorni 1990: ch. VII) that Dante refers a little too insistently to various divinatory and magical arts.... He [Dante] appears to have been somewhat familiar with an underground and marginalized culture of which the Kabbalah was confusedly a part, at least in popular opinion. ... The only drawback is that, in the absence of concrete proof of these contacts, this is all merely conjecture—as Busi (2004) pointed out in his review of Debenedetti Stow’s (2004) book on Dante and Jewish mysticism. (Eco—page 308).¹³

“Dante between Modistae and Kabbalah” is a “reworking” of chapters from two of Eco’s previous books: (1) CHAPTER 3, “The Perfect Language of Dante,” in *Search for a Perfect Language* (Oxford – Cambridge: Blackwell, 1995), and (2) CHAPTER 2, “Languages in Paradise,” in *Serendipities: Language and Lunacy* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1998).

Jewish mysticism as a source for Dante has been explored in a few other works:

- Courtis, Jack. “The *Divine Comedy* and Kabala,” at *ROSICRUCIAN ARCHIVE: KABALA LIBRARY*, online at <http://www.crcsite.org/Dante.htm>
- “Dante Alighieri (1265-1321),” at *Jewish Virtual Library*, § BIOGRAPHY, online at http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/judaica/ejud_0002_0005_0_04876.html.
- Forte, Valeria. FROM ROME TO JERUSALEM: THE QUEST FOR COSMIC REVELATION; JEWISH MYSTICISM IN “THE DIVINE COMEDY” (PhD diss., Dallas: University of Texas, 2014).

“This study will present a comparative analysis between the practices advocated by Jewish mysticism in the quest for spiritual elevation and those described by Dante in *The Divine Comedy*. This analysis will be based on the historical premise discussed by Moshe Idel, according to which, the traditions of Jewish Hekhalot literature were present in the cultural fabric of Italy from the 10th century onward.” (from the ABSTRACT)

- Mirsky, Mark J. *Dante, Eros, and Kabbalah* (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 2003).

“My speculations on Dante and the erotic vibrations of the *Commedia* recalled to me the reading I had done in the *Zohar*, where dreams speak of knowledge of God through a spiritualized sex. I began to wonder whether Hell, Paradise, and Heaven in Dante were constructed out of similar ideas.

“Moses de Leon, the reputed author of the *Zohar*, was dependent on Maimonides. Dante’s philosophical tutor, Thomas Aquinas, was a careful student of the twelfth-century Jewish philosopher. Shlomo Pines, in the introduction to his translation of Maimonides’ *The Guide of the Perplexed*, speculates on the basis of a designation of the prophet Moses in the *Inferno* that Dante had read Maimonides in Latin translation. The Neoplatonism of the thirteenth century underlay both the new mysticism of the Kabbalists and the dreams of the poets of Sicily and Bologna—texts that sought to draw together philosophic and erotic longing.

“It was to Dante’s advantage to know and absorb the lessons of the Kabbalah.”

(*Dante, Eros, and Kabbalah*—pp. 18-19)

¹³ The references are all to works in Italian: “(Gorni 1990: ch. VII)” = Guglielmo Gorni, *Lettera a nome numero: L’ordine delle cose in Dante* (Bologna: Il Mulino, 1990); “Busi (2004)” = Giulio Busi, “La Qabbalah second Dante,” in *Il Sole-24 Ore* (Milan: October 17, 2004), online at <http://www.ilsole24ore.com/>; “Debenedetti Stow’s (2004) book” = Sandra Debenedetti Stow, *Dante e la mistica ebraica* (Florence: Giuntina, 2004).

In Italian, also see Giorgio Battisoni, *Dante, Verona e la cultura ebraica* (Florence: Giuntina, 2004).

LODOVICO LAZZARELLI (1447-1500)

Lodovico Lazzarelli “played a central role in the rediscovery of Renaissance hermeticism by Italian scholars since 1938; but he was entirely marginalized by [Frances] Yates and his name fell into oblivion after the 1960s” (—Wouter Hanegraaff, *Lodovico Lazzarelli...*, p. 2). “Lazzarelli’s integration of Jewish kabbalistic elements in a Christian-hermetic treatise [i.e., *Crater Hermetis*] makes him into one of the earliest pioneers of Christian kabbalah after Pico” (Wouter Hanegraaff, “Lazzarelli, Lodovico” in *Dictionary of Gnosis & Western Esotericism*, VOLUME II, Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2005).

Refer to *Lodovico Lazzarelli (1447-1500): The Hermetic Writings and Related Documents*, Wouter J. Hanegraaff and Ruud M. Bouthoorn [MEDIÆVAL AND RENAISSANCE TEXTS AND STUDIES, Volume 281] (Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 2005), which contains all of Lazzarelli’s Hermetic writings and a handful of “Related Documents” in Latin and English on facing pages. Hanegraaff provides a full introduction which at once criticizes Yates’ conclusions regarding Renaissance Hermeticism and discusses Lazzarelli’s life, development, and connections with Giovanni “Mercurio” da Correggio.

Also look for

- Beitchman, Philip. § RADICAL CABALA on Lazzarelli’s *Crater Hermetis*, in *Alchemy of the Word* (pp. 117-120)
- Churton, Tobias. § LODOVICO LAZZARELLI – BORN-AGAIN GNOSTIC, in *The Golden Builders: Alchemists, Rosicrucians, and the First Freemasons* (Lichfield: Signal Books, 2002; rpt Boston – York Beach: Weiser Books, 2005).
- Hanegraaff, Wouter. “Sympathy for the Devil: Renaissance Magic and the Ambivalence of Idols,” in *Esoterica: The Journal*, Volume II (East Lansing: Michigan State University, 2000), ed. Arthur Versluis: on-line at www.esoteric.msu.edu (in particular, pp. 21-30)
- Idel, Moshe. “Hermeticism and Judaism” (§ 5), in *Hermeticism and the Renaissance: Intellectual History and the Occult in Early Modern Europe*, eds. Ingrid Merkel and Allen G. Debus (Washington: Folger Books, 1988), which discusses “the well-known initiation of Ferdinand of Aragon by Ludovico Lazarelli.”
- _____. § LODOVICO LAZARELLI, in CHAPTER 11 of *Golem: Jewish Magical and Mystical Traditions on the Artificial Anthropoid* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1990), pp. 175-177.
- Walker, D. P. *Spiritual and Demonic Magic*, pp. 64-72.

GIOVANNI PICO DELLA MIRANDOLA (1463-1494)

One impressive study deals with Pico's contact with *kabbalah* in great detail: *Pico della Mirandola's Encounter with Jewish Mysticism* by Chaim Wirszubski (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1989), which discusses Pico's sources and, in particular, his mentor/translator, the Sicilian convert Flavius Mithridates. Throughout, Pico's famous *Conclusiones* are drawn upon for analysis. The appendices to this book, of which there are twenty-three, cover points of doctrine and history connected with Pico's knowledge and development of *kabbalah*. (It is interesting to note that Pico's main sources for *kabbalah* were Abraham Abulafia, Joseph Gikatilla, and Menahem Recanati, and that Recanati's writings contain numerous quotes from the *Zohar*.) One drawback to Wirszubski's fine work: One needs to know Latin to read all the extracts from Pico and his translated sources.

See also Wirszubski's articles, "Giovanni Pico's Companion to Kabbalistic Symbolism," in *Studies in Mysticism and Religion presented to Gershom G. Scholem...* (Jerusalem: Magnes Press – Hebrew University, 1967), and "Giovanni Pico's Book of Job," in *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, Volume 32 (London: The Warburg Institute – University of London, 1969).

For a complete edition of Pico's *Theses* with an annotated English translation, see Stephen A. Farmer's *Syncretism in the West: Pico's 900 Theses (1486): The Evolution of Traditional Religious and Philosophical Systems* (Tempe: Medieval and Renaissance Texts, 1998).

A translation of Pico's *Conclusiones Cabalisticæ* (extracted from the *900 Theses*) appears in Arthur E. Waite's *Holy Kabbalah* on pp. 445-452 (cited above in § SOME HISTORIANS).

In English, see Pico's *On the Dignity of Man* [aka *Oration on the Dignity of Man*], *On Being and the One*, *Heptaplus*, translated by Charles Glenn Wallis, Paul J. W. Miller, and Douglas Carmichael respectively, with an introduction by Paul J. W. Miller [THE LIBRARY OF LIBERAL ARTS] (Indianapolis – New York: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, Inc., 1965).

More recently published is *Pico della Mirandola, Oration on the Dignity of Man: A New Translation and Commentary*, eds. Francesco Borghesi, Michael Papio, and Massimo Riva (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012).

Find also *Pico's HEPTAPLUS and Biblical Hermeneutics* by Crofton Black (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2006), "the first full-length study of" Pico's "commentary on the creation narrative of Genesis" in which "Pico adopted an esoteric hermeneutic stance characteristic of Neoplatonic and kabbalistic exegesis..." (—from the back cover of the book). Note, however, Giulio Busi's reservations about "traces of less than mature scholarship" in Black's study (*Aries*, Volume 8, Number 1 [Leiden: Brill, 2008], pp. 91-92).

A project under the general editorship of Giulio Busi, THE KABBALISTIC LIBRARY OF GIOVANNI PICO DELLA MIRANDOLA, has thus far produced

- VOLUME 1: *The Great Parchment: Flavius Mithridates' Latin Translation, the Hebrew Text, and an English Version*, ed. Giulio Busi, with Simonetta Bondoni and Saverio Campanini. Torino: Nino Aragno Editore, 2004—a text, not treated by Wirszubski in *Pico della Mirandola's Encounter with Jewish Mysticism*, which has been all but unknown until recently.
- VOLUME 2: *The Book Bahir: Flavius Mithridates Latin Translation, the Hebrew Text, and an English Version*, ed. Saverio Campanini. Torino: Nino Aragno Editore, 2005.
- VOLUME 3: *Menahem Recanati: Commentary on the Daily Prayers – Flavius Mithridates' Latin Translation, the Hebrew Text, and an English Version*, edited with introduction and notes by Giacomo Corazzol. Torino: Nino Aragno Editore, 2008—the only English-language source for any of Recanati's writings, accompanied by a full introduction on Recanati and his works.

- VOLUME 4: *Yosef Gikatilla: The Book of Punctuation – Flavius Mithridates’ Latin Translation, the Hebrew Text, and an English Version*, edited with introduction and notes by Annett Martini. Torino: Nino Aragno Editore, 2010.
- VOLUME 5: *The Gate of Heaven – Flavius Mithridates’ Latin Translation, the Hebrew Text, and an English Translation*, edited with introduction and notes by Susanne Jurgan and Saverio Campanini with a Text on Pico by Giulio Busi. Torino: Nino Aragno Editore, 2012—not the work by Joseph Gikatilla but rather “probably written in Italy around the end of the 14th century by an author unknown to us” (—p. 11).

(For brief reviews of Corazzol’s *Menahem Recanati* and Martini’s *Yosef Gikatilla*, see ADDENDUM F of the present paper, at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>.)

On Pico’s kabbalistic sources—and for a fine, albeit brief, general account—refer to Giulio Busi’s article, “Who Does Not Wonder at this Chameleon? The Kabbalistic Library of Giovanni Pico della Mirandola,” in *Hebrew to Latin, Latin to Hebrew: The Mirroring of Two Cultures in the Age of Humanism* [BERLIN STUDIES IN JUDAISM, 1], ed. Giulio Busi (Berlin: Institut für Judaistik, Freie Universität Berlin/Torino: Nino Aragno Editore, 2006). Also refer to “Pico’s Hebrew Studies,” i.e., § 2 of CHAPTER 1 in Crofton Black’s *Pico’s HEPTAPLUS...*, noted above, and *The Library of Pico della Mirandola* by Pearl Kibre (New York: Columbia University Press, 1936; rpt New York: AMS Press, 1966).

On Pico (listed chronologically):

- Idel, Moshe. “The Magical and Neoplatonic Interpretations of the Kabbalah in the Renaissance,” in both (1) *Jewish Thought in the Sixteenth Century*, ed. Bernard Dov Cooperman (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1983); and (2) *Essential Papers on Jewish Culture in Renaissance and Baroque Italy*, ed. David Ruderman (New York: New York University, 1992).
- Mebane, John S. *Renaissance Magic & the Return of the Golden Age: The Occult Tradition & Marlowe, Jonson, & Shakespeare* (Lincoln – London: University of Nebraska Press, 1989): CHAPTER 3, “Pico della Mirandola: Christian Cabala, Theurgy, and Universal Reformation.”
- Manuel, Frank E. *The Broken Staff: Judaism through Christian Eyes* (Cambridge – London: Harvard University Press, 1992): § PICO DELLA MIRANDOLA AND HIS JEWISH MENTORS
- Reichert, Klaus. “Pico della Mirandola and the Beginnings of Christian Kabbala,” in *Mysticism, Magic, and Kabbalah in Ashkenazi Judaism*, eds. K. E. Grozinger and Joseph Dan (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1995).
- Mahoney, Edward P. “Giovanni Pico della Mirandola and Elia del Medigo, Nicoletto Vernia and Agostino Nifo,” in *Giovanni Pico della Mirandola: Convegno internazionale di Studi nel Cinquecentesimo Anniversario della Morte (1494-1994)*, a cura di Gian Carlo Garfagnini (Firenze: Leo S. Editore, 1997).
- Copenhaver, Brian. “Number Shape, and Meaning in Pico’s Christian Cabala: The Upright *Tsade*, the Closed *Mem*, and the Gaping Jaws of Azazel,” in *Natural Particulars: Nature and the Disciplines in Renaissance Europe*, eds. Anthony Grafton and Nancy Siraisi (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1999).
- Thumfart, Alexander. “Readings on the Cabbala: Giovanni Pico della Mirandola,” in *Jewish Studies at the Turn of the 20th Century* [PROCEEDINGS OF THE 6TH EAJS CONGRESS, Toledo 1998], Volume II: *Judaism from the Renaissance to Modern Times*, eds. Judit Targarona Borrás & Angel Sáenz-Badillos (Leiden – Boston - Köln: Brill, 1999).
- Copenhaver, Brian. “The Secret of Pico’s *Oration*: Cabala and Renaissance Philosophy,” in *Midwest Studies in Philosophy*, Volume XXVI: RENAISSANCE AND EARLY MODERN PHILOSOPHY, eds. Peter A. French and Howard K. Wettstein (Boston – London: Blackwell Publishing, 2002), pp. 56-81.
- Vanden Broecke, Steven. *The Limits of Influence: Pico, Louvin, and the Crisis of Renaissance Astrology* [MIEVEAL AND EARLY MODERN SCIENCE, VOLUME 4]. Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2003.
- Campanini, Saverio. “Talmud, Philosophy, and Kabbalah: A Passage from Pico della Mirandola’s *Apologia* and its Source,” in “*The Words of a Wise Man’s Mouth are Gracious*” (*Qob 10,12*) [FESTSCHRIFT FOR GÜNTER STEMBERGER ON THE OCCASION OF HIS 65TH BIRTHDAY], ed. Mauro Perani (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter GmbH & Co., 2005), pp. 429-448.

- Dougherty, M. V. “Pico’s *Heptaplus* and Biblical Hermeneutics” (review and summary of Crofton Black’s *Pico’s HEPTAPLUS and Biblical Hermeneutics*—noted above), in *Renaissance Quarterly*, Volume 60, Number 2 (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2007).
- Moshe Idel’s brief passage on Pico in *Ben: Sonship and Jewish Mysticism* [THE KOGOD LIBRARY OF JUDAIC STUDIES 5] (London – New York: Shalom Hartman Institute – Continuum, 2007): Chapter 5, § 1. GIOVANNI PICO DELLA MIRANDOLA AND SONSHIP (pp. 507-14).
- von Stuckrad, Kochu. “Christian Kabbalah and Anti-Jewish Polemics: Pico in Context,” in *Polemical Encounters: Esoteric Discourse and Its Others*, eds. Olav Hammer and Kocku von Stuckrad [ARIES BOOK SERIES: TEXTS AND STUDIES IN WESTERN MYSTICISM, Vol. 6] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007).
- *Pico della Mirandola: New Essays*, ed. M. V. Dougherty. (Cambridge – New York: Cambridge University Press, 2008).
CONTENTS: 1. INTRODUCTION – M. V. Dougherty; 2. Jill Kraye, “Pico on the Relationship of Rhetoric and Philosophy”; 3. Paul Richard Blum, “Pico, Theology, and the Church”; 4. Michael Sudduth, “Pico della Mirandola’s Philosophy of Religion”; 5. Michael J. B. Allen, “The Birth Day of Venus: Pico as Platonic Exegete in the *Commento* and the *Heptaplus*”; 6. M. V. Dougherty, “Three Precursors to Pico della Mirandola’s Roman Disputation and the Question of Human Nature in the *Oratio*”; 7. Sheila J. Rabin, “Pico on Magic and Astrology”; 8. Carl N. Still, “Pico’s Quest for All Knowledge”; 9. Francesco Borghesi, “A Philosophical Life.”
- Copenhaver, Brian. “Giovanni Pico della Mirandola” (*published 2008*) in *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, principal ed.: Edward N. Zalta, (Stanford: The Metaphysics Research Lab, CSLI, Stanford University)—online at <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/pico-della-mirandola/>
- Ogren, Brian. “Giovanni Pico della Mirandola and the Allegorical Veridicality of Transmigration” = CHAPTER SEVEN of *Renaissance and Rebirth: Reincarnation in Early Modern Italian Kabbalah* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009).
- Busi, Giulio. “Giovanni Pico and the Ideal of *Concordia Discors*: Disharmony as a Way to Esoteric Wisdom,” in *Constructing Tradition: Means and Myths of Transmission in Western Esotericism*, ed. Andreas B. Kilcher (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2010).
- Karr, Don. “Knots & Spirals: Notes on the Emergence of Christian Cabala” (2010), online at HERMETIC KABBALAH: <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/KS/index.php>
- Heiser, James D. *Prisci Theologi and the Hermetic Reformation in the Fifteenth Century* (Bryn Mawr: Repristination Press, 2011).
- Rabin, Sheila J. “Giovanni Pico della Mirandola, Kabbalah, and the *Disputations against Judaical Astrology*,” in *Hebraic Aspects of the Renaissance: Sources and Encounters*, eds. Ilana Zinguer, Abraham Melamed, and Zur Shalev (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2011).
- Forshaw, Peter J. “The Genesis of Christian Kabbalah: Early Modern Speculations,” in *Hidden Truths from Eden: Esoteric Readings of Genesis 1-3*, eds. Caroline Vander Stichele and Susanne Scholtz [SOCIETY OF BIBLICAL LITERATURE SEMEIA STUDIES; number 76] (Atlanta: SBL Press, 2014), pp. 121-144.
- Burns, Joshua Ezra. “Esotericism in Classical Rabbinic Culture: Interpretive Problems and Prospects,” in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, volume 15, number 1 (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2015), § 3, Classical Rabbinic Knowledge in the Christian Kabbalah,” pp. 32-41.

In ADDENDUM A: ITEMS OF INTEREST, find entries under “Benz,” “Bland,” “Couliano,” “Grätz,” “Idel: *Ascensions...*,” “Idel: *Prisca Theologia...*,” “Kristeller,” “Maxwell-Stuart,” “Quispel,” “Schmidt-Biggemann,” “Thorndike,” and “Wind.”

For an excellent bibliography, far more extensive than mine here and constantly updated, listing both translations and studies, refer to “Pico in English: The Works of Giovanni Pico della Mirandola (1463–1494) with a “List of Studies and Commentaries,” Compiled by M. V. Dougherty,” online at <http://www.mvdougherty.com/pico.htm>.

PICO'S MENTORS

Regarding convert Flavius Mithridates (whose Christian name was Guglielmo Raimondo Moncada) and Pico, along with Wirszubski's *Pico della Mirandola's Encounter...* (noted above), refer to CHAPTER 4 of David B. Ruderman's *World of a Renaissance Jew: The Life and Thought of Abraham ben Mordecai Farissol* (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College Press, 1981). Mithridates' *Sermo de Passione Domini*, a sermon on the Passion delivered before Pope Sixtus IV, Good Friday, 1481, was edited with notes and commentary by Chaim Wirszubski (Jerusalem: The Israel Academy of Sciences and Humanities, 1963). The text is in its original Latin; the 76-page introduction is in English, though most citations are in Latin. Wirszubski shows that the thrust of Mithridates' sermon derives, unacknowledged, from Raymundus Martini's *Pugio Fidei* (DAGGER OF FAITH, ca. 1280). Wirszubski points out, however, that in the *Sermo* there is "a shift from refutation of Judaism to proof of Christianity" (—Frances Yate's review of Wirszubski's edition of *Sermo*, "Flavius Mithridates," which is CHAPTER 7 of *Renaissance and Reform: The Italian Contribution*, COLLECTED ESSAYS, VOL. II [London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1983]).

Yohanan ben Isaac Alemanno (alphabetically by author):

- Busi, Giulio. *Mantua e la qabbalah/Mantua and the Kabbalah*. Milano: Skira editore, 2001. Catalogue for the exhibition of Mantuan kabbalistic manuscripts, Mantova: Palazzo della Ragione (September 2001) and New York: Casa Italiana Zerilli-Marimò Center for Jewish History (March 2002): § 2. THE HUMANISTIC KABBALAH OF YOCHANAN ALEMANNO.
- Herrmann, Klaus. "The Reception of Hekhalot Literature in Yohanan Alemanno's Autograph MS Paris 849," in *Studies in Jewish Manuscripts*, eds. Joseph Dan and Klaus Herrmann [TEXTS AND STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL AND EARLY MODERN JUDAISM 14] (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1999).
- Idel, Moshe. "The Anthropology of Yohanan Alemanno: Sources and Influences," in *Topoi: An International Review of Philosophy*, vol. 7, no. 3 (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1988).
- _____. *Ascensions on High in Jewish Mysticism: Pillars, Lines, and Ladders*. Budapest – New York: Central European University Press, 2005: CHAPTER 5, "The Neoplatonic Path for Dead Souls: Medieval Philosophy, Kabbalah and Renaissance," which begins with a discussion of Neoplatonic Arabic texts then takes the reader through early *kabbalah* and the *Zohar* to Alemanno, Pico, Reuchlin, and Bruno.
- _____. "Hermeticism and Judaism," in *Hermeticism and the Renaissance: Intellectual History and the Occult in Early Modern Europe*, eds. Ingrid Merkel and Allen G. Debus. Washington: Folger Books, 1988.
- _____. § R. YOCHANAN BEN ISAAC ALEMANNO in CHAPTER 11 of *Golem: Jewish Magical and Mystical Traditions on the Artificial Anthropoid* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1990), pp. 167-175.
- _____. "The Magical and Neoplatonic Interpretations of the Kabbalah in the Renaissance"—the first entry noted above under "On Pico."
- Lelli, Fabrizio. "Biography and Autobiography in Yohanan Alemanno's Literary Perception," in *Cultural Intermediaries: Jewish Intellectuals in Early Modern Italy*, eds. David B. Ruderman and Giuseppe Veltri (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004).
- Lesley, Arthur M. "Giving Birth to the Hebrew Author: Two Compositions by Johanan Alemanno," in *The Jewish Body: Corporeality, Society, and Identity in the Renaissance and Early Modern Period*, eds. Maria Diemling and Giuseppe Veltri (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009).
- _____. "The Place of the *Dialoghi d'amore* in Contemporaneous Jewish Thought," in *Essential Papers on Jewish Culture in Renaissance and Baroque Italy*, ed. David B. Ruderman (New York – London: New York University Press, 1992), pp. 178-183.
- _____. "THE SONG OF SOLOMON'S ASCENTS" BY YOCHANAN ALEMANNO: LOVE AND HUMAN PERFECTION ACCORDING TO A JEWISH COLLEAGUE OF PICO DELLA MIRANDOLA. Ph.D. dissertation, Berkeley: University of California, 1976.

In *The Song of Solomon's Ascents* (SHIR HA-MA'ALOT LI-SHLOMO), "drawing from the most diverse

sources, Alemanno both defined his conception of the complete wise man and praised an historical figure as the model for Jewish virtue in fifteenth-century Italy. The *Song of Solomon's Ascents* is, in addition, a compendium of the syncretistic teachings of Alemanno, one of the eminent Jewish teachers of his time, and a figure notable to investigators of the Florentine Platonists as Pico's consultant on Hebrew letters after 1488" (—pp. 2-3).

Along with background material, Lesley offers a detailed (153-page) summary of *The Song of Solomon's Ascents* stating, "The length, embellishment and verbosity of Alemanno's Hebrew composition precluded making a translation. ... [I]t is to be hoped that pruning can better expose the sense and structure of the original" (—p. 2).

- Lelli, Fabrizio. "The Role of Early Renaissance Geographical Discoveries in Yohannan Alemanno's Messianic Thought, in *Hebraic Aspects of the Renaissance: Sources and Encounters*, eds. Ilana Zinguer, Abraham Melamed, and Zur Shalev (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2011).
- Ogren, Brian. "Chaotic Beginnings: Yohanana Alemanno on the Time of Creation," in *Time and Eternity in Jewish Mysticism: That Which is Before and That Which is After*, ed. Brian Ogren (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2015), pp. 83-96.
- _____. "Unity and Diversity in *Gilgul*: Yohanana Alemanno" = CHAPTER SIX of *Renaissance and Rebirth: Reincarnation in Early Modern Italian Kabbalah* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009).
- Rosenthal, Erwin I. J. "Some Observations on Yohanan Alemanno's Political Ideas," in *Studies in Jewish Religious and Intellectual History Presented to Alexander Altmann on the Occasion of His Seventieth Birthday*, eds. Siegfried Stein and Raphael Loewe ([Tuscaloosa]: University of Alabama Press, 1979), pages 247-261.
- Sirat, Colette. *A History of Jewish Philosophy in the Middle Ages*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990: p. 410 on Johanan Alemanno in § JEWISH PHILOSOPHERS IN ITALY OF THE QUATTROCENTO.
- Tirosh-Rothschild, Hava. *Between Worlds: The Life and Thought of Rabbi David ben Judah Messer Leon*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1991
Chapter 2, § A VISIT TO FLORENCE (pp. 44-51) discusses Yohanan Alemanno and his kabbalistic pursuits, Pico della Mirandola's contact with him, and "the misuse of Kabbalah for Christian missionizing."

Elijah del Medigo (listed alphabetically by author):

- Bland, Kalman. "Elijah del Medigo's Averroist Response to the Kabbalah of Fifteenth-Century Jewry and Pico della Mirandola," in *The Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, vol. 1, eds. Elliot Wolfson and Paul Mended-Flohr (Chur: Harwood Academic Publishers GmbH, 1991).
Bland discusses del Medigo's remarks on Kabbalah and its adherents found in four of his works, one of which (his commentary to Averroes' *De substantia orbis*) was originally composed in Latin for Pico's benefit.
- Frank, Daniel H. and Leaman, Oliver (eds). *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Jewish Philosophy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003, pp. 416-420: § THE PERSISTENCE OF MEDIEVAL JEWISH ARISTOTLIANISM IN THE ITALIAN RENAISSANCE: ELIJAH DEL MEDIGO.
- Hames, Harvey. "Elijah Delmedigo: An Archtype of the Halakhic Man?" in *Cultural Intermediaries: Jewish Intellectuals in Early Modern Italy*, eds. David B. Ruderman and Giuseppe Veltri (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004).
- Idel, Moshe. "The Magical and Neoplatonic Interpretations of the Kabbalah in the Renaissance"—noted above under "On Pico."
- Ivry, Alfred. "Remnants of Jewish Averroism in the Renaissance," in *Jewish Thought in the Sixteenth Century*, ed. Bernard Dov Cooperman (Cambridge – London: Harvard University Press, 1983).
- Lesley, Arthur M. "The Place of the *Dialoghi d'amore* in Contemporaneous Jewish Thought," in *Essential Papers on Jewish Culture in Renaissance and Baroque Italy*, ed. David B. Ruderman (New York – London: New York University Press, 1992), pp. 174-176.
- Mahoney, Edward P. "Giovanni Pico della Mirandola and Elia del Medigo, Nicoletto Vernia and Agostino Nifo," in *Giovanni Pico della Mirandola: Convegno internazionale di Studi nel Cinquecentesimo Anniversario della Morte (1494-1994)*, a cura di Gian Carlo Garfagnini (Firenze: Leo S. Editore, 1997).
- Sirat, Colette. *A History of Jewish Philosophy in the Middle Ages*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990: pp. 405-407: § ELIJAH BEN MOSES ABBA DELMEDIGO.

JOHANNES REUCHLIN (1455-1522)

Johannes Reuchlin, whose main sources for *kabbalah* were the writings of Menachem Recanati (*Commentary on the Torah, Commentary on the Daily Prayers*) and Joseph Gikatilla (*Sba'are Orab, Ginnat 'Egoz*), wrote two books on *cabala*.

The first, *De verbo mirifico* (1494), speaks of the “wonder-working word,” YHShVH, the miraculous name of Jesus derived from the *tetragrammaton* of the Old Testament, YHVH, with the letter *shin* added in its midst. On this, refer to Wilhelm Schmidt-Biggemann’s “History and Prehistory of the Cabala of JHShVH,” In *Hebrew to Latin, Latin to Hebrew: The Mirroring of Two Cultures in the Age of Humanism* [BERLIN STUDIES IN JUDAISM, 1], ed. Giulio Busi (Berlin: Institut für Judaistik, Freie Universität Berlin – Torino: Nino Aragno Editore, 2006).

The second, *De arte cabalistica* (1516), is a broader, more informed excursion into various kabbalistic concerns, which appeared in English (translated by Martin and Sarah Goodman) in 1983 (New York: Abaris Books, Inc.); this translation was reprinted with a new introduction by Moshe Idel in 1993 (Lincoln: Bison Books, University of Nebraska Press) as *On the Art of the Kabbalah*.

On Reuchlin (listed chronologically):

- Ginsburg, Christian D. *The Kabbalah* (1864; published as *The Essenes and the Kabbalah*, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1956), offers a description of *De verbo mirifico* on pp. 208-213
- Hirsch, S. A. “Johann Pfefferkorn and the Battle of the Books (1892)” AND “Johann Reuchlin, The Father of the Study of Hebrew among Christians (1896),” in *A Book of Essays* (London: Macmillan & Co., Limited, 1905).
- Friedman, Jerome. *Most Ancient Testimony: Sixteenth-Century Christian-Hebraica in the Age of Renaissance Nostalgia*, by (Athens: Ohio University Press, 1983). The fourth chapter discusses Reuchlin’s writings, especially *De verbo mirifico*.
- Oberman, Hieko A. “Three Sixteenth-Century Attitudes to Judaism: Reuchlin, Erasmus, and Luther,” in *Jewish Thought in the Sixteenth Century*, ed. by Bernard Dov Cooperman (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1983)
- Idel, Moshe. § JOHANNES REUCHLIN in CHAPTER 11 of *Golem: Jewish Magical and Mystical Traditions on the Artificial Anthropoid* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1990), pp. 177-179.
- Manuel, Frank E. *The Broken Staff: Judaism through Christian Eyes* (Cambridge – London: Harvard University Press, 1992): § JOHANNES REUCHLIN IN DEFENSE OF THE TALMUD
- Zika, Charles. “Reuchlin’s *De verbo mirifico* and the Magic Debate of the Late Fifteenth Century,” in *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institute* 39 (London: Warburg Institute, University of London, 1976); reprinted in *Articles on Witchcraft* 11 (New York – London: Garland Publishing, 1992).
- Dan, Joseph. “The Kabbalah of Johannes Reuchlin and Its Historical Significance,” in *The Christian Kabbalah: Jewish Mystical Books and Their Christian Interpreters*, ed. Joseph Dan (Cambridge: Harvard College Library, 1997); reprinted in Dan’s collected articles, *Jewish Mysticism*, Volume III: THE MODERN PERIOD (Northvale: Jason Aronson Inc., 1999).
- Schmidt-Biggemann, Wilhelm. “Christian Kabbala: Joseph Gikatilla (1247-1305), Johannes Reuchlin (1455-1522), Paulus Ricius (d. 1541), and Jacob Böhme (1575-1624),” in *The Language of Adam / Die Sprache Adams* [WOLFENBÜTTELER FORSCHUNGEN, Band 84], ed. Allison Coudert (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 1999).
- Reuchlin’s *Recommendation Whether to Confiscate, Destroy and Burn All Jewish Books: A Classic Treatise against Anti-Semitism*, translated, edited, and with a forward by Peter Wortsman; critical introduction by Elisheva Carlebach (Mahwah: Paulist Press, 2000), written in 1510.
- Celenza, Christopher S. “The Search for Ancient Wisdom in Early Modern Europe: Reuchlin and the Late Ancient Esoteric Paradigm,” in *The Journal of Religious History*, Volume 25, Number 2 (Sydney: Association for the Journal of Religious History, 2001)—an analysis of *De arte cabalistica*.

- Roling, Bernd. “The Complete Nature of Christ: Sources and Structures of a Christological Theurgy in the Works of Johannes Reuchlin,” in *The Metamorphosis of Magic from Late Antiquity to the Early Modern Period*, eds. Jan N. Bremmer and Jan R. Veenstra (Leuven: Peeters, 2002).
- Rummel, Erika. *The Case against Johann Reuchlin: Religious and Social Controversy in Sixteenth-Century Germany* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2002); includes 13 documents concerning the Reuchlin-Pfefferkorn conflict.
- Wolfson, Elliot. “Language, Secrecy, and the Mysteries of the Law: Theurgy and the Christian Kabbalah of Johannes Reuchlin,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume 13, eds. Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2005); also in *Invoking Angels: Theurgic Ideas and Practices, Thirteenth to Sixteenth Centuries*, ed. Claire Fanger (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2012).
- *Philosophia Symbolica: Johann Reuchlin and the Kabbalah*. Catalogue of an exhibition in the Bibliotheca Philosophica Hermetica commemorating Johann Reuchlin (1455-1522) (Amsterdam: Bibliotheca Philosophica Hermetica, 2005).
- Young, Susan (Shya) M. *DISRUPTING BOUNDARIES: THEURGY, SALVATION, AND KNOWLEDGE IN DE ARTE CABALISTICA*. M. A. Thesis, Edmonton: University of Alberta, 2007.
- Price, David H. *Johannes Reuchlin and the Campaign to Destroy Jewish Books* (Oxford – New York: Oxford University Press, 2011).
- O’Callaghan, Daniel. *The Preservation of Jewish Religious Books in Sixteenth-Century Germany: Johannes Reuchlin’s Augenspiegel* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2012).
- Idel, Moshe. “Johannes Reuchlin: Kabbalah, Pythagorean Philosophy and Modern Scholarship,” in *Moshe Idel: Representing God*, eds. Hava Tirosh-Samuels and Aaron W. Hughes (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2014), pp. 123-148.
- Burns, Joshua Ezra. “Esotericism in Classical Rabbinic Culture: Interpretive Problems and Prospects,” in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, volume 15, number 1 (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2015) § 3 “Classical Rabbinic Knowledge in the Christian Kabbalah,” pp. 32-41.

