



Nauvoo, Illinois. Bird's-eye view from the hill across the Mississippi River to Nauvoo. Steel engraving, c. 1855, copyrighted by Herrmann J. Meyer. Library of Congress.

# The Mantle of the Prophet Joseph Passes to Brother Brigham: One Hundred Twenty-nine Testimonies of a Collective Spiritual Witness

Lynne Watkins Jorgensen

On August 8, 1844, six weeks after the Prophet Joseph Smith's martyrdom, a meeting of the Saints was held in Nauvoo, Illinois. Brigham Young, President of the Quorum of the Twelve, and several other apostles had just returned from missions. The purpose of this meeting was to determine by vote who had the right and responsibility to lead the Church—Sidney Rigdon, first counselor in the First Presidency, or the Quorum of the Twelve with Brigham Young at their head.<sup>1</sup> In the course of the two meetings held that day, many in attendance received a divine witness that Brigham Young was to be the next leader: some Saints specifically state that Brigham Young assured the congregation that “here is President Sidney Rigdon, who was counselor to Joseph. I ask, where are Joseph and Hyrum? They

---

1. The most complete text of the minutes of August 8, 1844, as gathered by early Church historians, is found in Joseph Smith Jr., *History of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints*, ed. B. H. Roberts, 2d ed., rev., 7 vols. (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1971), 7:231–43 (hereafter cited as *History of the Church*); for an early version of this compilation, see “History, 1838–1856, Volume F-1 [1 May 1844–8 August 1844],” 296–304, Church History Library, available on Church Historian's Press, *The Joseph Smith Papers*, <http://www.josephsmithpapers.org/paper-Summary/history-1838-1856-volume-f-1-1-may-1844-8-august-1844/280>. For more on these events, see Ronald K. Esplin, “Joseph, Brigham and the Twelve: A Succession of Continuity,” *BYU Studies* 21, no. 3 (1981): 301–41; and Martin B. Hickman, “Succession in the Presidency,” in *Encyclopedia of Mormonism*, ed. Daniel H. Ludlow, 4 vols. (New York: Macmillan, 1992), 3:1420–21.

are gone beyond the veil; and if Elder Rigdon wants to act as his counselor, he must go beyond the veil where he [Joseph] is. . . . I say unto you that the quorum of the Twelve have the keys of the Kingdom of God in all the world.”<sup>2</sup> During the meeting Brigham sounded and appeared remarkably like Joseph Smith; others simply say that the “mantle of Joseph” or the “mantle of the prophets” rested on Brigham Young; and others state that they were given a witness “by the spirit” that Brigham was to lead the Church.

This spiritual experience, which has come to be known as “the mantle of the Prophet falling on Brigham Young” or transfiguration, served to unite and comfort the Saints as they mourned the death of their beloved prophet and to direct them when they voted to support Brigham and the Twelve as leaders of the Church. Some Saints who were not present at the August 8 meetings reported experiencing a similar “mantle” witness on later occasions. To date we are aware of 129 people who wrote or otherwise passed on their remembrances of this witness.

Most Mormon historians acknowledge the mantle story, agreeing that something important happened in August 1844. For example, Ronald K. Esplin states, “Though there is no contemporary diary account, the number of later retellings, many in remarkable detail, argues for the reality of some such experience.”<sup>3</sup> Leonard J. Arrington and Davis Bitton acknowledge, “Many who were present at the August 8 meeting later remembered seeing in Brigham Young that day a new appearance and hearing from him a new voice—one that was very familiar, that of Joseph Smith. For them the ‘Mantle of Joseph’ was given directly, miraculously, to Young.”<sup>4</sup> Arrington notes in another book that “the diaries, letters, and later recollections of many of those present testified to an experience that persuaded them that Brigham was the new Joseph.” He acknowledges that an important event “took place” but observed that there may be psychological explanations for the phenomenon and reserves judgment

---

2. “History, 1838–1856, Volume F-1,” 297–98; *History of the Church*, 7:233.

3. Esplin, “Joseph, Brigham and the Twelve,” 325n84.

4. Leonard J. Arrington and Davis Bitton, *The Mormon Experience: A History of the Latter-day Saints* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1979), 84–85.

regarding whether a miraculous transfiguration<sup>5</sup> occurred.<sup>6</sup> Others have concluded that it is unlikely that a miraculous spiritual manifestation took place. Richard S. Van Wagoner, for instance, writes, "When 8 August 1844 is stripped of emotional overlay, there is not a shred of irrefutable contemporary evidence to support the occurrence of a mystical event." Van Wagoner concludes that "a more likely scenario was that it was the force of Young's commanding presence, his well-timed arrival at the morning meeting, and perhaps a bit of theatrical mimicry that swayed the crowd."<sup>7</sup> Van Wagoner and others insist that transfiguration stories must appear on the day of occurrence or shortly thereafter to be acceptable.<sup>8</sup> However, he has not presented documentation written on the day that refutes the fact that

---

5. The term "transfiguration" was used by early LDS writers in reference to the specific meeting of August 8, 1844, when the mantle of the Prophet Joseph descended upon Brigham Young. Although not everyone witnessed a change in the voice and form of Brigham Young, many reported that they did; hence the use of the term. One meaning of transfiguration is "an act, process, or instance of changing or being changed in form or appearance." *Webster's New International Dictionary*, 3d ed., s.v. *transfiguration*. Compare Matthew 17:1–2.

6. Leonard J. Arrington, *Brigham Young: American Moses* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1985), 114–15. Arrington acknowledges that it is possible to attribute the mantle experience to "the downcast spirits of the Saints, who had mourned Joseph's passing for forty days; their yearning to be comforted by their lost leader; their disappointment with Rigdon, whose ambition had diluted his sincerity; their surprise at the presence of 'Brother Brigham,' who was thought by many to be still on his way back from Boston, and Brigham's talent for mimicry." Most Mormon historians who have written about the mantle phenomenon matter-of-factly report that many Saints later testified that they had witnessed a miraculous transfiguration of Brigham Young. See Thomas G. Alexander, *Things of Heaven and Earth: The Life and Times of Wilford Woodruff, a Mormon Prophet* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1991), 114; James B. Allen and Glen M. Leonard, *The Story of the Latter-day Saints*, 2d ed. (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1992), 216; and D. Michael Quinn, *The Mormon Hierarchy: Origins of Power* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1994), 166–67.

7. Richard S. Van Wagoner, "The Making of a Mormon Myth: The 1844 Transfiguration of Brigham Young," *Dialogue: A Journal of Mormon Thought* 28 (Winter 1995): 21.

8. Van Wagoner, "Making of a Mormon Myth," 22–23; see also Reid L. Harper, "The Mantle of Joseph: Creation of a Mormon Miracle," *Journal of Mormon History* 22 (Fall 1996): 35–71.

a transfiguration occurred. In fact, Van Wagoner eventually admits that as the August 8, 1844, afternoon meeting progressed, “the sentiment which had so recently changed in favor of the twelve became palpable.”<sup>9</sup>

In order to enable readers to examine for themselves the evidence underlying these interpretations, numerous accounts of the mantle experience have been compiled in the document/testimony section of this article beginning on page 430. The evidence presented in these accounts demonstrates that many people testified powerfully that they had received a convincing sensory or spiritual witness of the mantle of the Prophet Joseph falling on Brigham Young. Brigham Young’s remarks as recorded by Thomas Bullock at the August 8, 1844, morning meeting are found in the appendix to this article (pages 505–7).

### **The Symbolic Mantle: Elijah and Elisha**

The image of the mantle as a symbol of the passing of authority is at least as old as the well-known Old Testament story of the prophet Elijah and Elisha, his young follower.<sup>10</sup> The Lord told Elijah that he was to anoint Elisha “to be prophet in thy room.” Elisha was plowing in the fields when Elijah walked past him and placed his rough mantle (cloak or cape) across the younger man’s shoulders. Elisha left the fields to follow Elijah and to have Elijah minister to him (1 Kgs. 19:16–21).

As the story continues, the time came for Elijah to leave his earthly mission:

And it came to pass, when they were gone over [the Jordan River], that Elijah said unto Elisha, Ask what I shall do for thee, before I be taken away from thee. And Elisha said, I pray thee, let a double portion of thy spirit be upon me. And he said, Thou hast asked a hard thing; nevertheless, if thou see me when I am taken from thee, it shall be so unto thee; but if not, it shall not be so. (2 Kgs. 2:9–10)

---

9. Van Wagoner, “The Making of a Mormon Myth,” 11. See also Richard S. Van Wagoner, *Sidney Rigdon: A Portrait of Religious Excess* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1994), 341.

10. Most converts learned to read from the Bible and were familiar with the term *mantle*. For more information on Elijah, Elisha, and prophetic succession, see Fred E. Woods, “Elisha and the Children: The Question of Accepting Prophetic Succession,” *BYU Studies* 32, no. 3 (1992): 47–58.

When the veil parted, there appeared a horse-drawn chariot of such brilliant glory it was called a “chariot of fire.” This vehicle swept between Elijah and Elisha, and Elijah “went up by a whirlwind into heaven” (2 Kgs. 2:11).

And Elisha saw it, and he cried, My father, my father, the chariot of Israel, and the horsemen thereof. And he saw him no more: and he took hold of his own clothes, and rent them in two pieces. He took up also the mantle of Elijah that fell from him, and went back, and stood by the bank of Jordan; And he took the mantle of Elijah that fell from him, and smote the waters, and said, Where is the Lord God of Elijah? and when he also had smitten the waters, they parted hither and thither: and Elisha went over. And when the sons of the prophets which were to view at Jericho saw him, they said, The spirit of Elijah doth rest on Elisha. And they came to meet him, and bowed themselves to the ground before him. (2 Kgs. 2:12–15)

Like the “sons of the prophets,” many of the Saints in Nauvoo experienced a witness of the Lord’s designation of the next prophet as they met in conference in Nauvoo on August 8, 1844. The mantle experience of 1844 has become a symbol of the transfer of prophetic authority in the Church. After the death of a prophet and the identification of his successor, members of the Church frequently say that “the mantle has fallen once again.”<sup>11</sup>

### **Oral Tradition of Mantle Testimonies**

Several years ago, on a warm Sunday morning on a houseboat at Lake Powell, my father, Victor Watkins, gathered his children and

---

11. It is important to understand the part that the vote of this conference played in establishing the succession of authority in The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. The authority of the Twelve as the governing body of the Church upon the death of a President was confirmed as the congregation chose to support Brigham Young in his calling as President of the Quorum of the Twelve. Each time a new President of the Church is sustained, this plan of priesthood leadership is followed. See Esplin, “Joseph, Brigham, and the Twelve,” 301–40. See also Hickman, “Succession,” and Ronald W. Walker, “Grant’s Watershed: Succession in The Presidency, 1887–89,” in *Qualities That Count: Heber J. Grant as Businessman, Missionary, and Apostle* (Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University Press, 2004), 195–229.

grandchildren together to share with them his testimony of the August 8, 1844, miracle.<sup>12</sup> He told them about his own grandfather William Lampard Watkins, who was seventeen at the time of Joseph Smith's martyrdom on June 27, 1844. When William heard the tragic news, he was in Kentucky campaigning for the Prophet, who was running for president of the United States.<sup>13</sup> William hurried back to Nauvoo to join other grieving and confused mourners. At this point in the story, my father pulled a wrinkled paper from his pocket and began to read directly from William's own words:

A meeting was appointed for August 8th [1844] by which time Brigham Young and most of the other apostles had returned home. It was at this meeting Sidney Rigdon made a lengthy and tedious speech presenting his claims, telling the people what wonderful things he had planned for them.

... The darkness was soon dispelled, for Brigham Young explained before the people on that day, the order of the Priesthood. He was filled with the power of the Holy Ghost. He stood before the people as the Prophet Joseph Smith often had done and we heard the voice of the true shepherd, for he spoke with the voice of Joseph. His manner and appearance were like unto Joseph's and it was manifested to all those present upon whom the responsibility rested to carry on the work of God and lead the Saints. (document 64)<sup>14</sup>

Sharing an ancestor's testimony of seeing and/or hearing Brigham's transformation before the multitude of Saints is a tradition for many Latter-day Saint families whose forebears witnessed the event. Juanita Leavitt Brooks recalled that her grandfather Dudley Leavitt loved to retell the story as long as he lived (document 103). John and Eliza Billington Welch "were both present at the meeting held August 8, 1844

---

12. The story of the Lake Powell family reunion is found in Victor Watkins, *Diary*, June 19, 1977, in possession of the author.

13. *History of the Church*, 6:338.

14. This narrative of the mantle experience is one of the more well-written accounts. Though a member of a working-class London family, William was one of six scholarship boys at Brewers School and received a classical education. Watkins became the executive secretary of the highly successful Brigham City Cooperative. Lynne Watkins Jorgensen, "The First London Mormons, 1840-45: 'What Am I and My Brethren Here For?'" (master's thesis, Brigham Young University, 1988), 69, 100.

where the mantle of the Prophet fell on Brigham Young . . . and these facts they related many, many times to their children and grandchildren, greatly strengthening and adding to the testimonies of those who listened” (document 76; see also 65).<sup>15</sup> Some descendants of Cynthia Harrington Durphy Bowen have for generations encouraged their children to memorize Cynthia’s account of the event.<sup>16</sup> William Ervin Stoker, who was raised from the age of six by his grandfather William Stoker, stated with pride that his grandfather “knew the Prophet Joseph Smith personally and was present when the Mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham Young, and received a personal testimony.” He would add that he owed much to his grandfather for building up his faith by relating this story to him (document 122).

While the faith of most Church members certainly is not dependent on testimonies of the mantle experience, clearly some members of the Church were strengthened by their faith in the validity of their own or a loved one’s mantle experience. The purpose of this work is to present the written and oral narratives of the people in Nauvoo who firmly believed they had experienced a manifestation and who left their testimonies as a witness.



Detail of Brigham Young from a steel engraving of the First Presidency and Twelve Apostles published by S. W. Richards and M. Cannon, January 1, 1853. Engraving by Frederick Piercy.

---

15. Eliza Billington and John Welch were married in Nauvoo on May 18, 1845.

16. While I was researching this paper, Katherine Adams Peterson, a Cynthia Bowen descendant, learned of my project. She immediately took a table napkin and on it wrote from memory Cynthia’s account. See document 6.



## The August 8 Conference

One session of the August 8, 1844, conference was held in the morning and another in the afternoon. Many historians of the transfiguration, including Leonard J. Arrington and Thomas G. Alexander, have concluded that the mantle event took place on the morning of August 8, 1844, after Rigdon's labored discourse offering to lead the Saints.<sup>17</sup> Others, including D. Michael Quinn, are convinced that "the available evidence also allows the setting to have been the afternoon meeting."<sup>18</sup> Often the actual witnesses do not record an exact date or time but merely call it "the meeting." However, a careful review of many of the available witness stories reveals that a series of at least three distinct manifestations actually occurred, in the same way spiritual experiences recur at successive temple dedications or general conference sessions.<sup>19</sup>

Records indicate that Sidney Rigdon addressed the congregation in the morning session.<sup>20</sup> After Rigdon's speech, Brigham Young suddenly stood up to call for an afternoon session and to make a few remarks. Brigham Young spoke again in the afternoon along with

---

17. Arrington, *Brigham Young*, 455n7, says, "There is some confusion in Latter-day Saint literature about the timing of the 'mantle of the Prophet' episode. Most published accounts have it occurring during the afternoon meeting, but my reading of Brigham Young's own diary, entry made on August 8, and the recollections of others who were there have persuaded me that it must have occurred when Brigham made his brief talk after Rigdon's speech in the morning"; Alexander, *Things in Heaven and Earth*, 371n106.

18. Quinn, *Mormon Hierarchy*, 393n111.

19. At the June 14, 1993, Mormon History Association conference, Ronald Esplin noted that he initially decided that the suggestion of three primary mantle events was almost too convenient as the answer to the various mantle discrepancies. Then the idea that it might have occurred that way seemed to fall into place based on careful research in pioneer diaries.

20. LaJean Purcell Carruth and Robin Scott Jensen, "Sidney Rigdon's Plea to the Saints: Transcription of Thomas Bullock's Shorthand Notes from the August 8, 1844, Morning Meeting," *BYU Studies Quarterly* 53, no. 2 (2015): 121–39; "Nauvoo, Hancock Co., Illinois," Andrew Jensen, ed., *Historical Record* 8, nos. 2–3 (March 1889): 789–91; available on *Internet Archive*, [https://archive.org/stream/historicalrecord08jens\\_0#page/n215/mode/2up](https://archive.org/stream/historicalrecord08jens_0#page/n215/mode/2up).

Parley P. Pratt, Amasa Lyman, and W. W. Phelps,<sup>21</sup> but apparently Sidney Rigdon did not accept the invitation to respond. The conference was of great interest to the membership of the Church, and estimates of the attendance at the meetings range from hundreds to thousands, including men, women, and children of all ages.<sup>22</sup> Whole families attended, all expecting an answer to the succession dilemma.

In the morning session, Sidney Rigdon outlined his claim to be guardian of the Church. Many accounts describe the mantle phenomenon coming at the end of the morning session after Rigdon completed his remarks. As Brigham rose to call for an afternoon session, the witnesses saw or heard Joseph, and some, startled, rose to their feet (see documents 10, 26B, 29, 30, 38A, 38B, 48, 94A, 101, 119, 123). In the afternoon, Brigham Young actively defended the position of the Quorum of the Twelve. This was a more dignified, better organized meeting. Some attenders claim they witnessed the miracle during the second session of the conference, when Brigham delivered his message, stating that many Saints saw or heard Joseph. One of the most precise descriptions of the afternoon event was written by Judge William Hyde. Hyde described the Nauvoo events of 1844 in minute detail, specifically recording that the mantle experience took place in the afternoon. His account conforms closely to the official minute reports of the afternoon.<sup>23</sup>

In the afternoon President Brigham Young came to the stand and addressed the vast multitude of anxious listeners as follows: . . . The Church had had the privilege of coming to Joseph and of receiving, but now he has stepped to the other side of the veil. He loved the Church even unto death, and laid down his life for it. . . .

---

21. William Hyde, "The Private Journal of William Hyde, 1868," holograph, 64–67, Church History Library, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City (document 36).

22. For attendance estimates, see documents 68B, 108, 109. Brigham Young wrote, "The people assembled by thousands." Brigham Young, "Diary, 27 July 1837–1 April 1845," holograph, August 8, 1844, Brigham Young Papers, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE4093039](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE4093039), image 39; for testimonies that mention very young children, see documents 21, 119.

23. See "History, 1838–1856, Volume F-1," 296–304; *History of the Church*, 7:231–43.

President Young again arose and spoke concerning the endowments of the Elders. . . . On this day it was plainly manifest that the mantle of Joseph had rested upon President Young. The voice of the same spirit by which he, Joseph, spake was this day sounded in our ears, so much so that I once, unthoughtedly, raised my head to see if it was not actually Joseph addressing the assembly. (document 36)

In the course of the August 8 conference, a vote was taken, with the majority voting for Brigham Young's position that the Quorum of the Twelve should assume leadership of the Church.

### Other Manifestations

The accounts of still others indicate that they witnessed a transformation not on August 8, but rather on a later date (documents 12, 41, 80).<sup>24</sup> Church historian Leonard J. Arrington verified, "It was not uncommon for people to see Joseph speaking through Brigham many years after 'the mantle had fallen on him.'"<sup>25</sup> An example is the account of the apostle Orson Hyde, who did not arrive in Nauvoo until August 12, 1844. He twice testified publicly to his "mantle" experience, which he shared with his wife, Mary Anne Price Hyde.<sup>26</sup>

---

24. Charles Wesley Hubbard's account (document 96) mentions a date of August 4, 1844, and then goes on to describe the meeting of August 8. This August 4 date is probably an error in memory or in transcription.

25. Arrington, *Brigham Young*, 115. For instance, John D. Lee, who penned a powerful testimony concerning the mantle experience, actually did not arrive in Nauvoo until August 20, 1844, according to his diary. He obviously had his mantle experience "after the fact," as did Orson Hyde, Mary Anne Price Hyde, Anson Call, Jacob Hamblin, Albert Carrington, and others. See also note 19 for Ronald Esplin's comment concerning multiple manifestations.

26. Orson Hyde, in *Journal of Discourses*, 26 vols. (Liverpool: F. D. Richards, 1855–86), 13:178–83 (October 6, 1869), available on "Journal of Discourses," *BYU Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections*, <http://contentdm.lib.byu.edu/cdm/ref/collection/JournalOfDiscourses3/id/4964>. See also Orson Hyde, in *Journal of Discourses*, 19:58 (April 5, 1877). Information and time line concerning Orson Hyde and Mary Anne Price Hyde sent to me by his biographer Myrtle Stevens Hyde. See also Myrtle Stevens Hyde, *Orson Hyde: The Olive Branch of Israel* (Salt Lake City: Agreka Books, 2000), 181–82.

A number of witnesses do not specifically mention seeing or hearing a vision but testify in general terms that “the mantle” or “the spirit of Joseph” rested on Brigham (documents 2, 9, 11, 20, 24, 31, 49, 68A, 68B, 71, 76, 78, 116, 120, 121A, 121B, 122); others simply report that Brigham and/or they were touched by the Spirit (documents 23, 44, 58).<sup>27</sup>

### Traits of the Living Joseph

Of the witnesses to the transformation, a few provided specific details about the traits they recognized as Joseph’s. Homer Duncan not only commented on the voice of Brigham sounding like that of Joseph’s, but also referred to one of Joseph’s mannerisms: “The very gestures of his right hand when he was saying anything very positive reminded me of Joseph. My decision was then made as to who should lead the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints for surely the mantle of Joseph has fallen upon Brigham” (document 17). Mosiah Lyman Hancock commented, “I saw in him the look of Joseph, and the

---

27. Joseph Fielding’s journal entry regarding the conference does not mention a transfiguration but states simply that “I felt doubtful about it [Rigdon’s authority] . . . partly because the Spirit did not bear witness to it.” Fielding continues: “A Meeting was called and Rigdon again addressed us but seemed to have no Liberty or Power after which Elder Brigham Young spoke to [the] People . . . he had much Liberty and the Power of the Spirit in speaking . . . and the Saints soon began to see how things were and that the 12 must now hold the Keys of Power and Authority according to the Revelation which says the 12 are equal with the first Presidency.” Joseph Fielding, “‘They Might Have Known That He Was Not a Fallen Prophet’—The Nauvoo Journal of Joseph Fielding,” Andrew F. Ehat, ed., *BYU Studies* 19, no. 2 (1979): 155, original in Church History Library, typescript in L. Tom Perry Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah.

Lorenzo Hill Hatch was serving a mission in Vermont when he received word of the martyrdom; at the same time, he received a spiritual witness that Brigham should succeed Joseph: “I received the sad news of this awful affair [the martyrdom] in the town of Bristol, Addison County, Vermont. While I yet had the letter in my hand this letter was written by my uncle who claimed that Sidney Rigdon was the man to lead the Church—a voice spoke to me and said, ‘Brigham Young is the successor of Joseph Smith.’” Lorenzo Hill Hatch, *Lorenzo Hill Hatch Journal* (Provo, Utah: Mimeographed by BYU Adult Education and Extension Services, 1958), 282. This collection was originally copied by Ruth Savage Hilton from the original journals.

voice of Joseph; and it seemed to me that he was as tall as Joseph too” (document 27).<sup>28</sup> Benjamin F. Johnson also observed Joseph’s “tall, straight and portly [robust] form.” He then added his famous comments about Joseph’s speech and a missing tooth, remarking that he “heard the real and perfect voice of the Prophet, even to the whistle, as in years past caused by the loss of a tooth said to have been broken out by a mob at Hyrum [Ohio]” (documents 38A, 38B).<sup>29</sup> George Morris also described Joseph’s familiar speech patterns, noting:

In the afternoon Presedent Young arose . . . when I was startled by Earing Josephs Voice—he had a way of Clearing his Throat before he began to speak—by a peculier Effort of His own—like Ah-hem—

I raised my Head sudinly—and the first thing I saw was Joseph—as plain as I ever saw Him in my life. . . . That was Testemony enough to Convince me where the Proper athoraty rested. (document 46)

Did Brigham himself know that something miraculous had happened? His own account, dated August 8, 1844, simply states:

I arose and spocke to the people. my hart was swolen with compo-sion toards them and by the power of the Holy Gost even the spirit of the Prophets I was enabled to comfort the harts of the Saints. in the afternoon a corden to my request the pe<0>ple assembl'd by thousands[.] I lade before them the order of the church and the Power of the Preasthood. after a long and laboras talk of a bout two ours in the open air with the wind blowing, the church was of one hart and one mind[.] they wanted the twelve to lead the church as Br Joseph had dun in his day.<sup>30</sup>

Perhaps Brigham was alluding to the miracle in his reference to “the spirit of the Prophets.” However, records do not indicate that he publicly acknowledged the manifestations at the time they occurred.

---

28. Joseph was well over six feet tall while Brigham was several inches shorter.

29. Although Joseph’s tooth had been repaired before his death, to Benjamin Johnson the whistle was proof that he had heard Joseph’s voice.

30. Young, “Diary,” image 39. This passage is in Brigham Young’s handwriting with his spelling and punctuation. Dean C. Jessee identifies which diary passages are actually written by Brigham Young and which are written by scribes. See Dean C. Jessee, “The Writings of Brigham Young,” *Western Historical Quarterly* 4 (July 1973): 284.

Brigham Young was careful never to claim to take Joseph's place. As early as August 15, 1844, he wrote an epistle to the Saints that stated emphatically, "Let no man presume for a moment that his [Joseph's] place will be filled by another; for, *remember, he stands in his own place* and always will."<sup>31</sup> Later Brigham advised, "The spirit of Joseph which fell upon me is ready to fall upon somebody else when I am removed."<sup>32</sup>

### Testimonies of the Mantle Experience of 1844

It is impossible to verify the number of those in attendance at the conference who saw a physical transformation or heard Joseph's voice. Currently known records establish that 129 people gave written testimonies or say that a transformation or other spiritual manifestation occurred.<sup>33</sup> Of these, sixty-eight people created firsthand documents: personal journals, personal narratives told to a scribe, or first-person testimonies published in Church magazine articles. Testimonies from sixty-one people are secondhand: accounts gleaned from biographies written by family members or from historical compilations.

The mantle testimonies come from people who eventually settled all over the Utah Territory—from northern Utah and Idaho to southern Utah and Arizona—and even in Tahiti. There is no pocket location of people who recorded this experience.

At least the earliest writers had no opportunity to read other detailed written accounts of the mantle experience before recording their own. Some testimonies (documents 3, 16, 27, 32, 42) were written

---

31. "An Epistle of the Twelve," *Times and Seasons* 5 (August 15, 1844): 618, available on "Mormon Publications: 19th and 20th Centuries," *BYU Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections*, <http://contentdm.lib.byu.edu/cdm/ref/collection/NCMP1820-1846/id/10011>; italics in original.

32. Brigham Young, in *Journal of Discourses*, 5:57 (July 19, 1857).

33. The testimonies included in this project were those I was able to document. It is possible to nearly double the number of mantle witnesses from the testimonies already included in this project. Many of the testimonies tell of spouses, parents, children, brothers, sisters, friends, and other individuals accompanying each participant. For example, see document 61. Mary Ann Stearns tells of attending the meeting with her little friend Julia Felshaw. They had to stand on benches to behold the wonderful transformation.

at least fifteen to twenty years before the publication of the most comprehensive, Church-sanctioned mantle testimony—George Q. Cannon’s 1870 essay in the *Juvenile Instructor* (document 13). Prior to the publication of Elder Cannon’s essay, printed references to the “mantle of Joseph” falling on Brigham appeared in the *Millennial Star*<sup>34</sup> and in the *Times and Seasons*.<sup>35</sup> These two Church publications do not mention any visions among members of the congregation but simply focus on the point of ecclesiastical interest—that the mantle had fallen on Brigham Young or, more generally, the Twelve.

In an address given on July 19, 1857, Brigham Young referred to Albert Carrington’s mantle experience, which occurred two months after the August 8 meeting: “He [Carrington] could not tell me from Joseph Smith, when I was speaking in the stand in Nauvoo during the October Conference of 1844. Somebody came along and passed a finger over his eyes and he could not see any one but Joseph speaking, until I got through addressing the congregation” (document 80). This talk was printed ten days later in the *Deseret News*<sup>36</sup> and may have inspired some Saints to write down their memories of the events of August 1844.

