

COUNCIL ON NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL EDUCATION

Meeting Minutes 1999 - 2003

CONTENTS

March 6, 1999	Tempe, Arizona
July 30, 1999.	Telephone Conference Call
August 20, 1999	Telephone Conference Call
October 13, 1999.	Telephone Conference Call
November 1, 1999	Coeur d'Alene, Idaho
April 1, 2000	Reno, Nevada
September 11, 2000	Bellevue, Washington
November 1, 2000	Telephone Conference Call
August 20, 2001	Tucson, Arizona
March 17, 2002	Toronto, Ontario
June 10, 2002	Telephone Conference Call
August 12, 2002.	Salt Lake City, Utah
December 16, 2002	Telephone Conference Call
August 12, 2003	Portland, Oregon

Minutes of two other meetings are not included because the computer files were corrupted by a virus: March 31, 2001 and April 5, 2003.

Council on Naturopathic Medical Education, Inc.

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Meeting of March 6, 1999

Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences ♦ Tempe, Arizona

Approved November 1, 1999

♦ 1. Call to Order

The Council's president, Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM], Portland, Oregon), called the meeting to order at 8:35 a.m. (MST). Executive Director Robert Lofft announced that this meeting was the Council's 1999 semiannual meeting, as prescribed by the *Bylaws*. In addition to Dr. Khalsa, the members present were:

- ♦ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ♦ Randall Bradley, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Omaha, Nebraska;
- ♦ Shirley B. Gordon, Ph.D. (Public Member), Seattle, Washington;
- ♦ N. Edd Miller, Ph.D. (Public Member), Reno, Nevada;
- ♦ Kareen O'Brien, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences [SCNM], Council Secretary), Tempe, Arizona;
- ♦ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed., (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington;
- ♦ Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), Toronto, Ontario;
- ♦ Donald Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Gloucester, Ontario; and
- ♦ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Treasurer), Bellingham, Washington.

Council Member Not Present:

- ♦ Carl Phillips, N.D., D.C. (Profession Member), Courtenay, British Columbia.

Staff Present:

- ♦ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Member Nominee Present:

- ♦ William J. Keppler, Ph.D., Dean of Health Emeritus and Honors Faculty Professor of Public Health, Florida International University, North Miami, Florida.

U.S. Department of Education (ED) Observers Present:

- ♦ Ronald Lipton, Staff Member, Accrediting Agency Evaluation Branch (AAEB), Washington, D.C.; and
- ♦ Naomi Randolph, Chief, AAEB, Washington, D.C.

Guests Present:

- ♦ Rick Chester, N.D., Immediate Past President, Arizona Naturopathic Medical Association, Chandler;
- ♦ Robert Cornesky, Sc.D., President, Rainstar College of Massage Therapy, Phoenix;
- ♦ Ronald Hobbs, N.D., Dean, College of Naturopathic Medicine, University of Bridgeport;
- ♦ Konrad Kail, N.D., Board Member, SCNM;
- ♦ David Marchese, President, SCNM; and
- ♦ Douglas Poorman, Ph.D., Academic Dean, SCNM.

Dr. Khalsa announced a quorum present. Mr. Lofft reported Dr. Phillips was unable to attend this meeting due to a family emergency this past week.

◆ 2. Agenda

Dr. Khalsa asked if members had changes to propose in the published agenda. Dr. Adele suggested as the next order of business that all present introduce themselves and be welcomed. Without objection. Beginning with Dr. Khalsa and going around the room, those present introduced themselves.

Dr. Bradley suggested a topic for discussion be added as item 8-A, under New Business: "Technical Assistance Program for Emerging and Developing Naturopathic Education Programs." Without objection.

Dr. Cornesky requested that the Council consider a proposal to allow for-profit colleges to seek accreditation. Dr. Bradley noted the Council had at its last meeting considered this proposal, explaining the reasons the Council had declined to adopt it. Dr. Khalsa said he agreed a proposal to accommodate for-profit colleges should not be reconsidered at this time.

◆ 3. Nominations Committee Report and Election of Members

■ A. Public Member Nominee

Dr. Warren (Nominations Committee chair) reported his committee was nominating Dr. Keppler as a Public Member, with his term to begin upon election. Dr. Keppler's curriculum vitae had been mailed to Council members before the meeting. Dr. Warren noted Dr. Keppler had attended the Council's April 1997 Evaluators Training Workshop and had been a member of the evaluation team that visited NCNM in May 1997. Dr. Miller seconded the nomination. **Dr. Khalsa called for a vote. Council members unanimously elected Dr. Keppler as a Public Member.**

■ B. Profession Member Nominees

Dr. Warren announced his committee was nominating himself and Dr. Bradley for re-election as profession members, with terms to begin upon re-election. Dr. Khalsa seconded the nomination of Dr. Bradley. Council members unanimously re-elected Dr. Bradley. Dr. Wessels seconded the nomination of Dr. Warren. Council members unanimously re-elected Dr. Warren.

■ C. Proposed Role and Objectives for the Nominations Committee

Dr. Warren distributed a written proposal that would give the Nominations Committee specific responsibilities and procedures. **Dr. Bradley moved adoption of the proposal, with one change (in the last paragraph): That announcements seeking member nominees appear a least six months in advance of meetings at which new members are to be elected. Dr. Wessels seconded. Unanimously adopted.**

◆ 4. Officers' Reports

■ A. Secretary

Dr. O'Brien referred members to the unapproved draft of the minutes of the Council's August 24, 1998 meeting, previously mailed to members, and asked for corrections. No changes were offered. **Dr. Wessels moved approval. Dr. Keppler seconded. Unanimously adopted.**

■ B. Treasurer

Dr. Wessels yielded to Mr. Lofft, who referred members to the 1997 auditors' report of the Council finances, copies of which had been previously mailed to members. The audit found no irregularities. The auditors reported the Council's net assets as of December 31, 1997 at \$12,897.

Dr. Wessels referred members to the 1998 year-end budget report and financial statement, previously mailed. Beginning-year reserves were \$12,897.40 (the 1997 year-end fund balance, which is also the amount reported as net assets in the 1997 audit). Total revenue for 1998 was \$58,730.84, and total expenditures were \$56,173.06, resulting in a surplus of \$2,557.78. Year-end reserves (networth) stood at \$15,455.18. **Dr. Miller moved acceptance of the 1998 budget report and financial statement. Seconded. Unanimously adopted.**

Mr. Lofft distributed an updated proposed 1999 budget and current budget report and financial statement, dated March 3, 1999. The proposed 1999 operating budget was \$67,500. Revenue to date was \$34,947.06, and expenditures were \$7,921.85. Cash on hand (networth) was \$42,480.39. Following discussion, **Dr. Keppler moved adoption of the proposed 1999 budget and acceptance of the budget report and financial statement. Dr. Miller seconded. Unanimously adopted.**

■ C. Vice President

Dr. Bradley reported no activities related to his office as vice president.

- **D. President**

Dr. Khalsa reported no activities separate from the items on this meeting's agenda.

- ◆ **5. Committee Reports**

- **A. Committee on Standards, Policies, and Procedures (COSPP)**

Mr. Lofft noted this committee consisted of the Council's four Institutional Member Representatives plus one Public Member (vacant) and one Profession Member (Dr. Bradley). Until his retirement from the Council at the last meeting, the Public Member (Dr. Keith Pailthorp) had been chair. COSPP now needs a new Public Member appointee and a new chair.

Mr. Lofft then reported on the survey COSPP conducted during October and November 1998 as part of the committee's ongoing review process to ensure the validity and reliability of the Council's accreditation standards. The survey included administrators, faculty, board members, and students at naturopathic colleges; administrators of naturopathic licensing agencies; administrators at state postsecondary education agencies; state and provincial naturopathic professional associations; and selected naturopathic physicians. Eighty-eight completed surveys have been received. In nearly every case, respondents indicated that compliance with each criterion of each standard would be "very important" or "important" for ensuring high quality in the aspect of the college or program that the standard addresses. The most helpful sections of the survey are those where respondents were asked to submit comments; respondents have made numerous suggestions for refining the standards, and Mr. Lofft said he would compile the comments in time for the Council's annual meeting. But it is already apparent, he said, that the Council needs to determine for the Standard on Curriculum whether dissection should continue to be required or whether prosection alone is acceptable.

Council members discussed at length a recent decision by NCNM to switch from dissection to prosection, but they reached no agreement as to whether the Council's present Standard on Curriculum allows prosection in place of dissection. **Dr. Keppler moved that the Council's president send a letter to each Institutional Member to request that faculty who teach gross anatomy meet to discuss and make recommendations on the most effective methodologies for teaching gross anatomy and submit a concise and complete report at the Council's 1999 annual meeting. Dr. Wessels seconded. Unanimously adopted.**

- **B. Committee on Development (COD)**

Dr. Wessels (chair) distributed a report showing that contributions from professional associations during 1998 totaled \$15,409, an all-time high. The report also showed 81 gifts from individuals since May 22, 1998, for a total of \$5,586.34. The individual donors and the amounts of their gifts were listed.

Dr. Warren announced he was resigning as a COD member. Dr. Ringdahl suggested that a Council member from Canada be appointed to replace Dr. Warren. Dr. Ross volunteered, and Dr. Khalsa named him to the committee.

- **C. Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education (CPME)**

Dr. Bradley (chair) reported CPME has received a residency program application for certification from NCNM, which is now preparing the program's self-study report. A site visit will be scheduled this year.

Dr. Bradley stated CPME may need to recommend changes in the *Residency Certification Manual* (RCM), specifically with regard to the requirement that 60 percent of a resident's first-year training be devoted to family practice. Members raised several issues: (1) that the major portion of a first-year residency program be called "primary care" rather than "family practice"; (2) that in the push to offer residencies, not just any training opportunity be called a residency; (3) that residencies maintain a naturopathic focus; (4) that the naturopathic profession is not a well-developed specialty profession with established groups of experts in various specialties that can set standards; and (5) that residencies need to stay in sync with the profession's needs, incorporating sub-specialties, e.g., a specialty in physical medicine with a sub-specialty in sports medicine.

Dr. Bradley stated that a guest at this meeting (Dr. Kail) will be presenting a proposal that non-members of the Council be eligible to serve on CPME. Presently CPME needs three more members. Drs. O'Brien and Keppler volunteered, and Dr. Khalsa named them to the committee. Dr. Bradley then invited Dr. Kail to address the Council.

Dr. Kail noted that in allopathic medicine, the body responsible for setting standards for postgraduate medical education is the Council on Graduate Medical Education (CGME). This entity establishes the standards for a specialty college and providing internships and residencies. The expertise within the specialty field that

body of knowledge that defines a clinical specialty and what is included in the specialty training is determined by the specialists themselves and exists in the specialty colleges. CGME does not determine what constitutes the specialty knowledge. Dr. Kail proposed that the Council expand CPME to include the person responsible for postdoctoral medical education at each of the accredited naturopathic colleges and programs, plus one representative from the Integrated Medical Education and Research System (IMERS), one representative from the American Association of Naturopathic Physicians (AANP), and one representative from any approved naturopathic specialty society. CPME would then have its charge expanded to identifying specialty practitioners, creating guidelines for specialty colleges, and furthering the creation of specialty colleges. He stated that naturopathic specialty education is defined by the specialty "body of knowledge," and that naturopathic specialists must define it, preserve it, and advance it.

Dr. Bradley thanked Dr. Kail for his helpful presentation, which will be considered at future CPME meetings. At Dr. Bradley's request, the Institutional Member Representatives agreed they would discuss at meetings of the institutions' deans whether the term "postdoctoral" or "graduate" is more appropriate for referring to residency training programs.

◆ 6. Executive Director's Report

Mr. Lofft distributed a written report and led members through its contents:

1. **Audit.** Completed in October 1998. Cost: \$1,550.
2. **Renewal of Federal Recognition.** Petition and exhibits submitted November 2. National Advisory Committee on Institutional Quality and Integrity will consider the petition in May. Notice inviting third-party comments published in the December 24, 1998 *Federal Register*. Mr. Lofft noted that copies of the Council's petition were on the display table in the meeting room.
3. **University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine.** Periodic calls received from Dr. Ron Hobbs, N.D., dean. College anticipates state approval for granting N.D. degree by this fall. Plans are to apply for candidacy soon afterward. The New England Association of Schools and Colleges has confirmed by telephone that the College of Naturopathic Medicine is included in the university's institutional accreditation. The agency did not consider the establishment of the new college to be a substantive change in that the university had already been issuing degrees at the doctorate level.
4. **Up-Coming On-Site Evaluations.**
 - **Bastyr University.** Three-day comprehensive evaluation for reaffirmation of accreditation, April 1999. Team members: Drs. William Keppler, Don Warren, Richard Barrett (all confirmed) and Lise Maltais (unconfirmed).
 - **Southwest College.** Three-day comprehensive evaluation for accreditation, tentatively scheduled for September 1999. Four team members to be selected.
 - **National College's Graduate Medical Education Program.** One-day visit for initial certification of residency program, to be scheduled for late spring or fall 1999. Two team members to be selected. To be coordinated by CNME's Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education (CPME).
 - **University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine.** Two-day evaluation for candidacy application, tentatively scheduled for the fall of 1999. Three team members to be selected.
 - **National College.** Three-day comprehensive evaluation for reaffirmation of accreditation, spring 2000. Four team members to be selected.
5. **Status of Litigation.** Asinoff vs. NCNM, CNME, and AANP. Plaintiff filed petition July 14, 1998 in the Fourth Judicial District Court of the State of Oregon, alleging fraud (essentially the same suit which had been dismissed a month earlier, with AANP added as a defendant). Plaintiff seeks \$3 million in general and punitive damages. Alleges CNME "is basically the behind the scenes entity and driving force for the matter complained of" (i.e., that Mr. Asinoff was misled by the conspiring actions of the defendants into believing he could practice naturopathic medicine in his home state of New York). Our attorney recently notified us the judge is ready to dismiss this case, but the Council will first take a deposition from Mr. Asinoff. The judge has agreed to the deposition.
6. **Proposed Colleges.**
 - **American University of Integrative Medicine, Arizona College of Naturopathic Medicine, 5008 W. Glendale Ave, Suite 1, Glendale, AZ 85301.** Robert L. Gear, N.M.D., acting administrator; Sophia

Alexandros, N.M.D., dean of admissions. Catalog published for 1999/2000. Classes to be offered in September 1999. The college has not initiated contact with the Council's office, and it has not requested the handbook. The catalog states, however, that the college "is in the process of submitting the preliminary candidacy application of accreditation to [the] Council on Naturopathic Medical Education [address and phone]. CNME is the agency recognized by the U.S. Secretary of Education for accrediting programs leading to the Doctor of Naturopathy or Doctor of Naturopathic Medicine degree." CNME's Policy on the Representation of a College's or Program's Relationship with the Council (*Handbook*, pp. 59-60) states a college is not to make any statement about possible future status with CNME.

- **Académie Internationale de Médecine Alternative.** Administrator: Mr. Jean LaCombe, 910 Belanger, #204, Montreal, Quebec H2S 3P4. Establishment of school announced at a press conference, December 8, 1998. Plans to offer a program of 4,500 hours. Mr. LaCombe called February 5, 1999 and reported that Quebec regulatory agencies are now informally allowing the practice of naturopathy. There's no licensure law but progress is being made to obtain one. Investors are involved in the school, so a potential problem exists in that it is not a non-profit organization, but this may change. Mr. LaCombe has visited CCNM during the past year. He believes his school will meet CNME's standards, and he said he will call again soon to request a consultation visit.
 - **International College of Complementary Health Care.** Cidalia Paiva, Ph.D., Dean of Complementary Programming, West Coast College of Massage Therapy, 555 W. Hastings St., Vancouver, BC V6B 4N6. Plans to start classes in September 1999. Intends "to graduate Naturopaths who will be eligible for licensing in British Columbia and other states and provinces which must be accredited by your organization (CNME)." Neil McKinney, N.D., (an on-site evaluator for the Council) has been invited to attend planning meetings as a representative of the Association of Naturopathic Physicians of British Columbia (ANPBC), the province's regulatory agency for naturopathic physicians.
 - **Canadian College of Holistic Health.** Sohrab Khoshbin, Ph.D., D.Acu., President, 10670 Yonge St., Richmond Hill, Ontario L4C-3C9. Made inquiry with a letter dated February 24, 1999.
7. **August 1998 NPLeX Administrations.** The results of the August 1998 administration of the Naturopathic Physicians Licensing Examinations have been submitted to the Council and were included in the report's appendix. Bastyr students and grads continue to perform as well as they have in previous years. CCNM examinees performed somewhat below their norm for previous years. CCNM and SCNM examinees performed below expectations for schools nearing the end of their candidacies.
8. **Correspondence**
- **Inquiries from Prospective Students.** Receive an average of 95 e-mail messages per month from prospective students, a three-fold increase over the first half of 1998. (Our Internet site was first posted in January 1998.) Have responded to each with the specific information requested. About half of the inquiries are about the correspondence schools. The other half ask specific questions about accreditation, new schools, scope of practice, licensing laws, and educational opportunities abroad.
 - **December 17, 1998 letter to Dr. Donald Mayfield,** who is now serving as provost for Central States College of Naturopathic Medicine and Health Sciences. Copy in written report's appendix.
 - **January 21, 1999 letter to Dr. Eddie Johnson,** Alabama's assistant superintendent of education. Written in response to Dr. Johnson's request for information about the anti-licensure activities of principals affiliated with Clayton School of Natural Health.p. Copy in report's appendix.
9. **Internet site.** Averaging about 70 users per day, and about 550 hits per day. Seems a good investment at a start-up cost of less than \$200 and a monthly fee of \$35 (which includes the Council's e-mail account). Access statistics in report's appendix.
10. **Attachments (in report's appendix):**
- "The Role of Faculty Observation in Assessing Students' Clinical Skills," from *Contemporary Issues in Medical Education*, published by the Association of American Medical Colleges.
 - *ASPA News* (Association of Specialized and Professional Accreditors) and March 28-30 conference registration materials.
 - Two pages from a new newsletter on problem-based learning in undergraduate programs, published by Samford University.

- Working papers available from the Health Professions' Task Force on Accreditation of Health Professions Education.

Following Mr. Lofft's report, Dr. Khalsa declared a recessed (12:10 p.m). The meeting reconvened at 1:30.

◆ 7. Old Business Not Related to Recognition Actions

■ Petition to the U.S. Secretary of Education for Renewal of Recognition

Dr. Khalsa noted that members had discussed at the previous evening's work session the possibility of amending the petition filed November 2 to expand the Council's scope of accreditation activities to include other programs of alternative medicine. He felt it was the Council's desire to seriously explore the kinds of colleges and programs that the Council may want to add to its scope. Following discussion among members, **Dr. Bradley moved that the Council seek a deferral from ED of the hearing scheduled in May for the purpose of submitting an addendum to the petition for an expansion of scope. Dr. Wessels seconded. Unanimously adopted.** Mr. Lofft said he would immediately file a letter with ED requesting the deferral.

◆ 8. New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions

■ Technical Assistance Program

Dr. Khalsa pointed to the need for the Council to develop formal policies and procedures for the Technical Assistance Program, which offers consultation to emerging and developing naturopathic medical colleges and programs. Council members made these observations: (1) that a task force be named for exploring options; (2) That the Council shift its level of involvement from one of waiting for requests for consultation services to a more proactive approach; (3) that the Council's members are the experts in this field; (4) that the Council must guard against becoming an external operator of new colleges and programs; and (5) that a flow chart for developing colleges and programs be developed, similar to the one in the *Handbook* for the self-study process. **Dr. Miller moved that a committee be named for developing a plan or plans for working with prospective naturopathic colleges and programs. Dr. Keppler seconded. Unanimously adopted.** Drs. Ringdahl, Bradley, and Keppler volunteered for the committee, and Dr. Khalsa appointed them. He named Dr. Ringdahl chair of the Committee on Technical Assistance.

◆ 9. Business Related to the Recognition of a College or Program (Closed Session)

■ A. Annual Reports of Institutional Members

Dr. Khalsa announced a closed session. Guests departed, with the exception of the ED observers. Dr. Khalsa referred members to the Institutional Members' annual reports to the Council, which had been previously mailed. He asked the primary reader for each report to make brief presentation.

a. Bastyr University's Naturopathic Medicine Program

Dr. Gordon, the primary reader, complimented the university on a very informative catalog. The annual report followed the Council's prescribed outline, and the information in the report was complete. She noted a new program in health and spirituality that would be offered in the fall.

In response to questions from members, Dr. Ringdahl said: (1) the university is taking innovative and creative steps to ensure that student clinicians continue to have a satisfactory number of patient contacts; (2) the Leadership Institute of Seattle (LIOS) is a part of Bastyr, but more in form than in function; and (3) the medical herbology program is intended for those who may wish to work in sales and related areas, not to produce practitioners. Dr. Keppler expressed a concern that the LIOS program may be a financial burden for the university.

b. Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine

In the absence of Dr. Phillips, who was the primary reader for CCNM's report, Mr. Lofft led the discussion. The report was thorough, even containing more information than necessary. In view of the college's recent acquisition of a new campus, discussion centered on (1) the institution's finances, (2) the ability of college to provide an adequate number of patient contacts for a greatly increased number of student clinicians, and at a relocated clinic; (3) the large number of students in certain classes; and (4) how the college instructs students in the history and philosophy of naturopathic medicine.

c. National College of Naturopathic Medicine.

