

## Face Scan App Inches Toward End of Privacy

### Using 3 Billion Photos to Identify Anyone

By KASHMIR HILL

Until recently, Hoan Ton-That's greatest hits included an obscure iPhone game and an app that let people put Donald Trump's distinctive yellow hair on their own photos.

Then Mr. Ton-That — an Australian techie and onetime model — did something momentous: He invented a tool that could end your ability to walk down the street anonymously, and provided it to hundreds of law enforcement agencies, ranging from local cops in Florida to the F.B.I. and the Department of Homeland Security.

His tiny company, Clearview AI, devised a groundbreaking facial recognition app. You take a picture of a person, upload it and get to see public photos of that person, along with links to where those photos appeared. The system — whose backbone is a database of more than three billion images that Clearview claims to have scraped from Facebook, YouTube, Venmo and millions of other websites — goes far beyond anything ever constructed by the United States government or Silicon Valley giants.

Federal and state law enforcement officers said that while they had only limited knowledge of how Clearview works and who is behind it, they had used its app to help solve shoplifting, identity theft, credit card fraud, murder and child sexual exploitation cases.

Until now, technology that readily identifies everyone based on his or her face has been taboo because of its radical erosion of privacy. Tech companies capable of

Continued on Page 16



WILLIAM WIDMER FOR THE NEW YORK TIMES

A picture of Ariel McCullough is one of the banners in "Seeing Newnan," an art installation that upended the Georgia community.

## Art Forces a Small Southern City to Rethink Its Image

By AUDRA D. S. BURCH

NEWNAN, Ga. — It was the Saturday afternoon that this small Southern city had been dreading. A group of neo-Nazis promised to hold a rally in downtown Newnan to celebrate Adolf Hitler's birthday and rail against illegal immigration and the removal of Confederate monuments.

Newnan had prided itself on its quiet charm. It offered small-town living just 40 miles southwest of Atlanta and had earned the nickname "City of Homes" for its antebellum architecture. Now, on a spring day in April 2018, a neo-Nazi group had assembled in a park near the courthouse, the leader having said the group preferred to hold rallies in

### IMPERFECT UNION

Rattled by Portraits of 19 Residents

predominantly white towns.

But it turned out that only a few dozen white nationalists attended the rally, and the Newnan they had imagined no longer existed. Its population had more than doubled in less than 20 years, drawing an increasingly diverse collection of newcomers. Newnan was changing and many in the community wanted to embrace that change more openly. A year after the white nationalist rally, the town made an effort to do so by putting up 17 large-scale banner portraits, images of the or-

inary people who make up Newnan.

They hang from the perches of brick buildings around downtown. There's Helen Berry, an African-American woman who for years worked at a sewing factory. Wiley Driver, a white worker who folded and packed blankets at a local mill before his death in 2017. Ji-neet Blanco, a waitress who arrived in Newnan carrying her Mexican traditions and dreams. And then there were the Shah sisters.

A portrait of Aatika and Zahraw Shah wearing hijabs was displayed on the side of an empty building in downtown Newnan. The sisters were born in Georgia and had lived in Newnan since 2012, after they moved from

Continued on Page 18

## TRUMP'S LAWYERS DISMISS CHARGES AS 'BRAZEN' PLOT

### A DEFIANT 6-PAGE FILING

### Democratic Memo Calls Actions the 'Framers' Worst Nightmare'

By MICHAEL D. SHEAR  
and NICHOLAS FANDOS

WASHINGTON — President Trump's legal defense team strenuously denied on Saturday that he had committed impeachable acts, denouncing the charges against him as a "brazen and unlawful" attempt to cost him re-election as House Democrats laid out in meticulous detail their case that he should be removed from office.

In the first legal filings for the Senate impeachment trial that opens in earnest on Tuesday, the dueling arguments from the White House and the House impeachment managers previewed a politically charged fight over Mr. Trump's fate, unfolding against the backdrop of the presidential election campaign.

They presented the legal strategies both sides are likely to employ during the third presidential impeachment trial in American history. They also vividly illustrated how the proceeding is almost certain to rekindle feuding over the 2016 election that has barely subsided during Mr. Trump's tenure, and reverberate — whether he is convicted or acquitted — in an even more brutal electoral fight in November.

In a 46-page trial memorandum, and additional 60-page statement of facts, the House impeachment managers asserted that beginning in the spring, Mr.

Continued on Page 14

## Royal Couple To Cede Titles In Family Rift

By MARK LANDLER

WINDSOR, England — Prince Harry and his wife, Meghan, will stop using their loftiest royal titles, give up state funding and repay at least \$3 million in taxpayer money used to refurbish their official residence at Windsor Castle under an agreement announced by Buckingham Palace on Saturday.

The unusual deal, negotiated by aides to Queen Elizabeth II, Prince Harry and other senior family members, is intended to end a crisis that erupted 10 days ago when the couple abruptly announced plans to step back from their royal duties and spend part of each year in North America.