As stories about the mantle experience began to circulate in the 1850s, some writers may have responded by offering their own personalized or embellished accounts—such is human nature. However, most of the stories recorded after this point were not identical. It does not seem that the writers were relying on the same source for their versions of the event. In fact, the accounts contradict each other to some extent in their descriptions of the events of the day, suggesting

---

34. See document 9; Thomas Bullock, “Letter from Elder Thomas Bullock to Elder John O. Angus,” *Millennial Star* 14 (July 13, 1852): 299, available on “Mormon Publications: 19th and 20th Centuries,” *BYU Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections*, <http://contentdm.lib.byu.edu/cdm/ref/collection/MStar/id/37609>.

35. “While the prophet lived, we all walked by ‘sight’; he is taken from us and we must now walk by ‘faith.’ After he [Brigham] explained matters so satisfactorily that every saint could see that Elijah’s mantle had truly fallen upon the ‘Twelve.’” “Special Meeting,” *Times and Seasons* 5 (September 2, 1844): 637.

36. Brigham Young, “Remarks,” *Deseret News*, July 29, 1857, 164, available on J. Willard Marriott Library, *Utah Digital Newspapers*, <https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/details?id=2576175&q=1857-07-29>.

that each person wrote his or her account as remembered, not as described by Church leaders years later.

George Romney vigorously defended the veracity of the mantle stories:

I testify to you in all fervor, before God, that the mantle of Joseph Smith fell upon Brigham Young. It was Joseph's voice; absolutely Joseph's voice and manner, as Brigham Young addressed the people and told them who should be their leader. Now this is no fiction; this is true as I stand here after so many years, passing from the year 1844 up to the present time. (document 55A; see also 55B)

### **Testimony of the Succession of the Twelve**

In 1844 the Twelve were beginning to understand their role in the Church. Joseph had carefully instructed them as to their responsibilities and had given them all the keys they would need to continue with the Lord's work,<sup>37</sup> but they did not always understand the significance of what they were taught. Brigham himself suggested that when he heard of Joseph's death he was at first overcome, fearing the keys of the priesthood were gone. Then, he said, "I felt it come like a flash of lightening to my mind, and I said 'the keys of the kingdom are here.'"<sup>38</sup> When he "came to Nauvoo," he knew "by visions of the Spirit" that from the Twelve would come a new First Presidency.<sup>39</sup> Several years passed, however, before all the Twelve agreed. Meanwhile, the support engendered by the events of the August 1844 conference gave him, as President of the Quorum of the Twelve, the authority he needed to guide the Church in the ensuing transitional period.

During the weeks following Joseph's death, the Saints had been obviously concerned about the succession of leadership. For the many who already believed that the Twelve held the keys and the authority to the leadership of the Church, the mantle experience was an additional testimony of the rightful succession of the Twelve; for others it might have been an answer to prayer. The powerful events of August

---

37. See Esplin, "Joseph, Brigham and the Twelve," 301–41.

38. Manuscript Minutes of Brigham Young Sermon, December 25, 1857, Brigham Young Papers.

39. Miscellaneous Minutes, February 12, 1849, Brigham Young Papers.



1844 finalized loyalties for many Nauvoo Saints and resolved the direction of their religious commitment. As Wilford Woodruff recalled, the mantle manifestation was the turning point. In 1872 he reminded Church members, "There was a reason for this [the mantle experience] in the mind of God: it convinced the people" (document 68B). By 1846 most of the Saints who attended the meeting were ready to leave Nauvoo and follow Brigham Young and the Twelve west.

Edward Hunter and Talitha Cheney affirmed in their mantle testimonies that they had no doubt that Brigham Young should lead the Church (documents 82 and 97). Anson Call and William Allred concluded that they were "perfectly satisfied" (documents 12 and 2). Homer Duncan pledged, "My decision was then made" (document 17). Mary Dunn, an eleven-year-old, soberly recalled her father's remarks as the family was returning home from the meeting: "They need not hunt any farther. Brigham Young is the man to lead us" (document 18).

For others, however, the way was not so clear. A few families were split in their loyalties. In the case of Albert and Ada Winchell Clements, the mantle episode led to a divorce. Albert was a missionary called to serve shortly before Joseph's death. On learning of the martyrdom, he started his journey back to Nauvoo. As he traveled home, he encountered his friend Sidney Rigdon. Sidney told him he was hurrying back to Nauvoo to take his place as guardian of the Church. Albert was satisfied with Rigdon's position.

Albert did not arrive home until August 15, 1844, when he learned of the August 8 meeting, which his wife, Ada, had attended. She happily described the mantle event, testifying that Brigham Young had actually looked and sounded like Joseph Smith. Albert inquired about Rigdon. Ada answered that he had spoken, but the Spirit was not with him. Albert still took the side of his friend Sidney Rigdon. Ada vowed she would continue with The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. She and the children left in the exodus to the Rocky Mountains; Albert stayed behind (documents 85A and 85B).<sup>40</sup>

---

40. Some years later, Albert sent a letter with an elder asking his wife for a divorce, which she granted. Both partners remarried. After the death of both mates, Albert rejoined the Church, traveled to Utah, and he and Ada went with their son to the Endowment House, where they were remarried and sealed.

Though Albert refused to accept Ada's testimony, other individuals bolstered their commitment to the Twelve through the witness of a close family member who had attended the August 1844 meeting. Sarah Studevant Leavitt accepted her husband's testimony without question:

My husband, Jeremiah, was attending a meeting where this question was being discussed. Brigham Young was speaking when suddenly he seemed to be clothed with all the authority of Joseph Smith. Jeremiah said that he had the same appearance, the same voice, as the Prophet. If he had not known that Joseph Smith was dead, he would have thought that Brigham Young was Joseph Smith. Tears dampened many cheeks. Joy and gladness filled many hearts. The Lord had not forgotten his people. . . . After that there was no one to doubt that Brigham Young was to be our new leader and Prophet. If Brigham had any doubts, my husband Jeremiah did not. (document 104)

Aurelia Spencer Rogers acknowledged that the testimony of her sister Ellen Spencer Clawson was what "strengthened my faith in the truth of Mormonism." Aurelia wrote:

[Ellen] was at a meeting of the Saints. . . . At this meeting, Brigham Young, who was President of the Quorum of Apostles, arose to speak, when "The Mantle of Joseph" fell upon him, and he was like one transformed; his countenance, voice and form were like those of the late Prophet. Many in the congregation, even children saw this miracle; it satisfied the people and decided the question who was to be the leader. (document 84)

George Armstrong Hicks struggled throughout his life with his own testimony, but he was adamant concerning the reality of his father's testimony concerning the mantle experience. He wrote in his journal:

I have heard my father [George Barton Hicks] say that he was present at the time when it is said that the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham Young. I believe [his testimony], I believe the spirit of Joseph took possession of the body of Brigham and spoke to the people through him. Brigham was the man to take the lead. (document 95)

---

"The Lonely Trail," in *Our Pioneer Heritage*, comp. Kate B. Carter, 20 vols. (Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1958-77), 3:111-12.

Even a twentieth-century prophet of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints responded with gratitude for the mantle testimony of his mother, Rachel Ridgeway Ivins Grant (document 37A). In a letter to a friend, Heber J. Grant acknowledged, “I am grateful that my mother was present and had the same testimony which she often gave in public” (document 37B).

### **Evidence of Contemporaneous Discussion of the Experience**

In Nauvoo throughout the temple building period, people seem to have talked and written about the mantle experience and about Brigham Young’s resemblance to Joseph Smith.<sup>41</sup> These very tentative discussions are a testimony for many scholars that the mantle experience was not orchestrated either as a public relations ploy or as a psychological phenomenon. The mantle references came forth slowly, almost reluctantly, as many participants were unwilling to publicly discuss spiritual events. Historian D. Michael Quinn writes this about the immediate response:

There *were* contemporary references to Young’s “transfiguration.” The *Times and Seasons* reported that just before the sustaining vote at the afternoon session of the August meeting, “every Saint could see that Elijah’s mantle had truly fallen upon the “Twelve.” Although the church newspaper did not refer to Young specifically for this “mantle” experience, on 15 November 1844 Henry and Catharine Brooke wrote from Nauvoo that Young “favours Br Joseph, both in person, manner of speaking more than any person ever you saw, looks like another.” Five days later Arza Hinckley referred to “Brigham Young on [w]hom the mantle of the prophet Joseph has fallen.”<sup>42</sup>

Sometime after the August 8, 1844, meeting, Howard Egan wrote a letter to Jesse C. Little in the East that also attested to a transfiguration. On December 8, 1844, Brother Little quoted Egan’s words in a letter to Brigham Young stating, “I rec<sup>d</sup> a Letter from Bro Egan at the time of the Conference he said ‘if a man had been blinded he would

---

41. See Carol Cornwall Madsen, *In Their Own Words: Women and the Story of Nauvoo* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1994), 168, 185, 204, 235, 242, 255–56.

42. Quinn, *Mormon Hierarchy*, 166; first italics added.

hardly have known if it were not Joseph.” This account is one of the earliest acknowledgments of a transfiguration.<sup>43</sup>

Ezra T. Benson, who was present at the August 8 meeting, later recorded in his autobiography that “many said, when they heard Brigham talk, that it was not Brigham’s voice, but the voice of Joseph.” Benson made no claim to having seen the transfiguration himself but evidently heard others discussing their experience, which he seems to have accepted without question.<sup>44</sup>

The diary of William Burton, a missionary who returned to Nauvoo in spring 1845, may refer to residents talking about the mantle experience. In May 1845, he recorded events in his diary that had occurred during his absence from Nauvoo:

[That which] had taken place during the time that I was out on my mission;-that greivous and hard to be borne. This was the Martyrdom of the Prophet and Seer, and Patriarch, whose voices I could not hear, declaring the truths of Heaven. But their [Joseph’s and Hyrum’s] places were filled by others much better than I once was supposed they could have been. The spirit of Joseph appeared to rest upon Brigham. (document 11)

Burton’s use of the past tense—“the spirit of Joseph appeared to rest upon Brigham”—in the context of his discussion of events that had transpired in his absence is significant. If Burton was referring by these words to the mantle experience, he must have heard of the event from others who had been at the meetings. If this was the case, at that early date at least some Nauvoo residents were discussing the incident.

In a February 1845 letter, Wilford Woodruff shared the mantle news with fellow Saints in the British Isles by assuring them that

on the second day after our arrival August 8th, 1844, we met in a special conference, all the quorums, authorities, and members of the Church that could assemble in Nauvoo. [We] were addressed by elder Brigham Young, the president of the quorum of the twelve. It

---

43. Jesse C. Little to Brigham Young, December 8, 1844, filed December 30, 1844, Brigham Young Papers (document 19), available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE3946022](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE3946022), image 9.

44. John Henry Evans and Minnie Egan Anderson, *Ezra T. Benson: Pioneer—Statesman—Saint* (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Press, 1947), 88–89.

was evident to the Saints that the mantle of Joseph had fallen upon him, the road that he pointed out could be seen so plainly. (document 68A)

## Recording the Experience

The spiritual witness received at the August conference was of such magnitude that believers were willing—even eager—to follow Brigham Young and the Twelve.<sup>45</sup> However, scholars continue to search for a witness account written on the same day as the mantle experience.<sup>46</sup>

---

45. Brent L. Top and Lawrence R. Flake, “‘The Kingdom of God Will Roll On’: Succession in the Presidency,” *Ensign* 26 (August 1996): 25.

46. A few Nauvoo Saints who kept daily records, personal or official, made entries on August 8, recording the results or proceedings of the meeting without mentioning a mantle experience at that time (see document 33). Wilford Woodruff, concerned with keeping an official record, made careful notes on the comments made by the speakers during the conference but makes no mention of a specific spiritual manifestation at the meeting. See Wilford Woodruff, *Wilford Woodruff’s Journal, 1833–1898, Typescript*, ed. Scott G. Kenney, 9 vols. (Midvale, Utah: Signature Books, 1983–84), 2:434–40. In their personal journals, William Clayton and Heber C. Kimball both briefly mention only the results of the vote taken at the meeting. See George D. Smith, *An Intimate Chronicle: The Journals of William Clayton* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1991), 142; and Heber C. Kimball, *Journal*, Church History Library.

Willard Richards’s journal has a two-and-one-half page entry for August 7, a very brief entry for August 8 followed by a blank page, then another long entry for August 9. See Willard Richards, *Journal* (volume 10), 1844 March–August, *Willard Richards Journals and Papers, 1821–54*, Church History Library, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE581801](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE581801), images 80–87. The entry marked August 8 is made up of a few short lines that simply state that Rigdon spoke in the morning and that the Twelve were voted by the Church to stand as the First Presidency. Then Richards writes, “See Times and Seasons.” The first reference to the August 8 meeting in the *Times and Seasons* is in the issue dated September 2, 1844 (see note 44), indicating that Richards probably made the entry after August 8. Richards, *Journal*, image 83.

Thomas Bullock’s personal journal has no entries for August 8, 1844. However, he did attend the meeting and kept minutes. His notes for the afternoon meeting make no mention of a mantle experience. His minutes of the morning meeting, taken in his particular shorthand, are notes taken during Sidney’s and Brigham’s speeches, with no additional comments of any kind. Thomas Bullock, *Minutes*, Thomas Bullock Collection, Church History Library. See the appendix to this article (pp. 505–7), Bullock’s minutes of Brigham Young’s comments in

If the experience was so “intense and life-changing”<sup>47</sup> for followers of the Prophet Joseph, why were none of the accounts that record the miracle written on the day of the manifestation or shortly thereafter? It is a question that unfortunately cannot be answered definitively.

A partial explanation may be that life was chaotic and dangerous for Nauvoo citizens in 1844 and 1845. The citizens were stunned by events, and some did not have the luxury of good health, time, money, or even access to writing materials.<sup>48</sup> After the death of Joseph and the acceptance of the leadership of Brigham and the Twelve, the Saints’ primary goals were to feed their families and to finish the Nauvoo Temple as quickly as possible<sup>49</sup>—a charge repeatedly given by Joseph Smith and then amplified by Brigham Young.<sup>50</sup> In fact, Judge William Hyde recorded that Brigham Young spoke in the afternoon session of the August 8 meeting concerning the need to finish the Nauvoo Temple (document 36).

The urgency expressed by Young motivated the Nauvoo Saints to complete as much of the temple in the next eighteen months “as had been accomplished in the previous three years.”<sup>51</sup> He organized the brethren into work crews and continued to commit the sisters to contribute a penny a week for glass and nails. Furthermore, Brigham “put the missionary work in order, studied Joseph Smith’s plan for

---

the morning meeting; and Carruth and Jensen, “Sidney Rigdon’s Plea to the Saints,” 133–39.

47. Carol C. Madsen comments, “Some human experiences are so intense and life-changing that memory returns not only the event in its fullness, but also the emotions that surround it.” Madsen, *In Their Own Words*, 158.

48. For a discussion concerning the lack of paper in Nauvoo in 1844, see George W. Givens, *In Old Nauvoo: Everyday Life in the City of Joseph* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1990), 266. On November 13, 1844, the *Nauvoo Neighbor* announced a lack of paper caused by the “bad state of navigation, &c.”

49. After giving his testimony of the mantle falling on Brigham Young, Edmund Ellsworth explained that President Young told them that the temple must be built. He added, “We went to work as one in poverty.” Edmund Ellsworth, *Autobiography* [c. 1892], holograph, 4–5, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE6996683](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE6996683), image 7.

50. Esplin, “Joseph, Brigham and the Twelve,” 330. The Saints did complete enough of the temple to enable many to receive their endowments before the exodus in 1846.

51. Arrington and Bitton, *Mormon Experience*, 85.

an expansion of gathering places, and vigorously pushed industrial development and construction.” Numerous new frame and brick homes as well as the Seventies Hall were erected in the next year.<sup>52</sup>

Additionally, the Nauvoo Saints were threatened by mobs and other lawless citizens, and the stresses that led to the murders of Joseph and Hyrum immediately reappeared, leading to the abandonment of Nauvoo in 1846. Grief and depression followed the martyrdom, and recurring diseases such as malaria and cholera were both endemic and virulent in this river town even during the best of times, which deterred record keeping.

Some diarists who had been keeping fairly regular diaries stopped writing around the time of the martyrdom and did not resume until later. For example, Thomas Bullock’s personal journal shows a gap from June 15 until October 8, 1844; Charles Coulson Rich made no entries from June 28, 1844, to January 1, 1845; and Eliza Roxcy Snow ceased writing in April 1844 and did not resume until February 1846.<sup>53</sup> Abraham O. Smoot stopped writing in his journal about the time he returned to Nauvoo (July 28, 1844) and picked up his narrative again on November 3, 1844.<sup>54</sup> Emmeline B. Wells, an important diarist of the Nauvoo period, did not begin her “Nauvoo Diary” until 1845.<sup>55</sup>

Bloody flux, summer sickness, typhoid, and tuberculosis are all named in the records of the city after Joseph’s death, in addition to the normal childhood diseases of the nineteenth century that were often fatal.<sup>56</sup> Thirteen-year-old George Washington Bean summed up the years following the Prophet’s death as being filled with hardships such

---

52. Allen and Leonard, *Story of the Latter-day Saints*, 202.

53. Davis Bitton, *Guide to Mormon Diaries and Autobiographies* (Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University Press, 1977), 47, 289, 331–32.

54. Abraham Owen Smoot, “Abraham Owen Smoot Journal, 1844–1845,” Abraham Owen Smoot Papers, Perry Special Collections.

55. Emmeline B. Harris Wells, “My Testimony,” in Preston Nibley, comp., *Faith Promoting Stories* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1943), 139; Madsen, *In Their Own Words*, 43–49. Madsen explains that Emmeline was sixteen, had just lost a baby, and had been deserted by her husband, James Harris, when she began to write her daily account. The early diary is typical of a heartbroken sixteen-year-old. She did not write of current events that surrounded her. She wrote of her adolescent pains and lost romance. Emmeline wrote about “the mantle” in her later years when she finally became aware of the significance of this event. See documents 94A and 94B.

56. Givens, *In Old Nauvoo*, 112–30.

as “scurvy and blackleg.” He was forced to grow up fast: “During this season I managed most of the family business as most of the folks were ill.”<sup>57</sup> Caroline Barnes Crosby verified that “persecution continued all around us. The brethren were obliged to be on guard all the time. The sickly season soon commenced. I was sick several weeks.”<sup>58</sup> One of the brethren on guard was Appleton Milo Harmon, who wrote:

They arose in mob and broke open the jail and killed Joseph and Hyrum and severely wounded Elder John Taylor, on the 27th day of June, 1844. During this time I was serving as policeman on almost constant duty night and day and in so doing exposed myself to wet and cold and soon after was taken sick with chills and fever and for three months was very sick, in fact the sickest I ever was in my life. My recovery was but slowly.<sup>59</sup>

Emily Smith Hoyt explained that she was often sick two or three months at a time and that her life was despaired of by her friends. Her husband was in even worse health.<sup>60</sup> In such an atmosphere, journal keeping was simply not a priority for people who were trying to survive and still accomplish the Lord’s work. In his journal, Joseph Grafton Hovey recorded:

The people said let the Lord God of Israel choose. Then the Twelve did explain the subject and made it as clear as the noon day sun of their power and authority given them by Joseph, have not time and space to write all the particulars. For I do work hard on the Temple of the Lord cutting and sawing stone and I do get so fatigued when I leave my labors that I have not much courage to write my life.<sup>61</sup>

---

57. George Washington Bean, *George Washington Bean and His Family Records*, comp. Flora Diana Bean Horne (Salt Lake City: Utah Printing, 1945), 23, 31.

58. Caroline Barnes Crosby, “Memoirs Begun at Tubuai, Society Islands, 1851,” holograph, unpagged, Church History Library.

59. Appleton Milo Harmon, “Appleton Milo Harmon’s Early History and Journal for His Travels through the United States, England, and Scotland in 1850, 1851, and 1852,” available on “Trails of Hope: Overland Diaries and Letters, 1846–1869,” *BYU Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections*, <http://contentdm.lib.byu.edu/cdm/ref/collection/Diaries/id/7646>.

60. Emily Smith Hoyt, *Reminiscences and Diaries, 1851–93*, microfilm of holograph, 19–20, MS 13346, Church History Library.

61. Joseph Grafton Hovey, “Biography of Joseph Grafton Hovey, Copied and Arranged from His Journal by His Grand Son, M. R. Hovey of Logan, Utah,” typescript, MSS SC 215, Perry Special Collections. Hovey’s use of the phrase “as



Additionally, most of the ordinary folk did not keep records. Diary entries, if kept at all, were generally logs or daybooks. Most members, even those few who kept journals, were very circumspect and may have been uncomfortable with writing about sacred spiritual and emotional events, as many are today.<sup>62</sup> One early Saint recorded her feelings about a vision she had experienced years before:

When a true spirit makes known anything to you, in the day time, we call it a vision. If it is a true spirit it will never leave you, every particular will be as plain fifty years hence as now. I said to myself then, my snakes [vision] I saw in Kentucky, when I thought I could almost see Zion, was a true vision, though I did not know what to call it and seldom ever spoke of it, for I thought it was given to me for my own benefit.<sup>63</sup>

Others may have not fully appreciated the pivotal importance of the meetings of that day and of the mantle experience until later in their lives. Because of the very personal nature of a spiritual experience, some Saints may have been reluctant to record their impressions. In a letter to Elder George S. Gibbs, Benjamin F. Johnson explains:

So deeply was I impressed with what I saw and heard in the transfiguration, that for years I dared not tell what was given me of the Lord to see. But when in later years I did publicly bear this testimony, I found that others had testified to having seen and heard the same. But to what proportion of the congregation that were present, I could

---

clear as the noon day sun,” sometimes associated with a visionary experience (Joseph Smith—History 1:16; D&C 110:3; Acts 9:3), may or may not have any special significance.

62. As a case in point, while teaching family history classes for the BYU Salt Lake Center, I asked my students how many of them had personally experienced a spiritual manifestation or knew of a spiritual experience of someone close to them. Nearly every hand went up. I then asked how many had written these experiences down. Nearly every hand went down. Only one or two of the students had actually kept a journal account. When I asked why they had not recorded the experience, they answered that they were uncomfortable writing about sacred events.

63. Martha Pane Jones Thomas, Autobiography, in *Daniel Stillwell Thomas Family History* (Salt Lake City: Kate Woodhouse Kirkham, 1927), 30–31, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE6694551](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE6694551).

never know. But I do know that this, my testimony is true. (document 38A)

By the time they recorded their experiences, the Church's progression under President Young's leadership and the accounts of others who had attended the meeting had helped to validate their experience and testifying to its reality had become an honorable activity.

### Early Written Accounts—Two Women's Testimonies

It is not always possible to determine when each account was first recited or written. Two of the earliest known accounts of the mantle experience were recorded by Caroline Barnes Crosby and Emily Smith Hoyt, two formidable pioneer women who zealously recognized their mantle experience as an opportunity for them to place on record one of the few episodes where they were an equal witness to a miraculous vision. Crosby and Hoyt recorded their mantle testimonies when they finally found the essential element they needed—a solid block of time. At the end of 1850, after six hectic and life-threatening years, Caroline and Emily both found the time and solitude to begin journals of their experiences. Each woman felt that the mantle story was important enough to include at the beginning of her history.

Caroline Barnes Crosby was one of the first women to be called as a missionary for the Church, assigned to serve with her husband, Jonathan Crosby.<sup>64</sup> In 1846 the indefatigable Caroline left Nauvoo. In 1848 she helped lead her family from Council Bluffs, Iowa, to the Salt Lake Valley.<sup>65</sup> Then in spring 1850, Jonathan and Caroline, along with Addison Pratt and Louisa Barnes Pratt (Caroline's sister), accepted a mission assignment to the Society Islands, a group of islands in the west part of French Polynesia. During fall 1850, Jonathan and Addison conducted business elsewhere, leaving Caroline and Louisa alone on the island of Tubuai Manu.<sup>66</sup> There, Caroline could finally settle

---

64. Carol Cornwall Madsen, "Mormon Missionary Wives in Nineteenth-Century Polynesia," *Journal of Mormon History* 13 (1986–87): 61.

65. Crosby, "Memoirs."

66. Crosby, "Memoirs."

down long enough to write her memoirs, including her account of the mantle experience. An educated witness, Caroline wrote:

Sidney Rigdon came to the stand and tried to show to the people that he was the rightful successor of Joseph. And his arguments were so powerful that many were almost persuaded to believe him such. But as soon as the twelve apostles with bro Brigham Young at their head took the stand it was shown conclusively where the power rested. It was the first time that I ever thought he [Brigham] resembled bro Joseph. But almost every one exclaimed that the mantle of Joseph had fallen on Brigham. For one I never had any doubts afterwards. (document 16)

Like Caroline, Emily Smith Hoyt, who arrived in the Utah Territory on October 30, 1851, wrote of her experience.<sup>67</sup> Emily was the Prophet's first cousin, the daughter of Joseph Smith's Uncle Asael, who had served briefly as Patriarch to the Church.<sup>68</sup> She found time to write her memoirs just before she left her home in Iowa to travel to the Utah Territory.<sup>69</sup>

In 1840, Emily and her husband, Samuel Pierce Hoyt, had purchased property just over the river from Nauvoo in Nashville (now Galland, Lee County, Iowa); erected a cabin; and then built a very substantial home with ten bedrooms and five fireplaces. Emily described her home as being just "four miles from a certain point in Nauvoo. . . . Eventually we could see the [Nauvoo] temple by standing in my front door."<sup>70</sup>

She and her family had supported Joseph Smith from the first moment they read the Book of Mormon in 1834. After learning of the murders of Emily's two cousins, the Hoyts traveled across the river to Nauvoo. Emily recalled, "We returned from that melancholy scene

---

67. Hoyt, *Reminiscences and Diaries*, 67.

68. Andrew Jenson, *Latter-day Saint Biographical Encyclopedia: A Compilation of Biographical Sketches of Prominent Men and Women in The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints*, 4 vols. (Salt Lake City: Andrew Jenson History, 1901–36), 1:182, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/lattersaintbi01bjens#page/182/mode/2up>.

69. Hoyt, *Reminiscences and Diaries*, 19–20.

70. Hoyt, *Reminiscences and Diaries*, 19.

The last one arose. It was the then President of the Twelve Brigham Young. He spoke to the people altogether in a different style from any of those who had preceded him. A cloud of witnesses arose after B. Y. had sat down and testified to the truth of what he had said. President B. Y. arose from his seat the second time and addressed the audience. I had been well acquainted with Joseph the latter part of his life. We had been at his home many times and Joseph, Hiram and families felt at home with us. From a place of retreat before the M<sup>h</sup>, mob sent to S. P. for money to aid him in escaping for a time from the grasp of his ungodly pursuers S. P. sent the money and they had the power in their own hands to go any place they might choose. They consulted and deliberated. Emma Joseph's wife wanted her husband and his brother Hiram to give themselves up, called them cowards etc. Joseph said if it would save the people he was willing to be sacrificed. After every thing was ready for them to get away, Joseph said he would go and give himself up to the State authorities. The Governor was pledged to protect them. Joseph said he felt that it might be, like a lamb going to the slaughter. The result of his counsel is well known. They returned and were murdered. And the latter day Saints apparently left without a leader. But the God of Heaven who had said it was his business to provide for his saints, sent President B. Young home just in time, and clothed him not with the mantle of Elijah, but the spirit and power which had rested on Joseph. I was an eye, and ear, witness. The manner of reasoning, the expression of the countenance, the sound of the voice thrilled my whole soul. My own eyes had beheld Joseph's murdered body. My own hands had felt death's icy coldness on his once noble forehead. I knew that Joseph was dead. And yet I often startled and involuntarily looked at the stand to see if it was not Joseph. It was not, it was Brigham Young and if any one doubts the right of Brigham to manage affairs for the Saints, all he has to say to them is this. Get the spirit of God and know for yourselves. The Lord will provide for his own. Thus the word of the Lord ever failed. Br. Young will not live forever clothed with mortality. But He who rules in heaven and on earth will control all things by the counsel of his own will. Saints will live

Page from the Emily Smith Hoyt journal (document 32). In 1851, Emily recorded her experience at the August 8, 1844, meeting. "S. P." refers to her husband. Courtesy Johnathan A. Dibble.

heart sick and sorrowful cast down but not in despair.”<sup>71</sup> She continued, “We were summoned over the river again and went to hear what was wanted.”<sup>72</sup> Thus Samuel and Emily were in Nauvoo for the meeting in the bowery on August 8, 1844, where they witnessed Brigham’s transformation. For five long years, starting in 1846, Emily’s home served as a way station for LDS refugees, a place where Saints could receive aid and nursing care before they followed the Twelve west.<sup>73</sup>

By 1851, Emily was determined to let the whole world know of her unflagging testimony concerning her cousin. Knowing that the Smith family was split in their loyalties to Brigham Young, Emily began her record with her mantle testimony and justified her choices in following the Saints west. Emphasizing that she and Joseph were about the same age and that Joseph had spent much time in her home, she explained that on August 8, 1844,

President B. Y. [Brigham Young] arose from his seat . . . and addressed the audience. I had been well acquainted with Joseph the latter part of his life. We had been at his home many times and Joseph, Hiram and families felt at home with us. . . . But the God of Heaven who had said it was his business to provide for his saints, sent President B. Young home just in time, and clothed him not with “the mantle of Elijah,” but the spirit and power which had rested on Joseph. I was an eye, and ear, witness. The manner of reasoning, the expression of the countenance, the sound of the voice thrilled my whole soul. . . . I knew that Joseph was dead. And yet I often startled and involuntarily looked at the stand to see if it was not Joseph. It was not, it was Brigham Young and if any one doubts the right of Brigham to manage affairs for the Saints, all I have to say to them is this. Get the spirit of God and know for yourselves. The Lord will provide for his own. (document 32; underlining in original)

Emily Smith Hoyt was an educated woman, a graduate of a teachers’ academy. She had family ties to Joseph Smith and knew him well. She was certainly also acquainted with Brigham Young. It seems hard to imagine that she could have been duped by a “bit of theatrical mimicry.”