Dr. Adele, the primary reader, led a discussion focused on the college's clinical resources and staffing.

d. **Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences**

At the beginning of this portion of the closed session, the ED observers left the meeting. SCNM President Marchese rejoined the meeting. Dr. Bradley, the primary reader of SCNM's annual report, distributed a written summary of the findings of the the Council's last three evaluation visits to the college. Dr. Bradley said the most recent visit, in November 1998, was not an in-depth evaluation and did not include a visit to the college's clinic. He added that the positive projections of the evaluation report produced after the November visit were not borne out by the more recent developments at the college, and that he did not believe the college was capable of meeting the Council's accreditation standards by this fall, when its five-year limit on candidacy expires. He also expressed the concern that the college had not informed the Council of critical information, such as the adverse action being considered by ED because of the college's financial condition.

Council members spent considerable time discussing the college's audit report. Mr. Marchese said ED's analysis of the audit was erroneously based on new rules that did not apply to this audit. Mr. Lofft said Mr. Marchese's was correct with regard to the college's 1997 audit but not the 1998 audit. Mr. Marchese stated he had not heard that ED had found the 1998 audit unacceptable. Dr. Bradley said the Council had information that the 1998 audit failed ED's analysis. Mr. Marchese offered assurances to the Council that the college could effectively address this issue at the appropriate time through its lawyers, that the college was not in serious financial difficulty, that the current year's budget is a balanced budget, and that Wells Fargo Bank has agreed to restructure the college's debt. Dr. Khalsa noted the college would soon be facing a balloon payment. Mr. Marchese replied that a reserve account of \$140,000 is being built from donations to address the balloon payment.

Dr. Khalsa declared an executive session. Mr. Marchese and Dr. O'Brien departed the meeting. Council members deliberated at length as to what action the Council should take with regard to SCNM. A proposal to issue a show-cause sanction that would in effect require the college to bring in a new administrative team was considered, but a point was made this would put the Council in the role of babysitter for the college and possibly incur liability for the Council should the new management team fail. It was noted that the decision on the college's accreditation is only a few months away. Rather than giving the college time under a show-cause sanction to remedy deficiencies, it would be just as effective to let the college know it has until the September site visit to demonstrate it qualifies for accreditation.

Dr. Miller left the meeting at this point, expressing his apology for not having made a later flight reservation for his return trip home.

Dr. Adele moved that the Council convey in a sternly worded statement the necessity that the college meet the Council's accreditation standards by September, and that the college be informed of the discussion that took place during this executive session. Dr. Bradley seconded. Unanimously adopted. Dr. Khalsa declared an end to the executive session, although the meeting remained in closed session. Dr. O'Brien rejoined the meeting.

Dr. Bradley moved acceptance of the Institutional Members' annual reports. Dr. Keppler seconded. Unanimously adopted.

■ **B. Canadian College Evaluation Team Report**

Dr. Ross departed the meeting. Dr. Gordon, chair of the team that visited CCNM in November, referred members to the evaluation report had been sent to them in January. She reported a generally positive experience, with the possible concern that academic programs were underfunded in comparison to administrative expenses. **The evaluation team's recommendation, Dr. Gordon reported, was that the college's candidacy be continued and that the Council direct it to proceed with an application for accreditation, with the accreditation visit to be scheduled in the fall of 2000. Dr. Gordon so moved. Dr. Keppler seconded. Unanimously adopted.** Dr. Ross rejoined the meeting.

■ **C. Approval of Substantive Changes**

Given the late hour, **Dr. Wessels moved that the Council's consideration of revised mission statements for NCNM and SCNM be deferred to the annual meeting. Seconded. Unanimously adopted.**

◆ **10. Miscellaneous Business**

Dr. Khalsa announced the Council's next scheduled meeting would be in Coeur d'Alene, Idaho, in conjunction with the AANP annual convention during the first week of November.

◆ **11. Adjournment**

There being no further business to be brought before the Council, Dr. Khalsa declared the meeting adjourned. Time of adjournment was 6:15 p.m.

*Respectfully submitted on behalf of
Kareen O'Brien, N.D., Council Secretary,
by Robert Lofft, Recorder
September 18, 1999*

Council on Naturopathic Medical Education, Inc.

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Meeting of July 30, 1999

Telephone Conference Call

Approved November 1, 1999

◆ 1. Call to Order

The Council's president, Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM], Portland, Oregon) called the meeting to order at 12 noon., PDT. He announced the meeting as a special meeting that will be an executive session (closed meeting) of the Council for discussion and action on urgent matters that had developed within the past few days. Other members participating in the conference call were:

- ◆ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ◆ Randall Bradley, N.D. (Profession Member), Omaha, Nebraska;
- ◆ Shirley B. Gordon, Ph.D. (Public Member), Seattle, Washington;
- ◆ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member), South Miami, Florida;
- ◆ N. Edd Miller, Ph.D. (Public Member), Reno, Nevada;
- ◆ Kareen O'Brien, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences [SCNM], Council Secretary), Tempe, Arizona;
- ◆ Carl Phillips, N.D., D.C. (Profession Member), Courtenay, British Columbia;
- ◆ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed., (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington;
- ◆ Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), Toronto, Ontario; and
- ◆ Donald Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Gloucester, Ontario.

Staff Participating:

- ◆ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Council Member Not Participating:

- ◆ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Treasurer), Bellingham, Washington (could not be reached before the meeting).

Dr. Khalsa announced a quorum present.

◆ 2. Agenda

Dr. Khalsa announced two items for the Council's consideration and action:

- A. Whether to issue a show-cause letter to Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine in view of developments at the college within the past four days; and
- B. How to respond to a suggestion received by phone this morning from U.S. Education Department (ED) staff that the Council voluntarily withdraw its petition for the Education Secretary's continued recognition.

◆ 3. Show-Cause Letter to Southwest College

Dr. Khalsa called upon Mr. Lofft to update members on developments at Southwest College. Mr. Lofft summarized the college's financial situation and the events that led to the July 27 resignations of the president and board chair. Following Mr. Lofft's briefing, Dr. Khalsa announced Dr. O'Brien, because of her affiliation with Southwest College, would not participate in this session of the meeting.

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council immediately withdraw the college's status as a candidate for accreditation. Seconded.

Discussion. Mr. Lofft noted the Council's procedures call for the issuance of a show-cause letter prior to any action to withdraw candidacy. Dr. Miller said a show-cause letter was the proper course to take, adding that the letter should ask the college to demonstrate it has the necessary resources to continue operations. Dr. Bradley withdrew his motion.

Dr. Adele moved that the Council issue Southwest College a show-cause letter today that asks the college to demonstrate by 5 p.m., August 2, 1999 that it has the financial resources and leadership necessary to continue operations, with the letter's details to be worked out by Dr. Khalsa, Dr. Bradley, and Mr. Lofft. Seconded. Unanimously adopted.

◆ **4. Withdrawing Petition for Continued Federal Recognition**

Dr. Khalsa asked Mr. Lofft to report on the phone call he had received this morning from ED officials. Dr. Miller commented that a voluntary withdrawal of the Council's petition under the present circumstances would be premature. Discussion of several related issues ensued.

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council send a letter to ED stating the Council will withdraw its petition upon written notice from ED that Southwest College has had its participation in Title IV programs terminated, if that should occur. Seconded. Unanimously adopted.

Dr. Miller suggested that the sending of the letter be delayed until August 3. General agreement. No objections. Mr. Lofft said he would call the Council's contact at ED to let her know a letter will be arriving next week.

◆ **5. Adjournment**

Dr. Miler moved adjournment. Seconded. Unanimously adopted. Time of adjournment: 1:12 p.m. (PDT).

*Respectfully submitted on behalf of
Kareen O'Brien, N.D., Council Secretary,
by Robert Lofft, Recorder
August 6, 1999*

Council on Naturopathic Medical Education, Inc.

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Meeting of August 20, 1999

Telephone Conference Call

Approved November 1, 1999

◆ 1. Call to Order

The Council's president, Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM], Portland, Oregon) called the meeting to order at 11:05 a.m., PDT. He announced the meeting as a special meeting of the Council, in closed session. In addition to Dr. Khalsa, all other members of the Council were participants:

- ◆ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ◆ Randall Bradley, N.D. (Profession Member), Omaha, Nebraska;
- ◆ Shirley B. Gordon, Ph.D. (Public Member), Seattle, Washington;
- ◆ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member), South Miami, Florida;
- ◆ N. Edd Miller, Ph.D. (Public Member), Reno, Nevada;
- ◆ Kareen O'Brien, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences [SCNM], Council Secretary), Tempe, Arizona;
- ◆ Carl Phillips, N.D., D.C. (Profession Member), Courtenay, British Columbia;
- ◆ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed., (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington;
- ◆ Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), Toronto, Ontario;
- ◆ Donald Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Gloucester, Ontario; and
- ◆ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Treasurer), Bellingham, Washington.

Staff Participating:

- ◆ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Guests Participating:

- ◆ Nick Buratovich, N.M.D., Secretary, Board of Directors, SCNM;
- ◆ Carol Giffiths, Staff, Accrediting Agency Evaluation Branch (AAEB), Office of Postsecondary Education (OPE), U.S. Education Department (ED), Washington, D.C. (observer);
- ◆ Clyde Jensen, Ph.D., President, NCNM; Consultant to SCNM;
- ◆ Paul Mittman, N.D., Interim President, SCNM;
- ◆ Douglas Poorman, Ph.D., Academic Dean, SCNM; and
- ◆ Naomi Randolph, Chief, AAEB, Washington, D.C. (observer).

◆ 2. Agenda

Mr. Lofft informed participants he had e-mailed an agenda the previous evening to the Council members who have e-mail. Agenda items were:

1. Call to order. Dr. Khalsa.
2. Roll call and introductions. Mr. Lofft
3. Motion to suspend normal order of business and to defer officers' reports to the annual meeting.
4. Update on SCNM. Drs. Mittman and Jensen.
5. Questions from Council members to Drs. Mittman and Jensen.

6. Executive session, chaired by Dr. Bradley, for consideration of SCNM's continued candidacy.
7. Adjournment.

Dr. Khalsa announced he would like to add one item to the agenda, following item three: A report on his visit to SCNM on August 2-3. Without objection.

◆ **3. Normal Order of Business Suspended; Officers' Reports Deferred**

Dr. Miller moved that the normal order of business for Council meetings be suspended, and that the reports by officers be deferred to the annual meeting. Second. Unanimously adopted.

◆ **4. Dr. Khalsa's Visit to SCNM**

Dr. Khalsa reviewed the events leading up to the July 27 resignations of the college's president and board chair, and the suspension of classes. During the August 2-3 visit, he had met with students, faculty, administrators, and board members. The college's financial situation was clearly very serious, but Wells Fargo bank was again working with the college. ED was allowing the college to continue participation in federal student loan programs. Future loan moneys, however, will be dispersed under ED's reimbursement system, and the college needs to post a letter of credit. The college is working with its auditors to determine the school's exact financial condition, and ED's auditors last week conducted a review of the college's financial aid procedures.

◆ **5. Update on SCNM by Drs. Mittman and Jensen**

Dr. Mittman summarized recent events: On August 6 the college's board voted to continue the summer term, and classes resumed on August 9; graduation took place as scheduled, and the summer term was concluded. Fund-raising efforts have been successful in bringing in \$250,000; students especially are to be thanked. The college has been able to meet payrolls. A report on ED's audit of the college's financial aid procedures is due in about 20 days. Administrators from NCNM and BU have been on campus, working long hours and providing extremely valuable help.

Dr. Jensen said the report by the ED auditors will probably be inconsequential with regard to the routines employed by the college in administering financial aid. During the exit interview, the auditors said the findings with regard to routine were in fact commendable. One question raised had to do with the college's academic calendar, whether the academic year was a three-quarter or four-quarter year, and whether student aid funds were awarded within prescribed limits for a nine-month academic year. The college originally offered three- and four-year programs, and it had a complicated academic calendar for the four-year students, but Dr. Jensen was hopeful that once the calendar was clarified for ED officials, no penalties would be assessed.

Dr. Mittman noted that Dr. Jensen has spent the past two weeks assembling internal and external management teams, and Dr. Mittman asked Dr. Jensen to comment on how the teams will function.

In describing the roles of the internal and external management teams, Dr. Jensen began by saying that SCNM did not have within its own administrative staff the expertise to overcome the financial crisis. The college, however, has re-hired Alan Kluger as its chief financial officer, and other internal officers have been named. Dr. Jensen and his external team will act as pro bono consultants, as mentors for the SCNM administrators. He has met with professionals whom he is hopeful will volunteer for the external management team, including BU representatives. He expects the selection of members for the external team will be completed by August 25.

Dr. Jensen reported he is requesting SCNM's board to declare a financial exigency. He is also leading the college's efforts to develop and implement a "resource recovery plan," to guarantee that the college operates within its revenue

CNME was certainly proceeding properly, Dr. Jensen said, when it imposed the show-cause sanction. He stated SCNM's financial situation was indeed very serious, but other matters also need attention. The college has had a history of turmoil, with differences among three factions (referred to as "the upstairs," "the downstairs," and "the clinic"). Dr. Jensen concluded his remarks by saying he would need three more weeks to assess the situation at SCNM. He expressed hope that the college would be able to post by the September 5 deadline the first \$212,000 installment of a \$436,000 letter of credit being required by ED for continued participation in HEA Title IV programs.

Dr. Miller asked Dr. Jensen about possible efforts to bring the various campus factions together, noting that internal differences can affect finances and the quality of the educational program. Dr. Jensen replied that each group is gaining an increased awareness of the college's needs and operations through their participation in the resource recovery plan. A second way that relations are being improved is that Dr. Mittman and the campus community have declared war; Dr. Mittman and representatives from the various factions meet in a "war room" where issues are discussed.

Dr. Mittman said the divisiveness on campus developed under the previous leadership. To overcome this, two steps

have been taken: The college's administration now has an "open-door" policy (no closed-door meetings), and an open communications policy, with updates issued daily, a telephone hotline, and a website.

Dr. Khalsa said he had recently learned that CNME's previous recommendations had not been passed on to the college's board members. He asked Dr. Buratovich if the board was now taking a more-involved role in the college. Dr. Buratovich replied that much information in the past had not been communicated with the entire board. He listed several ways that communications between the college's leadership and the board have improved since the July resignations of the president and board chair.

Dr. Adele asked the college's officials to what extent the college's community was aware of the show-cause letter that the Council had issued. Dr. Jensen said the sanction had been discussed with students but there had been no formal notification. Dr. Mittman said that the August 3 update issued by the college mentions the sanction and the college's response to it.

Dr. Ringdahl asked about enrollment projections. Dr. O'Brien reported that, to date, 89.1 percent of all students have registered. Of the 211 expected students, 180 have registered. Sixty-eight deposits have been received from incoming students; all in-coming students were notified of the suspension of classes in July-August and are aware of the college's financial difficulties. It is expected only a few of the in-coming students who have paid deposits will decide not to enroll.

Dr. Warren asked whether the college's financial difficulties are adversely impacting the quality of the educational program. Dr. O'Brien replied that one faculty member had recently resigned because of the financial situation, and another may do so. Finding adjunct faculty for the clinic is taking up much staff time. Dr. Jensen noted that some of the clinical training takes place at the college's medical center, and some at "off-site" locations. Next week, he said, college officials are meeting with a large hospital network in the Phoenix area to discuss an affiliation agreement. Despite the college's precarious situation, it has lots of wonderful opportunities, he said.

Dr. Jensen discussed the three-point plan he had described in a recent memorandum: Plan A is to continue SCNM's operations; Plan B is to have the SCNM's operation absorbed by another entity and to continue offering a naturopathic education program in the Phoenix area; and Plan C is to close the school and have the students transfer to other naturopathic colleges. Dr. Jensen said at this point he was not all that optimistic about plan A. He talked about the deterioration that had taken place at the college, and the little time that remained to repair it. He cited several possibilities for Plan B, should it become necessary.

Dr. Adele asked if the college's self-study report would be ready on time. Dr. Poorman said it was being mailed to Council members today.

At 12:10, Dr. Khalsa declared an executive session. Guests (except the ED observers) and the Council members affiliated with SCNM or otherwise having a conflict of interest departed (Drs. Khalsa and O'Brien). Dr. Bradley chaired the executive session, calling for a motion regarding SCNM's continued candidacy.

Dr. Wessels moved that the show-cause letter issued by the Council on July 30 remain in effect, with the amendment that the specific requirements of the July 30 letter now be replaced with the requirement that the College demonstrate by September 7, 1999 that (1) it has complied with conditions recently imposed by the U.S. Education Department; (2) its 1999-2000 enrollment will be sufficient for meeting budgetary projections; and (3) teach-out agreements are in the process of being formalized in the event of the college's closure. Dr. Miller seconded.

Discussion: Dr. Adele asked if the site visit to SCNM would take place as scheduled. Mr. Lofft replied that, provided candidacy is not withdrawn in the interim, the site visit would be conducted September 22-24. Dr. Adele requested that the college's most recent audit report be available to the evaluators.

Dr. Bradley noted the proposed September 7 deadline was a few days short of the three-week period Dr. Jensen had indicated the college would need in order to assure it could continue. In answer to a question, Mr. Lofft said SCNM was scheduled to start its fall classes on September 13.

Dr. Gordon suggested amending Dr. Wessels' motion with a September 10 deadline. Drs. Wessels and Miller agreed to the amendment. Dr. Khalsa called for a vote. Amended motion unanimously adopted.

Dr. Adele suggested that the letter to the college with the amended sanction also include a commendation on the progress SCNM has made in recent weeks toward resolving its financial crisis. Mr. Lofft said he would include the commendation. Without objection.

◆ **5. Adjournment**

**There being no further business to be brought before the Council, Dr. Bradley declared the meeting adjourned.
Time of adjournment: 12:18 p.m. (PDT).**

*Respectfully submitted on behalf of
Kareen O'Brien, N.D., Council Secretary,
by Robert Lofft, Recorder
August 26, 1999*

Council on Naturopathic Medical Education, Inc.

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Meeting of October 13, 1999

Telephone Conference Call

Approved April 1, 2000

◆ 1. Call to Order

The Council's president, Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM], Portland, Oregon) called the meeting to order at 11:03 a.m., PST. He announced the meeting as a special meeting that will be an executive session (closed meeting) to consider the status of Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences as a candidate member of the Council. In addition to Dr. Khalsa, the members participating were:

- ◆ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ◆ Randall Bradley, N.D. (Profession Member), Omaha, Nebraska;
- ◆ Shirley B. Gordon, Ph.D. (Public Member), Seattle, Washington;
- ◆ N. Edd Miller, Ph.D. (Public Member), Reno, Nevada;
- ◆ Kareen O'Brien, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences [SCNM], Council Secretary), Tempe, Arizona;
- ◆ Carl Phillips, N.D., D.C. (Profession Member), Courtenay, British Columbia;
- ◆ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed., (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington;
- ◆ Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), North York, Ontario; and
- ◆ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Treasurer), Bellingham, Washington.

Staff Participating:

- ◆ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Council Members Not Participating:

- ◆ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member), South Miami, Florida (due to a teaching commitment); and
- ◆ Donald Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Gloucester, Ontario (due to a prior commitment).

Dr. Khalsa announced a quorum present.

Dr. Miller moved that the reports of officers and committees, including approval of previous minutes, be deferred to the November 1, 1999 annual meeting. Dr. Wessels seconded. Unanimously adopted.

◆ 2. Agenda

Dr. Khalsa recognized Mr. Lofft for the purpose of stating the business for this meeting. Mr. Lofft said the Council needed to consider whether the documentation recently submitted by SCNM demonstrates that the college satisfies the conditions of the show-cause letter that the Council had issued.

◆ 3. Discussion and Action

Dr. Wessels expressed his view that the Council had two options: (1) accept the submissions as satisfactory and remove the show-cause sanction, or (2) withdraw the college's status as a candidate for accreditation.

Council members shared their impressions of the material the college had submitted. Dr. Miller asked what other information had come to the Council's attention, and Mr. Lofft responded that no other documentation had been made available, but a Council evaluation team had visited the school in late September. Dr. Adele reported on her experience as a member of that team.

At 11:20, Dr. Khalsa, because of a conflict of interest in having served SCNM as a member of a volunteer manage-

ment team, relinquished the chair to Dr. Bradley.

Dr. Bradley asked questions of Dr. O'Brien about the college's progress on developing the teach-out agreement which the Council had required, in the event the college is not accredited in November. Dr. O'Brien responded that a lot more detail needed to be worked out with NCNM, so SCNM might possibly become a branch campus of NCNM should SCNM not be accredited. Dr. Khalsa reported that during a recent visit with the Northwest Association of Schools and Colleges, the indication he received was that NCNM's regional accreditation process would not be jeopardized by taking on SCNM as a branch campus. Dr. Ringdahl reported the topic was also discussed during a recent meeting at BU.

Dr. Bradley thanked Drs. Khalsa and O'Brien for the information they offered. He announced an executive session, closed to any members who had an affiliation with SCNM. Drs. Khalsa and O'Brien departed the meeting.

Dr. Wessels moved that the Council remove the show-cause sanction. Dr. Phillips seconded. Dr. Miller spoke in favor of the motion, as did Dr. Gordon. Other members expressed their satisfaction with the college's progress as a candidate for accreditation, but whether it could qualify for accreditation remained in doubt. **Dr. Adele called the question. Unanimously adopted.**

◆ **4. Adjournment**

There being no additional business before the Council, Dr. Bradley declared the meeting adjourned. Time of adjournment was 11:35 a.m., PST.

*Respectfully submitted on behalf of
Kareen O'Brien, N.D., Council Secretary
by Robert Lofft, Recorder
February 11, 2000*

Council on Naturopathic Medical Education, Inc.