Refer to ADDENDUM A, ITEMS OF INTEREST: “Baron,” “Grätz,” “Schmidt-Biggemann,” and “Thorndike.”

PETRUS GALATINUS [or PIETRO COLONNA GALATINO] (ca. 1460–ca. 1540)

The Franciscan convert Galatinus compiled *De arcanis catholicae veritatis: contra obstinatissimum Judaeorum nostrae tempestatis perfidiam...* (ON THE SECRETS OF CATHOLIC TRUTH...—12 volumes, [Ortona]: Impressum vero Orthonae maris, summa cum diligentia per Hieronymum Suncinum, 1518) for the purpose of showing that “Judaism before Christ *was* Christianity” (Beitchman, *Alchemy...*, p. 120).

De arcanis... offers excerpts from the *Zohar*, and it quotes and defends Reuchlin’s *De arte cabalística*. *De arcanis...*, in fact, presents a dialogue between Reuchlin and Belgian theologian and controversialist Jakob van Hoogstraeten (ca. 1460-1527). It also introduces passages from Paul de Heredia’s *Epistola de secretis*, in particular those from the spurious kabbalistic text *Galerazaya* by the fictional Rabbenus Haccados (see page 3 above). *De arcanis...*, however, is more generally based on the cabalistic *Apocalypsis nova*, attributed to one Blessed Amadeus, and even moreso on Dominican Friar Raymundus Martini’s handbook for missionizers, *Pugio fidei* (DAGGER OF FAITH—composed ca. 1280) and Porchetto de Salvatici’s *Victoria adversus impios Hebraeos* (VICTORY OVER THE IMPIOUS HEBREWS—1303, printed in Paris, 1520).

In English, we find mostly shreads here and there; however, see

- Beitchman, Philip. *Alchemy of the Word*, pp. 120-121 *et passim*.
- Hamilton, Alisair. *The Apocryphal Apocalypse: The Reception of the Second Book of Esdra (4 Ezra) from the Renaissance to the Enlightenment* [OXFORD-WARBURG STUDIES] (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999) CHAPTER 2, “Prophecy and Kabbalism,” especially pp. 49-53.
- Leftley, S. A. *MILLENARIAN THOUGHT IN RENAISSANCE ROME WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO PIETRO GALATINO (c.1464-c.1540) AND EGIDIO DA VITERBO (c. 1469-1532)* ([UK]: University of Bristol, 1996).
- Morisi, Anna. “Galatino, Pietro,” in *Dictionary of Gnosis & Western Esotericism*, Volume 1, ed. Wouter Hanegraaff in collaboration with Antoine Faivre, Roelof van den Broek, and Jean-Pierre Brach (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2005).
- Schmidt-Biggemann, Wilhelm. “Political Theology in Renaissance Christian Kabbalah: Petrus Galatinus and Guillaume Postel,” in *Hebraic Political Studies*, vol. 1, no. 3 (Jerusalem: Shalem Press, 2006), pp. 286-309; also in *Political Hebraism: Judaic Sources in Early Modern Jewish Thought*, eds. Gordon Schochet, Fania Oz-Salzberger, and Meirav Jones (Jerusalem: Shalem Press, 2008), pp. 3-28.
- Wilkinson, Robert J. § *Pietro Galatino*, in Wilkinson’s *Orientalism, Aramaic and Kabbalah in the Catholic Reformation: The First Printing of the Syriac New Testament* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007), pp. 58-61.

In French:

- Gorny, Leon. *La Kabbale* (Paris: Pierre Belfond, 1977), § PIERRE GALATIN, pp. 159-160.
- Morisi, Anna. “Galatino et la Kabbale chrétienne,” in *Kabbalistes chrétiens* [series CAHIERS DE L’HERMÉTISME], ed. Faivre, Antoine (Paris: Albin Michel, 1979), pp. 211-231.
- Secret, F[rançois]. *Les Kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Dunod, 1964), § AUGUSTIN GIUSTINIANI ET PIERRE GALATIN, pp. 102-105 *et passim*.
- _____. *Le Zôhar chez les kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Durlacher, 1958), SECTION II, “Le Zôhar dans le *Psalterium* de Giustiniani et dans le *De Arcanic catholicae veritatis* de Galatin,” pp. 30-34.

JOHANNES TRITHEMIUS (*nee* Johann Heidenberg) (1462-1516)

Trithemius' "magical theology" was indebted to *cabala*, particularly as declared by Pico della Mirandola. Trithemius absorbed not only *cabala's* angelic magic and rituals, which utilized divine names, but also its ciphers and cryptological methods. Scholarly debate over the beliefs and intentions of Trithemius comprise the discussion in the final chapter of Noel L. Brann's book, *Trithemius and Magical Theology: A Chapter in the Controversy over Occult Studies in Early Modern Europe* [SUNY SERIES IN WESTERN ESOTERIC TRADITIONS], (Albany: State University of New York, 1999).

Trithemius' most significant text, *The Steganographia of Johannes Trithemius*, BOOK I, has been translated by Fiona Tait and Christopher Upton, with BOOK III (translated by Dr J. W. H. Walden) and an extract from a commentary (from BOOK IV of *Cryptomenytices et cryptographia*) by Gustavus Selenus (also translated by Dr J. W. H. Walden), edited with an introduction by Adam McLean (Edinburgh: Magnum Opus Hermetic Sourceworks [No. #12], 1982). Supplementing this is Wayne Shumaker's *Renaissance Curiosa* [MEDIEVAL & RENAISSANCE TEXTS & STUDIES, Volume 8] (Binghamton: Center for Medieval & Early Renaissance Studies, 1982), CHAPTER III: "Johannes Trithemius and Cryptography."

Find PART 1, § 3 MAGIC, PSEUDEPIGRAPHY, PROPHECIES AND FORGERIES IN TRITHEMIUS' MANUSCRIPTS. FROM CUSANUS TO BOVELLES? in Paola Zambelli's *White Magic, Black Magic in the European Renaissance* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007), and CHAPTER LX, "Magic in Dispute, II: Jacques Lefevre d'Etaples, Reuchlin, Trithemius," in Lynn Thorndike's *History of Magic and Experimental Science*, VOLUME IV (New York: Columbia University Press, 1934).

FRANCESCO GIORGI [or FRANÇOIS GEORGES DE VENISE] (1467-1540)

Francesco Giorgi (*or* Zorzi) “has been considered a central figure in sixteenth-century Christian Kabbalah both by his contemporaries and by modern scholars. ... After Giovanni Pico della Mirandola, who was the founder of the Christian kabbalah, Zorzi can claim second place,” writes Giulio Busi in “Francesco Zorzi: A Methodical Dreamer,” in *The Christian Kabbalah* (ed. Joseph Dan, Harvard College Library, 1997).

Giorgi’s major work, *De harmonia mundi*, “a massive and curious book, all Hermetic, Platonic, Cabalistic, and Pinchian,”¹⁴ has been given detailed treatment in *Francesco Giorgio’s DE HARMONIA MUNDI* by Yona Dureau (Lewiston – Lampeter: The Edwin Mellen Press, 2011). The publisher’s description of the book is misleading, for this work is not a straightforward “translation from the original Latin of Francesco Giorgio’s *De Harmonica (sic) Mundi* that establishes its connections to Christian Cabbala in the early Renaissance” (—from the Mellen Press website). Dureau’s forty untitled appendices offer facsimiles of key passages from Giorgi’s Latin text (Venice: 1525) and English translations of these, along with French translations from Guy Lefevre de la Boderie’s *L’Harmonie du Monde* (Paris: 1582); such facsimiles and translations (without Guy’s French) are also interspersed through the book. A CD is included, *Voces Harmoniae Mundi/Choirs of Harmony*—“to listen to while reading”—which features “music from Zorzo’s (*sic*) time and dreams.”

On Giorgi (listed chronologically):

- Yates, *Occult Philosophy*, CHAPTER IV.
- Walker, *Spiritual and Demonic Magic* (pp. 112-119).
- Wirszubski, Chaim. “Francesco Giorgio’s Commentary on Giovanni Pico’s Kabbalistic Theses,” in *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, VOLUME 37 (London: The Warburg Institute, 1974).
- Swietlicki, Catherine. § GIORGI in CHAPTER 1 of *Spanish Christian Cabala* (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1986), pp. 20-22.
- Schmidt-Biggemann, Wilhelm. CHAPTER 6, § 8, GIORGIO VENETO’S (1460-1540) *HARMONIA MUNDI, Philosophia Perennis* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 189] (Dordrecht: Springer, 2004).
- Getachew, Alex. “Zorzi’s Venetian Attack on Renaissance Science,” in *EIR Online: An Online Almanac from Executive Intelligence Review*, Volume 4, Issue Number 51 (December 2005—Founder and Contributing Editor Lyndon H. LaRouch, Jr.), pp. 50-2, at http://www.larouchepub.com/eiw/public/2005/2005_50-52/2005-51/pdf/box12_49.pdf [CAUTION: LINK CONTAINS VIRUS WARNING]
- Campanini, Saverio. “Francesco Giorgio’s Criticism of the *Vulgata. Hebraica Veritas or Mendosa Traductio?*” in *Hebrew to Latin, Latin to Hebrew: The Mirroring of Two Cultures in the Age of Humanism* [BERLIN STUDIES IN JUDAISM, 1], ed. Giulio Busi (Berlin: Institut für Judaistik, Freie Universität Berlin / Torino: Nino Aragno Editore, 2006).
- _____. “Shaping the Body of the Godhead: The Adaptation of the Androgynous Motif in Early Christian Kabbalah,” in *The Jewish Body: Corporeality, Society, and Identity in the Renaissance and Early Modern Period*, eds. M. Diemling and G. Veltri (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009).

Readers of French, refer to the chapters on Giorgi in François Secret’s works:

- *Hermetisme et Kabbale* (LEZIONI DELLA SCUOLA DI STUDI SUPERIORI IN NAPOLI 15, Napoli: Istituto Italiano per gli Studi Filosofici, 1992).
- *Le Zôhar chez les kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Durlacher, 1958), SECTION IV, “Les Problematata tires du Zôhar par Francisco Giorgio” (pp. 43-46).
- *Kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Dunod, 1964), § FRANÇOIS GEORGES DE VENISE (pp. 126-140).

¹⁴ Eugenio Garin, *History of Italian Philosophy*, vol 1, translated from the Italian and ed. Giorgio Pinton (Amsterdam – New York: Editions Rodopi B. V., 2008), p. 39.

CARDINAL EGIDIO DA VITERBO [or GILLES DE VITERBE] (1469–1532)

Cardinal Egidio da Viterbo was the author of two cabalistic works: *On the Hebrew Letters* and *Scechina*, published as *Libellus de litteris hebraicis; Scechina*, Testo critico latino con e inediti a cura di François Secret, two volumes (Roma: Centro Internazionale di studi Umanistici, 1959). *On the Hebrew Letters* is da Viterbo's summary of *Sefer ha-Temunah*, BOOK OF THE FIGURE (i.e., the *figure*, or *shape*, of the Hebrew letters), a treatise often cited by the early kabbalists of the Gerona circle.

Viterbo's later *Scechina* is "much longer and more comprehensive in its treatment of Cabalistic themes [than *de litteris*]"—ref. Joseph L. Blau's review of Secret's edition of da Viterbo in *Renaissance News*, Vol. 14, No. 4 (Hanover: Dartmouth College Library for the Council of Learned Societies, Winter 1961).

In English, see (listed chronologically)

- O'Malley, John W. *Giles of Viterbo on Church and Reform: A Study of Renaissance Thought* [STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL AND REFORMATION THOUGHT, volume 5] (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1968)—in particular CHAPTER II, "Several Renaissance Traditions," and CHAPTER III, "Scripture and the Cabala."
- Swietlicki, Catherine. § EGIDIO DA VITERBO in CHAPTER 1 of *Spanish Christian Cabala* (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1986), pp. 22-25.
- Martin, Francis X., *Friar, Reformer, and Renaissance Scholar: Life and Work of Giles of Viterbo 1469-1532*, with a foreword by John O'Malley, ed. John E. Rotelle. [THE AUGUSTINIAN SERIES, volume 18] (Villanova: Augustinian Press, 1992).
- Leftley, S. A. MILLENARIAN THOUGHT IN RENAISSANCE ROME WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO PIETRO GALATINO (c. 1464-c. 1540) AND EGIDIO DA VITERBO (c. 1469-1532) (Ph.D. dissertation, [UK]: University of Bristol, 1996)
- Wilkinson, Robert J. "First Beginnings: Egidio da Viterbo and the Kabbalistic Context of Syriac Studies at the Time of the Fifth Lateran Council," in Wilkinson's *Orientalism, Aramaic and Kabbalah in the Catholic Reformation: The First Printing of the Syriac New Testament* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007).
- Stein Kokin, Daniel. "Entering the Labyrinth: On the Hebrew and Kabbalistic Universe of Egidio da Viterbo," in *Hebraic Aspects of the Renaissance: Sources and Encounters*, eds. Ilana Zinguer, Abraham Melamed, and Zur Shalev (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2011).

Some enduring sources on Egidio are François Secret's works:

- *Le Zôbar chez les kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Durlacher, 1958), pp. 34-42.
- *Les Kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Dunod, 1964), pp. 106-126.

Egidio's *Commentarium ad mentum Platonis*, in Latin, has been published as *Giles of Viterbo – The Commentary on the Sentences of Petrus Lombardus*, ed. Daniel Nodds (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2010). Nodds' twenty-four-page introduction is in English.

JEAN THÉNAUD (*fl.* 1511-1523)

Franciscan Jean Thénaud, “voyager and cabalist,” was the author of *La Sainte et trescrestienne cabale* (THE HOLY AND VERY CHRISTIAN CABALA—1519, also called *La cabale métrifée*) and *Traité* (or *Traicté*) *de la cabale* (TREATISE ON THE CABALA—1521). Six-hundred lines of the former, in French, comprise APPENDIX D of J. L. Blau’s *Christian Interpretation of the Cabala*. Thenaud’s “The Very Christian Cabala” is discussed in Blau’s CHAPTER VII.

In his article, “Renaissance Kabbalah” (in *Modern Esoteric Spirituality*, eds. Antoine Faivre and Jacob Needleman, New York: Crossroad Publishing, 1995), G. Mallery Masters singles out Thenaud’s *Traité de la Cabale chretienne* as “one very typical ‘popularizing’ treatise from early sixteenth-century France.” After summarizing its contents, Masters reviews its sources, which amounts to a survey of the key figures of Renaissance *cabala*: Pico, Reuchlin, Agrippa, Ricci, and Giorgi (*or* Zorzi).

Further on the *Traité*, find Ian Christie-Miller’s brief article, “The Decrypting of the Kabbalistic Value of ‘Thirty-Seven,” online at <http://jec2.chez.com/christicart.pdf> [LINK CONTAINS VIRUS WARNING].

Readers of French: A critical edition of *Traicté de la Cabale*, annotated by Ian Christie-Miller in collaboration with François Roudaut, has been published (Paris: Honoré Champion, 2007). Also find François Secret’s discussion of Thénaud in *Les Kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Dunod, 1964), pp. 153ff, and Leon Gorny’s segment in *La Kabbale: Kabbale juive et cabale chrétiennes* (Paris: Pierre Belfond, 1977), pp. 191-196.

AGOSTINO (*or* AUGUSTINO) GIUSTINIANI (1470-1536)

Undoubtedly acquainted with the “kabbalistic circle” which included Egidio da Viterbo and Pietro Galatino, Dominican Agostino Giustiniani, a noble Genovese scholar of Greek and Hebrew, compiled *Psalterium hebraeum, Graecum, arabicum, et chaldaicum, cum tribus Latinis interpretationibus et glossis* [THE PSALTER OF HEBREW, GREEK, ARABIC, AND CHALDEAN, WITH THREE LATIN INTERPRETATIONS AND GLOSSES] (Genoa, 1516), which included the original Hebrew and Latin translations of kabbalistic passages from R. Isaac ibn Avi Sahulah and Abraham Abulafia. Augustino’s works may, in part, be the source of *kabbalah* for Leone Ebreo.

Alas, Augustino receives but passing notice in English-language books, the lengthiest being in Robert Wilkinson’s *Orientalism, Aramaic and Kabbalah in the Catholic Reformation* (Leiden: Brill, 2007—pages 55-57). See also the reference to Agostino in Valentina Izmirlieva’s *All the Names of the Lord: Lists, Mysticism, and Magic* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008) as “a well-known Christian Kabbalist” (page 200, note 42).

GIULIO CAMILLO (1480-1544)

Giulio Camillo, colorful alchemist and philosopher, was both praised and scorned in his day. He is most noted for his work on Memory Theatre, *L'idea del teatro* (Florence: Lorenzo Torrentino, 1550), which serves as a window into the intellectual and spiritual urgencies of his era, for Camillo engages the full gamut of the “Hermetic-Cabalist” tradition.

For the few sources in English, see

- Yates, Frances. *The Art of Memory* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966; rpt. 1994).
- Wenneker, Lu Beery. AN EXAMINATION OF *L'IDEA DEL THEATRO* OF GIULIO CAMILLO, Ph.D. diss. (University of Pittsburg, 1970).
- Maguire, Matthew. *The Memory Theatre of Giulio Camillo* (New York: [n.p.], ca. 1986).
 “*The Memory Theatre of Giulio Camillo* asks the question: How is the motion of the memory connected with the motion of history? How is the personal political? It is the story of a man with perfect memory who is haunted by the memory of a murder he may have committed. As he searches his memory he is confronted by events that he denies. Amnesia begins to set in as his denials grow until the mind of a man who could focus his entire memory in a single moment is in danger of shattering. ... *The Memory Theatre* is structured as a play within a play within a play.” (pp. 2 and 3)
- Rossi, Paolo. *Logic and the Art of Memory: The Quest for a Universal Language*, trans. Stephen Clucas (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000), *passim*.
- Robinson, Kate. *A Search for the Source of the Whirlpool of Artifice: The Cosmology of Giulio Camillo* (Edinburgh: Dunedin Academic Press Ltd., 2006).
 “There is evidence, however, that the cabbalah was not a subject that was wholly to absorb Camillo, and that he later felt that the references to it in *L'Idée del Teatro* were more like spice than the meat of the work.” (—Robinson, *A search...*, page 26)
 Also see Robinson’s brief “Giulio Camillo’s *L'idea del teatro*,” in *eSharp*, Issue 1 (University of Glasgow, Autumn 2003): MAGIC, at <http://www.gla.ac.uk/research/az/esharp/issues/1/robinson/>.
- Bolzoni, Lina. “Giulio Camillo’s Memory Theatre and the Kabbalah,” in *Hebraic Aspects of the Renaissance: Sources and Encounters*, eds. Ilana Zinguer, Abraham Melamed, and Zur Shalev (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2011).
- Uricchio, William. “A Palimpsest of Place and Past,” in *Performance Research: A Journal of the Performing Arts*, Volume 17, Issue 3 (London: Taylor & Francis, 2012), pp. 45-49.

Camillo’s works were published in Italian as *L'idea del Teatro e altri scritti di retorica* (Turin: Edizioni RES, 1990). Lina Bolzoni has edited a Spanish version: *La Idea del Teatro* [BIBLIOTECA DE ENSAYO/ESSAY LIBRARY], translated by Jordi Raventos (Madrid: Ediciones Siruela SA, 2006 and 2010).

In French, see SECTION V, “Giulio Camilio et le Zôbar,” of François Secret, *Le Zôbar chez les kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Durlacher, 1958), pp. 49-51.

HEINRICH CORNELIUS AGRIPPA (1486?-1535)

Following on Pico, Lazzarelli, Giorgi, and Reuchlin was Trithemius' student, Heinrich Cornelius Agrippa of Nettesheim. His major work, *De occulta philosophia* (in three books), is a compendium of occult sciences. Agrippa's account of *cabala* is found in Book III, coupled as it is with medieval angelology and demonology and the magic connected with these. There is a fine edition prepared by Donald Tyson, *Three Books of Occult Philosophy* (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications, 1992), where *De occulta philosophia* is rightly referred to as "The Foundation Book of Western Occultism."¹⁵ Indeed, no other book has contributed more to the Western magical-occult tradition than this—with its companion, the pseudo-Agrippan "Fourth Book," which is a tract on ceremonial magic in the same spirit as the three *true* books. See Robert Turner, translator, *The Fourth Book of Occult Philosophy*, edited, with commentary, by Stephen Skinner (London: Askini Publishers, 1978; rpt Berwick [ME]: Ibis Press, 2005), OR *The Fourth Book of Occult Philosophy: The Companion to the Three Books of Occult Philosophy*, edited and annotated by Donald Tyson (Woodbury: Llewellyn Publications, 2009).

Tyson's edition of *De occulta philosophia* supplements Agrippa's text with a substantial amount of well-researched support material covering such topics as "Practical Kabbalah," "The Sephiroth," "Magic Squares," "Geomancy," and others, in eight appendices, which makes this particular edition a valuable reference book.

See below, ADDENDUM B: SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY PRINTED WORKS ON CHRISTIAN CABALA IN ENGLISH, for the complete text of the title page of the 1651 English edition of *De occulta philosophia* (p. 124).

De occulta philosophia in English, including the "spurious" fourth book, can be viewed on-line at Joseph H. Peterson's TWILIT GROTTTO site, www.esotericarchives.com/agrippa/index.html and at the MSU Libraries Digital and Multimedia Center, <http://www.lib.msu.edu/branches/dmc/digital> (search "Author": Agrippa).

A new English translation of the first tome of *De occulta philosophia* from the original Latin has been published: *Three Books of Occult Philosophy: Books One, A Modern Translation* (ACADEMIC EDITION), translated by Eric Purdue, preface by Christopher Warnock (Renaissance Astrology, 2012). Note Christopher Warnock's critique of "Donald Tyson's Annotated Edition" on page 5.

Along with Yates' chapters on Agrippa in *Giordano Bruno* and *The Occult Philosophy*, see (listed chronologically)

- Walker, D. P. *Spiritual and Demonic Magic*, pp. 90-6.
- Nauert, Charles G. *Agrippa and the Crisis of Renaissance Thought* (ILLINOIS STUDIES IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES 55, Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1965); on Agrippa's cabalistic sources, see pp. 129-136.
- Mebane, John S. *Renaissance Magic & the Return of the Golden Age: The Occult Tradition & Marlowe, Jonson, & Shakespeare* (Lincoln – London: University of Nebraska Press, 1989): CHAPTER 4, "Cornelius Agrippa and the Dissemination of Renaissance Magic."
- van der Poel, Marc G. *Cornelius Agrippa: The Humanist Theologian and His Declamations* (Leiden – New York – Köln: Brill, 1997)
- Lehrich, Christopher I. *The Language of Demons and Angels: Cornelius Agrippa's Occult Philosophy* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2003) = HERMETIC HERMENEUTICS: LANGUAGE, MAGIC, AND POWER IN CORNELIUS AGRIPPA'S 'DE OCCULTA PHILOSOPHIA,' Volumes One and Two (Ph.D. dissertation, Chicago: University of Chicago, 2000).

¹⁵ See Christopher Warnock's critique of Tyson's edition in *Three Books of Occult Philosophy: Books One, A Modern Translation* (ACADEMIC EDITION), translated by Eric Purdue, preface by Christopher Warnock (Renaissance Astrology, 2012), p. 5.

- Nauert, Charles G. “Heinrich Cornelius Agrippa von Nettesheim” in *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, principal editor: Edward N. Zalta, (Stanford: The Metaphysics Research Lab, CSLI, Stanford University, 2007)—online at <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/agrippa-nettesheim/>

The van der Poel and Lehrich books complement each other nicely: The former concentrates on Agrippa’s philosophical and theological thought *via* his correspondence, orations, and declamations (i.e., *De incertitudine et vanite...*, *De nobilitate et præcellentia fæminei sexus*, etc.); the latter focuses on *De occulta philosophia*. Particularly on matters of Agrippa’s biography, van der Poel and Lehrich defer to Nauert as supplemented by the numerous articles of Paola Zambelli, only a few of which are in English:

- “Magic and Radical Reformation in Agrippa of Nettesheim,” in *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 39 (1976), AND *Articles on Witchcraft* 11 (New York – London: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1992)
- “Scholastic and Humanist Views of Hermeticism and Witchcraft,” in *Hermeticism and the Renaissance: Intellectual History and the Occult in Early Modern Europe*, eds. Ingrid Merkel and Allen G. Debus (Washington: Folger Books, 1988) = PART I, CHAPTER TWO of *White Magic, Black Magic in the European Renaissance: From Ficino, Pico, Della Porta to Trithemius, Agrippa, Bruno* [STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE TRADITIONS, VOLUME CXXV] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007).
- “Agrippa as an Author of Prohibited Books” = PART II of *White Magic, Black Magic in the European Renaissance*.

The bibliographies in van der Poel and Lehrich are immensely useful: See van der Poel (pp. 277-280) for a complete list of Agrippa’s works, and Lehrich (pp. 240-243): WORKS ON AGRIPPA. There is also “Agrippa and Occult Philosophy” in Lynn Thorndike, *A History of Magic and Experimental Science*, Volume V: THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY (New York – London: Columbia University Press, 1941^{1st ed}, 1966^{4th ed}).

Online, see Henry Morley’s *Life of Henry Cornelius Agrippa von Nettesheim, Doctor and Knight, Commonly Known as a Magician*, 2 volumes (London: Chapman & Hall, 1856), digitized by Google, at INTERNET ARCHIVE > <http://archive.org/search.php?query=life%20of%20henry%20cornelius%20agrippa>.

PHILLIPUS THEOPHRASTUS AUREOLUS BOMBASTUS VON HOHENHEIM
known as PARACELSUS (1493-1541)

Another student of Trithemius, Paracelsus is generally—and correctly—associated with alchemy; the term *cabala* can be attached to him only in its broadest, most inexact sense, *i.e.*, referring to astronomical and magical practices.

On or by Paracelsus (listed chronologically):

- Waite, Arthur Edward (ed.) *The Hermetic and Alchemical Writings of Paracelsus*, in two volumes (London: James Elliot and Co., 1894; rpt New Hyde Park: University Books, 1967).
- Stoddart, Anna M. *The Life of Paracelsus: Theophrastus von Hohenheim 1493-1541* (London: John Murray, 1911).
- Stillman, John Maxson. *Theophrastus Bombastus Von Hohenheim Called Paracelsus: His Personality and Influence As Physician, Chemist and Reformer* (London – Chicago: The Open Court Publishing Co., 1920).
- Sigerist, Henry (ed.) *Four Treatises of Theophrastus Von Hohenheim Called Paracelsus*, translated, with introductory essays by C. Lillian Temkin, George Rosen, Gregory Zilboorg, and Henry E Sigerist (Baltimore – London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1941; rpt 1996).
- Pachter, Henry M. *Magic into Science: The Story of Paracelsus* (New York: Henry Schuman, 1951)
- Pagel, Walter. *Paracelsus: An Introduction to Philosophical Medicine in the Era of the Renaissance* (Basil: S. Karger Publications, 1958; 2nd revised edition, 1984).
- *Paracelsus: Selected Writings*, ed. Jolande Jacobi, translated by Norbert Guterman [BOLLINGEN SERIES XXVIII] (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1979).
- Webster, Charles. “Alchemical and Paracelsian Medicine,” in *Articles on Witchcraft* 11 (New York – London: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1992)
- Schipperges, Heinrich. “Paracelsus and His Followers,” in *Modern Esoteric Spirituality*, eds. Antoine Faivre and Jacob Needleman [Volume 21 of *WORLD SPIRITUALITY: AN ENCYCLOPEDIA OF THE RELIGIOUS QUEST*] (New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1995).
- [Paracelsus.] *The Archidoxes of Magic* translated by Robert Turner, 1655 (London: Askin, 1975 rpt. Kila: Kessinger Publishing Company, 1997).
- Weeks, Andrew. *Paracelsus: Speculative Theory and the Crisis of the Early Reformation* [SUNY SERIES IN WESTERN ESOTERIC TRADITIONS] (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1997)
- Grell, Ole Peter (ed.) *Paracelsus: The Man and His Reputation, His Ideas and Their Transformation*. (Leiden: Brill, 1998).
- Goodrick-Clarke, Nicholas (ed.) *Paracelsus: Essential Readings* [WESTERN ESOTERIC MASTERS] (Berkeley: North Atlantic Books, 1999).
- Benzenhöfer, Udo; and Gantenbein, Urs Leo. “Paracelsus,” in VOLUME 2 of *Dictionary of Gnosis & Western Esotericism*, ed. Wouter J. Hanegraaff (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2005).
- Ball, Philip. *The Devil's Doctor: Paracelsus and the World of Renaissance Magic and Science* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2006).
- Weeks, Andrew. *Paracelsus (Theophrastus Bombastus von Hohenheim, 1493-1541): Essential Theoretical Writings* (Leiden: Brill, 2007).
- Goodrick-Clarke, Nicolas. “Alchemy, Paracelsus, and German *Naturphilosophie*,” = CHAPTER 4 of *The Western Esoteric Traditions: A Historical Introduction* (Oxford – New York: Oxford University Press, 2008).
- Webster, Charles. *Paracelsus: Medicine, Magic and Mission at the End of Time* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008).
- Hedesan, Georgiana. “The Mystery of *Mysterium Magnum*: Paracelsus’s Alchemical Interpretation of Creation in *Philosophia ad Atheniensis* and Its Early Modern Commentators,” in *Hidden Truths from Eden: Esoteric Readings of Genesis 1-3*, eds. Caroline Vander Stichele and Susanne Scholtz [SOCIETY OF BIBLICAL LITERATURE SEMEIA STUDIES; number 76] (Atlanta: SBL Press, 2014), pp. 145-166.

- Weeks, Andrew. "Paracelsus," in *The Occult World*, ed. Christopher Partridge (Abingdon: Routledge, 2015), pp. 99-106.

On the Internet: *Paracelsus, Five Hundred Years: Three American Exhibitions*, with introductory material by Allen G. Debus at www.nlm.nih.gov/exhibition/paracelsus/paracelsus_1.html > "Some Readings on Paracelsus"; and THE ZURICH PARACELTUS PROJECT [ENGLISH SECTION], online at <http://www.paracelsus.uzh.ch/index.html>.

PAUL RICIUS [or RICCI] (fl. 1506-1541)

“The years between” Reuchlin’s *De verbo mirifico* and *De arte cabalistica* “also witnessed the appearance of a number of works by the learned convert Paul Ricius, the private physician of Emperor Maximilian, who took Pico’s and Reuchlin’s conclusions and added to them through an original synthesis of kabbalistic and Christian sources” (—Scholem, *Kabbalah*, p. 198). Ricius’ four-volume *De caelesti agricultura* was included in Johannes Pistorius’ compendium, *Artis cabalisticæ* (Basileæ: per S. Henricpetri, 1587)—which also contained Rabi Iosephi (Joseph Gikatilla): *De porta*, i.e., *Sha’are Orab*; Leonis Hebræi (Leone Ebreo): *De amore dialogi tres*; Ionnis Revchlini (Johann Reuchlin): *De arte cabalistica*, libri III; *De verbo mirifico*, libri III; Archangeli Bvrgonovenisis (Archangelus of Borgo Nuovo): *Interpretationes in selectiora obscurioraq cabalistarum dogmata*; Abrahami (Abraham the Prophet): *De creatione & cabalisticis, hebraicè Sepher ierzira*, liber.

“A complete translation” of “PAUL RICCI’S INTRODUCTION TO THE LORE OF THE CABALISTS OR ALLEGORIZERS” (*Pauli Ricii in cabalistarum seu allegorizantium eruditionem isagoge*, Augsburg: 1515) is presented in Blau’s *Christian Interpretation of the Cabala in the Renaissance* (pp. 67-74). On this work, see Beitchman’s *Alchemy of the Word*: § THE DISSEMINATION OF CABALA (p. 169), along with his numerous other references.

See also (listed chronologically)

- Swietlicki, Catherine. “Christian Cabala in the Renaissance,” § THE RICCI BROTHERS, in *Spanish Christian Cabala* (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1986), pp. 13-14
- Schmidt-Biggemann, Wilhelm. “Christian Kabbala: Joseph Gikatilla (1247-1305), Johannes Reuchlin (1455-1522), Paulus Ricius (d. 1541), and Jacob Böhme (1575-1624),” in *The Language of Adam / Die Sprache Adams* [WOLFENBÜTTELER FORSCHUNGEN, Band 84], ed. Allison Coudert (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 1999)
- Schmidt-Biggemann’s *Philosophia Perennis: Historical Outlines of Western Spirituality in Ancient, Medieval and Early Modern Thought* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 189] (Dordrecht: Springer, 2004), § 3.5. “Christian Cabala I: Giovanni Pico, Johannes Reuchlin, and Paulus Ricius,” AND § 4.12. “Paulus Ricius’ Cabalistic Cosmos”
- Black, Crofton. “From Kabbalah to Psychology: The Allegorizing *Isagoge* of Paulus Ricius, 1509-41,” in *Magic, Ritual, and Witchcraft*, Volume 2, Number 2 (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, Winter 2007).
- Campanini, Saverio. “Shaping the Body of the Godhead: The Adaptation of the Androgynous Motif in Early Christian Kabbalah,” in *The Jewish Body: Corporeality, Society, and Identity in the Renaissance and Early Modern Period*, eds. Maria Diemling and Giuseppe Veltri (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009).

Readers of French, see § PAUL RICI in François Secret’s *Kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (pp. 87ff).

JOHANN ALBRECHT WIDMANSTETTER [*or* WIDMANSTADT] (1506-1557)

One of the most remarkable of the foreign humanists working in Italy at this time [1529-1555] was the German, Johann Albrecht Widmanstadt, later Chancellor of Lower Austria and Rector of the University of Vienna, who went far beyond the rudiments of Jewish scholarship and enjoyed the advantage of instruction by a number of distinguished teachers.

—Cecil Roth, *The Jews of the Renaissance* (New York: Harper & Row, 1959), p. 148.

“As a young man he knew of Reuchlin. ... [I]n Naples...he met Pico della Mirandola’s teacher of Kabbalah, Rabbi Dattilus [or Dattilo], and it was here that Widmanstetter’s kabbalistic education began. ... [Edigio] invited Widmanstetter to Rome to further his Arabic and kabbalistic studies”—Robert J. Wilkinson, *Orientalism, Aramaic and Kabbalah in the Catholic Reformation: The First Printing of the Syriac New Testament* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007), CHAPTER FIVE “The Scholars of the *editio princeps*: Widmanstetter” (quotes from pp. 137-9; see in particular §§ WIDMANSTETTER AS A KABBALIST and THE ANNOTATIONS, pp. 162-169).