---

71. Hoyt, *Reminiscences and Diaries*, 20.

72. Hoyt, *Reminiscences and Diaries*, 20.

73. Hoyt, *Reminiscences and Diaries*, 20–21.

## **“The Prophet Is Not Dead!”—Children’s Testimonies**

Adults were not the only witnesses of the mantle event. A number of those present at the meeting were children. William Van Orden Carbine was only nine years old in 1844, but he was well acquainted with the Prophet Joseph. He remembered sitting in the meeting with his mother, Adelia Rider Carbine, and saying, “The Prophet [is] not dead, for I [see] him on the stand.” William’s experience became a favorite story of his mother, who retold it many times (document 79A; see also 79B).

James Madison Fisher, an eleven-year-old who had often played ball with the Prophet Joseph, also remembered the unexpected vision of his friend, “Rigdon spoke first it did not have the wright ring to it when he sat down brother Brigham got up, the mantle of Joseph fell upon him, he was the picture of the Prophet [Joseph] and he had the Prophet’s voice it was a great surprise for the people, the saints was shown who was to be their leader” (document 22).

One of the children, eight-year-old Mary Field, specifically identified what she was doing at the time of the event. She recalled:

Mother [Mary Harding Field] had the baby on her knee, who was playing with a tin cup. He dropped it, attracting our attention to the floor. Mother stooped over to pick it up, when we were startled by hearing the voice of Joseph. Looking up quickly we saw the form of the Prophet Joseph standing before us. Brother Brigham looked and talked so much like Joseph that for a minute we thought it was Joseph. (document 21)

## **The Mantle Testimonies Are Finally Published**

Emily Smith Hoyt and Caroline Barnes Crosby wrote their memoirs a few years after the event, long before the first detailed accounts of the mantle experience were published. It was not until the 1870s that a mantle account relating in detail the miraculous vision of Joseph was finally published and made generally accessible to the members of the Church.<sup>74</sup>

---

74. As already noted, the only “official” mantle references that had been previously published were Brigham Young’s reference in 1857 to Albert Carrington’s

Orson Hyde's remembrance of his mantle experience was delivered publicly in Salt Lake City on October 6, 1869, and published in the *Deseret News Semi-weekly* on November 16, 1869 (document 35A).<sup>75</sup> But it was George Q. Cannon's testimony that the congregation "both saw and heard [Joseph] with their natural eyes and ears," published in the *Juvenile Instructor* in 1870 (document 13), that became the major source for transfiguration accounts by Mormon historians such as B. H. Roberts in *A Comprehensive History of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints*.<sup>76</sup> On April 8, 1872, Wilford Woodruff publicly bore his testimony concerning the mantle experience. This testimony was published in the *Deseret News Weekly* on May 22, 1872 (document 68B). Cannon's and Woodruff's published testimonies were followed by other testimonies that were recorded in histories written by Edward W. Tullidge and Orson F. Whitney.<sup>77</sup> A mantle statement from William C. Staines was published in the *Contributor* in June 1891, ten years after his death (document 60).

In 1905, the young women of the Church were also presented with the deeply personal testimonies of three redoubtable Mormon women who remembered August 8, 1844, as a day that changed their lives. Maria Wealthy Wilcox, Jane Snyder Richards, and Rachel Ridgeway

---

experience and the statements in the *Times and Seasons* and the *Millennial Star*.

75. In this 1869 discourse, Orson Hyde speaks as if he had been present at the August 8 conference in Nauvoo. He mentions Rigdon's speech to the congregation as well as Brigham Young's. However, Wilford Woodruff's diary places Orson's arrival in Nauvoo on August 13.

76. B. H. Roberts, *A Comprehensive History of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Century One*, 6 vols. (Provo, Utah: Corporation of the President, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1965), 2:418; *History of the Church*, 7:236n. George Q. Cannon's account has become a widely quoted source for the mantle stories in major histories of the Nauvoo period. It is still accepted as a faithful version and reappears in contemporary Latter-day Saint historical and educational materials. Elder Cannon's account was quoted most recently in the *Ensign*, along with Benjamin F. Johnson to Elder George S. Gibbs, 1903. See Top and Flake, "Kingdom of God Will Roll On," 25.

77. Edward W. Tullidge, *Life of Brigham Young; or, Utah and Her Founders* (New York: n.p., 1877); Orson F. Whitney, *History of Utah* (Salt Lake City: Cannon and Sons, 1892-1904).



Grant each wrote about their memories of Joseph the Prophet for the *Young Woman's Journal* (documents 37A, 54B, 67).

Like Wilcox, Richards, and Grant, many witnesses did not write about their experience until late in their lives. Perhaps the published accounts validated their own experience; perhaps they were pressured by their children to write the story they had told over the years. As death approached, they may have felt the need to leave their written testimonies for posterity, or they may have wanted to leave a document that would silence any doubters. Several of the accounts became grand, almost poetic proclamations of belief, as though the writers felt that the formal rhetoric would lend weight to their testimonies.

### Mantle Testimonies into the Twentieth Century

Mantle testimonies recorded after 1900 begin to read very much alike, probably because the participants had read the published accounts. However, significant and unique renderings were still to come. On July 2, 1902, the first known legal document concerning the mantle event made its appearance in a statement that John Welch swore before the county clerk in Logan, Cache County, Utah (document 65). Less than a year later, Robert Crookston wrote an affidavit affirming his witness of the mantle event (document 15). In 1916, Eliza Ann Haven Westover recorded her testimony in a letter to her son (document 29). The last documented and formally witnessed testimony of the mantle experience by a living participant appeared in 1925 by Jacob Jones (document 40).

Bishop George Romney twice testified publicly seventy-five years after Joseph's death. Romney was only thirteen when he witnessed the mantle event. At age eighty-eight, he delivered his testimony in the Ensign Ward in Salt Lake City on June 22, 1919. The message was so powerful that a listener immediately recorded his words for posterity:

I shall never forget in this world or in the world to come the scene as Brigham Young arose. . . . When Brigham got up the mantle of Joseph Smith fell upon him. It was Joseph's voice; it was Joseph's appearance, and I testify to you, if I never again do so on this earth,



in the presence of God and angels, that this is verily the truth. This is true—that the mantle of Joseph did fall upon Brigham Young and the people knew it. (document 55B)

With equal power, Bishop Romney also bore his testimony before the Swedish Saints in Salt Lake City on December 17, 1919. It was published for the missionaries of the Church in the *Liahona, the Elders' Journal* on April 13, 1920 (document 55A).

## Conclusion

At least ninety-five people have declared, through their own or others' records, that Brigham Young took on the appearance, voice, and/or mannerisms of the Prophet Joseph Smith. When we include the records that state without further explanation that "the mantle fell on Brigham," we can increase the number of these testimonies. These records are impressive evidence that must be weighed carefully. The introduction to the legal text *Eyewitness Testimony: Civil and Criminal* explains the value of eyewitness testimony: "Lawyers can neither afford to exclude eyewitness testimony legally nor ignore it. Sometimes it is the only evidence available, and *it is often correct*."<sup>78</sup>

In his book *In Search of Stones*, psychiatrist M. Scott Peck states, "One of the tests of proof, of reality, is termed 'consensual validation,' . . . [that is,] whenever two or more very different people make exactly the same extraordinary assessment of a phenomenon, then . . . it needs to be taken seriously."<sup>79</sup>

To those who accept with little question the visions and spiritual experiences of the Prophet Joseph Smith and his associates, it is also plausible that a large body of Saints could witness a miraculous manifestation. At meetings of the School of the Prophets and gatherings at the time of the Kirtland Temple dedication, numbers of Saints

---

78. Elizabeth F. Loftus and James M. Doyle, *Eyewitness Testimony: Civil and Criminal*, 2d ed. (Charlottesville, Va.: Michie Company Law Publishers, 1992), 8; italics added.

79. M. Scott Peck, "Holiness," in *In Search of Stones: A Pilgrimage of Faith, Reason, and Discovery* (New York: Hyperion, 1995), 75.

experienced group manifestations.<sup>80</sup> Nancy Alexander Tracy reported that during the dedication of the Kirtland Temple in 1836, many witnessed the appearance of heavenly beings.<sup>81</sup> As with the mantle experience, not all the Saints present reported having seen these visions,<sup>82</sup> nor did everyone who was reported by others to have seen a vision actually record the experience themselves. Those to whom visions have been opened may well report seeing different things, as was the case with the personal descriptions of a manifestation shared in Hawaii by a group of Saints that included David O. McKay.<sup>83</sup>

In spite of the silence of some in regard to the events of August 8, the time lapse between the event and the written expression of others, and differences in detail or similarities in wording of the written accounts, the simple fact remains that many Saints who attended that conference in the grove behind the Nauvoo Temple testified that they saw, heard, and/or felt a manifestation that helped determine or confirm the direction for the rest of their lives and sustain a willingness to sacrifice everything.

---

80. Milton V. Backman Jr., *The Heavens Resound: A History of the Latter-day Saints in Ohio, 1830–1838* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1983), 264–68, 284–309. See also Karl Ricks Anderson, *Joseph Smith's Kirtland: Eyewitness Accounts* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1989), 169–91.

81. Backman, *Heavens Resound*, 300; see generally Steven C. Harper, “‘A Pentecost and Endowment Indeed’: Six Eyewitness Accounts of the Kirtland Temple Experience,” herein.

82. Ezra T. Benson makes no claim to having had a mantle vision personally but mentions and apparently accepts the experience of others (see note 48). A number of Saints, whose reminiscent accounts have been located, were careful to record that they were at the meeting on August 8 but make no specific reference to a transfiguration. See the following accounts: (1) Lucy Diantha Morley Allen, “Joseph Smith, the Prophet,” *Young Woman's Journal* 17 (December 1906): 537, available on “Mormon Publications: 19th and 20th Centuries,” *BYU Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections*, <http://contentdm.lib.byu.edu/cdm/ref/collection/YWJ/id/12922> (2) Gilbert Belnap, Autobiography, typescript, 37, Perry Special Collections; and (3) David E. Fullmer, “A Brief Sketch of the Life of David E. Fullmer and His Father Peter Fullmer,” holograph, 40, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE2388664](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE2388664), image 17.

83. Lavina Fielding Anderson, “Prayer under a Pepper Tree: Sixteen Accounts of a Spiritual Manifestation,” *BYU Studies* 33, no. 1 (1993): 73–74.

In the afternoon session of the August 8 conference, Sidney Rigdon chose W. W. Phelps to speak for him. Phelps was an inadvisable choice, because he spoke supporting Brigham Young.<sup>84</sup> Phelps was obviously affected by the spirit of that session. Long before he died in 1878, Phelps penned in verse and music his witness of the mantle experience:

Up, up! ye royal priesthood holders,—  
Joseph's robe's on Brigham's shoulders,—  
Clear the way; clear the way; clear the way,—  
Israel reigns.<sup>85</sup>

*Lynne Watkins Jorgensen is an Accredited Genealogist and has an M.A. in family and community history from BYU. She recently retired as a Consultant in the U.S./Canada Reference Department of the Family History Library of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. She concurrently taught family history and genealogy classes for Brigham Young University.*

*I, the author, acknowledge the assistance of the BYU Studies staff, who double-checked all sources. I would like to thank Barbara Bennett Roach, whose husband and father both served as directors of the Family History Library. Her father, Archibald Bennett, collected family names of ancestors who were at the mantle meeting, and she forwarded several additional names to me that I had not found. Thanks also to Myrtle Stevens Hyde, who forwarded a detailed timeline and information concerning Mary Anne and Orson Hyde. Thanks also to my husband, Dr. Leland H. Jorgensen, for his wise counsel and encouragement. I would also like to acknowledge the help of others who, when learning of this research project, informed me about mantle accounts in their family records. Without such help I might not have located all those*

---

84. See "History, 1838–1856, Volume F-1," 300–304; *History of the Church*, 7:237–38; Quinn, *Mormon Hierarchy*, 165; and Van Wagoner, "Making of a Mormon Myth," 12.

85. W. W. Phelps to Brigham Young, January 1, 1862, holograph, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE3976324](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE3976324), image 28.

*accounts. Testimonies appearing in this project were those I was able to document. Many descendants suggested ancestor names for this project, but my research discovered their testimonies were part of an oral family tradition and not formally recorded. I am grateful for all suggestions. Any readers aware of documented testimonies of the mantle experience that are not included in this collection are invited to contact BYU Studies by email at [byu\\_studies@byu.edu](mailto:byu_studies@byu.edu).*

*An earlier version of this article appeared in BYU Studies 36, no. 4 (1996–97): 125–204.*

## Documents of Testimonies of the Mantle Experience

The following are the known testimonies of persons who left a record of their mantle experience. They are segregated into firsthand accounts and secondhand accounts. Firsthand accounts were written in the person's own hand or dictated by them to a scribe; secondhand accounts are reported by another person. Women are listed by the surname they had in August 1844. This list gives each person's name, birth and death dates, age in August 1844, and testimony, as well as sources and comments. Any underlining that appears is reproduced from original documents. Angle brackets < > indicate above-the-line insertions. Editorial comments are given in brackets [ ].

### Firsthand Accounts

#### 1. WILLIAM ADAMS

*January 8, 1822–September 30, 1901, age 22*

There was a great multitude attending the meeting, more than one half the crowd could not find seats, and stood on their feet. Never were so many at one meeting that I ever saw. I was sitting down and could not see the speakers on the stand. I was listening very attentively, so that I could hear every word.

I heard a voice speaking, I was surprised, and jumping to my feet, expecting Joseph the Prophet was speaking, having heard him often in public and private, so that I was quite acquainted with his voice. This was a strong testimony that the Twelve Apostles were the rightful leaders of the church and that the mouth of Joseph had fallen on Brigham Young.<sup>1</sup>

---

1. William Adams, "Autobiography of William Adams, 1822–1894," typescript, 14, MSS SC 3089, L. Tom Perry Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library,

## 2. WILLIAM MOORE ALLRED

*December 24, 1819–January 8, 1901, age 24*

Sidney Rigdon one of Joseph's counselors had moved to Pittsburg, and when he heard of Joseph's death he came to Nauvoo claiming his right to lead the Church. At least he said the Church was 14 years old and had the right to choose a guardian, but Brigham Young, the President of the twelve Apostles and others of the twelve (that had been on a mission) just got home as the meeting was called for Rigdon to preach. And after he got through Brigham got up and spoke with such power that it convinced nearly all that were present that the Mantle of Joseph had fallen on him. I was perfectly satisfied.<sup>2</sup>

## 3. BENJAMIN ASHBY

*December 19, 1828–November 19, 1907, age 15*

Soon the twelve Began to return, also Sidney Rigdon who endeavored to have himself elected as guardian of the Church and I was present when he made his silly and boastful speech about leading the Church back to Pittsburg and twerling the nose of Queen Victoria &c &c too foolish to be worth remembering I did not know Rigdon when he was in the Spirit of his Calling and cannot say what manner of Man he was. but when I knew him he had lost the favor of God and he was as dry as sticks in his preaching[.]

I was in the congregation when the Question of the succession to the leadership of the Church was before the people and I solemnly assert and testify that the last time I saw the Features. the Gestures and heard the sound of the voice of Joseph Smith: was when the form, voice, and countenance of Brigham Young was transfigured before the congregation so that he appeared like Joseph Smith in every particular. Thus the Lord showed the people that the Mantle of Joseph had been bestowed upon Brigham.<sup>3</sup>

---

Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah; for a transcription, see William Adams, "Autobiography 1894," typescript, 14, Church History Library, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City; "William Adams, 1822–1894," *Book of Abraham Project*, <http://www.boap.org/LDS/Early-Saints/WAdams.html>.

2. William Moore Allred, "Reminiscences and Diary, 1883," holograph, 11, Church History Library; for a transcription, see "Biography and Journal of William Moore Allred," *Allred Family Organization*, [http://www.allredfamily.com/history\\_detail.htm](http://www.allredfamily.com/history_detail.htm).

3. Benjamin Ashby, "Autobiography of Benjamin Ashby, 1828–1907," microfilm of holograph, unpagged, Family History Library, The Church of Jesus

## 4. LEWIS BARNEY

*September 8, 1808–November 5, 1894, age 35*

The next day President Brigham Young arived in Nauvoo with some of the other apostles from a Mission to the Eastern States And Called a meeting and invited Sidney Rigdon to the Stand and in the presance of the assembled thousands of the Saints Said to Sidney Now if you have any thing to say you have the apertunity and you can take the stand[.] But Sidney declined and kept his seat. President young then arose and took the stand his face and Countenance having the apearanc[e] of Joseph his voice and words were the familiar voice and Words of our martered prophet so much so the Who[l]e Congregation was fully satisfied that the mantle of the Prophet Joseph had fallen on him and some of the saints realy Believed it was in reality the Prophet himself[.] Well do I remember the feelings that possesed my Breast at that time I knew it was Brigham Young and being familiar with the Countinance voice and the maner of the Speech of the Prophet Joseph Smith I also knew the mantle of the prophet had fallen on Brigham and it was marvelous and a mericle wrought by the Power of God in the Sight and hearing of the Whole multitude that they might never doubt that Brigham was the Chosen leader of the Church.<sup>4</sup>

## 5. EUNICE BILLINGS

*January 3, 1830–November 25, 1914, age 14*

There were so many opinions as who would be the leader of the Saints at that time. Sidney Rigdon was sure he was the man. He stood up and declared that he was the one, but he was called down and Brigham Young stood up and spoke with the power and voice of Joseph. He surely had the

---

Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City; Robert L. Ashby, ed., *Ashby Ancestry: Something of the Origin of the Name and Family* (Salt Lake City: Stringham Ashby Steven, 1941), 14; see also Armis J. Ashby, *The Robert L. Ashby and Hannah Cropper Family Book of Their Descendants and Ancestors* (Salt Lake City: Ashby-Cropper Family Organization, 1991), 16, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE4784099](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE4784099).

4. Lewis Barney, *Reminiscences* [1888], holograph, 15–16, microfilm, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE9719603](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE9719603).

Prophet Joseph's mantle on. There seemed to be no doubt of Brigham Young being the one to lead the saints at that time.<sup>5</sup>

## 6. CYNTHIA HARRINGTON DURPHY/DURFEY BOWEN

*November 30, 1811–November 1883, age 32*

While at the prayer meeting that was called after hearing Sydney Rigdon speak an event that gave me great strength took place. Brigham Young stood before us & as I listened to him, his countenance changed & I saw the prophet Joseph Smith & heard his voice speaking as well & I knew who was to be the next prophet of the Lord & who was to lead the Saints.<sup>6</sup>

## CATHARINE BROOKE

*[no available dates]*

See Henry Brooke.

## 7. HENRY BROOKE

*[no available dates]*

The loss of Br. Joseph and Hyrum has been greatly felt but we have the twelve apostles to preside in their stead. Br. Brigham Young is president of the twelve and stands as prophet, seer, and revelator to the Church. He is an excellent man, and favours Br. Joseph, both in person, and manner of speaking, more than any person ever you saw looks like another.<sup>7</sup>

---

5. "Eunice Billings Warner Snow Tells Her Own Story" [sent to Archibald Bennett], ed. Marva Peck Hale, transcript copy, Family History Library; "Writings of Eunice Billings Snow," 1910, ed. Marva Peck Hale.

6. Information presented personally to the author by a descendant, Katherine Adams Peterson, August 1996.

7. Henry and Catharine Brooke to Leonard Pickell, November 15, 1844, Yale University, copy at Church History Library, MS 8829, quoted in Glen M. Leonard, *Nauvoo: A Place of Peace, a People of Promise* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 2002), 438. This handwritten note includes the signatures of both Henry and Catharine.



## 8. HENRY SCHULER BUCKWALTER

*May 12, 1831–November 6, 1908, age 13*

Was at the meeting when Sid[n]ey Rigdon tried to lay claim to the presidency of the Church And President Brigham Young told him different and his voice and looks was precisely like that of the Prophet Joseph.<sup>8</sup>

## 9. THOMAS BULLOCK

*December 23, 1816–February 10, 1885, age 27*

They [Joseph and Hyrum] were two good men when living, and they died good men; they died martyrs for the truth, and they sealed their testimony with their blood; and their testimony is true. . . .

The mantle of Joseph fell on Brigham Young, the blood of the martyrs became as seed on the earth.<sup>9</sup>

## 10. ROBERT TAYLOR BURTON

*October 25, 1821–November 11, 1907, age 22*

This morning, at the Presiding Bishop's Office, after reading what purported to be an appeal to the Latter-day Saints by Frederick J. Smith in regard to the successor of the Prophet Joseph Smith Jr., I had occasion, in conversation with Bishop O. P. Miller to refer to my experience in Nauvoo, Illinois some time after the martyrdom of Joseph and Hyrum Smith, and upon his request, I made the following statement:

This to my mind was one of the most critical periods in the history of the Church. A number of persons claimed the legal succession, and to have this authority, among them Sidney Rigdon, James J. Strang, Aaron and Moses Smith and others. The occasion that I now refer to was a general meeting of the Latter-day Saints, soon after the return to Nauvoo of President Brigham Young and other members of the Quorum of Twelve Apostles, from their

---

8. Henry Schuler Buckwalter, "Biographical Sketch of Henry Schuler Buckwalter," *Miscellaneous Mormon Diaries*, 11:3, typescript, MSS SC 1739, Perry Special Collections.

9. Thomas Bullock to John O. Angus, December 18, 1851, printed in *Millennial Star* 14 (July 3, 1852): 299, available on "Mormon Publications: 19th and 20th Centuries," *BYU Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections*, <http://contentdm.lib.byu.edu/cdm/ref/collection/MStar/id/37609>.

missions. The meeting had been called to order, and after the usual opening exercises President Brigham Young arose to address the assembly.

At that time I was not acquainted with President Young, but his voice, manner, expression, and in fact, his personal appearance was so strikingly that of the martyred Prophet, that I rose from my seat, as did hundreds of others, to look at the Prophet Joseph Smith Jr. The likeness was so marked that I could hardly make myself believe that the Prophet had not himself returned; not that there was a resemblance between the two men. I am not going to say why this was other than I received it, as an evidence to the people that God had chose Brigham Young as successor to the Prophet Joseph Smith Jr. There were dozens, even hundreds of others, who were impressed just the same as I was at that time, and I have heard many, many who are now gone make similar statements or expressions to that I am here making.  
(signed) R. T. Burton<sup>10</sup>

## 11. WILLIAM BURTON

*October 3, 1809–March 17, 1851, age 34*

We arrived in Nauvoo [in] May [1845]. . . . [There] was one change more that had taken place during the time that I was out on my mission, that greivious and hard to be borne, this was the Martyrdom of the Prophet and & Seer & Patriarch, whose voices I could <not> hear, declaring the truths of heaven. But their [Joseph's and Hyrum's] places were filled by others much better than I <once> was supposed they could have been, the spirit of Joseph appeared to rest upon Brigham. . . . Great and mysterious are the ways of God.<sup>11</sup>

---

10. Robert Taylor Burton, "Statement Concerning the Transfiguration," July 28, 1905, typescript, MS 3040, Church History Library; see also Janet Burton Seegmiller, "Be Kind to the Poor: The Life Story of Robert Taylor Burton" (n.p.: Robert Taylor Burton Family Organization, 1988), 49, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE2091211](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE2091211).

11. William Burton, Journal, May 1845 [under entry of April 26, 1845], Perry Special Collections; "William Burton Diaries, 1839–1851," May 1845, 2–8, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE3836219](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE3836219), images 5–6; see also Eugene England, *Brother Brigham* (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1980), 75; and D. Michael Quinn, "The Mormon Succession Crisis of 1844," *BYU Studies* 16, no. 2 (1976): 212. This is one of the earliest surviving contemporary accounts, written ten months after the event. Burton was not in Nauvoo in 1844; he was on a mission.

## 12. ANSON CALL

*May 13, 1810–August 31, 1890, age 34*

That week Brigham Young and others of the 12 came to the city. On the Sunday following, Brigham and a portion of the Twelve presented themselves in our congregation. He said he had not come to electioneer nor set up any particular claim, but to do his duty and it was for the people to judge between truth and error. Before he [Brigham] had spoken many sentences, I discovered that it was the voice of Joseph and had I have been where my eyes could not have beheld him I should have believed that Joseph had been speaking. It was Joseph's voice and Joseph's gestures through the entire discourse. I became perfectly satisfied that it was the voice for me to follow in connection with the majority of the brethren.<sup>12</sup>

## 13. GEORGE Q. CANNON

*January 11, 1827–April 12, 1901, age 17*

It was the first sound of his voice [Brigham's] which the people had heard since he had gone east on his mission, and the effect upon them was most wonderful. Who that was present on that occasion can ever forget the impression it made upon them! If Joseph had risen from the dead and again spoken in their hearing, the effect could not have been more startling than it was to many present at that meeting. It was the voice of Joseph himself; and not only was it the voice of Joseph which was heard; but it seemed in the eyes of the people as though it was the very person of Joseph which stood before them. A more wonderful and miraculous event than was wrought that day in the presence of that congregation we never heard of. The Lord gave His people a testimony that left no room for doubt as to who was the man He had chosen to lead them. They both saw and heard with their natural eyes and ears, and then the words which were uttered came, accompanied by the convincing power of God, to their hearts, and they were filled with the Spirit

---

12. Anson Call, "The Life and Record of Anson Call: Commenced in 1839," holograph, 30, Church History Library. In a note at the end of Call's journal in the Church History Library, T. Edgar Lyon identifies Mary Flint Call as Anson's scribe. Anson Call, "The Journal of Anson Call" (n.p.: Ethan L. Call and Christine Shatter Call, 1986), 31–32. This journal began in 1839 and was dictated to or recopied by "various individuals, presumably his wives." Call, "Journal of Anson Call," publisher's note.

and with great joy. There had been gloom, and, in some hearts probably, doubt and uncertainty; but now it was plain to all that here was the man upon whom the Lord had bestowed the necessary authority to act in their midst in Joseph's stead.<sup>13</sup>

#### 14. ELIAS COX

*January 15, 1835–May 8, 1917, age 9*

I heard Brother Brigham speak and that is the first time that I ever saw two men look and sound so much alike in all my life. And after he had sat down, I wondered where Joseph had gone.<sup>14</sup>

#### 15. ROBERT CROOKSTON

*September 21, 1821–September 25, 1917, age 22*

I attended the funeral of the Prophet Joseph and his brother Hyrum Smith. I was also present at the meeting held in the grove at Nauvoo August 8, 1844, when Sidney Rigdon made the claim that it was his right to assume the leadership and presidency of the church. I saw Brigham Young stand up and speak to the people, and he spoke with the voice of Joseph Smith. I further testify that I was well acquainted with the Prophet Joseph Smith and heard him speak many times. Among the many sermons I heard him preach was at the funeral of King Follett. I also heard him deliver his last adieu to the Nauvoo Legion. As to Brigham Young, I know of a surety that he spoke with the voice of Joseph Smith, and I was convinced then and never doubted

---

13. [George Q. Cannon], "Joseph Smith, the Prophet," *Juvenile Instructor* 5 (October 29, 1870): 174–75, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/juvenileinstruct522geor#page/174/mode/2up>; see also Edward W. Tullidge, *Life of Brigham Young; or, Utah and Her Founders* (New York: n.p., 1877), 115; B. H. Roberts, *A Comprehensive History of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Century One*, 6 vols. (Provo, Utah: Corporation of the President, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1965), 2:418; and Leonard Arrington, *Brigham Young: American Moses* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1985), 115.