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Meeting of November 1, 1999

The Coeur d'Alene ♦ Coeur d'Alene, Idaho

Approved April 1, 2000

♦ 1. Call to Order

The Council's president, Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM], Portland, Oregon), called the meeting to order at 8:45 a.m. (Pacific Time). Executive Director Robert Lofft announced that this meeting was the Council's 1999 annual meeting, as prescribed by the *Bylaws*. All members were present. In addition to Dr. Khalsa, they were:

- ♦ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ♦ Randall Bradley, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Omaha, Nebraska;
- ♦ Shirley B. Gordon, Ph.D. (Public Member), Seattle, Washington;
- ♦ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member), South Miami, Florida;
- ♦ N. Edd Miller, Ph.D. (Public Member), Reno, Nevada;
- ♦ Kareen O'Brien, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences [SCNM], Council Secretary), Tempe, Arizona;
- ♦ Carl Phillips, N.D., D.C. (Profession Member), Courtenay, British Columbia
- ♦ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed., (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington;
- ♦ Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), North York, Ontario;
- ♦ Donald Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Gloucester, Ontario; and
- ♦ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Treasurer), Bellingham, Washington.

Staff Present:

- ♦ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Guests Present (for all or portions of the meeting's open session):

- ♦ Nancy Aagenes, N.D., L.Ac., Vice President, American Association of Naturopathic Physicians (AANP); Helena, Montana;
- ♦ Clyde Jensen, Ph.D., President, NCNM; Consultant to SCNM (voluntary);
- ♦ Eric Jones, N.D., Associate Professor, BU; Chair of the Council's Evaluation Team to SCNM;
- ♦ Alan Kluger, M.B.A., Chief Financial and Chief Operating Officer, SCNM;
- ♦ Norbert Matts, Ph.D., Provost, Westbrook University, Aztec, New Mexico;
- ♦ Paul Mittman, N.D., Interim President, SCNM;
- ♦ Sheila Myers, N.D., L.Ac., Member, Board of Directors, SCNM; Bend, Oregon; and
- ♦ Douglas Poorman, Ph.D., Vice President for Strategic Planning, SCNM.

♦ 2. Agenda

Dr. Khalsa asked if members had changes to propose in the published agenda. Members requested two changes: (1) that discussion on "Evaluator Training" be added under New Business (as item 8), and (2) that a closed session be added under Miscellaneous Business (as item 11.A) to consider action on the Council's petition for continued federal recognition. Dr. Khalsa added these items to the agenda. Without objection.

◆ **3. Nominations Committee Report**

Committee Members: Drs. Warren (chair), Adele, and Ringdahl. Dr. Warren reported the committee had recently placed a notice in AANP's newsletter, *The Naturopathic Physician*, which announced the Council was accepting nominations for Profession Members. No nominations have been submitted as of yet. Three of the Council's five Profession Members' terms expire in fall 2000 (Drs. Adele, Phillips, and Wessels). The three positions must be filled, as the *Bylaws* require a minimum of five Profession Members. Additionally, the committee is seeking nominations for a Public Member. (Dr. Miller's term expires in fall 2000; he is eligible to serve one additional term.) Dr. Warren invited Council members to submit nominations for Profession and Public Members to any committee member.

◆ **4. Officers' Reports**

■ **A. Secretary**

Dr. O'Brien referred members to the unapproved drafts of the minutes of the Council's meetings of (a) March 6, 1999; (b) July 30, 1999; and (c) August 20, 1999. She asked for corrections. None heard. **Dr. Miller moved that Council members approve the minutes of the three meetings. Dr. Bradley seconded. Unanimously adopted.** Mr. Lofft stated one additional set of draft minutes, for the meeting of October 13, 1999, had not yet been prepared. These minutes will be submitted to Council members for approval at the spring 2000 meeting.

■ **B. Treasurer**

Dr. Wessels referred members to the Budget Report and Financial Statement, dated October 18, 1999, previously mailed to Council members. Beginning-year reserves were \$15,455.18 (the 1998 year-end fund balance). Total revenue to date for 1999 was \$58,996.62, and total expenditures were \$56,106.00, resulting in a current fund balance of \$18,345.80. **Dr. Keppler moved acceptance of the Budget Report and Financial Statement. Dr. Gordon seconded. Unanimously adopted.**

■ **C. Vice President**

Dr. Bradley reported no activities related to his office as vice president.

■ **D. President**

Dr. Khalsa distributed a written report on the challenges and important decisions now before the Council. The report also summarized his experience during the past year as Council president. He addressed the issue of an Institutional Member Representative serving as Council president, and members voiced a consensus on its appropriateness. **Dr. Keppler moved that Council members accept the President's Report, and that the report respectfully be included as an attachment [Exhibit 1] to the meeting's minutes. Dr. Wessel's seconded. Unanimously adopted.**

◆ **5. Committee Reports**

■ **A. Committee on Standards, Policies, and Procedures (COSPP)**

Committee Members: Drs. Bradley, Keppler (appointed at this meeting), Khalsa, O'Brien, Ringdahl, and Ross. Chair vacant. Dr. Bradley addressed the Council, stating the committee was about to begin a new cycle on the revision of the Council's standards. The committee will consider possible tonal directions that the Council might want to implement. Based on the Council's growing experience, the committee plans to examine different approaches to help member and applicant schools better utilize the standards.

Dr. Warren spoke to the importance for a separate standard for a program's clinical component, with greater emphasis on evaluation during on-site visits. Dr. Ringdahl suggested including specificity in the standards, with a reference to OSHA rules. Dr. O'Brien stated the need, with an ever greater shift toward integrative medicine, to clarify how much supervision may be by doctors other than naturopathic physicians. Dr. Warren observed that simply requiring the clinical component to be 1,200 hours is no longer an adequate measurement; the clinical program needs to be more quantified and specified, with a greater emphasis on outcome measures. Dr. Khalsa suggested requiring clinic exit exams that assess students' levels of expertise.

Mr. Lofft noted the committee, so it can address these and other matters, must have a chair to convene its meetings, and the Public Member position needs to be filled. At Dr. Khalsa's request, Mr. Lofft outlined the committee's membership: the four Institutional Member Representatives plus one Public Member and one Profession Member. Dr. Miller stated his desire to volunteer Dr. Keppler to fill the vacancy. Dr. Khalsa appointed Dr. Keppler, and he accepted. Dr. Bradley said the committee would select a chair at its next meeting.

- a. **Proposed Revisions to the Residency Certification Manual.** Dr. Bradley reported the Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education made use of the residency standards for this first time this past summer in evaluating the residency program sponsored by NCM. As a result of that experience, some refinements to the *Residency Certification Manual* are in order. He proposed six changes:
- (1) Adding a new definition to the glossary: “Contract Site: A remote, major, or small training site that is under contract to provide a residency training site for the residency program under review and is under the direct administrative control of the contracted organization or individual.” Contract sites, Dr. Bradley explained, are not directly administered by the sponsoring institution but are under the supervision of the contractor. But the sponsoring institution carries on a review of the contracted site and certifies the resident upon completion.
 - (2) Dropping the requirement that sponsoring institutions provide every resident with membership in the national professional association.
 - (3) Dropping the requirement that the residency program director’s office be at the primary training site.
 - (4) Dropping the requirement that the residency be called “a family practice residency.” Dr. Bradley explained that developments within the profession make this requirement restrictive, and that as long as the Council maintains the principle that a first-year resident’s training consist of at least 60 percent primary naturopathic medicine care, the residency could be called by another name.
 - (5) Revising the requirements for residents’ compensation, allowing a portion of the compensation to be based on production, provided (a) that the compensation plan is approved by CPME, (b) that a requirement is in place for ongoing monitoring by both the program and CPME, (c) that a safety net exists so at no time is the resident left without adequate income. Dr. Bradley said the rationale is to allow schools flexibility in experimenting with compensation plans, but only under tight rein. Dr. Ross questioned the appropriateness of having a resident’s compensation partially based on dispensary proceeds. Dr. Warren expressed a concern about having a compensation plan based on approval by CPME rather than a prescribed standard. He cited the need for a basis on which to make a judgment. Dr. Bradley replied that CPME is still in an experimental stage with residency programs, and that the manual will be revisited for revisions on an ongoing basis. Dr. Miller suggested the change, if adopted, be reviewed within a certain time. Dr. Adele suggested rewording the safety-net requirement, to the effect that residents have a guaranteed minimum so every resident is ensured an adequate income. Dr. Bradley said COSPP will consider this suggestion in the future.
 - (6) Making editorial changes throughout the manual, as appropriate, to accommodate the concept of a contracted site.

Dr. Miller moved that the Council accept Dr. Bradley’s report, which includes immediately adopting the changes to the Residency Certification Manual, and that this matter be placed on the agenda again in one year. Dr. Phillips seconded. Discussion: Mr. Lofft suggested there would be no need for public comment on the changes, because of their nature, and Council members agreed. Dr. Khalsa called for a vote. **Unanimously adopted.**

- b. **Proposed Revisions to Standards, Policies, and Procedures.** Mr. Lofft stated the Council needed to develop regulations, as the *Bylaws* require, for implementing the rotation system for breaking tie votes. He distributed a draft of the proposed rules [Exhibit 2]. **Dr. Bradley spoke in favor of the draft regulations and moved acceptance of them as written. Dr. Kepler seconded. Unanimously adopted.**

Mr. Lofft then distributed draft revisions to the Council’s Appeals Policy [Exhibit 3]. The changes are necessary, he said, because the present policy allows an appeal board composed of non-Council members to make a decision that would grant candidacy or accreditation to a college or program, but the appeal board would not be a federally recognized agency and its decision would therefore not enable a freestanding college to qualify for federal programs. The draft revisions to the policy would call for an appeal board instead to remand the matter to the Council for reconsideration. Mr. Lofft explained the proposed revision would leave it to the Council to decide the extent of the re-evaluation – whether it would include a new self-study and another evaluation visit. Dr. O’Brien asked what prompted the proposed change. Mr. Lofft stated the Council’s present policy had been approved by the Education Department four years ago, but in the most recent Department staff analysis the policy was determined to be in noncompliance with the Department’s regulations. Dr. Bradley questioned whether the proposed new procedure would really be an appeal, as appeals are normally heard by a third party empowered to make the final decision. Mr. Lofft stated his agree-

ment, but in cases where a negative decision is remanded, the appeal board could direct the Council to consider information that had been overlooked. **Dr. Bradley moved adoption of the proposed revisions. Dr. Miller seconded.** Discussion: Dr. Keppler stated he had seen the same appeals process implemented twice during his service for the Northwest Association of Schools and Colleges, and it worked well both times. **It was suggested that the revised policy, if adopted, become effective 30 days after it is released for public comment, provided no negative comments are received. Drs. Bradley and Miller accepted the suggestion as a friendly amendment to the motion.** Dr. Khalsa called for a vote. **Unanimously adopted.**

■ **B. Committee on Development (COD)**

Committee Members: Drs. Wessels (chair) and Ross. Dr. Wessels referred members to information on the current budget report, which showed contributions to date have made up 24.5 percent of the Council's total 1999 revenue. The report also listed the amounts contributed by each national, state, and provincial professional association, as well as the total amount received from individuals. The back side of the report listed individual donors since May 1998.

Dr. Wessels noted several of the professional associations had not yet sent their 1999 contributions, and Mr. Lofft said he had recently mailed a reminder to them, with four additional contributions having already arrived from the associations in Nebraska, Rhode Island, British Columbia, and New Mexico. Dr. Wessels cited the need to maintain visibility with the profession, which could be accomplished in part by coverage in every issue of *The Naturopathic Physician*. Dr. Warren suggested making a presentation of the Council's financial needs to the profession sometime during the AANP convention, especially in light of the desire to hire legal counsel for the Council's federal recognition process. Dr. Phillips spoke in support of the suggestion, saying that potential donors respond best to an urgency.

Dr. O'Brien stressed the need for an ongoing solicitation process among members of the profession, using letters and telephone calls. The Council could hire part-time help throughout the year, and budget for it, to coordinate the effort and maintain records. Dr. Khalsa proposed submitting a funding proposal to the Institute for Natural Medicine, which is now an organization separate from AANP. Dr. Miller said every member of the Council should be a contributor, of any amount, which would further encourage others to give. He suggested proposals for specific projects to foundations, and he mentioned the significant help another organization with which he is affiliated received from an individual donor, on a matching basis, from the parent of a Bastyr alumna. Dr. Miller said the Council should not forget about possibly obtaining help from a major donor.

Dr. Khalsa stated his desire to see the Council develop a formal fund-raising plan, and he suggested a brainstorming session among COD members and other interested Council members sometime during the AANP convention. Dr. Keppler stated the necessity of presenting specific needs to prospective donors. It is important, too, he said, that practitioners become sensitive to the importance of the Council's work and that they financially support it. He also suggested as prospective donors the publishing companies that produce books on natural medicine and health. An action plan for fund raising must be developed, he said.

Dr. Adele said she plans to personally thank the individual donors whom she sees at the AANP convention. Dr. Ringdahl suggested emphasizing the Council's work with residency programs would have for graduates of naturopathic programs. Dr. Khalsa said donors need to know their contributions are valued, and that close contact must be maintained.

Dr. Bradley asked if the Council needs to consider developing a contingency fund for the upcoming effort to retain the Council's federal recognition. Dr. Khalsa said he will include this topic under Miscellaneous Business, where the Council will discuss and take action with regard to retaining federal recognition.

Dr. Keppler moved approval of the COD report. Dr. Miller seconded. Unanimously adopted.

■ **C. Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education (CPME)**

Committee Members: Drs. Bradley (chair), Keppler, O'Brien, Ringdahl (appointed at this meeting), and Wessels (appointed at this meeting). Dr. Bradley announced CPME would meet immediately following this meeting to consider action on the first application to be received by the committee. The application is from the Graduate Medical Education program at NCNM.

a. **Appointment of Members.** Dr. Bradley noted that CPME needed two additional members, and Dr. Khalsa appointed Drs. Ringdahl and Wessels. Both accepted.

- b. **Update on Activities.** Dr. Bradley reported that a CPME evaluation team (himself, Dr. Steve Rissman from Colorado, and Mr. Lofft) visited NCNM's residency program in August, and a member of the team (Mr. Lofft) conducted a visit to one of the program's remote sites in October.

■ **D. Committee on Technical Assistance**

Committee Members: Dr. Ringdahl (chair), Bradley, and Keppler. Dr. Ringdahl reported the committee had recently met and, as a result of the discussions among the committee's members, the committee wished to recommend that the Council pursue a new policy direction which would involve taking a more active role in providing technical assistance and support to existing colleges. One component of the program would utilize the Council's present and former Public Members to serve as consultants to the colleges, and for referring college personnel to someone who may be able to help with a specific problem. The names and phone numbers of the consultants could be provided to the colleges.

Dr. Ringdahl reported her university is becoming active in the American Association for Higher Education, and she would encourage other naturopathic colleges to do the same. In this way, the colleges can build relationships with people who are associated with higher education at its finest

Another of the committee's proposals, Dr. Ringdahl said, is to develop a packet of print materials for responding to initial requests for information from those who are interested in starting naturopathic colleges. A list of consultants for new colleges would also be developed, but no present members of the Council would serve in this capacity. The consultants could be former Public Members and others who have a realistic sense of higher education and accreditation, as well as a knowledge of naturopathic medicine.

Dr. Keppler stated one intention of the committee was to find a goodness of fit in choosing consultants, with consultants identified and selected in light of their expertise in the specific area covered by a particular accreditation standard. Dr. Bradley proposed that a primary consultant could be assigned to helping new colleges, and this individual would be someone with a broad overview of higher education institutions, who, based on a fee structure, would serve in a coordinating role. It is important, he said, that the Council not develop a conflict of interest by accepting funds from a new school and making an investment of its own time in helping the school develop its programs. Dr. Keppler added that the Council would not want to be seen by new colleges as the source of help for all the new school's problems. In assuming this responsibility, it would be difficult for the Council to remain objective in considering the school's candidacy application.

Dr. Gordon asked if representatives of proposed colleges ever request in-depth, information-gathering visits to existing naturopathic colleges. Dr. Ringdahl said the requests come in cycles, and when the visits do occur, it is evident the organizers of the proposed schools have unrealistic expectations about forming relationships with the existing schools. The existing schools need to be certain such relationships are mutually supportive, she said.

Dr. Warren suggested that the committee approach former Public Member Dr. Keith Pailthorp about serving as a technical assistance consultant for proposed and new colleges.

Dr. Bradley stated his personal view that, as the Council revises its standards, it should be with an eye toward taking a more proactive approach with the Council's affiliated colleges and programs. This role would involve the Council being more assertive, early in the process, with schools that may be going in the wrong direction or deficient in certain areas. Dr. Ringdahl noted that making more frequent remedial recommendations, in quick response to undesirable situations, would be a part of the proactive approach. She used the term "preventative educational support."

Dr. Khalsa observed that Council members seem to agree on the general direction of the technical assistance effort, and he asked if any member wished to make a motion based on the report by the committee. **Dr. Ringdahl moved that the Council develop resources that may be utilized by college personnel for educational development. Dr. Warren seconded. Unanimously adopted.**

Members then discussed the Council's role with its colleges, whether it is more desirable to be proactive with the colleges or to maintain a somewhat distant posture of non-involvement. No consensus evolved.

Dr. Miller moved that the Council commend the Technical Assistance Committee on its creative approach to helping new colleges, and that the committee be encouraged in its work. Dr. Phillips seconded. Unanimously adopted.

◆ 6. Executive Director's Report

Mr. Lofft distributed a written report and led members through its contents:

- ◆ Site visits are scheduled for spring 2000 at NCNM and CCNM;
- ◆ The Asinoff lawsuit is still in progress. The judge has indicated dismissal, but CNME has been granted a motion to depose the plaintiff prior to dismissal.
- ◆ Four new naturopathic colleges have been proposed since the last Council meeting, three of them in Canada and one in St. Lucia;
- ◆ Two existing higher education institutions, one in Ontario and the other in the District of Columbia, have requested the Council's *Handbook*;
- ◆ Current *Information Reports* and cover letters were sent to the state and provincial licensing agencies (on August 25, 1999) and the national, state, and provincial professional associations (on October 18, 1999); and
- ◆ The University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine expects to submit its candidacy application in time for consideration at the Council's fall 2000 meeting.

Dr. Kepler moved acceptance of the report. Dr. Wessels seconded, Unanimously adopted.

At 12 noon, Dr. Khalsa declared a recess for lunch. At 1:25, in Dr. Khalsa's absence, Dr. Bradley re-convened the meeting as acting chair. Dr. Khalsa returned at 1:35 and re-assumed the chair (midway through item 8).

◆ 7. Old Business Not Related to Recognition Actions

■ Petition to the U.S. Secretary of Education for Renewal of Recognition

Mr. Lofft reported to members the names of the individuals he submitted to the Education Department to make oral presentations on behalf of the Council. The recognition hearing will be December 6 in Arlington, Virginia. Mr. Lofft said he will prepare a draft response to the Department's October 21 staff analysis, and after revisions suggested by the Council's leadership, the final response document will be submitted by the November 12 deadline. He reported he has been in contact with a Washington, D.C., law firm that may be able to serve as legal counsel.

◆ 8. New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions

■ Evaluator Training

Members discussed the Council's training program for on-site evaluators, with the following suggestions.

- Involve new people not previously associated with the Council's work;
- Bring training materials and presentations up to date, appropriate for current developments at the colleges and in the profession;
- Have Council members and evaluators attend workshops sponsored by other accrediting agencies;
- For new evaluators, have them participate in a mock evaluation visit to one of the colleges;
- Require evaluator training before someone may be eligible for service on the Council;
- Have training an ongoing priority, with some opportunities offered every year;
- Obtain schedules of workshops offered by the regional accreditors;
- Conduct the Council's next training workshop in spring 2001.

The Council reached consensus on encouraging members and prospective members to attend training workshops sponsored by regional accreditors.

◆ 9. Business Related to the Recognition of a College or Program (Closed Session)

■ A. Approval of Substantive Changes

Mr. Lofft stated that because of time constraints at the March 6, 1999 meeting, the Council decided to postpone to this meeting a decision on approving new mission statements that two colleges has submitted.

Dr. Bradley acted as chair for this portion of the meeting.

- a. **NCNM's Revised Mission Statement.** The revised statement was submitted to the Council in a letter from NCNM's president and mailed to Council members in February 1999.

Dr. Ringdahl moved approval of NCNM's revised mission statement. Dr. Keppler seconded. Carried.

Dr. Miller moved that the Council send a letter to member institutions reminding them to adhere strictly to the substantive change procedures, as well as all other procedures and policies. Dr. Keppler seconded. Carried.

- b. **SCNM's Revised Mission Statement.** The new mission statement was submitted to the Council in the college's Special report, mailed to Council members on January 23, 1999.

Dr. Khalsa moved that the Council approve the revised mission statement. Dr. Adele seconded. Carried.

■ **B. Reaffirmation of Accreditation for BU's Naturopathic Medicine Program**

Dr. Ringdahl departed the meeting. Dr. Keppler announced the evaluation team's recommendation on reaffirmation of accreditation.

Dr. Miller moved that the Council accept the Evaluation Team's Report and reaffirm accreditation for the BU Naturopathic Medicine Program, and that the Council's next full scale evaluation of the program take place in 2002. Dr. Wessels seconded. Unanimously adopted.

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council request from BU an interim report on the evaluation team's six major recommendations, coinciding with the submission of the program's next annual report [due by January 2, 2001]. Dr. Miller seconded. Adopted, with one abstention.

Dr. Ringdahl returned to the meeting room

■ **C. Initial Accreditation of SCNM**

Dr. Khalsa, declaring a conflict of interest because he had recently served on a volunteer external management team to the college, relinquished the chair to Dr. Bradley. Dr. Bradley introduced Dr. Mittman, who offered a response to the *Evaluation Team Report* and made a presentation on the college's recent progress and activities. Dr. Bradley declared an executive session, and non-members of the Council, as well as Drs. Khalsa and O'Brien, departed the meeting room.

Dr. Jones summarized the findings of the evaluation team (which also had included Drs. Adele, Warren, and Frank Kerins, Helena, Montana).

