



HR Office

This version has been edited for linguistic clarity (11 February 2016)

### **Examination of CV information**

After claims in the media that one of Karolinska Institutet's employees, Paolo Macchiarini (PM) provided inaccurate information in his resume regarding his employment at the universities of Pisa and Hanover, KI examined the information PM included in the documents, which were grounds for his employment at KI. The investigation focused on the CV PM submitted to KI when he applied for a position as a visiting professor in 2010.

This report will be supplemented with information from the University of Alabama at Birmingham; the University of Franche-Comté, Beçanson; Paris-Sud University and the University of Barcelona as soon as their findings have been made available to KI.

### **The Investigation**

In conducting the investigation, the universities in question provided information about the positions and assignments PM has had at each university. This was done preferably through record abstract. Some information has been personally checked and verified via email or telephone. It should be noted in this context that academic titles, role titles and positions vary among countries. Even organizational affiliation and definitions of assignments can vary among organizations. Due to both this incongruence and language variations, it is not always possible to fully translate all academic titles, jobs and tasks.

### **Conclusion**

It can be concluded that certain statements about positions, job titles, assignments, etc. in PM's CV do not correspond with the information provided by his previous employers. According to KI's assessment, these differences are of such a nature that they cannot solely be explained by carelessness or attributed to differences in organizations, language or academic titles. Several of the differences are substantial and cannot be considered negligible. It can thus be concluded that prior to his official employment as a visiting professor in 2010, PM intentionally provided false or misleading information in his CV.

**Attachment 1** provides information on roles, employment, assignments, etc. listed by PM in the CV he submitted, which served as a basis for his appointment as a visiting professor at KI in 2010. This data is compared with corresponding information provided by previous employers.

**Attachment 2** shows extracts from archives and registers, certificates, etc., plus supplementary e-mail conversations, which KI has received from the institutions concerned.

**Attachment 3** presents the entire resume that PM submitted for his appointment as a visiting professor at Karolinska Institutet, in addition to all other CVs PM has submitted to KI on other occasions.

Solna, 1 February 2016

Mats Engelbrektson

**Attachment 1**

*Employments, roles, assignments, etc. as listed by PM in the CV he submitted for his appointment as a visiting professor at KI in 2010. This data is compared with corresponding information from previous employers.*

**PM CV University of Pisa, Italy***Degrees*

MD University of Pisa, Pisa, Italy	1980-1986
MCh University of Pisa, Pisa, Italy	1986-1991

*Postgraduate Training:*

Resident, Service of Thoracic Surgery, University of Pisa, Pisa, Italy	November 1986-December 1989
---	-----------------------------

*Faculty appointments*

Assistant Professor of Thoracic Surgery University of Pisa, Pisa, Italy	May 1990-May 1992
--	-------------------

*Teaching Experiences*

Thoracic Surgery, University of Pisa, Pisa, Italy	May 1990-May 1992
--	-------------------

**Comments**

The data corresponds in regard to faculty appointments and teaching experiences but excludes a specified period: The University of Pisa confirms that he was affiliated during the periods April-May 1991 and May-June, 1992.

We have not yet received evidence from Pisa regarding postgraduate training.

**PM CV University of Alabama at Birmingham***Postgraduate Training:*

Fellow, Dept. of Thoracic Surgery, University of Alabama at Birmingham, Birmingham, Alabama, USA	January 1, 1990 - December 31, 1991
--	--

**Comment**

Information has not yet been received from the University of Alabama. PM provided a certificate from the institution certifying that he attended and graduated from a course in "Statistical Methods in Clinical Research" during the spring semester, 1989.

**PM CV University of Franche-Cômpte, Beçanson, and Paris-Sud University, France**

*Degrees*

MSc Organ and Tissue Transplantation University of Franche-Cômpte, Beçanson, France	1992-1994
PhD Organ and Tissue Transplantation University of Franche-Cômpte, Beçanson, France	1994-1997
Research Director Paris-Sud University (HDR) * (*HDR -Habilitation à Diriger la Recherche: Accreditation to Full Professor)	1998

*Postgraduate Training*

Fellow, Dept. of Thoracic and Vascular Surgery And Heart-Lung Transplantation, Hôpital Marie- Lannelongue, Paris-Sud University, Le Plessis Robinson, FRANCE	January 1, 1992 - 1992 December 31,
---	--

*Teaching Experiences*

Thoracic Surgery and Transplantation, Paris-Sud University, France	August 1993-April 1999
---	------------------------

**Comments**

PM has submitted a graduation certificate relating to his masters and doctorate (see Annex MSc Franche-Compte and PhD Franche-Cômpte). This information will be checked with his supervisor and the French Embassy in Stockholm.