14. Elias Cox, "Joseph Smith, the Prophet," *Young Woman's Journal* 17 (December 1906): 544, available on "Mormon Publications: 19th and 20th Centuries," *BYU Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections*, <http://contentdm.lib.byu.edu/cdm/ref/collection/YWJ/id/12922>.

during all the intervening years that passed that Brigham Young was chosen and ordained of God to lead the church.<sup>15</sup>

## 16. CAROLINE BARNES CROSBY

*January 5, 1807–February 16, 1884, age 37*

Sidney Rigdon came to the stand and tried to show to the people that he was the rightful successor of Joseph. And his arguments were so powerful that many were almost persuaded to believe him such. But as soon as the twelve apostles with bro Brigham Young at their head took the stand it was shown conclusively where the power rested. It was the first time that I ever thought he [Brigham] resembled bro Joseph. But almost every one exclaimed that the mantle of Joseph had fallen on Brigham. For one I never had any doubts afterwards.

We all soon became comforted concerning our leaders, but persecution continued all around us. The brethren were obliged to be on guard all the time.<sup>16</sup>

## 17. HOMER DUNCAN

*January 19, 1815–March 23, 1906, age 29*

I must make mention on one [more] manifestation of the Lord's goodness to me. At the special meeting held at Nauvoo after the Prophet Joseph Smith's death at the time that the mantle of the Prophet of the Lord fell upon Brigham Young. I sat listening to someone speaking with my head down, my face in the palms of my hands and my elbows on my knees. While in

---

15. Robert Crookston, "Affidavit, February 3, 1903," copies in the possession of Gloria Hansen, a great-granddaughter of Robert Crookston, and at Church History Library, MS 14786. The affidavit was written and sealed by Robert Crookston and witnessed by Lydia Owen and H. J. Mathews at Logan City, Cache County, Utah.

16. Caroline Barnes Crosby, "Memoirs Begun at Tubuai, Society Islands, 1851," holograph, unpagged, Church History Library; Caroline Barnes Crosby, "The Papers of Jonathan and Caroline Crosby," unpagged, microfilm, films 1185 and 1186, Family History Library. For a transcript, see Edward Leo Lyman, Susan Ward Payne, and S. George Ellsworth, eds., *No Place to Call Home: The 1807–1857 Life Writings of Caroline Barnes Crosby, Chronicler of Outlying Mormon Communities* (Logan: Utah State University Press, 2005), 63. The journal of Caroline Barnes Crosby began in 1851 in the Society Islands while the Crosbys were on a mission.

this position, Brigham Young came to the stand and commenced to speak with the voice of Joseph the Prophet. Being so well acquainted with the Prophet's voice, I nearly sprang from my seat through astonishment, but I sat and heard the Prophet's [Joseph's] voice as long as Brigham Young was speaking. Not only did the voice of Brigham [sound] like that of Joseph, but the very gestures of his right hand when he was saying anything very positive reminded me of Joseph. My decision was then made as to who should lead the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints for surely the mantle of Joseph has fallen upon Brigham.<sup>17</sup>

## 18. MARY DUNN

*November 2, 1833–November 7, ?, age 11*

I well remember when the bodies of the martyrs were brought home and placed in the Mansion House and thousands came to view their remains. We wondered what would become of the Church and who would lead it. It seemed that everything was at a standstill but you all know the story of how the mantle of Joseph fell on Brigham Young. I was at the meeting. Father said on our way home, "They need not hunt any farther. Brigham Young is the man to lead us."<sup>18</sup>

## 19. HOWARD EGAN

*June 15, 1815–March 18, 1878, age 29*

Jesse C. Little quoted Howard Egan's words in his letter to Brigham Young dated December 8, 1844: "I rec[eive]d a Letter from Bro Egan at the time of the Conference he said if a man had been blinded he would hardly have known if it were not Joseph."<sup>19</sup>

---

17. Homer Duncan, Autobiographical Sketch, holograph, 22–23, MS 3068, Church History Library; transcription available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE7695035](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE7695035), image 7.

18. Effie Ensign Merrill, essay for the Sea Gull Camp of the Daughters of Utah Pioneers, September 12, 1941, copy in possession of the author. This family history was shared with the author by Colonel Amos Wright.

19. Jesse C. Little to Brigham Young, December 8, 1844, Brigham Young Papers, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE3946022](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE3946022), image 9, quoted in Leonard, *Nauvoo*, 438.

## 20. EDMUND ELLSWORTH

*July 1, 1819–December 29, 1893, age 25*

The Prophet concluded to run for the President of the United States. I was called to go to the State of New York on a lectioneering mission to which place I immediately started where I labored untill the death of the Prophet. when I received a letter a letter [*sic*] from President Young calling the Elders home, I was present at the meeting which tried President Sydney Rigdon where I plainly saw the Mantle of Priesthood fall upon President Young with its power and Spirit. The testimony of this was given to most of the congregation.<sup>20</sup>

## 21. MARY FIELD

*February 1, 1836–July 20, 1943, age 8*

After Joseph Smith's death there was some confusion as to who should be our leader. Sidney Rigdon claimed to have had a vision that he should be our head, but I, with my mother, was present at the meeting in the bowery when the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham Young while he was talking with the people. Mother had the baby on her knee, who was playing with a tin cup. He dropped it, attracting our attention to the floor. Mother stooped over to pick it up, when we startled by hearing the voice of Joseph. Looking up quickly we saw the form of the Prophet Joseph standing before us. Brother Brigham looked and talked so much like Joseph that for a minute we thought it was Joseph. There was no doubt in the hearts of the Saints from that moment on who was to be their inspired leader.

After Brigham Young was sustained as our prophet and leader, the Church was again restored to order under his guiding hand. The Saints were anxious to complete the Nauvoo Temple, as they had been commanded by the Prophet Joseph before his death. By hard work and determination the Saints completed the temple and large numbers received their endowments there.<sup>21</sup>

---

20. Edmund Ellsworth, Autobiography [c. 1892], holograph, 4–5, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE6996683](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE6996683), images 6–7.

21. Mary Field Garner, Autobiographical Sketch, typescript, 6–7, MS 5026, Church History Library; Mary Field Garner, “Biography as-told-to Harold H. Jensen and Mary’s Granddaughter Annie Garner Barton,” typescript, 6–7, Perry Special Collections, copy in possession of the author.

## 22. JAMES MADISON FISHER

*July 22, 1833–January 1, 1907, age 11*

The twelve apostles were all away from home, before they got back Sydney Rigdon wanted to call a meeting and have the people choose him for their leader the people said no wait untill the twelve comes home. Brigham Young was the first to arrive after they all come home there was a meeting called to choose a leader it was held in a grove where they held meetings in the summer time. I was there, Rigdon spoke first it did not have the right ring to it when he sat down brother Brigham got up, the mantle of Joseph fell upon him, he was the picture of the Prophet [Joseph] and he had the Prophet's voice it was a great surprise for the people, the saints was shown who was to be their leader, Rigdon left the Church went to Penn. and started a Church of his own which soon flatened out.<sup>22</sup>

## MARY FIELD GARNER

See Mary Field.

## 23. JACOB GATES

*March 9, 1811–April 14, 1892, age 33*

After the Death of Joseph & Hyrum the Excitement Seemed [gradually?] to die away. Meantime Sidney Rigdon who once was a Counsellor to Joseph arrived & attempted to usurp authority over the Church as the Successor of Joseph but the Church was saved by the timely arrival of the Twelve & the Spirit of God which always teaches right & the result was that Rigdon was cut off from the Church for his miss conduct & went to Pittsburg followed by a few who were as himself whose Mouth was full of Cursing & bitterness the Power of the Priesthood rested down upon the Twelve backed up by the Spirit of God which enabled them to give that instruction which [seemed?] to unite the hearts of the Saints together as the heart of one Man they moved forward to build the Temple.<sup>23</sup>

---

22. Typescript of journal of James Madison Fisher [1906], in Lucy Elizabeth Fisher Brown, comp., "History and Genealogy of Jesse, Joseph, and James Madison Fisher and Evaline McLean," typescript, 5–6, microfilm 215595, Family History Library.

23. Jacob Gates, Journals, 1836–61, vol. 2, holograph, unpagged, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE9208242](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE9208242), images 49–50.



## 24. JAMES HARVEY GLINES

*April 19, 1822–August 31, 1905, age 22*

I arrived in time to hear Sidney Rigdon's last lectures before the Church. President Brigham Young and others of the twelve apostles now arrived and appointed a meeting in the grove at the stand east of the temple block. . . .

Sidney Rigdon stopped speaking. President Brigham Young stood up and commenced speaking, and all eyes were turned upon him for he seemed to have the voice of the prophet Joseph, as many testified at the time, for he spoke with great power and authority to the convincing of the Saints that the mantle had fallen from Joseph to Brigham.<sup>24</sup>

## RACHEL RIDGEWAY IVINS GRANT

See Rachel Ridgeway Ivins.

## MARY CLOUGH/CLUFF GREENHALGH

*March 18, 1814–December 16, 1851, age 30*

See William Greenhalgh.

## 25. WILLIAM GREENHALGH

*July 29, 1811–April 3, 1882, age 33*

In a few days Sidney Rigdon came up to Nauvoo to see if the people would accept him as a guardian to act for Joseph. He told the people if they did not accept him, God would reject them as a people with their dead. He was to return to Pittsburg and God would raise up a people at Pittsburg for him. With uplifted hands he called on God and angels to bear him witness. He spoke next day to them and (to) see if the people would accept him.

Just at this time came home Brigham Young and Heber C. Kimball. The morning following Brigham Young ordered the people to bring a wagon to the south side of the congregation that the people could all hear what he had to say. Brigham rose and said. "I would to God, there was not such a hurried

---

24. James Harvey Glines, "Reminiscences and Diary, March 1845–December 1899," holograph, 41, MS 1685, Church History Library; transcription available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE206891](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE206891), page 5.

spirit here". He spoke with such power and the voice of Joseph sounded through him so plain that the people who could not see him, knew that it was the voice of Joseph speaking through Brigham Young. My wife Mary sitting close by me not able to turn her head asked me if that was Joseph. I told her no, but it was the voice of Joseph speaking through Brigham Young. This was a living testimony that the mantle had fallen from Joseph on to Brigham—and from this time many wanted to well off and part from the Saints—But Brigham forbid them and told them that the flock must not be scattered.<sup>25</sup>

## 26A AND 26B. JACOB HAMBLIN

*April 2, 1819–August 31, 1886, age 25*

Come the 24th when I arived at Nauvoo I saw thare was a gertherin [gathering] of the Saints at the Stand as I drew nere I saw Mr Sidney Rigdon (a)ddressing the Congregation I listened a few minits and Said in my hart it that was not the vois of the trew Sepherd.<sup>26</sup>

At Nauvoo I found Sidney Rigdon busy among the Saints, trying to establish his claim to the presidency of the Church. He was first Counselor to the Prophet Joseph at the time of the latter's death. The Church was fourteen years old, and he claimed that it was its privilege and duty to appoint a guardian; and he wished the people to sanction his guardianship.

I was much dissatisfied with the course he was taking, and, as I could not sustain him, I felt to leave Nauvoo for a season. I went into the country, where I had left my wife and two children with my sister Melissa. . . .

On the 8th of August, 1844, I attended a general meeting of the Saints. Elder Rigdon was there, urging his claims to the presidency of the Church. His voice did not sound like the voice of the true shepherd. When he was

---

25. William Greenhalgh, "The History of William Greenhalgh: As Written by Himself," typescript, 1–2, Family History Library, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE6217831](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE6217831); copy in possession of the author. This typescript was written in the 1870s based on earlier diary accounts. This copy was given to the author and to the Family History Library by William's great-grandson Glade Greenhalgh. The holographic original is owned by Jean Bluth of Colorado Springs, Colorado.

26. Jacob Hamblin, Journal, typescript, 8, MS 1951, microfilm, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE4922731](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE4922731), image 12.

about to call a vote of the congregation to sustain him as President of the Church, Elders Brigham Young, Parley P. Pratt and Heber C. Kimball stepped into the stand.

Brigham Young remarked to the congregation: “I will manage this voting for Elder Rigdon. He does not preside here. This child” (meaning himself) “will manage this flock for a season.” The voice and the gestures of the man were those of the Prophet Joseph.

The people, with few exceptions, visibly saw that the mantle of the prophet Joseph had fallen upon Brigham Young. To some it seemed as though Joseph again stood before them.

I arose to my feet and said to a man sitting by me, “That is the voice of the true shepherd—the chief of the Apostles.”<sup>27</sup>

## 27. MOSIAH LYMAN HANCOCK

*April 9, 1834–January 14, 1907, age 10*

Altho only a boy, I saw the mantle of the Prophet Joseph rest on Brigham Young; and he arose lion-like to the occasion, and lead the people forth. . . .

I remember Sidney Rigdon in his great desire to become Guardian of the Church. But I had seen the Prophet [Joseph] proclaim these words before the people, “I have carried Sidney Rigdon long enough—I now throw him from my shoulders. If my brother Hyrum wishes to pick him up and carry him, he may—I carry him no longer.”

I saw Brother Brigham Young, of the Quorum of the Twelve, arise before the people—and I saw in him the look of Joseph, and the voice of Joseph; and it seemed to me that he was as tall as Joseph too. I knew that the mantle of Joseph had fallen on Brigham. I had heard the Prophet say from the frame that he threw the furtherence of this Church and Kingdom upon the shoulders of the Twelve; that they should bear and send this Gospel to every nation under heaven.<sup>28</sup>

---

27. James A. Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience, as a Frontiersman, Missionary to the Indians and Explorer* (Salt Lake City: Juvenile Instructor Office, 1881), 19–20, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/jacobhamblinnarr00littrich#page/18/mode/2up>. Little writes in the preface that Jacob Hamblin “was induced to narrate, for Brother James A. Little’s pen to record, the incidents herein published.” See also Pearson H. Corbett, *Jacob Hamblin, the Peacemaker* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1952), 21–22.

28. Mosiah Lyman Hancock, “Autobiography of Mosiah Lyman Hancock,” 1834–65, holograph, unpagged, Church History Library; Mosiah Lyman Hancock, “Mosiah Lyman Hancock,” 23, 30, microfilm, Family History Library; Mosiah

## 28. JOHN NELSON HARPER

*March 9, 1813–March 31, 1863, age 31*

When the Twelve returned home the Saints was troubled to know who should lead the church; Sidney Rigdon was there from Pittsburg and wanted to choose a guardian for the church, but when Bro Brigham arose on the stand I received a testimony for myself, he appeared to me as if it was Bro Joseph and it was Joseph's voice and there the mantle of Joseph Fell on Brigham. He [Brigham] said it was no enviable place to stand at the head of the people for at them the arrows of the enemy would be directed. But he was willing to stand where God placed him.<sup>29</sup>

## 29. ELIZA ANN HAVEN

*May 15, 1829–January 20, 1923, age 15*

I was then 15 year[s] and I felt so sad I was to meeting when Sidney [or Sidny] Rigdon declared himself our true Prophet and leader very [or vey] few responded to the call, am happy to say none of my Fathers family f[el]t [page torn] th[at] [page torn] he was soon after Prest. Young came home from the east where he was on a mission I was to meeting when he said he was our Prophet & seer when he spoke it was Br Josephs voice I gave a jump of[f] my seat and said our Prophen [Prophet] Joseph has come to life we have our Prophet back I looked up and there stood Br. Joseph just as plain as I ever saw him when alive [page break] 3 for a minute I heard Br Joseph voice and saw his features then a mist seemed to pass from Brigham face and go up then there stood Br Brigham talking to us. hundreds seen the same that I did but not all that were present.<sup>30</sup>

---

Lyman Hancock, "The Life Story of Mosiah Lyman Hancock," typescript, 16, 20, Perry Special Collections, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE2071530](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE2071530).

29. John Nelson Harper, Autobiography [c. 1861], typescript, 10, typed by Jewel B. Furniss, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE5004789](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE5004789). The title page states, "This Book was copied from the old original that was written by John Harper."

30. Eliza Ann Haven Westover to Lew [Haven], July 2, 1916, MS 4284, Church History Library, copy in possession of Douglas M. Chabries, published in Janet Burton Seegmiller, *Life Story of Robert Taylor Burton* (n.p.: Robert Taylor Burton Family Organization, 1988), 50. She wrote a similar account to another son two years later relating the same information; see Eliza Westover, "Letter to Son

## 30. DRUSILLA DORRIS HENDRICKS

*February 8, 1810–May 20, 1881, age 34*

It was not long before Sidney Rigdon called a meeting in order to present his claims to the presidency of the Church. Some of the Twelve had returned from their missions and the day the meeting was held and while it was in session, Brigham Young (President of the quorum of the Twelve Apostles) and others slipped up to the stand and said nothing until Sidney Rigdon was through, he was standing near the center of the audience in a wagon. As the meeting was in the Boury [Bowery]. Then Pres. Brigham Young began to speak. I jumped up to look and see if it was not Brother Joseph for surely it was his voice and gestures. Every Latter Day Saint could easily see upon whom the priesthood descended for Brigham Young held the keys. Sidney Rigdon led off a few, but where are they now. They have dwindled away in unbelief and have come to naught.<sup>31</sup>

## 31. ARZA ERASTUS HINCKLEY

*August 15, 1827–February 18, 1901, age 16*

The entry after 20 November 1844 in the diary of Arza Hinckley at Brigham Young University states: “. . . and Brigham Young on hom the mantle of the prophet Joseph has falen is a men of god and he ceeps all things in good order.”<sup>32</sup>

---

Written 1918,” 4, MS 11956, Church History Library. See also Ora Haven Barlow, *The Israel Barlow Story and Mormon Mores* (Salt Lake City: By the author, 1968), 205, 697, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE519438](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE519438).

31. Drusilla Dorris Hendricks, “Historical Sketch of James Hendricks and Drusilla Dorris Hendricks,” typescript, unpagged, microfilm 119, Family History Library, dictated by Drusilla after the death of her husband in 1870; Drusilla Dorris Hendricks, “Historical Sketch of James Hendricks and Drusilla Dorris Hendricks,” typescript, 18, microfilm, Church History Library; Marguerite H. Allen, comp., *Henry Hendricks Genealogy* (n.p.: Hendricks Family Organization, 1963), 26; Drusilla D. Hendricks, *Reminiscences*, on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE1954207](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE1954207), image 21. See also Carol Cornwall Madsen, *In Their Own Words: Women and the Story of Nauvoo* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1994), 168.

32. Arza E. Hinckley, *Diary*, MSS SC 783, Perry Special Collections, quoted in Quinn, “Mormon Succession Crisis,” 212n69.

## 32. EMILY SMITH HOYT

*September 1, 1806–August 6, 1893, age 37*

[After the martyrdom] we [Emily and Samuel] were summoned over the river again and went to hear what was wanted. Brigham Young then President of the twelve had returned home. The people were convened in the Old Bowry where Joseph had last spoken to the people. Sydney Rigdon made a speech and claimed to have authority to lead the Church others had similar claims. None appeared reasonable to me. The last one arose. It was the then, President of the twelve Brigham Young. He spoke to the people altogether in a different style from any of those, who had preceeded him. A crowd of witnesses arose after B. Y. had sat down and testified to the truth of what he had said. President B. Y. arose from his seat the second time and addressed the audience. I had been well acquainted with Joseph the latter part of his life. We had been at his home many times and Joseph, Hiram and families felt at home with us. [Emily writes of events leading to martyrdom of Joseph and Hyrum.] . . . But the God of Heaven who had said it was his business to provide for his saints, sent President B. Young home just in time, and clothed him not with “the mantle of Elijah,” but the spirit and power which had rested on Joseph. I was an eye, and ear, witness. The manner of reasoning, the expression of the countenance, the sound of the voice thrilled my whole soul. My own eyes had beheld Joseph’s murdered body. My own hands, had felt death’s icy coldness on his once noble forehead. I knew that Joseph was dead. And yet I often startled and involuntarily looked at the stand to see if it was not Joseph. It was not, it was Brigham Young and if any one doubts the right of Brigham to manage affairs for the Saints, all I have to say to them is this. Get the spirit of God and know for yourselves. The Lord will provide for his own. Has the word of the Lord ever failed. Br Young will not live forever clothed with mortality. But He who rules in heaven and on earth will control all things by the counsel of his own will. Saints will live.<sup>33</sup>

---

33. Emily Smith Hoyt, *Reminiscences and Diaries 1851–93*, holograph, 20–21, microfilm, MS 13346, Church History Library, original diary in the possession of Jonathan A. Dibble, Salt Lake City.

## 33A AND 33B. ZINA DIANTHA HUNTINGTON

*January 13, 1821–August 27, 1901, age 23*

I went to meeting in the afternoon thanks be to Him who reigns on high the majority of the Twelve are her[e] Brigham Youngs spoke and the Church voted that the 12 should act in the office of there calling next to Joseph or the three first presidents.<sup>34</sup>

Never can it be told in words what the saints suffered in those days of trial; but the sweet spirit—the comforter—did not forsake them; and when the twelve returned, the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham.

When I approached the stand (on the occasion when Sidney Rigdon was striving for the guardianship of the Church), President Young was speaking. It was the voice of Joseph Smith—not that of Brigham Young. His very person was changed. The mantle was truly given to another. There was no doubting this in the minds of that vast assembly. All witnessed the transfiguration, and even to-day thousands bear testimony thereof. I closed my eyes. I could have exclaimed, I know that is Joseph Smith's voice! Yet I knew he had gone. But the same spirit was with the people; the comforter remained.<sup>35</sup>

## 34. MARY ANNE [PRICE] HYDE

*June 5, 1816–June 16, 1900, age 28*

In listening to the remarks of President Young, it carried me back to the time when the spirit and mantle of Joseph fell upon him. I was there and witnessed that scene at the time it occurred. I looked, and it seemed as though it was Joseph himself. I said to those near me, “See there is Joseph,” not even

---

34. Zina Diantha Huntington Young, *Diaries 1844–45*, holograph, August 8, 1844, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE1954192](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE1954192), image 6, published in Maureen Ursenbach Beecher, “All Things Move in Order in the City”: The Nauvoo Diary of Zina Diantha Huntington Jacobs,” *BYU Studies* 19, no. 3 (1979): 294.

35. Edward W. Tullidge, *The Women of Mormondom* (New York: Tullidge and Crandall, 1877), 326–27, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/womenofmormondom00tull#page/326/mode/2up>; see also Richard Neitzel Holzapfel and Jeni Broberg Holzapfel, *Women of Nauvoo* (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1992), 134–35.

taking my eyes off for fear I should lose the sight of it. It was a testimony to me that he was the right man in the right place.<sup>36</sup>

### 35A AND 35B. ORSON HYDE

*January 8, 1805–November 28, 1878, age 39*

I will tell you that as long as God has a Church on the earth, He will govern it. Now I will tell you a little of my feelings in relation to it. I know that when President Young returned with the Twelve to Nauvoo, he gathered them around him, and said he: “I want you to disperse among the congregation and feel the pulse of the people while I go upon the stand and speak.”

We went among the congregation and President Young went on the stand. Well, he spoke; and his words went through me like electricity. “Am I mistaken?” said I, “or is it really the voice of Joseph Smith?” This is my testimony, it was not only the voice of Joseph, but there were the features, the gestures and even the *stature* of Joseph there before us in the person of Brigham. And though it may be said that President Young is a complete *mimic*, and can mimic anybody, I would like to see the man who can mimic another *in stature* who was about *four or five inches higher than himself*.—every one who was inspired by the spirit of the Lord, felt it. They knew it. They realized it.

I sat myself down in the midst of the congregation, with my two wives, whom Joseph had given and sealed to me. When President Young began to speak, one of them said: “It is the voice of Joseph! It is Joseph Smith!” The exclamation of the other was,—“I do not see him, where is he?!” Well the thought occurred to my mind respecting the Scripture which President Young has just quoted:—“My sheep know my voice and follow me.” Where is the one that recognized the voice of Joseph in President Young? Where is she? She is in the line of her duty. But where is the other? Gone where I wish she

---

36. John M. Whittaker, “Memorial Anniversary,” *Woman’s Exponent* 17 (August 15, 1888): 46, available on “Mormon Publications: 19th and 20th Centuries,” *BYU Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections*, <http://contentdm.lib.byu.edu/cdm/ref/collection/WomansExp/id/36784>. The occasion was a Relief Society meeting held in the Ogden Tabernacle, July 19, 1888, in commemoration of the last public visit and instructions of President Brigham Young eleven years previous, just prior to his death. Mary Anne Price Hyde, widow of Orson Hyde, was president of the Relief Society of the Sanpete Stake and spoke at that meeting. See also Myrtle Stevens Hyde, *Orson Hyde: The Olive Branch of Israel* (Salt Lake City: Agreka Books, 2000), 181–82.



were not. The sheep of the good shepherd will follow the voice they know; but they will not follow the voice of a stranger.

Now, this was a manifestation of the power of the Almighty—it was the power of God resting on an individual in the eyes of all the people; not only in feature and voice, but actually in *stature*. This is my testimony. . . . Did it require proof that Joseph was there in the person of Brigham, speaking with an angel's voice? It required no argument; with those who feared God and loved truth, it required none.<sup>37</sup>

At the time our Prophet and Patriarch were killed, or at least soon afterwards, when the Twelve returned to Nauvoo, their immediate circumstances were not altogether agreeable and pleasant or profitable. But suffice it to say we had a meeting, a Conference, at which President Young was the centre of attraction. On his rising to speak, and as soon as he opened his mouth, I heard the voice of Joseph through him, and it was as familiar to me as the voice of my wife, the voice of my child, or the voice of my father. And not only the voice of Joseph did I distinctly and unmistakably hear, but I saw the very gestures of his person, the very features of his countenance, and if I mistake not, the very size of his person appeared on the stand. And it went through me with the thrill of conviction that Brigham was the man to lead this people. And from that day to the present there had not been a query or a doubt upon my mind with regard to the divinity of his appointment; I know that he was the man selected of God to fill the position he now holds.<sup>38</sup>

### 36. WILLIAM HYDE

*September 11, 1818–March 2, 1874, age 25*

On Thursday, August the 8th, I attended a special conference in Nauvoo. Elder Rigdon addressed the assembly in the forenoon. Elder Rigdon sought, as he expressed it, the guardianship of the Church, but it was plainly manifest that the Spirit of the Lord had withdrawn from him, and that he

---

37. Orson Hyde, "Remarks," *Deseret News Semi-Weekly*, November 16, 1869 (discourse given October 6, 1869); see also Orson Hyde, in *Journal of Discourses*, 26 vols. (Liverpool: F. D. Richards, 1855–86), 13:181, available on "Journal of Discourses," *BYU Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections*, <http://contentdm.lib.byu.edu/cdm/ref/collection/JournalOfDiscourses3/id/4962>. A summary of Elder Hyde's discourse was also published in "Thirty-Ninth Semi-Annual Conference," *Deseret News*, October 13, 1869, 1–3, available on J. Willard Marriott Library, *Utah Digital Newspapers*, <https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/details?id=2604075>.

38. Orson Hyde, in *Journal of Discourses*, 19:58 (April 5, 1877).

sought that which did not belong to him. From the time the saints were driven from Missouri he had evidently been on the background, and had not walked up to his station, and on one occasion I heard Joseph Smith say that he had carried Elder Rigdon on his back long enough, and then turning to the Twelve said that if they did not help him at that time in shaking him off, the time would come when they would have to do, and that without his, Joseph's assistance. And on Thursday, the 8th of August, was this saying of the Prophet brought home with weight to my mind.

In the afternoon President Brigham Young came upon the stand and addressed the vast multitude of anxious listeners as follows: "For the first time the Twelve walk up to the stand in their place, we have walked by sight and not by faith. The Church had had the privilege of coming to Joseph and of receiving, but now he has stepped to the other side of the veil. He loved the Church even unto death, and laid down his life for it." President Young then asked the following questions: "Do you want to choose a person to lead you into the Kingdom, if so manifest it." All were silent. "If there is any person present that wishes to draw away [a] party after them let them rise." But no one rose. "I have wanted," said President Young, "to fast thirty days, and clothe my house in mourning, but it seems that the saints are determined to drive business. They are not willing to wait and let everything come in its place, but business must be driven, and as it falls to my lot to speak, I shall speak in plainness. Do you want President Rigdon to take Joseph's place, if so take him. Here are the Twelve. Have my knees ever faltered, have these hands ever slackened?" "No." and "No." said voices from all directions. "[T]he Twelve hold the keys and are in authority equal with the First President when the first is absent. Do you want to choose a trustee in trust to take Joseph's place, if so the Twelve must ordain him, for the power rests in them, and in them alone, the Church cannot do it. . . ."