Dr. Wessels moved that the Council accept the team's report, granting accreditation to SCNM with the request that the college (1) submit monthly reports for the next six months on its finances, including budget reports, and on the progress the college is making in addressing the three major recommendations in the September 1999 evaluation report; and (2) that the college host a one-day focused visit in May 2000 to assess compliance with the three major recommendations. Dr. Miller seconded.

Dr. Jones departed the meeting. **Motion adopted, with one abstention.**

◆ **10. Election of Officers (Open Session)**

Dr. Khalsa returned to the meeting and re-assumed the chair. He recognized Dr. Warren for the purpose of hearing the Nominations Committee's nominations for Council president, vice president, treasurer, and secretary. Dr. Warren stated the Bylaws provide that each officer except the treasurer may serve two consecutive terms; the treasurer may serve only one term. **He announced the nominees: Dr. Khalsa for re-election as president; Dr. Adele for vice president; Dr. Bradley for treasurer; and Dr. O'Brien for re-election as secretary. Dr. Wessels moved that the slate of nominees be elected. Dr. Phillips seconded. Dr. Wessels called the question. Unanimously adopted.**

Mr. Lofft, on behalf of the Council, conveyed congratulations to the elected officers. Members agreed by consensus that Dr. Khalsa's previous partial term as president does not affect his eligibility to serve two consecutive full terms.

Dr. O'Brien expressed a concern that the Council lacked liability insurance for its officers and other board members. Dr. Miller supported the concept of having board liability insurance. Mr. Lofft said he has been gathering information on liability insurance from different companies; simple liability insurance, that protects the Council against losses due to accidents for which the Council might be held at fault, is inexpensive, but insurance against lawsuits based on the Council's decisions and responsibilities as an accrediting agency would be quite costly. He offered an estimate of \$180 a month. No consensus was reached.

◆ **11. Miscellaneous Business**

■ **A. Response to the Education Department's Staff Analysis**

Dr. Khalsa declared an executive session. **Dr. Bradley moved that the Council seek an extension in its recognition with the help of legal counsel, if deemed advisable by the Council's Executive Committee. Dr. Wessels seconded.** Dr. Khalsa called for a vote. **Adopted, with one abstention.**

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council request a voluntary assessment of \$10,000 from each accredited program as a contingency fund for expenses associated with retaining recognition by the U.S. Secretary of Education, with any leftover funds to be applied toward seeking membership with the Council for Higher Education Accreditation. Dr. Wessels seconded.

Discussion: Mr. Lofft noted the institutional members' dues must be paid by January 1, in two months, which would be adequate for now. he said the voluntary assessment could then be paid over a period of ten months during the coming year, which could be used to finance the Council's ongoing operations. All Institutional Member Representatives from accredited programs expressed agreement with this plan. Dr. O'Brien called the question. **Adopted, with one abstention.**

The Council agreed by consensus that the Executive Committee was not empowered to make a decision to withdraw from the Education Department's recognition process, should a withdrawal be proposed by legal counsel or others. Such a proposal would need to come before the entire Council during a telephone meeting. End of executive session.

■ **B. Recognition of Retiring Director**

Dr. Khalsa recognized Mr. Lofft, who announced the Council's conferral of its 1999 Service Award upon Dr. Gordon. He read the award certificate:

Presented to Dr. Shirley B. Gordon, Ph.D. in gratitude for her invaluable leadership as a Public Member of the Council from 1993 to 1999, for her service as chair of on-site evaluation teams, and for her gracious and generous spirit in contributing her higher education experience and wise counsel to the voluntary accreditation process for naturopathic medical colleges and programs in the United States and Canada. Presented November 1, 1999, Coeur d'Alene, Idaho.

Mr. Lofft asked for a motion to grant the award. Unanimous affirmation. Dr. Gordon accepted the award to the applause of the members. She said her service on the Council had been truly gratifying, and she stated her ongoing commitment to promoting an understanding of naturopathic medicine among the professionals with whom she is associated. Dr. Khalsa expressed the the Council's gratitude to Dr. Gordon for her service.

■ **C. Next Meeting**

Members discussed a date and place for the Council's semiannual meeting in spring 2000. Dr. Miller suggested that the Executive Committee be charged with selecting a date and place. Dr. Wessels spoke in favor of this suggestion. Dr. Bradley suggested Reno as a site. Dr. Miller said he would be happy to have the Council in Reno. Members generally agreed that the meeting could be in April, but left the final decision to the Executive Committee. [Recorder's note: The Executive Committee decided to schedule the meeting for April 1, 2000, in Reno, with an informal planning session on the evening of March 31.]

Dr. Khalsa recognized Dr. Miller, who offered an evaluation of the executive director's performance. Affirmed by consensus. Mr. Lofft thanked Dr. Miller for his remarks.

◆ **11. Adjournment**

There being no further business before the Council, Dr. Miller moved adjournment. Unanimously affirmed. Time of adjournment was 7:05 p.m.

*Respectfully submitted on behalf of
Kareen O'Brien, N.D., Council Secretary,
by Robert Lofft, Recorder
February 11, 2000*

Council on Naturopathic Medical Education, Inc.

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Meeting of April 1, 2000

Cal Neva / Virginian Hotel ♦ Reno, Nevada

Approved September 11, 2000

♦ 1. Call to Order

The Council's president, Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM], Portland, Oregon), called the meeting to order at 8:48 a.m. (Pacific Time). Executive Director Robert Lofft announced that this meeting was the Council's 2000 semiannual meeting, as prescribed by the *Bylaws*.

By consensus, members agreed each meeting is to begin with a reading of the the Council's mission statement. Dr. Ringdahl read the statement.

In addition to Dr. Khalsa, the members present were:

- ♦ Randall Bradley, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Treasurer), Omaha, Nebraska;
- ♦ N. Edd Miller, Ph.D. (Public Member), Reno, Nevada;
- ♦ Kareen O'Brien, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences [SCNM], Council Secretary), Tempe, Arizona;
- ♦ Carl Phillips, N.D., D.C. (Profession Member), Courtenay, British Columbia;
- ♦ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed., (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington; and
- ♦ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member), Bellingham, Washington.

Staff Present:

- ♦ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Members Absent:

- ♦ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ♦ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member), South Miami, Florida;
- ♦ Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), North York, Ontario; and
- ♦ Donald Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Gloucester, Ontario.

♦ 2. Agenda

Members agreed to three additions to the Draft Agenda, all under item 7, New Business: (A) joining the Association of Specialized and Professional Accreditors (ASPA) and the Council for Higher Education Accreditation (CHEA); (B) a discussion of the Council's pre-meeting work sessions; and (C) future directions for the Council.

♦ 3. Officers' Reports

■ A. Secretary

- a. Dr. Phillips moved acceptance of the the minutes of the Council's meeting of October 13, 1999. Dr. Wessels seconded. Carried.
- b. Dr. Phillips moved acceptance of the minutes of the Council's meeting of November 1, 1999. Dr. Wessels seconded. Dr. Bradley moved to amend the motion to have the draft of the minutes changed to conform with the Council's policy of including only motions, not discussion, for the parts of meetings that were closed sessions. Seconded. Carried. Amended main motion carried.

Following discussion, Dr. Khalsa directed that minutes of future Council meetings include only motions, appointments, other necessary information, and material that the Council or the president may direct during the course of a meeting for inclusion in the minutes.

■ **B. Treasurer**

- a. Dr. Wessels moved acceptance of the 1999 Year-End Budget Report [Exhibit 1] (mailed to absent members on April 7, 2000). Dr. O'Brien seconded. Carried.
- b. Dr. Wessels moved adoption of the 2000 Proposed Budget [Exhibit 2] (mailed to absent members on April 7, 2000). Dr. Miller seconded. Carried. Agreed by consensus: That the line items for ASPA and CHEA memberships be combined as one item.

■ **C. Vice President**

Dr. Adele absent. No report.

■ **D. President**

Dr. Khalsa stated his activities have been related to the Council's federal recognition status, and that he will present his report under agenda item 6.A.

◆ **4. Committee Reports**

■ **A. Committee on Standards, Policies, and Procedures (COSPP)**

Members: Drs. Bradley (chair), Keppler, Khalsa, O'Brien, Ringdahl, and Ross. Dr. Bradley submitted his resignation as a COSPP member, pending selection of another Profession Member to replace him. Dr. Khalsa stated he will ask Dr. Warren to consider joining COSPP and serving as chair.

■ **B. Committee on Development (COD)**

Members: Drs. Wessels (chair) and Ross. Written report [Exhibit 3] (mailed to absent members on April 7, 2000).

■ **C. Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education (CPME)**

Members: Drs. Bradley (chair), Keppler, O'Brien, Ringdahl, and Wessels. Dr. Bradley announced CPME granted certification on November 1, 1999 to NCNM's Graduate Medical Education Program. CPME has requested the program to host its next on-site evaluation in the fall of 2001.

■ **D. Committee on Technical Assistance**

Members: Dr. Ringdahl (chair), Bradley, and Keppler. Dr. Ringdahl presented a verbal report.

■ **E. Nominations Committee**

Members: Drs. Warren (chair), Adele, and Ringdahl. Written report [Exhibit 4] (mailed to absent members on April 7, 2000). With Dr. Warren's retirement from the committee, Dr. Khalsa appointed his replacement, Dr. Keppler, as chair.

◆ **5. Executive Director's Report**

Written report [Exhibit 5] (mailed to absent members on April 7, 2000). Regarding the upcoming interim visit to SCNM, Dr. Khalsa stated the team will consist of the Council's executive director and two others, one of them a Council member. Dr. Ringdahl suggested BU's financial vice president as one team member. Regarding the lawsuit against CNME, Dr. Bradley offered to have a mutual friend contact the plaintiff. Without objection.

◆ **6. Old Business Not Related to Recognition Actions**

■ **Report on CNME's Federal Recognition Status**

Dr. Khalsa briefed members on developments since the Council's November 1, 1999 meeting. Following discussion, Dr. Khalsa stated he would talk with the Council's attorneys to determine the best course to take with regard to communicating the Council's concerns to the U.S. Department of Education. Without objection.

At 12 noon, Dr. Khalsa declared a recess for lunch. He re-convened the meeting at 1:30 p.m.

◆ **7. New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions**

■ **A. Memberships Applications to ASPA and CHEA**

Members discussed seeking affiliation for the Council with ASPA and CHEA. (Information on ASPA and its *Code of Good Practice* [Exhibit 6] were mailed to Council members on January 24, 2000.) Members agreed by consensus to pursue ASPA membership at once but to postpone submitting an application to CHEA.

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council adopt ASPA's *Code of Good Practice*. Dr. Wessels seconded. Carried.

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council submit an application to ASPA in time for consideration at the organization's next meeting. Dr. Phillips seconded. Carried.

■ **B. Pre-Meeting Work Sessions.**

Members discussed the Council's pre-meeting work sessions that are held on the evening before the annual and semiannual meetings. Dr. Bradley moved that the evening work sessions henceforth be conducted in executive session as part of each annual and semiannual meeting, but the evening sessions may not include any discussion or action related to recognizing a college or program. Dr. Wessels seconded.

Dr. Miller moved to amend the motion to add that the Council may not consider actions of any kind during the evening sessions. Dr. O'Brien seconded. Carried. Main motion carried.

■ **C. Future Directions for the Council.**

Members discussed the Council's role as a programmatic accreditor and the importance of maintaining the confidence of the colleges, the profession, licensing agencies, and the examinations board.

◆ **8. Business Related to the Recognition of a College or Program (Closed Session)**

■ **A. Acceptance of Institutional Members' 1999 Annual Reports.**

a. Dr. O'Brien moved acceptance of the report submitted by BU's Naturopathic Medicine Program. Dr. Wessels seconded. Carried.

b. Dr. Wessels moved acceptance of CCNM's report. Dr. Miller seconded. By consensus, in the absence of CCNM's Institutional Member Representative, the motion was tabled until the Council's next meeting. Dr. Bradley moved that the Council direct a letter to CCNM's Institutional Member Representative regarding the procedures to be followed in submitting annual reports. Seconded. Carried.

c. Dr. Wessels moved acceptance of NCNM's annual report. Dr. Bradley seconded. Carried.

d. Dr. Wessels moved acceptance of SCNM's annual report. Dr. Bradley seconded. Carried.

■ **B. Acceptance of SCNM's Monthly Reports**

Dr. O'Brien departed the meeting. Dr. Miller moved that the Council issue a letter of advisement to the college. Dr. Bradley seconded. Carried.

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council request SCNM to continue submitting monthly reports until the Council's annual meeting in September 2000. Dr. Phillips seconded. Carried. (Closed session concluded. Dr. O'Brien returned to the meeting.)

◆ **9. Miscellaneous Business**

Next Meeting. Council members agreed to have their next meeting in Bellevue, Washington, during the national convention of the American Association of Naturopathic Physicians. Tentatively, members selected September 10 (evening) and 11 (during the day).

◆ **10. Adjournment**

There being no further business before the Council, Dr. Miller moved adjournment. Dr. O'Brien seconded. Carried. of adjournment was 5:30 p.m.

*Respectfully submitted on behalf of
Kareen O'Brien, N.D., Council Secretary,
by Robert Lofft, Recorder
May 9, 2000*

COUNCIL ON NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL EDUCATION

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Meeting of September 11, 2000
DoubleTree Hotel ♦ Bellevue, Washington

Approved March 31, 2001

♦ 1. Call to Order, Meeting Notice, Roll of Members, Introductions

The Council's president, Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM], Portland, Oregon), declared a quorum present and called the meeting to order at 8:33 a.m. The Council's executive director announced the meeting as the Council's 2000 annual meeting, as prescribed by the *By-laws*. In addition to Dr. Khalsa, members present were:

- ♦ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ♦ Randall Bradley, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Treasurer), Omaha, Nebraska;
- ♦ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member), South Miami, Florida;
- ♦ N. Edd Miller, Ph.D. (Public Member), Reno, Nevada;
- ♦ Donald Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Gloucester, Ontario;
- ♦ Carl Phillips, N.D., D.C. (Profession Member), Courtenay, British Columbia;
- ♦ Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, The Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), North York, Ontario;
- ♦ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed., (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington; and
- ♦ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member), Bellingham, Washington.

Member Nominees Present:

- ♦ Douglas H. Poorman, Ph.D. (Institutional Member Representative Nominee), Chief Academic Officer, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences (SCNM), Tempe, Arizona; and
- ♦ Paul R. Saunders, N.D., Ph.D. (Profession Member Nominee), Dundas, Ontario.

Staff Present:

- ♦ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Member Absent:

- ♦ Karen O'Brien, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative, retiring as of this meeting), SCNM.

Guests Present for Parts of the Meeting:

- ♦ James F. Bemis, Ed.D., LL.D., Executive Director Emeritus, Commission on Colleges, Northwest Association of Schools and Colleges, Seattle, Washington; Evaluation Team Member, Full-Scale Evaluation Visit to CCNM, March 22-24, 2000;
- ♦ Sheldon Haber, Vice President for Finances & Administration, BU; Evaluation Team Member, Focused Evaluation Visit to SCNM, August 17-18, 2000;
- ♦ Eric Jones, N.D., Associate Professor, BU; Evaluation Team Chair, Full-Scale Evaluation Visit to NCNM, May 17-19, 2000;
- ♦ Peter Martin, D.C., Interim Dean, University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine (UBCNM), Bridgeport, Connecticut;
- ♦ Paul Mittman, N.D., President, SCNM; and
- ♦ Anthony F. Ross, Jr., Ph.D., Associate Dean, UBCNM

◆ 2. Agenda

Members agreed to three additions to the Draft Agenda:

- ◆ Under item 7, “Old business not related to recognition actions,” was added “Discussion on the Council for Higher Education Accreditation, and New Directions for CNME”;
- ◆ Under item 8, “New business not related to recognition actions,” were added (a) “Discussion of the Town Hall Meetings of the White House Commission on Complementary and Alternative Medicine,” and (b) “Discussion of a Time and Place for CNME Committee Meetings.”

◆ 3. Election of Directors and Secretary

Dr. Keppler, chair of the Nominations Committee, introduced the committee’s two nominees for election to membership and the Board of Directors. Nominations seconded. Both elected unanimously. Dr. Adele nominated Dr. Wessels for secretary, to complete the one remaining year on Dr. O’Brien’s term. Dr. Warren seconded. Dr. Wessels was unanimously elected secretary.

◆ 4. Officers’ Reports

■ A. Secretary

Dr. Keppler moved approval of the minutes of the Council’s April 1, 2000 meeting with one correction: Under the Vice President’s report, correct the wording to state the Vice President (Dr. Adele) was absent. Seconded. Carried.

■ B. Treasurer

- a. **Budget Report.** Dr. Adele moved acceptance of the Budget Report and Financial Statement dated September 7, 2000 (EXHIBIT 1). Seconded. Carried.
- b. **Proposed Budget.** Dr. Miller moved adoption of the 2001 Proposed Budget [EXHIBIT 2]. Seconded. Carried. Dr. Keppler suggested that the Council establish a process for reviewing staff performance and compensation, and Dr. Khalsa added the topic to the agenda as item C under “New business not related to recognition actions.” Without objection.

■ C. Vice President

Dr. Adele reported no activities related to her office as vice president.

■ D. President

Dr. Khalsa presented comments regarding the Council’s federal recognition and the role the Council has in ensuring the high quality of naturopathic medical education programs.

◆ 5. Committee Reports

■ A. Committee on Standards, Policies, and Procedures (COSPP)

Members: Drs. Warren (chair), Khalsa, O’Brien, Ringdahl, and Ross. Dr. Khalsa announced the appointment of Dr. Warren as COSPP chair. Dr. Warren stated the committee plans to submit a new set of accreditation standards by next year, as well as revisions to the policies and procedures in the *Handbook*.

■ B. Committee on Development (COD)

Members: Drs. Wessels (chair) and Ross. Dr. Wessels reported on contributions received this year from the professional associations (\$21,959.80) and individuals (\$3,555.00).

■ C. Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education (CPME)

Members: Drs. Bradley (chair), Keppler, O’Brien, Ringdahl, and Wessels. Dr. Khalsa moved that the Council set \$2,000 as the amount for the annual dues paid by the sponsoring institutions of certified residency programs, effective with the beginning of 2001. Seconded. Carried.

■ D. Committee on Technical Assistance

Members: Dr. Ringdahl (chair), Bradley, and Keppler. No report.

■ **E. Nominations Committee**

Members: Drs. Keppler (chair), Adele, and Ringdahl. Written report [Exhibit 3] (mailed to absent members on April 7, 2000). Dr. Adele nominated Dr. Francis J. Kerins for election to the Council as a Public Member, with his term to be effective upon election. Seconded. Council members unanimously elected Dr. Kerins.

Council members discussed the possibility of Dr. Joan Niemann as a future Public Member. By consensus, the Council agreed to invite her to the March 2001 Evaluators' Training Workshop as a presenter and participant.

◆ **6. Executive Director's Report**

Dr. Keppler moved acceptance of the Executive Director's Report [EXHIBIT 4]. Seconded. Carried.

◆ **7. Old Business Not Related to Recognition Actions**

Council for Higher Education Accreditation. Dr. Bradley moved that the Council prepare and submit an application for membership in and recognition by the Council for Higher Education Accreditation. Seconded. Carried.

At 11:45 a.m., Dr. Khalsa declared a recess for lunch. He re-convened the meeting at 1:20 p.m.

◆ **8. New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions**

■ **A. White House Commission on Complementary and Alternative Medicine**

Members exchanged information about the commission and the series of town hall meetings it is conducting.

■ **B. Time and Place for Committee Meetings**

The Council by consensus agreed to have the Council's president and executive director establish a schedule and place for committee meetings and a full-Council work session on the day and evening before the Council's next meeting.

■ **C. Performance Evaluation**

Dr. Khalsa established an *ad hoc* Evaluation and Compensation Committee. He appointed Drs. Keppler (chair), Wessels, and Saunders as its members, with Mr. Lofft as an *ex officio* member. Dr. Khalsa charged the committee with conducting a performance evaluation of the Council's contracted executive director services, and later of the Council's board.

Dr. Miller moved that the Council in executive session consider the executive director's position description and contract. Dr. Bradley seconded. Discussion. Carried.

In executive session, Dr. Warren moved to increase the executive director's contracted annual fee by \$2,100 beginning January 1, 2001, based on a 2.8 percent cost-of-living increase over two years. Dr. Miller seconded. Carried.

Dr. Phillips moved to amend the 2001 budget, taking \$2,100 from the amount allocated for reserves and adding it to the amount allocated for the executive director's contract. Dr. Keppler seconded. Carried. (End of executive session. Mr. Lofft absent during the session.)

◆ **9. Business Related to the Recognition of a College or Program (Closed Session)**

■ **A. CCNM's 1999 Institutional Member Annual Report**

Following discussion, Dr. Wessels moved acceptance of the report. Seconded. Carried.

■ **B. SCNM's Monthly Reports**

Dr. Keppler moved acceptance of the reports. Dr. Warren seconded. Discussion. Carried.

■ **C. UBCNM Candidacy Application**

Response by and interview with UBCNM Interim Dean Dr. Martin and Associate Dean Dr. A. Ross. Dr. Bradley moved that the Council accept the candidacy application submitted by UBCNM. Seconded. Discussion. Motion withdrawn.

Dr. Miller moved that the Council accept the application (Dr. Bradley's original motion). Dr. Wessels seconded. Discussion. Did not carry.

Dr. Adele moved that the Council defer action until its spring meeting, pending the timely submission by UBCNM of the University's 2000 audit report and a letter clarifying the University's relationship with its regional accreditor. Dr. Miller seconded. Carried. (Dr. Martin and A. Ross absent during Council's discussion and vote.)