Further references to Widmanstetter appear in Wilkinson’s *Kabbalistic Scholars of the Antwerp Polyglot Bible* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007).

Widmanstetter’s critique of Dattilus is quoted by Scholem in “The Beginnings of Christian Kabbalah” (in *The Christian Kabbalah*, ed. Joseph Dan [Cambridge: Harvard College Library, 1997], p. 19).

With guileless irony, Widmanstetter “warned his coreligionists that ‘from the Kabbalah of the Jews will spring, as from a Trojan horse, an infinite number of startling opinions which will serve as weapons for attack upon the Church of Christ.’”—Salo Wittmayer Baron, *A Social and Religious History of the Jews: Late Middle Ages and Era of European Expansion 1200-1650*, VOLUME XIII: INQUISITION, RENAISSANCE, AND REFORMATION (New York – London: Columbia University Press/Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society, 1969), p. 180. Scholem reiterates Widmanstetter’s warning in “The Beginnings of Christian Kabbalah,” noting, “Widmanstadt’s criticism shows, at least on this particular point, an unusual understanding both of the kabbalah’s true character, and of the ambiguity inherent in the Christian kabbalist project, especially when, as in Pico’s case, that project was grounded in a belief in syncretism as a positive value.”

Readers of French, refer to the segment of Secret’s *Kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Dunod, 1964), pp. 121-123 on Widmanstetter.

GUILLAUME POSTEL (1510-1581)

Guillaume Postel produced a Latin translation of the *Sefer Yezirah* and penned some comments on it. “In addition, he translated the *Bahir*, part of a commentary of Menahem of Recanati, and a part of the *Beresith Rabba*.” (—Marion Kuntz, *Guillaume Postel*, p. 85—this title is cited in detail below). Postel also translated portions of the *Zohar*, receiving guidance in understanding them from an unlikely tutor: an illiterate woman, though something of a sixteenth-century Mother Teresa (perhaps in both the best and worst sense), called Madre Zuana, or Mother Johanna—the “Venetian Virgin.” At various times, Postel identified her as mother of the world, the *shekhinah*, and the second messiah. Marion Kuntz writes, “As [Postel] worked on his translation of the *Zohar*, he became ever more convinced that the restitution of all things as interpreted by his Mother Johanna was confirmed not only in the ‘most divine and rare books of the *Zohar*,’ but also in the books of the ancient [Jewish] interpreters...” (—Kuntz, *Guillaume Postel*, p. 84). Alas, none of Postel’s translations has ever been published.

On Postel, in chronological order:

- Butler, Geoffrey. “William Postel, World Peace through World Power” = CHAPTER III of *Studies in Statecraft, being Chapters, Biographical and Bibliographical, mainly on the Sixteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1920); APPENDIX D. “A Bibliography of William Postel.”
- Bouwsma, William. “Postel and the Significance of Renaissance Cabalism,” in *Journal of the History of Ideas*, vol. XV (Lancaster – New York: City College, 1954); reprinted in *A Usable Past: Essays in European Cultural History* by William J. Bouwsma (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990).
- _____. *Concordia Mundi: The Career and Thought of Guillaume Postel (1510-1581)* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1957).
- Kuntz, Marion L. *Guillaume Postel: Prophet of the Restitution of All Things—His Life and Works* (The Hague – Boston – Hingham: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1981).
- McGinn, Bernard. “Cabalists and Christians: Reflections on Cabala in Medieval and Renaissance Thought,” in *Jewish Christians and Christian Jews*, eds. R. H. Popkin and G. M. Weiner (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1993); McGinn’s article also covers Pico and includes a brief section on the period before him, back into the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, discussing in particular the converted Jew Petrus Alfonsi.
- Åkerman, Susanna. “The Gothic Kabbala: Johannes Bureus, Runic Theosophy, and Northern European Apocalypticism,” in *The Expulsion of the Jews: 1492 and After*, eds. Raymond B. Waddington and Arthur H. Williamson (New York – London: Garland Publishing, 1994), the final section: GUILLAUME POSTEL AND THE ROSICRUCIAN LION.
- Kuntz’ article, “The Original Language as a Paradigm for the *restitution omnium* in the Thought of Guillaume Postel,” in *The Language of Adam / Die Sprache Adams* [WOLFENBÜTTELER FORSCHUNGEN, Band 84], ed. Allison Coudert. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 1999.
- Novelist, historian, and semiotics specialist Umberto Eco devotes some pages to Postel in *The Search for the Perfect Language* (Oxford and Cambridge: Blackwell Publishers Ltd, 1995), a book which offers much of interest regarding Christian Europe’s approaches to *kabbalah* and the Hebrew tongue. On all of this, also see James Knowlson, *Universal Language Scheme in England and France 1600-1800* (Toronto – Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 1975), and Paolo Rossi, *Logic and the Art of Memory: The Quest for a Universal Language*, translated and with an introduction by Stephen Clucas (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000).
- Kuntz’ collection, *Venice, Myth and Utopian Thought in the Sixteenth Century: Bodin, Postel and the Virgin of Venice* (VARIORUM COLLECTED STUDIES SERIES CS668, Aldershot – Brookfield: Ashgate Publishing Company, 2000; of the 8 articles on Postel, 6 are in English, 2 in Italian).
- Petry, Yvonne. *Gender, Kabbalah and the Reformation: The Mystical Theology of Guillaume Postel (1510-1581)* [STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL AND REFORMATION THOUGHT, Volume XCVIII] Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2004.

This is an improved version of Petry's Ph.D. dissertation: *GENDER, KABBALAH AND THE CATHOLIC REFORMATION: A STUDY OF THE MYSTICAL THEOLOGY OF GUILLAUME POSTEL (1510-1581)* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba, 1997).

- Schmidt-Biggemann, Wilhelm. *Philosophia Perennis: Historical Outlines of Western Spirituality in Ancient, Medieval and Early Modern Thought* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 189] (Dordrecht: Springer, 2004): CHAPTER 7. The Return of Time, § 3. Origenism, d) "The Unification of All Religions. Guillaume Postel's (1510-1581) Synergetic *Apokatastasis*."
- Schmidt-Biggemann, Wilhelm. "Political Theology in Renaissance Christian Kabbalah: Petrus Galatinus and Guillaume Postel," in *Hebraic Political Studies*, vol. 1, no. 3 (Jerusalem: Shalem Press, 2006), pp. 286-309.
- Wilkinson, Robert J. "The Scholars of the *editio princeps*: Postel," in (*idem*) *Orientalism, Aramaic and Kabbalah in the Catholic Reformation: The First Printing of the Syriac New Testament* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007); and "Northern Scholars: The Role of Postel in the Antwerp Polyglot" = CHAPTER FOUR of *The Kabbalistic Scholars of the Antwerp Polyglot Bible* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007).
- Brach, Jean-Pierre. "Spiritual Authority and the Transmission of Knowledge in Christian Kabbalah: The Case of Guillaume Postel (1510-81)," in *Constructing Tradition: Means and Myths of Transmission in Western Esotericism*, ed. Andreas B. Kilcher (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2010).
- Meroz, R[onit]; and Weiss, J. "The Source of Guillaume Postel's 1553 Zohar Latin Translation," in *Renaissance Studies*, vol. 29, no. 2 (Malden – Chichester: The Society for Renaissance Studies and John Wiley & Sons Ltd, 2014), pages 247-260.

Readers of French, refer to the works on Postel written or edited by François Secret:

- *Le Zôhar chez les kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Durlacher, 1958), SECTION VI, "Les traduction du Zôhar de Guillaume Postel" (pp. 51-78) and APPENDIX I, "Préface de Postel à sa traduction du Zôhar sur la Genèse" (pp. 104-114).
- *Les Kabbalistes chrétiens de la Renaissance* (Paris: Dunod, 1964), § GUILLAUME POSTEL, pp. 171-186, and § L'ÉCOLE DE GUILLAUME POSTEL, pp. 187-217.
- *Bibliographie des manuscrits de Guillaume Postel* (Genève: Droz, 1970).
- *Guillaume Postel, 1510-1581: et son interpretation du candelabra de Moïse en hébreu, latin, italien et française*, avec une introd. et des notes par François Secret (Nieuwkoop: B. de Graaf, 1966).
- *Guillaume Postel: apologues et rétractions; manuscrits inédits publiés avec une introd. et des notes par François Secret* (Nieuwkoop, B. de Graaf, 1972).
- *Postelliana: Guillaume Postel: édités par François Secret* (Nieuwkoop: B. de Graaf, 1981).
- *Postel revisité: Nouvelles recherches sur Guillaume Postel et son milieu* (Paris: S. E. H. A. / Milan: Archè, 1998).

In French, also see

- Gorny, Leon. *La Kabbale* (Paris: Pierre Belfond, 1977), § GUILLAUME POSTEL, pp. 197-206, and § L'ÉCOLE DE GUILLAUME POSTEL, pp. 225-238.
- Lestringant, Frank. "Kabbale et cosmographie, de Guillaume Postel à Jacques d'Auzoles- Lapeyre," in *Hebraic Aspects of the Renaissance: Sources and Encounters*, eds. Ilana Zinguer, Abraham Melamed, and Zur Shalev (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2011).

JOHN DEE (1527-1608)

In *Occult Philosophy in the Elizabethan Age*, Frances Yates calls John Dee a “Christian Cabalist.” Indeed, Dee seems to have drawn his *cabala* fully from Christian sources, primarily Agrippa.

There is a well-developed literature on Dee—quite a few more items than are listed here—including his own writings in reprint as well as studies of his work and influence. First, note the references above in § SOME HISTORIANS: FRANCES YATES.

Recent publications and reprints include these works by Dee:

- Méric Casaubon’s presentation of Dee material: *A True and Faithful Relation of What Passed for Many Years between Dr. John Dee and Some Spirits* (London: 1659; rpt. London: Askin, and Glasgow: Antonine Publishing Company, 1974; rpt. New York: Magickal Childe Publishing, 1992; rpt. Kila: Kessinger Publishing, n.d.).
A “completely new & reset edition” of *A True and Faithful Relation...* published as *Dr John Dee’s Spiritual Diaries (1583-1608)*, ed. Stephen Skinner (Singapore: Golden Hoard Publishing, 2011); supplemented by Skinner’s *Key to the Latin of Dr John Dee’s Spiritual Diaries* (Singapore: Golden Hoard Publishing, 2012), “a full translation of the more than 50,000 words printed in Latin in Dee’s Diaries.”
- There is a discussion of *A True and Faithful Relation...* in Wayne Shumaker’s *Renaissance Curiosa* [MIEVEAL AND RENAISSANCE TEXTS AND STUDIES, Volume 8] (Binghamton: Center for Medieval & Early Renaissance Studies, 1982), CHAPTER I: “John Dee’s Conversations with Angels.”
- *Hieroglyphic Monad*, translated by J. W. Hamilton-Jones (London: John M. Watkins, 1947; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1975; rpt. Edmonds: Sure Fire Press, 1986; rpt. York Beach, Red Wheel/Weiser, 2000).
The best edition remains that of C. H. Josten: “A Translation of John Dee’s ‘Monas Hieroglyphica’ (Antwerp, 1564), with Introduction and Notes,” in *Ambix: The Journal of the Society for the Study of Alchemy and Early Chemistry*, volume XII, numbers 2 & 3 (Cambridge, 1964), which shows the original on pages facing the translation. Benjamin Rowe’s edition is at <http://hermetic.com/norton/pdf/Dee%20Monad.pdf>.
- *The Heptarchia Mystica of John Dee*, ed. Robert Turner (Wellingborough: Aquarian Press, 1983 & 1986).
- Geoffrey James’ edition of *The Enochian Magick of Dr. John Dee* (St. Paul, Llewellyn Publications, 1984 & 1994).
- *The Secrets of John Dee*, introduction and commentary by Gordon James (Edmonds: Holmes Publishing Group, 1995)
- *John Dee: Essential Readings*, selected and introduced by Gerald Suster (Wellingborough [GB]: Crucible, 1986; reprinted, Berkeley: North Atlantic Books, 2003).
- *John Dee’s Five Books of Mystery: Original Sourcebook of Enochian Magic* FROM THE COLLECTED WORKS KNOWN AS MYSTERIORUM LIBRI QUINQUE, ed. Joseph H. Peterson (York Beach: Weiser Books, 2003).
Five Books... is a welcome reprint of *Mysteriorum Libri Quinque: Five Books of Mystical Exercises of John Dee* [MAGNUM OPUS - HERMETIC SOURCE WORKS SERIES, 20] hand-bound by Adam McLean, limited edition of 250 copies in 1985.

An interesting addition to the Dee magical material is Stephen Skinner and David Rankine’s *Practical Angel Magic of Dr John Dee’s Enochian Tables*, TABULARUM BONORUM ANGELORUM INVOCATIONES [SOURCEWORKS OF CEREMONIAL MAGIC – Volume 1] (London: Golden Hoard Press, 2004): “...the present manuscript is a working expansion of the *Book of Invocation or Calls*, the last of the four manuscripts found in Dee’s secret chest.” (—p. 37) “The two manuscripts transcribed in Part 3 of this book are Sloane MS 307 and Sloane MS 3821, both from the British Library.” (—p. 53) It is strongly suggested that the author of the “extensive expansion” was one Thomas Rudd (1583-1656),

whose manuscripts are also featured in volumes 2 and 3 of SOURCEWORKS OF CEREMONIAL MAGIC: *Keys to the Gateway of Magic: Summoning the Solomonian Archangels & Demon Princes* AND *The Goetia of Dr Rudd: Angels and Demons*. Add to these Colin D. Campbell's *Magic Seal of Dr. John Dee: The Sigillum Dei Aemeth* (York Beach: Teitan Press, 2009), which presents the history of Dee's *sigillum*, suggests corrections which might be made, then shows how it can be put to ritual use.

About Dee (listed chronologically)

- Deacon, Richard. *John Dee: Scientist, Astrologer & Secret Agent to Elizabeth I* (London: Frederick Muller, 1968).
- French, Peter. *John Dee: The World of an Elizabethan Magus* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1972; rpt. 1984)—*Cabala* is referred to in passing throughout.
- Clulee, Nicholas H. *John Dee's Natural Philosophy: Between Science and Religion* (London: Routledge, 1988)—*Cabala* is most often mentioned in Clulee's discussion of Dee's *Monas hieroglyphica*. It is pointed out that Dee believed that he had superseded the "vulgar linguistic discipline" of Hebraic *kabbalah* with his own "real" *kabbalah*.
- Turner, Robert. *Elizabethan Magic: The Art of the Magus* (Longmead: Element Books Ltd, 1989)—The chapters on Dee in Turner's book treat the Enochian magical art and the resulting "angelic manuscripts." Connections to *cabala* are not discussed.
- James, Geoffrey. *Angel Magic: The Ancient Art of Summoning and Communicating with Angelic Beings* (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications, 1995)—James refers to the principle based on Hebrew *cabala* "which says that the name of an object is inextricably linked with that object. To know the true name of something is to be able to control it completely." (p. 16)
- Harkness, Deborah. *John Dee's Conversations with Angels: Cabala, Alchemy, and the End of Nature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999)—*Cabala* is dealt with throughout; see in particular CHAPTER 5, "The True Cabala: Reading the Book of Nature," which describes "angelic cabala and explains how it is similar, and dissimilar, to the Jewish and Christian cabala of the early modern period." (—p. 5)
- Håkansson, Hakan. *Seeing the Word: John Dee and Renaissance Occultism* [UGGLAN MINERVASERIEN, 2] (Lund: Lunds Universitet, 2001)—Dee's uses of *Cabala* are discussed in numerous sections toward the middle of *Seeing the Word*, in particular pp. 170-199.
- Woolley, Benjamin. *The Queen's Conjuror: The Science and Magic of Dr. John Dee, Advisor to Queen Elizabeth I* (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 2001)—CHAPTER IX opens with a brief account of Dee's exploration of "a new field of research: the Cabala."
- Szonyi, György E. *John Dee's Occultism: Magical Exaltation through Powerful Signs*. (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2004)—See pp. 90-104, where there is a "sketchy outline of the cabala" within a segment called PICO'S ECOMIUM OF EXALTATIO.
- Clucas, Stephen (ed). *John Dee: Interdisciplinary Studies in English Renaissance Thought* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES OF THE HISTORY OF IDEAS (= INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES), 193]. Dordrecht: Springer, 2006—Refer in particular to PART THREE: DEE AND THE OCCULT SCIENCES (in which the lead article is Karen De Léon-Jones' "John Dee and the Kabbalah"), PART FOUR: DEE'S CONVERSATION WITH ANGELS, and Stephen Clucas' "Recent Works on John Dee (1988-2005): A Select Bibliography" [of works since Clulee's *John Dee's Natural Philosophy*].
- Parry, Glyn. *The Arch-Conjuror of England: John Dee*. (New Haven - London: Yale University Press, 2011). See especially CHAPTER 5, "The Kabbalah of Creation."

For a review of Harkness, Håkansson, Woolley, and Szulakowska, see György E. Szonyi, "John Dee and Early Modern Occult Philosophy," in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, NEW SERIES, vol. 2, no. 1 (Leiden – Boston – Köln: Brill, 2002).

Significant short works, articles, and chapters on Dee:

- James, M[ontague]. R[hodes]. *Lists of Manuscripts Formerly Owned by Dr. John Dee*, with preface and identifications (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1921).

- Butler, E. M. *Myth of the Magus* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1948; rpt 1979), PART II, CHAPTER IV, § (a) *Dee and Kelley* (pp. 160-172), and Butler's *Ritual Magic* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1949; rpt Cambridge: 1979 and University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1998), PART II, CHAPTER VI, § (a) *The Magic Crystal* (pp. 258-281).
- Clulee, Nicholas H. "John Dee's Mathematics and the Grading of Compound Qualities," in *Ambix: The Journal of the Society for the History of Alchemy and Chemistry*, vol. XVIII (Cambridge, 1971); reprinted in *Alchemy and Early Modern Chemistry* (cited immediately above).
- Walton's earlier piece, "John Dee's *Monas Hieroglyphica*: Geometrical Cabala," in *Ambix: The Journal of the Society for the History of Alchemy and Chemistry*, vol. XXIII (Cambridge, 1976); reprinted in *Alchemy and Early Modern Chemistry: Papers from Ambix*, ed. Allen G. Debus (Huddersfield: Jeremy Mills Publishing, 2004).
- Walton's article on Dee and Fludd, "Hermetic Cabala and the *Monas Hieroglyphica* and the Mosaical Philosophy," online at ONG'S HAT: THE INCUNABULA PAPERS > GREYLODGE > *Grey Lodge Occult Review*, Issue #9 / ESSENTIA, vol. 2 (Summer 1981), at <http://www.incunabula.org/greylodge/Grey%20Lodge%20Occult%20Review%20Vol%20I%20Issue%20IX.pdf> [DEFUNCT LINK – 02/01/2015]
- Clulee's "At the Crossroads of Magic and Science: John Dee's Archemastrie" and Mordechai Feingold's "Occult Tradition in the English Universities of the Renaissance: A Reassessment," in *Occult & Scientific Mentalities in the Renaissance*, ed. Brian Vickers (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984).
- Clulee's "Astrology, Magic, and Optics: Facets of John Dee's Natural Philosophy" and Samuel Clyde McCulloch's "John Dee: Elizabethan Doctor of Science and Magic," both of which are in *Articles on Witchcraft* 11 (New York – London: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1992).
- Walton, Michael T. and Walton, Phyllis J. "The Geometrical Kabbalahs of John Dee and Johannes Kepler: The Hebrew Tradition and the Mathematical Study of Nature," in *Experiencing Nature: Proceedings of a Conference in Honor of Allen G. Debus*, eds. Paul H. Theerman and Karen Hunger Parshall (Dordrecht – Boston: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1997).
- Szulakowska, Urszula. "John Dee's Alchemy of Light: the *Monas Hieroglyphica* and the Cabbalah" and "John Dee's Conceptual Architecture and 'Zographie' in an Alchemical Context," which are CHAPTERS FIVE and SIX of Szulakowska's *Alchemy of Light: Geometry and Optics in Late Renaissance Alchemical Illustration* [SYMBOLA ET EMBLEMATA – *Studies in Renaissance and Baroque Symbolism*, VOLUME X] (Leiden: Brill, 2000).
- Clulee's "*Astronomia inferior*: Legacies of Johannes Trithemius and John Dee," in *Secrets of Nature: Astrology and Alchemy in Early Modern Europe*, eds. William R. Newman and Anthony Grafton. (Cambridge: The MIT Press, 2006).
- CHAPTER 3 of Christopher Lehrich's *Occult Mind* (Ithaca – London: Cornell University Press, 2007) discusses Dee's *Monas Hieroglyphica*.
- Sledge, James Justin. "Between *Loagaeth* and *Cosening*: Towards and Etiology of Jonh Dee's Dairies," in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, VOLUME 10, NUMBER 1 (Leiden: Brill Academic Publishers, 2010).
- Clucas, Stephen. "Pythagorean Number Symbolism, Alchemy, and the *Disciplina Noua* of John Dee's *Monas Hieroglyphica*," in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, VOLUME 10, NUMBER 2 (Leiden: Brill Academic Publishers, 2010).
- von Stuckrad, Kocku. "Scientific Encounters" = CHAPTER SEVEN of *Locations of Knowledge in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Esoteric Discourse and Western Identities* [BRILL'S STUDIES IN INTELLECTUAL HISTORY 186] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2010).
- Clucas' "False Illuding Spirits & Cownterfeiting Deuills: John Dee's Angelic Conversations and Religious Anxiety," in *Conversations with Angels: Essays Towards a History of Spiritual Communication, 1100-1700*, ed. Joad Raymond (Hampshire – New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011).
- Perry, Glyn. "John Dee," in *The Occult World*, ed. Christopher Partridge (Abingdon: Routledge, 2015), pp. 107-116.

One source looming behind many of the published works on Dee is I. R. F. Calder's unpublished dissertation, *JOHN DEE STUDIED AS AN ENGLISH NEOPLATONIST* (London: University of London,

1952). Fortunately, this work is now available on-line at THE JOHN DEE SOCIETY site at www.johndee.org > click “Calder thesis.” Charlotte Fell Smith’s *John Dee (1527-1608)* (London: Constable & Company Ltd, 1909) is also at this site: click “Charlotte Fell Smith book.” Indeed, quite a bit of material on Dee is available on the Internet at not only THE JOHN DEE SOCIETY but also THE JOHN DEE PUBLICATION PROJECT (for Enochian material in particular) at www.john-dee.org and at TWILIT GROTTTO (selected writings) at www.esotericarchives.com/dee/index.html.

Dozens of books have been written about Enochian magic as derived from Dee’s work with Edward Kelley for the simple reason that the Hermetic Order of the Golden Dawn (see Part 3, below) incorporated a portion of it into their teachings. The Golden Dawn’s manner of Enochia was further developed by Aleister Crowley and subsequent authors and *magickians*, many of whom added elements which are quite alien to Dee’s work even while omitting well-nigh half of his original system. For an accurate impression of Dee and Kelley’s *entire* system, see Donald Tyson’s *Enochian Magic for Beginners* (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications, 1997). The title is misleading: Tyson’s book is a thorough introduction, description, and appraisal.

“Enochian” literature spinning off from the Golden Dawn’s use of Dee material is extensive. Some examples:

- Crowley, Aleister; DuQuette, Lon Milo; and Hyatt, Christopher S. *Enochian World of Aleister Crowley: Enochian Sex Magick* (Scottsdale: New Falcon Publications, 1991).
- Laycock, Donald C. *The Complete Enochian Dictionary: A Dictionary of the Angelic Language as Revealed to Dr. John Dee and Edward Kelley*, preface by Stephen Skinner (York Beach: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1994).
- Schueler, Gerald J. *Enochian Magic: A Practical Manual* (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications: 1985).
- _____. *An Advanced Guide to Enochian Magick* (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications: 1987).
- _____. *Enochian Physics: The Structure of the Magical Universe* (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications: 1985).
- Schueler Gerald and Betty. *The Enochian Tarot: A New System of Divination for a New Age*, with paintings by Sallie Ann Glassman (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications: 1992).
- _____. *Enochian Yoga: Uniting Humanity and Divinity* (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications: 1990).
- _____. *The Enochian Workbook: An Introduction to the Enochian Magical System*, presented in 43 easy lessons (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications: 1993).
- Zalewski, Chris. *Enochian Chess & the Golden Dawn: A Four-Handed Chess Game* (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications: 1994).
- Zalewski, Pat. *Golden Dawn Enochian Magic* (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications: 1990).

Egil Asprem offers full scholarly treatment of the development of Enochian magic in *Arguing with Angels: Enochian Magic & Modern Occulture* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2012).

JEAN BODIN (1530-1596)

Bodin was a more accomplished Hebraist than most around him, including his older contemporary Guillaume Postel. In his works, especially *Colloquium heptaplomeres de rerum sublimium arcanis abditis* (COLLOQUIUM OF THE SEVEN ABOUT THE SECRETS OF THE SUBLIME—1588), Bodin cites a wide range of Jewish sources, including the Talmud, Maimonides, and the *Zohar*. Of the seven fictional discussants of the *Colloquium*, the most prominent—and portrayed as the most learned—is a Jew named Salomon Barcassius, “whose bearing and erudition command general respect and who argues that the religion of Moses, the most ancient, remains superior to all others” (—Frank E. Manuel, *The Broken Staff* [Cambridge – London: Harvard University Press, 1992], p. 55). The “others” are a rich Venetian host, a convert from Catholicism to Islam, a Calvinist, a Lutheran, a skeptic, and a “deist.” The *Colloquium* was put into English by Marion Leathers Kuntz (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1975; rpt. University Park: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008).

Note Kuntz’ articles in her collection, *Venice, Myth and Utopian Thought in the Sixteenth Century: Bodin, Postel and the Virgin of Venice* (full bibliographic details above in § POSTEL):

- “The Home of Coronaeus in Jean Bodin’s *Colloquium*”
- “Structure, Form and Meaning in the *Colloquium Heptaplomeres* of Jean Bodin”
- “Harmony and the Heptaplomeres of Jean Bodin”
- “The Concept of Toleration in the *Colloquium Heptaplomeres* of Jean Bodin”

See also S[hlomo] Pines, “The Jewish Religion after the Destruction of the Temple and State: The Views of Bodin and Spinoza,” in *Studies in Jewish Religious and Intellectual History Presented to Alexander Altmann on the Occasion of His Sixtieth Birthday*, eds. Siegfried Stein and Raphael Loewe ([Tuscaloosa]: Published in Association with The Institute of Jewish Studies, London: University of Alabama Press, 1979), pages 215-234.

Bodin is also known for his rants against witchcraft and his condemnation of Pico and Agrippa “for attempting to use Cabala for transitive magic” (—John S. Mebane, *Renaissance Magic* [Lincoln – London: University of Nebraska Press, 1989], p. 97). Refer to Yates’ *Occult Philosophy*, pp. 67-71, and Bodin’s tract *On the Demon-Mania of Witches* (*De la démonomanie des sorciers*—1580) translated by Randy A. Scott, with an introduction by Jonathan L. Pearl (Toronto: Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies, 1995).

P. G. Maxwell-Stuart’s *Occult in Early Modern Europe: A Documentary History* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1998) contains a handful of passages from Bodin: “on forms of divination,” *Demonomaniae magorum* (1581, clearly the Latin of the above mentioned *Demon-Mania*), pp. 30-31; “spirits are innumerable,” *Colloquium...* (1596), p. 41; “the stars and geography,” *Methodus Historica* (1576), pp. 94-95; “definition of a magician,” *Demonomaniae magorum*, p. 122; “on the extraordinary possibilities of Kabbalistic interpretation,” *Demonomaniae magorum*, pp. 147-148; “witches cannot fly through the air,” *Colloquium...*, pp. 177-178.

GIORDANO BRUNO (1548-1600)

According to Frances Yates, Bruno's *cabala* was derived primarily from Agrippa and remained rather dilute, being far less important to Bruno than his "Egyptianism" (see above: § SOME HISTORIANS: FRANCES YATES • *Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition*).

In his *Cabala del Cavallo Pegaseo* he appears to be totally rejecting Cabala for his purely Egyptian insights, an attitude which accords with his highly unorthodox view of the history of *prisca theologia*, or *prisca magia*, in which, according to him, the Egyptians are not only earliest but best, and the Jews and Christians later and worse. (—*Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition*, p. 257)

Compare Yates' conclusions about Bruno with those in *Giordano Bruno and the Kabbalah: Prophets, Magicians, and Rabbis* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997) by Karen Silvia de Leon-Jones, who contends that Bruno's knowledge and development of the *kabbalah* were far more extensive than Yates suggests. In de Leon-Jones' words,

Bruno does not merely present or discuss the *kabbalah*, he transforms it, manipulates it, makes it his own, does it. (—*Giordano Bruno and the Kabbalah*, p. 5)

Note, however, the objections of David Harari in "Was the Author of *Cabala del Cavallo Pegaseo* a Kabbalist?" (in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume 4, eds. Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam, Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 1999). Responding to de Leon-Jones' *Giordano Bruno and the Kabbalah*, Harari suggests that Leone Ebreo was the author of *Cabala del cavallo pegaseo*, not Bruno, thus pulling the rug (*i.e.*, the star textual witness) out from under de Leon-Jones' thesis. (On Leone Ebreo, see ADDENDUM D: THE PROBLEM OF LEONE EBREO'S *DIALOGHI*.)

The text in question, *Cabala del cavallo pegaseo* (THE CABALA OF PEGASUS)—attributed to Bruno—has been translated and annotated by Sidney L. Sondergard and Madison U. Sowell (New Haven – London: Yale University Press, 2002): "The Brunist persona Saulino lectures on the Sefirot early in the first dialogue of the *Cabala*...a kabbalistic system derived primarily from Cornelius Agrippa's *De occulta philosophia*..." (—p. xxx).

Another Bruno dialogue has been put into English: *The Expulsion of the Triumphant Beast*, translated and with an introduction by Arthur D. Imerti, foreword by Karen Silvia de Leon-Jones (Lincoln – London: University of Nebraska Press, 2004).

Also look for Bruno's

- *CAUSE, PRINCIPLE AND UNITY and Essays on Magic*, eds. Richard J. Blackwell and Robert de Lucca... [CAMBRIDGE TEXTS IN THE HISTORY OF PHILOSOPHY] (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998).
- *Cantus Circaeus: The Incantation of Circe* TOGETHER WITH *The Judiciary* BEING THE *Art of Memory*, translated by Darius Klein (Seattle: Ouroboros Press, 2009)
- *De Umbris Idearum: On the Shadows of Ideas & The Art of Memory*, translated and introduced by Scott Gosnell (History in Thought Series, Volume I) (Huginn, Munnin & Co., Publishers/CreateSpace, 2013).
- *On the Infinite, the Universe and the Worlds: Five Cosmological Dialogues* (GIORDANO BRUNO COLLECTED WORKS—History in Thought Series, Volume II), translation and introduction by Scott Gosnell (Huginn, Munnin & Co., Publishers/CreateSpace, 2014).
- *Four Works on Lull: On the Compendious Architecture of Ramon Lull, Lullian Lamps, Scrutiny of the Subjects, Animadversions*, translation and introduction by Scott Gosnell (GIORDANO BRUNO COLLECTED WORKS—Volume III) (Huginn, Munnin & Co., Publishers/CreateSpace, 2015).

Further see (listed chronologically)

- Bruno, Giordano. *The Heroic Enthusiasts (Gli eroici furori): An Ethical Poem*, Part the First, translated by L. Williams, with an introduction, compiled chiefly from David Levi's "Giordano Bruno, o La religione del persiero" (vol. 1 – London: G. Redway, 1887-1889; vol. 2 – London: B. Quaritch, 1889).
This title, also translated *The Heroic Frenzies*, can be found at Joseph Peterson's ESOTERIC ARCHIVES, at <http://www.esotericarchives.com/bruno/home.htm>, along with ten other Bruno works in Latin. Peterson reproduces the translation of Paulo Eugene Memmo, Jr. (1964).
- Greenberg, Sidney. *The Infinite in Giordano Bruno: With a Translation of His Dialogue Concerning the Cause, Principle, and One* (New York: King's Crown Press/Columbia University Press, 1950).
- Singer, Dorothea Waley. *Giordano Bruno: His Life and Thought, with Annotated Translation of His Work*, ON THE INFINITE UNIVERSE AND WORLDS (New York: Henry Schuman, 1950).
- Feingold, Mordechai. "Occult Tradition in the English Universities of the Renaissance: A Reassessment," in *Occult & Scientific Mentalities in the Renaissance*, ed. Brian Vickers (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984).
- Gosslin, Edward A. "Bruno's 'French Connection': A Historiographical Debate," in *Hermeticism and the Renaissance: Intellectual History and the Occult in Early Modern Europe*, eds. Ingrid Merkel and Allen G. Debus (Washington: Folger Books, 1988).
- Bossy, John. *Giordano Bruno and the Embassy Affair* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991; rpt 2002).
- Ordine, Nuccio. *Giordano Bruno and the Philosophy of the Ass*, translated by Henryk Baranski in collaboration with Arielle Sailer (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1996).
- Gatti, Hilary. *Giordano Bruno and Renaissance Science* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1999).
Gatti treats Bruno the scientific thinker and mathematician rather than Bruno the "Hermetic Magus"—the title Frances Yates gave him.
- Rossi, Paolo. "The Imaginative Logic of Giordano Bruno" = CHAPTER 4 of *Logic and the Art of Memory: The Quest for a Universal Language*, translated and with an introduction by Stephen Clucas (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000).
- Gatti, Hilary. "The Natural Philosophy of Giordano Bruno," in *Midwest Studies in Philosophy*, Volume XXVI: RENAISSANCE AND EARLY MODERN PHILOSOPHY, eds. Peter A. French and Howard K. Wettstein (Boston – London: Blackwell Publishing, 2002), pp. 111-123.
- White, Michael. *The Pope and the Heretic: The True Story of Giordano Bruno, the Man Who Dared to Defy the Roman Inquisition* (New York: William Morrow, 2002; rpt Toronto: Perennial [HarperCollins], 2003).
- Ciliberto, Michael. "Bruno, Giordano (Filippo)," in *Dictionary of Gnosis & Western Esotericism*, Volume 1, edited by Wouter J. Hanegraaff *et al.* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2005), pp. 206-213.
- Leirich, Christopher. *Occult Mind: Magic in Theory and Practice* (Ithaca – London: Cornell University Press, 2007), pages 25-47 and 84-91.
- Zambelli, Paola. "Bruno as a Reader of Prohibited Books" = PART III of *White Magic, Black Magic in the European Renaissance: From Ficino, Pico, Della Porta to Trithemius, Agrippa, Bruno* [STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE TRADITIONS, VOLUME CXXV] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007).
- Hanegraaff, Wouter J. "Under the Mantle of Love: The Mystical Eroticism of Marsilio Ficino and Giordano Bruno," in *Hidden Intercourse: Eros and sexuality in the History of Western Esotericism*, edited by Wouter j. Hanegraaff and Jeffrey J. Kripal (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2008), pages 175-207.
- Rowland, Ingrid. *Giordano Bruno: Philosopher/Heretic* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2008).
"In its multiple worlds, its combinations of Hebrew letters, and its interconnections, in addition to its affinities with the Neoplatonic interplay of darkness and light, Kabbalah bore an uncannily close relationship to the way of thinking that Giordano Bruno came to identify as the Nolan philosophy. Bruno's was certainly not a Christian Kabbalah; if anything it was more identifiably Jewish. Neither alternative would find any approval within the walls of San Domenico. As a student, Bruno restricted his energies to a less dangerous pursuit: the material exercise known as the art of memory." (—Rowland, *Giordano Bruno*, p. 61).
- Gatti, Hilary. *Essays on Giordano Bruno* (Princeton – Woodstock: Princeton University Press, 2011).