PM has submitted a graduation certificate relating to "Habilitation à Diriger la Recherche" (see attachment HDR\_Paris-Sud), which is a test for lectureship and the "degree" required to supervise PhD students. Furthermore it is a prerequisite for being able to apply for a professorship (see <https://www.univ-paris1.fr/recherche/habilitation-a-diriger-des-recherches>). According to the Swedish Council for Higher Education, "Research Director" must be translated as 'forskningsledare' or 'vetenskaplig ledare'. This information will be checked with his academic supervisor.



- In PM's CV, MHH and Heidehaus Hospital are presented as a unit, which is not the case. They are in fact two different principalities. Heidehaus Hospital is a hospital within and managed by the city of Hanover. The clinics owned by the city - and thus Heidehaus - serve as MHH's teaching hospitals. PM has supplemented the department name with "Hannover Medical School". This is incorrect.
- The Dissertation Office at the MHH mistakenly translated the certificate of appointment as Reader as "degree of a Professor". The correct translation would have been "adjunct professor".

## **PM CV University of Barcelona, Spain**

### *Faculty appointments*

Associate Professor of Surgery, University of Barcelona, Barcelona, Spain March 2005-12/2009

Investigator of the Institut d'Investigacions Biomèdiques August Pi i Sunyer (IDIBAPS), Barcelona January 2006-12/2009

Director, Laboratory Thoracic Bioengineering March 2006-12/2009

Institut d'Investigacions Biomèdiques August I Sunyer (IDIBAPS), Barcelona March 2006-12/2009

### *Hospital appointments*

Senior Consultant and Chairman, Department of General Thoracic Surgery Hospital Clinic, University of Barcelona January 2005 12/2009

### *Teaching Experiences*

Professor, General Thoracic Surgery, University of Barcelona, Barcelona March 2005- present

Director, Post-graduate (Residents and Fellows) program of General Thoracic Surgery, Hospital Clínic, Universidad de Barcelona, Barcelona March 2005- 12/2009

PHD Supervisors, General Thoracic Surgery, Universidad de Barcelona, Barcelona March 2005- 12/2009

Master en Transplante, de Órganos Universidad de Barcelona, Barcelona	February 2007 - 12/2009
Coordinator Transplant and Surgical Pathology. EU Master in Respiratory Medicine, University de Barcelona, Barcelona	Septembre 2007 - 12/2009
EU Master in Respiratory Medicine. University of Barcelona, Barcelona	April 2008 – present
Master of Intensive Care & Emergencies. University of Barcelona, Barcelona	Mai 2008 – 12/2009

### Comments

The CV indicated "Professor, General Thoracic Surgery" under the title Teaching Experiences. This title is not translated from Spanish. In Spain, the title means "teacher" and not formal professor.

The university confirms that PM has been an investigator (researcher) at IDIBAPS during the period March 2006 - October 2009 (not December as his CV indicates). He did not receive a salary but was affiliated with the University, with his main employment at the hospital. IDIBAPS states that there is not and has never been something called "Laboratory Thoracic Bioengineering" at the Institute.

The University of Barcelona has certified that PM was Profesor Asociado Médico del Area Conocimiento de Cirugia, corresponding to medical teacher in surgery, from March 2005 - December 2009, 6 hours per month. His main employment was at the Hospital Clinico de Barcelona, which has not yet provided any information. KI will follow up with the clinic to verify this information.