■ **D. Initial Accreditation for CCNM**

Report and recommendation presented by Dr. Phillips, team chair for the full-scale evaluation visit, March 22-24, 2000. Interview with Dr. C. Ross.

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council grant accreditation, with the next full-scale evaluation conducted within the Council's five-year review cycle, on condition that the college submit an interim report in September 2001 regarding the progress on the recommendations in the March 2000 evaluation report, both the major recommendations and those at the end of each section of the evaluation report; that in fall 2003 the college host a two-person team for a one- or two-day evaluation visit that will focus on all recommendations; and that the college submit a progress report covering the recommendations at least 30 days prior to the visit. Dr. Keppler seconded. Discussion. Carried. (Drs. C. Ross and Saunders absent during team chair's recommendation, Council's discussion, and vote.)

Reconsideration of Visit Date for BU. Dr. Warren moved that the Council place on the agenda for its next meeting the reconsideration of the date previously scheduled for the next full-scale evaluation visit to BU's Naturopathic Medicine Program. Dr. Khalsa agreed to place this item on the next meeting's agenda before the motion could be seconded. Without objection.

■ **E. Reaffirmation of Accreditation for NCNM's Naturopathic Medicine Program**

Vice President Dr. Adele presided. Report and recommendation by Dr. Jones, chair of the team for the full-scale evaluation visit, May 17-19, 2000. Response by and interview with Dr. Khalsa.

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council reaffirm its grant of accreditation to NCNM's Naturopathic Medicine Program, with the next full-scale evaluation to take place within the Council's five-year review cycle, on condition that the program submit an interim report in September 2001 on the progress being made regarding the major recommendations in the May 2000 evaluation report; that the program host a two-person evaluation team for a one- or two-day visit in fall 2003 which will focus on all recommendations in the May 2000 evaluation report, both the major recommendations and the recommendations at the end of each section of the report; and that the program submit a progress report on all recommendations at least 30 days prior to the fall 2003 focused visit. Seconded. Carried. (Dr. Khalsa absent during team chair's recommendation, Council's discussion, and vote.)

■ **F. Reaffirmation of Accreditation for SCNM**

Report presented by Mr. Haber and Dr. Wessels, team members for the focused evaluation visit, August 17-18, 2000. Response by and interview with SCNM President Dr. Mittman and Dr. Poorman.

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council withdraw its April 1, 2000 letter of advisement to SCNM. Several members seconded. Carried.

Dr. Bradley moved that the college's accreditation be continued, with the next full-scale evaluation to take place within the Council's five-year review cycle, on condition that the college submit quarterly reports during the next year on finances and all recommendations in the September 1999 and August 2000 evaluation reports; that the college host a two-day visit by a two-person evaluation team in fall 2001 which will focus on finances and all recommendations in the September 1999 and August 2000 evaluation reports; and that the college provide documentation to the Council by October 11, 2000 that its students and applicants have been informed of the April 2000 decision by Washington state not to license new graduates of the college. Dr. Phillips seconded. Carried. (Drs. Mittman and Poorman absent during the team's recommendation, Council's discussion, and vote.)

◆ **10. Miscellaneous Business (Open Meeting Resumed)**

■ **A. Recognition of Retiring Directors**

Dr. Wessels moved that the Council formally recognize the outstanding contributions of its three retiring directors by presenting Service Awards to Drs. Miller, O'Brien, and Phillips. Seconded. Carried. Mr. Lofft presented the awards. Dr. Poorman accepted Dr. O'Brien's award in her absence.

■ **B. Date and Site for Evaluators' Training Workshop**

Members agreed by consensus that the workshop be conducted March 31 or April 1 at a site determined by the Executive Committee.

■ **C. Date and Site for the 2001 Semiannual Meeting**

Members agreed by consensus that the meeting take place March 31 or April 1 at a site determined by the Executive Committee.

◆ **11. Adjournment**

There being no further business before the Council, Dr. Miller moved adjournment. Seconded. Carried. Time of adjournment was 6:24 p.m.

*Respectfully submitted on behalf of
Joseph Wessels, N.D., Council Secretary,
by Robert Lofft, Recorder
February 9, 2001*

COUNCIL ON NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL EDUCATION

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Meeting of November 1, 2000 Special Meeting ♦ Telephone Conference Call

Approved March 31, 2001

1. Call to Order, Meeting Notice, Roll of Members, Introductions

The Council's president, Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM], Portland, Oregon), declared a quorum present and called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m., PST. The Council's executive director announced the meeting as a special meeting called by Council's president. Besides Dr. Khalsa, members participating were:

Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Colorado Springs, Colorado;

Randall Bradley, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Treasurer), Omaha, Nebraska;

Francis J. Kerins, Ed.D. (Public Member), Helena, Montana;

Douglas H. Poorman, Ph.D. (Institutional Member Representative, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Science [SCNM]), Tempe, Arizona;

Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, The Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), North York, Ontario;

Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed., (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington; and

Paul R. Saunders, Ph.D., N.D. (Profession Member), North York, Ontario; and

Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member), Bellingham, Washington.

Staff Present:

Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Members Absent:

William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member), South Miami, Florida;

Donald Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Gloucester, Ontario.

Guests Present for Part of the Meeting:

Peter Martin, D.C., Interim Dean, University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine (UBCNM), Bridgeport, Connecticut;

Anthony F. Ross, Jr., Ph.D., Associate Dean, UBCNM

Members agreed to the Draft Agenda as e-mailed to them:

1. Call to order, roll call, agenda changes.
2. Motion to defer officer and committee reports to the semiannual meeting.

3. Comments by Dr. Peter Martin, Interim Dean, UBCNM. Questions and responses.
4. Closed Session. Motion to accept for consideration the candidacy application from UBCNM.
5. Request from SCNM to defer deadline for informing applicants of Washington state's decision not to recognize SCNM graduates as eligible for licensing. (SCNM letter and attachments mailed to members October 20.)
6. Letter of inquiry about CNME's policy on advance standing and transfer credit (mailed to members October 20).
7. Adjournment.

2. Officer and Committee Reports Deferred

Dr. Wessels moved to defer officer and committee reports to the semiannual meeting. Dr. Bradley seconded. Carried.

3. Comments by UBCNM's Interim Dean

Dr. Martin reviewed the additional information submitted to members since the Council's September 11, 2000 meeting, and he informed them of several recent developments, including UBCNM's engagement of Dr. James Bemis as a consultant for the self-study process. He responded to questions regarding the search process for a permanent dean; the college's relationship with the local naturopathic profession; the number of students to graduate in June 2001(4), December 2001 (6), and June 2002 (12); and enrollment projections (30 new students for fall 2001, and 30 more new students each fall thereafter).

4. Acceptance of UBCNM'S Candidacy Application (Closed Session)

Dr. Bradley moved that the Council accept for consideration the candidacy application from UBCNM. Dr. Wessels seconded. Discussion. Carried. (Drs. Martin and Ross not participating in closed session and remainder of meeting.)

5. Request from SCNM

Dr. Kerins moved that the Council deny the request from SCNM that the college be granted an extension in the deadline for informing applicants of Washington state's decision not to license new graduates of the college. Dr. Wessels seconded. Discussion. Carried.

6. Inquiry Letter Regarding Advance Standing and Transfer Credit

Discussion. No action.

7. Adjournment

There being no further business, Dr. Khalsa declared the meeting adjourned at 11:20 a.m., PST.

*Respectfully submitted on behalf of
Joseph Wessels, N.D., Council Secretary,
by Robert Lofft, Recorder
February 9, 2001*

COUNCIL ON NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL EDUCATION

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Meeting of August 20, 2001 **Sheraton El Conquistador Resort ♦ Tucson, Arizona**

Approved March 17, 2002

♦ 1. Call to Order, Meeting Notice, Roll of Members, Introductions

The Council's president, Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM]), Portland, Oregon, declared a quorum present and called the meeting to order at 8:32 a.m. The Council's executive director announced the meeting as the Council's 2001 annual meeting, as prescribed by the *Bylaws*. All members were present. In addition to Dr. Khalsa, they were:

- ♦ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ♦ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member, Council Treasurer), South Miami, Florida;
- ♦ Francis J. Kerins, Ed.D. (Public Member), Helena, Montana;
- ♦ Douglas H. Poorman, Ph.D. (Institutional Member Representative, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences [SCNM]), Tempe, Arizona;
- ♦ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed., (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington;
- ♦ Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, The Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), North York, Ontario;
- ♦ Paul R. Saunders, N.D., Ph.D. (Profession Member), Dundas, Ontario;
- ♦ Don Warren, N.D., (Profession Member), Ottawa, Ontario; and
- ♦ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Secretary), Bellingham, Washington.

Member Nominee President:

- ♦ Peter Martin, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative Nominee, University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine [UBCNM]), Bridgeport, Connecticut.

Staff Present:

- ♦ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Guests Present for Parts of the Meeting:

- ♦ R. Wilson Geldner, N.D., President, Florida Naturopathic Physicians Association, Orlando, Florida;
- ♦ Bob L. Harris, Attorney, Akerman, Senterfitt & Eidson, P.A., Tallahassee, Florida;
- ♦ Marvin D. Kelly, Ph.D., Vice president for Administration, National College of Oriental Medicine, Orlando, Florida;
- ♦ David Matteson, Director of Public Affairs and Advisor to the President, BU; and
- ♦ Michael Brad Miller, M.D., Dean, National College of Oriental Medicine, Orlando, Florida.

♦ 2. Agenda

Members agreed to add one item to the agenda, as Item 8-A under "New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions": Discussion of a Three-Year Strategic Plan for CNME.

♦ 3. Election of Directors

Dr. Keppler, chair of the Nominations Committee, presented information on the Committee's nomination of Dr. Rita Bettenburg of Portland, Oregon, as a Profession Member, for a three-year term beginning upon election. Dr. Wessels second the nomination. After discussion, members voted to elect Dr. Bettenburg.

Dr. Keppler presented information on Dr. Peter Martin of Bridgeport, Connecticut, nominated by the University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine as its Institutional Member Representative. Dr. Adele seconded the nomination. Following discussion (Dr. Martin not present), members elected Dr. Martin.

Dr. Keppler moved that the nominations be closed. Seconded. Carried.

◆ 4. Officers' Reports

■ A. Secretary

Dr. Wessels referred members to the draft minutes of the Council's meeting of March 31, 2001. One correction was noted: Dr. Poorman is to be included among the members of the Committee on Standards, Policies, and Procedures as listed in item 5.A, page 2 of the minutes. Dr. Kerins moved acceptance of the minutes as corrected. Dr. Keppler seconded. Carried.

■ B. Treasurer

1. Budget Report and Financial Statement. Dr. Keppler referred members to the current Budget Report and Financial Statement in their meeting packets. The report, dated August 20, 2001, showed revenue at \$54,522.46 and expenses at \$53,197.35. Cash on hand was \$20,016.85, of which \$18,691.74 was designated as reserves. Dr. Wessels moved acceptance of the report. Dr. Warren seconded. Carried.

2. Proposed 2002 Budget. Dr. Keppler referred members to the proposed 2002 budget in their meeting packets. The proposed budget projected revenue and expenditures at \$74,170, with continued reliance upon the voluntary support of the national and most state and provincial professional associations for revenue. The proposed budget projected an addition to the reserves at the end of 2002 of \$8,370.

Dr. Ringdahl moved that the Council direct its treasurer to make inquiry with the treasurer of the American Association of Naturopathic Physicians and with the Arizona Naturopathic Medical Association, the Oregon Association of Naturopathic Physicians, and the Washington Association of Naturopathic Physicians regarding those organizations' intentions to continue their support of CNME, both for 2001 and 2002. Dr. Keppler seconded. Carried.

Members agreed by consensus that should 2002 revenue come to exceed expectations, the treasurer shall work with the executive director in augmenting the \$7,500 projected as an expenditure for Affiliations.

Dr. Adele moved acceptance of the proposed budget. Dr. Wessels seconded. Discussion. Carried.

■ Presentation by Mr. Matteson

At 9:33 a.m., members agreed without objection to a departure from the published agenda. Dr. Khalsa introduced Mr. Matteson, who updated the Council on the activities of Accreditation Task Force of the American Association of Naturopathic Medical Colleges.

◆ 4. Officers' Reports (continued)

■ C. Vice President

No report.

■ D. President

Dr. Khalsa stated one of his top priorities is developing a federal link for CNME, so the agency will be eligible to seek the recognition of the U.S. Secretary of Education.

◆ 5. Committee Reports

■ A. Committee on Standards, Policies, and Procedures (COSPP)

Members: Drs. Warren (chair), Kerins, Khalsa, Martin, Poorman, Ringdahl, Ross, and Mr. Lofft (ex officio).

Dr. Warren reported on a Internet "work center" his committee has been using to make revisions to the *Handbook*, including many of the standards. He directed Mr. Lofft to make the work center accessible by the full Council, so members can review the proposed changes and offer comments prior to the semiannual meeting in spring 2002. Dr. Warren also reported on progress in developing a new Standard on Clinical Training, noting that some of the more prescriptive criteria are still under discussion. Once approved by the committee, the new standard will be posted on the work center. Dr. Kerins moved that the Council issue a letter of thanks to Dr. Randall Bradley who prepared the initial draft of the new standard. Dr. Ringdahl seconded. Carried.

Mr. Lofft said the Council could have a phone meeting prior to the semiannual meeting to approve the proposed revisions to the *Handbook* and have them released for public comment.

Dr. Warren presented for adoption a new definition in the *Handbook's* Glossary for the term "Program of Naturopathic Medical Education." The proposed new definition states: "As used in this *Handbook*, denotes a doctoral-level educational program that prepares students to become licensed naturopathic physicians and which is itself or is part of an institution of higher education." Dr. Keppler moved adoption of the new definition. Dr. Khalsa seconded. Carried.

Dr. Warren suggested Council members consider changes in the Council's eligibility requirements that would permit naturopathic educational programs at for-profit institutions to apply for the Council's candidacy and accreditation. Following discussion, Dr. Wessels moved that the Council approve in principle changes to the eligibility requirements that would allow naturopathic educational programs at for-profit institutions to apply to CNME. Dr. Khalsa seconded. Carried. Dr. Warren directed Mr. Lofft to draft appropriate changes to the eligibility requirements for the Council's approval at its 2002 semiannual meeting, including strengthening of the wording that requires an in-residence program.

■ **B. Committee on Development (COD)**

Members: Drs. Wessels (chair) and Ross. Dr. Wessels reported on donations CNME has so far received during 2001 (a total of \$2,510.61). Mr. Lofft agreed to issue a second mail appeal to the professional associations and individual donors of previous years, enclosing a donation card and return envelope.

■ **C. Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education (CPME)**

Members: Drs. Wessels (chair), Adele (appointed at this meeting), Keppler, Ringdahl, and Saunders (appointed at this meeting). Dr. Wessels reported the committee sent an evaluation team to the NCNM residency program on July 9, 2001, and a decision on continuing certification of that program will be made at CPME's meeting following this Council meeting. CPME has received an application for certification from BU's Graduate Medical Education, and CPME has accepted it for consideration. BU will submit a self-study, and an evaluation visit is scheduled for November 2001. Dr. Khalsa appointed Drs. Adele and Saunders to CPME to fill vacancies created by the departures of former members from the Council.

■ **D. Committee on Technical Assistance**

Members: Dr. Ringdahl (chair), and Keppler. Dr. Ringdahl reported no committee activity since the Council's last meeting.

■ **E. Nominations Committee**

Members: Drs. Keppler (chair), Adele, and Khalsa (appointed at this meeting). Dr. Khalsa announced that Dr. Ringdahl's term on the committee has expired. He appointed himself as her replacement. (Each committee member serves a three-year staggered term. Dr. Adele's term expires in spring 2002, Dr. Keppler's in spring 2003, and Dr. Khalsa's in spring 2004.) The committee will continue to consider candidates as future Profession and Public members.

■ **F. Committee on Evaluation and Compensation**

Members: Drs. Keppler (chair), Saunders, Wessels and Mr. Lofft (ex officio). Dr. Keppler reported that a form for evaluating the executive director's performance has been developed and will be distributed to Council members. It covers nine performance parameters. The executive director has also been requested to submit a self-evaluation. A process is also in development for the the board's self-evaluation.

■ **G. Communications Strategy Committee**

Members: Drs. Warren (chair), Wessels, and Mr. Lofft (ex officio). The committee will develop a report to update the profession on CNME's activities and plans. It will distributed before year's end to the officers of the national, state, and provincial professional associations, to other leaders of the profession, and to current and former individual supporters.

At 11:45, Dr. Khalsa declared a recess for lunch. The meeting resumed at 1:36.

◆ **6. Executive Director's Report**

Mr. Lofft submitted a written report dated August 20, 2001. The report covered developments at (1) new and potential naturopathic programs (American University of Integrative Medicine, Boucher Institute of Naturopathic Medicine, National College of Oriental Medicine, D'Youville College, Mountain State University, Naturopathic Institute of

Therapies and Education, and National University of Health Sciences); (2) the fall meeting in Phoenix of the Association of Specialized and Professional Accreditors; (3) an application for recognition of CNME by the Council for Higher Education Accreditation; (4) public outreach activities; (5) selected correspondence; (6) a challenge to Connecticut's naturopathic law; and (7) California's proposed educational requirements for naturopathic physicians.

Mr. Lofft introduced Dr. Miller, who presented information on plans for establishing a naturopathic educational program at National College of Oriental Medicine. Dr. Geldner spoke on the history of the profession in Florida (started in 1927, many naturopathic doctors specialized, licensing was sunset in 1959) and on progress toward re-establishing naturopathic licensing in Florida.

◆ **7. Old Business Not Related to Recognition Actions**

No old business was introduced.

◆ **8. New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions**

■ **Three-Year Strategic Plan**

Following discussion, Dr. Warren moved that the Council conduct a day-long, professionally facilitated strategic planning session in conjunction with the spring 2002 semiannual meeting. Dr. Ringdahl seconded. Dr. Khalsa assigned preparations for the planning session to the Executive Committee.

◆ **9. Business Related to the Recognition of a College or Program (Closed Session)**

■ **A. SCNM Quarterly Progress Reports.**

Following discussion, Dr. Kerins moved acceptance of the most recent quarterly report submitted by SCNM. Dr. Keppler seconded. Carried.

■ **B. NCNM's Interim Report**

Following discussion, Dr. Keppler moved acceptance of the 2001 interim report submitted by NCNM. Carried.

◆ **10. Election of Officers (Open Meeting Resumed)**

Dr. Keppler, Nominations Committee chair, presented a slate of nominees for two-year terms as officers of the Council: Dr. Warren for president, Dr. Adele for vice president, Dr. Keppler for treasurer, and Dr. Wessels for secretary. Dr. Kerins moved that nominations be closed. Dr. Wessels seconded. Carried. Dr. Keppler moved that the committee's slate of nominees be elected. Dr. Ross seconded. Carried. Dr. Warren assumed responsibilities as chair of the meeting.

◆ **11. Miscellaneous Business**

■ **A. Recognition of Retiring Officer**

Dr. Saunders moved that Dr. Khalsa be recognized by the Council for his three years of service as president. Dr. Kerins seconded. Carried. Mr. Lofft presented Dr. Khalsa with a plaque expressing the Council's gratitude for his service and leadership.

■ **B. Date and Site for 2002 Semiannual Meeting**

By consensus, the Council agreed to hold its 2002 semiannual meeting and a strategic planning session on March 15, 16, and 17 in Toronto. March 15 is reserved for a COSPP meeting, the evening of March 15 for a pre-planning session meeting, March 16 for the planning session, and March 17 for the semiannual meeting.

◆ **11. Adjournment.**

There being no further business to be brought before the Council, Dr. Warren declared the meeting adjourned. Time of adjournment was 3:24 p.m.

*Respectfully submitted on behalf of
Joseph Wessels, N.D., Council Secretary,
by Robert Lofft, Recorder
January 11, 2001*

COUNCIL ON NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL EDUCATION

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Meeting of March 17, 2002 Delta Chelsea Hotel ♦ Toronto, Ontario

Approved August 12, 2002

♦ 1. Call to Order, Meeting Notice, Roll of Members, Introductions

The Council's president, Don Warren, N.D., (Profession Member), Ottawa, Ontario, declared a quorum present and called the meeting to order at 9:05 a.m. The meeting was announced as the Council's 2002 Semiannual Meeting, as prescribed by the *Bylaws*. The other members present were:

- ♦ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ♦ Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM]), Portland, Oregon;
- ♦ Francis J. Kerins, Ed.D. (Public Member), Helena, Montana;
- ♦ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed. (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington;
- ♦ Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, The Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), North York, Ontario; and
- ♦ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Secretary, Meeting Recorder), Bellingham, Washington.

Member Nominee President:

- ♦ Marcia Prenguber, N.D. (Profession Member Nominee), Goshen, Indiana.

Guests Present for Parts of the Meeting:

- ♦ David Matteson, Director of Public Affairs and Advisor to the President, BU;
- ♦ Paul Mittman, N.D., President, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine, Tempe, Arizona; and
- ♦ Patricia Wolfe, N.D., Executive Director, Boucher Institute of Naturopathic Medicine (BINM), New Westminster, British Columbia.

Absent Members:

- ♦ Rita Bettenburg, N.D. (Profession Member), Portland, Oregon;
- ♦ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member, Council Treasurer), South Miami, Florida; and
- ♦ Paul R. Saunders, N.D., Ph.D. (Profession Member), Dundas, Ontario.

Vacancy:

- ♦ Institutional Member Representative from Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences (SCNM), Tempe, Arizona. [Dr. Douglas Poorman, formerly SCNM's representative, left the college in January. SCNM's president will nominate a replacement at a later date.]

♦ 2. Agenda

Members adopted by consensus the published agenda for the meeting, with one change: "Possible Changes to the Council's Institutional Members' Annual Report Form," to be included under agenda item 7, "New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions."