SHAKESPEARE (1564-1616)

Quite a few works discuss the occult in Shakespeare, for example,

- Frances Yates' *Occult Philosophy...*, CHAPTER XII, "Shakespeare and the Christian Cabala: Francesco Giorgi and *The Merchant of Venice*";
- Yates' *The Theatre of the World*, as mentioned above
- John S. Mebane's chapter "Magic as Love and Faith: Shakespeare's *The Tempest*," in *Renaissance Magic & the Return of the Golden Age: The Occult Tradition & Marlowe, Jonson, & Shakespeare* (Lincoln – London: University of Nebraska Press, 1989);
- the extensive treatment of Arthur Versluis in *Shakespeare the Magus* (St. Paul: Grail Publishing, 2001).

Two writers have given Shakespeare's connections with *kabbalah*, or *cabala*, book-length consideration: Daniel Banes and Yona Claire Dureau.

Regarding cabalistic influence upon The Bard of Avon, Banes' *Shakespeare, Shylock and Kabbalah* (Silver Spring: Malcolm House Publications, 1978) begins with a discussion of John Dee and Robert Fludd to establish the existence of *cabala* in England. Banes then goes on to the purpose of his book: "to identify some of the kabbalistic themes in *The Merchant of Venice*, and to relate them to antecedents in the literature of Kabbalah." From Banes' analysis, it would appear that Shakespeare was most indebted to Francesco Giorgi's *De harmonia mundi* (1525) via the French version of it rendered by Guy le Fevre de la Boderie (1578).

Banes' earlier work, *The Provocative Merchant of Venice* (Silver Spring – Chicago: Malcolm House, 1975), begins with a dismissive critique of Charles and Mary Lamb's prose retelling of *The Merchant of Venice* and concludes with his own "vagrant speculations" regarding the dependence of this famous work upon the Kabbalah. Indeed, Banes sets up a variant *tree of life* showing correspondences between the *sefirot* and the play's *dramatis personæ*.

Banes' "commentary" on *The Merchant of Venice* is critiqued by Yates in *Occult Philosophy...*, CHAPTER XII.

We will use the chapter titles of Yona Dureau's *Christian Cabbalah Movement in Renaissance England & Its Influence on William Shakespeare* (Lewiston: Edwin Mellen Press, 2009)—with a few notes—to compose our description of her work:

- CHAPTER I. "Favourable Circumstances for the Development of Christian Cabbalah in England"
- CHAPTER II. "Translators of Christian and Jewish Cabbalah and Their Relationship to Writing and Writers"
- CHAPTER III. "The Impossible Quest for Lost Shakespeare"
- CHAPTER IV. "The Metaphysics of Prophecies and Free Will in *Richard III*"
- CHAPTER V. "*Julius Caesar*: Representation of History and the Talmudic Combination of Divine and Human Time"
- "...shows how *Julius Caesar* can be read according to seven levels of spiral time structures..."
(—INTRODUCTION, p. 13)
- CHAPTER VI. "*As You Like It* as a Kabbalist Teaching on the Impact of Sacred Study"
- "...focuses on *As You Like It* and its intertextual connections with Cordovero's manuscript *Or Ne'erah*" (—INTRODUCTION, p. 13). CHAPTER VI opens
- Renaissance Europe bore the print of many trends and influences in the realm of esoteric teachings. It would probably be a comfortable hypothesis for the critic to look for Christian cabalistic elements in Shakespeare's plays, to support and complete the imaginary image of the

playwright established by generations of critics. Yet, just as intellectuals sometimes turned to kabbalah with no clearly defined religious purpose, and probably mostly for primarily intellectual stimulation, Shakespeare's plays display a variety of influences. Some plays nevertheless are definitely more kabbalistical than others, some obviously influenced by the syncretic dimension of Christian Cabbalah. (—p. 197)

CHAPTER VII. “*Antony and Cleopatra* and Christian Cabbalah's Hercules”

CHAPTER VIII. “*Richard II*, the Cabbalistic Loss of the Crown and the Rise of the Antichrist, or the Failure of the Way of Milderness and the Forecast of the Way of Severity”

A chapter which is summarized in Dureau's INTRODUCTION (—p. 13), which “offers a reading of *Twelfth Night* in view of Christian Cabbalah's theory of death by the divine kiss,” is missing from the book. Indeed, content descriptions in the INTRODUCTION conflate CHAPTERS IV and V and incorrectly number the chapters thereafter—fleeting indications of the pervasive messiness of this otherwise intriguing book.

JOHANNES BUREUS (1568-1652)

“Scandinavia was the land of the Hyperboreans who had migrated to the Baltic shores before the fall of the Tower of Babel and who therefore possessed the original, uncorrupted culture and spirituality of mankind,” recounts Susanna Åkerman (—“The Gothic Kabbala: Johannes Bureus, Runic Theosophy, and Northern European Apocalypticism,” in *The Expulsion of the Jews: 1492 and After*, eds. Raymond B. Waddington and Arthur H. Williamson, New York – London: Garland Publishing, 1994; p. 177). “The most striking of the theorists of the new Baltic imperium was Johannes Bureus” (p. 178).

Bureus “is the most important non-Jewish Swedish Kabbalist. In Bureus’s work older Gothism along with runic and linguistic research blended with his strong interest in all forms of esotericism: astrology, magic, alchemy, and above all the Kabbalah” (—Thomas Karlsson, “Kabbalah in Sweden,” in *Western Esotericism, Based on Papers Read at the Symposium on Western Esotericism Held at Åbo, Finland, on 15-17 August 2007*, ed. Tore Ahlbäck [SCRIPTA INSTITUTI DONNERIANI ABOENSIS XX], Åbo/Turku: Donner Institute in Religious and Cultural History, 2008; p. 88).

Further on Bureus, see Åkerman’s *Rose Cross over the Baltic: The Spread of Rosicrucianism in Northern Europe* (Leiden-Boston-Köln: Brill, 1998) and Stephen E. Flowers’ *Johannes Bureus and Adalruna, Being a Study toward the Delineation of the Historical Movement toward the Northern Dawn*, Vol. I (Smithville: Rûna-Raven Press, 1998).

ROBERT FLUDD (1574-1637)

The *cabala* of Robert Fludd is a mixture of all sorts of stuff. Fludd did, however, expound upon the *sefirot* and the Hebrew letters in the second book of *Summum Bonum* and charted their correspondences with the planets and holy names in *The Mosaicall Philosophy*. Cabalistic material appears as well in *Utriusque cosmi...historia*. Interestingly, while Fludd claimed Menahem Recanati as his kabbalistic authority, his sources were more apparently Pico (who, in fact, drew extensively, albeit selectively, from Recanati), Reuchlin, and Agrippa.

Out of print and difficult to find these days is Adam McLean's edition of *The Mosaicall Philosophy: The Cabala of Robert Fludd* [MAGNUM OPUS HERMETIC SOURCEWORKS #2] (London: The Hermetic Research Trust, 1979), which reproduces Books 1 and 2 of the second section. Fortunately, the 1659 edition of *The Mosaicall Philosophy* has been reprinted—in full—by Kessinger Publishing Company (2003); *cabala* is given its most direct treatment in the second section: Book 2, starting at CHAP. II, p. 171ff of the 1659 (= Kessinger) edition.

Mosaicall Philosophy is discussed in the seventeenth chapter of J. B. Craven's *Dr. Robert Fludd: The English Rosicrucian, Life and Writings* (listed below). Abridged versions of Fludd's preface to *Mosaicall Philosophy* and its chapter summaries are given in CHAPTER 8 of William H. Huffman's *Robert Fludd: Essential Readings* (London: Aquarian/Thorsons, 1992).

See further my description of *The Mosaicall Philosophy* in ADDENDUM B of the present work: SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY PRINTED WORKS ON CHRISTIAN CABALA IN ENGLISH (at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>), pp. 125-126.

Along with Craven's treatment of *Utriusque cosmi...historia* (in *Dr. Robert Fludd...*, CHAPTERS 9 through 13), sections of this work have been put into English:

- *Origin and Structure of the Cosmos*, text translated by Patricia Tahil, with an introduction by Adam McLean. (Edinburgh: Magnum Opus Hermetic Sourceworks, No. 13, 1982) = *Utriusque cosmi historia*, VOLUME I, TRACTATE 1, Books One and Two.
- *On the Divine Numbers and Divine Harmony*, translated by Charles Rainsford, with an introduction by Adam McLean (Glasgow: Magnum Opus Hermetic Sourceworks, No. 24, 1997) = *Utriusque cosmi historia*, VOLUME II, TRACTATE 1, Books One and Two.

Utriusque cosmi...historia, VOLUME I, TRACTATE 1, Book 1 (CHAPTERS 1, 4, 6-7, 9-10) and Book 2 (CONTENTS, CHAPTERS 1, 3-4, 6-8, 10, and 15) are given in Huffman's *Robert Fludd: Essential Readings* (noted above). Alas, Fludd's most concentrated treatment of *cabala* within *Utriusque cosmic...historia* resides in VOLUME II, TRACTATE II, has not yet, to the best of my knowledge, been put into English. See Craven's CHAPTERS 11-13 and Wilhelm Schmidt-Biggemann's "Robert Fludd's Kabbalistic Cosmos" (listed immediately below).

On or by Fludd (listed chronologically):

- the antique but adequate *Dr. Robert Fludd: The English Rosicrucian, Life and Writings*, by J. B. Craven (Kirkwall: 1902; rpt. Kila: Kessinger Publications, n.d.)
- Frances Yates' works, especially *Art of Memory* and *Theatre of the World*.
- Josten, C. H. "Robert Fludd's 'Philosophicall Key' and His Alchemical Experiment on Wheat," in *Ambix: The Journal of the Society for the History of Alchemy and Chemistry*, vol. XI (Cambridge, 1963); reprinted in *Alchemy and Early Modern Chemistry* (ed. Allen G. Debus—cited above).
- Fludd's writing, "The Rosicrucian Brotherhood," which is Book IV of *Summum Bonum*, in Paul M. Allen (ed.), *A Christian Rosenkreutz Anthology* (Blauvelt: Rudolf Steiner Publications, 1968 and 2000), pp. 293-323.

- *Robert Fludd and His Philosophicall Key: being a transcription of the manuscript at Trinity College, Cambridge*, with an introduction by Allen G. Debus (New York: History Publications, 1979; and Sagamore Beach: Watson Publishing International, 1979).
Debus includes a full BIBLIOGRAPHICAL ESSAY covering scholarship on Fludd to 1979.
- Godwin, Joscelyn. *Robert Fludd: Hermetic Philosopher and Surveyor of Two Worlds* (London: Thames & Hudson Ltd, 1979).
- Walton, Michael T. “Hermetic Cabala and the Monas Hieroglyphica and the Mosaicall Philosophy,” (on Dee and Fludd), in *Grey Lodge Occult Review*, Issue #9 / ESSENTIA, Volume 2 (Summer 1981), online at http://www.greyloodge.org/occultreview/glor_009/hermetic_cabala.htm [defunct link - 12/12/2015]
- Westman, Robert S. “Nature, Art and Psyche: Jung, Pauli, and the Kepler-Fludd Polemic,” in *Occult & Scientific Mentalities in the Renaissance*, ed. Brian Vickers (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984).
- Huffman, William H. *Robert Fludd and the End of the Renaissance* (London – New York: Routledge, 1988)
- Szulakowska, Urszula. “Robert Fludd: The Divine Alchemy of the Eye of God,” in *Alchemy of Light: Geometry and Optics in Late Renaissance Alchemical Illustration* [SYMBOLA ET EMBLEMATA – *Studies in Renaissance and Baroque Symbolism*, VOLUME X] (Leiden: Brill, 2000).
- Schmidt-Biggemann, Wilhelm. “Robert Fludd’s Kabbalistic Cosmos,” in *Platonism at the Origins of Modernity: Studies on Platonism and Early Modern Philosophy*, eds. Douglas Hedley and Sarah Hutton [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 196]. (Dordrecht: Springer, 2008)
This article discusses the cabalistic content of *Utriusque Cosmi historia II: Tomi Secundi Tractatus secundus, Sectio prima: De Theosophico, Cabalistico et Physiologico utriusque mundi discursu* (Frankfort: 1621).
- Janacek, Bruce. “Robert Fludd, Natural Theology, and the Alchemical Debate of 1623” = CHAPTER 2 of *Alchemical Belief: Occultism in the Religious Culture of Early Modern England* (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2011).

Also find at THE ALCHEMY WEBSITE:

- “Titlepages to Robert Fludd’s Books” at www.alchemywebsite.com/fluddtit.html
- articles on Fludd by Ron Heisler and Sharon M. W. → SCHOLARLY ARTICLES ON ALCHEMY at http://www.alchemywebsite.com/articles_scholarly_individuals.html.

JACOB BÖHME (1575-1624)

My ADDENDUM D: THE PROBLEM OF LEONE EBREO'S *DLALOGHI* sets out an array of quotes from books and articles on Leone and his work which, on many points, contradict each other. A similar compilation could be arranged regarding Böhme and his connections to *kabbalah*. To illustrate, Gershom Scholem notes, "...students (as well as opponents) of Jacob Boehme had discovered the inner affinity between his own theosophical system and that of the Kabbalah, though there would seem to be no historical connection between them. In certain circles, particularly in Germany, Holland, and England, Christian Kabbalah henceforward assumed a Boehmian guise" (—*Kabbalah*, p. 200).

Yet, we read,

Of those learn'd men that convers'd with [Böhme] in the greatest familiarity was one Balthasar Walther ... an apparent expert in kabbalistic tracts... who had poisoned Böhme's pious Lutheran thoughts with its teachings.

Such is the assessment of the mid-seventeenth-century editor of Böhme's works ["Toruń edition," 1652-1674], cited by Leigh T. I. Penman in "A Second Christian Rosenkreuz? Jakob Böhme's Disciple Balthasar Walther (1558-c.1630) and the Kabbalah, with a Bibliography of Walther's Printed Works" (in *Western Esotericism, Based on Papers Read at the Symposium on Western Esotericism Held at Åbo, Finland, on 15-17 August 2007*, ed. Tore Ahlbäck [SCRIPTA INSTITUTUM DONNERIANI ABOENSIS XX], Åbo/Turku: Donner Institute in Religious and Cultural History, 2008).

With Böhme's "curious assertion concerning the globe [as opposed to *tablets*—DK] of the covenant," T. I. Penman shows a bridge from Reuchlin (*De arte cabalistica*) via Walther to Böhme, who "could not speak Latin, let alone Hebrew, and therefore could have had no direct access to Reuchlin or his sources." (All quotes are from Penman's article. See XL. *Questions concerning the soule : propounded by Dr. Balthasar Walter, and answered by Jacob Behmen...*, London: Matth. Simmons..., 1647).

Here is a trim selection of sources on Böhme biased toward our focus on *kabbalah/cabala*:

- Benz, Ernst. "The Cabalistic Sources of the Romantic Philosophy of Nature" = CHAPTER IV of *The Mystical Sources of German Romantic Philosophy* (= *Les Sources Mystiques de la Philosophie Romantique Allemande*), translated by Blair R. Reynolds and Eunice M. Paul [PITTSBURG THEOLOGICAL MONOGRAPHS, New Series, 6] (Allison Park: Pickwick Publications, 1983).
The sources outlined are the Spanish *conversos*, Lull, Pico, and Reuchlin. The philosophical recipients include Oetinger, Böhme, Saint-Martin (via Böhme), and Schelling (via Oetinger).
- Deghaye, Pierre. "Jacob Boehme and His Followers," in *Modern Esoteric Spirituality*, eds. Antoine Faivre and Jacob Needleman [*Volume 21 of WORLD SPIRITUALITY: AN ENCYCLOPEDIA OF THE RELIGIOUS QUEST*] (New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1995).
- Gibbons, B. J. *Gender in Mystical and Occult Thought: Behmenism and its Development in England* [CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN EARLY MODERN BRITISH HISTORY]. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996; paperback rpt 2002.
"One of the more important sources of Behmenist thought on gender is to be found in the Jewish mystical tradition." (p. 69)
- Jones, Rufus M. *Spiritual Reformers in the 16th and 17th Centuries* (London: Macmillan and Co., 1914; rpt. Boston: Beacon Press, 1959).
Jones treats Böhme in CHAPTERS IX, X, XI, and XII.
- O'Regan, Cyril. *Gnostic Apocalypse: Jacob Boehme's Haunted Narrative* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2002).
See especially CHAPTER 9, "Kabbalah in Boehme's Discourse and its Valentinian Enlisting." O'Regan concludes—in so many words—that Böhme was more *kabbalah*-like than genuinely kabbalistic.

- Schmidt-Biggemann, Wilhelm. § 6. CHRISTIAN CABALAH II: JAKOB BÖHME'S DOCTRINE OF QUALITIES, and § 14. JAKOB BÖHME'S THEOLOGY OF CREATION in *Philosophia Perennis* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 189] (Dordrecht: Springer, 2004); pp. 117-128 and 187-192.

Perhaps the best works on Böhme and his descendents, *e.g.*, John Pordage, Johann Georg Gichtel, Friedrich Christoph Oetenger (on Oetenger, see below), are Arthur Versluis' companion volumes, *Wisdom's Children: A Christian Esoteric Tradition* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1999) and *Wisdom's Book: The Sophia Anthology* (St. Paul: Paragon House, 2000).

ATHANASIUS KIRCHER (1601-1680)

Athanasius Kircher is described by Frances Yates as “a most notable descendant of the Hermetic-Cabalist tradition founded by Pico.” She also points out that “Kircher maintained the full Renaissance attitude to Hermes Trismegistus, completely ignoring Casaubon.” (Yates makes similar comments about Robert Fludd.)

It was Isaac Casaubon who, in 1614, through careful and thorough scholarship, showed that the *Hermetica* were “not the work of very ancient Egyptian priests but written in post-Christian times.” Kircher maintained similar erroneous attitudes toward *cabala* and Hebraica. See Yates’ discussion in *Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition* (pp. 416-423).

There are five illustrated works on Kircher:

- Godwin, Joscelyn. *Athanasius Kircher: A Renaissance Man in Search of Lost Knowledge* (New York: Thames & Hudson, 1979).
The ubiquitous large paperback.
- *Athanasius Kircher (1602-1680): Jesuit Scholar. An Exhibition of His Works in the Harold B. Lee Library at Brigham Young University*, introduction and descriptions by Brian Merrill, which was originally published by The Friends of the Brigham Young University Library (Provo: 1989), and more recently reprinted by Martino Publishing (Mansfield Centre: 2003).
- Rowland, Ingrid D. *Ecstatic Journey: Athanasius Kircher in Baroque Rome* (Chicago: University of Chicago Library, 2000)
An exhibition catalogue of “Kircher’s amazing world of magic lanterns, volcanoes, fossils, flying cats, hieroglyphics, and practical jokes with the most serious of intentions.” Also find Rowland’s article, “Athanasius Kircher and the Egyptian Oedipus” (2004) at the University of Chicago’s FATHOM ARCHIVE, online at <http://fathom.lib.uchicago.edu/content.shtml>.
- *The Great Art of Knowing: The Baroque Encyclopedia of Athanasius Kircher*, ed. Daniel Stolzenberg (Stanford: Stanford University Libraries, 2001)
A series of articles which serves as an exhibition catalogue to and celebration of Stanford’s 1998 acquisition of all but one of Kircher’s works in first editions. In connection with this, online see THE ATHANASIUS KIRCHER PROJECT AT STANFORD UNIVERSITY at <http://kircher.stanford.edu/>.
- Godwin, Joscelyn. *Athanasius Kircher’s Theatre of the World: The Life and Work of the Last Man to Search for Universal Knowledge* (Rochester [VT]: Inner Traditions, 2009)
A grand summary of previous studies on Kircher housed in a generously illustrated over-sized book. One is tempted here to resort to the old reviewer’s cliché, “If you buy one book on...”

The Vulcanos: OR, Burning and Fire-vomiting Mountains Famous in the World (1669), which offers material “collected for the most part out of Kircher’s *Subterraneous World*,” has been reprinted by Kessinger Publishing (2009).

“[T]he long awaited masterwork on the great polymathic German Jesuit of the seventeenth century” has been published: *A Study of the Life and Works of Athanasius Kircher, ‘Germanus Incredibilis’* by John Edward Fletcher (1940-1992), with a selection of Kircher’s unpublished correspondence and an annotated translation of his autobiography, edited for publication by Elizabeth Fletcher [ARIES BOOK SERIES 12] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2011).

Recent essays on Kircher are collected in *Athanasius Kircher: The Last Man Who Knew Everything*, ed. Paula Findlen (New York – London: Routledge, 2004). See especially “Four Trees, Some Amulets, and the Seventy-two Names: Kircher Reveals the Kabbalah” by Daniel Stolzenberg. Also, refer to Stolzenberg’s *Egyptian Oedipus: Athanasius Kircher and the Secrets of Antiquity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013—a revision of Stolzenberg’s Ph.D. dissertation, EGYPTIAN OEDIPUS:

ANTIQUARIANISM, ORIENTAL STUDIES AND OCCULT PHILOSOPHY ON THE WORK OF ATHANASIUS KIRCHER [Stanford University, 2004]), especially pp. 162-174 on Kircher's treatment of *kabbalah*.

There is also the entertaining "popular biography" of Kircher by John Glassie, *A Man of Misconceptions: The Life of an Eccentric in an Age of Change* (New York: Riverhead Books, 2012).

Kircher is discussed at some length in Umberto Eco's *Search for the Perfect Language* (Oxford – Cambridge: Blackwell Publishers, 1995) and Eco's *Serendipities: Language and Lunacy* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1998) in the third essay, "From Marco Polo to Leibniz: Stories of Intellectual Misunderstandings."

Make sure to read through Christopher Leirich's *Occult Mind: Magic in Theory and Practice* (Ithaca – London: Cornell University Press, 2007), in particular pages 91-131.

See also

- Åkerman, Susanna. "Queen Christina's Esoteric Interests as a Background to Her Platonic Academies," in *Western Esotericism, Based on Papers Read at the Symposium on Western Esotericism Held at Åbo, Finland, on 15-17 August 2007*, ed. Tore Ahlbäck [SCRIPTA INSTITUTUM DONNERIANI ABOENSIS XX] (Åbo/Turku: Donner Institute in Religious and Cultural History, 2008): § THE JESUIT MISSION IN STOCKHOLM AND ATHANASIUS KIRCHER, pp. 22-3
- Veltri, Giuseppe. "Mathematical and Biblical Exegesis: Jewish Sources of Athanasius Kircher's Musical Theory" = CHAPTER SIX of *Renaissance Philosophy in Jewish Garb: Foundations and Challenges in Judaism on the Eve of Modernity* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009)
- Godwin, Joscelyn. "Athanasius Kircher's Construction of the Hieroglyphic Tradition," in *Constructing Tradition: Means and Myths of Transmission in Western Esotericism*, ed. Andreas B. Kilcher (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2010)
- Rowland, Ingrid D. "Athanasius Kircher's Guardian Angel," in *Conversations with Angels: Essays Towards a History of Spiritual Communication, 1100-1700*, ed. Joad Raymond (Hampshire – New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011)
- Pieczyński, Maciej. "Ars Combinatoria as a Poetics: On the Presence of Combinatorial Structures in the Late-Baroque Artificial Poetry," in *Poesis Artificiosa: Between Theory and Practice*, eds. Agnieszka Borysowska and Barbara Milewska-Ważbińska (Frankfurt am Main: PL Academic Research/Peter Lang GmGH, 2013), pp. 193-206.

In ADDENDUM A: ITEMS OF INTEREST, find "Ennemoser" and "Thorndike."

Two items at Mats Rendel's Homepage <http://www.phonurgia.se/rendel/> treat Kircher: "Athanasius Kircher" (biography, translations) and "Kircherianum Virtuale," an extensive index of web links. One site not listed by Rendel is the attractive MUSEUM OF JURASIC TECHNOLOGY, which has a series of articles on Kircher's life and works in "Collections and Exhibitions, Gallery 6": <http://www.mjt.org/exhibits/kircher/Knots.html>.

JOHN MILTON (1608-1674)

If Shakespeare and, as we shall see below, Blake can be dragged into our cabalistic procession, then Milton too must be considered. Milton's cabalism has certainly been a matter of pointed debate.

In *Milton: Man and Thinker* (New York: The Dial Press, 1925; rpt 1935), Denis Saurat begins § II, "Contemporary Sources and Influences,"

Milton's relationship to movements of his own time may be summed up thus: roughly speaking, the whole of Milton's philosophy is found in the Kabbalah, except his materialism; his materialism is found in Fludd, except his mortalism; and his mortalism is connected with ideas of the contemporary English Mortalist group. The three stages are connected and form developments, one from the other: Fludd starts from the Kabbalah, and the Mortalists have their general principles in common with Fludd, and probably derived them from him. (*Milton*—p. 280)

Countering Saurat is Marjorie H. Nicolson's "Milton and the *Conjectura Cabbalistica*," in *Philological Quarterly*, vol. 1, no. 1 (January 1927), and R. J. Zwi Werblowsky's article, also titled "Milton and the *Conjectura Cabbalistica*," in *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, Vol. XVIII, Nos. 1-2 (London: The Warburg Institute, 1955). Werblowsky concludes his opening paragraph, "The ill-fated 'Milton and the Zohar' theory [of Denis Saurat] may ... at least have the merit of serving as a warning example" (—p. 90). Alas, Saurat fell prey to the distorted French translation of the *Zohar* by Jean de Pauly: *Sepher ha-Zohar (Le Livre de la Zohar)*, 6 volumes (Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1906-11).

See also Werblowski's article, "O Felix Culpa: A Cabbalistic Version," in *Studies in Jewish Religious and Intellectual History Presented to Alexander Altmann on the Occasion of His Sixtieth Birthday*, eds. Siegfried Stein and Raphael Loewe ([Tuscaloosa]: Published in Association with The Institute of Jewish Studies, London: University of Alabama Press, 1979), pages 355-362.

On the other hand, Joseph L. Blau and Frances Yates concurred with Saurat that Milton bears an unmistakable kabbalistic stamp. See Blau, "The Diffusion of the Christian Interpretation of the Cabala in English Literature," in *The Review of Religion*, Vol. VI, No. 2 (1942), and Frances Yates' *Occult Philosophy in the Elizabethan Age* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1979 and 2001; rpt. London: Ark Paperbacks, 1983), CHAPTER XVII: "The Occult Philosophy and Puritanism: John Milton." Michael Lieb writes,

Although Blau sees Milton in the kabbalistic line, he does not view Milton as a "kabbalist." Whereas Yates accords Milton more of a kabbalistic bent than does Blau, she is generally inclined to agree (Blau, "Diffusion," pp. 163- 65, Yates, *Occult Philosophy*, pp. 177- 81).

—"Encoding the Occult: Milton and the Traditions of *Merkabah* Speculation in the Renaissance," in *Milton Studies*, Volume 37 (University of Pittsburg Press, 1999), n. 51.

Refer to Philip Beitchman's collection, *The View from Nowhere: Essays in Literature, Mysticism, and Philosophy* (Lanham – New York – Oxford: University Press of America, 2001), in particular CHAPTER 1, "Milton and Cabala Reconsidered," where, in the opening sections, Beitchman reviews Saurat vs Werblowski. Excerpts of *The View from Nowhere*, i.e., §§ SATAN'S TRUTH, THE PART OF EVIL, and FOLLOWING LUCIFER from the midst of "Milton and Cabala Reconsidered," are online as "Following Lucifer: Miltonic Evil as Gnostic Cabala," at *Esoterica: The Journal of Esoteric Studies*, Volume I, ed. Arthur Versluis (East Lansing: Michigan State University, 1999), www.esoteric.msu.edu/Beitchman.html (pp. 61-78).

Note also J. H. Adamson's study "The War in Heaven: Milton's Version of the *Merkabah*," in *Journal*

of *English and Germanic Philology*, volume LVII (Urbana: University of Illinois, October 1958), reprinted as “The War in Heaven: The *Merkabah*” in *Bright Essence: Studies in Milton’s Theology*, eds. William Bridges Hunter, C. A. Patrides, and Jack H. Adamson (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1971), AND Eve Keller’s “Tetragrammic Numbers: Gematria and the Line Total of the 1674 *Paradise Lost*,” in *Milton Quarterly*, Volume 20, Issue 1 (Athens: Department of English, Ohio University, 1986).

ANTONIA OF WÜRTMBERG (1613-1679)

Antonia of Würtemberg was “a learned expert of historical and genealogical sciences. The particular inclination of Princess Antonia, however, was applied to theology, and in particular to the Kabbalah” (—Ernst Benz, *Christian Kabbalah* [St. Paul: Grailstone Press, 2004], p. 60).

Antonia is noted for having commissioned and donated a “Kabbalistic-Alchemical Alterpiece in a small church in the town of Bad Teinach near Cawl in Germany” (—Adam McLean, “The Kabbalistic-Alchemical Alterpiece in Bad Teinach,” in *Hermetic Journal* 12 [Edinburgh: Summer 1981], pp. 21-26. The image can also be viewed online at McLean’s ALCHEMY WEBSITE: http://www.alchemywebsite.com/bad_teinach.html).

The central panel of the alterpiece is a painting by Johann Friedrich Gruber entitled *Turris Antonia* (TOWER OF ANTONIA) which “represents pictorially the secret, hermetic, cabalistic road to ‘initiation’ and spiritual advancement of the self within the Christian framework” (—Lu Ann De Cunzo, Therese O’Malley, Michael J. Lewis, George E. Thomas, and Christina Wilmanns-Wells, “Father Rapp’s Garden at Economy: Harmony Society Culture in Microcosm,” in *Landscape Archaeology*, eds. Rebecca Yamin and Karen Bescherer Metheny [Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1996], p. 107).

“[O]ne of Oetinger’s most important works, *Öffentliches Denckmal der Lebtafel* (1763),” is a commentary on Antonia’s kabbalistic painting (—Glenn Alexander Magee, *Hegel and the Hermetic Tradition* [Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2001], p. 65).

“We have already mentioned that Antonia occupied herself with the study of the Cabala: and evidence thereof is even now preserved in the Royal Library at Stuttgart. At that place there is an *Unterschiedlicher Riss zu Sephiroth* (‘Diagrams to the Sephiroth’), containing Cabbalistic diagrams.... These diagrams were drawn by Princess Antonia of Würtemberg, who delighted in Cabbalistic and Rabbinical lore” (—M. Kayserling, “A Princess as Hebraist,” in *The Jewish Quarterly Review*, VOLUME IX, NUMBER 35 [New York: The Macmillan Company, 1897], p. 510).

On the Kabbalistic-Alchemical Alterpiece, in particular, Ernst Benz, *Christian Kabbalah* (pp. 91-97), “The KEY to the KABBALISTIC Master Tablet of Princess Antonia of Würtemberg IN THE CHURCH OF THE TRINITY AT DEINACH” and the accompanying diagrammatic rendering of *Turris Antonia*.

THOMAS VAUGHAN (1622-1666)

On Vaughan, refer to my notes in ADDENDUM B, “Seventeenth-century Printed Works on Christian Cabala in English,” at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>, pages 131-132.

THE 17th CENTURY:
FRANCIS MERCURY VAN HELMONT, KNORR VON ROSENROTH,
& THE CAMBRIDGE PLATONISTS¹⁶

In the seventeenth century, two men account for the most significant promulgation of *kabbalah* outside Jewry: Francis Mercury van Helmont (1614-1698) and Christian Knorr von Rosenroth (1636-1689). Van Helmont's influence was surprisingly broad: from the Cambridge Platonists—in particular Henry More—to Leibniz. *Kabbalah*, as gathered through his contact with van Helmont and Anne Conway, is thought to have influenced Leibniz' concept of *monads* and his notions of free will.

A number of items by Allison Coudert deal with all of this (listed chronologically):

- “A Cambridge Platonist’s Kabbalist Nightmare,” in *Journal for the History of Ideas*, xxxvi: 4 (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976)—More’s responses to van Helmont as printed in *Kabbala denudata*.
- “A Quaker-Kabbalist Controversy: George Fox’s Reaction to Francis Mercury van Helmont,” in *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, Volume Thirty-nine (London: The Warburg Institute – University of London, 1976)
- “Forgotten Ways of Knowing: The Kabbalah, Language, and Science in the Seventeenth Century,” in *The Shapes of Knowledge from the Renaissance to the Enlightenment*, eds. Donald Kelley and Richard Popkin [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 124] (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1991)
- “The *Kabbala denudata*: Converting Jews or Seducing Christians?” in *Jewish Christians and Christian Jews*, eds. Richard H. Popkin and Gordon M. Weiner [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 138] (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1993)
- *Leibniz and the Kabbalah* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 142] (Dordrecht: Kluwer, 1995)
- “Leibniz, Locke, Newton and the Kabbalah,” in *The Christian Kabbalah*, ed. Joseph Dan (Cambridge: Harvard College Library, 1997)
- “Leibniz and the Kabbalah,” in *Leibniz, Mysticism and Religion*, eds. Allison P. Coudert, Richard Popkin, and Gordon M. Weiner [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 158] (Dordrecht: Kluwer, 1998). (This article = CHAPTER 13 of Coudert’s *Impact of the Kabbalah...* cited below.)
- “John Locke and Francis Mercury van Helmont,” in *Everything Connects: In Conference with Richard Popkin. Essays in His Honor*, eds. James E. Force and David S. Katz (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 1999).
- “The *Kabbala denudata*,” in *The Columbia History of Western Philosophy*, ed. Richard Popkin (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999: pp. 363-6)
- “Kabbalistic Messianism versus Kabbalistic Enlightenment,” in *Millenarianism and Messianism in Early Modern European Culture*, Volume I: JEWISH MESSIANISM IN THE EARLY MODERN PERIOD, eds. Matt Goldish and Richard H. Popkin [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 173] (Dordrecht: Kluwer, 2001)
- “Five Seventeenth-Century Christian Hebraists,” in *Hebraica Veritas? Christian Hebraists and the Study of Judaism in Early Modern Europe*, eds. Allison P. Coudert and Jeffrey S. Shoulson (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, 2004). The five are Johan Jacob Schudt, Knorr von Rosenroth, Francis Mercury van Helmont, Johann Georg Wachter, and Johann Peter Späth
- “Judaizing in the Seventeenth Century: Francis Mercury van Helmont and Johann Peter Späth (Moses Germanus),” in *Secret Conversions to Judaism in Early Modern Europe*, eds. Martin Mulsow and Richard Popkin [BRILL’S STUDIES IN INTELLECTUAL HISTORY, vol. 122] (Leiden: Brill, 2004)

Coudert’s book, *The Impact of the Kabbalah in the Seventeenth Century: The Life and Thought of Francis Mercury van Helmont (1614-1698)* [BRILL SERIES IN JEWISH STUDIES, 9] (Leiden: Brill Academic Publishers, 1999) covers van Helmont and those influential thinkers around him: Rosenroth, Henry

¹⁶ Refer to ADDENDUM B, “Seventeenth-century Printed Works on Christian Cabala in English,” at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>, for a catalogue of title pages, excerpts, and sources for works by H. C. Agrippa, John Brinsley, Anne Conway, Robert Fludd, F. M. van Helmont, Henry More, Thomas Vaughan, and Abbé de Villars.

