



DALARNA
UNIVERSITY

Degree Thesis

Bachelor's level (First cycle)

Censorship in video games: a comparative case study of *EarthBound* and *Mother 2*

Author: Santeri Lehtinen
School: Dalarna University
Supervisor: Hiroko Inose
Examiner: Herbert Jonsson
Subject/main field of study: Japanese
Course code: GJP23Y
Credits: 15 credits
Date of examination: 02.06.2023

At Dalarna University it is possible to publish the student thesis in full text in DiVA. The publishing is Open Access, which means the work will be freely accessible to read and download on the internet. This will significantly increase the dissemination and visibility of the student thesis.

Open Access is becoming the standard route for spreading scientific and academic information on the internet. Dalarna University recommends that both researchers as well as students publish their work Open Access.

I give my/we give our consent for full text publishing (freely accessible on the internet, Open Access):

Yes

No

Abstract:

This study examines the censorship guidelines and translation techniques used in the localization of *Mother 2* (1994) (English title: *EarthBound*), a video game developed originally by Nintendo of Japan and released in North America in 1995 by Nintendo of America. Having extracted 50 dialogue lines which are considered to include topics subject to censorship, the study analyses the prevalence of censorship and translation techniques, as well as the consistency of the localization with Nintendo of America's guidelines. The results show that adaptation and modulation were the most favoured translation techniques, used in 36% and 40% of the cases, respectively. Furthermore, censorship appeared to be more prevalent in categories related to graphic violence and religious themes. However, inconsistencies in the localization suggest that the guidelines were not always followed strictly. These findings align with some previous studies on censorship and localization in media and entertainment, although every product has a different distribution of themes, which in turn affects the type of censorship found. The study concludes that further research on censorship and translation techniques in video games, as well as other forms of media, could provide useful insights into the process of localization.

Keywords: censorship, Japanese-English translation, Nintendo, Nintendo of America's Video Game Content Guidelines, video game localization

Table of Contents

1. Introduction.....	4
2. Background.....	6
2.1 Censorship in video games.....	6
2.1.1 The congressional hearing of 1993	6
2.2 Censorship in localization.....	7
2.2.1 Censorship in Japanese to English localization	7
3. Previous research	8
3.1. Research in censorship.....	8
3.2. Research in localization techniques	9
4. Material and Methodology	11
4.1 Material.....	11
4.2 Methodology.....	11
4.2.1 Methodology: Criteria.....	12
4.3 Methodology: Peter Newmark’s translation techniques.....	13
5. Results	14
6. Analysis.....	16
6.1. Include sexually suggestive or explicit content including rape and/or nudity.....	16
6.2. Depict random, gratuitous, and/or excessive violence.....	17
6.3. depict graphic illustration of death.....	18
6.4. Depict domestic violence and/or abuse.....	19
6.5. Reflect ethnic, religious, nationalistic, or sexual stereotypes of language	20
6.6. Use profanity or obscenity in any form or incorporate language or gestures that could be offensive by prevailing public standards and tastes	21
6.7. Incorporate or encourage the use of illegal drugs, smoking materials, and/or alcohol..	22
7. Discussion.....	24
8. Conclusion	27
References.....	28
Appendix	30

1. Introduction

Video game censorship has been a topic of discussion for decades, with concerns over the impact of violent or inappropriate content on young audiences leading to regulations and guidelines in many countries. However, the way in which censorship is applied to video games can vary greatly, from outright bans to subtle changes in localization.

Censorship is a complex idea that doesn't fit into a specific set of rules, which puts the translator in an uncertain position. Guidelines or rules can be considered arbitrary, but they should be adhered to, nonetheless. This complicates the process of providing a translation that tries to convey the same idea as the original text. However, the translator has techniques to mitigate the restrictions of censorship, for example, through ellipses or word changes to follow the guidelines while retaining as much as possible of the original meaning.

This study focuses on the censorship and localization of the 1995 video game *EarthBound* for its release in North America by Nintendo of America. The Japanese version named *Mother 2* was released in 1994 by Nintendo of Japan. *EarthBound* is a role-playing video game with a contemporary urban setting and a quirky sense of humour. It gained a cult following outside of Japan despite being a commercial disappointment upon its initial release in North America. What set *EarthBound* apart from other games at the time was the variety of themes, ranging from light-hearted jokes to fairly serious topics such as domestic violence implications. As such, *EarthBound* is an interesting game to study to see how the localization handled these different situations.

This study aims to analyse the censorship and localization techniques used in the English translation of *Mother 2* for the Super Nintendo Entertainment System (SNES). More specifically, the study focuses on observing Nintendo of America's Video Game Content Guidelines on how often Nintendo of America's censorship guidelines went in accordance with the localization. Additionally, what was the distribution of translation techniques used in the localization. The study examines contents that were censored or modified in localization using a comparative analysis approach. Aiming to enhance our understanding of video game censorship and localization practices and seeks to analyse a specific case of video game censorship and localization. By examining the challenges faced, strategies employed, and outcomes observed in this case, the study aims to offer a view on the decision-making process of video game censorship that is rarely observed.

The study examines 50 data examples, which are dialogues extracted from the game, covering a range of themes and content types. Each example was analysed in terms of how it was translated and whether it followed the guidelines provided by Nintendo of America.