And then he said that if Elder Rigdon wanted to be a spokesman for Joseph, let him go to the other side of the veil. "Who," said he, "ever heard of such a thing as a person on one side of the veil acting as a spokesman for a person on the other side." The President further stated that no person could stand between Joseph and the Twelve. And then turning to the people, said it was their place to rise up and help roll on the Kingdom. "But let us not undertake anything new, let us follow the law and not undertake to divide the Priesthood one hair."

Elders P. P. Pratt and Amasa Lyman made some very appropriate remarks, confirming what President Young had said. . . .

President Young again arose and spoke concerning the endowments of the Elders. Said that if they did not get them in the Temple, they should

have them if they had to receive them in the wilderness, for the Devil could not cheat them out of them. He then called upon the saints to know if they would receive the Twelve and let them stand in their place as the First Presidency of the Church in the absense of Joseph. The vote was unanimous in the affirmative. On this day it was plainly manifest that the mantle of Joseph had rested upon President Young. The voice of the same spirit by which he, Joseph, spake was this day sounded in our ears, so much so that I once, unthoughtedly, raised my head to see if it was not actually Joseph addressing the assembly. The assembly was dismissed by President Young after being blessed in the name of the Lord.<sup>39</sup>

### 37A AND 37B. RACHEL RIDGEWAY IVINS

*March 7, 1821–January 27, 1909, age 23*

After the Prophet's death when Sidney Rigdon came to Nauvoo and spoke, he thought that it was his right and privilege to be President of the Church. President Young jumped right up on the seat and spoke. If you had had your eyes shut, you would have thought it was the Prophet [Joseph]. In fact he looked like him, his very countenance seemed to change, and he spoke like him.<sup>40</sup>

---

39. William Hyde, "The Private Journal of William Hyde, 1868," holograph, 64–67, and typescript, 13–15, Church History Library, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE1103543](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE1103543).

William was baptized in 1834 and kept a dated and detailed record of his Church activities. If this handwritten journal was not kept concurrently, it must have been based on copious and dated notes. He admitted that on occasion instructions were given "which I did not pen." Hyde, "Private Journal," 16. This indicates that the information in his journal was generally written at the time of offering.

Elder George Albert Smith, a member of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles, saw the original journal in the home of a granddaughter, Elizabeth Hyde Geary, and scanned its contents. Recognizing the wide sweep of Church history contained in this private journal, he immediately requested it for the Church archives and had a typed copy made for Sister Geary. William Layne Woolf, "Forward" in Hyde, "Private Journal," n.p.

40. Rachel Ridgeway Grant, "Joseph Smith the Prophet," *Young Woman's Journal* 16 (December 1905): 551; see also Ronald W. Walker, "Rachel R. Grant: The Continuing Legacy of the Feminine Ideal," in *Supporting Saints: Life Stories*

In a letter, President Heber J. Grant recorded the following about his mother's mantle testimony:

I read [Ezra Clark's] testimony of the transfiguration . . . of Brigham Young at the time that Sidney Rigdon tried to claim appointment as the guardian of the Church, representing the Prophet Joseph, and how Brigham Young spoke with the voice, and used the gestures, and had the personal appearance of Joseph Smith. I am grateful that my mother was present and had the same testimony which she often gave in public.<sup>41</sup>

### 38A AND 38B. BENJAMIN FRANKLIN JOHNSON

*July 28, 1818–November 18, 1905, age 26*

Of Brigham Young as President of the Church I will again bear this as a faithful Testimony that I do know and bear Record. that upon the head of Brigham Young as Chief with the Apostleship in full was by the voice of the prophet Joseph in in [*sic*] my hearing laid the full Responsibility of bearing of the kingdom of God to all the world. And I do further bear this as a testimony Faithful & True. to the Church & to all the world. That at a Conference of the whole Church at Nauvoo subsequent to the Prophets death. and Return of the absent Apostles—That I sat in the assembly near to Pres Rigdon Closely attentive to his apeal to the Conference to Recognize & Sustain his claim as “Guardian for the Church.” And I was perhaps to a degree, forgetful of what I knew to be the Rights & duties of the apostleship. and as he Closed his address & sat down my Back was partly turned to the seat occupied by Apostle Brigham Young & other Apostles. when suddinly and as from Heaven I heard the voice of the prophet Joseph that thrilled my whole being. and quickly turning around I saw in the transfiguration of Brigham Young the Tall straight & portly form of the Prophet Joseph Smith Clothed in a sheen of Light Covering him to his feet. and I heard the Real & perfect voice of the Prophet Even to the whistle as in years past caused by the loss of a Tooth, said to have been broken out by a mob at Hyrum. This view or vission altho but for seconds was to me as vivid & Real as the glare of lightening or the voice of Thunder from the heavens and so deeply was I impressed with

---

*of Nineteenth-Century Mormons*, ed. Donald Q. Cannon and David J. Whittaker (Provo, Utah: Religious Studies Center, Brigham Young University, 1985), 24.

41. Heber J. Grant to Edward B. Clark, reproduced in Annie Clark Tanner, *A Biography of Ezra Thompson Clark* (Salt Lake City: Tanner Trust Fund, University of Utah, 1931), xi.

what I saw & heard in this transfiguration. That for years I dare not Publicly tell what was given me of the Lord to see= But when in later <years> I did publicly bear this Testimony I found that others Could testify to having seen & heard the same. But to what proportion of the congregation who were present I could never know. But I do know that this my testimony is True. The prophets lost tooth to which I aluded was as generally understood, broken out by the mob at Hyrum while trying to pry open his mouth to strangle him with Assid from which time untill a tooth was Replaced by Dentist Neighbor a year or so previous to his death there had a whistle like sound to accompany all his Public speaking. Which I again plainly heard at the time of which I write.

And while I do know that Brigham Young as president of the Church was the Right man in the Right place and a great Leader for Israel I Still know that he never Claimed to be perfect in all of his ways. But that like his Brethren he at times was liable to mistakes.<sup>42</sup>

At the time of the martyrdom all the Quorum of the Twelve were absent except John Taylor and Dr. Richards, both of whom were with the Prophet in the Carthage jail, and Sidney Rigdon having retained a partial fellowship as one of Joseph's counselors, came forward claiming the right of Guardian of the Church. James J. Strang also claimed through a spurious revelation purporting to be through the Prophet that he should lead the Church. And so matters stood until the return of the Twelve, when a conference was assembled, and President Rigdon was called upon to put forth his claim before the people, which he did, and after closing his remarks, which were void of all power or influence, President Brigham Young arose and spoke. I saw him arise, but as soon as he spoke I jumped upon my feet, for in every possible degree it was Joseph's voice, and his person, in look, attitude, dress

---

42. "An Interesting Letter: From Patriarch Benjamin F. Johnson to Elder Geo. S. Gibbs," typescript, 15, Perry Special Collections; Benjamin F. Johnson to George S. Gibbs, 1903, Church History Library, on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE5397060](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE5397060), images 58–60; also cited in E. Dale LeBaron, "Benjamin Franklin Johnson: Colonizer, Public Servant, and Church Leader" (master's thesis, Brigham Young University, 1967), 343–44. This letter was written in the early part of 1903, when Johnson was about eighty-five years old ("Interesting Letter," i). See also Dean R. Zimmerman, *I Knew the Prophets: An Analysis of the Letter of Benjamin F. Johnson to George F. Gibbs, Reporting Doctrinal Views of Joseph Smith and Brigham Young* (Bountiful, Utah: Horizon, 1976), 65–67.

and appearance was Joseph himself, personified; and I knew in a moment the spirit and mantle of Joseph was upon him. Then I remembered his saying to the Council of which Sidney Rigdon was never a member, and I knew for myself who was now the leader of Israel.<sup>43</sup>

### 39. DAN JONES

*August 4, 1811–January 3, 1862, age 33*

They [the Apostles] returned to Nauvoo as soon as they heard; and on the 8th of August an assembly was held in Nauvoo to organize things for the future, and to bring into effect the measures arranged through Joseph Smith; but primarily for the apostles to stand in their proper place at the head of the church on earth, in the absence of their former leaders. There were between twelve and fifteen thousand Saints gathered there. . . . Brigham Young, Orson Hyde, P. P. Pratt, and others addressed the crowd warmly and effectively, so that everyone perceived that the mantle of the prophet had truly fallen on the apostles; and the whole crowd without exception manifested their approval of the apostles as leaders of the church by raising their right hand.<sup>44</sup>

### 40. JACOB JONES

*April 26, 1835–March 17, 1926, age 9*

Just before we had to leave Nauvoo, my father took me in to the Temple and I well remember almost everything about the Temple. I remember Sidney Rigdon, and I was present at the meeting when the mantle of the Prophet Joseph fell upon Brigham Young. When Brigham Young began to speak, we all felt that he was the chosen one to succeed the Prophet Joseph. You could just feel that he was the divinely appointed leader to lead this people.<sup>45</sup>

---

43. Benjamin F. Johnson, *My Life's Review* (n.d.; reprint, Mesa, Ariz.: Lofgreen Printing, 1979), 103–4; see also Arrington, *Brigham Young*, 114–15n8.

44. Dan Jones, *History of the Latter-day Saints*, trans. Ronald D. Dennis (1847; reprint, Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University Religious Studies Center, 2002), 92.

45. Helen D. O'Connor, "Jacob Jones—Biography of a Pioneer," Biographical Sketch Competition Entries, MS 10452, Church History Library. The excerpt from the affidavit of May 24, 1925, given at Sugar City, Idaho, and witnessed by Stake President Fred Schwendiman, is found on p. 3.

## 41. ZADOC KNAPP JUDD

*October 15, 1827–January 28, 1909, age 16*

Right here I might relate another circumstance that to me was a sufficient testimony of the truth of the Gospel. I had for years been more or less acquainted with the Prophet Joseph Smith. I had many many times heard him preach; had heard him talk with others in common conversation. I had known his voice as well as I do that of my most intimate friend. . . . [T]his circumstance I am going to relate happened late in the fall or early winter. The people had usually convened for meeting [in] a little grove near the temple. A bowery had been built, and seats arranged to accommodate all. . . . In the meantime the building of the temple had progressed; the roof was on, the windows were in, the floor was laid, but no seats arranged. It was very cold, wet Sunday and a drizzling rain. The meeting had been adjourned from the grove to the temple for there people could get shelter. While waiting for the people to gather and also for the hour of meeting, Brigham Young, Heber C. Kimball and some others of the quorum of the twelve had come to an upper room or kind of gallery and seemed to be passing and repassing an open door and window and from the position I had chosen, which was next to the wall and near the stand, I could see them very plainly, and although I knew Joseph was dead, I could scarcely make myself believe he was not there. His [Brigham's] look, his motion, his walk, were precisely like that of Joseph and yet it was Brigham Young, and when he came and commenced to speak to the people his voice was like that of Joseph's.

In the meantime people had gathered in and standing, huddled close together, made such an immense weight on the floor that the propping under the center gave way and let the floor settle a few inches, which caused a panic among the people and some tried to rush for the door, but the loud voice of the prophet Joseph soon restored quiet and only a few were hurt by being pushed down and stepped on. No damage was done, only a few broken windows.

The change of voice and appearance I could not account for only that the mantle of Joseph had fallen on Brigham Young.<sup>46</sup>

---

46. Zadoc Knapp Judd, "Autobiography of Zadoc Knapp Judd, 1827–1909," typescript, 17–19, Perry Special Collections; Zadoc Knapp Judd, "Reminiscences of Zadoc Knapp Judd," 1900, typescript, 8, Church History Library, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE952168](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE952168).

## 42. GEORGE LAUB

October 5, 1814–November 14, 1877, age 29

Now after the death of Br. Joseph & Hyrum, Sidney Rigdon having A mision appointed him by Joseph to Pittsburg before his death. Now after his death Sidney came in all the hast[e] in him to Nauvoo from Pittsburg to claime the presidency of the church, him not knowing that Joseph Sent him out of the way to get r[i]d of him. Now when he returned to Nauvoo he called all the people to gether to choos them a guardian, as he Expressed himself. Now, Said he, the Church is 14 years old and it was the duty of the church to choose a guardien & preached there for Two days on that subject of guardinism & the Lords way was not as mans ways, But as the heavens are hier than the earth So are the Lords ways above mans ways, etc. Just about the time that the Vote was to be taken for him to be president & guardien, But as the Lord would have the Twelve to come home & I felt to praise God to See Bro Brigham Young walk upon the stand then. Thes[e] positive Revelations of Rigdon's ware only guess So, & he thinks So & hoap so, while the lord had told him how to proseed before according to his one [own] mouth & after wards ony Suposed them so.

Now when President Young arose to address the congregation his Voice was the Voice of Bro. Joseph and his face appeared as Joseph's face, & Should I not have seen his face but herd his Voice I Should have declared that it was Joseph.<sup>47</sup>

---

47. George Laub, "George Laub's Journal, 1845–46," holograph, 90–91, microfilm, MS 1983, Church History Library; Eugene England, ed., "George Laub's Nauvoo Journal," *BYU Studies* 18, no. 2 (1978): 166.

The above quotation has been challenged by Richard S. Van Wagoner in his book *Sidney Rigdon: A Portrait of Religious Excess* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1994), 351n99. Van Wagoner states Laub's mantle account was not written until after he arrived in the Utah Territory in 1852. Van Wagoner's claim is that Laub's 1845–46 journal was actually copied from another Laub journal dated 1845–52 and that the transfiguration incident was then appropriately inserted. Both journals are currently stored in the Church History Library. Historian Michael Quinn explains: "Eugene England edited 'George Laub's Nauvoo Journal,' *Brigham Young University Studies* 18 (Winter 1978): 166, which also gives an explicit description of Brigham Young's transfiguration. However, Van Wagoner, *Sidney Rigdon*, demonstrates that England had edited Laub's own revision (dated about 1852) of his original Nauvoo diary that was unavailable to England. Donated to LDS Archives after England's article, Laub's original diary made no reference to a mystical experience at the August 1844 meeting." D. Michael



## 43. WANDLE MACE

*February 19, 1809–August 10, 1890, age 35*

Upon arriving in Nauvoo he—Sidney—immediately appointed a meeting for the people to choose a Guardian for the church. Fortunately the Twelve with the President Brigham Young, arrived in time to attend this meeting.—Sidney's intentions was to hold this meeting before the Twelve arrived.—

The meeting was held according to appointment, Sidney Rigdon addressing us, giving his views upon our situation and called upon the people to choose a Guardian or trustee for the church, but there seemed to be no spirit of the Gospel in his remarks, and it was evident to all that he was not dictated by the Holy Ghost.

A Meeting was appointed or rather continued as a Special Conference and in the afternoon and President Brigham Young addressed the people. At this meeting the soieit [spirit] was truly manifest inasmuch it seemed that Joseph himself was addressing us, the voice, the countenance was Joseph. The mantle of Joseph had indeed fallen upon Brigham Young. There was no dubiaty now, if there had been any before, who held the power. All could see and bore testimony that the spirit had manifested to them that Brigham Young was the right man, and he was in the right place. Said Joseph with his hands upon the head of Brigham Young, in the house of John P. Green at quincy, "While you live no other man can occupy this place."

. . . President Brigham Young gave his views of the present situation of the church, now our Prophet and patriarch is taken from our midst. He said, "... While the Prophet lived, we walked by 'sight' he is taken from us, and we must now walk by 'faith.'" After he had explained matters so satisfactory

---

Quinn, *The Mormon Hierarchy: Origins of Power* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1994), 393n114.

The George Laub journal order, which Van Wagoner presents as proof that early Laub memoirs might be suspect, can only be accepted as his personal opinion according to the late Eugene England, who stated that Van Wagoner's conclusion cannot be proved one way or the other. In a personal interview with England in the summer of 1997, I found he angrily and firmly stood by the timeline of his article "George Laub's Nauvoo Journal."

If Van Wagoner is correct in redating to 1852 Laub's journal mentioning the mantle, this account is still one of the earliest renderings, written at least seventeen to eighteen years before the first complete published account of the mantle experience.

that every Saint present could see that as aforetime the—mantle of Elijah fell upon Elisha—so also fell the mantle or the spirit and power which Joseph held in his life time had fallen upon Brigham Young as President of the Twelve, which was the highest Quorum, and holding the highest—or first Presidency—of the Church of God upon the earth.<sup>48</sup>

#### 44. PHILEMON CHRISTOPHER MERRILL

1820–1904, age 24

Sad was the day that the Saints met by a call of the Apostles in a Grove, east of our beloved Temple which was unfinished, to listen to what might be said. For where was the good Shepherd? We were left alone as we thought, with none to lead us. It was a gloomy time. Sidney Rigdon talked to us and said we were of age, choose our guardian and he offered himself as that one to lead the Church but it did not satisfy the people. But when President Brigham Young arose and said to the people, “Stand still and see the Salvation of the Lord,” the Spirit of God rested upon me, and I received a testimony at that time that upon Brigham Young rested the Authority of the Holy Priesthood.<sup>49</sup>

#### 45. ELMIRA POND MILLER

February 14, 1811–September 3, 1904, age 33

We [Elmira and her husband, Henry] were there [at home, four miles from Carthage] when Joseph and Hyrum were shot. Did not hear of it till next morning. I could not describe my feelings. It had not entered into my mind

---

48. Wandle Mace, “The Diary of Wandle Mace” (Salt Lake City: Genealogical Society of Utah, 1964), 156–57, microfilm 375867, Family History Library; Wandle Mace, Autobiography [c. 1890], holograph, 95–96, MS 1189, microfilm, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE5032694](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE5032694), images 98–99. See also Wandle Mace, Autobiography [c. 1890], holograph [written in 1911], 113–14, MS 1924, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE5032686](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE5032686), images 121–22. Both of the autobiographies in the Church History Library were copied by his wife, Elizabeth Howell Mace.

49. Philemon Christopher Merrill, Autobiography [c. 1890], typescript, 4, MS 8244, Church History Library. Transcription by Zola S. Hardy, the wife of a great-grandson of Philemon, from a six-page holograph.

that our enemies would take the life of our Prophet. It seemed a dark day to be left without a leader; But when Brother Brigham returned and spoke to the Saints it was plainly manifest that the same spirit rested on him that was on Bro. Joseph.<sup>50</sup>

#### HENRY WILLIAM MILLER

*May 1, 1807–October 9, 1885, age 37*

See Elmira Pond Miller.

#### 46. GEORGE MORRIS

*August 24, 1816–June 27, 1897, age 27*

Sidney Rigdon set up his Clame as Guardain of the Church—Saying that it was not of Age to do Buisness for itself being Only about 14 years of Age—and as he was the next in athoraty to Joseph—it was his Duty to act as Guardain for it untill it was Old enough to do Business for itself—on the 5th [*sic*] of August 1844 a special meeting was apointed for the Church to come together to here what he had to say upon the subject—he ocupied the time in the forenoon.—in the afternoon Presedent Young arose to reply to what he had said—and when he arose to speak I was sitting right Before Him holding down my Head—reflecting about what Rigdon had said—when I was startled by Earing Josephs Voice—he had a way of Clearing his Throat before he began to speak—by a peculier Effort of His own—like Ah-hem—I raised my Head sudinly—and the first thing I saw was Joseph—as plain as I ever saw Him in my life—and the first words he uttered whare, Right here—is the Athoraty to Lead This Church—and at the same time srikeing his hand upon his Bosam and, after uttering another sentance or two—it was Brigham Young—That was Testemony anough to Convince me where the Proper athoraty rested.<sup>51</sup>

---

50. Elmira Pond Miller, "A Biography of the Life of Elmira Pond Miller Written by Herself in 1890, Fourteen Years Before Her Death," typescript, 4, Daughters of Utah Pioneers Library and Archives, Salt Lake City. Submitted by Julia T. Bodily in 1964.

51. George Morris, "Life Story of George Morris of the Seventeenth Ward, Salt Lake," holograph, unpagged, microfilm, Family History Library; see also George Morris, "Autobiography of George Morris," typescript, 27, Perry Special Collections. Morris's autobiography has been edited, but the editor is not given.

## 47. JOSEPH STACY MURDOCK

*June 26, 1822–February 15, 1899, age 22*

Went with Brother Joseph Smith when on the way to Carthage Gale. I went in a monsoot the horses and held onto his pants and Beged to goo with him. . . . His remains war brot to Navoo and, the, people in sorow witnesed the seen in, Morning for the prophit of the Lord times roled on un till Brother Brigham Young come forward and tok the s[t]and in Navoo I seen Brigham transfigard. into, image of Joseph Smith the, teeth out of the mouth that the, mob, broke of Brother Joseph mouth when thay undertook to turn Eegifortiz down him this was 'a' testimony to me that the Lord had plased the roling on, of thes great Later\day work upon Brigham Young I, herd Brother Joseph Smith Role, the Roleing of this gred Later\day wort on to the Twelve A Polstels with Brother Brigham at the Head, from this time Brother Brigham had Con trole of the Later day Saints.<sup>52</sup>

## 48. WILLIAM BYRAM PACE

*February 9, 1832–June 18, 1907, age 12*

Sidney Rigdon spent, what seemed to me several hours, harrangueing the people on the importance of making him their Leader, after which, Brigham Young arose and said only a word, when it was observed by the whole congregation that the mantle of “Joseph” was upon him, in word, gesture and general appearance.

The people arose en-masse to their feet astonished, as it appeared that Joseph had returned and was speaking to the people.

I was small and got upon a bench that I might more fully witness the “Phenonomia.”

There was no longer any question as to who was the Leader.<sup>53</sup>

---

52. Joseph Stacy Murdock, *Diary and Reminiscences*, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE7583213](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE7583213), images 8–10. Diary excerpt quoted in *History of Alphonso and Betsey Bonney (Murdock) Green* (n.p., 1993), 34, and in George A. Thompson, *Advancing the Mormon Frontier: The Life and Times of Joseph Stacy Murdock*, 31, microfilm, Family History Library. Joseph Murdock wrote the text to the Latter-day Saint hymn “Come, Listen to a Prophet’s Voice.”

53. William Byram Pace, “Diary of William Byram Pace and Biography of His Father, James Pace,” typescript, 7, Perry Special Collections. This is a copy from an original in the possession of Sidney A. Pace, Orem, Utah. See

## 49. GEORGE PATTEN

*October 8, 1825, or October 26, 1828–February 16, 1914, age 15*

I was acquainted with the Prophet Joseph Smith, and saw him in death, and one of the strongest testimonies I ever had of the truth of this Latter-day work was when President Young got up before the people and the spirit of the Prophet [Joseph] rested upon him, and his countenance resembled the Prophet, and his voice sounded like the Prophet's, so the Lord showed the people who and where the leader was for there were several clamoring as to their right to lead the church. "The mantle which our prophet wore was sought for by a half a score." But God knew the very man so therefore it fell upon Brigham Young, and with few exceptions, the people went to their homes rejoicing and contented.<sup>54</sup>

## 50. WILLIAM WINES PHELPS

*February 17, 1792–March 6, 1878, age 52*

"Israel Reigns" [verse two]—tune "Dixie"

We love the words of the prophet Joseph—  
While the gentile only knows of  
    War and wo; war and wo; war and wo,—  
                    Israel reigns;

Up, up! ye royal priesthood holders,—  
Joseph's robe's on Brigham's shoulders,—  
    Clear the way; clear the way; clear the way,—  
                    Israel reigns.<sup>55</sup>

---

also "Autobiography of William Byram Pace," available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, <https://familysearch.org/photos/artifacts/13751739>.

54. George Patten, "Life Sketch," 1900, holograph, unpagged, Church History Library; George Patten, "A Short Sketch [c. 1909]," typescript, 2, microfilm, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE4537175](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE4537175), image 6.

55. W. W. Phelps to Brigham Young, January 1, 1862, holograph, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE3976324](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE3976324), image 28. On "Israel Reigns," see Michael Hicks, *Mormonism and Music: A History* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2003), 114. Concerning Phelps's participation in the August 8 meeting, Quinn, *Mormon Hierarchy*, 165, notes that in the afternoon session, "[Sidney]

## 51. NATHAN TANNER PORTER

*July 10, 1820–April 9, 1897, age 24*

It was now a matter of question with Some as to who Should lead the Church, which caused much comment in private circles. and many conjectures to arise in the minds of the People. as to who was the Legitimate Successor in the Presidency of the Church. As Sidney Rigdon had preseeded the Twelve in his return from the East & claimed that it was his right, in deavering to get the People together for the purpose of rattifying his claims by their <voice> But the Twelve having returned before this was accomplished Brigham Young Being the President of the Quorum appointed a special Conference of the whole Church. at which it was vissably made manifest to the most if not all present That he was chosen of God to stand in Josephs Stead in moving on the cause of Zion For as he arose & began to speak to the People he was transfigured into Josephs likeness in looks appearence & the sound of his voice so that a low whisper ran through the vast Assembly—thats Joseph—thats Joseph while the eyes of the multitude became fastened upon him with wonder & astonishment. this prodused a firm conviction in the minds of the People beyond all doubt that he was the Man and thus he was inorgerated by a unanimous voice of all present with Heber C Kimble & Willard Richards as his Councillors I being inattendance was also an eye witness to this marvelous manifestation.<sup>56</sup>

## 52. JOHN PULSIPHER

*July 17, 1827–August 9, 1891, age 17*

I have been with the Prophet Joseph and heard his instruction weekly and sometimes daily. The last time I heard him speak in public he spoke to the Legion. After telling over what he had passed thru and what he had suffered from men because he preached the Gospel of Jesus Christ, He says:

---

Rigdon . . . asked William W. Phelps to speak in his behalf. He could not have chosen a worse advocate.” Hyde, “Private Journal,” 15, states that “Elder W. W. Phelps also made some very comforting remarks” after Brigham spoke in the afternoon session.

56. Nathan Tanner Porter, *Reminiscences* [c. 1879], holograph, 131–33, microfilm, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE4230354](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE4230354), images 138–40. He has conflated the August 8, 1844, meeting with the meeting at Winter Quarters on December 5, 1847, when Brigham Young was sustained as president of the Church with Heber C. Kimball and Willard Richards as counselors.

from my boyhood up to the present time I have been hunted like a roe upon the mountains. I have never been allowed to live like other men. I have been driven, chased, stoned, whipped, robbed, mobbed, imprisoned, persecuted, accused falsely of everything bad. I have suffered till the Lord knows I have suffered enough.

After the death of the Prophet Joseph, Sidney Rigdon came and sought to place himself at the head of the Church. By his flatteries he deceived many. Just before he called a vote of the public congregation, Brigham Young, the President of the Twelve, arrived from his mission. This was a joyful meeting. The faithful knew not that Joseph had ordained Brother Brigham and the Twelve to lead the church but they knew that the Twelve were the next quorum in authority. They that served the Lord faithful were not deceived. I went to meeting where the church met in the grove east of the Temple where President Young arose and spoke and behold he spoke with the voice of Joseph. The very moment I heard him speak (August 8th) I thought of Joseph and from that time on his voice sounded like Joseph's and from that time the Church generally were satisfied that the mantle of Joseph was on Brigham. Notwithstanding all this, Sidney Rigdon, James J. Strang, Lyman Wight, James Emmet and others led away many people from the church.<sup>57</sup>

### 53. ZERAH PULSIPHER

*June 24, 1789–January 1, 1872, age 55*

At this time the mob expected we should rise and give them battle; we thought best not to do it. We just kept still and continued our work on the Temple, finished it and got our End[owments]. But at that time most of the 12 were absent on missions. Sidney Rigdon, who aspired for the Presidency came and called the church together and presented his claim for the Presidency. But the 12 soon came home and appeared on the stand at the day appointed for choosing. Sidney made his plea. Brigham Young began to speak and at that time I sat with my back towards the stand as did many others. And when Brigham spoke he spoke with the voice of Joseph and we turned around to see Brigham speaking in Joseph's voice and behold Joseph's mantle had fallen

---

57. John Pulsipher, "A Short Sketch of the History of John Pulsipher," typescript, 7–8, Church History Library, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE3450405](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE3450405); Linda King Newell and Valeen Tippetts Avery, *Mormon Enigma: Emma Hale Smith* (New York: Doubleday, 1984), 203.

on him. The people understood it in the same way. Brigham stood at the head of the Twelve therefore the church turned to him.<sup>58</sup>

#### 54A AND 54B. JANE SNYDER RICHARDS

*January 31, 1823–November 17, 1912, age 21*

Upon the return of the Apostles and Elders a meeting was called and by a unanimous vote Brigham Young was chosen President as he stood on the stand he said he felt as though he would rather sit in sack cloth and ashes for a month than appear before the people. But then loneliness seemed to require somebody to step forward and he felt constrained to do so. And we knew he was [to be president] because he had the voice and manner of Joseph at the time as hundreds can testify.<sup>59</sup>

After his [Joseph's] tragic death I attended the meeting at which President Brigham Young addressed the Saints, and saw his face illuminated and appear as the face of Joseph while the voice of Joseph seemed to address the people through the mouth of Brigham. I can never forget the divine thrill that passed through the audience on that occasion and the impression that the appearance and voice of Joseph produced upon his hearers.<sup>60</sup>

#### MARIA WEALTHY WILCOX RICHARDS

See Maria Wealthy Wilcox.