More, Anne Conway, John Locke, Leibniz. This work offers the most comprehensive treatment of seventeenth-century *cabala* to date.

Works by F. M. van Helmont:

- *Alphabet of Nature* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007). With Taylor Corse, Allison Coudert has produced an annotated translation.
- *Two hundred queries moderately propounded concerning the doctrine of the revolution of humane souls and its conformity to the truths of Christianity* (1684) (Ann Arbor: EEBO Editions/ProQuest, 2011)—“an authentic reproduction.”
- *Francis Mercury van Helmont’s ‘Sketch of Christian Kabbalism’* translated and ed. Sheila Spector (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2012), namely, *Adumbratio Kabbalæ Christianæ* in English.
- *One Hundred Fifty Three Chymical Aphorisms (Octob. 1687) / One Hundred Fifty Seven Alchemical Aphorisms (Octob. 1687)*, edited with additional material by Prince Karl Hildebrand von Niebelung (FBN Press VisionCon, 2004), printed as a chap book.

See my transcriptions, SELECTED WRITINGS OF FRANCIS MERCURIUS VAN HELMONT, at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/VanHelmont/index.php>. Writings include *A Cabbalistical Dialogue*, *The Paradoxal Discourses*, CHAPTER IV, AN APPENDIX...CONCERNING...THE REVOLUTION OF HUMAN SOULS from *The Divine Being and Its Attributes*, and *Seder Olam*. Excerpts from all of these appear in ADDENDUM B: SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY PRINTED WORKS ON CHRISTIAN CABALA IN ENGLISH, within the second part of the current paper, at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>, pp. 126-130. Also find Philip C. Almond’s *Heaven & Hell in Enlightenment England* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), especially §§ PRE-EXISTENCE AND THE SCRIPTURES and THE TRANSMIGRATION OF SOULS within CHAPTER 1 (pp. 13-23).

KNORR VON ROSENROTH (1636-1689)

Christian Knorr von Rosenroth, as translator, annotator, and editor, published the massive two-volume *Kabbala denudata* (KABBALAH UNVEILED), which virtually alone represented authentic (Jewish) *kabbalah* to Christian Europe until the mid-nineteenth century. These tomes contain a range of kabbalistic texts: sections of the *Zohar*, *Pardes Rimmonim* by Moses Cordovero, *Sha’ar ha-Shamayim* and *Beit Elobim* by Abraham Kohen (or Cohen) de Herrera, *Sefer ha-Gilgulim* (a Lurianic tract attributed to Hayim Vital), and others, with commentaries by Rosenroth himself and Henry More, and—appended to some later editions—a summary of Christian *cabala* (*Adumbratio Kabbalæ Christianæ*) by F. M. van Helmont—all in Latin translation.

ADDENDUM C of the present paper (which can be found at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>) outlines the contents of *Kabbala denudata* and lists sources in English. Refer to the items by Allison Coudert noted above, especially *The Impact of the Kabbalah in the Seventeenth Century*, which devotes a substantial section to Rosenroth and the ingredients of *Kabbala denudata*. Also treating Rosenroth is Coudert’s “Seventeenth-Century Natural Philosophy and Esotericism at the Court of Sulzbach,” in *Ésotérisme, Gnosés & Imaginaire Symbolique: Mélanges offerts à Antoine Faivre* [GNOSTICA 3], eds. Richard Caron, Joscelyn Godwin, Wouter J Hanegraaff, and Jean-Louis Viellard-Baron (Leuven: Peeters, 2001).

Further see

- Moshe Idel’s *Ben: Sonship and Jewish Mysticism* [THE KOGOD LIBRARY OF JUDAIC STUDIES 5]. London – New York: Shalom Hartman Institute/Continuum, 2007: CHAPTER 5, § 3. THE IMPACT OF CHRISTIAN KNORR VON ROSENROTH’S KABBALA DENUDATA.
- Klaus Reichert’s summary of developments in “Christian Kabbalah in the Seventeenth Century,” in *The*

Christian Kabbalah, ed. Joseph Dan (Harvard College Library, 1997), building on his earlier piece, “Pico della Mirandola and the Beginnings of Christian Kabbala,” in *Mysticism, Magic, and Kabbalah in Ashkenazi Judaism*, eds. K. E. Grozinger and Joseph Dan (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1995).

- Guiseppe Veltri’s first chapter, “Jewish Philosophy: Humanist Roots of a Contradiction in Terms,” in *Renaissance Philosophy in Jewish Garb* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009), where Knorr is described as
...perhaps the last of those who still adhered to the tried and true Christian theory of the Kabbalah as an aspect of divine, archaic wisdom...who tried to support that theory with new arguments. (—p. 26).
- J. H. (Yossi) Chajes’ “Kabbalah and the Diagrammatic Phase of the Scientific Revolution,” in *Jewish Culture in Early Modern Europe: Essays in Honor of David B. Ruderman* (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College Press / Pittsburg: University of Pittsburg Press, 2014), pages 109-123.
Rosenroth’s diagrammatic representation of Lurianism constitutes a juncture where the parallel evolving discourses of Lurianism and early modern natural philosophy converges, en route to a meeting with the makers of modernity if not modernity itself. (—page 118)

THE CAMBRIDGE PLATONISTS (chronologically)

- Cragg, Gerald R. (ed.) *The Cambridge Platonists* (LIBRARY OF PROTESTANT THOUGHT, New York: Oxford University Press, 1968)—a useful collection of extracts, primarily from Benjamin Whichcote, John Smith, Ralph Cudworth, and Henry More.
- Powicke, Frederick James. *Cambridge Platonists, a Study*, first published in 1926 (London – Toronto: J. M. Dent and Sons Ltd and Cambridge: Harvard University Press), reprinted in 1970 (Westport: Greenwood Press) and 1971 (Hamden: Archon Books), which discusses Whichcote, Smith, Cudworth, and More as well as Nathaniel Culverwel and Peter Sterry.
- Patridfes, C. A. *The Cambridge Platonists* (Cambridge – London – New York, etc.: Cambridge University Press, 1980).
- For a fine brief account: Sarah Hutton’s article, “The Cambridge Platonists,” in *The Columbia History of Western Philosophy*, ed. Richard H. Popkin (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999).
- *Cambridge Platonist Spirituality*, eds. Charles Taliaferro and Alison J. Tepley (New York: Paulist Press, 2004), which contains excerpts from the writings of Cudworth, Whichcote, Culverwell, John Smith, More, Peter Sterry, and Anne Conway.
- *The Cambridge Platonists: A Brief Introduction – With Eight Letters of Dr. Antony Tuckney and Dr. Benjamin Whichcote*, edited by Tod E. Jones, translations by Sarar Elise Phang (Dallas – Lantham – Boulder – New York – Oxford: University Press of America, 2005).

HENRY MORE (1614-1687)

More’s *Conjectura Cabbalistica, OR, A Conjectural Essay of Interpreting the minde of Moses according to the Threefold Cabbala, VIZ. Literal, Philosophical, Mystical, or Divinely Moral* (1653) is most often found bound with other works by More in a compendium titled *A Collection of Several Philosophical Writings of Dr Henry More* (“The second Edition more correct and much enlarged”—London: James Flesher, for William Morden Book-seller in Cambridge, 1662). It comprises Volume 2 of *Henry More: Major Philosophical Works* (9 vols.), ed. G. A. J. Rogers [series: THE CAMBRIDGE PLATONISTS] (Bristol: Thoemmes Continuum, 1997).

On More’s “Cabbalistical” works, see ADDENDUM B: SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY PRINTED WORKS ON CHRISTIAN CABALA IN ENGLISH on his *Conjectura Cabbalistica*, and ADDENDUM C: THE CONTENTS OF *KABBALA DENUDATA*... on his material within that work, at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>, pp. 130-131 and 135-137, respectively.

Further, see

- Brown, C. C. “The Mere Numbers of Henry More’s Cabbala,” in *Studies in English Literature, 1500-1900*, Volume 10, Number 1, THE ENGLISH RENAISSANCE (Houston: Rice University, Winter 1970).

- Copenhaver, Brian P. “Jewish Theologies of Space in the Scientific Revolution: Henry More, Joseph Raphson, Isaac Newton and their Predecessors” in *Annals of Science*, xxxvii (London: Taylor and Francis, Ltd., 1980)
- Coudert, Allison. “Henry More, the Kabbalah, and the Quakers,” in *Philosophy, Science, and Religion in England*, eds. R. Ashcraft, R. Kroll, and P. Zagorin (Cambridge University Press, 1992), which, somewhat revised, appears as CHAPTER 10 of Coudert’s *Impact of the Kabbalah...*, cited above.
- Crocker, Robert. *Henry More, 1614-1687: A Biography of the Cambridge Platonist* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 185] (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2003). See especially CHAPTER 5: “Plato Democritans: The Ancient Cabbala Revived” regarding what More meant by “*Philosophical Cabbala*”; and CHAPTER 12: “The Kabbalah and the Quakers: Anne Conway, van Helmont, and Knorr von Rosenroth,” § 1, THE JEWISH AND THE ‘GREEK’ CABBALA, and § 2. MORE, ANNE CONWAY AND THE QUAKERS, regarding More’s response to the *kabbalah* as presented by van Helmont and von Rosenroth.
- Fouke, Daniel C. *The Enthusiastical Concerns of Dr. Henry More: Religious Meaning and the Psychology of Delusion*. Leiden – New York – Köln: E. J. Brill, 1997.
- George, Edward Augustus. *Seventeenth Century Men of Latitude: Forerunners of the New Theology* (New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1908): § HENRY MORE, 1614-1687 (pp. 109-128)
- Hall, Rupert. *Henry More: Magic, Religion and Experiment* (Oxford – Cambridge: Basil Blackwell, 1990); reprinted as *Henry More and the Scientific Revolution* (Cambridge – New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997).
- *Henry More (1614-1687) Tercentenary Studies* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 127] (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1990). In the present context, see especially Stuart Brown’s “Leibniz and More’s Cabbalistic Circle,” Richard Popkin’s “Spiritualistic Cosmologies of Henry More and Anne Conway,” Allison Coudert’s “Henry More and Witchcraft” and David Katz’ “Henry More and the Jews.”
- *Henry More: The Immortality of the Soul*, ed. A[lexander] Jacob. [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 122] (Dordrecht: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 1987).
- *Henry More’s Manual of Metaphysics: A Translation of the ENCHIRIDIUM METAPHYSICUM* (1679), introduction and notes by Alexander Jacob (Hildesheim – New York: G. Olms Verlag, 1995).
- Henry, John. “Henry More” (*First published Fri Aug 24, 2007*) in *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, principal editor: Edward N. Zalta, (Stanford: The Metaphysics Research Lab, CSLI, Stanford University)—online at <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/henry-more/>
- Lichtenstein, Aharon. *Henry More: The Rational Theology of a Cambridge Platonist*. (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1962).
- Mackinnon, Flora Isabel. *Philosophical Writings of Henry More* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1925; rpt Kessinger Publishing, 2007)
- More, Henry. *Enchiridion ethicum*, the English translation of 1690 reproduced from the first edition (New York: The Facsimile Text Society, 1930).
- Mulligan, Lotte. “‘Reason,’ ‘Right Reason,’ and ‘Revelation’ in Mid-Seventeenth-Century England,” in *Occult & Scientific Mentalities in the Renaissance*, ed. Brian Vickers (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984).
- Nicolson, Marjorie Hope (ed.) *Conway Letters: The Correspondence of Anne, Viscountess Conway, Henry More, and their Friends, 1642—1684* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1930; revised edition with introduction & new material, ed. Sarah Hutton, New York: Oxford University Press, 1992)
- Ward, Richard. *The Life of [the Learned and Pious Dr.] Henry More, Parts 1 & 2* [London: Joseph Downing, 1710], eds. Sarah Hutton, Cecil Courtney, Michelle Courtney, Robert Crocker and Rupert Hall [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 167] (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2000)

RALPH CUDWORTH (1617-1688)

One becomes frustrated trying to find evidence of any substantive *cabalistic* influence in Cudworth. A. E. Waite correctly acknowledges that “Cudworth connects but superficially with Kabbalism” (—*The Holy Kabbalah*, p. 480; on Waite, refer to § SOME HISTORIANS, above). Thus, beware of Kessinger’s pointless offprint of less than three pages of Waite’s *Holy Kabbalah* entitled *Ralph Cudworth: A Christian Student of the Holy Kabbalah* (2006).

On Cudworth, see

- Cudworth, Ralph. *The True Intellectual System of the Universe*. (London: Printed for Richard Royston, 1678; London: Andrew Bell at the Cross-keys, 1706; London: printed for J. Walthoe, D. Midwinter, J. and J. Bonwick, W. Innys, R. Ware [and 17 others in London], 1743; London: J. F. Dove for Richard Priestly, 1820; Oxford: D. A. Talboys, 1829; Andover: Gould & Newman; 1837-38; London: Thomas Tegg, 1845; rpt in 4 volumes: Kessinger & The Lighting Source, 2004. Find *True Intellectual System...* and other material on Cudworth online at Internet Archive: <http://www.archive.org/search.php?query=ralph%20cudworth%20AND%20mediatype%3Atexts>
- _____ . *Treatise Concerning Eternal and Immutable Morality, with A Treatise of Freewill* (London: Printed for James and John Knapton..., MDCCXXXI [1731]). See Sarah Hutton’s edition: Cambridge – New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Lowrey, Charles Emmet. *The Philosophy of Ralph Cudworth: A Study of THE TRUE INTELLECTUAL SYSTEM OF THE UNIVERSE* (New York: Phillips & Hunt – Cincinnati: Cranston & Stowe, 1884; rpt Adamant Media Corporation, 2005).
- Passmore, J. A. *Ralph Cudworth: An Interpretation* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1951; rpt Bristol: Thoemmes, 1990).
- Three papers in *Platonism at the Origins of Modernity: Studies on Platonism and Early Modern Philosophy*, eds. Douglas Hedley and Sarah Hutton [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 196] (Dordrecht: Springer, 2008): (1) Leslie Armour’s “Trinity, Community and Love: Cudworth’s Platonism and the Idea of God,” (2) Jean-Louis Breteau’s “Chaos and Order in Cudworth’s Thought,” and (3) Robin Attfield’s “Cudworth, Prior and Passmore on the Autonomy of Ethics.”

ANNE CONWAY (1631-1679)

As a student of both More and van Helmont, Conway refuted the major philosophers of her time (Descartes, Hobbes, Spinoza) with an arsenal which included concepts from Lurianic *kabbalah* (as found in Rosenroth’s *Kabbala denudata*). As did van Helmont, Conway became a Quaker; also as van Helmont, she appears to have had some influence upon Leibniz.

On Conway, start with Sarah Hutton’s “intellectual biography,” *Anne Conway: A Woman Philosopher* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), and Conway’s own *Principles of the Most Ancient and Modern Philosophy*, eds. Allison Coudert and Taylor Corse (Cambridge University Press, 1996). In addition, refer to

- Byrne, David. ANNE CONWAY: AN INTELLECTUAL PORTRAIT OF A SEVENTEENTH CENTURY COUNTESS. PhD. dissertation (Claremont: Claremont Graduate University, 2005)
- Merchant, Carolyn. “The Vitalism of Anne Conway: Its Impact on Leibniz’s Concept of the Monad,” in *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, Volume XVII, Number 3 (La Jolla: Journal of the History of Philosophy, Inc., 1979)
- _____ . “Women on Nature: Anne Conway and Other Philosophical Feminists” = CHAPTER 11 of *The Death of Nature: Women Ecology and the Scientific Revolution* (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1980; rpt 1989 and 1990, with a new preface).
- Nicolson, Marjorie Hope (ed.) *Conway Letters: The Correspondence of Anne, Viscountess Conway, Henry More, and their Friends, 1642—1684* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1930; revised edition with introduction &

new material, ed. Sarah Hutton, New York: Oxford University Press, 1992).

- Refer to my segment on Conway in ADDENDUM B: SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY PRINTED WORKS..., (<http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>) pp. 124-125.
- White, Carol Wayne. *The Legacy of Anne Conway (1631-1679): Reverberations from a Mystical Naturalism* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2008).

THOMAS BURNET (1635-1715)

Theologian Burnet was a contemporary of the Cambridge Platonists, though not one of them. In *Archæologia Philosophicæ* (London: 1692: LIBRI I. CAP. VII. *De Hebræis, eorumque Cabalâ*—which is not included in Foxton’s 1729 English translation reproduced by Kessinger, 2003), Burnet expounds upon *kabbalah*, dividing it into the Nominal and the Real, the former being the hermeneutical devises *gematria*, *temurah*, and *notaricon*, along with *vocabula* (NAMES), the latter being the doctrine of the *sefirot* and the four worlds. Given that Burnet’s primary, if not sole, source on the subject was *Kabbala demudata*, his “slender knowledge” is more of *kabbalah* than of *cabala*.

In his “best-seller” *Tellurius theoria sacra* (London: 1681) [English edition: SACRED THEORY OF THE EARTH, London: 1684, with several subsequent editions into the early 1700s], Burnet writes

There has been a great fame, ’tis true, of the *Jewish Cabala*, and of great mysteries contain’d in it; and, I believe, there was once a Traditional doctrine amongst some of them, that had extraordinary Notions and Conclusions: But where is this now to be found? The *Essenes* were the likeliest Sect, one would think, to retain such doctrines, but ’tis probable they are now so mixt with things fabulous and fantastical, that what one should alledge from thence would be of little or no authority. One Head in this *Cabala* was the doctrine of the *Sephiroth*, and though the explication of them be uncertain, the Inferiour *Sephiroth* in the Corporeal World cannot so well appli’d to any thing, as to those several Orbs and Regions, infolding one another, whereof the Primigenial Earth was compos’d. Yet such conjectures, I know, are of no validity, but in consort with better Arguments. I have often thought also, that their first and second Temple represented the first and second Earth or World; and that of *Ezekiel’s*, which is the third, is still to be erected, the most beautiful of all, when this second Temple of the World shall be burnt down. If the Prophecies of *Enoch* had been preserv’d, and taken into the Canon by *Ezra*, after their return from *Babylon*, when the Collection of their Sacred Books is suppos’d to have been made, we might probably have had a considerable account there, both of times past and to come, of Antiquities and Futurities; for those Prophecies are generally suppos’d to have contain’d both the first and second fate of this Earth, and all the Periods of it. But as this Book is lost to us, so I look upon all others that pretend to be Ante-Mosaical or Patriarchal, as Spurious and Fabulous. (—*Sacred Theory...*, chapter IX pp. 200-201)

On Burnet, see

- Waite, A. E. *The Holy Kabbalah*, § XIV.—THOMAS BURNET, pp. 482-485 (—ref. § SOME HISTORIANS, above)—the source of the phrase “slender knowledge.”
- Almond, Philip. *Heaven & Hell in Enlightenment England* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), chapter 4. “The Last Day,” § HELL ON EARTH (pp. 119-123).
- Burnet’s *Sacred Theory of the Earth* is available as an Amazon Kindle text and at THE INTERNET ARCHIVE, eibniz www.archive.org/search.php?query=thomas%20burnet%20sacred%20theory%20AND%20mediatype%3Atexts.

ISAAC NEWTON (1642-1727)

Of course, part of the seventeenth-century fray was Isaac Newton, who, “in formulating the factors in the corruption of the primitive church, found the influence of metaphysical emanation cosmologies, such as those in the *kabbalah*, the main culprit.

Newton came to the *kabbalah* through Knorr von Rosenroth's *Kabbala denudata*, but his criticisms of it were formed through his preconceived notion of the role of emanation in the church's corruption and through the influence of [*Histoire des Juifs* (1716) by Jacques] Basnage, who dedicates considerable space to criticizing Kabbalah," [my brackets—DK] writes Matt Goldish in *Judaism in the Theology of Sir Isaac Newton* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 157] (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1998: p. 161).

Goldish suggests that fanning the flame of Newton's criticisms of *kabbalah* was his desire to undermine a key source of Leibniz' "emanational cosmology," which Newton could not abide.

On Newton and *kabbalah*,

- Goldish, Matt. "Newton on Kabbalah," in *The Books of Nature and Scripture* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 139] (Dordrecht: Kluwer, 1994).
- Trompf, Garry W. "Isaac Newton and the Kabbalistic Noah: Natural Law between *Mediaevalia* and the Enlightenment," in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, VOLUME 5, NUMBER 1 (Leiden: Brill Academic Publishers, 2005).

On other aspects of "esoteric Newton," see

- Westfall, Richard S. "Newton and the Hermetic Tradition," in *Science, Medicine, and Society in the Renaissance: Essays in Honor of Walter Pagel* (New York: Neale Watson Academic Publishers, 1972); also in *Articles on Witchcraft, Magic and Demonology*, Volume 11: RENAISSANCE MAGIC, ed. Brian P. Levack (New York – London: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1992).
- _____ . "Newton and Alchemy," in *Occult & Scientific Mentalities in the Renaissance*, ed. Brian Vickers (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984).

LEIBNIZ (1646-1716)

On Leibniz, along with the numerous articles by Allison Coudert already listed and her book, *Leibniz and Kabbalah* (Dordrecht: Kluwer, 1995), see (listed chronologically)

- Merchant, Carolyn. "Leibniz and Newton" = CHAPTER 12 of *The Death of Nature: Women Ecology and the Scientific Revolution* (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1980; rpt 1989 and 1990 (with a new preface).
- *Leibnizian Inquiries: A Group of Essays*, ed. Nicholas Rescher (Lanham – New York – London: University Press of America, 1989).
- Brown, Stuart. "Leibniz and More's Cabbalistic Circle," in *Henry More (1614-1687): Tercentenary Studies*, [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 127: 1990], noted above.
The "circle" Brown refers to here comprised of Francis Mercury van Helmont and Knorr von Rosenroth. Whether Leibniz' philosophy was the result of direct influence or convergence is the gist of Brown's discussion; Brown highlights the latter.
- Adams, Robert Merrihew. *Leibniz: Determinist, Theist, Idealist* (New York – Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994).
- *Leibniz, Mysticism and Religion*, eds. Allison P. Coudert, Richard Popkin, and Gordon M. Weiner [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 158] (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1998)
See in particular Stuart Brown's "Some Occult Influences on Leibniz's Monadology"—the influences discussed are alchemy and *kabbalah*—AND Marcia (*sic*) Keith Schuchard's "Leibniz, Benzelius, and the Kabbalistic Roots of Swedish Illuminism."
- Fox, Nicholas James. LEIBNIZ'S COSMOLOGY: TRANSCENDENTAL RATIONALISM AND KABBALISTIC SYMBOLISM. PhD diss. Open University (UK): 2003.
"The thesis proposes that the proximity of these two doctrines is such that Christian Lurianic Kabbalah can be regarded, in many ways, as a mystical exoteric parallel to Leibniz's." (—ABSTRACT)

THE 17th & 18th CENTURIES

KEMPER – OETINGER

In the late seventeenth century, Rabbi Johan Kemper [the Christian name taken by Moses ben Aaron of Cracow, 1670-1716], a Polish Jew who immigrated to Sweden and converted to Christianity, was appointed professor of Hebrew at the University of Uppsala. ... During Kemper's long tenure at the University of Uppsala he "trained a whole generation of Swedish scholars in Oriental and Rabbinic studies." (—Shalom Goldman, *God's Sacred Tongue* [Chapel Hill – London: University of North Carolina Press, 2004], pp. 42-43, quoting Pinchas Lapide, *Hebrew in the Church*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1984, p. 76)

Marsha Keith Schuchard refers to Kemper as "a crypto-Sabbatian" who "infused Sabbatian themes into his kabbalistic writings" (—"Leibniz, Benzelius, and Swedenborg," in *Leibniz, Mysticism and Religion* [Dordrecht: Kluwer, 1998], p. 97). In *Mapping Messianic Jewish Theology: A Constructive Approach* (Milton Keynes – Colorado Springs – Hyderabad: Paternoster/Authentic Media, 2009), Richard Harvey writes (p. 115)

Christianizing the mystical tradition was the goal of Johann Christian Jakob Kemper of Uppsala, a 17th century Jewish Christian who established the truths of Christianity on the basis of Jewish sources, particularly the *Zohar*, to show that the messianic faith of the Christians was, in fact, the truly ancient *Kabbalah* of Judaism. His commentary on the *Zohar* [*Mateh Moshe* – THE ROD OF MOSES] published in 1711, begins with three initial chapters, on the Trinity, the divinity of the Messiah, and on *Metatron*, the embodiment of the Messiah.

On Kemper, see in particular Elliot R. Wolfson, "Messianism in the Christian Kabbalah of Johann Kemper," in *Millenarianism and Messianism in Early Modern European Culture*, Volume I: *JEWISH MESSIANISM IN THE EARLY MODERN PERIOD* [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 173], eds. Matt Goldish and Richard H. Popkin (Dordrecht: Kluwer, 2001), and Wolfson's "Angelic Embodiment and the Feminine Representation of Jesus: Reconstructing Carnality in the Christian Kabbalah of Yohann Kemper," in *The Jewish Body: Corporeality, Society, and Identity in the Renaissance and Early Modern Period*, eds. Maria Diemling and Giuseppe Veltri (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009). Also note the final pages (137-138) of Boaz Huss' article, "The Text and Context of the 1684 Sulzback Edition of the *Zohar*," in *Tradition, Heterodoxy, and Religious Culture: Judaism and Christianity in the Early Modern Period*, eds. Chanita Goodblatt and Howard Kreisel (Beer-Sheva: Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, 2006).

A passage concerning Kemper from the oft-cited study of Hans-Joachim Schoeps, *Barocke Juden, Christen, Judenchristen* (Bern – Munich: Francke Verlag, 1965), is translated into English in George Dole's "Philosemitism in the Seventeenth Century" in *Studia Swedenborgiana*, Volume 7, number 1 (Newton: Swedenborg School of Religion, December 1990).

Ernst Benz' *Christian Kabbalah: Neglected Child of Theology*, translated into English by Kenneth W. Wesche, ed. Robert J. Faas (St. Paul: Grailstone Press, 2004), opens with "The Beginnings of Christian Kabbalism," a rather swift chapter following Scholem's article of the same name. Benz then treats developments of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, with chapters on Knorr von Rosenroth, Koppel Hecht, Isaac Luria (whom Oetinger "counted next to Jacob Böhme and Swedenborg as principal witnesses of spiritual knowledge"—p. 43), and "The Kabbalistic Master Tablet of Princess Antonia" (the image of which, with key, is appended to the text). Benz pays special attention to the theosophist Friedrich Christoph Oetinger (1702-1782) throughout the book and in the chapters "Oetinger's Path to Kabbalah" and "Oetinger's Doctrine of the Sephiroth."

Note, however, Wouter J. Hanegraaff's remarks in *Swedenborg, Oetinger, Kant: Three Perspectives on the Secrets of Heaven* (West Chester: The Swedenborg Foundation, 2007), "Oetinger has often been presented as one of the main representatives of a Western esoteric tradition known as Christian Theosophy, and of another one known as Christian Kabbalah, but as will become clear from our discussions, there is much reason to see him as a remarkably orthodox representative of biblical fundamentalism as understood in the Protestant tradition" (—p. xxii). Hanegraaff, however, acknowledges Oetinger's "kabbalistic interests" and his contact with Knorr von Rosenroth's *Kabbala denudata*.

Further, find CHAPTER X on Oetinger in Arthur Versluis' *Wisdom's Book: The Sophia Anthology* (St. Paul: Paragon House, 2000).

THE CONFLATION OF CABALA & ALCHEMY

Toward the end of his sub-chapter on Christian *cabala* (—*Kabbalah*, pp. 196-201), Gershom Scholem writes of the blending of *cabala* and alchemy [my additions appear in brackets—DK]

As early as the late 16th century [with, for example, Paracelsus—see above, § PARACELSUS] a pronounced trend had emerged toward the permeation of Christian Kabbalah with alchemical symbolism, thus giving it an oddly original character in its final stages of development in the 17th and 18th centuries. This mélange of elements typifies the works of Heinrich Khunrath, *Amphitheatrum Sapientiae Aeternae* (1609) [the eleven plates from *Amphitheatrum*... with explanations are in Paul M. Allen, *A Rosenkreutz Anthology* (Blauvelt: Rudolf Steiner Publications, 1968), pp. 273-292], Blaise de Vigenère, *Traité du Feu* (1617), Abraham von Frankenberg, Robert Fludd (1574–1637) [see above, § FLUDD and ADDENDUM B], and Thomas Vaughan (1622–1666) [see ADDENDUM B], and reaches its apogee in Georg von Welling's *Opus Magico-Cabbalisticum* (1735) [recently translated by Joseph G. McVeigh and ed. Lon Milo DuQuette, San Francisco – Newburyport: Weiser Books, 2006] and the many books of F. C. Oetinger (1702–1782) [see § immediately above], whose influence is discernible in the works of such great figures of German idealist philosophy as Hegel [treated below] and Schelling.¹⁷ In yet another form this mixture reappears in the theosophical systems of the Freemasons in the second half of the 18th century [and on into the nineteenth century, as indicated below in Part 2]. (—*Kabbalah*, p. 200)

Refer to Scholem's *Alchemy and Kabbalah*, translated from the German by Klaus Ottmann [= "Alchemie und Kabbala" in *Eranos Yearbook* 46 (1977)] (Putnam: Spring Publications, 2006). Further on Heinrich Khunrath's *Amphitheatrum sapientiae aeternae*, see Peter Jonathan Forshaw's doctoral thesis, *ORA ET LABORA: ALCHEMY, MAGIC, AND CABALA IN HEINRICH KHUNRATH'S AMPHITHEATRUM SAPIENTIAE AETERNAE* (1609) (Birkbeck: University of London, 2003), in two volumes.¹⁸

¹⁷ See Zev Golan, *God, Man and Nietzsche: A Startling Dialogue between Judaism and Modern Philosophers* (Bloomington: iUniverse, 2008), CHAPTER II, "The Gates of Eden: God and Evil, Man and Evil (A Dialogue between Schelling, Luria and Maimonides)," pp. 15-52.

¹⁸ Noted here only because of its title, *Cabala: Spiegel der Kunst und Natur* by Stephan Michelspacher (German and Latin editions, Augsburg: 1615-1616) is a brief, albeit fascinating, alchemical text. The German and Latin versions, along with an annotated English translation by T. I. Penman, has been published by Ouroboros Press (Seattle: 2015).

THE ‘UNKNOWN SUPERIORS’: SWEDENBORG, CAGLIOSTRO, & FALK

In the eighteenth century, quite a bit of kabbalistic influence appears to trace to a single individual. There are indications that, among others, Emanuel Swedenborg¹⁹ (1688-1772) and Alessandro Cagliostro (1743-1795) were indebted to Samuel Falk (ca 1710-1782), a Polish Kabbalist known as the “*Ba`al Shem* of London” (*ba`al shem*, MASTER OF THE NAME, i.e. one who uses holy names in performing magical operations and writing amulets). Falk supposedly introduced aspects of *kabbalah* to a number of Christian scholars.

Falk, Swedenborg, and Cagliostro are discussed in Joscelyn Godwin’s *Theosophical Enlightenment* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1994: CHAPTER 5). Godwin’s main sources of information on this trio were two items by Marsha Keith Schuchard:

- FREEMASONRY, SECRET SOCIETIES, AND THE CONTINUITY OF THE OCCULT TRADITION IN ENGLISH LITERATURE (Ph.D. dissertation, Austin: University of Texas, 1975)
Schuchard’s dissertation contains such chapters as I. “The Cabala, Sexual Magic, and the Jewish Visionary Traditions,” II. “The Christian Interpretation of the Cabala in the Renaissance, and the Development of the Syncretic Occult Tradition” (based primarily on Scholem, Yates and Waite) and VIII. “Cabalistic and Magnetic Visions among the London Swedenborgians in the 1780’s and 1790’s,” before giving “special emphasis...to William Blake from 1780 to 1827” in CHAPTERS IX through XIII.
- “Yeats and the ‘Unknown Superiors’: Swedenborg, Falk and Cagliostro,” in *Secret Texts: The Literature of Secret Societies*, eds. Marie Mulvey Roberts and Hugh Ormsby-Lennon (New York: AMS Press, 1994).
Schuchard provocatively suggests that the Unknown Superiors (of illuminist masonry, Falk in particular) may lurk in the obscure origins of the Golden Dawn. This piece is an expanded version of the article of the same name, subtitled “A short paper read at the Golden Dawn 100th Anniversary Conference organised by Hermetic Research Trust on 25th and 26th April 1987,” in *The Hermetic Journal*, Issue Number 37, ed. Adam McLean (Tysoe: The Hermetic Research Trust, Autumn 1987).

¹⁹ Introductions to Swedenborg:

- Benz, Ernst. *Emanuel Swedenborg: Visionary Savant in the Age of Reason*, translated by Nicholas Goodrick-Clarke (West Chester: Swedenborg Foundation, 2002)—a translation of *Emanuel Swedenborg: Naturforscher und Seher*. 1st edition 1948; 2nd edition 1969.
- *Emanuel Swedenborg: A Continuing Vision. A Pictorial Biography and Anthology of Essays and Poetry*, ed. Robin Larsen (New York: Swedenborg Foundation, Inc., 1988)
- Lamm, Martin. *Emanuel Swedenborg: The Development of His Thought*, translated by Tomas Spiers and Anders Hallengren. West Chester: The Swedenborg Foundation, 2000.
- Sigstedt, Cypriel Odhner. *The Swedenborg Epic: The Life and Works of Emanuel Swedenborg* (London: The Swedenborg Society, 1981)
- Stanley, Michael. *Emanuel Swedenborg: Essential Readings* (Sydney: Swedenborg Lending Library and Enquiry Centre, 1993)
- *Swedenborg and His Influence*, gen. editor: Erland Brock (Bryn Athyn: Academy of the New Church, 1988).
- Synnestvedt, Syg. *The Essential Swedenborg* (West Chester: Swedenborg Foundation, 1977)
- Warren, Samuel M. (ed) *A Compendium of the Theological Writings of Emanuel Swedenborg* (New York: Swedenborg Foundation, 1875, reprinted frequently).