♦ 3. Election of Directors

- **A. Re-election of Dr. Warren as a Profession Member.** Dr. Adele, acting chair of the Nominations Committee (in Dr. Keppler's absence), announced Dr. Warren's present term as a Profession Member ends with the conclusion of this meeting. The Committee is nominating him for re-election for another three-year term. Dr. Kerins moved that Dr. Warren be re-elected. Seconded by Dr. Martin. **Carried.**

- **B. Election of Dr. Prenguber as a Profession Member.** Dr. Adele announced her Committee is nominating Dr. Prenguber for a three-year term as a Profession Member, effective upon election. Dr. Ringdahl moved that Dr. Prenguber be elected. Dr. Kerins seconded. **Carried.**

◆ 4. Officers' Reports

- **A. Secretary.** Dr. Kerins moved approval of the minutes of the Council's meeting of August 20, 2001. Dr. Adele seconded. **Carried.**
- **B. Treasurer.** Dr. Warren reported on behalf of Treasurer Dr. Keppler.
 - a. **2001 Year-End Financial Report.** Dr. Warren referred members to the report (Exhibit 1) in their meeting packets. Discussion.
 - b. **March 9, 2002 Budget Report.** Dr. Warren referred members to the report (Exhibit 2) in their meeting packets. Dr. Adele moved acceptance of both the 2001 Year-End Report and the March 9 Budget Report. Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.**
 - c. **Revisions to the 2002 Budget.** Dr. Khalsa moved approval of the revisions to the 2002 operating budget, as stated in the March 9 Budget Report. Dr. Ross seconded. **Carried.**
- **C. Vice President.** Dr. Adele emphasized her support for the president during this "emergency" period and commended the hard work done by Mr. Lofft. Dr. Warren moved acceptance of the report. Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.**
- **D. President.** Dr. Warren read a letter from the Council's executive director, Mr. Robert Lofft, which stated he was terminating his contract with the Council in accord with the terms of the contract (which call for a 60-day notice). Dr. Kerins moved that the Council not accept the letter until the president had an opportunity to discuss it with Mr. Lofft. Dr. Martin seconded. **Motion failed.** Dr. Adele moved to accept the letter. Dr. Khalsa seconded. Dr. Martin offered a friendly amendment that Mr. Lofft be offered a consulting role in order to provide for an orderly transition. Dr. Wessels seconded. **Amendment carried. Main motion carried.**

Dr. Warren referred members to the Council's Goals for 2002, as included in their meeting packets. Discussion. Dr. Kerins moved to accept the president's report and commended Dr. Warren his leadership. Dr. Ross seconded. **Carried.**

At Dr. Warren's invitation, Mr. Matteson provided an update on the activities of the White House Commission on Complementary and Alternative Medicine Policy, and on other matters that could impact the Council's future activities.

◆ 5. Committee Reports

- **A. Communications Strategy Committee.**

Members: Drs. Adele (chair), Warren, Wessels, and Mr. Lofft (ex officio). Dr. Adele reported she will submit an article about the Council to the "ND News." She also reported that Dr. Prenguber has agreed to serve on the Committee. Dr. Khalsa moved acceptance of the Committee's report. Dr. Kerins seconded. **Carried.**
- **B. Committee on Development.**

Members: Drs. Wessels (chair) and Ross. Dr. Wessels referred members to the Committee's written report (Exhibit 3), included in their meeting packets. He stated that, in addition to the donations listed in the report, the Council also expects a contribution of \$10,000 within the coming days from a corporate donor outside the naturopathic profession. Dr. Kerins moved acceptance of the Committee's report. Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.**
- **C. Evaluation and Compensation Committee.**

Members: Drs. Keppler (chair), Saunders, Wessels and Mr. Lofft (ex officio). Dr. Warren commended Dr. Keppler (in absentia) for his work on the executive director's evaluation report. In view of the executive director's decision to terminate his contract with the Council, Dr. Wessels moved that the report be tables. Dr. Prenguber seconded. **Carried.**

■ **D. Nominations Committee.**

Members: Drs. Keppler (chair), Adele, and Khalsa. Dr. Adele reviewed the Committee's work since the last Council meeting and invited members to recruit potential nominees as Profession and Public Members and to submit their résumés to her Committee. Dr. Wessels moved acceptance of the Committee's report. Dr. Prenguber seconded. **Carried.**

■ **E. Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education.**

Members: Drs. Wessels (chair), Adele, Keppler, Ringdahl, and Saunders. Dr. Wessels reported his Committee conducted an evaluation visit on February 4 to the Naturopathic Medicine Residency Program sponsored by Bastyr University. A decision on whether to certify the program will be made at the Committee's meeting, immediately following this meeting. The Annual Report from the one residency program presently certified, the Naturopathic Family Practice Residency Program sponsored by NCNM, has been received and will also be considered at the Committee's meeting. Dr. Kerins moved acceptance of the Committee's report. Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.**

■ **F. Committee on Standards, Policies, and Procedures.**

Members: Drs. Warren (chair), Kerins, Khalsa, Martin, Ringdahl, Ross, and Mr. Lofft (ex officio). Dr. Warren referred members to the Committee's written report (Exhibit 4), dated March 15, 2002, which contained 14 recommendations for additions and changes in the Council's standards, policies, and procedures. He guided members through the report, noting the following additional changes as approved by the Committee at its March 15 meeting.

- a. In the proposed new Standard on Clinical Education (Attachment I to the Committee's report):
 - The last sentence in paragraph C-1 on page 1 is changed to: "Prior to beginning their *formal* clinical education, students may participate in observations and rotations through clinical posts, such as the dispensary, laboratory, and physical medicine facilities, but the time they spend in these observations and and rotations *may not exceed 20 percent* of the program's required number of clock hours." [Changes are in italics.]
 - The third sentence of paragraph C-2 on page 2 is changed to: "At least *60* percent of the clinical education program's required number of minimum hours are in [delete "direct"] patient care."
 - The first sentence of paragraph C-4 on page 2 is deleted, with the intent that this criterion be re-considered at a later date.
 - The third sentence of paragraph C-5 on page 2 is changed to: "Clinical faculty have a minimum of *two* years of [delete "full-time"] clinical experience, unless they are residents at the program's teaching clinic *or have completed a residency program certified by the Council.*"
 - Paragraph C-6-d on page 2 is changed to: "The opportunity to treat patients of all ages, *and to treat a wide variety* of conditions."
 - Delete paragraph C-6-e on page 2, and renumber the remaining paragraphs accordingly.
 - Delete the last four words of paragraph C-6-g (as renumbered) [i.e., delete "and practice management principles"].
 - Add a new paragraph as C-6-1 (as renumbered): "A thorough knowledge of practice management principles."
 - Delete all of paragraph C-7 on pages 2-3, with the intent that it be reconsidered at a later date.
- b. In the Revised Specific Objectives of the Accreditation Process in Evaluating a Naturopathic Medicine Program (Attachment 2 to the Committee's report):
 - Paragraph 28 is changed to: "To determine that the basic sciences courses, clinical sciences courses, naturopathic history and philosophy courses, and practice management courses [delete "that a program requires"] *required* of students are appropriate for educating future naturopathic physicians with respect to meeting the needs of the public."
 - Paragraph 34 is changed to: "To verify that clinical faculty are qualified *and demonstrate ongoing professional development.*" [Delete "and have opportunities for professional development."]

- Paragraph 37 is changed to: “To ensure that clinical facilities and staff are adequate for providing experience to student clinicians in all aspects of naturopathic diagnosis and treatment *that are allowed by the jurisdiction in which the program is located*, with all student clinicians having comparable educational experiences.”
- c. In the Proposed Revisions to the Accreditation Standards (Attachment 4 to the Committee’s report), in paragraph F (page 4), the phrase “Chief Executive Officer” is replaced by “Chief Administrative Officer.”
- d. In the proposed revisions to the Eligibility Requirements (Attachment 5 to the Committee’s report):
 - Change the first sentence of requirement 9 to: “Has a core library....” [Delete “at least.”]
 - Change requirement 13 to: “Can document a funding base, financial resources, and plans for financial development adequate to carry out its mission and objectives.” [Delete “within a balanced budget and a safe level of debt.”]
- e. Regarding the proposed changes in the *Articles of Incorporation* and *Bylaws* (Attachment 7 to the Committee’s report), Dr. Kerins moved that the proposed revisions be delegated to the Executive Committee for further evaluation, with the understanding that the number of Institutional Member Representatives will be appropriately limited. Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.**
- f. In the proposed revisions for the “Policy on Council Membership” (Attachment 8 to the Committee’s report):
 - The changes proposed for paragraph A-1, which would affect the number of Institutional Member Representatives and the rotation of their terms, are deleted pending the outcome of the Executive Committee’s evaluation and decision regarding the proposed changes for the *Articles of Incorporation* and *Bylaws*, in accord with the adopted motion above.
 - In paragraph A-2, change the first sentence to: “Profession members of the Council hold a current license to practice naturopathic medicine in a United States or Canadian jurisdiction that regulates the practice of naturopathic medicine.” [Delete the listing of the licensed states, provinces, and territories.]
- g. In the proposed revisions for the “Policy on Potential Conflicts of Interest” (Attachment 10 to the Committee’s report):
 - Change paragraph B-1 to: “Is or ever has been an officer, director, trustee, employee, contractor, consultant, student, applicant for admission, *or applicant for employment* at the institution where the program is located.” (New wording is italicized.)
 - Delete paragraph B-3, changing the next paragraph number from 4 to 3.
 - Change new paragraph 4 (which becomes new paragraph 3) to: “Has a current or former [delete “close”] relationship of any [delete “other”] nature with anyone serving in any capacity the institution at which the program is located, or who is enrolled as a student at the institution.”

Following discussion on the proposed changes to this policy, Dr. Kerins moved that the wording for paragraph B, which defines the term “affiliated,” be delegated to the Executive Committee for further research and review. Dr. Prenguber seconded. **Carried.**
- h. Recommendation 14 on page 3 of the Committee’s recommendations, which would change the Council’s dues structure, is being withdrawn . COSPP will consider introducing the recommendation or one similar to it at a subsequent meeting.
- i. By consensus, Council member agreed to delete “microbiology” (Attachment 4 to the Committee’s report, page 7, paragraph C-3-e) from the list of courses required under “Environmental/Public Health.”

Dr. Adele moved that the Council approve the Committee’s recommendations as presented in its report, with the additional changes noted above, except for the recommendations regarding revisions to the *Articles of Incorporation* and *Bylaws* (recommendation 7), “Policy on Council Membership” (recommendation 8), “Policy on Potential Conflicts of Interest” (recommendation 10), and the dues structure (recommendation 14), all of which the Council will reconsider at its next meeting. Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.**

■ **G. Strategic Planning Committee.**

Members: Drs. Kerins (chair), Warren, and Mr. Matteson. Dr. Kerins reported that the committee's work to date is just a start. The Council needs to follow up on the Strategic Planning Session that took place the previous day, focusing on its practical implications. Dr. Ringdahl moved that the committee provide those who attended the Strategic Planning Session, within 30 days, a report on the session's proceedings and recommendations. Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.**

Dr. Warren moved that the Council adopt in principle the five recommendations contained in the Executive Summary of *Strategies for Change and Improvement*, a June 1999 report by the Pew Task Force on Accreditation of Health Professions Education (Exhibit 5). Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.**

Dr. Warren moved that the Council adopt as guiding principles the "Statement on Good Practices and Shared Responsibility in the Creation and Application of Specialized Accreditation Standards" as published in September 2001 by the Council for Higher Education Accreditation (Exhibit 6). Dr. Khalsa seconded. **Carried.**

■ **H. Committee on Technical Assistance.**

Members: Drs. Ringdahl (chair) and Kepler. In view of conflicts that can arise when an accrediting agency works too closely with developing programs, and because U.S. Department of Education regulations no longer require accrediting agencies to offer technical assistance to developing programs, Dr. Ringdahl requested that the Committee be dissolved. Dr. Khalsa so moved. Dr. Ross seconded. **Carried.**

◆ **6. Executive Director's Report.**

Mr. Lofft not present. No report.

◆ **7. Old Business Not Related to Recognition Actions**

Possible Changes to the Council's Institutional Members' Annual Report Form. Drs. Ross and Ringdahl agreed to present to COSPP at its next meeting a proposed revision of the form.

At noon, Dr. Warren recessed the meeting for lunch. The meeting resumed at 1:15 p.m.

◆ **8. New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions**

Members presented no new business for the Council's consideration.

◆ **9. Business Related to the Recognition of a College or Program (Closed Session)**

- **A. Annual Report from SCNM.** After discussion, Dr. Wessels moved acceptance of the report. Dr. Adele seconded. **Carried.**
- **B. Reaffirmation of SCNM's Accreditation.** After discussion, Dr. Kerins moved that the Council accept the *Evaluation Team Report* of January 2002. Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.** Dr. Khalsa moved that the Council reaffirm SCNM's accreditation, with the requirement that SCNM include in its 2002 Annual Report to the Council an update on the college's determination of the causes of the below-average performance during the past two years of its students and graduates on the Naturopathic Physicians Licensing Examinations, and the efforts undertaken to improve performance. Dr. Adele seconded. **Carried.**
- **C. Annual Report from BU.** After discussion, Dr. Martin moved acceptance of the report. Dr. Khalsa seconded. **Carried.**
- **D. Reconsideration of Scheduled Focus Visit to BU.** After discussion, in view of positive developments at BU with regard to the recommendations in the Council's *Evaluation Team Report* of April 1999, Dr. Khalsa moved that BU submit its progress report as scheduled but that the Council not conduct the focused on-site evaluation previously scheduled for April 2002. Dr. Adele seconded. **Carried.**
- **E. Annual Report from CCNM.** After discussion, Dr. Wessels moved acceptance of the report. Dr. Kerins seconded. **Carried.**
- **F. Annual Report from NCNM.** After discussion, Dr. Adele moved acceptance of the report. Dr. Kerins seconded. **Carried.**

- **G. Annual Report from UBCNM.** After discussion, Dr. Warren moved acceptance of the report. Dr. Wessels seconded. **Carried**
- **H. Application for Candidacy from BINM.** After discussion, Dr. Adele moved that the Council not accept for consideration BINM's December 2001 application for candidacy. Dr. Prenguber seconded. **Carried.**

◆ **10. Miscellaneous Business**

- **A. Date and Site for Next Meeting.** Members decided by consensus that the Council's 2002 Annual Meeting will take place August 12 in Salt Lake City.
- **B. Announcements.** Dr. Warren announced that COSPP will meet August 11 in Salt Lake City.

◆ **11. Adjournment**

There being no further business for the Council's consideration, Dr. Warren declared the meeting adjourned. Without objection. Time of adjournment was 5:20 p.m.

*Respectfully submitted on behalf of
Joseph Wessels, N.D., Council Secretary,
by Robert Lofft, Executive Director
April 18, 2002*

COUNCIL ON NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL EDUCATION

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Special Meeting of June 10, 2002 Telephone Conference

Approved August 12, 2002

◆ 1. Call to Order, Meeting Notice, Roll of Members, Introductions

The Council's president, Don Warren, N.D., (Profession Member), Ottawa, Ontario, declared a quorum present and called the meeting to order at 5:36 p.m. The meeting was announced as a special meeting of the Council, as provided for in the *Bylaws*. The other members present were:

- ◆ Rita Bettenburg, N.D. (Profession Member), Portland, Oregon;
- ◆ Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM]), Portland, Oregon;
- ◆ Francis J. Kerins, Ed.D. (Public Member), Helena, Montana;
- ◆ Peter A. Martin, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine [UBCNM]);
- ◆ Marcia Prenguber, N.D. (Profession Member Nominee), Goshen, Indiana.
- ◆ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed. (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington; and
- ◆ Paul R. Saunders, N.D., Ph.D. (Profession Member), Dundas, Ontario. Joined the meeting at 6:02 p.m. at the beginning of the discussion on the proposed changes to the *Handbook*.

Absent Members:

- ◆ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ◆ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member, Council Treasurer), South Miami, Florida; and
- ◆ Cory P. Ross, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, The Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine [CCNM]), North York, Ontario; and
- ◆ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Secretary), Bellingham, Washington.

Staff Present:

- ◆ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon.

Dr. Warren reported that Drs. Adele, Keppler, and Wessels had notified him prior to the meeting that they could not participate because of scheduling conflicts. Dr. Ross was unable to participate because an auto accident near his home had downed power and communication lines.

Vacancy:

- ◆ Institutional Member Representative from Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences (SCNM), Tempe, Arizona.

◆ Agenda

Members adopted by consensus the published agenda for the meeting, which included three items:

- A. Consideration of a request from Boucher Institute of Naturopathic Medicine (BINM) for a refund of its application fee;
- B. Consideration of the proposed changes to the Council's eligibility requirements, standards, policies, procedures, *Handbook* glossary, the Articles of Incorporation, and the Bylaws; and
- C. Determination of a rotational system for service on the board by institutional member representatives (pending adoption under item B of amendments to the Policy on Council Membership, the Articles of Incorporation, and the Bylaws).

◆ 1. Request from BINM

Dr. Warren referred members to a previously distributed letter from BINM, which requested a refund of the application fee BINM had paid CNME in December 2001. Mr. Lofft noted the Council presently has no policy or procedure on making a full or partial refund should the Council not accept for consideration an application for candidacy or accreditation. The Council's written procedures do not specifically state the fee is non-refundable. Members approved by consensus a proposal to refund \$3,000 of BINM's \$4,000 application fee.

Dr. Khalsa moved that the Council immediately amend its written procedures regarding the submission of applications for candidacy and accreditation to be such that applicants would pay a \$4,000 application fee but if the Council decides the applicant program does not meet the Council's eligibility requirements, the Council would refund \$3,000. Dr. Martin seconded. Discussion. Question called. **Carried.**

◆ 2. Proposed Changes

Dr. Warren referred members to the June 8, 2002 report that he and Mr. Lofft had released, entitled "Report and Recommendations on the Responses to the Call for Public Comments, April 23, 2002" [Exhibit 1]. The report contained a summary of the comments received in response to the Council's distribution of a document, *For Public Comment*, containing proposed changes to the accreditation standards, eligibility requirements, policies, procedures, and the *Handbook's* glossary [Exhibit 2]. The report also contained Mr. Lofft's and Dr. Warren's recommendations on each specific proposed change. In several cases, the recommendations called for modifications to changes as originally proposed, in light of the public comments received.

Dr. Kerins moved that the Council adopt all the proposed changes as published in the *For Public Comment* document and as modified by the recommendations in Mr. Lofft and Dr. Warren's report. Dr. Martin seconded. Discussion. Question called. **Carried.**

Dr. Martin moved that the proposed changes to the *Articles of Incorporation* and *Bylaws* be adopted as contained in the document distributed to members on June 4, 2002 [Exhibit 3], except that, regarding the *Articles of Incorporation*, the proposed Article Eleventh in the June 4 document is to be replaced by the proposed Article Eleventh in the June 8 document [Exhibit 2] and, further, that the language of this article state that those profession members presently serving on the board shall be entitled to re-election to one additional term rather than to two additional terms. Dr. Saunders seconded. Discussion. Question called. **Carried.**

Mr. Lofft announced that, with the adoption of the amendments to the *Articles of Incorporation*, the board now consists of its public and profession members, and these members must adopt a rule for electing institutional member representatives.

◆ 3. Rotation System for Institutional Member Representatives

Dr. Ringdahl moved:

- ◆ That the Council use a lottery system for determining, from among its five recognized programs, the first three programs that shall nominate representatives under the newly amended *Articles of Incorporation*;
- ◆ That the chief executive or administrative officer whose program's name is first drawn shall nominate a representative for a three-year term; that the second drawn shall nominate for a two-year term; that the third drawn shall nominate for a one-year term; that the fourth drawn shall later nominate for a three-year term beginning with the conclusion of the 2003 annual meeting; and that the fifth drawn shall later nominate for a three-year term beginning with the conclusion of the 2004 annual meeting.
- ◆ That the rotation established by the lottery shall remain as the permanent rotation schedule for the nomination of institutional member representatives; and
- ◆ That any new programs recognized by the Council shall be added to the end of the rotation schedule.

Dr. Saunders seconded. Discussion. Question called. **Carried.**

Council members agreed to having the program's names drawn by Dr. Kerins. He announced the names as he drew them: BU, SCNM, UBCNM, NCNM, CCNM.

Dr. Ringdahl announced she was nominating herself as an institutional member representative for a three-year term.

Dr. Kerins moved Dr. Ringdahl's election. Dr. Saunders seconded. **Carried.**

Dr. Martin announced that, as dean of UBCNM, he was nominating himself for a one-year term. Dr. Saunders moved Dr. Martin's election. Dr. Bettenburg seconded. **Carried.**

Dr. Kerins moved that letters of appreciation be sent to Drs. Khalsa and Ross for their service as Council members, and that they be invited to the Council's August 12, 2002 annual meeting in Salt Lake City to be formally recognized for their contributions. Dr. Saunders seconded. **Carried.**

◆ **Adjournment**

There being no further business to be brought before the board, Dr. Warren declared the meeting adjourned. Time of adjournment was 6:54.

*Respectfully Submitted by
Robert Lofft
Executive Director, Assistant Secretary
June 18, 2002*

COUNCIL ON NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL EDUCATION

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Annual Meeting of August 12, 2002

Wyndham Hotel ♦ Salt Lake City, Utah

Approved April 5, 2003

♦ 1. Call to Order, Meeting Notice, Roll of Members, Introductions

The Council's president, Don Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Ottawa, Ontario, declared a quorum present and called the meeting to order at 8:42 a.m. The meeting was announced as the Council's 2002 Annual Meeting, as prescribed by the *Bylaws*. The other members present were:

- ♦ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ♦ Rita Bettenburg, N.D. (Profession Member), Portland, Oregon;
- ♦ Francis J. Kerins, Ed.D. (Public Member), Helena, Montana;
- ♦ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member, Council Treasurer), South Miami, Florida;
- ♦ Peter A. Martin, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine [UBCNM]);
- ♦ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed. (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington;
- ♦ Paul R. Saunders, N.D., Ph.D. (Profession Member), Dundas, Ontario; and
- ♦ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Secretary), Bellingham, Washington.