#### 55A AND 55B. GEORGE ROMNEY

*August 14, 1831–February 1 or 2, 1920, age 12*

Well, the time came when the Twelve returned to Nauvoo. They called a meeting in the Bowery, and Sidney Rigdon with all the eloquence possible for a man to have, spoke for one hour and a half, but when he sat down, Brigham

---

58. Zerah Pulsipher, Autobiographical sketch, Church History Library; Nora Hall Lund and Terry Lund, comps., "Pulsipher Family History Book," 20, Family History Library, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE207560](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE207560).

59. Jane Snyder Richards, "Papers 1869–," holograph, 13, Church History Library; Madsen, *In Their Own Words*, 174.

60. Jane Snyder Richards, "Joseph Smith, the Prophet," *Young Woman's Journal* 16 (December 1905): 550.



Young got up, and I testify to you in all fervor, before God, that the mantle of Joseph Smith fell upon Brigham Young. It was Joseph's voice; absolutely Joseph's voice and manner, as Brigham Young addressed the people and told them who should be their leader. Now this is no fiction; this is true as I stand here after so many years, passing from the year 1844 up to the present time.<sup>61</sup>

They were children as it were; and when the man of God, as the people knew him, was taken away they did not know what would become of them. That was the condition we were in—sorrow and anguish for the loss of that man. I said the people were all children. But they knew the shepherd's voice. Sidney Rigdon and the others said, "I am the man, I am the man" but it did not take. The sheep knew better. And when the Twelve returned from the east, I shall never forget in this world or in the world to come the scene as Brigham Young arose after Sidney Rigdon had used up an hour and a half delivering an eloquent discourse. When Brigham got up the mantle of Joseph Smith fell upon him. It was Joseph's voice; it was Joseph's appearance, and I testify to you, if I never again do so on this earth, in the presence of God and angels, that this is verily the truth. This is true—that the mantle of Joseph did fall upon Brigham Young and the people knew it.<sup>62</sup>

## 56. JOB TAYLOR SMITH

*December 2, 1828–January 3, 1913, age 15*

Sometime during this week in August Sidney Rigdon returned and called the people together to listen to his oratory and special claims. I heard all his discourses and they were lengthy and to the point that the father of

---

61. George Romney, "Joseph Smith Was the Chosen Prophet of God—His Mantle Fell upon Brigham Young," *Liahona, the Elders' Journal* 17 (April 13, 1920): 339, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE61167](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE61167); Caroline Eyring Miner, *Miles Romney and Elizabeth Gaskell Romney and Family* (Salt Lake City: Miles Romney Family Organization, 1978), 74. Romney's last public testimony was delivered at a meeting of the Swedish Saints in the Twelfth-Thirteenth Ward Chapel in Salt Lake City on December 17, 1919, seventy-five years after the August 1844 mantle phenomenon. A distinguished man of eighty-eight, he bore a powerful testimony of the mantle miracle.

62. George Romney, typescript account of testimony, typed by Mary R. Ross, Church History Library; England, *Brother Brigham*, 75; Gustave Arnt Iverson, "The Mantle of the Prophet," typescript, MS 733, Church History Library. Bishop George Romney gave his testimony at a stake conference on June 22, 1919, in the Ensign Ward, Salt Lake City.

the church was dead and needed a guardian and that he was the man to fill that position.

But on the 8th of August the apostles appeared on the stand, having very recently returned from the east. And to me it was a sensation. President Brigham Young arose to speak and every eye was turned towards him, and as he spoke I fancied it was the prophet's voice speaking through him, I scarcely remember much that he said in the way of reasoning, but the ring of his voice will never cease from my memory as he uttered aloud the words, "If you wish to know who is the president of the church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints it is I." Historians have given his remarks in full, but I merely write from memory. I also remember his coupling with the motion to sustain the twelve apostles as the presiding authority of the church, the further carrying out of the measures of the prophet in finishing the building of the temple and giving the people their endowments. The votes for these measures were given heartily, for the sheep know the shepherd's voice, and a stranger, or one weakened in time of trouble they would not follow.<sup>63</sup>

#### 57. ABRAHAM OWEN SMOOT

*February 17, 1815–March 5, 1895, age 29*

I was present at the meeting held in Nauvoo on the occasion when President Young assumed leadership of the Church, and can testify with hundreds of others that he spoke by the power of God on that occasion and that he had the very voice and appearance of Joseph Smith.<sup>64</sup>

#### 58. MARGARET THOMPSON MCMEANS ADKINSON SMOOT

*April 16, 1809–September 1, 1884, age 35*

I was present upon the occasion when the Twelve Apostles with Pres Brigham Young at their head, took the presidency of the church by the unanimous vote of all Israel there assembled and personally witnessed

---

63. Job Taylor Smith, "Diary of Job Taylor Smith; a Pioneer of Nauvoo, Illinois and Utah [c. 1902]," typescript, 8, MS 4809, Church History Library.

64. Abraham O. Smoot, "Early Experiences of A. O. Smoot," *Early Scenes in Church History: Eighth Book in the Faith-Promoting Series* (Salt Lake City: Juvenile Instructor's Office, 1882), 24, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/earlyscenesinchu00salt#page/24/mode/2up>; C. Elliott Berlin, "Abraham O. Smoot, Pioneer Mormon Leader" (master's thesis, Brigham Young University, 1955), 35–36, available on *BYU ScholarsArchive*, <http://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=5522&context=etd>.

the supernatural power shown through Brigham Young. And was firmly convinced that he was the legitimate successor to the Martered Prophet. And was as ready and willing from that moment to obey his council, and receive his Revelations, as I was those of Joseph Smith.<sup>65</sup>

#### EUNICE BILLINGS WARNER SNOW

See Eunice Billings.

#### 59. WARREN STONE SNOW

*June 15, 1818–September 19 or 20, 1896, age 26*

For Sidney Rigdon rose up and asserted his right to be the guardian of the church. I was at the meeting when President Brigham Young stood up and I saw the mantle of Joseph rest upon him and I heard the voice of Joseph and had I not known that Joseph was dead I should say that was Joseph speaking and this convinced me that I was in the right channel for truth.<sup>66</sup>

#### 60. WILLIAM C. STAINES

*September 26, 1818–August 3, 1881, age 25*

After this [a long speech from Sidney Rigdon lasting about three hours] President Young stated he had listened to all that had been said by the speaker. . . . But as the subject had been broached and the people would be anxious to know something about those who would lead, he said in a loud voice: "I will tell you who your leaders or guardians will be—The Twelve! I at their head!"

---

65. Margaret T. Smoot to Mr. [H. H.] Bancroft, "Experiences of a Mormon Wife," September 2, 1880, Provo City, Utah, Perry Special Collections; see also Berlin, "Abraham O. Smoot," 36.

66. "Biography of Warren Stone Snow," typescript, 1, Church History Library, prepared by Lund and Laura Johnson, Merlene Tew Colarusso, and Thomas G. Colarusso. See Archibald Bennett, Ella M. Bennett, and Barbara Bennett Roach, *Valiant in the Faith: Gardner and Sarah Snow and Their Family* (Murray, Utah: Roylance, 1990), 56, 384, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE47181](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE47181); and John A. Peterson, "Warren Stone Snow, a Man in Between: The Biography of a Mormon Defender" (master's thesis, Brigham Young University, 1985), 33, available on *BYU ScholarsArchive*, <http://scholars.archive.byu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=6041&context=etd>.

This was with a voice like the voice of the Prophet Joseph. I thought it was his, and so did the thousands who heard it.<sup>67</sup>

## 61. MARY ANN STEARNS

*April 6, 1833–April 2, 1912, age 11*

I was at the great meeting when the mantle of Brother Joseph rested upon Brigham Young until his whole being seemed changed and his voice was like that of the Prophet. The people around me, rising to their feet to get a better chance to hear and see, I and my little companion of the day, Julia Felshaw, being small of stature, stood upon the benches that we, too might behold the wonderful transformation, and I know that from that time on the power of that change remained with Brother Brigham Young as long as he lived on earth. The faithful and honest hearted were quick to discern the right and took up the armor of the Gospel anew, rallied round the faithful Brigham whose rightful leadership had been plainly shown to them.<sup>68</sup>

## 62. CATHERINE THOMAS

*March 17, 1834–September 15, 1927, age 10*

The Saints were soon called to the Temple and the great question as to who should be their Leader was settled. Then Brigham Young was chosen to fill the vacancy of our beloved Prophet. I saw Brother Young rise to take his place as President of our Church and testify that he appeared to me and others to be Joseph the Prophet himself in person and voice, and I exclaimed “Oh, the Prophet Joseph is Resurrected.” My sister Rachel said “No, that is Brother Brigham Young.”<sup>69</sup>

---

67. William C. Staines, “Reminiscences of William C. Staines,” *Contributor* 12 (June 1891): 315, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/contributor1208eng#page/314/mode/2up>; see also William C. Staines, quoted in Roberts, *Comprehensive History*, 2:418n12.

68. Mary Ann Stearns Winters, “An Autobiographical Sketch of the Life of the Late Mary Ann Stearns Winters, daughter of Mary Ann Stearns Pratt,” typescript, MS 119, Church History Library, available on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE3618928](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE3618928), images 15–16.

69. Catherine Thomas Leishman, Autobiographical sketch [May 1, 1914], typescript, 2–3, microfilm, MS 11367, Church History Library, available on *Church*

## 63A AND 63B. NANCY NAOMI ALEXANDER TRACY

*1814–1902, age 30*

We bore faithful testimony to our relatives and in the spring, bid our friends [in the East] farewell to return again to our home in Nauvoo. We landed at the City of the Saints about the middle of April, on Sunday morning. But oh, how lonely it seemed, our Prophet and Patriarch was not among the Saints in person, but that day his spirit rested upon Brigham Young, and as the mantle of Elijah fell upon Elisha, so the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham. It seemed that the voice and every gesture was like Joseph, and he was sustained as the prophet, seer and revelator by the voice of the people.<sup>70</sup>

As soon as we arrived, we went right home and prepared to go to meeting for that day was appointed for us to choose a first presidency to lead the Church. The saints convened in a grove. Sidney Rigdon and his followers were on hand to contest their right to be the leaders of the Saints. At one time he was one of Brother Josephs councilors, but he was not righteous, and Joseph shook him off saying that the [*sic*] had carried him long enough and he would carry him no longer. Therefore, it was out of the question to have such a man lead the people.

Brigham Young was the man chosen and sustained by unanimous vote to be the mouthpiece of God to the Saints. I can testify that the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham that day as that of Elijah did fall upon Elisha, for it seemed that his voice, his gestures, and all were Joseph. It seemed that we had him again with us. He was sustained by the voice of the people to be the prophet, seer, and revelator.<sup>71</sup>

---

*History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE2603136](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE2603136), images 3–4.

70. Nancy Naomi Alexander Tracy, “Autobiography,” holograph, 5, microfilm, Family History Library; Nancy Alexander Tracy, “A Short Sketch of the Life and Travels of Nancy N. Tracy,” typescript (prepared by grandson David E. Ellingson), 19, Perry Special Collections. See also Madsen, *In Their Own Words*, 255–56. The account indicates that Nancy and her husband were in the East at the time of the August 8 meeting or that Nancy had confused the dates. Her story may have been secondhand or might be an account of something they experienced later. See also William C. Anderson, ed., *A Condensation of the Auto-Biography of Nancy Naomi Alexander Tracy* (n.p., 1947), 5, MS 11585, Church History Library, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE4043557](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE4043557).

71. Nancy N. Tracy, Autobiography, typescript, 31, Church History Library.

## 64. WILLIAM LAMPARD WATKINS

*February 7, 1827–September 18, 1911, age 17*

A meeting was appointed for August 8th by which time Brigham Young and most of the other apostles had returned home. It was at this meeting Sidney Rigdon made a lengthy and tedious speech presenting his claims, telling the people what wonderful things he had planned for them.

It was a solemn time for he was a man who on account of his experience and talents had been sustained as Joseph's counselor by the people, although contrary to the Prophet's wish for some time past, but the darkness was soon dispelled, for Brigham Young explained before the people on that day, the order of the Priesthood. He was filled with the power of the Holy Ghost. He stood before the people as the Prophet Joseph Smith often had done and we heard the voice of the true shepherd, for he spoke with the voice of Joseph. His manner and appearance were like unto Joseph's and it was manifested to all those present upon whom the responsibility rested to carry on the work of God and lead the Saints.

I sat in that assembly and did not realize for a time but that I was still listening to the Prophet Joseph, so great and marvelous was the manner in which the manifestation before the entire congregation was made, that when the proposition was placed before the people to decide whom they would sustain as the leader of the church, the twelve apostles with Brigham Young as their President were almost unanimously sustained. This circumstance, although the Saints were in deep trouble and filled with sorrow for the condition in which they were placed brought a great relief and gave joy to the Saints for they realized that God was still mindful of them.<sup>72</sup>

## 65. JOHN WELCH

*January 6, 1823–November 8, 1910, age 21*

I, John Welch, being of mature years desire to leave to my friends and descendants the following statement:

---

72. William Lampard Watkins, "A Brief History of William Lampard Watkins, from His Birth until His Arrival in Utah on September 12th, 1852," typescript, 2, Perry Special Collections; William Lampard Watkins, "Autobiography of William Lampard Watkins, from His Birth until He Arrived in Utah on 12 September 1852," 4, Church History Library; Marie M. Hayes, *That Others Might Know: A History of the Watkins and Lampard Families* (Seattle: By the author, 1979), 24–25.

. . . I was baptizd into the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in the year 1841; emigrated to Nauvoo, Ill., in 1843 and to Salt Lake City in the year 1852. I was well acquainted with the Prophet Joseph Smith and heard him speak both in public and private many times. I was present at the meeting in the grove at Nauvoo August 8th, 1844, when Sidney Rigdon made the claim. . . . I saw Brigham Young, then President of the Twelve Apostles, stand up to speak to the people and he spoke with the voice of Joseph Smith; and I further declare and testify that he, Brigham Young, had the appearance of the Prophet Joseph Smith while he, Young, was talking; that I was convinced then, and have never doubted in all the intervening years from that time up to the present, that Brigham Young was the right man and the man chosen of God to lead the Church.

Signed, John Welch  
Sworn before  
A. L. Farrell,  
County Clerke, Cache Co, Utah<sup>73</sup>

#### ELIZA ANN HAVEN WESTOVER

See Eliza Ann Haven.

#### 66. HELEN MAR KIMBALL WHITNEY

*August 25, 1828–November 15, 1896, age 15*

I can bear witness, with hundreds of others who stood that day under the sound of Brigham's voice, of the wonderful and startling effect that it had upon us. If Joseph had risen from the dead and stood before them, it could hardly have made a deeper or more lasting impression. It was the very voice of Joseph himself. This was repeatedly spoken of by the Latter-day Saints. And surely it was a most powerful and convincing testimony to them that he was the man, instead of Sidney Rigdon, that was destined to become the "great leader," and upon whose shoulders the mantle of Joseph had fallen.<sup>74</sup>

---

73. John Welch, "Deposition, July 5, 1902," typescript, microfilm, Church History Library. This is a copy of a statement that John Welch made July 5, 1902, at Logan City, Cache County, Utah. It was signed, sealed, and sworn before A. L. Farrell, Cache County Clerk. Parts of the deposition are also included in Evaline Dunn Snow, "John and Eliza B. Welch Biographical Sketch," transcript, 2, microfilm, Church History Library.

74. Helen Mar Whitney, "Scenes in Nauvoo after the Martyrdom of the Prophet and Patriarch," *Woman's Exponent* 11 (February 1, 1883): 130; Stanley B.

## 67. MARIA WEALTHY WILCOX

*June 17, 1827–January 13, 1909, age 17*

I well remember the Sunday morning when the sorrowing saints were gathered together, in the little grove where they were accustomed to meet. Sidney Rigdon presented his claim as successor to the Prophet Joseph, making quite an impression upon the people; but Brigham Young, President of the Apostles, had just returned to Nauvoo, from his mission, in time to attend the afternoon meeting, and in a voice not unlike the Prophet's, he told the people that although the Prophet Joseph was dead, Joseph had left behind the Keys of the Kingdom, and had conferred the same power, and authority that he himself possessed, upon the Twelve Apostles, and that the Church would not be left without a leader and a guide. Truly the mantle of Joseph had fallen upon Brigham, and he spoke with power, even to the convincing of the saints, assuring them that they had nothing to fear, as all would yet be well, if they would harken to the Word of God, and to the counsel of his servants, and keep his commandments.<sup>75</sup>

## MARY ANN STEARNS WINTERS

See Mary Ann Stearns.

## 68A, 68B, AND 68C. WILFORD WOODRUFF

*March 1, 1807–September 2, 1898, age 37*

In an address published in February 1845, Wilford Woodruff shared the mantle news with “[Church] officers and members” in England by assuring them that

On the second day after our arrival, Aug. 8th, 1844, we met in a special conference, all the quorums, authorities, and members of the Church, that could assemble in Nauvoo. They were addressed by elder Brigham Young, the president of the quorum of the twelve. It was evident to the Saints that the mantle of Joseph had fallen upon him, the road that he pointed out could be seen so

---

Kimball, “Heber C. Kimball and Family, the Nauvoo Years,” *BYU Studies* 15, no. 4 (1975): 472.

75. Maria Wealthy Wilcox, “Joseph Smith, the Prophet,” *Young Woman's Journal* 16 (December 1905): 553–54.



plainly, that none need err therein; the spirit of wisdom and counsel attended all his teachings, he struck upon a chord, with which all hearts beat in unison.<sup>76</sup>

I know this work is of God. I know Joseph Smith was a prophet of God. I have heard two or three of the brethren testify about Brother Young in Nauvoo. Every man and every woman in that assembly, which perhaps might number thousands, could bear the same testimony. I was there, the Twelve were there, and a good many others, and all can bear the same testimony. The question might be asked why was the appearance of Joseph Smith given to Brigham Young? Because here was Sidney Rigdon and other men rising up and claiming to be the leaders of the Church; and men stood, as it were, on a pivot, not knowing which way to turn. But just as quick as Brigham Young rose in that assembly, his face was that of Joseph Smith—the mantle of Joseph had fallen upon him, the power of God that was upon Joseph Smith was upon him; he had the voice of Joseph, and it was the voice of the shepherd. There was not a person in that assembly, Rigdon, himself, not excepted, but was satisfied in his own mind that Brigham was the proper leader of the people, for he [Rigdon] would not have his name presented, by his own consent, after that sermon was delivered. There was a reason for this in the mind of God: it convinced the people. They saw and heard for themselves, and it was by the power of God.<sup>77</sup>

I do not know if there is any one present here tonight but myself who was there at that conference. There are but few living who were present on that occasion . . . and when Brigham Young arose and commenced speaking, as has been said, if my eyes had not been so I could see, if I had not seen him with my own eyes, there is no one that could have convinced me that it was not Joseph Smith. It was as the voice and face of Joseph Smith; and any one can testify to this who was acquainted with these two men.<sup>78</sup>

---

76. Wilford Woodruff, "To the Officers and Members of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints in the British Islands," *Millennial Star* 5 (February 1845): 138.

77. Wilford Woodruff, "Remarks," *Deseret News*, May 22, 1872, 4, available on J. Willard Marriott Library, *Utah Digital Newspapers*, [https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/details?id=2611115#t\\_2611115](https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/details?id=2611115#t_2611115); see also Wilford Woodruff, in *Journal of Discourses*, 15:81 (April 8, 1872).

78. B. H. Roberts, "Priesthood, and the Right of Succession," *Deseret Semi-weekly*, March 15, 1892, also *Deseret Weekly*, March 19, 1892, 407, available on J. Willard Marriott Library, *Utah Digital Newspapers*, [https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/details?id=2689970#t\\_2689970](https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/details?id=2689970#t_2689970). This testimony was publicly delivered

## Secondhand Accounts

This section contains secondhand accounts of the mantle experience. These accounts concern people who reported a personal mantle experience but did not record their own story. Their oral testimonies were recorded later by others, usually family members. Other accounts in this section come from firsthand diaries that are unavailable to the author of this paper; in these cases, secondary sources have been cited. As with the firsthand accounts, these accounts list each person's name, birth and death dates, age in August 1844, and testimony, including sources, and appropriate notes. Women are listed under the name they had in August 1844.

### 69. SALLY ADAMS

*May 29, 1825–February 15, 1905, age 19*

“I well remember that June day of 1844, when the announcement reached Nauvoo that the Prophet and Patriarch had been killed by a cruel mob. The news fell like a thunderbolt upon the Saints. Their grief was indescribable. Many thought he, like the Savior, would rise again to become their leader. . . . The memory of the occasion can never be erased. This sad occurrence marks the culmination of the devil inspired persecutions of two of God's greatest and truest noblemen.”

Sally told of being at the meeting on August 8, 1844, when Brigham Young spoke in the voice of the martyred Prophet. He assumed the form and appearance of Joseph, so that the thousands at the meeting believed for the moment that President Smith actually stood before them.<sup>79</sup>

---

at a gathering of Young Men Mutual Improvement Association groups. Speaker B. H. Roberts was presenting a lecture on the succession in the presidency of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. At Roberts's request, President Woodruff, who was present in the audience, was asked to present his testimony concerning the events of August 8, 1844, and the mantle experience. See also Arrington, *Brigham Young*, 115.

79. Celestia Snow Gardner, *History of the William Snow and Robert Gardner Families: Pioneers of 1847 and 1850* (Salt Lake City: Acorn Printing, 1942), 17–18, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE933555](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE933555). Sally married William Snow in January 1846 in the Nauvoo Temple (18).

## 70. ABIGAIL JANE DALEY ANDRUS

*January 26, 1815–October 27, 1894, age 29*

Abigail and Milo pressed on in whatever was asked of them during that turbulent time. They were both present at the meeting where the transfiguration of Brigham Young occurred. Both saw and felt the miracle and Abigail was startled to hear Br. Brigham state that they would be leaving Nauvoo for the wilderness.<sup>80</sup>

## MILO ANDRUS

*March 6, 1814–June 19, 1893, age 30*

See Abigail Jane Daley Andrus.

## 71. TRUMAN OSBORN ANGELL

*June 5, 1810–October 16, 1887, age 34*

Not only did Truman Angell neglect to record much about his personal and professional life during this period, but he also wrote little of the larger historical events occurring around him. He mentions only that he “suffered much—in common with the rest of my Brethern—during the persecutions in which the Prophet and Patriarch lost their lives.” Angell’s loyalty lay with the Apostles in the aftermath of this tragedy. “Although the Prophet Joseph and Hyrum Smith had lost their lives by mob violence,” he writes, “the Twelve Apostles came forward, with Brigham Young at their head, and the mantle of Joseph was upon them in all that was done.”<sup>81</sup>

---

80. Carla Spencer Anderson, “Brief Life Sketches of Our Pioneer Foremothers,” in *Our Sister Saints: A Sesquicentennial Family Project to Commemorate the Arrival in the Salt Lake Valley of the Mormon Pioneers* (Soldotna, Alaska: n.p., 1997).

81. Truman O. Angell, “Biography of Truman Osborn Angell Sr.,” typescript, 6, Church History Library, quoted in Paul L. Anderson, “Truman O. Angell: Architect and Saint,” in *Supporting Saints: Life Stories of Nineteenth-Century Mormons*, ed. Donald Q. Cannon and David J. Whittaker (Provo, Utah: Religious Studies Center, Brigham Young University, 1985), 143, 169.

## 72. ELIZABETH HAVEN BARLOW

*December 28, 1811–December 25, 1892, age 32*

When Brigham Young, the President of the Twelve, began speaking I saw a change come over him—saw him take on the form of Joseph Smith and heard his voice change to that of the Prophet’s. Thousands in that assembly testified to the same thing. From that moment forward I knew whom the Lord had chosen. So did all the true Latter Day Saints. The crowd felt that the Lord had not forsaken them.<sup>82</sup>

## 73. WILLIAM MILTON BELL

*July 22, 1833–November 12, 1908, age 11*

William and his mother were living at the prophets home when the prophet was tarred and feathered. She helped remove the tar and feathers from his bruised body. He well remembered the gloom that fell over the people after his death. He well remembered seeing the Prophet riding his fine gray horse and his brother’s black horse. William was at the meeting with his father when the mantle of the Prophet Joseph fell upon Brigham Young. The likeness was so complete that William asked his father if it were the Prophet.<sup>83</sup>

## 74. ELI BENNETT

*November 26, 1831–October 14, 1906, age 13*

Eli had been in Nauvoo at the time Joseph and Hyrum Smith had been murdered. He was at the meeting to decide who would be the next leader of the Church. He stated that when Brigham Young walked into the meeting “he walked like the Prophet; his voice and gestures were those of Joseph. . .” This manifestation of the mantle of the Prophet falling upon Brigham Young made a deep impression upon the mind of this boy, not yet 14.<sup>84</sup>

---

82. Pamela Barlow Thompson, “Biography of Elizabeth Haven Barlow,” 6, Family History Library, quoted in Barlow, *Israel Barlow Story*, 204–5, 697.

83. “The Life of William Milton Bell,” typescript, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE9550091](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE9550091).

84. William H. Bennett, “Life Story of William Alvin Bennett,” in *Our Legacy from William and Elizabeth New*, comp. Archibald F. Bennett and Blanche Bennett Nordgren, 2 vols. (Provo, Utah: New Family Organization, 1984), 1:356.

## ELIZA ANN PERRY BENSON

See Eliza Ann Perry.

## 75. EZRA T[AFT] BENSON

*February 22, 1811–September 3, 1869, age 33*

When Brother Brigham Young rose before the people and spoke . . . it was very easy to see who possessed the mantle of Joseph. Truly, as Jesus said, “My sheep know my voice, but a stranger they will not follow.” For many said, when they heard Brigham talk, that it was not Brigham’s voice, but the voice of Joseph.<sup>85</sup>

## 76. ELIZA BILLINGTON

*December 16, 1825–August 16, 1916, age 18*

They [Eliza and her husband, John Welch] were both well acquainted with the Prophet Joseph Smith and his brother, Hyrum, in life and were permitted to view their remains after the martyrdom. John Welch was one of the guards over the bodies as they lay in state. They were both present at the meeting held August 8, 1844, where the mantle of the Prophet fell on Brigham Young, and they knew Brigham Young had been called by Divine Authority and power, and these facts they related many, many times to their children and grandchildren, greatly strengthening and adding to the testimonies of those who listened.<sup>86</sup>

---

William H. Bennett was William Alvin Bennett’s son and an assistant to the Quorum of the Twelve. William Alvin Bennett was the son of Eli Bennett. “[Eli] Bennett heard the Prophet Joseph Smith preach upon several occasions. . . . He was at the meeting in Nauvoo on Aug. 8, 184[4] when the mantle of Joseph Smith the prophet fell upon Brigham Young.” “Obituary,” *Deseret News*, October 19, 1906, 3.

85. John Henry Evans and Minnie Egan Anderson, *Ezra T. Benson: Pioneer—Statesman—Saint* (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Press, 1947), 88–89.

86. Evaline Dunn Snow, “John and Eliza B. Welch Biographical Sketch,” typescript, 2, microfilm, Church History Library. Evaline is a granddaughter of John and Eliza.