Complete works by Swedenborg in English translation:

- *Apocalypse Explained* (6 volumes)
- *Apocalypse Revealed* (2 volumes)
- *Arcana Coelestia* (12 volumes)
- *Conjugal Love*
- *The Divine Love and Divine Wisdom*
- *The Divine Providence*
- *Heaven and Hell*
- *The Spiritual Diary* (5 volumes)
- *True Christian Religion* (2 volumes)

These works are all perpetually available from both The Swedenborg Foundation in West Chester (Pennsylvania) and The Swedenborg Society in London. Not usually carried in bookstores, all of the titles listed here can easily be mail-ordered from The General Church Book Center, 1100 Cathedral Road, Box 743, Bryn Athyn, PA 19009-0743 or on-line at <http://www.newchurchbooks.com/>.

Further on Swedenborg and Falk, see Schuchard's articles,

- “Emanuel Swedenborg: Deciphering the Codes of a Celestial and Terrestrial Intelligencer,” *Rending the Veil: Concealment and Revelation of Secrets in the History of Religions*, edited Elliot R. Wolfson (New York: Seven Bridges Press, 1999).
This article discusses, among other things, Swedenborg's “access to kabbalistic exegetic and visionary techniques and to traditions of Jewish sexual theosophy.”
- “Dr. Samuel Jacob Falk: A Sabbatian Adventurer in the Masonic Underground,” in *Millenarianism and Messianism in Early Modern European Culture*, Volume I: JEWISH MESSIANISM IN THE EARLY MODERN PERIOD [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 173], eds. Matt Goldish and Richard H. Popkin (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2001).

Schuchard's “elaborate reconstruction of Falk and his associates” is discussed in David Ruderman's *Jewish Enlightenment in an English Key* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000), pp. 156-169. While quite intrigued by Schuchard's portrait of Falk, Ruderman expresses a desire for more research and firmer evidence.

For more on Falk, see Michal Oron, “Dr. Samuel Falk and the Eibeschuetz-Emden Controversy,” in *Mysticism, Magic and Kabbalah in Ashkenazi Judaism*, eds. Karl Erich Grozinger and Joseph Dan (Berlin – New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1995), and Cecil Roth, “The King and the Cabalist,” in Roth's *Essays and Portraits in Anglo-Jewish History* (Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society of America, 1962).

Regarding other likely sources of *kabbalah* for Swedenborg, see Schuchard's “Leibniz, Benzelius, and the Kabbalistic Roots of Swedish Illuminism” in *Leibniz, Mysticism and Religion* (Dordrecht: Kluwer, 1998). “From 1703 to 1710, as Benzelius led Swedenborg through the university [Uppsala] ... [i]t is almost certain” that Swedenborg studied under the convert Johann Kemper (—Schuchard, “Leibniz, Benzelius...,” p. 97), a “crypto-Sabbatian” and author of an extended commentary on the *Zohar*. On Kemper, see above § 17th & 18th CENTURIES: KEMPER – OETINGER.

All of the research by Marsha Keith Schuchard which has been mentioned thus far—plus a great deal more—has been woven into her monumental *Emanuel Swedenborg, Secret Agent on Earth and Heaven: Jacobite, Jews, and Freemasons in Early Modern Sweden* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2012). This work is by far the most extensive treatment of both “occult” and “clandestine” Swedenborg.

The following study of the role of esoteric intelligence in exoteric politics will raise many questions about our preoccupations of the rationalist, scientific mentality of the “enlightened” eighteenth century. In tracing Swedenborg's long career, we come upon the persistence of early modern—even pre-modern—religious and philosophical beliefs, which fueled the imaginations of major thinkers as well as the machinations of major political players. (—p. xvi)

For a detailed preamble to Schuchard's items above, see her hefty *Restoring the Temple of Vision: Cabalistic Freemasonry and the Stuart Culture* [BRILL'S STUDIES IN INTELLECTUAL HISTORY, v. 110] (Leiden: Brill Academic Publishers, 2002), which takes the reader from the influence of “Jewish mathematical and architectural mysticism” upon medieval Masonic guilds (CHAPTER ONE) to “The Ruined Temple and the Flight of Knights” of the seventeenth century (CHAPTER TWELVE). Schuchard “concentrate(s) on certain themes that define the Stuart Masonic mentality—*i.e.*, Jewish and Scottish architectural mysticism; Jewish and Lullist mnemonic-visualization techniques; Cabalistic and Hermetic sexual theosophy; Rosicrucian and Masonic scientific schemes; crusader chivalry and illuminated knighthood; liberty of conscience and universal brotherhood” (INTRODUCTION, p. 7).

In *Swedenborg, Oetinger, Kant: Three Perspectives on the Secrets of Heaven* (West Chester: The Swedenborg Foundation, 2007), Wouter J. Hanegraaff calls into question the conclusion that Swedenborg is, in essence, part of the Hermetic-Cabalist tradition—as opposed to his having remained in basic continuity with his scientific background. Noting “the paucity of explicit references on Swedenborg’s part to Western esoteric authors and traditions,” Hanegraaff concludes that his own “close study of *Secrets of Heaven* [*Arcana Cælestia*] and other works, as well as the relevant secondary literature, has convinced him [Hanegraaff] that the ‘exoteric’ Swedenborg defended by [Swedenborg biographers] Lamm and Jönsson is much closer to the truth than the ‘esoteric’ one [of Benz and Schuchard]” (—pp. xx-xxi). With his strong emphasis on *Secrets of Heaven*, Hanegraaff seems to overlook—or dismiss—key writings in the Swedenborg corpus, in particular *Apocalypse Explained* and *The Spiritual Diary*, in which the influence of esoteric traditions is more apparent.

Another proponent of the “esoteric” Swedenborg—along with Benz and Schuchard—is the much earlier Ethan Allen Hitchcock, author of *Swedenborg, a Hermetic Philosopher* (New York: D. Appleton & Company, 1858).

Of interest in the present context are these three articles by Swedenborgian scholar Jane Williams-Hogan:

- “The Place of Emanuel Swedenborg in Modern Western Esotericism,” in *Western Esotericism and the Science of Religion* [= GNOSTICA 2], eds. Antoine Faivre and Wouter J. Hanegraaff (Leuven [Belgium]: Peeters, 1998)
- “Swedenborg Studies 2002: ‘On the Shoulders of Giants,’” in *The New Philosophy Online* (ISSUE: January-June 2002), at <http://www.newphilosophyonline.net/journal/article.php?page=1002&issue=106> and in *New Church History: ARTICLES* (Bryn Athen: The Academy of the New Church, n.d.), at <http://newchurchhistory.org/articles/jkwh2002.php#top>
- “Emanuel Swedenborg and the Kabbalistic Tradition,” in *Ésotérisme, Gnozes & Imaginaire Symbolique: Mélanges offerts à Antoine Faivre* [= GNOSTICA 3], eds. Richard Caron, Joscelyn Godwin, Wouter J Hanegraaff, and Jean-Louis Viellard-Baron (Leuven: Peeters, 2001).

Cagliostro (born Giuseppe Balsamo) is treated as either an occult genius or a charlatan. On his life and works, see (listed chronologically)

- [Barberi?]. *The Life of Joseph Balsamo, Commonly Called Count Cagliostro* (London: C. and G. Kearsley, 1791).
- Trowbridge, W. R. H. *Cagliostro (Savant or Scoundrel): The Splendor and Misery of a Master of Magic* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1910; rpt New Hyde Park: University Books, 1961)
- King, Frank. *Cagliostro, the Last of the Sorcerers: A Portrait* (London: Jarrolds Publishers, [n.d. – ca. 1929]; rpt. 1961).
- Evans, Henry Ridgely. *Cagliostro: A Sorcerer of the Eighteenth Century* (New York: The Masonic Bibliophiles, 1931).
- _____. “Cagliostro and His Egyptian Rite of Freemasonry...,” (from *New Age Magazine*, 1919; rpt Edmonds: Sure Fire Press, 1994, and Kessinger Publishing, 2007)
- Waite, Arthur Edward. *A New Encyclopedia of Freemasonry...* (London, Rider & Co., 1923; rpt, New Hyde Park: University Books, 1970): pp. 89-99
- Shirley, Ralph. *Occultists & Mystics of All Ages* (New Hyde Park: University Books, 1972): CHAPTER 6
- Godwin, *Theosophical Enlightenment* (noted above), pp. 97-101
- McCalman, Iain. *The Last Alchemist: Count Cagliostro, Master of Magic in the Age of Reason* (Scranton: HarperCollins, 2003).
- Faulks, Philippa and Cooper, Robert L. D. *The Magical Mason: The Life and Death of Count Cagliostro and His Egyptian Rite* (London: Watkins Publishing, 2008).

WILLIAM BLAKE (1757-1827)

If we follow this line of Cabalists, Swedenborgians, and Freemasons, we eventually trip over William Blake, who, as we have seen, is discussed in Marsha Keith Schuchard's dissertation. See also Schuchard's articles:

- "The Secret Masonic History of Blake's Swedenborg Society," in *Blake: An Illustrated Quarterly*, vol. 26, no. 2 (1992)
- "Blake and the Grand Masters (1791-4): Architects of Repression or Revolution?" in *Blake in the Nineties*, eds. Steve Clark and David Worrall (London – New York: Macmillan Press Ltd / St. Martins Press, Inc., 1999)
- "Why Mrs. Blake Cried: Blake, Swedenborg, and the Sexual Basis of Spiritual Vision," in *Esoterica: The Journal of Esoteric Studies*, Volume II, ed. Arthur Versluis (2000, on-line at www.esoteric.msu.edu/VolumeII/BlakeFull.html).
"Why Mrs. Blake Cried..." was immensely expanded—and then, I've been informed, somewhat reduced—into a most intriguing book: *Why Mrs. Blake Cried: William Blake and the Sexual Basis of Spiritual Vision* (London: Century, 2006); released in the US as *William Blake's Sexual Path to Spiritual Vision* (Rochester [VT]: Inner Traditions, 2008).
- "William Blake and the Jewish Swedenborgians," in *The Jews and British Romanticism: Politics, Religion, Culture*, ed. Sheila A. Spector (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005)
- "William Blake, George Cumberland, and the Visionary Art of Exotic Erotica," in *Esotericism, Art, and Imagination*, eds. Arthur Versluis, Lee Irwin, John Richards, and Melinda Weinstein (East Lansing: Michigan State University, 2008).

Further on Blake and Swedenborg, find the collection of articles eds. Harvey F. Bellin and Darrell Ruhl: *Blake and Swedenborg: Opposition Is True Friendship, The Sources of William Blake's Arts in the Writings of Emanuel Swedenborg* (New York: Swedenborg Foundation Inc., 1985); Robert Rix's article, "William Blake and the Radical Swedenborgians," on-line at *Esoterica* (www.esoteric.msu.edu), Volume V (2003); and Joseph Viscomi's piece, "In the Caves of Heaven and Hell: Swedenborg and Printmaking in Blake's *Marriage*," in *Blake in the Nineties*, eds. Steve Clark and David Worrall (Hampshire & London: Macmillan Press Ltd / New York: St. Martin's Press, Inc., 1999).

Alas, one can sift through the daunting tonnage of Blake studies and find scant mention of *kabbalah/cabala*, even where it is acknowledged that esoteric currents are reflected in Blake's work. Thus, most welcome is the recent study of the influence of *kabbalah/cabala* on Blake: Sheila Spector's well-illustrated companion volumes "*Wonders Divine*": *The Development of Blake's Kabbalistic Myth* AND "*Glorious Incomprehensible*": *The Development of Blake's Kabbalistic Language* (Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2001). (See my full-length review of Spector's volumes on Blake in ADDENDUM F below, at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>, and at *Esoterica: A peer-reviewed academic journal ...*, Vol. V, ed. Arthur Versluis (East Lansing: Michigan State University, 2003) at www.esoteric.msu.edu/VolumeV/Reviews/Spector.html.)

Spector writes ("*Wonders Divine*," p. 25)

...even though he [Blake] explicitly, often even emphatically, rejected many aspects of what might be called normative Christianity, he still found himself trapped within what had become the oppressive archetypal framework he repudiated, and it was only through a concerted life-long effort, first to recognize the bonds, and then, to seek out alternate modes of thought, that Blake was able, finally, to create his own system. But that new system, contrary to popular belief, was not an original creation. Rather, when Blake finally liberated himself from the exoteric myth structure that dominates Western thought, he turned to

its esoteric counterpart, the myth that, though originating with Jewish mystics, had been adapted by Christian Kabbalists to conform with their—and, in fact, with Blake’s—own brand of Christianity.

Spector has published a number of articles:

- “Kabbalistic Sources—Blake’s and His Critics’,” in *Blake: An Illustrated Quarterly* 67, volume 17, number 3 (Winter 1983-84), an extremely useful article which contains
 - (1) a review of scholars who broach the issue of *kabbalah* in connection with Blake;
 - (2) a discussion of the problems surrounding the scholarly approach to *kabbalah* itself;
 - (3) a survey of sources of *kabbalah* which could have been available to Blake.
- “The Reasons for ‘Urizen’” in *Blake: An Illustrated Quarterly* 21, no. 4 (Spring 1988);
- “Hebraic Etymologies of Proper Names in Blake” in *Philological Quarterly* 67, no. 3 (Summer 1988).
- “Sources and Etymologies of Blake’s ‘Tirzah’” in *Blake: An Illustrated Quarterly* 23, no. 4 (Spring 1990).
- “Blake as an Eighteenth-Century Hebraist” in *Blake and His Bibles*, ed. David V. Erdman [LOCUST HILL LITERARY STUDIES, No. 1] (West Cornwall: Locust Hill Press, 1990).
- “Blake’s *Milton* as Kabbalistic Vision” in *Religion and Literature* 25, no 1 (Spring 1993).

In *Blake: An Illustrated Quarterly* 46 (volume 12, number 2 [Fall 1978], an issue which focuses on *The Four Zoas*, a long poem among Blake’s “major prophecies”) see Terrence Allan Hoagwood’s article, “*The Four Zoas* and “The Philosophick Cabbala.”” Hoagwood writes (p. 87):

“The Philosophick Cabbala,” part of [Henry] More’s retelling of the fall of man as narrated in the Book of Genesis, bears close resemblance in many points to Blake’s retelling of the fall of man in *The Four Zoas*.

I have seen two other book-length treatments of Blake’s *kabbalah*:

- (1) Laura DeWitt James, *William Blake: The Finger on the Furnace* (New York: Vantage Press, 1956), which “is the result of ten years of intensive research on the interpretation of Blake’s didactic and symbolical works.” James writes (p. 62)

So it is with the underlying pattern of Blake’s Prophetic and Symbolic Poems. It is surprisingly harmonious with qabalistic lore; and anyone familiar with that basic pattern can supply many a missing piece. In fact some of the most subtle points will never yield their hidden meanings without those shadowy outlines to connect the pieces that are given.

- (2) Clay Mathew Bowman’s M.A. paper, THE DIVINE FAMILY IN BLAKE’S “THE FOUR ZOAS”: A COMPARISON OF THE DIVINE FAMILY MOTIF IN BLAKE AND THE KABBALAH (Houston: University of Houston, 1987).

I have not seen Dena Donna Cheryl Taylor’s EMANATIONS OF THE DIVINE: KABBALISTIC ELEMENTS IN THE POETRY AND DESIGNS OF WILLIAM BLAKE (Ph.D. dissertation, Toronto: University of Toronto, 1983).

Then, there is Asloob Ahmad Ansari’s article, “Blake and the Kabbalah,” in *William Blake: Essays for S. Foster Damon*, ed. Alvin H. Rosenfeld (Providence: Brown University Press, 1969). Neither the Bowman nor the Ansari, however, is as useful as the works by Schuchard and Spector listed above, or the James title listed here.

Refer also to Jos van Meurs’ deft “William Blake and His Gnostic Myths,” in *Gnosis and Hermeticism from Antiquity to Modern Times*, eds. Roelof van den Brock and Wouter J. Hanegraaff (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1998). This article emphasizes Böhme as a major influence on Blake—an influence acknowledged by Blake himself.

Online via Amazon Digital Service is a Kindle edition of Daniel Buchanan's 11-page *Blake's Kabbalistic Influences: A Practical Application of the Sacred Tree of Life* ([n.p.]: Magic Beanstalk Publishing House, 2013).

Finally, we have "*Wheels within Wheels*": *William Blake and the Ezekiel's Merkabah in Text and Image* [THE PÈRE MARQUETTE LECTURE IN THEOLOGY 2007] (Milwaukee: Marquette University Press, 2007) by Christopher Rowland. Rowland intrigues us with references to "thirty years of studying Jewish mysticism" (that is, by the theology department at Marquette) and *ma'aseh merkabab* in his opening section, but he then somehow gets from antique apocalyptic to Blake without mentioning *kabbalah* at all. After Spector's substantial description of Blake's amalgam of Lurianic *kabbalah*, van Helmont's *cabala*, and *merkabab*, Rowland's lecture is something of an anticlimax.

GEORG WILHELM FRIEDRICH HEGEL (1770-1831)

Bound to the esoteric stream is Hegel, who drew upon Böhme, Ramon Lull and other *Pansophists*, e.g., Fludd, Comenius, Leibniz), and Lurianic *kabbalah* by way of *Kabbala denudata* and F. C. Oetinger. All of this is very efficiently discussed in *Hegel and the Hermetic Tradition* by Glenn Alexander Magee (Ithaca – London: Cornell University Press: 2001); see in particular CHAPTER FIVE: "The Kabbalistic Tree: *The Science of Logic*" and CHAPTER SEVEN, § 3. "Hegel's Philosophy of History: The Influence of Isaac Luria and Jewish Eschatology." See also Magee's article, "Hegel's Philosophy of History and Kabbalist Eschatology," in *Hegel and History*, ed. Will Dudley (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2009).

Online, see G. W. F. Hegel, "Kabbalah and Gnosticism" [an excerpt from Hegel's LECTURES ON THE HISTORY OF PHILOSOPHY, translated from Hegel's *Vorlesungen über die Geschichte der Philosophie ii*, (Theorie Werkausgabe, Bd. 19), Frankfurt a.M., Suhrkamp Verlag, 1977, 426-430]; translation and notes by Scott J. Thompson at http://www.wbenjamin.org/hegel_kabbalah.html#fn3.

W. B. YEATS (1865-1939)

With William Butler Yeats, we are getting ahead of ourselves. However, following the broad outlines of esoteric—if not purely (or *really*) kabbalistic—developments described above (§§ THE 'UNKNOWN SUPERIORS' and WILLIAM BLAKE), the formula SWEDENBORG → BLAKE → YEATS could be advanced.

In Kathleen Raine's words (quoted on the end flap of her *W. B. Yeats & the Learning of the Imagination* [Dallas: Dallas Institute Publications, 1999]),

Yeats did not possess Swedenborg's psychic gift, nor Blake's soaring imaginative vision. States of expanded consciousness came to him seldom, and then through magical techniques, mediumship, and other aids towards opening of the mind. Yeats was, one might say, a scientific investigator, but winged by that attitude of imaginative assent which serves to create the reality towards which it is directed—nothing less than the building of worlds—the heaven's and the earth's—the soul inhabits.

In other words, Yeats, according to Raine, was something of a *wannabe*, though not without insight

and interesting connections. See Raine's *Yeats the Initiate: Essays on Certain Themes in the Work of W. B. Yeats* (Mountrath, Portlaoise: The Dolmen Press/London: George Allen & Unwin Limited, 1986), especially CHAPTER 5, "Yeats's Debt to Blake," CHAPTER 6, "From Blake to *A Vision*," CHAPTER 7, "Yeats, the Tarot and the Golden Dawn," CHAPTER 8, "Death-in-Life and Life-in-Death," and CHAPTER 9, "Blake, Yeats, and Pythagoras."

In AS ABOVE, SO BELOW: YEATS, CROWLEY, AND QABALAH (Ph.D. dissertation, Binghamton: State University of New York, 1996), Charles Nicholas Serra II, offers the thesis, "...if one comes to Yeats's texts with an understanding of Qabalah in application (*via* Crowley) then one should be able to reconstruct Yeats's deliberately fragmented overstructure or didactic message" (—p. v). Refer also to Serra's MA thesis, A REEVALUATION OF THE LITERARY WORKS OF EDWARD ALEXANDER (ALEISTER) CROWLEY (Des Moines: Drake University, 1991), Section One: "Yeats and the Golden Dawn."

Further on Yeats:

- Bachchan, Harbans Rai. *W. B. Yeats and Occultism: A Study of His Works in Relation to Indian Lore, the Cabbala, Swedenborg and Theosophy* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1965).
- Graf, Susan Johnston. *W. B. Yeats—Twentieth-Century Magus* (York Beach: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 2000).
"An in-depth study of Yeats' esoteric practices and beliefs, including excerpts from his Magical Diaries."
- Leavitt, June. *Esoteric Symbols: The Tarot in Yeats, Eliot, and Kafka* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2007).
- Mills, George Harper. *Yeats's Golden Dawn* (London: Macmillan/New York: Harper & Row, 1974).
- Timmermann, Anke. "Pictures passing before the mind's eye: The Tarot, the Order of the Golden Dawn, and William Butler Yeats's Poetry," in *Societas Magica Newsletter*, Issue 15, Spring 2006—online at <http://www.societasmagica.org/>

Part 2¹

THE NINETEENTH CENTURY opened with the production of a book which is, for the most part, an unacknowledged copy of Agrippa's *De occulta philosophia* and the pseudo-Agrippan *Fourth Book*, along with material from *The Heptameron* (attributed to Peter of Abano), Giambattista della Porta's *Magia naturalis*, and other sources—namely, Francis Barrett's tome, *The Magus, or Celestial Intelligencer* (London: 1801). While no great school accumulated around Barrett that we know of, his book inaugurated an era of renewed interest in medieval and Hermetic-Cabalist magic, which seems to have been as uncritically accepted in the early 1800s as it had been in the Renaissance.

Several reprints of *The Magus* have gone to press in the last several decades, such as the 1967 edition of University Books (New Hyde Park), the once ubiquitous 1975 oversize green-covered paperback of Citadel Press (Secaucus), and the Samuel Weiser reprint (York Beach: 2000) which includes full-color reproductions of the plates. *The Magus* can also be viewed on-line at the SACRED TEXTS site: www.sacred-texts.com/grim/magus/.

The always readable Francis X King (*aka* Francis King) composed a slim book about Barrett, *The Flying Sorcerer* (Oxford: Mandrake, 1992), based on the rather limited documentation concerning his being a daring, though failure-prone, experimental balloonist as well as a plagiarizing occultist; appended is “Barrett's Hitherto Unpublished Skrying Manuscript.” For another account—indeed, a defense—of Barrett, see “Beyond Attribution: The Importance of Barrett's *Magus*,” which constitutes CHAPTER TWO of THE REVIVAL OF THE OCCULT PHILOSOPHY: CABALISTIC MAGIC AND THE HERMETIC ORDER OF THE GOLDEN DAWN, Alison L. Butler's M.A. thesis from St. John's Memorial University of Newfoundland (2000); a trimmed version of this chapter appears as the lead article in *The Journal for the Academic Study of Magic*, Issue 1 (Oxford: Mandrake, 2003).²

Other accounts of Barrett can be found in Christopher McIntosh's book, *The Devil's Bookshelf* (Wellingborough: The Aquarian Press, 1985—CHAPTER 13, “Magic in the Nineteenth Century”), and Joscelyn Godwin's *Theosophical Enlightenment* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1994—CHAPTER SIX, “Neophytes and Initiates”).

When the nineteenth century was about at its midpoint, there began a fairly steady stream of European works on *kabbalah* and *cabala*. Some of these were serious, even if not entirely successful, attempts to present the Jewish *kabbalah* on its own terms, such as the works of Adolphe Franck, C. D. Ginsburg, and A. E. Waite. Others knotted together various Christianized strands, adorning them with other doctrines and currents, as did Éliphas Lévi, H. P. Blavatsky, Papus, the founders of the Hermetic Order of the Golden Dawn, and Golden Dawn member Aleister Crowley. Some notable

¹ It would be profitable to compare my listings with those in Sheila Spector's *Jewish Mysticism: An Annotated Bibliography on Kabbalah in English* (New York – London: Garland Publishing, 1984), § O: “Non-Jewish Kabbalah,” pp. 309-357.

The first division of § O, “Primary Sources,” begins with “J.F.'s” 1651 translation of Agrippa's *De occulta philosophia*; ironically, the second division, “Secondary Sources,” begins with Francis Barrett's *Magus* (1801). Spector's listings go through 1983. She includes—and comments on—quite a few items not given notice in my paper:

- 19th- and early 20th-century books which touch upon *kabbalah*, or *cabala*, briefly or incidentally, like William Story's *Proportions of the Human Figure...* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1866) and George Alexander Kohut's *Ezra Stiles and the Jews* (New York: Philip Cowen, 1902).
- works which I have never encountered, for example Laurel Miller's *Kabbalistic Numerology* (New York: Metaphysical Publishing House, 1921) and F. Schneider Schwartz' *True Mysteries of Life: The Psychology of the Bible, the Kabbalah, and the Dead Sea Scrolls* (New York: Vantage Press, 1957).
- 19th- and 20th-century articles.

² Now see Butler's book, *Victorian Occultism and the Making of Modern Magic: Invoking Tradition* [PALGRAVE HISTORICAL STUDIES IN WITCHCRAFT AND MAGIC] (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan Ltd., 2011); on *The Magus*, pp. 102-108.

authors apparently had Masonic agenda, like Albert Pike, Ralston Skinner, and co-authors Bond and Lea. Works from this array remain the basis of *kabbalah/cabala* study among great numbers of (primarily Christian) esoteric readers and researchers—even today—often pointedly in spite of the contributions of Jewish and Christian scholars of the last hundred years.

This period is quite thoroughly treated in *Magi and Maggidim: The Kabbalah in British Occultism, 1860-1940*, by Liz Greene (Ceredigion: Sophia Centre Press, 2012).

What follows here is a selection of books from the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries which treat *kabbalah/cabala* and were written in English or have been translated into English. These are given in roughly chronological order; the bold italicized dates in the left margin generally indicate the first edition of the earliest—if not the only—work listed by each writer noted.

1819

Enfield, William. *The History of Philosophy FROM THE EARLIEST TIMES TO THE BEGINNING OF THE PRESENT CENTURY: DRAWN UP FROM Brucker's Historia Critica Philosophiæ, IN TWO VOLUMES.* London: Printed by J. F. Dove, St. John's-Square; FOR WILLIAM BAYNES, PATERNOSTER-ROW; AND R. PRIESTLEY, HOLBORN, 1819.

Discussion of “Cabbalah” woven into a chapter on Jewish philosophy appears in VOLUME II, Book IV; see in particular chap. III, “OF THE JEWISH PHILOSOPHY, EXOTERIC AND CABBALISTIC,” pp. 191-206.

“The Jews pretend to derive their Cabbala from Esdras, Moses, Abraham, and Adam : but it is very evident from the Cabbalistic doctrine concerning Divine emanations...that it originated in Egypt, where the Jews learned, by the help of allegory, to mix Oriental, Pythagoric, and Platonic dogmas with Hebrew wisdom.” (VOLUME II, p. 184)

1843

Franck, Adolphe. *The Kabbalah: Religious Philosophy of the Hebrews.* French original, 1843; German translation by A. Jellinek, 1844; English translation by I. Sossnitz, New York: The Kabbalah Publishing Company, 1909, rpt 1926; abridged English edition, New York: Bell Publishing Company, 1940.

Despite his errors, Franck still commands a fair amount of regard. As noted by Moshe Idel (*Kabbalah: New Perspectives* [New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988]: pp. 7-10) some of Franck's conclusions bear notable similarities to those of Gershom Scholem, most importantly that *kabbalah* was a vital force at the “heart and soul” of Judaism, not the aberrant and heretical sideshoot which historians such as Heinrich Grätz and other “enlightened” scholars of the nineteenth century thought it was. Franck brought to a common modern language (French—and a year later Adolph Jellinek put Franck's *Kabbalah* into German) a reasoned account of *kabbalah* with informed descriptions of *Sefer Yezirah* and the *Zohar*.

Franck's major error was finding in Zoroastrian lore the source of kabbalistic concepts. His mistakes notwithstanding, Franck's serious attempt to present the *kabbalah* from its own sources stands in marked contrast with another French writer who began to publish some dozen years later: Éliphas Lévi, who took every liberty his imagination could conceive in presenting *kabbalah/cabala* and other esoteric subjects.

See Wouter J. Hanegraaff, “The Beginnings of Occultist Kabbalah: Adolphe Franck and Éliphas Lévi,” in *Kabbalah and Modernity: Interpretations, Transformations, Adaptations*, eds. Boaz Huss, Marco Pasi, and Kocku von Stuckrad [ARIES BOOK SERIES: TEXTS AND STUDIES IN WESTERN MYSTICISM/10] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2010).

Lévi, Éliphas. *The Book of Splendours. The Inner Mysteries of Qabalism (Its Relationship to Freemasonry, Numerology and Tarot)*, French original, 1894; English translation, Wellingborough: The Aquarian Press and New York: Samuel Weiser, 1973.

The Book of Splendours contains a compacted paraphrase of *Idra Rabba* from the *Zohar* (though Lévi refers to it as “The Idra Suta”) and the oft-reprinted short piece, “The Elements of the Qabalah in Ten Lessons: The Letters of Éliphas Lévi” (1891), which also appears in Papus’ *Qabalah* (listed below), and independently as *The Elements of the Kabbalah in Ten Lessons*, ed. Darcy Kuntz [GOLDEN DAWN SERIES 13] (Edmonds: Holmes Publishing Group, 1997).

_____. *The Great Secret. Lessons on the Mysteries of Occultism, including Magnetism, Astral Emanations, Divination and Creative Omnipotence.* French original, 1868; English translation, Thorsons Publishers Ltd, 1975; rpt. Wellingborough: The Aquarian Press and New York: Samuel Weiser, 1981.

_____. *The History of Magic.* French original, 1860; English translation by A. E. Waite, London: William Rider and Son Ltd, 1913; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1969.

_____. *The Key of the Mysteries.* French original, 1861; English translation by Aleister Crowley in *The Equinox*, vol. 1, no. 10 London: (Marshall, Simpkin) 1913; republished London: Rider 1959; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1970.

_____. *The Mysteries of the Qabalah.* Part One: Commentary on Ezekiel; Part Two: The Apocalypse of St. John as the Key to the High Qabalah. First published, 1920; English translation, New York: Samuel Weiser, 1974.

1855-6 _____. *Transcendental Magic.* French original in two parts: 1. *The Doctrine of Transcendental Magic* (1855); 2. *The Ritual of Transcendental Magic* (1856). English translation by A. E. Waite, London: George Redway, 1896; revised and enlarged edition (Waite), London: William Rider and Son Ltd, 1923; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1974.

Lévi’s works are eloquent, fascinating—and highly influential—mayhem. On Lévi and his milieu (works listed chronologically):

- McIntosh, Christopher. *Éliphas Lévi and the French Occult Revival* (London: Rider Publishers, 1972; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1975)
- Williams, Thomas A. *Éliphas Lévi: Master of Occultism* (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 1975).
- Uzzel, Robert Lesley. THE KABBALISTIC THOUGHT OF ÉLIPHAS LÉVI AND ITS INFLUENCE ON MODERN OCCULTISM IN AMERICA (Ph.D. dissertation, Waco: Baylor University, 1995), subsequently enhanced with photographs and published as *Éliphas Lévi and the Kabbalah: The Masonic and French Connection of the American Mystery Tradition* (Lafayette: Cornerstone Book Publishers, 2006).
- Wilkinson, Lynn R. “Politics, Magic, and Language: Swedenborgianism in the works of Alphonse-Louis Constant, a.k.a. Éliphas Lévi,” in Wilkinson’s *Dream of an Absolute Language: Emanuel Swedenborg & French Literary Culture* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996).
- Hanegraaff, Wouter J. “The Beginnings of Occultist Kabbalah: Adolphe Franck and Éliphas Lévi,” in *Kabbalah and Modernity*—noted above.

Etheridge, J[ohn] W[esley]. *Jerusalem and Tiberias; Sora and Cordova: A SURVEY OF THE RELIGIOUS AND SCHOLASTIC LEARNING OF THE JEWS; DESIGNED AS AN INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY OF HEBREW LITERATURE.* London: Longman, Brown, Green, and Longmans, 1856: ORDER VII. “Kabalists”

“The disciples of the Tanaim and Amoraim, as we have seen, hold by tradition. The Karaites maintain the sole authority of the written word. Between these two there is also an intermediate class, who do not

constitute a corporate sect, and who are orthodox in their belief of the verities of the Hebrew Scriptures and of the great facts of tradition, but who claim at the same time the right of rationalizing upon them. They are represented by such writers as Saadja Gaon, Bachja, and Maimonides. But in addition to these, there has been always for the last two thousand years a mystical school, more or less numerous, who have treated the written word as the symbolic vehicle of an esoteric doctrine. This school may be said to consist of two classes. 1. Those with whom that interior spiritual signification shapes itself into a philosophical system, which they nevertheless hold either from, or in connexion with, a foreign or Gentile teaching, such as Platonism. Their representative is Philo. They blend the Mosaic law with the Gentile monotheism. 2. The other class are the KABBALISTS, properly so called, who, from the impulse of the mind after a deep and satisfying knowledge of the inmost mysteries of being, have given themselves up too much to the tutelage of the imagination, and constructed a system which combines, at once, the sublime and the despicable.” (*Jerusalem and Tiberias*, pp. 296-7)

1863

Ginsburg, Christian D. *Kabbalah: Its Doctrines, Development and Literature*. London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1863; London: G. Routledge and Sons, 1864; rpt. with *The Essenes*, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1956; rpt. Santa Fe: Sun Books, 1993.