Absent Member:

- ♦ Marcia Prenguber, N.D. (Profession Member), Goshen, Indiana.

Vacancy:

- ♦ Institutional Member Representative from Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences (SCNM), Tempe, Arizona. Nominee to be considered at this meeting.

Staff Present:

- ♦ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Guests Present for All or Parts of the Meeting:

- ♦ Ron Lipton, Accrediting Agency Evaluation Unit, U.S. Department of Education, Washington, D.C.
- ♦ Gannady Raskin, N.D., Dean of Clinical Education and Chief Naturopathic Medical Officer, Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine (CCNM), North York, Ontario;
- ♦ Cory Ross, D.C., Executive Director for Development, CCNM;
- ♦ Ron Saranchuk, Ph.D., Assistant Dean of Academic Affairs, CCNM; and
- ♦ Fraser Smith, Ph.D., Dean of Academic Affairs, CCNM.

♦ 2. Agenda

Members adopted by consensus the published agenda for the meeting, with three changes: (1) "Recognition of Retired Members," to be included as item A under item 8, "New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions"; (2) "Goals for 2003," to be included as item B under item 8, "New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions"; and (3) "The Council's May 13, 2002 Letter to Mr. Scott South, Chairman of the Board of Directors, National College of Naturopathic Medicine, Portland, Oregon," to be included as item C under item 9, "Business Related to the Recognition of a Program (closed session)."

◆ 3. Election of Directors

Dr. Martin, chair of the Membership and Nominations Committee, referred board members to his committee's report in their meeting packets [Exhibit 1]. The committee has endorsed the nomination of Joel H. Lanphear, Ph.D., by SCNM's president as the college's nominee as an institutional member representative, and the committee has nominated Dr. Keppler for a second term as a public member. Following discussion (Dr. Keppler absent during discussion on his nomination), board members elected (1) Dr. Lanphaer for a term commencing September 1, 2002, provided he assumes the position of SCNM's chief academic officer by that date, and ending at the conclusion of the 2003 Annual Meeting; and (2) Dr. Keppler for a term commencing at the conclusion of this meeting and ending at the conclusion of the 2005 Annual Meeting.

◆ 4. Officers' Reports

A. Secretary. Dr. Wessels referred members to two sets of minutes previously distributed and included in the meeting packets.

- a. Dr. Keppler moved approval of the minutes for March 17, 2002. Dr. Martin seconded. Carried.
- b. Dr. Kerins moved approval of the minutes for June 10, 2002. Dr. Saunders seconded. Carried.

B. Treasurer.

- a. **Acceptance of the 2001 Audited Financial Statements and Auditors' Report.** At Dr. Keppler's request, members reviewed the audited financial statements and auditors' report [Exhibit 2], which Mr. Lofft passed around the meeting table. Dr. Keppler noted the statements and report reflect a sound financial condition and no irregularities. Dr. Adele moved acceptance of the audited financial statements and the auditors' report. Dr. Wessels seconded. **Carried.** Members agreed by consensus to retain the same auditing firm for the next audit.
- b. **Acceptance of the August 7, 2002 Budget Report and Financial Statement.** Dr. Keppler referred members to the report [Exhibit 3] in their meeting packets. The report showed revenues to date of \$71,369.09 and expenditures of \$70,436.60. Cash on hand was \$18,225.94, of which \$17,293.45 was reserves. Members accepted the report by consensus.
- c. **Revisions to the 2002 Budget.** Members agreed by consensus not to amend the current year's budget, but to engage in a well-planned fund-raising program to offset any overruns.
- d. **Approval of the Proposed 2003 Operating Budget.** Dr. Keppler referred members to the proposed budget in their packets [Exhibit 4]. Proposed revenues and expenditures were \$97,460. The proposed expenditures included enough under "Members' Travel" to reimburse profession members for their travel and lodging for the semiannual (spring) meeting. Public members will continue to have expenses reimbursed for both the semiannual and annual meetings. After discussion, Dr. Saunders moved adoption of the proposed budget, with an increase of \$3,000 in revenue and expenditures for evaluation visits, to cover the visit for fall 2003 to CCNM, which had been inadvertently omitted from the proposed budget. Dr. Wessels seconded. **Carried.** Dr. Warren charged Dr. Keppler's Finance and Development Committee with developing and carrying out fund-raising initiatives for this year and 2003.

C. Vice President. Dr. Adele announced she had no report.

D. President. Dr. Warren distributed and reviewed a written report [Exhibit 5]. It included a review of the year's highlights and plans and goals for the coming year.

◆ 5. Committee Reports

A. Evaluation and Compensation Committee. *Members: Drs. Keppler (chair), Saunders, Wessels, and Mr. Lofft (ex officio).* Dr. Keppler submitted a revised form [Exhibit 6] for evaluating the performance of the executive director. Dr. Wessels moved approval of the form. Dr. Adele seconded. **Carried.** Within the coming weeks, Dr. Keppler will initiate the evaluation process and afterward will recommend compensation for the executive director to the Executive Committee.

B. Executive Committee. *Members: Drs. Warren (chair), Adele, Keppler, and Wessels.* Dr. Warren reported the committee had met by phone prior to the July Futures Summit. Minutes were distributed to Council members. The committee's next meeting will be by phone on September 9, 2002.

- C. Finance and Development Committee.** *Members: Dr. Keppler (chair) and Mr. Lofft (ex officio).* Dr. Keppler referred members to the current budget report [Exhibit 3], which showed contributions to date of \$8,115.20. The committee is \$14,714.80 short of its goal of \$22,830. Dr. Keppler and Mr. Lofft will develop and carry out a plan for raising funds from the national, state, and provincial professional associations and from individual naturopathic physicians. Dr. Kerins stated the desirability that members of the Council's board make financial contributions.
- D. Membership and Nominations Committee.** *Member: Dr. Martin (chair).* Dr. Martin noted that five board vacancies will occur in one year, at the conclusion of the 2003 Annual Meeting when the terms for Drs. Adele, Kerins, Martin, Saunders, and Wessels expire. All except Dr. Martin will be eligible for re-election. Replacing Dr. Martin will be a representative from National College of Naturopathic Medicine (NCNM). The committee will announce its nominations for board positions and principal officers prior to the 2003 Annual Meeting. The terms of the current principal officers will expire at that meeting, upon the election of the new officers.
- E. Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education.** *Members: Drs. Wessels (chair), Adele, Keppler, Ringdahl, and Saunders.* Dr. Wessels reported his committee on March 17, 2002 granted certification to the Naturopathic Medicine Residency Program sponsored by BU. The committee's next visit to the program is scheduled for February 2005. The committee will meet later today to consider including seven additional training sites in the certification the committee previously granted to the Naturopathic Family Residency Program sponsored by NCNM.
- F. Committee on Standards, Policies, and Procedures.** *Members: Drs. Warren (chair), Kerins, Lanphaer, Martin, Ringdahl, and Mr. Lofft (ex officio).*
- a. Reimbursement of Profession Members' Expenses.** Dr. Warren reported his committee adopted a recommendation the previous day that profession members be reimbursed for their travel and lodging for the Council's semiannual (spring) meetings. Profession members will continue to pay their own expenses for annual meetings. An appropriate amount was included in the 2003 budget (under "Members' Travel"), as adopted under item 4-B-d above.
 - b. Possible Changes in the Dues Structure.** Dr. Warren reported his committee recommends that the board explore options for revising the dues structure. (See item 8-B below.)
 - c. Revisions to the Annual Report Form.** Dr. Ringdahl presented proposed changes for the Institutional Members' Annual Report Form. After discussion, board members agreed by consensus to have the committee assess the proposed changes, develop a proposed revised form, and distribute it for the board's approval.
 - d. New Policy on the Submission of Audited Financial Statements by Institutions.** Members discussed whether the Annual Report Form should require submission of audited financial statements by the institutions that offer accredited or preaccredited naturopathic medicine programs. The form presently does not. Dr. Saunders moved that, rather than including the requirement in the Annual Report Form, that the Council adopt a policy that requires institutions to submit their audited financial statements and auditors' reports within 30 days after they receive the statements and reports from their auditors. Dr. Kerins seconded. **Carried.**
- G. Strategic Planning Committee.** *Members: Drs. Kerins (chair), Bettenburg, Ringdahl, Warren, and Mr. David Matteson (advisor).*
- a. Maintaining the Involvement of Non-Represented Programs.** Dr. Kerins reported his committee believes it is important to keep involved those representatives from the naturopathic medicine programs not presently represented on the board. To this end, contact persons at the non-represented programs are being copied on the Council's non-confidential communiques, meeting minutes, and other documents. The committee recommends that the contact persons also be allowed to serve as consultants or advisors to the board.
 - b. Keeping CNME's Focus on Naturopathic Medicine Programs.** The committee has considered whether the Council should continue to focus exclusively on naturopathic medicine programs or expand its accreditation activities to other areas of complementary and alternative medicine. For the

present, the committee recommends that the Council limit its accrediting activities to naturopathic medicine programs, with an emphasis on ever improving its performance in this area. Dr. Kerins moved adoption of this recommendation. Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.**

- c. **Strategic Planning Documents to be Compiled.** Dr. Warren directed Mr. Lofft to assemble in one volume for members all documents related to strategic planning, including the documents distributed at the March 16 Strategic Planning Session.

◆ **6. Executive Director's Report.**

- A. **Update on USDE Recognition Application.** Mr. Lofft reported he submitted the Council's application for USDE recognition as a programmatic accrediting agency on August 8. Mr. Lipton confirmed receipt. Mr. Lofft passed copies of the application around the table.

- B. **Update on CHEA Application.** Mr. Lofft, as previously agreed by the board, will submit a letter of application in September to the Council for Higher Education Accreditation.

- C. **Upcoming Evaluation Visits.**

- To CCNM, fall 2003. Focused visit. Dates and team members to be determined.

- To NCCNM, fall 2003. Focused visit. Dates and team members to be determined.

- UBCNM, spring 2003. Comprehensive visit for continued candidacy. Dates and team members to be determined.

- D. **Anticipated Applications for Candidacy.**

- The Florida College of Integrative Medicine (FCIM) has submitted notice of its intention to file an application for candidacy for the college's naturopathic medicine program. The college could apply as early as mid-2003. FCIM is presently accredited by ACAOM and is seeking regional preaccreditation from SACS.

- Boucher Institute of Naturopathic Medicine (BINM) has not given notice that it intends to re-apply. However, Mr. Lofft expects the school will submit an application late in 2002 or early in 2003.

◆ **7. Old Business Not Related to Recognition Actions.**

No old business.

◆ **8. New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions.**

- A. **Retiring Members.** Dr. Warren presented former Institutional Member Representative Dr. Cory Ross with a gift certificate in appreciation of Dr. Ross' service as a board member from 1995 to 2002. Dr. Warren also noted the retirement of Dr. Guru Sandesh Singh Khalsa, who has been thanked for his service by letter.

- B. **Goals for 2003.** Dr. Warren referred to the goals he listed in his President's Report [Exhibit 5]. Regarding a possible re-structuring of the annual dues for institutional members, board members agreed by consensus that the Executive Committee will develop a plan and present it to the American Association of Naturopathic Medical Colleges. Members also agreed by consensus to adopting the goals for 2003 as stated in the President's Report.

At noon, Dr. Warren declared the meeting recessed. The meeting resumed at 1:30 p.m.

◆ **9. Business Related to the Recognition of a College or Program (closed session).**

- A. **Interim Report from BU.** Drs. Adele and Ringdahl departed the meeting, in accordance with the Policy on Potential Conflicts of Interest. Dr. Keppler moved acceptance of BU's interim report dated March 22, 2002. Dr. Saunders seconded. Dr. Wessels presented a review of the report. Discussion. **Motion carried.** Drs. Adele and Ringdahl returned.

- B. **Interim Report from UBCNM and Evaluation Report of the May 3 Visiting Team to UBCNM.**

- Dr. Ringdahl, chair of the UBCNM evaluation team, led board members in a review of the two reports. Dr. Martin presented an oral response to the Evaluation Team Report, expressing his satisfaction. He departed the meeting. Dr. Saunders moved acceptance of the two reports. Dr. Keppler seconded. Discussion. **Motion carried.** Dr. Martin returned.

C. Letter to NCNM's Board Chairman. Dr. Warren read a letter he issued to the chairman of NCNM's Board of Directors on May 13, 2002. There has been no response to the letter, now three months later. In accordance with the Policy on Potential Conflicts of Interest, Drs. Warren, Bettenburg, Saunders, and Wessels departed the meeting. Dr. Adele presided. After discussion, Dr. Kerins moved that the Council immediately issue a letter to NCNM that requests an evaluation visit within four weeks, with the focus of the visit on the college's finances, admissions, governance, the presidential search process, and the reasons the board chairman did not respond to Dr. Warren's May 13 letter. The letter is to express the Council's urgent concerns. Dr. Martin seconded. **Carried.**

Dr. Kerins agreed to serve as the evaluator for the visit. Mr. Lofft read the Council's procedures for evaluation visits, which contain the requirement that a naturopathic medicine program first submit a written report on the areas of concern. Members agreed by consensus to include this request in the letter to NCNM and to schedule the visit to accommodate the submission of the report. Those members who departed the meeting returned.

◆ **10. Miscellaneous Business.**

Next Meeting. Members agreed by consensus to schedule the Council's 2003 Semiannual Meeting for April 4-5 at the Fiesta Inn and Resort, Tempe, Arizona.

◆ **11. Adjournment.**

There being no further business for the board's consideration, Dr. Saunders moved adjournment. Dr. Bettenburg seconded. **Carried.** Time of adjournment was 4:15 p.m.

*Respectfully Submitted by Robert Lofft
Executive Director, Assistant Secretary
September 6, 2002*

COUNCIL ON NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL EDUCATION

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Special Meeting of December 16, 2002 Telephone Conference Call

Approved April 5, 2003

◆ 1. Call to Order, Meeting Notice, Roll of Members, Announcements

The Council's president, Don Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Ottawa, Ontario, declared a quorum present and called the meeting to order at 6:05 p.m. PST. The meeting was announced as a Special Meeting of the Council's Board of Directors, as prescribed by the *Bylaws*. All other members present:

- ◆ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ◆ Rita Bettenburg, N.D. (Profession Member), Portland, Oregon;
- ◆ Francis J. Kerins, Ed.D. (Public Member), Helena, Montana;
- ◆ William J. Keppler, Ph.D. (Public Member, Council Treasurer), South Miami, Florida (left the meeting at 6:30 p.m. following the report of the Evaluation and Compensation Committee);
- ◆ Joel H. Lanphear, Ph.D. (Institutional Member Representative, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences [SCNM], Tempe, Arizona (joined at 6:30 p.m. during the report by the Strategic Planning Committee);
- ◆ Peter A. Martin, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine [UBCNM]), Bridgeport, Connecticut;
- ◆ Marcia Prenguber, N.D. (Profession Member), Goshen, Indiana;
- ◆ Sarah (Sally) C. Ringdahl, N.D., M.Ed. (Institutional Member Representative, Bastyr University [BU]), Kenmore, Washington;
- ◆ Paul R. Saunders, N.D., Ph.D. (Profession Member), Dundas, Ontario; and
- ◆ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Secretary), Bellingham, Washington.

Staff Present:

- ◆ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder) (left the meeting at 6:45 p.m. prior to the "Executive Committee's Recommendation on the Executive Director's Contract").

Dr. Warren acknowledged with gratitude Dr. Ringdahl's four-and-a-half years of service. Dr. Ringdahl is leaving the board effective December 31, 2002. He affirmed the presentation of the Council's 2002 "Distinguished Service Award," as earlier voted upon by e-mail ballot, and which Mr. Lofft presented to Dr. Ringdahl in the President's Office at Bastyr University on November 15.

Dr. Warren noted neither he nor Mr. Lofft were able to reach Dr. Lanphear to inform him of the correct starting time for this meeting, but that Dr. Lanphear would probably join the meeting at the time incorrectly printed on the agenda (6:30 p.m.), and this would be Dr. Lanphear's first meeting as a board member.

Members extended a special welcome to Dr. Keppler, who was recently named president of National College of Naturopathic Medicine (NCNM) and was participating in the conference call from the president's office at NCNM, where he was visiting. Dr. Keppler will officially become NCNM's president on January 27, 2003, at which time he will no longer be eligible to serve CNME as a Public Member.

◆ 2. Agenda

Dr. Warren asked whether members had changes to propose for the meeting's agenda. Dr. Kerins suggested a discussion on how best to use the advising services of Mr. David Matteson, and who should contact him regarding his help on the Strategic Planning Committee and in preparing for a possible NACIQI recognition hearing in June. Without objection, the topic was added to the agenda under Item 4-B, "Report by the Strategic Planning Committee."

Dr. Warren proposed that Item 5 (“Executive Committee’s Recommendation on the Executive Director’s Contract”) be moved to Item 6, and that published Item 6 (“Acceptance of NCNM’s Evaluation team Report”) be changed to the more general topic of “Special Evaluation Visit to NCNM” and that the topic become Item 5 on the agenda. Dr. Warren noted, with the leadership transition taking place at NCNM, no one from the college is available to respond to the evaluation report at this meeting, and consideration of the report must be deferred to the April 5, 2003 meeting in Tempe, Arizona. **Without objection, board members approved Dr. Warren’s proposed agenda changes.**

◆ 3. Executive Director’s Report on Fund Raising

Mr. Lofft referred board members to the written report he had earlier distributed by e-mail. The report listed sources and amounts totaling \$27,258.20 in donations received between January 1 and December 13, 2002. The contributed amount is the most in CNME’s history and exceeds projections by some \$5,000. The total does not include a \$10,000 strategic planning sponsorship grant from Mr. Harry Voortman. Mr. Lofft reported that, since distributing his written report, CNME has received another \$3,300 in donations, bringing the total to \$30,558.20. He is hopeful of at least another \$6,000 during the remaining two weeks of the year. CNME, however, needs about \$10,000 in gifts to avoid a deficit for the year. Reserves are more than adequate to cover a deficit, should there be one.

◆ 4. Committee Reports

A. Membership and Nominations Committee

Member: Dr. Martin (chair).

- a. **New Treasurer.** Dr. Martin announced his committee’s nomination of Dr. Prenguber for treasurer, to the complete the term of Dr. Keppler when he leaves the board. Dr. Keppler seconded the nomination. He stated his resignation will be effective January 25, 2003, so the new treasurer’s term will run from January 25 to the time of the next election of officers (August 10, 2003). [Recorder’s note: The *Bylaws* do not permit the treasurer to serve successive terms, but the CNME board interprets, as established by precedents, that service for any period of time less than the standard two-year term is not considered a term. The treasurer elected at this meeting, then, is eligible for re-election to a two-year term as treasurer at the August 10, 2003 Annual Meeting.] Dr. Kerins spoke in favor of the nomination. No other nominations. Dr. Warren called for vote. **Members unanimously elected Dr. Prenguber.**
- b. **Public Member Candidate.** Dr. Martin reviewed the qualifications of a Public Member candidate who has tentatively agreed to serve on CNME’s board, pending the approval of the board of another accrediting agency which he serves and from which he will soon retire. Drs. Keppler and Kerins spoke in favor of the candidate. Dr. Martin will contact the candidate to learn if election at the April 5, 2003 meeting is possible. [Recorder’s note: CNME’s Policy on Council Membership states a member’s term begins at the conclusion of the annual or semiannual meeting at which the member is elected. The *Bylaws* state in the event of a vacancy among Public Members, the board must fill it within five months. A new Public Member, then, may be elected at the April 5 Semiannual Meeting or at a special meeting (allowed when a vacancy is being filled) no later than June 29. It would not be necessary that the candidate attend the April 5 meeting, if the election takes place then, since the candidate would not be a member until the meeting concludes. There is also no requirement that the new member attend the August 10, 2003 Annual Meeting. There is only the general requirement in the Policy on Council Membership that “members agree to attend the meetings of the Council.” Historically, the board has recognized that circumstances sometimes make it impossible for a member to attend a meeting. For this reason, the Policy on Council Membership does not specify that members agree to attend *all* meetings.]

B. Evaluation and Compensation Committee.

Members: Drs. Keppler (chair), Saunders, and Wessels.

In view of Dr. Keppler’s need to leave at 6:30 for a meeting with NCNM’s board chair, Dr. Warren announced the report by the Evaluation and Compensation Committee is being moved to this portion of the agenda, switching places with the report by the Strategic Planning Committee. Dr. Keppler referred members to his draft report, earlier distributed in members’ meeting packets. He thanked the eight of the ten eligible board members who participated in the evaluation of the executive director’s performance. He explained the process he used for developing the report, and his effort to guard the anonymity of evaluators’ comments. **Dr. Martin moved acceptance of the report. Dr. Kerins seconded. Carried.**

C. Strategic Planning Committee.

Members: Drs. Kerins (chair), Adele, Bettenburg, Lanphear, Ringdahl, and Warren

Dr. Kerins announced Dr. Warren has appointed Dr. Lanphear as a member of the committee, with the intention that Dr. Lanphear is replacing Dr. Ringdahl, who will leave the board December 31.

Dr. Kerins reported his committee met by phone December 8. During the meeting the committee reviewed CNME's ten goals for 2002 and noted that six of the ten goals had been accomplished. Four others (CHEA recognition, development of the three-year plan, finding additional funding sources, and development a communications strategy) were still in process.