### PM CV University College and The London Clinic, London

#### *Faculty appointments*

Honorary Professor, University College London      Since 2009-  
Department of Nose, Ear and Through

#### *Hospital appointments*

Honorary Professor and Consultant, Great Ormone      Since 1/2010  
Street Children Hospital, UCL London  
(UK)

Consultant General Thoracic Surgeon,      Since 1/2010  
The London Clinic, London (UK)

**Comments**

Acting Director, Dr. Jonathan Gale, confirms that PM was appointed Visiting Professor August 1, 2009. They write that "the honorary appointment was granted for 5 years and came to an end on 31.7.2014." The task described is different from what PM stated in his CV, where he wrote Honorary Professor. For both the title of Visiting Professor and Honorary Professor the UCL states that "The appointee should be of an academic standing equivalent to that of Professor at UCL." Otherwise the data in PM's CV is deemed correct.

**PM CV University Hospital Careggi***Hospital appointments*

Director, Department of General Thoracic and Regenerative Surgery and Intrathoracic Biotransplantation, University Hospital Careggi, Florence, Italy Since 1/2010

Director, BIOAIR (Laboratory of Bioengineering and molecular airways), University Hospital Careggi, Florence, Italy

**Comment**

Macchiarini was employed by the University Hospital Careggi at the specified time, however, not as "Director" but as "consultant" and "project manager".

University Hospital Careggi also informed KI that there has never been any Department of General Thoracic Surgery and Regenerative and Intrathoracic Biotransplantation.

**Further data**

PM has submitted two CVs to KI when applying for professorships in 2011 and 2014. KI has compared the information in the latter CVs with the CV submitted as the basis for appointment as a visiting professor in 2010; only negligible differences were found. For obvious reasons, information about the Cuban State University, Krasnodar, Russia has been added. This information is reported below, with comments.

**PM CV Kuban State Medical University, Krasnodar, Ryssland***Docent-Level Competence*

Professor of Surgery, Kuban State Medical University, 11/2011-present  
Krasnodar, Russia

*Current Position*

Consultant, Airway Transplantation, Kuban State Medical University, Krasnodar, Russia 10/2011 – present

Director of International Research, Clinical and Educational 10/2011 – present



Center of Regenerative Medicine, Kuban State Medical  
University, Krasnodar, Russia

Full Professor, Kuban State Medical University,  
Krasnodar, Russia

10/2011 – present

### **Comment**

Cuba State University has submitted written material that will be added to this document when translated. However, after a preliminary review of the documents, it appears that PM has held an honorary doctorate since 10/2011. PM stated in his CV that he is a Professor of Surgery and full professor. However, it is correct that PM currently holds a position as Director of International Research, Clinical and Educational Center of Regenerative Medicine.

### **Summary comments**

Most of the content in PM's CV is considered to be accurate. However, there are in some parts significant differences between the information in the CV and information from relevant institutions. It is not likely that these differences are random or due to negligence since all differences enhance PM's qualifications. They cannot be explained by factors other than that the information was deliberately provided in order to make his qualifications appear to be more favorable than they really are, and thus to strengthen the chance of obtaining a visiting professorship at KI. PM has thus intentionally provided false or misleading information before his appointment as a visiting professor in 2010 that were relevant to Karolinska Institutet's hiring decision. The information PM submitted in his 2010 CV, as well as in the applications for professorships at KI in 2011 and 2014, have also been grounds for the current employment contract as Senior Researcher. Comparisons between PM's CV and information from universities involved in the investigation show the following differences:

- At the University of Pisa, PM has been generous with his time at the university and careless with his title. He has stated "assistant professor May 1990-May 1992". According to the employer, he was "Professor a contratto" (lecturer) during April-May 1991 and May-June, 1992.
- It is stated in the CV that PM held a two-year fellowship in thoracic surgery in Birmingham University of Alabama, Birmingham. According to information in the *Vanity Fair* article, the University refutes that statement. According to the article, he has a six-month non-surgical fellowship in hematology/oncology.
- PM states in his CV, "Full Professor of Surgery Since March, 2001 Medical School, Hannover, Germany." He was in fact "ausserplanmässiger" professor, which can be regarded as an appointment. He has, in any case, not received a salary from the Medical School, Hannover, at any time. He has also stated "Head and Chairman, Department of General Thoracic and Vascular Surgery, Heidehaus Hospital". PM has not been the

Head and Chairman at Heidehaus Hospital, only a Consultant, as he himself admitted in an email to KI on January 15 this year.