One might assume that Ginsburg was a sympathetic commentator, for he outlined the traditional history of the *kabbalah* “as told by its followers”; but obliquely in this book and more openly in subsequent articles, Ginsburg showed his hostility toward *kabbalah* to be equal to—and perhaps derived from—Grätz’s. In an article which Ginsburg co-wrote with S. A. Cook, there is a reference to the *Zohar* as “that farrago of absurdity.” Ginsburg considered the *Zohar* a fraud perpetrated by Moses de Leon. Even so, Ginsburg’s *Kabbalah* gives an admirable account of its subject. This book is, in form, an expanded outline, so its manner is somewhat clipped, though dense with information. There are lots of biblical and *Zoharic* references, and great detail on such topics as the 72 names of God and the hermeneutical conventions *gematria*, *notaricon*, and *terumah*.

NOTE: *Gematria*, *notaricon*, and *terumah* predate *kabbalah* by centuries. *Gematria* in particular, which is so often treated as central to the *kabbalah* by Christian commentators, plays only a limited role in such kabbalistic classics as the *Zohar*, the works of Moses Cordovero, and the Lurianic compendia assembled by Hayim Vital. See Scholem’s article, “*Gematria*,” in *Kabbalah* (Jerusalem: Keter Publishing House, 1974; rpt. New York: Dorset Press, 1987), and Dan’s comments in “Christian Kabbalah: From Mysticism to Esotericism,” in *Western Esotericism and the Science of Religion*, eds. A. Faivre and W. Hanegraaff (Leuven: Peeters, 1998: pp. 127-8).

1870

Jennings, Hargrave. *The Rosicrucians, Their Rites and Mysteries*. London: J. C. Hotten, 1870; 2nd edition, London: Chatto, 1879; 3rd edition—in two volumes, London: John C. Nimmo, 1887; rpt. Mokolunne Hill: Health Research, 1966.

Jennings says of *The Rosicrucians*, “[I]his whole Book is but the translation and exposition of his highly-prized and very scarce works ... our own countryman, Robert Flood or Fludd (Robertus de Fluctibus), the famous physician and philosopher (1574-1637)” (—PREFACE TO THE SECOND EDITION, p. xi. See also VOLUME II [3rd edition], Chapter the Twenty-First, “Remarks Relating to the Great Mystic—Robert ‘de Fluctibus’”—p. 235 ff).

Jennings’ ranging—or rambling—survey of symbols, concepts, and myths never quite gets to Rosicrucian rites as such. A cabalistic undercurrent courses through these volumes. Focused treatment of *cabala* appears in the final chapters of the second volume (3rd edition): Chapter the Twenty-Third, “The Outline of the Cabala, or Kabbalah,” and Chapter the Twenty-Fourth, “Cabalistic Profundities.” Extracts from

Kabbala denudata are included—in Latin though. (One gets to brush up on one’s French in Chapter the Fourteenth.)

The *sacred fire* is at the core of Jennings’ mysteries; he saw its most blatant symbol in just about everything higher than wide. *Rosicrucians...* and Jennings’ other books served as source-works for the Hermetic Brotherhood of Luxor and Mme. Blavatsky. (Indeed, in *Women of the Golden Dawn* [Rochester: Park Street Press, 1995], Mary K. Greer includes Jennings’ *Rosicrucians...* on her “Timeline of Western Magic” [pp. 60-61] at 1870, between Éliphas Lévi’s *Dogma and Ritual of High Magic* [1854] and Mme. Blavatsky’s *Isis Unveiled* [1877]. Oddly, nothing of Jennings’ is included in the expanded timeline, *The Chronology of the Golden Dawn*, by Mary Greer and Darcy Kuntz [GOLDEN DAWN SERIES #10], Edmonds: Holmes Publishing Group, 1999.)

For accounts of Jennings, see Joscelyn Godwin’s *Theosophical Enlightenment* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1994), pp. 261-275, Godwin’s article, “Hargrave Jennings,” in *The Hermetic Journal* 1991, ed. Adam McLean (London: Hermetic Research Trust), pp. 49-77; and VOLUME III of R. Swinburne Clymer’s *Book of Rosicruciae* (Quakertown: Philosophical Publishing Company, 1949), pp. 60-66.

On the Internet, see the 1995 (© Ordo Templi Orientis) biographical sketch at THE HERMETIC LIBRARY > *The Invisible Basilica of Sabazius*, www.hermetic.com/sabazius/jennings.htm.

1871

Pike, Albert. *Morals and Dogma of the Ancient and Accepted Scottish Rite of Freemasonry*. 1871; copyright Supreme Council of the Southern Jurisdiction: 1906; rpt. Charleston: L. H. Jenkins, 1949.

Pike steepens his descriptions of Masonic grades in *kabbalah/cabala* and other esoteria. Already on page 15, the 1st degree Apprentice is told, “...you must open the pages of the Sohar (i.e., *Zohar*) and Siphre de Zeniutha, and other kabbalistic books, and ponder deeply on their meaning.” From there on, the book is quite full of kabbalistic references and passages. Unfortunately, the bulk of these were lifted from one of the most unreliable sources: Éliphas Lévi, whom Pike quotes freely without acknowledgement. (See “Lévi’s Kabbalistic Thought in America: Albert Pike,” in Uzzel, *THE KABBALISTIC THOUGHT OF ÉLIPHAS LÉVI ... = Éliphas Lévi and the Kabbalah*, noted above: “Lévi —1855-6.”)

Pike also borrows from Adolphe Franck: On page 256 of *Morals and Dogma*, Pike writes of Jewish families who had familiarized themselves with the doctrine of Zoroaster and, subsequently, developed those parts which could be reconciled with their faith; this sounds like Franck’s conclusion regarding the “traces that the religion of Zoroaster has left in all parts of Judaism,” stating later that “this borrowing did not destroy the originality of the Kabbalah,” for it was reconciled with the Jews’ concept of “the unity of cause” (Franck, *Kabbalah*, Bell edition, p. 224).

Pike also makes numerous references to works which appear in Knorr von Rosenroth’s *Kabbala denudata*.

See James T. [Jim] Tresner II, *Albert Pike: The Man Behind the Monument* [SCOTTISH RITE RESEARCH SOCIETY] (New York: M. Evans and Company, 1995).

1872

Greene, William B. *The Blazing Star; with an appendix treating of the Jewish Kabbala, also a tract on the Philosophy of Mr. Herbert Spencer and one on New-England Transcendentalism*. Boston: A. Williams and Co., 1872; rpt without the tracts on Spencer and Transcendentalism: *The Blazing Star and the Jewish Kabbalah*, with a foreword by R. A. Gilbert, Berwick: Ibis Press [Nicolas-Hays, Inc.], 2003.

An unusual, albeit engaging, take on *kabbalah* emerging from a mixture of the French occult scene around Éliphas Lévi, Freemasonry, and New England Transcendentalism (1830s-60s), which included Ralph Waldo Emerson, Henry Thoreau, and early feminist Margaret Fuller.

1873

Mackey, Albert G. *An Encyclopedia of Freemasonry and Its Kindred Sources, Comprising the Whole Range of Arts, Sciences and Literature as Connected with the Institution.* Philadelphia: Moss and Co., 1873 and 1878; revised edition, Philadelphia: L. H. Everts and Co., 1894; reprint Kilo: Kessinger, n.d.

Mackey includes a fairly substantial article on *kabbalah* (vol. 1, pp. 439-443 of the Kessinger edition) apparently derived from C. D. Ginsburg.

1875

Skinner, Ralston. *Key to the Hebrew Egyptian Mystery in the Source of Measures with Supplement.* 1875-76; rpt. Philadelphia: 1910; rpt. San Diego: Wizards Bookshelf, 1972.

Originally published as installments in *Masonic Review*, Skinner's book "constitutes a series of developments, based upon the use of geometrical elements, giving expression in a numerical value. These elements are found in the work of the late John A. Parker...setting forth *his* discovery (but, in fact, the rediscovery) of the quadrature value of the circle" (p. 1). The "geometrical elements," measures, and numbers are drawn mainly from the Great Pyramid and the Old Testament. Wizards Bookshelf, the reissuer of Skinner's *Key*, refers to it as "the most esoteric work we sell."

1877

Blavatsky, H. P. *Isis Unveiled: A Master-Key to the Mysteries of Ancient and Modern Science and Theology*, 2 volumes. New York: Bouton, 1877; reprinted often.

_____. *The Secret Doctrine: The Synthesis of Science, Religion and Philosophy.* 2 volumes (standard) or 5 volumes ("Adyar" edition). London: Theosophical Publication Society, 1888; reprinted often.

_____. "The Kabbalah and the Kabbalists at the Close of the Nineteenth Century," and "Tetragrammaton" in *Kabbalah and Kabbalism*, 1881-92, rpt., Los Angeles: The Theosophy Company, n.d.

The two articles from *Kabbalah and Kabbalism* are reprinted in *Zohar* by Nurho de Manhar [San Diego: Wizards Bookshelf, 1978] pp. 396-424 (see below). The other articles in *Kabbalah and Kabbalism* are "Isis Unveiled and the Visishtadwaita," "Stray Thoughts on Death and Satan," and "A Posthumous Publication."

Where were the builders, the luminous sons of Manvantaric dawn? ... In the unknown darkness in their Ahhi Paranishpanna. The producers of form from no form—the root of the world—the Devamatri and Svabhavat, rested in the bliss of non-being.

(*Book of Dzryan*, Stanza II, § 1)

Throughout the compendious works of Mme. Blavatsky (hereafter HPB), *Isis Unveiled* and *The Secret Doctrine*, are numerous references to *kabbalah*, and some passages which deal at length with kabbalistic doctrine. But in the collection of articles published together as *Kabbalah and Kabbalism*, HPB made it most clear that she believed that

1. "Kabbalah" was inferior to "our (Eastern) septenary system";
2. kabbalistic writings had "all suffered corruptions in their content by sectarian editors";
3. there was "evidence of occult knowledge in the West," even though HPB saw fit to expose "[*kabbalah's*] limitations" and point to "the misleading character of Kabbalistic symbolism."

With all of this, HPB claimed to be restoring the true meaning of kabbalistic doctrine according to Chaldean originals known to her—and only to her. She did condescend to say that "the Jews can claim the Zohar, Sepher Yetzirah, Sepher Dzeniuta and a few others, as their own undeniable property and as Kabbalistic works," referring to the *Zohar* and *Sifre Detzeniuuta* as if they were separate works. HPB's attitude would raise eyebrows had she been the all-knowing scholar that she claimed to be. However, these

statements come from one whose references to *kabbalah* are shot through with serious errors and misunderstandings. HPB had but a cursory knowledge of the subject, and that from easily traceable sources.

For our own part we regard her neither as the mouthpiece of hidden seers, nor as a mere vulgar adventuress; we think that she has achieved a title to permanent remembrance as one of the most accomplished, ingenious, and interesting impostors in history.

(Society for Psychological Research: 1883, report)

Gershom Scholem writes (*Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism*, pp. 398-9)

There can be little doubt in my opinion that the famous stanzas of the mysterious Book Dzyan on which Mme. H. P. Blavatsky's *magnum opus*, *The Secret Doctrine*, is based owe something, both in title and content, to the pompous pages of the Zoharic writing called *Sifra Di-Tseniutha*. The first to advance this theory, without further proof, was L. A. Bosman, a Jewish Theosophist, in his booklet *The Mysteries of the Qabalah* (1916) p. 31. This seems to me, indeed, the true 'etymology' of the hitherto unexplained title. Mme Blavatsky has drawn heavily upon Knorr von Rosenroth's *Kabbala denudata* (1677-1684), which contains (vol. II, pp. 347-385) a Latin translation of the *Sifra Di-Tseniutha*. The solemn and magniloquent style of these pages may well have impressed her susceptible mind. As a matter of fact, H. P. B. herself alludes to such a connection between the two 'books' in the very first lines of *Isis Unveiled* (vol. I, p. 1) where she still refrains from mentioning the *Book Dzyan* by name. But the transcription used by her for the Aramaic title shows clearly what she had in mind. She says: "There exists some-where in this wide world an old Book... It is the only copy now in existence. *The most ancient Hebrew document on occult learning—the Sifra Dzeniuta—was compiled from it.*' The *Book Dzyan* is therefore nothing but an occultistic hypostasy of the Zoharic title. This 'bibliographical' connection between fundamental writings of modern and Jewish theosophy seems remarkable enough.

If one takes a lenient view, HPB's sources could be blamed for the bulk of her errors, for many of these had indeed "suffered corruptions in their content by sectarian editors":

1. from Lull to Pico and Reuchlin to Knorr von Rosenroth, Christian cabalists believed that with kabbalistic methods rightly used, Jews could be shown the "truth" behind the Old Testament and won over to Christ. Indeed, some editions of *Kabbala denudata* concluded with F. M. van Helmont's *Adumbratio Kabbala Christiana*, namely, translating the full title, an *Outline of Christian Cabala which is the Hebraic Conception or Brief Application of Doctrines of Hebrew Cabalists to the Dogma of the New Covenant; to Form a Hypothesis proficient for converting the Jews*.
2. Éliphas Lévi, who "[n]ever made an independent statement upon any historical fact in which the least confidence could be reposed," and who "never presented the sense of an author whom he was reviewing in a way which could be said to reproduce that author faithfully" (Waite, *The Holy Kabbalah*, p. 489).
3. S. L. MacGregor Mathers, who was also dependent upon Rosenroth and Lévi.
4. Isaac Myer, whose earnest study contains many errors, some of which even HPB did not commit, as, for example, Myer's mix-up of the roles and order of the *sefirot*, calling *binah* the second and *hokhmah* the third (Myer, *Qabalah*, pp. 259-63).

But with these sources and others in a similar vein, we cannot account for all of HPB's blunders. She alone refers to the Talmud as the "darkest of enigmas even for most Jews, while those Hebrew scholars who do comprehend it do not boast of their knowledge" (*Isis Unveiled*, vol. I, p. 17), and she is unique in considering *Liber Drushim* as part of that murky Talmud (*The Secret Doctrine*, Adyar edition, vol. 2, p. 156). The nature of the Talmud is well known. As for *Liber Drushim* (= *Sefer ha-Derushim*), it is a sixteenth-century tract of the Lurianic school which HPB undoubtedly encountered in Rosenroth's *Kabbala denudata*. Further, her statements regarding the authorship of the *Zohar*, which are sprinkled through *The Secret Doctrine*, contradict one another, mixing history, legend, and imagination differently with each reference.

1877

Kalisch, Isador. *Sepher Yetzirah. A Book on Creation; or The Jewish Metaphysics of Remote Antiquity*, with English translation, preface, explanatory notes and glossary. New York: L. H. Frank & Co., 1877.

On Kalisch's *Sepher Yetzirah*, see my "Notes on Editions of *Sefer Yetzirah* in English," PART 1: TRANSLATIONS, at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/syie.pdf>.

Pancoast, S[eth]. *The Kabbala: The True Science of Light. An Introduction to the Philosophy and Theosophy of the Ancient Sages, Together with a Chapter on Light in the Vegetable Kingdom.* Philadelphia: J. M. Studdart and Co., 1877; New York: R. Worthington, 1883.

Pancoast makes two remarks in his introduction which, along with his ties with Mme. Blavatsky (as her physician), indicate his perspective:

...the grand old Kabbalistic Theosophy was the native root, the central trunk, whence *all* the religions the world has ever known sprang, as shoots and branches from a parent tree...

...the special purpose of this volume is to promote the well-being of mankind in this probationary world, by advocating Light and its Rays as the best remedial means for the Human Organism, when from any cause, internal or external, the equilibrium of health is disturbed, and disease wastes the body and deranges the mind—nay, even when there is no clearly defined disease, but only feebleness and indisposition for physical and mental effort.

These ideas are bridged in statements such as

Light is the foundation upon which rests the superstructure of the Kabbalistic Theosophy—Light the source and centre of the entire harmonious system. Light was the first-born of God—His first manifestation.

Pancoast combines Kabbalistic Theosophy, the science and medicine of his day with its fascination with magnetism and electricity, and esoteric methods of "assisting nature" with "applications of Light" for the purpose of physical and mental health.

1880

Hershon, Paul Isaac. *A Talmudic Miscellany, or A Thousand and One Extracts from THE TALMUD, THE MIDRASHIM, AND THE KABBALAH.* London: Trübner & Co., Ludgate Hill, 1880.

After some "Preliminary Remarks," CHAPTER XVI, "Extracts from the Kabbalah," gives excerpts, primarily from "An Epitome of the Two Tables of the Covenant," *i.e.*, a summary of Isaiah Horowitz' *Sb'nei Lubot ha Brit*.

1887

Westcott, William Wynn. *Sepher Yetzirah. The Book of Formation and the Thirty-Two Paths of Wisdom.* 1st edition, Bath: Fryar, 1887; 2nd edition, London: Theosophical Publishing Society, 1893; 3rd edition, London: J. M. Watkins, 1911; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser 1975 and Wizards Bookshelf, 1990; so-called 4th edition as #3 of the Golden Dawn Series ed. Darcy Kuntz, Edmonds: Holmes Publication Group, 1996.

On Westcott's *Sepher Yetzirah*, see my "Notes on Editions of *Sefer Yetzirah* in English," PART 1: TRANSLATIONS, at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/syie.pdf>.

_____. *Aesch Mezareph, or the Purifying Fire.* London: Theosophical Publishing Society, 1894; rpt. New York: Occult Research Press, n.d.; rpt. Edmonds: Holmes Publication Group, 1996.

See ADDENDUM C regarding *Aesch Mezareph*, as it appears in *Kabbala denudata*.

_____. *An Introduction to the Study of the Kabbalah*. London: J. M. Watkins, 1910 and 1926; rpt. Kila: Kessinger Publishing, n.d.

One can find nearly identical material in *The Kabbalah of the Golden Dawn* by W.W. Westcott, with a preface by S. L. MacGregor Mathers, ed. Darcy Kuntz [GOLDEN DAWN SERIES 16], Edmonds: Holmes Publishing Group, 1997; and in R. A. Gilbert's edition of Westcott's writings, *The Magical Mason*, Wellingborough: Aquarian Press, 1983.

Westcott's *Introduction...* was highly regarded by occultists of the Golden Dawn strain. Aleister Crowley, in *The Equinox* (vol. 1, no. 5, 1911) writes, "For the student unacquainted with the rudiments of the Qabalah we recommend the study of S. L. M. Mathers' 'Introduction' to his translation of the three principle books of the Zohar, and Westcott's 'Introduction to the Study of the Qabalah.' ... Dr. Westcott's little book is principally valuable for its able defense of the Qabalah as against exotericism and literalism."

Mathers, S[amuel] L[iddell] MacGregor. *The Kabbalah Unveiled*. London: George Redway, 1887; revised edition with a preface by Moina Mathers, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1926; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1968—reprinted frequently.

Mathers is a particularly important figure in that he, with W. W. Westcott, was one of the founders of the Golden Dawn. As author of most of the Golden Dawn rituals and many of its instructions, he was instrumental in laying the groundwork for modern occultism. However, as a translator and commentator in the field of *kabbalah*, he was prey to—and perpetuator of—much misunderstanding and misinformation. An easy way to demonstrate this is to look at a couple of lists which Mathers gives in *The Kabbalah Unveiled*.

On page 14, as the most important kabbalistic books, Mathers lists the following:

- (α) The Sepher Yetzirah and its dependencies.
- (β) The Zohar with its developments and commentaries.
- (γ) The Sepher Sephiroth and its expansions.
- (δ) The Asch Metzareph and its symbolism.

With the first two entries there can be no argument: the *Sefer Yetzirah* and the *Zohar* are two of the most important and influential works in *kabbalah*. But the third and fourth entries simply do not belong. With evidence of Mathers' dependence on Rosenroth, we can fairly assume the "Sepher Sephiroth" refers to the section of *Kabbala denudata* which treats of the unfolding of the tree of the *sefirot*, in outline, then diagrammatic, form based upon Israel Sarug's version of the teachings of Isaac Luria. It is an item of considerable interest, but not one of the canons of *kabbalah*. "Asch Metzareph" (*Esh M'zareph*) is a rather unusual example of the merger of *kabbalah* and alchemy. As such, it is something of a peripheral curiosity, not a central work.

On pages 14 and 15, Mathers gives a list of "the most important books" contained in the *Zohar*:

- (α) The SPRA DTzNIOVThA, Siphra Dtzenioutha, of "Book of Concealed Mystery," which is the root and foundation of the *Zohar*.
- (β) The ADRA RBA QDISHA, Idra Rabba Qadisha, or "Greater Holy Assembly": this is a development of the "Book of Concealed Mystery."
- (γ) The ADRA ZVTA QDISHA, Idra Zuta Qadisha, or "Lesser Holy Assembly"
- (δ) The pneumatical treatise called BITH ALHIM, Beth Elohim, or the "House of Elohim," ...from the doctrines of Rabbi Yitzchaq Loria...
- (ε) The "Book of the Revolutions of Souls"...an expansion of Rabbi Loria's ideas.

It is true that by the time we get to Luria (= Loria), the themes begun in *Sifra Detzeniuta* and the *Idrot* [(β) and (γ)] were considered central to the *Zohar*, but in a purely zoharic context these texts are something of an oddity. Mathers ignored, or was ignorant of, the real core and bulk of the *Zohar*: the running commentary to the Torah. As with the previous list, the last two items simply do not belong. As Mathers even notes, they are Lurianic, which separates them from the *Zohar* by nearly 300 years.

Quite a few subsequent writers have accepted Mathers' lists, especially the first, as authoritative. For instance, Charles Ponce in *Kabbalah* (San Francisco: Straight Arrow Books, 1973), pp. 50-52, includes *Esh Mezaref* in his list, "Other Main Works of Kabbalism." Typical of Ponce, he sets two perfectly viable choices (*Sefer Bahir* and Cordovero's *Pardes Rimmonim*) against two items with no real place on the list (*Esh Mezaref* and *The Thirty-two Paths of Wisdom*). Mme. Blavatsky, too, referred to *Esh Mezaref* as one of the most important books in *kabbalah*. As noted above, she and Mathers both made heavy use of Rosenroth's *Kabbala denudata*.

Mathers' *Kabbalah Unveiled* is an English translation of (α), (β), and (γ) of the second list as rendered from Knorr von Rosenroth's Latin: *Kabbala denudata*. The translation is full of extranea—some Rosenroth's, some Mathers'—so it is hardly a fair representation of these complex texts. I recommend the translation of Roy A. Rosenberg: *The Anatomy of God* (New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1973).

1888

Hartmann (or Hartman), Franz (copyist/translator). *Cosmology, or Cabala. Universal Science. Alchemy. Containing the Mysteries of Nature... by means of The Secret Symbols of the Rosicrucians of the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries*. Boston: Occult Publishing Company, 1888; photographic reproduction, Pomeroy: Health Research, 1996.

The late edition of *Cosmology* presents an 11" x 17" colored-in photocopy of Hartman's translation of the same set of illustrations as "The Secret Symbols of the Rosicrucians," in *A Christian Rosenkreutz Anthology*, compiled and ed. Paul M. Allen (Great Barrington: Rudolph Steiner Publications, 1968 – 1981 – 2000).

Myer, Isaac. *Qabbalah: The Philosophical Writings of Solomon Ben Yehuda Ibn Gebirol...and their connection with the Hebrew Qabbalah and Sefer ha-Zohar*. Philadelphia: published by the author, 1888; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1970; rpt. San Diego: Wizards Bookshelf, 1988.

Myer's book discusses Gebirol's work in relation to the *Zohar* and analyzes his *Mekor Hayim*. The bulk of the book is a survey of *kabbalah's* history and relationship to other religious systems. Myer's last chapters are devoted to translated excerpts from the *Zohar*. Myer confused, or reinterpreted, some doctrine, e.g., the roles and order of the second and third *sefirot*: *bokhmah* and *binah* (pp. 259-63).

Page, Thomas Frederick. *The Golden Fleece: A Book of Jewish Cabalism*. Laconia, N. H.: [published by the author], 1888.

A few paragraphs (from pages 10 and 11) suffice to illustrate the tone and approach of Page's *Golden Fleece*:

There is *no* Hebrew, but what more Hebrew can be taken from it. That language which is understood to be Hebrew at the present day, can be treated in the same manner, and it is all of it, the explanation of the explication of the connection betwixt this life and the life beyond the grave.

The history of the Jews is obscure, for the very reason that all races of men have in their turn been Jews and Hebrews, as will be shown in this work. They are numerous as the sands of the sea (C), and scattered over the earth.

Letters were named abominations, at a time when people had an understanding of their astrological meaning. Abomination, is defined as odious. O die us. When a good soul goes forth from the house of clay, it sees these letters in the light of that word in all of its meaning.

The present use of the word comes down from an age when the masses did arise against the abominable use to which they were part.

These things "which shall be an abomination unto you," are for the Jews to study; both the name and letter, and the thing of life, as the parts of that thing of life fit the law of language by names and anatomy. See the kidneys and the kid (goat) and the knees—the kneepans—the sign Capri. See capricious.

1892

Papus [Gerard Encausse]. *The Tarot of the Bobemians: The Most Ancient Book in the World, for the Exclusive Use of Initiates* [= *The Absolute Key to Occult Science*], translated by A. P. Morton, with a preface by A. E. Waite. London: Chapman and Hall, 1892; New York: Arcanum Books, 1958; New York: Samuel Weiser, 1971.

Through its associations with the Hebrew letters, tarot is here *cabalized* in the tradition of Etteilla and Éliphas Lévi.

_____. *Qabalab: Secret Tradition of the West*. French original, 1892; English translation, Wellingborough: Thorsons and New York: Samuel Weiser, 1977.

Qabalab is a hodge-podge of Jewish and Christian, cabalistic and non-cabalistic elements. Several writers contributed to the work: Éliphas Lévi, Saint-Yves d'Alveydre, and "Sedir." Papus himself drew on the works of Kircher, Lenain, Stanislas de Guaita, Heinrich Khunrath, and others, primarily Christian occultists, putting this work firmly in the Hermetic-Cabalist vein. Papus' eclectic bibliography includes all sorts of stuff, much of which has nothing whatsoever to do with *cabala*.

For further comments on Papus' *Qabalab*, see my "Notes on Editions of *Sefer Yetzirah* in English," at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/syie.pdf> : PART 1: TRANSLATIONS.

1896

(anonymous) *Cabala OR The Rites and Ceremonies of the Cabalist*. New York: Redding & Co., 1896; rpt Kila: Kessinger Publishing, n.d.

Masonic rituals—featuring a "M[aster] Cabalist"—in a code reminiscent of **IF U CN RD THIS**, with a few other signs and symbols (such as ✕ and $\frac{\text{A}}{\text{B}}$) thrown in. Thus, "W-t. ws. th-n. s-d. t. u-." is "What was then said to you?" Assuming a familiarity with Masonic rites and a little practice, *Cabala* is almost readable. One of these days, someone will pore over Masonic tomes and manuscripts and match it with an un-coded text.

1897

Agrippa, H. C. *Three Books of Occult Philosophy or Magic*. English edition by Wallis F. Whitehead, 1897; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1971.

Regarding Agrippa, see the comments in Part 1 above, § AGRIPPA, and ADDENDUM B.

Whitehead's edition contains only "Book I—Natural Magic," with segments from Henry Morley's *Cornelius Agrippa, The Life of Henry Cornelius Agrippa von Nettesheim, Doctor and Knight, commonly known as a Magician* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1856)

Stirling, William. *The Canon. An Exposition of the Pagan Mystery Perpetuated in the Cabala as the Rule of All the Arts*. Elkin Matthews, 1897; rpt. London: Research Into Lost Knowledge Organisation Trust, 1974 and 1981; rpt. York Beach: Samuel Weiser, 1999.

The ancient "canon of the arts" and knowledge through the ages of significant ratios and measures are considered *via* the proportions of ancient monuments and the numerical values of biblical names. The book attempts to establish that a standardized sacred geometry, which was applied in the construction of holy sites and in the writing of holy names, reflects key proportions of the universe.

1900

Farr, Florence. *The Way of Wisdom. An Investigation of the Meaning of the Hebrew Alphabet Considered as a Remnant of the Chaldean Wisdom.* London: J. M. Watkins, 1900; rpt. Edmonds: Sure Fire Press (= Holmes Publishing Group), 1995.

For each of the Hebrew letters, Farr (a Golden Dawn member) presents a brief paragraph; she promotes these epitomes as comparable to the statements of the intelligences in *The Thirty-two Paths of Wisdom*—or the last twenty-two of them, anyway. She then sets the twelve simple letters in correspondence to the twelve symbols of the Buddhist Wheel of Existence.

Nurho de Manhar. *The Zohar. Bereshith-Genesis.* Published as a serial in *The Word*, a monthly magazine ed. H. W. Percival, New York: Theosophical Publishing Society, 1900-14; rpt. San Diego: Wizards Bookshelf, 1978 and 1980.

Nurho's work is a translation of the first sections of the *Zohar* rendered in the light of Mme. Blavatsky's teachings. Nurho was a member of the Golden Dawn whose real name was William Williams.

1901

Harris (OR Harry), Maurice H. *Hebraic Literature. Translations from the Talmud, Midrashim and Kabbala.* Washington & London: M. Walter Dunne, Publisher, 1901.

Harris' § "The Kabbala" contains the same extracts given by Paul Isaac Hershon (1880).

1902

Fluegel, Maurice. *Philosophy, Qabala and Vedānta.* Baltimore: H. Fluegel & Co., 1902.

The subtitle reads, "Comparative Metaphysics and Ethics, Rationalism and Mysticism of the Jews, the Hindus and most of the Historic Nations, as links and developments of one chain of Universal Philosophy."

Waite, Arthur Edward. *Doctrine and Literature of the Kabbalah.* London: Theosophical Publishing Society, 1902.

_____. *The Secret Doctrine in Israel.* London: Rider and Co., 1913

_____. *The Holy Kabbalah* (incorporating the two titles above). London: Williams and Norgate Ltd, 1929; rpt. New Hyde Park: University Books, 1960 and subsequently.

Waite made a serious attempt to set the record straight about what true *kabbalah* was and what it was not. His effort was hampered by his falling prey to the unreliable Latin and French translations available to him, in particular Jean de Pauly's *Le Livre de la Splendeur* (Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1906-1911), a Christianized French rendering of the *Zohar* which has unfortunately been relied upon by a host of twentieth-century occultists, historians, and writers, including Denis Saurat and Anais Nin.

1903

Begley, Walter. *Biblia Cabalistica, or The Cabalistic Bible.* London: Nutt, 1903; rpt. Belle Fourche: Kessinger Publishing, n.d.

Written "for lovers and collectors of literary curiosities," this book treats "HOW THE VARIOUS NUMERICAL CABALAS HAVE BEEN CURIOUSLY APPLIED TO THE HOLY SCRIPTURES" (from the preface and title page). According to Begley, there is an old *cabala* and a new *cabala*. "The first is mainly Hebrew, and occasionally Greek; the second is almost entirely Latin, and of much later invention, not being heard of till about A.D. 1530" (p. 3). Begley's book treats the latter, "the record of Christian fancy on Christian themes"—primarily by way of *gematria*. Knowledge of Latin and German is helpful.

1908

Peeke, Margaret B. *Numbers and Letters, or The Thirty-Two Paths of Wisdom*. 1908; rpt. Belle Fourche: Kessinger Publishing, n.d.

Infusions of Christian doctrine, coinages such as “Sephiroths” and the dedication to Dr. Gerard Encausse (= Papus) give apt clues regarding this work’s viability and orientation.

1909

Bayley, Harold. *A New Light on the Renaissance Displayed in Contemporary Emblems*. London: J. M. Dent & Co., 1909.

In CHAPTER VII, “The Kabbalah,” Bayley writes, “The points of contact between the Kabbalah and the Albigenian Church of the Holy Spirit are therefore so numerous that the two systems may be said at times to merge completely into one another” (—p. 99). He goes on to describe the use of *notaricon* (stating “Dante made frequent use of this Kabbalistic system of *notaricon*...”—p. 100) and *theruma*, the meanings of the letters as numbers and shapes (illustrating, however, with Latin letters), and the indications of certain two-fold “veiling terms” (such as “sun and moon,” “active and passive,” leading up to the point that “Swedenborg expressed the same duality by the terms ‘Will’ and ‘Understanding,’ by the reconciliation of which man becomes an angel”—p. 106).

Bennett, Allan. “A Note on Genesis,” in *The Equinox: The Official Organ of the A. :A. .: The Review of Scientific Illuminism*, Volume 1, Number 2; ed. Aleister Crowley. London: (Simpkin, Marshall) 1909; Bennett’s article with a preface by Crowley was reprinted New York: Samuel Weiser, 1976.

Bennett expands on the meaning(s) of Genesis 1:1 “by applying to the Text the Keys of the Qabalah,” showing that “[c]ontained therein also are the Divine, Magical, and Terrestrial Formulae of the Passage of the Incomprehensible Nothingness of the Ain Soph to the Perfection of Creation....”

Crowley, Aleister. *The Equinox: The Official Organ of the A. :A. .: The Review of Scientific Illuminism*. Volume I, Numbers 1-10, London: (Simpkin, Marshall) 1909-13; rpt. York Beach: Samuel Weiser, 1972 and 1999.

The Equinox is a grandiose esoteric miscellany which includes Golden Dawn materials (as reworked by Crowley), rituals, essays, “knowledge lectures,” stories, plays, tables, charts, poetry, etc. Two items of particular interest in the present context were extracted from *The Equinox*, namely “Gematria” (from vol. 1, no. 5) and “Sepher Sephiroth” (from vol. 1, no. 8), reprinted with *Liber 777* as *The Qabalah of Aleister Crowley* (New York: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1973). See comments below in Part 3 regarding Crowley and *Liber 777*.

Wilson, Epiphanius. *Hebrew Literature, comprising Talmudic Treatises, Hebrew Melodies and the Kabbalah Unveiled*. London – New York: The Colonial Press, 1909.

As the title suggests, the “Kabbalah Unveiled” in this volume is S. L. M. Mathers’ translation of THE LESSER HOLY ASSEMBLY.

1910

Sperling, H. “Jewish Mysticism,” in *Aspects of the Hebrew Genius: A Volume of Essays on Jewish Literature and Thought*, ed. Leon Simon (London: George Routledge & Sons, Limited / New York: Bloch Publishing Co., 1910).

On the first page of this 32-page history, Sperling writes that “mysticism is the raw material of religion” (p. 145). He concludes, “For there is in Judaism a wholesome synthesis of legalism and mysticism, which has saved it from becoming either a visionary castle in the air or a petrified body of formulas” (p. 176).

1912

Kozminsky, Isadore. *Numbers: Their Meaning and Magic*. 1st edition (= *Numbers: Their Magic and Mystery*): London: (Rider?), 1912; 2nd enlarged edition: New York—London: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1927; London: Rider & Co., 1972; New York: Samuel Weiser 1972 and 1977; Vintage/Ebury (Random House) 1985; Ballantrae reprint, 2000.