Dr. Warren reported he has spoken with BU President Dr. Thomas Shepherd regarding the university's loan of Mr. Matteson's services to CNME as an advisor. Dr. Shepherd approves of Mr. Matteson dedicating a portion of his time to CNME, and Mr. Matteson has expressed a desire to help wherever he can.

Dr. Lanphear joined the meeting at this point. Dr. Warren welcomed him and apologized for the incorrect notice of the starting time.

Dr. Warren reported the Strategic Planning Committee is proposing, as adopted at its December 9 meeting, that the Executive Committee, plus Dr. Kerins (as chair of the Strategic Planning Committee), Mr. Lofft, and Mr. Matteson, comprise the group that will coordinate, from this point onward, the effort to obtain the U.S. Secretary of Education's recognition. Included in the group's assignment will be preparations for the possible NACIQI hearing in June 2003. Dr. Warren suggested that this group meet about every two weeks and that it could, if it wishes, delegate the group's responsibilities to a smaller steering committee. **Dr. Saunders moved adoption of the committee's proposal. Dr. Bettenburg seconded.** Dr. Kerins commented that the members of this group would not necessarily be the individuals who would appear at the hearing, noting it would be better to have only a very small number of persons present oral testimony. Dr. Warren called for a vote on the motion. **Carried.**

◆ **5. Special Evaluation Visit to NCNM**

Dr. Kerins reported on his October 28 visit to NCNM, noting that the *Evaluation Team Report* already distributed to board members, and to be considered at the board's April 5 meeting, is self-explanatory. Mr. Lofft, who accompanied Dr. Kerins on the visit, said the college will need two years to fully recover from its short-term debt. The college does not appear to be in serious financial trouble, he said. [Recorder's note: The independent audit report for the college's fiscal year that ended June 30, 2002, was still in preparation at the time of the visit. The report is forthcoming. Updated details on the college's long- and short-term indebtedness will be available to members prior to the April 5 meeting.]

◆ **6. Recommendation on Executive Director's Contract (Executive Session)**

Mr. Lofft turned over his role as the conference call's moderator to Dr. Warren and left the meeting. Dr. Warren assumed responsibility as the recorder for the remainder of the meeting.

Dr. Warren read a recommendation from the Executive Committee, as follows: "That the Council offer Robert Lofft a two-year contract commencing June 1, 2003, with the option of a renewal for a third year, and that a formal contract prepared by an attorney, the terms to be negotiated between CNME's president and the executive director and approved at a meeting of the Council." **Dr. Martin moved acceptance of the recommendation. Dr. Saunders seconded. Carried.**

Members discussed the NPLEX results that the executive director had recently sent to them. Although it was noted this topic will be on the April 5 agenda, a concern was expressed that some of the programs may be in noncompliance with the new requirements for NPLEX performance that the CNME board adopted June 10, 2002 (*Handbook*, p. 29, Standard I, paragraph E-2). Members by consensus referred this matter to the Executive Committee, which is to decide whether the issue should be addressed prior to the board's April 5 meeting.

◆ **7. Adjournment.**

There being no further business for the board's consideration, Dr. Saunders proposed adjournment. Adopted by consensus. Time of adjournment was approximately 7 p.m. PST.

*Respectfully Submitted by Robert Lofft
Executive Director, Assistant Secretary
December 17, 2002*

COUNCIL ON NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL EDUCATION

MINUTES

Council (Board of Directors) Annual Meeting of August 12, 2003 DoubleTree Lloyd Center ♦ Portland, Oregon 25th Anniversary Meeting

Unapproved as Dec. 31, 2003

♦ 1. Call to Order, Meeting Notice, Roll of Members, Introductions

The Council's president, Don Warren, N.D. (Profession Member), Ottawa, Ontario, declared a quorum present and called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m. The meeting was announced as the Council's 2003 Annual Meeting, as prescribed by the *Bylaws*. The other members present were:

- ♦ Ruth Adele, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Vice President), Colorado Springs, Colorado;
- ♦ Rita Bettenburg, N.D. (Profession Member), Portland, Oregon;
- ♦ Brian J. Henderson, M.Ed. (Public Member), Perth, Ontario;
- ♦ Francis J. Kerins, Ed.D. (Public Member), Helena, Montana;
- ♦ Joel H. Lanphear, Ph.D. (Institutional Member Representative, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences [SCNM]), Tempe, Arizona;
- ♦ Peter A. Martin, D.C. (Institutional Member Representative, University of Bridgeport College of Naturopathic Medicine [UBCNM]), Bridgeport, Connecticut;
- ♦ Marcia Prenguber, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Treasurer), Goshen, Indiana;
- ♦ Paul R. Saunders, N.D., Ph.D. (Profession Member), Dundas, Ontario; and
- ♦ Joseph Wessels, N.D. (Profession Member, Council Secretary), Bellingham, Washington.

Member-Elect Present:

- ♦ Gannady Raskin, M.D., N.D. (Election effective September 1, 2003 as the Institutional Member Representative for Bastyr University), Toronto, Ontario.

Member Nominee Present:

- ♦ Pauline C. Baumann, N.D. (Institutional Member Representative Nominee, National College of Naturopathic Medicine [NCNM]), Portland, Oregon.

Absent Members: No members absent.

Staff Present:

- ♦ Robert Lofft, Executive Director, Eugene, Oregon (meeting recorder).

Guests Present for All or Parts of the Meeting:

- ♦ David A. Cheesman, D.O., Dean of Naturopathic Medicine, Florida College of Integrative Medicine (FCIM), Orlando, Florida;
- ♦ Catherine Downey, N.D., Associate Dean of Clinical and Graduate Medical Education, NCNM;
- ♦ Gary Garcia, M.D., Director of Graduate Medical Education, Bastyr University, Kenmore, Washington;
- ♦ William J. Keppler, Ph.D., President, NCNM, Portland, Oregon;
- ♦ Michael Brad Miller, M.D., Ph.D., President, FCIM;

- ◆ Shawn O'Reilly, Executive Director, Canadian Naturopathic Association, Toronto, Ontario;
- ◆ Ron Saranchuk, Ph.D., Assistant Dean, Academic Affairs, Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine (CCNM), Toronto, Ontario;
- ◆ David Scotten, N.D., Academic Dean, and Faculty Representative to the Board of Governors, Boucher Institute of Naturopathic Medicine; New Westminster, British Columbia; and
- ◆ Fraser Smith, N.D., Dean, Naturopathic Medicine Program, CCNM.

◆ 2. Agenda

Members adopted by consensus the published agenda for the meeting, with no changes.

◆ 3. Election of Directors

Dr. Martin, chair of the Nominations and Membership Committee, announced the terms of the Profession Member terms of Drs. Adele, Saunders, and Wessels expire at the conclusion of this meeting. The committee has nominated all three for re-election. Additionally, the Public Member term for Dr. Kerins expires at the end of this meeting, and the committee has nominated him for re-election. Dr. Martin also reported that Dr. Baumann is NCNM's nominee as the college's Institutional Member Representative for a term beginning at the conclusion of this meeting. No nominations from the floor. All nominees elected.

Dr. Saunders moved that Dr. Raskin's election conducted by e-mail during the last week of May 2003 be affirmed. Seconded. Carried.

◆ 4. Officers' Reports

A. Secretary. Dr. Wessels referred members to two sets of minutes previously distributed.

- a. Dr. Adele moved approval of the minutes for April 5, 2003. Dr. Wessels seconded. Carried.
- b. Dr. Adele moved approval of the minutes for May 14, 2003. Dr. Wessels. Carried.

B. Treasurer.

- a. Acceptance of the Budget Report & Financial Statement as of August 7, 2003 (Exhibit 1).
Dr. Prenguber referred members to the report in members' meeting packets. Dr. Kerins moved acceptance. Dr. Saunders seconded. Carried.
- b. Acceptance of the Proposed Operating Budget for 2004 (Exhibit 2). Dr. Prenguber referred members to proposed budget in members' meeting packets. Dr. Adele moved acceptance. Dr. Martin seconded. Carried.

C. Vice President. No report.

D. President. Dr. Warren presented a report he had made the previous day at a meeting of the Naturopathic Coordinating Committee. The report stated:

One year ago, the three top commitments made by the CNME at this group's meeting were:

- ◆ To achieve USDE recognition as the programmatic accrediting agency for naturopathic medical education;
- ◆ To achieve recognition by the Council on Higher Education Accreditation (CHEA); and
- ◆ To develop a three-year plan.

1. National Recognition. On June 10 the National Advisory Committee on Institutional Quality and Integrity (NACIQI) voted to recommend to the U.S. Secretary of Education that CNME be recognized as the national accrediting agency for naturopathic medical education programs. A positive announcement from the Secretary of Education is expected within the next month or two. This decision was hard earned and definitely the result of a team effort. Special thanks goes to our executive director who meticulously wrote the application; to Frank Kerins who chaired the Hearing Planning Group and who made an excellent presentation at the hearing; to each Council member who volunteered time serving on committees, attended telephone conference meetings as well as two "in person" meetings during the year and who as a group had the wisdom to make the right decisions even though they were difficult at times; to David Matteson who worked with our lawyers to identify a federal link and who worked closely with the planning group and

with the staff at USDE; to Bastyr University for its generous loan of Mr. Matteson; to the AANMC, which contributed to help cover legal costs; and to AANP and NABNE for their generous financial support. This was truly a team effort and shows what is possible as the profession works together toward significant goals with a planned, focused approach and a unified spirit.

The success was “hard earned.” Several identifiable factors contributed to the success:

- ♦ With the help of competent legal council, the CNME was able to identify several federal links, which were unassailable.
- ♦ CNME went into the hearings with a positive staff report. Ron Lipton, a USDE staff member, evaluated CNME closely. Ron studied our application, attended several Council meetings and observed an evaluation visit to Bridgeport. His final report gave the CNME a “totally clean bill of health.” CNME met all USDE criteria 100%! It was noted by the chair that it was unusual to have a new agency apply for recognition without a staff recommendation for the correction of some deficiency.
- ♦ CNME maintained a very positive relationship with USDE staff throughout the process.
- ♦ We were prepared. Our oral presentations to NACIQI were reviewed, critiqued and rehearsed in advance. In meetings with the lawyers well prior to the hearings, we identified questions that might be raised by both the committee and our opposition.
- ♦ CNME had strong letters of support from the profession that were submitted with our application. The one thing that we could have done differently and should do with our next application is to have the profession also send letters of support during the public-comment period.

The recognition, once given by the Secretary of Education, will be for a two-year period, so in one year we will start the process again. We can be sure our opposition will be better prepared for this next hearing. However, as long as we continue to assiduously meet the USDE criteria for recognition, and continue to do our work professionally, and provided we have the continued financial support of the profession, we should expect to receive a longer renewal period next time around.

2. **CHEA Recognition.** CHEA advises that we wait until we have the USDE recognition before we apply. Once we receive the recognition, we will begin the process with CHEA.
3. **Three-Year Plan.** The Strategic Planning Committee’s work was put on the back burner prior to the hearings in Washington. It is now once again gearing up under the leadership of Dr. Kerins. One of the first priorities is to enlist outside professional help to evaluate what CNME needs to do in the future to increase our capacity. We have obtained funding from the Robert Schad Foundation which will help us hire outside expertise and to help carry out the resulting recommendations. As new states are licensed, we expect to see a greater number of programs applying for accreditation. We would also like to have input on what we are doing well and what we could be doing better as an accrediting agency. This outside audit would provide us with the basis for the development of our three-year plan.

So far, we have nine responses from the profession regarding a three-year commitment to the CNME. The commitments so far total just over \$10,000. We are still operating on a very slim budget with minimal allowance for the administration of the Council. This was commented on by one of the NACIQI members.

Dr. Warren also reported he invited each organization within the profession to send representatives to CNME’s training session next spring. CNME will involve an outside trainer. This training is specifically for Council members, possible future Council members, site evaluators, program administrators (particularly for new programs), and for any of the leadership of the profession who would like to better understand CNME’s work.

Following Dr. Warren’s report, Dr. Adele requested that Council members recommend possible future members to the Nominations and Membership Committee. [*Recorder’s Note:* Dr. Warren has appointed Dr. Adele chair of the Nominations and Membership Committee, replacing Dr. Martin, whose term as a director expired at the conclusion of this meeting. The other members are Mr. Henderson and Dr. Saunders.]

Recognition of Dr. Keppler’s Service. With consensus from the board’s members, Dr. Warren presented a service award to Dr. Keppler for the contributions he made during his four years as a board member prior to his resignation to become president of NCNM. Dr. Keppler accepted the award, thanking the Council for the opportunity to serve.

◆ 5. Committee Reports

- A. Evaluation and Compensation Committee.** *Drs. Wessels (chair), Kerins, and Warren.* Dr. Wessels reported the committee will undertake an evaluation of the executive director's performance and the board's performance near the end of the calendar year.
- B. Executive Committee.** *Drs. Warren (chair), Adele, Prenguber, and Wessels.* Dr. Warren reported the committee will meet by phone on September 15, 7:30 Eastern Time (4:30 Pacific Time). The committee will consider several recommendations to be presented to the board at future meetings.
- C. Finance and Development Committee.** *Drs. Prenguber (chair) and Wessels.* Dr. Prenguber referred members to the committee's report in their meeting packets (Exhibit 3). Mr. Lofft proposed that each Council member select one or more state and provincial associations to contact for their three-year commitments, and a list was circulated on which members noted the associations they will contact.
- D. Hearing Planning Group.** *Dr. Kerins (chair) and Dr. Warren; Mr. Matteson (advisor) and Mr. Lofft (ex officio).* Dr. Kerins noted Dr. Warren's President's Report had covered the committee's work. The Council needs to keep in mind the final decision has not yet been made.

- E. Membership and Nominations Committee.** *Dr. Martin (chair), Mr. Henderson, and Dr. Saunders.* Dr. Martin thanked his colleagues on the committee for their service in helping the committee to identify and nominate directors and officers. The committee will present a slate of officer nominees for the board's consideration near the end of this meeting.

Dr. Warren declared the meeting recessed. During the recess, the Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education conducted its meeting. Immediately following the CPME meeting, the board meeting reconvened.

- F. Committee on Postdoctoral Medical Education.** *Drs. Wessels (chair), Adele, and Bettenburg; Mr. Henderson; Drs. Prenguber and Saunders.* Dr. Wessels reported the committee, in addition to its meeting during the recess, also had a phone meeting on August 8 at which it approved the Outside In training site in Portland, Oregon, as part of the certification granted NCNM's residency program. At the August 8 meeting, the committee also approved the transfer of two training sites, the Cancer Treatment Centers of America sites at Zion, Illinois, and Tulsa, Oklahoma, from NCNM's certified residency program to Bastyr's certified residency program.

At the meeting during the recess, the application for certification submitted by the International Naturopathic Postdoctoral Medical Education Administration was withdrawn, and the committee approved two additional training sites as part of the certification granted NCNM's residency program: Mountain park Health Clinic, Portland, Oregon; and Alpine Clinic, Alpine, Utah. The committee did not approve two other sites for which NCNM had applied for approval but agreed to meet by phone in the near future to further consider the two sites.

Dr. Prenguber moved acceptance of the committee's report. Dr. Wessels seconded. Carried.

- G. Committee on Standards, Policies, and Procedures (COSPP).** *Drs. Warren (chair) and Bettenburg; Mr. Henderson; Dr. Kerins, Lanphear, and Martin; and Mr. Lofft (ex officio).*

- a. Revisions to the Review and Certification Manual for Postdoctoral Medical Education Programs.** Dr. Warren asked Mr. Lofft to present the committee's recommendations for changes in the document. Mr. Lofft referred members to the revisions previously mailed to them (Exhibit 4) and reviewed the changes. Dr. Martin moved approval of the changes for release for a 45-day period of public comment this fall, with final adoption of the proposed changes to be considered at the board's spring 2004 meeting. Dr. Adele seconded. Carried. Mr. Lofft thanked the board members for their help in formulating the revisions, especially Dr. Adele for her suggestions on ways to improve the document.

- b. Criteria for Programs' Performance on NPLEX.** Members discussed the criteria in Standard I, paragraph E.2, which states: "The overall pass rate of students and graduates on licensing examinations compares favorably to other naturopathic medicine programs. Consistently the program has a pass rate on licensing examinations of at least 70 percent."

Following discussion, Dr. Saunders moved that the first sentence be dropped. Dr. Adele seconded. Carried.

Members generally agreed that for the second sentence, wording needed to be substituted that would require the overall pass rate to be within two standard deviations of the national average for accredited

programs. Dr. Saunders volunteered to research this matter, to determine the effect of using two standard deviations, and to report to the board's members by e-mail within the coming weeks. The board will then decide on final wording by an e-mail poll, and the changes in these criteria will be released for public comment, with final adoption by the board at its spring 2004 meeting.

- c. **Restructuring the Dues Schedule.** Dr. Warren reported the committee as for the time being tabled any changes to the Council's dues structure.
- d. **Distance Education Standards.** Dr. Warren stated the committee believes the current standards accommodate distance-education courses. A program that plans to offer distance-education courses must consult CNME's executive director to learn if the number and nature of the courses being converted to distance-education would constitute a substantive change. Members prior to the meeting received a CHEA publication that reported on how various accrediting agencies evaluate distance-education programs. Many agencies use existing standards but require a program to go through substantive change procedures if several courses are converted to distance education. CNME's Substantive Change Policy requires the same.
- e. **Revisions to the *Handbook and Evaluators' Worksheets*.** The committee is still considering ways to refine the Handbook so it will be more clear which criteria apply for institutional evaluations and which apply for programmatic evaluations.
- f. **Outcome Measures.** The committee is considering ways to evaluate programs using competency-based outcome measures. A COSPP subcommittee consisting of Mr. Henderson and Drs. Bettenburg and Lanphear will prepare a proposal and distribute it to other COSPP members in advance of COSPP's spring 2004 meeting.
- g. **Other Models Clinical Training.** The committee has deferred discussion to a future meeting on the possibility of developing new models for clinical education.
- h. **Preparatory Courses.** The committee has likewise tabled discussion on this topic to a future meeting.
- i. **Bylaws Amendment.** COSPP recommends that the board approve for a public comment period changes to the Council's *Bylaws* that would allow a Profession Member or an Institutional Member Representative an extension in the member's term as a director if serving as an officer. The amendments would treat these two classes of members the same as Public Members. Article I, Section 3 would read (new wording in italics): "Institutional member representatives, as defined in the Articles of Incorporation, shall be elected for three-year, non-renewable terms, *except that an institutional member representative who may be a principal officer of the Council may serve beyond the member's three-year term until the term of office expires.*" Section 4 would read; "Profession members, as defined in the Articles of Incorporation, shall be elected for three-year terms, with a limit of two consecutive full terms, *except that a profession member who may be a principal officer of the Council may serve beyond the member's second three-year term until the term of office expires.*" Following discussion, Dr. Wessels moved adoption of the recommendation. Dr. Prenguber seconded. Carried.

G. Strategic Planning Committee. Drs. Kerins (chair) and Adele; Mr. Henderson; Drs. Lanphear, Prenguber, and Warren; Mr. Matteson (advisor) and Mr. Lofft (ex officio). Dr. Kerins reported three members of the committee, Dr. Warren, Mr. Matteson, and himself, met earlier in the day. The committee's goal is to create a comprehensive action plan for the next three years, a period that will see a rapid expansion in the profession and CNME's activities. The committee will make its recommendation to the Executive Committee which in turn will make recommendations to the full board. Outside assistance in developing the plan is needed for objectivity. The written plan will consider such things as the Council's role and governing structure. The outside consultant will help facilitate the planning process.

◆ 6. Executive Director's Report

Mr. Lofft submitted a detailed written report (**Exhibit 5**) and reviewed its contents. Mr. Henderson moved acceptance of the report. Dr. Adele seconded. Carried.

Dr. Saunders proposed that the board look into joining the Association of Accrediting Agencies of Canada. He will attend the November 4 meeting in Vancouver, during the Northwest Naturopathic Physicians Conference, at which a proposal for forming a "Canadian CNME" will be presented. Dr. Kerins proposed that Dr. Warren appoint a small committee that would focus on the developments in Canadian accreditation. Dr. Warren stated a team would be organized before the November 4 meeting, and that he would be one of the liaison members.

◆ **7. Old Business Not Related to Recognition Actions**

No old business.

◆ **8. New Business Not Related to Recognition Actions**

No new business.

◆ **9. Business Related to the Recognition of a College or Program**

No business related to the Recognition of a College or Program

◆ **10. Election of Officers**

Dr. Martin, chair of the Nominations and Membership Committee, presented the committee's slate of nominees for the principal offices of the corporation: Dr. Warren for a second term as president; Dr. Wessels for a first term as vice president; Dr. Prenguber for a full term as treasurer; and Dr. Kerins for a first term as secretary. No nominations from the floor. Members elected the slate of nominees, with the election effective immediately.

◆ **11. Miscellaneous Business**

A. Recognition of Retiring Board Member. Dr. Wessels moved that Dr. Martin be presented with a service award for the contributions he made to the Council during his two years on the Council's Board of Directors. Dr. Saunders seconded. Carried. Dr. Warren presented the service award to Dr. Martin, who expressed his pleasure at having been able to serve on the board.

B. Next Meeting. Members agreed by consensus to schedule the Council's 2004 Semiannual Meeting for Friday, March 12, at a site in the Phoenix, Arizona area. The previous day, March 11, will be reserved for committee meetings. The evaluators's training session will be Saturday, March 13.

◆ **11. Adjournment**

There being no further business for the board's consideration, Dr. Warren declared the meeting adjourned. Time of adjournment was 5: 45 p.m.

*Robert Lofft
Executive Director, Assistant Secretary
September 5, 2003*