## 77. WILLIAM BURGESS

*May 20, 1794–November 20, 1880, age 50*

After the death of the Prophet Joseph Smith, the Church members met in the grove east of the Temple. There Brigham Young spoke, and while he was speaking the Mantle of Joseph Smith fell on him. . . . Even his features and voice were like the Prophet's. . . . So the Saints knew who was to be their leader.<sup>87</sup>

## 78. ANN CANNON

*January 28, 1832–July 25, 1921, age 12*

After the prophet's death, I was at the meeting where Sydney Rigdon, standing in a wagon box to make his speech, presented his claim to be guardian of the Church. When Brigham Young presented his claim, the mantle of the prophet rested on him and we knew he was to be the new leader.<sup>88</sup>

## 79A AND 79B. WILLIAM VAN ORDEN CARBINE

*February 17, 1835–May 11, 1921, age 9*

I was nine years old when the Prophet was martyred. I well remember the excitement at that time. The people hardly knew what to do. The Prophet was gone and Sidney Rigdon wanted a guardian put in for the Church. Brother Thomas Grover, one of the High Council, spoke and told the people not to be in a hurry: the Twelve would be home soon and they would tell the people what to do. When Brigham Young came home he held a meeting at which time, the mantle of Joseph fell on him. It was a manifestation to let the people know who was to lead the Church. His looks and ways were like the Prophet. I, as a boy, was quite well acquainted with the Prophet. I was sitting with my

---

87. Jennie Caroline Burgess Miles, "Sketch of the Life of William Burgess Sr., Pioneer," 5, Daughters of Utah Pioneers Library and Archives. Jennie, a granddaughter of William, sent the sketch to the county historian of the Washington County Chapter of Daughters of Utah Pioneers in 1937.

88. Beatrice Cannon Evans and Janath Russell Cannon, eds., *Cannon Family Historical Treasury* (Salt Lake City: George Cannon Family Association, 1967), 162–63, copy in Church History Library; condensed from Angus M. Woodbury, arr. and ed., *Reminiscences of Ann Cannon Woodbury* (n.p., 1963). Grandson Angus M. Woodbury prepared Ann's journals for publication.

mother in the meeting and I thought it was the Prophet and told my mother so. There are a good many who have heard my mother tell this.<sup>89</sup>

Though I was only a boy, I remember it quite distinctly, and I told my mother [Adelia] that the Prophet was not dead, for I had seen him on the stand.<sup>90</sup>

## 80. ALBERT CARRINGTON

*January 8, 1813–September 19, 1889, age 31*

In his conference address delivered in the Bowery in Salt Lake City on July 19, 1857, Brigham Young referred to Albert Carrington's mantle experience, which is reported to have taken place during the October conference of 1844:

Do people imagine that they can kill "Mormonism?" I may die for my religion, and who cares for that? Brother Carrington has told you that God can carry on his own work, and the spirit of Joseph which fell upon me [Brigham] is ready to fall upon somebody else when I am removed. . . .

. . . Brother Carrington's testimony proves to you that men's eyes are liable to be deceived. It may appear strange to some that he [Carrington] could not tell me from Joseph Smith, when I was speaking in the stand in Nauvoo during the October Conference of 1844. Somebody came along and passed a finger over his eyes and he could not see any one but Joseph speaking, until I got through addressing the congregation.<sup>91</sup>

## 81. RHODA [HINMAN] CHASE

*September 29 1830–January 28 1920, age 14*

It was my privilege to be personally acquainted with the Prophet Joseph Smith and his brother Hyrum. I was baptized by the Prophet, also received a

---

89. "In the Valley of the Saints," in *Our Pioneer Heritage*, comp. Kate B. Carter, 20 vols. (Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1958–77), 6:204. The account was written by William Van Orden Carbine.

90. Andrew Jenson, *Latter-day Saint Biographical Encyclopedia: A Compilation of Biographical Sketches of Prominent Men and Women in The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints*, 4 vols. (Salt Lake City: Andrew Jenson History, 1901–36), 3:41, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/latterday-saintbi03jensrich#page/40/mode/2up>.

91. Brigham Young, in *Journal of Discourses*, 5:57–58 (July 19, 1857); see also Arrington, *Brigham Young*, 115.

patriarchal blessing under the hands of Hyrum, the Patriarch. After the death of our Prophet the saints felt like a ship at sea, their rudder gone. No one to guide them. I was present at the meeting where his successor was appointed. Brigham arose after some of them declared they were to be the leader. But as Brigham began to speak, it seemed as if the mantle of the Prophet rested upon him, he had the voice of the Prophet. His very face shone. I never had a doubt that Brigham Young was the chosen of God. Shortly after this, the expulsion of saints began—the exodus to the West. Never shall I forget my feelings as I took the last look at the once happy home.<sup>92</sup>

## 82. TALITHA GARLIK AVERY CHENEY

*September 22, 1824–April 17, 1902, age 19*

I was in Nauvoo when Sidney Rigdon came from the east after Brother Joseph and Hyrum were killed to take lead of the church. There were none of the Twelve Apostles at home but Brother Taylor and Brother Richards. Brother Taylor had been badly wounded so Sidney Rigdon thought he would have things his own way, but he was mistaken; he called a meeting and said the church was old enough to choose a guardian for itself, it had been fourteen years since it was organized. But Brother Brigham and the rest of the Apostles got there in time to be at the meeting. After Rigdon sat down Brother Brigham got up and said, “All who want Brother Rigdon to lead them can have him, but I tell you the Keys of the Kingdom are in the hands of the Twelve Apostles. They are the ones to lead this people.”

As soon as Brother Brigham got up to speak, I said to myself, “That is the man to take the lead of this people.” He looked just like Brother Joseph and spoke like him, I said “Surely the mantle of the Prophet Joseph has fallen on Brother Brigham.” I never had a doubt, I knew Brother Brigham was the man to fill the place of our beloved Prophet. I knew Joseph Smith was a true Prophet of God and was the mouthpiece of God to the people and that Brother Brigham was his lawful successor and a man of God.<sup>93</sup>

---

92. Leslie Terrlink, “Family Papers,” which are diaries of her grandmother; the diaries are in possession of Terrlink’s mother. See also “The Life of Rhoda Chase Stoddard Hinman,” available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, <https://familysearch.org/photos/artifacts/10095698>. Rhoda Chase is the daughter of Isaac and Phoebe Chase, who helped build a mill in Liberty Park, Salt Lake City.

93. “The Unpublished Story,” in Carter, *Our Pioneer Heritage*, 12:202.



## 83. EZRA THOMPSON CLARK

*November 23, 1823–October 17, 1901, age 20*

When a meeting of the Saints was called to consider leadership, Sidney Rigdon put in a plea for his promotion as president of the Church and gave a two-hour discourse. In the afternoon President Young gave a clarion call to which all hearts responded. In his “Attention All,” as he addressed the Saints, he demonstrated his power, his authority, and his masterful leadership. The Saints no longer felt that they had no shepherd. So striking was Brigham Young’s commanding personality, manifesting as it did the same desire as Joseph’s to serve the Saints, love them, and lead them to a triumphant accomplishment of the plan which the Lord had revealed for their salvation, that the Saints declared that it was almost as though the Prophet Joseph had returned.

Ezra and his wife were at this meeting. He often referred to the spirit of that gathering and said that it was a strong testimony to the divine calling of Brigham Young.<sup>94</sup>

I was one who heard his voice [Joseph Smith’s], and know that he spoke like an angel from heaven. I never heard him speak with more power than then, and I heard him many times, and had seen his prophecies fulfilled, and had also shaken hands with him, and he had blessed me, and had felt the influence and power of the Lord upon him and upon me, and I have never forgotten that blessing from that day to this, and I never shall. Two days later the Prophet was martyred, and two or three weeks later, when the saints held a conference, and Brigham Young arose as leader of the Church, I want to bear record that he spoke as Joseph used to speak; to all appearances, the same voice, the same gestures, the same stature. I bear this record that this work is God’s work, and that it will roll on as it has done from that day to this.<sup>95</sup>

---

94. Annie Clark Tanner, *A Biography of Ezra Thompson Clark* (Salt Lake City: Tanner Trust Fund, University of Utah Library, 1931), 8.

95. Statement given by Ezra T. Clark on his death bed, in possession of the author and given to the author by his great granddaughter, Carolyn Clark Adamson. See also *Improvement Era* (January 1902): 202, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/improvementera0503unse#page/202/mode/2up>.

## 84. ELLEN SPENCER CLAWSON

*November 21, 1832–August 24, 1896, age 11*

Aurelia Spencer Rogers writes the following concerning her sister Ellen:

My sister Ellen's testimony has also strengthened my faith in the truth of Mormonism, and it seems to me appropriate to give it here, as it may prove a help to others. She was at a meeting of the Saints, held in a grove west of the Temple in Nauvoo, soon after the death of the Prophet Joseph Smith. The question under consideration, who should take the Prophet's place in presiding over the Church. Sidney Rigdon, who had been one of Joseph's Counselors, claimed the right to the position; yet the spirit he manifested was not in accord with the spirit of the Gospel. At this meeting, Brigham Young, who was President of the Quorum of Apostles, arose to speak, when "The Mantle of Joseph" fell upon him, and he was like one transformed; his countenance, voice and form were like those of the late Prophet. Many in the congregation, even children saw this miracle; it satisfied the people, and decided the question who was to be the leader. Sister Ellen occasionally referred to this circumstance, and said whenever she was tired, or felt to doubt any of the principles of the Gospel, this testimony came up before her.<sup>96</sup>

## 85A AND 85B. ADA WINCHELL CLEMENTS

*December 24, 1801–March 4, 1890, age 42*

When Joseph and Hyrum Smith were martyred, Albert [Ada's husband] was away from home, working for the Church interests and also the support of his family. When he heard of the terrible news he immediately started for home. On the way his horse took sick and he stopped at a store to obtain medicine. Here he met his friend Sidney Rigdon. Sidney told Albert he was hurrying back to Nauvoo to be with the Saints during this time of sorrow, and to take his place as their leader. Albert was happy to learn of Mr. Rigdon's decision. On August 15, 1844, Albert arrived home, and Ada immediately told him all that had happened, including the meeting she had attended wherein the Saints had chosen Brigham Young as their leader.<sup>97</sup>

---

96. Aurelia Spencer Rogers, *Life Sketches of Orson Spencer and Others* (Salt Lake City: George Q. Cannon and Sons, 1898), 331–32, on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/lifesketchesofor00roge#page/330/mode/2up>.

97. Bertha M. Linebarger, "Ada Winchell Clements," in Carter, *Our Pioneer Heritage*, 3:111–12.

Ada related the events of this meeting. She told Albert how Elder Young had actually sounded and looked like Joseph Smith. Albert was surprised! He inquired about Sidney Rigdon. Ada said he had spoken, but the spirit was not with him. Albert took the side of his friend Sidney Rigdon. This was a sad day for the Clements family. Albert asked Ada if she were going to leave him and go west with Brigham Young? She said she would continue with the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints. However, she said she would always love him and pray for Albert to see the truth.<sup>98</sup>

## 86. CATHERINE STEPHENSON CORLESS

*December 13, 1807–September 27, 1902, age 36*

[John Corless, a son of Catherine and Edward] was with his parents at the meeting and John said he heard his mother and others say when Brigham Young arose and began to speak, “O! It’s Joseph himself.”<sup>99</sup>

## 87. EDWARD CORLESS

*March 14, 1804–January 18, 1873, age 40*

After the opening of this meeting President Brigham Young, President of the Twelve Apostles, spoke on the duties of the Twelve Apostles, and while he was speaking the Mantle of Joseph fell on President Young and he looked like Joseph and he spoke in Joseph’s voice, and many thought it was Joseph himself.<sup>100</sup>

---

98. Charlotte Parker, “How Mormonism Affected the Lives of the Clements Family” (paper written for History 100, Brigham Young University, April 1982), 14; copy in the possession of author. Ada (Aidah) Clements evidently worked for Joseph and Emma Smith in the Mansion House. Newell and Avery, *Mormon Enigma: Emma Hale Smith*, 134.

99. William G. Hartley, *Kindred Saints: The Mormon Immigrant Heritage of Alvin and Kathryne Christenson* (Salt Lake City: Eden Hill, 1986), 25; see also Grace Wilson Norris, “Biography of John Corless,” and “Catherine Stephenson Corless: A Pioneer of 1848,” Christenson Family Archives, in the possession of Richard A. Christenson, Salt Lake City, copy given to the author by Pat Heilpren, a Corless descendant. Grace is a great-granddaughter of Edward and Catherine.

100. Grace Wilson Norris, “Edward Corless: A Pioneer of 1848,” 3, Christenson Family Archives, copy in the possession of author.

## 88. SARAH LOUISA NORRIS DECKER

*about 1824–1914, age 20*

Not satisfied yet those opposed to us began a series of persecutions; also a great apostacy took place and jealousy arose as to who should lead the Church. Sidney Rigdon, Lyman Wight and Strang had their followers but when a meeting was called and Brigham Young arose and spoke with power, it was as if the Prophet Joseph's very voice spoke through him. I heard my father and mother when they returned from meeting testify to this, and many others since then. I believe it was the largest attended meeting ever held in Nauvoo.<sup>101</sup>

## 89. OLIVER DE MILLE

*March 30, 1830–July 8, 1908, age 14*

After talking about a minute, his voice changed to the voice of Joseph, his countenance and every appearance and motion was that of Joseph, and his language was so convincing and prophetic that it seemed to bring conviction to the hearts of all who were present. I was in the meeting and seen with my own eyes and heard with my own ears all that was said and done and know for a surety whereof I speak and I lie not.<sup>102</sup>

## 90. SIMEON ADAMS DUNN

*August 7, 1803–February 20, 1883, age 41*

Simeon returned from New York in time for the meeting on 8 Aug 1844 when the mantle of the Prophet Joseph Smith fell on Brigham Young. As Brigham Young rose to speak, the congregation saw the Prophet Joseph instead of Brigham Young, and they heard his voice as if he, himself, stood before them in life. Simeon remarked upon leaving the meeting with his family in their wagon, "They need not hunt any further. Brigham Young is the man to lead us." His daughter, Mary, never forgot her father's exact words.<sup>103</sup>

---

101. Louisa Decker, "Reminiscences of Nauvoo," *Woman's Exponent* 37 (March 1909): 41–42; Madsen, *In Their Own Words: Women and the Story of Nauvoo*, 242–43.

102. William G. Hartley, *"They Are My Friends": A History of the Joseph Knight Family, 1825–1850* (Provo, Utah: Grandin Book, 1986), 154.

103. Simeon Dunn, "Personal Journal," copied by his grand-daughter Mrs. Eva Dunn Snow in 1962. Original journal missing at present. See also "History of Simeon

91. TAMSON PARSHLY EGAN

*July 27, 1824–March 31, 1905, age 20*

After the martyrdom of the Prophet and Patriarch at the time of the return of the Twelve Apostles . . . Mother [Tamson Parshly Egan] saw Brigham Young look like Joseph and speak in his voice at a meeting held Aug. 8th, 1844 showing conclusively where the authority of leadership laid.<sup>104</sup>

LUVERA ELLEN ENSIGN

See Luvera Ellen Ensign Preece.

92. EVALINE MCLEAN FISHER

*December 25, 1805–July 19, 1893, age 38*

They [Evaline and her husband, Joseph] were in Nauvoo at the time of the martyrdom of the Prophet Joseph Smith and his brother Hyrum and supposedly was at the meeting when the mantle of the Prophet fell upon Brigham Young.<sup>105</sup>

JOSEPH FISHER

*November 25, 1801–March 21, 1867, age 43*

See Evaline McLean Fisher.

---

Adams Dunn,” [http://dkwilde.com/Genealogy/Dunn/Histories/Simeon\\_Adams\\_Dunn.htm](http://dkwilde.com/Genealogy/Dunn/Histories/Simeon_Adams_Dunn.htm).

104. Howard Ransom Egan, *Pioneering the West 1846 to 1878: Major Howard Egan's Diary*, ed. William M. Egan (Richmond, Utah: Howard R. Egan, 1917), 9, 11, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/pioneeringwest1917egan#page/8/mode/2up>. Major Howard Egan is the father of Howard Ransom Egan, who included his own autobiography in this book.

105. Lucy E. Fisher Brown, comp., “Genealogical and Historical Record of the Fisher Family,” holograph, 3, microfilm, Family History Library. Lucy is Evaline’s granddaughter.

## 93. MARY ELIZABETH GROVER

*April 13, 1833–September 28, 1921, age 11*

She then related to me a story about a meeting she attended and tried to impress upon me its importance. In fact, after she told the story once, she repeated it. . . . I am grateful now that she did repeat it, because its importance to her has stayed with me all my life. I remember it as follows:

“ . . . the prophet was dead. I attended this meeting along with several others. Several men spoke. Brigham Young got up to speak and while he was talking, his voice began to sound like the Prophet Joseph’s. His face looked like Joseph’s and all who saw this knew that Brigham Young was God’s choice to replace the Prophet Joseph as next President of the Church and none of the other men who had spoken. I saw and heard it!”

As she related this story, the tears ran down her wrinkled old face and I knew she spoke the truth.<sup>106</sup>

## 94A AND 94B. EMMELINE BLANCHE WOODWARD HARRIS

*February 29, 1828–April 25, 1921, age 16*

The people were gathered in the grove where there was a rude stand to speak from and very rude benches for the choir and others. The crowd extended through the grove and even outside the trees, many people standing in their wagon boxes, drawn up against the trees, to listen to what was going on. . . . But when Brigham Young rose in the midst of the people, most of them rose to their feet. . . . Well, we all stood on our feet, and as President Young spoke, everyone that had known the Prophet Joseph declared in a loud voice, as loud as they could, almost, that it was the Prophet Joseph himself risen again . . . that it was his voice, his manner, his clothing, himself, that stood there in the midst of the people. Of course this talking after a while subsided, and by and by most of them doubtless realized that it was Brigham Young. But it was a transfiguration real and convincing.<sup>107</sup>

I was standing in a wagon box on wheels, so I did not have to rise, but those who were seated arose and made the exclamation. I could see very well, and every one of them thought it was really the Prophet Joseph risen from the dead. But after Brigham Young had spoken a few words, the tumult

---

106. Sylvia Lola Read Thatcher, *Inspirational Experiences* (Hancock, New York: East Branch Family Press, 1989), 4.

107. “That They May Live Again,” in Carter, *Our Pioneer Heritage*, 8:198.

subsided, and the people really knew that it was not the Prophet Joseph, but the President of the quorum of the Twelve Apostles. It was the most wonderful manifestation, I think, that I have known or seen, and I have seen a very great number.<sup>108</sup>

## 95. GEORGE BARTON HICKS

*December 15, 1803–April 2, 1885, age 41*

In his journal, George Armstrong Hicks referred to his father's mantle experience:

I have heard my father [George Barton Hicks] say that he was present at the time when it is said that the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham Young. I believe it, I believe the spirit of Joseph took possession of the body of Brigham and spoke to the people through him. Brigham was the man to take the lead.<sup>109</sup>

## 96. CHARLES WESLEY HUBBARD

*February 7, 1810–December 19, 1903, age 34*

A few weeks before his death [in Willard, Utah,] he [Charles Wesley Hubbard] walked two blocks to Fast Meeting and bore his testimony in a language and spirit that held the audience in silence and attention. One of the men present said: "There was not a sound in the room other than his voice; many were in tears, the spirit was so strong as he declared he knew that Joseph Smith was a true prophet of God and that Brigham Young was the rightful successor, for he was at the meeting when the mantle fell on Brigham Young. Brigham Young looked like the prophet [Joseph], and

---

108. Emmeline B. Wells, "My Testimony," in *Faith Promoting Stories*, comp. Preston Nibley (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1943), 137. In his foreword, Nibley states, "The stories contained in this volume have been selected with care from books and periodicals on file in the Church Historians Library."

109. Davis Bitton, "'I'd Rather Have Some Roasting Ears': The Peregrinations of George Armstrong Hicks," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 68, no. 3 (2000): 201. This article is based on the history of George Armstrong Hicks written by him in 1878, which is still held in his family and which Bitton examined meticulously. George Armstrong Hicks, *Family Record and History of George Armstrong Hicks* (n.p.: Kerry J. Zabriskie, 1995), 11.

no one who was present could ever doubt that Brigham Young was called of God.”<sup>110</sup>

## 97. EDWARD HUNTER

*June 22, 1793–October 16, 1883, age 51*

“I went to the meeting that had been called and listened thoughtfully to what was said and done. The longer I listened the more mystified I became. I bowed my head in my hands and prayed for God to give me understanding. While I was in this attitude, Brother Brigham rose to speak, I suppose. I heard a voice—the Prophet’s [Joseph’s] voice as natural and true as I ever heard it. I raised up quickly, fully expecting to see the Prophet [Joseph], and I did. There he stood and gradually changed to that of Brother Brigham, but the voice was not Brother Brigham’s. It was still the Prophet’s [Joseph’s]. Then beside Brother Brigham I saw the Prophet [Joseph], who turned toward the speaker and smiled. My heart beat rapidly with joy and I know beyond the shadow of a doubt that Brother Brigham was called of God to lead the Church.”

Others of the assembled Saints received the same remarkable manifestation; and when a vote was called for, the Council of the Twelve was unanimously sustained as the ruling body of the Church.<sup>111</sup>

## 98. JOSEPH ELLIS JOHNSON

*April 28, 1817–December 17, 1882, age 27*

During the dismal days following the murders of Joseph and Hyrum, JEJ [Joseph Ellis Johnson] and others of the family lived through the grief, fears, uncertainties and confusion into which all had been plunged. They were present when Sidney Rigdon voiced his plea to be named Guardian of the Church, which fell on unresponsive ears. They also saw Brigham Young rise to begin his speech and they declared that they witnessed a miracle. As he began to speak his voice suddenly became that of the slain prophet,

---

110. *A Record of Charles W. Hubbard and Descendants, 1810–1955* (privately printed, 1956), 13. Ouida Blanthorn, a great-granddaughter of Charles, provided this source.

111. William E. Hunter, *Edward Hunter: Faithful Steward*, ed. Janath Russell Cannon (n.p.: Mrs. William E. Hunter, 1970), 79.



and they and the audience were electrified by the change in his appearance which became that of Joseph Smith. So lifelike was he that BFJ [Benjamin F. Johnson] said he jumped to his feet in amazement and awe. They with the others of the congregation, convinced that the mantle of the prophet had fallen upon Brigham, voted to sustain him as leader of the Church. Later the rejected Sidney Rigdon, who was really a brilliant man in many ways, apostatized and formed a small church organization in Pittsburg, Pa.<sup>112</sup>

#### 99. SOPHRONIA ELDRIDGE CORBITT STOWELL KELLEY

*July 22, 1825–January 24, 1907, age 19*

Mother [Sophronia] was present when the cornerstone of the Nauvoo Temple was laid. She had seen the Prophet Joseph Smith and heard him talk many times. She was present when Brigham Young, as President of the Quorum of Twelve Apostles, assumed leadership of the Church. She has testified many times that he was transfigured and appeared both in voice and general appearance to be the Prophet Joseph himself.<sup>113</sup>

#### 100. MARTHA MCBRIDE KNIGHT

*March 17, 1805–November 1, 1901, age 39*

She [Martha] often told her grandchildren of the cruel martyrdom of the prophet, the sorrowing of the Saints and the solemn services; her witnessing the form of Brigham Young change to the person of Joseph Smith, and Brigham's voice ringing out in the tone of Joseph's voice, declaring him the leader of the wondering Saints.<sup>114</sup>

---

112. Rufus David Johnson, J. E. J. [*Joseph Ellis Johnson*]: *Trail to Sundown* ([Salt Lake City]: Deseret News Press, 1961), 90. The book was written from personal recollections. Rufus was the last of Joseph's twenty-nine children. See also "True to the Faith," in Carter, *Our Pioneer Heritage*, 15:230–31.

113. Martha S. Hill, "Immigrant Pioneer Women," in *An Enduring Legacy*, comp. Lesson Committee, 12 vols. (Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1977–89), 9:86. Martha is Sophronia's daughter.

114. Florence R. Ellison, "Martha McBride Knight," in *Historical Pamphlet*, 1942, comp. Kate B. Carter (Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1942), 242; see also Martha McBride Knight, in "Biographies of the Belnap and Knight Families," 18, Perry Special Collections, copy in the possession of Della Belnap of Ogden, Utah.

101. SAMUEL KNIGHT

*October 14, 1832–February 11, 1910, age 12*

Another incident I have heard him [Samuel Knight] narrate was when the succession to the presidency of the Church, after the martyrdom, was being discussed, and he was in attendance at the meeting. As a small boy, perhaps playing with his marbles or otherwise passing the time, he was surprised to hear what he thought was the voice of Joseph Smith. He [Samuel] arose in astonishment and beheld the transfiguration of Brigham Young as related in Church History.<sup>115</sup>

JAMES LAKE

*October 17, 1788–October 7, 1874, age 55*

See Philomela Smith Lake.

102. PHILOMELA SMITH LAKE

*April 13, 1794–March 20, 1873, age 50*

After the awful scene at Nauvoo, when they saw the forms of the Prophets they had loved so well laid in the grave, they sought a testimony from God as to their future procedure, and this testimony they received at the great meeting held in the grove at Nauvoo, Aug. 8, 1844, where they witnessed the sublime personality of Joseph Smith as it cast its mantle of splendor around the chosen form of Brigham Young, he being transformed before the eyes of the people, as a heavenly witness to them that God had caused the Majesty of His High Priesthood to fall upon “whom he would,” that His work might continue. Father and Mother Lake received that testimony and took up their march again with the Saints.<sup>116</sup>

---

115. Arthur Knight Hafen, “History of Samuel Knight,” 1960; copy in the possession of author. Arthur is a grandson of Samuel.

116. Jenson, *Biographical Encyclopedia*, 2:389. This narrative is related by Philomela’s granddaughter Samantha T. B. Foley.

## 103. DUDLEY LEAVITT

*August 31, 1830–October 15, 1908, age 13*

It was not until Brigham Young and a number of the Twelve had returned that a public meeting was held to determine the successor to Joseph Smith.

All the Leavitt family were present on that occasion, August 8, 1844, for, to them, this was a matter of great importance. Fourteen-year-old Dudley was with his friends near the back of the large audience which had gathered to hear the talks of the authorities. . . . Brigham Young arose to speak. . . .

On the edge of the crowd, Dudley whispered to some of his companions. Suddenly they all stopped and listened. It was their Prophet Joseph speaking! How well they knew his accents. They raised up and looked toward the stand. For a second, they thought it was the Prophet who stood there. But they knew it was not, and soon the vision passed. It was so real to Dudley that it made a lasting impression. For him, the mantle of Joseph had in reality fallen upon Brigham. As long as he lived he loved to re-tell the incident.<sup>117</sup>

## 104. JEREMIAH LEAVITT

*May 30, 1796–August 20, 1846, age 48*

Sarah Studevant Leavitt (September 5, 1799–April 5, 1878, age 45), Jeremiah's wife, wrote:

When the news came the whole city of Nauvoo was thunderstruck. Oh such mourning and lamentation. . . . There were many, myself among them, that would gladly give our lives in place of his, if his life could have been spared in so doing. I never had spoken to Joseph Smith in my life. My husband, Jeremiah, had, but I had heard him preach and I had seen him and knew that he was a Prophet of God. He had been sent here to set up his Kingdom upon the Earth. I knew that the God of Heaven was back of this latter day Kingdom, and I knew that it never could be thrown down by mortal man.

As I looked around me in despair, I wondered how that great work was to be accomplished. The answer was not long in coming. My husband, Jeremiah, was attending a meeting where this question was being discussed. Brigham

---

117. Juanita [Leavitt] Brooks, *Dudley Leavitt: Pioneer to Southern Utah* (n.p., 1942), 9, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/dudleyleavitt/pio00broo#page/8/mode/2up>. Juanita is a granddaughter of Dudley. In her foreword, Brooks writes, "In 1933 I began collecting the diaries and journals of pioneers of the southwest. In many of them I found references to Dudley Leavitt. These, with the material from the family records, have formed the basis of this work."