(—also titled *Numbers and Their Practical Application*)

“In treating in an entirely elementary fashion a subject so vast as that of *numbers*, it is in my opinion necessary that the wisdom of Quaballistical lore should be presented in an easy and intelligible form” (p. iii). The “Quaballistical lore” referred to is principally numerology, or number/letter equivalents, as in the conventional Hebrew values, applied to our Roman alphabet as well as other “systems of valuations set down to the mystic Pythagoras” (FOREWORD, p. 84).

1913

Pick, Bernhard. *The Cabala: Its Influence on Judaism and Christianity*. Chicago: Open Court Publishing Company, 1913; rpt. La Salle: Open Court, 1974.

“As soon as the Cabala became better known, Christians betook themselves to its study and paid it greatest attention because of the supposed agreement of its teachings with the dogmas of the Christian Church.” (p. 100)

Sepharial [Walter Gorn-Old]. *The Kabala of Numbers. The Original Source Book in Numerology*. In two volumes: Philadelphia: David McKay Company, 1913, revised 1928; one-volume edition: 1933, enlarged 1942; rpt. Van Nuys: Newcastle Publishing Co. Inc., 1974; Ballantrae reprint, 2000; Kessinger reprint, 2003.

Cabalistic numerology of the Western esoteric sort, namely, the occult significance of numbers and ratios according to “Greeks, Aryans, and Egyptians,” as well as the Hebrews. The correspondences of numerology and astrology dominate.

1914

Mordell, Phineas. *The Origin of Letters and Numerals according to the Sefer Yetzirah*. Philadelphia: (self-published), 1914.

On Mordell's *Origin*..., see my “Notes on Editions of *Sefer Yetzirah* in English,” PART 1: TRANSLATIONS, at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/syie.pdf>.

1916

Coleville, W. J. *Kabbalah, The Harmony of Opposites: A Treatise Elucidating Bible Allegories and the Significance of Numbers*. New York: Macoy Publishing and Masonic Supply Co., 1916; rpt. Kilo: Kessinger Publishing, n.d.

Coleville's readable presentation is derived from previous English sources (C. D. Ginsburg, translations of Éliphas Lévi, S. L. M. Mathers, A. E. Waite, etc.). Coleville emphasizes the kabbalistic view of the human soul and includes a chapter entitled “Kabbalistic Doctrine Concerning Cause and Effect (Karma).”

1917

Bond, Frederick Bligh; and Lea, Thomas Simcox. *Gematria. A Preliminary Investigation of the Cabala*. 1917; rpt. London: Research Into Lost Knowledge Organisation Trust, 1977.

Though some Hebrew *gematriot* appear toward the beginning, this work is primarily concerned with Greek letters and their values.

Horne, Charles F. (contributing editor). *The Sacred Books and Early Literature of the East*, VOLUME IV: *Medieval Hebrew: The Midrash, The Kabbalah*. New York and London: Parke, Austin, and Lipscomb, 1917.

The chapter II, “The Kabbalah, or Secret Tradition from unknown date to A.D. 1305,” contains Westcott’s translation of *Sepher Yetzirah* and Mathers’ translation of *Sifre Dtzeniuta* (THE BOOK OF CONCEALED MYSTERY) and *Idra Rabba* (THE GREATER HOLY ASSEMBLY).

1918

Gewurz, Elias. *The Hidden Treasures of the Ancient Qabalah*. Vol. I: THE TRANSMUTATION OF PASSION INTO POWER. Chicago: Yogi Publication Society, 1918.

_____. *The Mysteries of the Qabalah*. Vol. II, “Written down by seven pupils of E. G.” Chicago: Yogi Publication Society, 1922.

Gewurz’ works are of the Hermetic-Cabalist type as influenced by Mme. Blavatsky, Golden Dawn writers, and the Masonic cabalists. One of the “seven pupils of E. G.” who wrote down *The Mysteries* was L. A. Bosman, mentioned above in Scholem’s comments regarding Mme. Blavatsky. Bosman’s *Mysteries of the Qabalah* (London: The Dharma Press, 1916; rpt Kila: Kessinger, 2003) is identical to PART II (pp. 54—99) of the 1922 Yogi edition.

1919

Evans, Henry Ridgely. *The Cabala and Freemasonry*. Washington, D. C.: 1919.

The Cabala and Freemasonry is a mere 19 pages, even with illustrations and diagrams. One suspects that it is an excerpt from—or came to be included in—one of Evans’ numerous books.

1920

Boyle, Veolita Parke. *The Fundamental Principles of Yi-King, Tao: The Cabbalas of Egypt and the Hebrews*. New York: Azoth Publishing Company, 1920; Chicago: Occult Publishing Company, 1929; London: W. & G. Folye, 1934; rpt of the 1929 edition, Kila: Kessinger Publishing, n.d. (ca. 2000).

The nature of this work, which is at once eclectic and uncritical, can be exemplified by its CHAPTER III, “Definitions of Letters and Numbers,” where meanings according to the “Hebrew Cabbala” and “Chinese Tao and Yi-King” are given for the 26 letters of the English alphabet. Boyle’s sources for “Hebrew” are S. L. M. Mathers, Isaac Myer, Éliphas Lévi, and Papus.

1921

Fabre d’Olivet [Antoine]. *The Hebraic Tongue Restored, and the True Meaning of the Hebrew Words re-established and Proved by their Radical Analysis*, Done into English by Nayán Louise Redfield. New York – London: G. P. Putnams Sons – The Knickerbocker Press, 1921. [original: *Langue Hébraïque Restituée, et le Véritable sens des mots Hébreux, rétabli et prouvé par leur analyse radicale*, 2 volumes Paris: Chez l’auteur/Barrois/Eberhart, 1815/16]

Refer to Arthur McCalla’s article on Fabre d’Olivet in VOLUME 1 of *Dictionary of Gnosis & Western Esotericism*, ed. Wouter J. Hanegraaff (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2005) pp. 350-4, where Fabre d’Olivet is described as an “immensely curious and massively erudite self-proclaimed Neo-Pythagorean.” The thesis of *Hebraic Tongue* is that “The Mosaic cosmogony...contains the principle of all science, ancient and modern” (—McCalla, p. 355).

1922

Hirsch, S[amuel]. A[braham]. *The Cabbalists and Other Essays*. London: William Heinemann, 1922.

Hirsch begins the title essay, “It is hoped that the time has passed when the term ‘Jewish Cabbala’ suggested the notion of a store-house of magic, black art, and witchcraft.” (—p. 1).

“The Cabbalists” originally appeared in *Jewish Quarterly Review*, Volume 20, Number 1 (London: October 1907) under the title “Jewish Mystics—an Appreciation.”

Maeterlinck, Maurice. *The Great Secret*, translated by Bernard Miall. New York: The Century Company, 1922, GB release [s.l.]: Methuen, 1922; rpt New Hyde Park: University Books, 1969.

Maeterlinck follows Adolph Franck (see above: “1843 Franck”) in his chapter VIII, “The Cabala,” which discusses the *Sefer Yezirah* and the *Zohar*. Among the other brief chapters: VII THE GNOSTICS AND NEOPLATONISTS, IX THE ALCHEMISTS, and X THE MODERN OCCULTISTS; chapter X touches on “Éliphas Lévi and his books, with their alarming titles,” “Madame Blavatzky” (*sic*), and Rudolph Steiner.

1923

Stenring, Knut. *The Book of Formation by Rabbi Akiba ben Joseph Including the 32 Paths of Wisdom...with an introduction by Arthur Edward Waite*. Philadelphia: McKay, 1923; rpt. New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1970.

For details on Stenring’s translation—and Waite’s introduction—see my “Notes on Editions of *Sefer Yezirah* in English,” which is among my other bibliographic essays at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/index.php>.

Though Stenring’s is a much better piece of work, it has been overshadowed by Westcott’s edition of *Sefer Yezirah*, which has been reprinted many times and shows up in dozens of sites on the Internet.

Fortune, Dion. *The Cosmic Doctrine*. 1923-4; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1976.

The Cosmic Doctrine gives an account of “Inner Plane” teachings, received from “one of the ‘Great Masters,’” covering all aspects of the material and spiritual universe(s), their “evolutions,” “influences,” and “laws.” According to Janine Chapman, “*The Cosmic Doctrine* is supposed to be a re-written version of *The Seven Aphorisms of Creation*, which are compilations of notes taken at Dr. Moriarty’s lectures and which are the real ‘secrets of Dr. Taverner,’ the fictitious name Dion gave to Moriarty when she wrote her book, *The Secrets of Dr. Taverner*” (*Quest for Dion Fortune* [York Beach: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1993]: p. 14; for more on Fortune’s “Moriarty period,” see *The Story of Dion Fortune* by Charles Fielding and Carr Collins [Dallas: Star and Cross, 1985]).

1924

Frazer Achad [Charles Stansfield Jones]. *The Anatomy of the Body of God, Being the Supreme Revelation of Cosmic Consciousness*. Chicago: The Collegium Ad Spiritum Sanctum, 1925; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1969.

_____. *The Chalice of Ecstasy, Being a Magical and Qabalistic Interpretation of the Drama of Parzival*. Chicago, 1923; Edmonds: Holmes Publishing Group, 1994.

_____. *The Egyptian Revival, or The Ever-coming Son in the Light of Tarot*. Chicago: The Collegium Ad Spiritum Sanctum, 1923; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1969.

_____. “Horus, Isis, and QBL,” in *The Equinox*, Volume III, Number 10, ed. Hymenaeus Beta X [William Breeze]; York Beach: Samuel Weiser, 1986 and 1990.

_____. *I.N.R.I. De Mysteriis Rosae Rubae et Aurae Crucis*. Chicago: The Collegium Ad Spiritum Sanctum, 1924; rpt. Edmonds: Sure Fire Press, 1989.

_____. *Liber 31*. 1918/1948; San Francisco: Level Press, 1974; this edition includes “Additional Notes on Liber Legis,” *Liber QNA*, and “Gambling with the World.”

_____. *Q.B.L. or The Bride’s Reception, Being a Short Qabbalistic Treatise on the Tree of Life*. Chicago: 1922; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1969

_____. *XXXI Hymns to the Star Goddess Who Is Not*. Chicago: W. Ransom, 1923; also in *Tree: 3*, ed. David Meltzer, Santa Barbara: Christopher Books, Winter 1972: pp. 66-80.

Frater Achad is generally considered Aleister Crowley’s most important student. Achad expands upon the Golden Dawn *qabalah*, establishing some of his own variations on such things as the attributions of the Hebrew letters and their correspondences to the paths of the kabbalistic *tree of life*; in his books of the ‘twenties, he turns the attribution system established by the Golden Dawn completely upside-down.

A more recent writer, considered by some to be Crowley’s true heir, is Kenneth Grant, whose numerous books treat *qabalah* throughout. See, for example, Grant’s summary statements regarding the *qabalistic* tradition in *Beyond the Mauve Zone* (London: Starfire Publishing Ltd, 1999), Chapter 8: “The Metaphysics of Transmission.” For an overview of Grant, see Dave Evans, “Trafficking with an Onslaught of Weirdness: Kenneth Grant and the Magical Revival,” in *Journal for the Academic Study of Magic*, Issue 2 (Oxford: Mandrake of Oxford, 2004), pp. 226-259, and Evans’ *History of British Magick after Crowley* (n.p.: Hidden Publishing, 2007). Further, refer to my comments on Crowley, Frater Achad, and Grant in *Approaching the Kabbalah of Maat* (York Beach: Black Jackal Press, 2013), pages 18-41 *et passim*.

Mention of Crowley, Frater Achad, and Grant inevitably leads to the subject of the O.T.O., *Ordo Templi Orientis*—a can of worms, indeed. Perhaps the best single book on this still-functioning order is *O.T.O. Rituals and Sex Magick*, by Theodor Reuss and Aleister Crowley, compiled and ed. A. R. Naylor, introduced by Peter-R. Koenig (Thame: I-H-O Books, 1999). The book almost immediately fell out of print, soon commanding high prices, many times its original \$50 cover price. The bulk of the book is O.T.O. documents, which, apparently, the active O.T.O. groups are not pleased to see in print. Further controversy surrounds the introduction—and assessments—of Peter-R. Koenig. Much of the material which appears in *O.T.O. Rituals...* can be seen at Koenig’s well-crafted website, *The Ordo Templi Orientis Phenomenon* at <http://www.parareligion.ch/>.

A similar negative reaction greeted Francis King’s edition of the O.T.O. material in 1973, *The Secret Rituals of the O.T.O.* (New York: Samuel Weiser)—which was reissued in 2004, “REVISED & UPDATED,” as a “deluxe, hand-numbered limited edition to 666 copies” on CD-ROM (Austin: O.T.O. New Media). The CD includes King’s text in two formats (*read-only* and Microsoft Word), “Scans of documents relating to the work”—G. M. Kelly’s review of the Naylor/Koenig work, two fancy degree certificates, a woodcut of the eastern Mediterranean which supposedly depicts a “symbolic journey (relevant to the Minerval Degree),” a two-page typescript entitled “A Short History of Saladin,” and scans of the CD’s own packaging—*plus* a three-part photo gallery containing

- (1) 16 photos of Crowley from throughout his adult life,
- (2) 16 more photos of Crowley in various ritual postures and costumes, and
- (3) “The Women,” within which is a subsection devoted to Leah Hirsig claiming seven previously unpublished photographs, five of which are quite obviously doctored.

All the while, an unidentified Shostakovich (?) piece drones in the background.

1925

Pullen-Burry, Henry B. *Qabalism*. Chicago, Yogi Publication Society, 1925.

That which literarians, and bookworms call the Kabbalah, is but a strange and more or less valueless set of writings chiefly of Jewish origin; in which scholars, knowing that there is throughout the scripture hidden as well as an open meaning, having striven to discover it; and have recorded their conclusions, often in words as hard to understand, or even get meaning from, as the scriptures themselves. (—p. xi)

Pullen-Burry goes on to give examples of these writings: “the Sepher Yetzirah” and “the Books of the Zohar.”

As a member of the Golden Dawn, Pullen-Burry reached the level of Hierophant in 1894 under the motto *Anima pura sit. Qabalism*, in spite of the quote above, discusses the *sefirot*, the four worlds, Adam Kadmon, and Philo as “the most important link we have with the Gnosticism of the Jews” (p. 7).

1928

Hall, M[anly] P[almer]. *The Secret Teachings of All Ages: An Encyclopedic Outline of Masonic, Hermetic, Qabbalistic and Rosicrucian Symbolical Philosophy.* San Francisco: H. S. Crocker Co., 1928; rpt. Los Angeles: The Philosophical Research Society, 1978.

The subtitle, “*An Encyclopedic Outline...*,” is certainly fitting. As far as *cabala* is concerned, Hall’s sources are all familiar to us from the present discussion: Barrett, Blavatsky, Fludd, Franck, Ginsburg, Khunrath, Kircher, Lévi, Mathers, Myer, Papus, Paracelsus, Pike, Stenring, Rosenroth, Waite, and Westcott.

_____. *The Sacred Magic of the Qabalah.* Los Angeles: Philosophical Research Society, 1929/1936/1945.

Introduction: THE SCIENCE OF THE DIVINE NAMES

Part 1: KEYS OF THE SACRED WISDOM

Part 2: THE MYSTERY OF THE NUMBERS

Part 3: THE POWER OF INVOCATION AND THE SCIENCE OF THE SACRED NAMES

1932

Regardie, Francis Israel. *A Garden of Pomegranates: An Outline of the Qabalah.* London: Rider and Co., 1932; rpt. St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications, 1970.

A Garden... is an insider’s summary of the Golden Dawn’s *qabalah*. See below: 1936, this paper’s “Part 3,” and “ADDENDUM A, ITEMS OF INTEREST” for other works by Regardie.

1934

Ancona, Sergius Gortan. *The Substance of Adam: A Complete System of Cosmogony Founded on the Kabbala.* London: Rider & Co., 1934; rpt. Brampton: Ballantrae Reprint (www.ballantrae-reprint.com)—alas, off-line 12/15/07; however, Kessinger Publishing picked up the title in 2003).

Part One: THE FOUR WORLDS OF THE UNIVERSE; Part Two: THE WORLD OF THE MAN OF FLESH IN ACTION. Quoting such sources as the Bible (Old and New Testaments), the Zohar, *The Emerald Tablet*, and some Latin Pico-like CABBALISTIC DOGMA(S), Ancona presents “the western tradition” which, by way of “the great works of Éliphas Lévi, Saint-Yves d’Alveydre and Fabre d’Olivet...goes back consistently and without interruption to what was given to the white race by its three great interpreters of God—Rama, Orpheus and Moses—and by direct grace of the Prince of the Archangels, the Son, Jesus the Christ.”

1935

Fortune, Dion. *The Mystical Qabalah.* London: Williams and Norgate, 1935; reprinted frequently.

This work is considered a “classic,” essential reading for students of the Western esoteric stream as exemplified by the Golden Dawn and its heirs.

Regarding Dion Fortune, see the comments below in Part 3.

1936

Regardie, Israel. *The Middle Pillar. A Co-Relation of the Principles of Analytical Psychology and the Elementary Techniques of Magic.* Chicago: Aries Press, 1936; rpt. St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications, 1970.

The Middle Pillar gives instructions for expansions of the “Qabalistic Cross” and “Lesser Banishing Ritual,” both of which are basic to Golden Dawn practice.

1937

Fuller, J. F. C. *The Secret Wisdom of the Qabalab. A Study in Jewish Mystical Thought.* London: Rider and Company, 1937; rpt. Chicago: Yogi Publication Society, n.d.

Fuller's *Secret Wisdom* is an effort to introduce the core of "Qabalistic" doctrine, covering cosmogony, notions of good and evil, fall and redemption, etc., drawing on the *Zohar* (the translation prepared by Simon, Sperling, and Levertoff, referred to as *The Soncino Edition*), Ginsburg's *Kabbalah*, Waite's *Holy Kabbalah*, Lévi's *History of Magic*, Myer's *Qabbalah*, Ariel Bension's *Zohar in Moslem and Christian Spain*, and Knut Stenring's translation of *Sefer Yezirah*.

Part 3

THE HERMETIC ORDER OF THE GOLDEN DAWN was founded in the 1880s by S. L. M. Mathers, W. W. Westcott (both of whom are represented in the list above at **1887**), and a third, apparently less significant, gentleman named W. R. Woodman. Mathers and Westcott concocted an eclectic program of occult study containing quite a bit of *cabala* as derived from the Christian sources we have discussed, especially Agrippa, Dee, and Rosenroth. For better or worse, Golden Dawn teachings have become the cornerstone for much—if not most—of the occult work practiced today. For the history and development of the Golden Dawn, refer to the following items:

Butler, Alison L. *THE REVIVAL OF THE OCCULT PHILOSOPHY: CABALISTIC MAGIC AND THE HERMETIC ORDER OF THE GOLDEN DAWN*. MA thesis, St. John's: Memorial University of Newfoundland, 2000.

“We will show how this synthesis [‘of cabalistic magic...in which many currents of esotericism could be assimilated’] began in the Renaissance by scholars such as Pico della Mirandola, Johannes Reuchlin and Heinrich Cornelius Agrippa von Nettesheim, and we will show how the process was concluded by Samuel Liddell MacGregor Mathers... This dissertation builds upon the work of Dame Frances Yates....” (p. ii)

Butler, Alison. *Victorian Occultism and the Making of Modern Magic: Invoking Tradition*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.

Butler examines not only the personalities involved in the formation of the Golden Dawn but also the influences and motives which shaped their response to “the tightening camps of science and religion in an intellectual environment that heightened the allure of magic.”

Gilbert, R. A. *The Golden Dawn: Twilight of the Magicians. The Rise and Fall of a Magical Order*. Wellingborough: The Aquarian Press, 1983.

Gilbert tells the story from the founding of the order in 1888 to its collapse in 1914. Several important documents are presented, such as the letters from Anna Sprengel, now generally considered fraudulent, authorizing and encouraging William Wynn Westcott to set up the Golden Dawn, and Westcott's “Historical Lecture.”

Greene, Liz. *Magi and Maggidim: The Kabbalah in British Occultism, 1860-1940*. Ceredigion: Sophia Centre Press, 2012.

“In order to explore the ‘metaphysical and cosmological self-understanding’ of the practitioners of the British occult revival, I have employed the qualitative methodology of the multiple case study to examine the work of six occultists and their perceptions of the Kabbalah[;] ... Éliphas Lévi, ... William Wynn Westcott, Samuel Liddel Mac Gregor Mathers, Arthur Edward Waite, Aleister Crowley, and Dion Fortune.” (—p. 29)

“The results of my research strongly suggest that the Kabbalah of the occult revival may not, after all, be an occultist Kabbalah divorced from its Jewish roots, but instead displays a surprising fidelity to the complex currents of the Jewish Kabbalah....” (—p. 30)

Howe, Ellic. *Magicians of the Golden Dawn. A Documentary History of a Magical Order 1887-1923*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1972; New York: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1978.

An account based on careful research, though not fully sympathetic to its subject.

King, Francis. *Ritual Magic in England*. London: Neville Spearman Ltd., 1970
= *The Rites of Modern Magic*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1971.

King's account is a bit more ranging than Howe's (*Magicians of the Golden Dawn*). He gets into some of the subsequent Golden Dawn offshoots which appeared after the original order's demise. In some regards casting an even wider net is *The Rebirth of Magic*, co-authored by King and Isabel Sutherland (London: Corgi Books, 1982—published only in paperback), which adds a bit more background and detail on the French occult revival and expanded treatment of personalities such as Dion Fortune.

The bulk of the Golden Dawn teachings, through its own documents, has been generally available since Israel Regardie's four-volume edition of *The Golden Dawn, 1937-40* (Chicago: Aries Press; frequent reprints were begun by Llewellyn Publications of St. Paul in 1969). Beyond Regardie's full selection, other books which present Golden Dawn documents of some significance include the following:

Mathers, S. L. MacGregor, et al. *Astral Projection, Ritual Magic, and Alchemy*, ed. Francis King; 1st edition London: Spearman, 1971; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1975; 2nd enlarged edition, Rochester: Destiny Books, 1987.

This book reprints the "Flying Rolls," *i.e.*, the instructional materials handed around to Golden Dawn members, which are not included in Regardie's collection. The 2nd edition adds some material.

Torrens, R. G. *The Secret Rituals of the Golden Dawn*. New York: Samuel Weiser Inc., 1973.

Torrens gives historical accounts, doctrinal summaries, and alternative (early) versions of the Outer Order rituals.

Gilbert, R. A. *The Golden Dawn Companion*. Wellingborough: Aquarian Press, 1986.

Companion is a wealth of documentary minutia on the Golden Dawn's history, structure, workings, membership, and sources.

Waite, Arthur Edward. *Inner and Outer Order Initiations of the Holy Order of the Golden Dawn*. Burnaby [BC]: Ishtar Publishing, 2005.

The grade rituals/initiations from Neophyte (0° = 0[□]) to Magus (8° = 3[□]) written in the years 1916-1923.

_____. *Rosicrucian Rites and Ceremonies of the Fellowship of the Rosy Cross [aka Complete Rosicrucian Initiations of the Fellowship of the Rosy Cross]*. Burnaby [BC]: Ishtar Publishing, 2005-7.

Includes Festivals of the Equinox and Solstices; Consecrations of the Temple for the First, Second, and Third Orders.

Zalewski, Patrick J. *Golden Dawn Ritual Commentaries*. Hastings: 1994; second revised edition: *Golden Dawn Rituals and Commentaries*. [n.p.]: Rosicrucian Order of the Golden Dawn, 2010.

"*The Golden Dawn Rituals and Commentaries* expounds on the structure only up to 5°=6[□], but the diligent student in Golden Dawn mysteries who studies this book carefully will be able to extrapolate and develop the 6°=5[□] and 7°=4[□] and in due time even the 'Babe of the Abyss' (Portal of the Third Order). 8°=3[□], and 9°=2[□] formulae." (—Martin Thibeault, FOREWORD to the 2010 edition, page 9)

_____. *Secret Inner Order Rituals of the Golden Dawn*. Phoenix: Falcon Press, 1988.

Zalewski gives the 6° = 5[□] and 7° = 4[□] (*i.e.*, The Inner Order) rituals not included by Regardie—now supplemented by Zalewski's *Inner Order Teachings of the Golden Dawn* (Loughborough: Thoth Publications, 2006), which takes the teachings "back to the original Mathers/Westcott formulae. Included in this book are most of the previous unpublished teachings of Mathers for the Theoricus Adeptus Minor grade of the old Golden Dawn."

The *qabalab* of the Golden Dawn is epitomized by its treatment of the *tree of life*, which merges memory theater, sympathetic magic, and encyclopædism. The quintessential example of the Golden Dawn's brand of *qabalistic* synthesis is Aleister Crowley's *Liber 777*, which consists of table after table of correspondence—almost 200 columns—arranged according to the ten *sefirot* and the twenty-two paths which interconnect them. The EDITORIAL PREFACE (to the 1955 and subsequent editions, probably written by Gerald Yorke) calls 777 a "Qabalistic dictionary of ceremonial magic, oriental mysticism, comparative religion and symbology." Among the sources which Crowley's introduction acknowledges are *Kabbala denudata*, "the lost symbolism of the Vault in which Christian Rosenkreutz

is said to have been buried,” Dee, Agrippa, the “Art” of Ramon Llull, Pietro di Abano, Éliphas Lévi, to mention those who have been connected, however loosely, with *cabala*. The preface of 777 goes on to say, “The Chinese, Hindu, Buddhist, Moslem, and Egyptian systems have never before been brought into line with the Qabalah; the Tarot has never been made public.” 777 was reprinted with two other “Qabalistic” items as *The Qabalah of Aleister Crowley* (New York: Samuel Weiser Inc., 1973; this collection has subsequently been reprinted a few times).

Some of the books listed above in Part 2 of the present paper are considered “classics of qabalah”: Mathers’ *Kabbalah Unveiled* and Fortune’s *Mystical Qabalah*. A student of Fortune’s, Gareth Knight, produced a compendious study, *A Practical Guide to Qabalistic Symbolism* (Helios Book Service [UK], 1965; New York: Samuel Weiser, 1978), which offers a thorough compilation of the Golden Dawn’s “qabalah of correspondence” in its 500-plus pages.

Among the books on *kabbalah/cabala* which are often recommended by students of Golden Dawn-type occultism are Waite’s *Holy Kabbalah*, Myer’s *Qabbalah*, and Ginsburg’s *Kabbalah*; these are thought to be the “serious... difficult... scholarly” books on the subject. Considered more practical are Fortune’s *Mystical Qabalah* and the popular series by William Gray, which includes *The Talking Tree* (1977), *The Ladder of Lights, or Qabalah Renovata* (1981), *Concepts of the Qabalah* (1984) and *The Tree of Evil* (revised edition, 1985—all titles, New York: Samuel Weiser). *Concepts of Qabalah* is Volume 3 of Gray’s SANGREAL SODALITY SERIES: Vol. 1. *Western Inner Workings* (1983); Vol. 2. *The Sangreal Sacrament* (1983); Vol. 4. *Sangreal Ceremonies and Rituals* (1986—all titles, New York: Samuel Weiser, Inc.) Another favorite is W. E. Butler’s *Magic and the Qabalah* (Wellingborough: Aquarian Press, 1964; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1972). None of these “practical” books draws much from Jewish sources; each is based instead on Golden Dawn materials, whether first- or second-hand.

One book “presents the majority of the Kabbalistic teachings from the Golden Dawn in one fascinating volume”: Pat Zalewski’s *Kabbalah of the Golden Dawn* (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications, 1993). This book may well reflect Golden Dawn teachings, but it also demonstrates that the longstanding tradition of mangling (Jewish) *kabbalah*—and the stubborn ignorance of it—has not come to an end. The book’s account of the history and major texts of *kabbalah* is studded with a staggering number of errors; even the titles of the books given in the footnotes contain mistakes. As an inexpensive source showing what has become of *cabala*, Zalewski’s book may have something to recommend it.

John Michael Greer’s *Paths of Wisdom: Principles and Practice of the Magical Cabala in the Western Tradition* (St. Paul: Llewellyn, 1996) is a far better, more complete—and certainly more readable—introduction to the Golden Dawn’s Magical *cabala*. Neither as inclusive nor as well presented as Greer’s *Paths of Wisdom* is a work of similar intent, *Experiencing the Kabbalah* by Chic Cicero and Sandra Tabatha Cicero (St. Paul: Llewellyn, 1997), which offers the reader an “easy-to-use beginner’s guide.”

Recent interest in the Golden Dawn is demonstrated by a book-sized journal featuring articles by contemporary authors; between 1994 and 1998, four volumes were published—none since, however.³ The second volume, *The Golden Dawn Journal*, Book II, is subtitled “Qabalah: Theory and Magic,” eds. Chic Cicero and Sandra Tabatha Cicero (St. Paul: Llewellyn, 1994).⁴ The articles are

³ A reprint edition, *Basics of Magic: The Best of the Golden Dawn Journal*, Book I: DIVINATION, appeared in 2007 from H.O.G.D. Books.

⁴ Given that the Hermetic-Cabalistic tradition is the major source of notions and practices of the Golden Dawn, it is no surprise that the subject “Qabalah” (i.e., *cabala*) is also well represented in the other issues of *The Golden Dawn Journal*: Book I:

spotty; some are downright bad. A few are sincere attempts to offer the results of thoughtful research, both academic and practical.

For developments of Western esoteric (*i.e.*, Golden Dawn, Crowley, etc.) *kabbalah* through the twentieth century, refer to my survey, *Approaching the Kabbalah of Maat* (York Beach: Black Jackal Press, 2013), pages 3-113.

Some basic readings on the *qabalab* of the Golden Dawn:

1. Regardie's edition of Golden Dawn documents, either as *The Golden Dawn* (most accessible through the Llewellyn reprints) or *The Complete Golden Dawn System of Magic* (Tempe: New Falcon Publications, 1984 and 1994, with 150 pages of new material, 2008—somewhat less available than the Llewellyn edition). See also the Kindle edition (New Falcon Publications, 2014) which contains “new material” by Israel Regardie and contributions from David Cherubim, Chic and Tabatha Cicero, Lon Milo DuQuette, Jack Willis, and S. Jason Black.
2. Dion Fortune's *Mystical Qabalab* (reprinted many times).
3. Regardie's *Tree of Life: A Study in Magic* (London: Rider and Co., 1932; rpt New York and York Beach: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1969 and 1989—which many occultists *and* academics rank as one of the best introductions to the whole topic).
4. Gareth Knight's *Practical Guide to Qabalistic Symbolism* (available through Weiser reprints).
5. John Michael Greer's *Paths of Wisdom: Principles and Practice of the Magical Cabala in the Western Tradition* (St. Paul: Llewellyn, 1996)—in my opinion, the best of the introductory books.
6. Crowley's *777* (London: Neptune Press, 1955); included in *The Qabalab of Aleister Crowley* (New York: Samuel Weiser, 1973), reprinted as *777 and Other Qabalistic Writings of Aleister Crowley* (York Beach: Samuel Weiser, 1986); also available on the Internet—search: “*liber 777*”
7. Golden Dawn founders' versions of kabbalistic texts:
 - a. Westcott's *Sepher Yetzirah* (in print from several publishers and on the Internet at dozens of sites)
 - b. Mathers' *Kabbalah Unveiled* (available both in print and on the Internet)

DIVINATION (1994); Book III: THE ART OF HERMES (1995); and Book IV: THE MAGICAL PANTHEONS (1998; all from Llewellyn Publications, St. Paul). See, for example, Madonna Compton's article in Book III, “Logos Revealed: Hermetic Influences on the Renaissance Humanists,” where there is an effort to affect an academic tone in discussions of Pico, Reuchlin, Henry More, and Rosenroth; or Harvey Newstrom's article in Book IV, “In the Beginning was the Word,” which draws on the *Sefer Yetzirah* and *Sefer Bahir*—along with *The Key of Solomon*—in a discussion of the sundry epithets for each of the ten *sefirot*.

Some basic readings on Aleister Crowley:

1. *Symonds, John. *The King of the Shadow Realm: Aleister Crowley: His Life and Magic*. London: Duckworth, 1989. This title incorporates Symond's earlier works, *The Great Beast: The Life of Aleister Crowley* (London – New York: Rider, 1951) and *The Magic of Aleister Crowley* (London: F. Muller, 1958).
2. Cammell, Charles Richard. *Aleister Crowley: The Man, the Mage, the Poet*. New Hyde Park: University Books, 1962.
3. Regardie, Israel. *The Eye in the Triangle: An Interpretation of Aleister Crowley*. St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications, 1970.
4. Stephenson, P. R., and Regardie, Israel. *The Legend of Aleister Crowley, Being a Study of the Documentary Evidence Relating to a Campaign of Personal Vilification Unparalleled in Literary History*. St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications, 1970.
5. Grant, Kenneth. *Aleister Crowley and the Hidden God*. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1974.
6. King, Francis. *The Magical World of Aleister Crowley*. New York: Coward, McCann & Geoghegan, Inc., 1978. (Reprinted in 2004 as *Megatherion: The Magical World of Aleister Crowley* by Creation Books.)
7. Suster, Gerald. *The Legacy of the Beast. The Life, Work and Influence of Aleister Crowley*. York Beach: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1989.
8. *Booth, Martin. *A Magick Life: The Biography of Aleister Crowley*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 2000.
9. *Sutin, Lawrence. *Do What Thou Wilt: A Life of Aleister Crowley*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 2000.
10. *Kaczynski, Richard. *Perdurabo: The Life of Aleister Crowley*. Tempe: New Falcon Publications, 2002.
11. Starr, Martin P. *The Unknown God: W. T. Smith and the Thelemites*. Bolingbrook: Teitan Press, 2003.
12. Evans, Dave. *Aleister Crowley and the 20th Century Synthesis of Magick*. 2nd revised edition: Hidden Publishing, 2007.

A sampling of Crowley's works:

1. *Gems from the Equinox: All the Magical Writings, Instructions by Aleister Crowley for His own Magical Order*, ed. Israel Regardie (St. Paul: Llewellyn Publications, 1974)
2. *Magick in Theory and Practice* ([Paris]: published for subscribers only [Lecram Press], 1929); reprinted as PART III of *Magick: Liber Aba: Book 4* (York Beach: Weiser Books, PARTS I-III, 1983 & PARTS I-IV, 1994).
3. *Magick without Tears* (Phoenix: Falcon Press, 1973)
4. *Liber Aleph vel CXI: The Book of Wisdom and Folly* (West Point: Thelema Publishing Company, 1962; rpt York Beach: Samuel Weiser, Inc., 1991)
5. *The Book of Thoth: A Short Essay on the Tarot of the Egyptians* (California OTO: 1944; rpt New York: Samuel Weiser, 1969 and subsequently).

* For a review of Symonds, Booth, Sutin, and Kaczynski, see Marco Pasi, "The Neverendingly Told Story: Recent Biographies of Aleister Crowley," in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, volume 3, number 2 (Leiden – Boston: Brill Academic Publishers, 2003).