## References

1 S. Kapelner and N. Maio, "The Stability of Some Metallic Oxides, Carbides and Nitrides to Liquid Lithium at 800 K and 1500 K, TIM-651, March, 1961, Pratt & Whitney Aircraft-CANEL.

W. H. Cook, "Corrosion Resistance of Various Ceramics and

Cermets to Liquid Metals," ORNL-2391, June, 1960.

- 3 H. Leeper,<sup>2</sup> "Compatibility of Materials in Liquid Metal and Composition 30," TIM-251, March, 1956, Pratt & Whitney Aircraft-
- 4 H. Apkarian, "Investigation of Liquid Metal Lubricated Bearings," R 50FL231, November, 1950, General Engineering Laboratory, General Electric Company.

5 D. B. Vail, "Compatibility of Materials in Liquid Metal,"

KAPL-1021, January, 1954.

- 6 R. C. Kumpitsch, J. R. Granan, and P. J. Kroon, "Study of a Liquid Metal NaK-77 for Application in Flight Control Systems,"
- ASD-TDR-62-597, vol. 1, May, 1962.
  7 M. J. Wallace, "Summary Report of Potential Liquid Metal Bearing Materials for SNAP-50/SPUR Pumps," PWAC-468, November, 1965, Pratt & Whitney Aircraft-CANEL.
- 8 J. W. Kissel, W. A. Glaeser, and C. M. Allen, "Friction Behavior of Sodium Lubricated Materials in a Controlled High Tempera-
- ture Environment," Wear, vol. 5, 1962.

  9 M. B. Peterson, "Investigation of Solid Lubricants and Sliding Contacts at Temperatures Above 1000°F," GE-APEX 569, 1960.

  10 W. H. Roberts, "The Friction and Wear Behavior of Molyb-
- denum-Tungsten Chromium Alloys in High Temperature Sodium Environments," ASLE Paper No. 641c-25, 1964.
- 11 E. C. Leao,<sup>2</sup> E. W. Hobart, and D. E. Fornwalt, "General Method for Analyzing Refractory Metal Alloys Using the Vacuum Cup Electrode," TIM-904, Pratt & Whitney Aircraft-CANEL. 12 N. S. Bornstein,<sup>2</sup> "Carburization of Cb-1 Zr Alloy," TIM-927,
- August, 1965, Pratt & Whitney Aircraft-CANEL.

## DISCUSSION

## E. E. Bisson<sup>3</sup>

Mr. Wallace states that the mechanism of lubrication is a matter of conjecture for the sintered carbides. Since the paper

<sup>2</sup> These reports may be obtained from Department Technical Information Center, Oak Ridge, Tenn.

<sup>3</sup> Assistant Chief, Fluid System Components Division, National Aeronautics and Space Administration, Lewis Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio.

was written some time ago, I wonder whether the author has come to any different conclusions after further study.

The data on wear with sintered carbides of Table 7 are intriguing if I am interpreting the results correctly. The series of tungsten carbides with increasing cobalt content seem to show appreciable improvement in friction and wear as cobalt content increases. For example, the wear rating on the flat is 3 for cobalt contents of 3.1, 3.3, and 3.86 percent; in contrast the wear rating is 1 for cobalt conditions of 5.55 and 8 percent. We at the NASA Cleveland laboratories have always felt that the binder in bonded carbides can have a strong beneficial influence on the friction and wear properties of these materials. These data seem to bring out this conclusion if my interpretation is correct.

## Author's Closure

I would like to thank Mr. Bisson for his discussion of this paper. Since the termination of the initial study, I have done no additional work with liquid metal bearing materials; therefore, the mechanism of lubrication is still a matter of speculation. Although I offer the double-oxide formation for the development of the boundary lubricant, there may still be the possibility that the binder in the bonded carbides has a beneficial influence on the wear and frictional properties. But I attribute the differences of the ratings of 1 and 3 on the flat rub shoes for cases cited by Mr. Bisson to the loss of lithium and not the differences in cobalt concentration. With the loss of lithium, the source of boundary lubrication and heat-transfer medium is not available and, therefore, increased wear and surface damage occurs. The disk to flat rub shoe variation in the rating of 1 versus 3 for the same material (Kll, Carboloy 999, 905) is attributed to the constant contact of the shoe as opposed to only a very small area of contact on the disk at any time during the short duration with no lithium before the rotation stopped.