Young was speaking when suddenly he seemed to be clothed with all the authority of Joseph Smith. Jeremiah said that he had the same appearance, the same voice, as the Prophet. If he had not known that Joseph Smith was dead, he would have thought that Brigham Young was Joseph Smith. Tears dampened many cheeks. Joy and gladness filled many hearts. The Lord had not forgotten his people. Brigham Young was absent in the east when Joseph and Hyrum Smith had been killed. Sidney Rigdon tried hard to take Joseph Smith's place and assume the Presidency of the Church, but his lies and deceit were proven by the Twelve Apostles, that returned about this time. And also by the incident I have just related. After that there was no one to doubt that Brigham Young was to be our new leader and Prophet. If Brigham had any doubts, my husband Jeremiah did not. From that moment on he was our Prophet and our leader.<sup>118</sup>

#### 105. ESTHER MELETA JOHNSON LeBARON

*January 12, 1828–March 15, 1874, age 16*

Esther Meleta was at the meeting in August 1844, when Brigham Young was transfigured before the audience. She said Sidney Rigdon had spoke long and tried to convince the people that he was the rightful leader of the Church. When Brigham Young arose and began to speak, he was changed so that he looked like the Prophet Joseph Smith and his voice and manner of speech was the same so when the Saints saw this change there was no doubt as to who should lead the Church, the President of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles with Brigham Young as the Prophet.<sup>119</sup>

#### 106. JOHN DOYLE LEE

*September 6, 1812–March 23, 1877, age 31*

Time passed on until the whole twelve got in from their missions, and a conference was held, and the several claimants came forward with their claims. Sidney Rigdon was the first who appeared upon the stand. He had been

---

118. Sarah Studevant Leavitt, "Autobiography of Sarah Studevant Leavitt, April 19, 1875," rev. Joseph Page Leavitt, April 12, 1978, typescript, 18–19, Family History Library. Joseph is a grandson of Sarah. See also "Courageous Pioneers," in Carter, *Our Pioneer Heritage*, 7:246.

119. Dollene LeBaron Noson, "Esther Meleta Johnson LeBaron," essay for the Daughters of Utah Pioneers, Daughters of Utah Pioneers Library and Archives, copy in possession of the author. Dollene is a granddaughter of Esther.

considered rather in the back-ground for sometime previous to the death of the Prophet. He made but a weak claim. Strong (Strang) did not file any. Just them [*sic*] Brigham Young arose and roared like a young lion, imitating the style and voice of Joseph, the Prophet. Many of the brethren declared that they saw the mantle of Joseph fall upon him. I myself, at the time, imagined that I saw and heard a strong resemblance to the Prophet in him, and felt that he was the man to lead us until Joseph's legal successor should grow up to manhood, when he should surrender the Presidency to the man who held the birthright.<sup>120</sup>

#### 107. ALZINA LUCINDA LOTT

*March 4, 1834–August 18, 1910, age 10*

A special meeting was called, to be held on Thursday, August 8, 1844. The members of the church were all urged to be in attendance. Among others, Brigham Young addressed the great multitude of Saints assembled there. He spoke with great power. When he first arose to speak the saints were greatly astonished. President Young stood transfigured before them, and they beheld the Prophet Joseph Smith, and heard his voice as plainly as ever they did when he was living among them. Cornelius and Permelia Lott were among the saints gathered there. Alzina Lott, their young daughter 11 years of age turned to her mother and said "Mama, I thought the Prophet was dead". Her mother answered and said "He is Alzina, and this is the way our Heavenly Father has told us who is to be our next leader and Prophet."<sup>121</sup>

---

120. John Doyle Lee, *Mormonism Unveiled; or, The Life and Confessions of the Late Mormon Bishop, John D. Lee* (St. Louis: Bryan and Brand, 1877), 155, on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/mormonismunveile00le#page/154/mode/2up>; see also Juanita Brooks, *John Doyle Lee: Zealot, Pioneer Builder, Scapegoat* (Glendale, Calif.: Arthur H. Clark, 1962), 63. Historian D. Michael Quinn considers Lee's statement as an important witness that Lee had a mystical mantle experience. Quinn states, "John D. Lee's bitter rejection of Brigham Young in later life actually verified the honesty of Mormons who waited years before speaking and writing about Young's transfiguration." Quinn, *Mormon Hierarchy*, 167. When considering the timing of the mantle experience, one should note that Lee did not arrive in Nauvoo until August 20, 1844, according to his diary. Because of controversy surrounding the publication of Lee's memoirs and because his original manuscript is not available, I have included this account with the secondhand testimonies.

121. Rhea Lott Vance, "Descendants of Cornelius Peter Lott, 1798–1972," typescript, 10–11, Genealogical Society of Utah, Salt Lake City, available on The

## PERMELIA DARROW LOTT

December 15, 1805–January 6, 1882, age 30

See Alzina Lucinda Lott

## 108. AMASA MASON LYMAN

March 30, 1813–February 4, 1877, age 31

He [Amasa Lyman] was not blinded with foolish ambition. He had recognized the true ring of authority in the voice of Brigham Young. . . .

“I do not rise to electioneer,” he declared, wanting the Saints to know at once that he was making no claims to leadership. . . . “I have been at the back of Joseph Smith and I will be at the back of the Twelve forever, and then I will be saved.”

. . . Being awake with “his lamp trimmed and burning” at that momentous occasion, he was able with thousands of Latter-day Saints to see the splendid and undisputed manifestation of the power of God in presenting Brigham Young before the Saints as the martyred Prophet, for Brigham spoke with the Prophet’s voice and appeared so nearly like the martyred leader that many of the people thought it was really Joseph Smith, and in this way they were shown clearly that the Prophet’s mantle had fallen on Brigham Young.<sup>122</sup>

## 109. HORACE MURDOCK

December 24, 1824–May 1, 1915, age 19

After the martyrdom of the Prophet Joseph Smith, the presidency of the Church developed upon the quorum of the Apostles, and President Brigham Young stood at their head as captain and file leader, to carry out

---

Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE184822](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE184822).

122. Albert R. Lyman, *Amasa Mason Lyman: Trailblazer and Pioneer from the Atlantic to the Pacific*, ed. Melvin A. Lyman (Delta, Utah: Melvin A. Lyman, 1957), 118–20. Amasa Lyman became a counselor to Joseph Smith just before Joseph’s death. Elder Lyman was asked by Brigham Young to present his case at the August 8 meeting to be considered as Joseph’s successor. This rather florid account is based, according to the authors, on information from Amasa Lyman, *Journals*, 23 vols., Church History Library. However, source checkers could find nothing in the journals other than the statement that Lyman spent the day with the brethren, so this account of the transfiguration may come from other family sources.

the plans that had been designated by the Prophet Joseph. There were many hundreds, perhaps thousands, present at the meeting held in the grove near the Temple at Nauvoo, in August, 1844, when President Young was recognized by miraculous manifestation as the leader of the Church, and they have testified it was evident that the mantle of Joseph the Prophet fell upon him. . . . I had a letter recently from Brothers Horace and John R. Murdoch of Beaver, who testify that they were eyewitness to the wonderful transformation and power manifested through President Brigham Young on that occasion [when the mantle of the Prophet Joseph fell upon him].<sup>123</sup>

#### 110A AND 110B. JOHN RIGGS MURDOCK

*September 13, 1826–November 12, 1913, age 17*

It was the greatest manifestation I ever beheld, for the voice, the gesture, the whole appearance of President Young was just exactly as if the Prophet Joseph stood there in person.<sup>124</sup>

I had a letter recently from Brothers Horace and John R. Murdoch of Beaver, who testify that they were eyewitness to the wonderful transformation and power manifested through President Brigham Young on that occasion [when the mantle of the Prophet Joseph fell upon him].<sup>125</sup>

#### 111. WILLIAM NEELEY

*August 29, 1830–January 24, 1913, age 14*

Our Grandfather, William Neeley, then 14 years old, was at that meeting, and many, many times throughout his life, he told of the things he witnessed upon that occasion, when the Mantle of the Prophet fell upon Brigham Young. William's children and grandchildren have heard him tell of that meeting; as he recited the events of that day,—he and his father were seated in the congregation, when suddenly they were startled to hear the

---

123. Seymour B. Young, in *Seventy-Sixth Annual Conference of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints* (Salt Lake City: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1906), 12.

124. J. M. Tanner, *A Biographical Sketch of John Riggs Murdock* (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Press, 1909), 71, available on *Internet Archive*, <https://archive.org/stream/abiographicalsk02tanngoog#page/n84/mode/2up>. This biography was written in 1909 by Tanner, a friend of John Riggs Murdock for many years, and was read to Murdock for his approval. See also Barlow, *Israel Barlow Story*, 204.

125. Young, in *Seventy-Sixth Annual Conference*, 12.

voice of the Prophet Joseph Smith. Looking up, they saw him standing in the pulpit; in a moment the vision had passed, and Brigham Young stood before them;—but there was not a single soul in that meting who doubted that Brigham Young was to carry on the work that Joseph Smith had begun.<sup>126</sup>

#### 112. LUCY ANNA OLNEY

*December 28, 1830–November 16, 1909, age 14*

I heard the Prophet Joseph Smith preach on many occasions. I saw and heard him when he made his farewell address to the Nauvoo Legion. I saw the body of our beloved Prophet after he was martyred. The one thing I remember very plainly was his sword which hung on the wall.

I was present when Brigham Young spoke to the saints and the mantle of the Prophet Joseph Smith fell upon him, for his voice and appearance were that of the Prophet and we felt and knew that he was the one to lead the Church.<sup>127</sup>

#### 113. JAMES CLARK OWENS

*July 7, 1832–February 1, 1901, age 12*

With his parents he passed through the trials and drivings of the Saints, first in Missouri and afterwards in Illinois. . . . attended the conference at Nauvoo, Aug. 8, 1844, and remembered how Brigham Young was transformed in the eyes of the people.<sup>128</sup>

#### 114. JAMES PALMER

*August 6, 1820–October 6, 1905, age 24*

Brigham Young, the President of the Twelve Apostles, came to the front and stated in a public meeting that the Twelve in their organized capacity

---

126. Meltrude Hunsaker Stohl, Orpha H. Stohl, and Harriet Strong Spiers, “Lewis Neeley Sr. Biography,” courtesy International Society of Daughters of Utah Pioneers. See also Alice Neeley Moncur, ed., *History of Lewis Neeley, Sr. (1805–1857) and William Neeley (1830–1913) and Other Family Stories* (n.p., 1978), 16.

127. Colleen Bauman, “Family History,” which includes Lucy Anna Olney journal notes, in possession of the author. See also “Alvin Nichols, Utah Pioneer 1819–1899,” typescript, 60, Genealogical Society of Utah, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE111156](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE111156).

128. Jenson, *Biographical Encyclopedia*, 3:191.



had the authority and the legal right to preside over the Church in all the world. As he was speaking in a public meeting, the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham and it was as if the Prophet were speaking. It was truly the voice of the Prophet, and it seemed to be the Prophet in person! It was a convincing and a remarkable demonstration of the power of God unto His people. In the minds of the faithful there was now no further question about who our rightful leader was, and this was acknowledged by the main body of the people. Those who did not accept this order of things went their own way.<sup>129</sup>

### 115. ELIZA ANN PERRY

*March 20, 1828–May 13, 1913, age 16*

After Eliza Ann Perry arrived in Nauvoo, she met the Prophet, Joseph Smith, and became well acquainted with him. Eliza Ann was a member of the Nauvoo Choir. She also contributed to the purchase of glass for the windows of the Nauvoo Temple. She was present at the meeting called by Sidney Rigdon to choose a guardian for the church. In her diary she said, and I quote, “Suddenly, Joseph came on the stand to all appearance. But, the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham Young, his voice, the color of his hair, his general appearance. People raised from their seats enmass and exclaimed, ‘Joseph has come! He is here!’ Then they knew that Brigham was the man to lead these people.”<sup>130</sup>

---

129. James Palmer, *James Palmer’s Travels and Ministry in the Gospel*, ed. Fannie Palmer (n.p.: Fannie Palmer Gleave, 1963), 61. Fannie is a daughter of James. In Palmer’s holograph account, he is less specific: “Brigham Young, the President of the Twelve Apostles came to the front and claimed that the Twelve in their organized capacity had the legal right to preside over the Church in all the world and their rights were acknowledged by the main body of the people.” James Palmer, “Journal: James Palmer’s Travels and Ministry in the Gospel,” holograph, 80, Church History Library, on *Church History Library*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE3234339](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE3234339), image 96.

130. Donald Benson Alder and Elsie L. Alder, comps., *The Benson Family: The Ancestry and Descendants of Ezra T. Benson* (Salt Lake City: Ezra T. Benson Genealogical Society, 1979), 151, which was written from diaries, records, letters, histories, and interviews from family members. This section is quoted from Eliza Perry’s diary. Donald is a great-grandson of Eliza’s husband Ezra T. Benson through a different wife.

## 116. LUVERA ELLEN ENSIGN PREECE

*June 24, 1826–June 14, 1898, age 18*

[On] August 8, 1844, she [Luvera] was at the meeting, called to appoint the new leader of the church, and witnessed the mantle of Joseph Smith cover Brigham Young as he talked to the assembled saints.<sup>131</sup>

## 117. CLARISSA MARINA [TAGGART] ROGERS

*1836–April 8, 1901, age 8*

As a child, she [Clarissa] remembered the terrible gloom and sorrow that swept over the city of the saints when the Prophet and his brother were killed at Carthage. She remembered passing through the Prophet's Mansion House and viewing their dead bodies. She remembered the sorrow they all felt. She went to the meeting afterwards and saw the mantle of the Prophet Joseph Smith fall upon Brigham Young as he was speaking. I have heard her bear her testimony to the congregation at Sunday School in Richville, Morgan County, Utah pertaining to this.<sup>132</sup>

## 118. RACHEL SMITH ROSS

*August 22, 1813–December 21, 1900, age 31*

When the meeting was held to select a successor to the Prophet, grandfather took the family in a covered wagon with a bed made in it for grandmother who was ill at the time. The meeting being held in a bowery, they could sit in the wagon and listen. Grandmother said, "When Brother Brigham arose and began to speak, his voice was exactly the same as that of the Prophet. I got out of my bed to see, and his appearance was also the same as the

---

131. Lucy Preece Stewart, "Biography Sketch of Luvera Ellen Ensign Preece," typescript, 2, Margaret Steed Hess Pioneer Histories Collection, Perry Special Collections, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, <https://familysearch.org/photos/artifacts/23581671>. Lucy is a daughter of Luvera. Margaret Hess is noted as "Camp Historian."

132. Valeria Laird Taggart, "A Tribute to My Husband's Mother (Clarissa M. R. Taggart)," quoted in Eileen Taggart Robinson, "George Washington Taggart, 1816–1893," typescript, 4, Genealogical Society of Utah, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE200798](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE200798).

Prophet and we knew he was the one to fill the vacancy and that the Lord had not forgotten his people.”

“The mantle of Joseph Smith, our Prophet, truly had fallen upon Brigham Young, one of the most wonderful testimonies ever given.”

This happened just a few months prior to the birth of my mother, Mary Elizabeth Ross Parker who was born March 4, 1845, just nine months after the death of the Prophet Joseph Smith and his brother Hyrum, 27 June, 1844.<sup>133</sup>

### 119. JANE WADLEY SMITH

*January 2, 1814–May 22, 1888, age 30*

Mother and father were present at the meeting when the mantle of Joseph Smith fell on Brigham Young. She said Brigham Young was not present at the meeting when it started, but he had been called back from a mission because of the martyrdom of the Prophet Joseph and his brother, Hyrum. Brigham Young came up from the boat and took his place on the stand. Mother had leaned over her baby and just then Brigham Young started to speak. She said she raised up suddenly because she heard what she believed was the Prophet’s [Joseph’s] voice, although she knew he was dead. This thoroughly convinced them that he was the successor to Joseph Smith, chosen of God.<sup>134</sup>

### 120. JOHN SIVEL SMITH

*March 10, 1809–February 12, 1905, age 35*

He [John] was present when the Prophet Joseph Smith delivered his last address to the Nauvoo Legion, and he also attended the memorably [sic] meeting held at Nauvoo August 8, 1844, when the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham Young. He often testified that Brigham Young was the Lord’s chosen prophet.<sup>135</sup>

---

133. Ella Parker Ogden, comp., *Descendants of Thomas Bryant Parker and Thomas Ross* (Salt Lake City: By the author, 1965), 253.

134. Harriet Smith and Leona L. Adams, “History of Jane Wadley Smith,” *John Sivel Smith Family Newsletter*, no. 1 (January 28, 1965): 5, microfiche, Family History Library, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE2004048](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE2004048).

135. Mary Smith Steed Porter, “Brief History of John Sivel Smith,” *John Sivel Smith Family Newsletter*, no. 1 (January 28, 1965): 3. See also Jenson, *Biographical Encyclopedia*, 3:241–42.

## 121A AND 121B. JAMES CHAUNCEY SNOW

*January 11, 1817–April 30, 1884, age 27*

He [James C. Snow] was present at the meeting August 8, when Brigham Young spoke with great power, reminding the people that the Church was the Church of Jesus Christ. . . . All the powers of the Priesthood were vested in the Twelve until a new Presidency should be nominated by them through the spirit of revelation and sustained by the vote of the people. Both James and Warren [brothers] saw the mantle of Joseph fall upon Brigham Young as he spoke, an event of which they both often testified afterwards, and they were convinced that Brigham Young was to be their leader.<sup>136</sup>

Bro. Snow, together with other missionaries, was called home shortly after the martyrdom, and he was present at the meeting when the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham Young—an event of which he often testified afterwards.<sup>137</sup>

## SALLY ADAMS SNOW

See Sally Adams.

## 122. WILLIAM STOKER

*March 26, 1819–May 19, 1892, age 25*

From the age of six, he [Bishop W. E. Stoker] was raised by his grandfather [William Stoker], who knew the Prophet Joseph Smith personally and was present when the Mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham Young, and received a personal testimony. Bishop Stoker felt he owed much to his grandfather for building up his faith through the relating of this Church experience.<sup>138</sup>

## 123. PLEASANT GREEN TAYLOR

*February 8, 1827–May 16, 1917, age 17*

After the death of Joseph the question arose as to who should lead the church. The twelve apostles being away on missions. Sidney Rigdon claimed

---

136. Archibald F. Bennett, Ella M. Bennett, and Barbara Bennett Roach, *Valiant in the Faith: Gardner and Sarah Snow and Their Family* (Murray, Utah: Roylance, 1990), 56.

137. Jenson, *Biographical Encyclopedia*, 1:794–95.

138. Ruth J. Martin, comp, “Biography of Bishop William Ervin Stoker,” *Twentieth Ward History, 1856–1979*, 69, microfilm, Family History Library.

the right to lead the church though his claim was not looked on with favor by the majority of the Saints. He was present and saw Brigham Young come into the bowery where the Saints had assembled. He, as well as hundreds of others, arose to his feet and felt sure that Joseph had been resurrected. And even after Brigham began to speak he still thought it was the Prophet Joseph who was speaking to them.<sup>139</sup>

#### 124. MARTHA TUTTLE

*1830–1922, age 14*

I well remember the Sunday morning the sorrowing Saints were gathered together in the little Grove where they were accustomed to meet. Sidney Rigdon presented his claim as successor to the Prophet Joseph making quite an impression upon the people. But Brigham Young, Pres. of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles, had just arrived in Nauvoo from his mission in time to attend the afternoon meeting. In a voice not unlike that of the Prophet Joseph, [Brigham] told the people that although Joseph was dead, Joseph had left behind the keys of the Kingdom and had conferred the same power and authority that he himself possessed upon the Twelve Apostles and the church would not be left without a leader and a guide. Truly the mantle of Joseph had fallen upon Brigham and he spake with power even to the convincing of the Saints, assuring them they had nothing to worry about as all would be well if they would hearken to the word of God and The council of his servants and keep His Commandments.<sup>140</sup>

#### 125. PETER EDMUND VAN ORDEN

*January 27, 1830–September 25, 1911, age 14*

Peter remembers that after the Prophet's funeral, Sidney Rigdon, came and claimed the right to rule the Church. He held a meeting and talked to the people about it, asking them to return later to make a decision. It was at this later meeting that Brigham Young spoke and the Mantle of the Prophet

---

139. Levi James Taylor, "Pleasant Green Taylor Family Records," typescript, 6, Church History Library. Levi is a son of Pleasant. See also Fred G. Taylor, "Pleasant Green Taylor," in *Outlines of Study, 1942–43*, comp. Kate B. Carter ([Salt Lake City]: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, n.d.), 255–56.

140. Martha Tuttle, quoted in Opal Jackman Harper, Notebook, in possession of Steven Harper, published in Steven C. Harper, ed., "A Testimony Written by Martha Tuttle Gardner," *Nauvoo Journal* 7, no. 2 (Fall 1995): 57–59.

fell over his shoulders. The people knew this was their sign that Brigham was to be their leader. Peter witnessed this event and bore testimony of it until his dying day.<sup>141</sup>

#### 126A AND 126B. HENSON WALKER

*March 13, 1820–January 24, 1904, age 24*

At the death of Joseph Smith, Brigham Young who was President of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles, assumed the leadership of the Church. Sidney Rigdon, one of the counselors to Joseph in the Presidency, felt it was his right to take the place. Henson was present at the public meeting held in the bowery at which both Sidney and Brigham spoke. Sidney Rigdon made his claims first. Henson said that Brother Rigdon was an eloquent speaker and made a forceful appeal to the people. When he finished Brigham Young arose to speak. In the words of Henson, “The mantle of Joseph Smith fell upon Brigham Young and the congregation knew who their leader was. He looked like the Prophet Joseph and the tone of his voice was like his.”<sup>142</sup>

Henson was present at the time that Sidney Rigdon set forth his claims to the presidency. He also witnessed the mantle of Joseph resting upon Brigham Young and was fully convinced that he was the future Prophet of God.<sup>143</sup>

#### 127. ABRAHAM DANIEL WASHBURN

*March 17, 1805–June 17, 1886, age 39*

Abraham sometimes related incidents from the trying times when the people were overcome by persecution and grief at the time of the martyrdom of their beloved leader Joseph and his brother Hyrum. Abraham was at the meeting when the mantle of Joseph fell upon Brigham.<sup>144</sup>

---

141. “Peter Edmund Van Orden 1830–1911,” 2, Van Orden Family Archives, in the possession of Bruce Van Orden, Springville, Utah. This was recorded by an unnamed grandchild of Peter after listening to many of Peter’s accounts.

142. Jennie Walker Johnson, “Biography of Henson Walker Jr.,” 48, microfilm, Family History Library, available on The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *FamilySearch*, [https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps\\_pid=IE520538](https://dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE520538).

143. Jensen, *Biographical Encyclopedia*, 1:509.

144. Ella Larsen Turner, *The Ancestors and Descendants of Abraham Daniel Washburn and His Wife Flora Clarinda Gleason* (Provo, Utah: By the author, 1963), 21.

ELIZA BILLINGTON WELCH

See Eliza Billington.

EMMELINE BLANCHE WOODWARD HARRIS WHITNEY WELLS

See Emmeline Blanche Woodward Harris.

128. WILLIAM WEST WOODLAND

*January 2, 1832–February 19, 1906, age 12*

[William] accompanied his parents through all the drivings that took place in the early days of the Church and was exposed to the many spiritual manifestations that happened . . . even as a youth witness to the grand experience of the mantle of the Prophet Joseph falling upon Brigham Young after the death of the Prophet Joseph. This did more to influence him in future years than most any other experience.<sup>145</sup>

129. SAMUEL AMOS WOOLLEY

*September 11, 1825–March 23, 1900, age 18*

During the troublous times of 1844 I served as a city guard in Nauvoo. After the martyrdom of Joseph and Hyrum Smith I was present at the important meeting where Pres. Brigham Young first spoke to the Saints of Joseph's death, and I received a testimony that the mantle of Joseph had fallen upon Brigham Young's shoulder, for when he spoke it seemed as if Joseph himself were speaking, his voice and gestures being exactly like those of the martyred Prophet.<sup>146</sup>

---

145. Mary W. Fox and Daniel P. Woodland, "Life of William West Woodland," typescript copy in the possession of John W. Welch. Daniel is a son of William.

146. Jenson, *Biographical Encyclopedia*, 1:781–82. See also Florence Woolley Russell, "History of Samuel Amos Woolley, Pioneer of 1848," 2, Church History Library. Florence is a daughter of Samuel.

## Appendix

### Minutes of Brigham Young's Remarks at the Morning Meeting, August 8, 1844

Skeptics have implied that Thomas Bullock's curious shorthand minutes from the meeting of August 8, 1844, have not been transcribed and made available to historians or general researchers because this text has material that would prove embarrassing to mantle advocates. The following minutes were transcribed in August 1997 at the request of BYU Studies editors and were provided by the Church History Library.<sup>1</sup>

#### Literal Transcription

Pres Young: If I can make the people hear I want their attention a few minutes      be perfectly still [--?] you can't hear      in the first place I have not asked any man or woman for their following      I feel much better than a shiprat and can refrain from weeping      [three words crossed out: I have not] I rise to [said/set/st/sd] to this congregation about their support of being in a hurry to transact business here      [where/we're/who] are [in/

---

1. Transcription by LaJean Purcell Carruth in August 1997, provided by Church History Library, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City. Bullock's minutes were written in Taylor shorthand, a very rudimentary shorthand developed by Samuel Taylor in 1786. This shorthand has no vowels, except a dot may be used to indicate a strong vowel at the beginning or end of a word; this, however, does not indicate which vowel is intended. Words where the transcription is uncertain are indicated by square brackets [ ]. At times the transcriber has included two or more possibilities when it is impossible to determine the most likely one. Taylor does not include any punctuation: the end of a sentence is shown only by a longer space between words, and is often difficult to determine. The transcriber has preserved these spaces. Many sentences are incomplete, some just fragmented phrases, as the recorder apparently struggled to keep up with the speaker.



any] laboring under a mistake I am sorry that the [three letters written out: LLS/LDS?] should be in a hurry and as there has been a meeting called for this day to choose for themselves an agent not knowing what has been we have ----- a meeting for next [letter written out: T] I wanted to sit weep for 30 days before the priesthood to business but there is a spirit who shall be greatest in our midst and it will be foiled by that Jehovah and all things will be made right

we are surrounded by enemies come [tkr] this afternoon at 2 and there will be no meeting on [written out: T.] it is not the feelings of my brethren in the name of the people I say we will have a meeting [at two/here] show our hands my private feelings might always bend for the public good the [kmstrts] [west/would] be in that [letter/later/elder] for the general good of all and in regard to the question why [poor/brother] [written out: J.S.] [has been?] in a hurry I [now/no] know for myself and I wish I would hear from every [written out: E. H. O.] and all I want to know where every brother and sister were that [would/will] submit to the organization that is [b/p rt-- tl/tion] a plan the question is asked who will take [written out: J] place he keeps it himself let every man stand in his own place and all will [be peace and harmony] gather together all men and there we can transact business right and when we can get all things right we can [tell you about?] it I want to know what is in them I will [now?] want every man in his [trntl/trntion?] awake up at his post and all things will be right I will say to our brethren the [two letters written out: HC] take their seats by themselves [written out: PM] take his seat here in this seat it will be proper and right for every man be in his place [br.] [letter written out: R] come and take his seat at our right hand then other [letters written out: H.C. then the LB] the other persons in their place this will be the right way [words on fold of paper illegible] resolves and we can do the things [several words on fold of paper illegible] [--] as well as we are we are not going to act against every other and every man and woman will [written out: Amen] meeting to be [end of document]

## Edited Transcription

Pres Young: If I can make the people hear, I want their attention a few minutes. Be perfectly still, or you can't hear.

In the first place, I have not asked any man or woman for their following. I feel [not] much better than a shiprat and can [hardly] refrain from weeping. I have not. I rise to [speak] to this congregation about their support.

Of being in a hurry to transact business here. Where are any laboring under a mistake. I am sorry that the LDS should be in a hurry as there has been a meeting called for this day to choose for themselves an agent not knowing what has been [scheduled]. We have a meeting [scheduled] for next T[uesday]. I wanted to sit [and] weep for 30 days before the priesthood [took up] business, but there is a spirit who shall be greatest in our midst and it will be foiled by that Jehovah and all things will be made right.

We are surrounded by enemies. Come [together] this afternoon at 2 and there will be no meeting on T[uesday]. It is not the feelings of my brethren. In the name of the people I say we will have a meeting at two. [We will] show our hands.

My private feelings might always bend for the public good. The [kmstrts] would be in that [leader] for the general good of all.

And in regard to the question why [brother] J.S. [has been?] in a hurry. I now know for myself.

And I wish I would hear from every E. H. O. and all. I want to know where every brother and sister are that will submit to the organization that is [?] a plan.

The question is asked, Who will take J[oseph's] place? He keeps it himself.

Let every man stand in his own place and all will be [in] peace and harmony.

Gather together all men and there we can transact business right. And when we can get all things right, we can [tell you about?] it. I want to know what is in them. I will [now?] want every man in his [?] awake up at his post and all things will be right.

I will say to our brethren. The H[igh] C[ouncil] take their seats by themselves. PM take his seat here in this seat. It will be proper and right for every man [to] be in his place. Brother R[igdon] come and take his seat at our right hand. Then other H.C. then the L.B. The other persons in their place. This will be the right way.

resolves and we can do the things

as well as we are

we are not going to act against every other, and every man and woman will Amen.

Meeting to be