- PM has stated that he has held positions as Director of Laboratory Thoracic Bioengineering (IDIBAPS), Barcelona and at the Department of General Thoracic Surgery and Regenerative and Intrathoracic Biotransplantation, University Hospital Careggi. This is false. According to the relevant employers, such units have never existed.
- PM holds an honorary doctorate from Kuban State Medical University since 10/2011 and is not Professor of Surgery and full professor as stated in PM's CV. This finding, however, is preliminary.

## Attachment 2

*Certificates and other information from the employers PM lists in the CV submitted as a basis for his appointment as a visiting professor at KI.*

Gentile Catarina Lindqvist  
Karolinska Institutet - Stockholm

in risposta alla sua richiesta, per gli aspetti di competenza di questo ufficio, si comunica che il nominativo da voi indicato ha ricoperto il ruolo di "professore a contratto", nominato dalla Facoltà di Medicina e Chirurgia di questo Ateneo, presso la Scuola di Specializzazione in "Chirurgia toracica" per l'insegnamento di "TERAPIE ADIUVANTI NELLE NEOPLASIE DEL TORACE" per i periodi:

aprile – maggio 1991  
maggio - giugno 1992

Si fa presente che il titolo ricoperto, è limitato a detti periodi di insegnamento.

Distinti saluti

Unità Amministrazione Personale Docente  
Responsabile: Dott. Massimiliano Galli

**UNIVERSITA' DI PISA**  
**DIREZIONE DEL PERSONALE**  
Dirigente: dott. A.Farenti – 050/2212178  
[a.farenti@unipi.it](mailto:a.farenti@unipi.it)

Unità Amministrazione Personale Docente  
Responsabile dott. M.Galli (tel. 050/2212158 – fax 050/2212156) – [m.galli@adm.unipi.it](mailto:m.galli@adm.unipi.it)  
g.vasta: tel. 050/2212149 – fax: 050/2212156 – [g.vasta@adm.unipi.it](mailto:g.vasta@adm.unipi.it)

Svar från Medizinische Universität Hannover (översatt till svenska)

Som Frau Reinhold-Wolter (personalchefen) redan har berättat har det aldrig funnits ett anställningsförhållande mellan Herr Macchiarini och Medizinischen Hochschule Hannover (MHH). Han var mellan 1999 och 2004 chef för avdelningen för thorax- och kärlkirurgi vid dåvarande *Sjukhus Heidehaus Hannover*, ett sjukhus med staden Hannover som huvudman. Klinikerna i stadens regi – och därmed *Heidehaus*, fungerade som MHH:s undervisningssjukhus. Herr Macchiarini har i de CV (som ni har skickat till Frau Reinhold-Wolter) kompletterat avdelningens namn med „Hannover Medical School“. Detta är oriktigt.

Herr Macchiarini har genom beslut av MHH:s senat (ungefär styrelsen) daterat 991020 erhållit en ny docentur med hänvisning till den tidigare docenturen vid universitetet Paris Sud (vilket innebär att han därmed avsäger sig sin docentur vid detta universitet, anmärkning SG). Han har därmed blivit docent (Privatdozent) vid MHH – han har aldrig varit ordinarie professor (haft en ordinarie professor) vid MHH, och, som enligt ovan redan har meddelats: det har aldrig funnits något som helst anställningsförhållande vid MHH utan han var anställd i staden resp. region (ungefär *läns landsting*) Hannover.

Bifogat intyg på utnämning som docent (Privatdozent) är korrekt. Det engelska intyget från disputationsbyrån kan missuppfattas: här skulle ha varit rätt att skriva "adjunct professor".

Undertecknas med vänliga hälsningar

Joerg Strate

Präsidialamt der MHH (ungefär „rektors kansli“, förmodligen motsvarande universitetsdirektör)

**Tel.: 0511-532-6010/-6002/-6000**

**Fax: 0511-532-6003**

*(see materials in separate annexes).*

### **Attachment 3**

*Here follows the CVs that PM submitted to KI when applying for a visiting professorship in 2010 and the CVs that PM submitted to KI when applying for two different professorships in 2011 and 2014.*

*(see materials in separate annexes).*