However civil, the agreement codifies one of the most dramatic ruptures within the British royal family since King Edward VIII abdicated the throne in 1936 to marry an American woman, Wallis Simpson. It is a spectacle that has enthralled and divided Britain, overshadowing even the country's impending departure from the European Union, and has provoked conversations around the world about race, privilege and tradition.

The couple plan to spend a majority of their time outside Britain, initially in Canada but later likely in the United States as well, according to officials at the palace. They will continue to carry out limited duties on behalf of the

Continued on Page 4



MERIDITH KOHUT FOR THE NEW YORK TIMES

A small clothing factory that was flooded by calls from widows seeking work in Aleppo, Syria.

## Finding Freedom in a Syria of Ever Fewer Men

By VIVIAN YEE  
and HWAIDA SAAD

ALEPPO, Syria — The women of eastern Aleppo were rarely visible before the war, but now they shape the bitter peace. In the poor, conservative districts of Syria's ancient commercial capital, many women seldom used to leave the house, and only with their husbands if they did; the men not only won the bread, but also went out to buy it.

Then came the civil war.

Eight years and counting of

bloodshed have condemned a generation of Syrian men to their deaths, to prison or to precarious lives as refugees. Now, with most of the country once again under government control, yet ruptured beyond recognition, moving forward is up to the women left behind: part survivors, part mourners, part mop-up crew.

Grandmothers are raising orphaned grandchildren. Single women worry they will never find husbands. Widows are supporting families gutted by losses that once seemed unendurable, and that the

world now treats as routine.

In many cases, women are leaving the house on their own and working for the first time, old customs succumbing to the extremities of war and an economy in collapse — nothing new in large cities like Damascus, the capital, but a swift transformation for some of the more traditional corners of this socially and religiously conservative country.

"Before, women were afraid of everything," said Fatima Rawass, 32, who opened a beauty salon for

Continued on Page 10

## Up for 5th Senate Term, Collins Walks Impeachment Tightrope

By JENNIFER STEINHAUER

WASHINGTON — A few days after Senator Susan Collins cast her votes to acquit President Bill Clinton, as she was greeted with icy stares at a Lincoln Day dinner in rural Maine, a fellow Republican approached her, irate.

"I can't believe you let him off the hook," he told Ms. Collins. "I am never, ever voting for you again."

Twenty-one years later, she faces another presidential impeachment vote with heavy consequences for the nation and her own political survival. Ms. Collins, one of a handful of moderate Republicans whose votes could alter the trajectory of the trial, said she does not regret her votes to acquit then.

She said she would use the same logic behind that decision when she weighs the impeachment charges against President Trump in a Senate trial that begins in earnest this week.

"I, too, was furious at President Clinton and felt that he had lied under oath, but it didn't reach the constitutional test of high crimes and misdemeanors, and was not sufficient to overturn an election and throw him out of office," she said in an interview on Thursday in her Capitol Hill office.

In the case of Mr. Trump, she said, she would be "applying that same standard."

Ms. Collins's position as a centrist gives her outside influence over the shape of Mr. Trump's trial, including whether new wit-



DAVID HUME KENNERLY/GETTY IMAGES

Senator Susan Collins said she would use the "same standard" she followed in the 1999 trial.

nesses and evidence will be heard, just as it has in some of the most important and impassioned debates during her four terms in the Senate. But that middle ground is shrinking in the Trump era, leaving her open to bitter attack from both political parties.

She was among three Republicans who sank Mr. Trump's attempts to repeal the Affordable Care Act, and she helped lead an unsuccessful effort to prevent him from taking unallocated money for his border wall. But she also voted for a tax bill that was the centerpiece of the Republican agenda. And the move that overshadowed all that was her deciding vote to confirm Justice Brett

Continued on Page 15

### NATIONAL 12-23

#### A Guantánamo Bay Mystery

The trial of a former commander of the naval base put a spotlight on life at the secretive outpost best known for its terrorist court and prison. PAGE 21

#### Message at the Women's March

In the movement's fourth year, participants say that President Trump's policies cannot be separated from the matters they are protesting. PAGE 23

### INTERNATIONAL 4-11

#### Enduring China's Crackdown

A rare visit finds the people of the ancient town of Yarkand, a cultural cradle for Uighur Muslims, resilient in the face of mass detentions. PAGE 6

### SUNDAY BUSINESS

#### Unliking All Those 'Likes'

Instagram's chief executive wants to keep the platform a safe, special space. That means learning from the mistakes of its parent company, Facebook. PAGE 1

### SUNDAY REVIEW

#### Michelle Alexander

PAGE 1



"'Once Upon A Time...in Hollywood' is not going anywhere. It will stand as a source of delight for as long as we care about movies. And it wants us to care."

A.O. SCOTT *The New York Times*

10 ACADEMY AWARD NOMINATIONS  
INCLUDING  
BEST PICTURE

ONCE UPON A TIME IN...  
HOLLYWOOD

WRITTEN AND DIRECTED BY  
QUENTIN TARANTINO