To answer these research questions, the study first goes over the background of video game censorship in the 90's as well as tendencies in video game censorship in terms of what problems can arise from censorship. Then, to show what the research field looks like for both censorship and localization techniques, respectively. In this section,

research in both video games and other forms of media is covered to establish some common ground and highlight why this study fills a research gap. In the material section, *EarthBound*'s and *Mother 2*'s details are given more in-depth and reasons for choosing them as the material for this study. Then in the methodology section, research questions are specified, and the Nintendo of America's Video Game Content Guidelines are listed as the baseline on what types of censorship cases this study aims to gather. Additionally, the translation techniques used for the analysis section of the study are listed and explained. Then in the results, a few tables give an overview of what this study focuses on. The distribution of guideline categories, the adherence rate of guidelines and what translation techniques were used. The analysis section establishes patterns for each guideline category and shows examples of both going and not going in accordance with the guideline when possible. Following next, the discussion brings all the data together and compares the overall results with the previous research. Furthermore, discussing the validity and strictness of the guidelines and what the data can tell us about censorship in *EarthBound*. Lastly, the conclusion summarizes all the main points and results and highlights the new knowledge gained from this study. As well as recommendations on how to approach future studies in a way that can be done in a meaningful way and what we learned about the limitations of this present study.

2. Background

Censorship is the act of controlling published information in a manner that removes or changes the information's original meaning. The subject of censorship can range from literary publications to films and video games. Censorship is usually justified by the notion of moral harm (obscenity) or the harmful effects on behaviour from overly violent content. Other justifications can include religious blasphemy or even on a more national level threatening national security (Chandler & Munday 2011). The degree of censorship varies and is "time and site-specific, rather than universal" (Freshwater 2004, p. 18). This means that individual corporations or publishers may have their own criteria and policies for censorship (Freshwater 2004).

2.1 Censorship in video games

Before the 1990s, the technology in the video game industry was still at an early stage and video games did not yet produce content that could trigger potential legal controversies. However, this all changed with the controversial releases of *Mortal Kombat* (1992) produced by Midway Games, and *Night Trap* (1993) produced by Digital Pictures. *Mortal Kombat* was a fighting game that had a significant difference compared to its competitors, with its visual and audio presentation. The game featured brutal and violent moves, which typically ended with the winner performing gruesome acts on the losing player. These included acts such as electrocution or ripping body parts and mutilation (O'Holleran 2010). The following year, *Night Trap* was released and caused an uproar due to it being inappropriate and offensive to women as it featured full-motion video (FMV). In a particular scene, a teenage girl is seduced by a vampire in a humiliating manner (O'Holleran 2010).

2.1.1 The congressional hearing of 1993

Prior to 1994, video games had no rating system to evaluate their contents, and this created an issue with more visually recognizable games. A series of letters were sent to Senator Joel Liberman about the violent and sexual contents of *Mortal Kombat* and *Night Trap* (O'Holleran 2010). The US Congress made an official statement that it would act if video games were not regulated properly by video game companies. On December 9th in 1993, led by Senators Joe Lieberman and Herb Kohl, the Senate invited game companies to discuss the lack of a rating system for inappropriate content such as violence and sexual content. (Kent 2001).

During the actual hearing, different representatives from video game companies such as SEGA and Nintendo of America gave their stance on how violent and sexual content is evaluated. When giving their definitions on what was deemed inappropriate and during Howard Lincoln's (then vice president of Nintendo of America) turn, he presented a list of guidelines that were followed to ensure that all video games met their releasing standards. After the hearing, a consensus on a video game rating system was agreed upon and the Entertainment Software Rating Board (ESRB) was established. The ESRB

ensures that video game releases have the appropriate age and content labels attached to the covers of video games and it is still active today (Kent 2001).

2.2 Censorship in localization

Different countries have their own rules and regulations which can have an impact on game localization as well. Every adaption, including video games, cross cultural borders and they must be treated with legality in mind (Chandler 2005: 26). This means that translators have to consider the cultural differences and potential legal complications that they need to take into consideration if they work under a company. When translating a game for the target culture, the choices made during the process are not necessarily choices the translator would make under normal circumstances. It can potentially mean that the original author's intention needs to be altered to go in accordance with the company's policies. Consequently, this compromises the freedom that translators have over their work. Censorship can also lead to an unnatural translation, which in turn can be interpreted as a lower quality translation, but as censorship policies are most often not publicly available it becomes hard to judge whether censorship was an influence (Costales 2012). Censorship is not widely accepted as a popular solution as the fans and customers pay for a product that may be inferior to the original release. For instance, the localization of *Fire Emblem: Fates* released in 2015 by Nintendo of America was widely criticized for altering an event that contained physical affection (caressing faces) to a simple fade to black (Mandiberg 2017; O'Hagan 2017).

2.2.1 Censorship in Japanese to English localization

Video games are often created with the intention of selling in the source culture initially, but consideration must also be given to the international market. If the game in its original version is not suitable then there are a few options available. Raising the age rating to match the target culture's legal requirements or content is removed or adapted. Raising the age rating reduces the market size for profit as fewer age groups have access to the product, so companies would prefer not to change it. Japanese games have a reputation for including humor or jokes with sexual innuendo despite the low age rating, which can be considered inappropriate in Europe or North America (Di Marco 2007). Before the establishment of the ESRB, there was no system in place to designate different age groups as the targeted audience for video games. As video games were primarily marketed towards children, Nintendo of America is a notable example of a company that implemented censoring practices. (Mangiron 2012). Adaptation is also a method that is associated with localization, as it offers the ability to change contextual meaning with techniques such as paraphrasing and omission. The focus is on "preserving the character and function of the original text, in preference to preserving the form or even the semantic meaning" (Baker & Saldanha 2019, p. 4).

3. Previous research

Research that focuses on the analysis of translation strategies in video games from the perspective of censorship is fairly limited, as these two aspects are more often studied separately rather than combined. Examples of this separation can be observed in the studies with their focus on localization strategies (e.g. Costales 2012), and other studies focusing on censorship (e.g. O'Holleran 2010). While some studies that focus on localization strategies touch upon censorship it is never the main focus. This separation in research creates a gap that there is a need for research that combines these two perspectives, which the current research is trying to fill.

As such, previous research is divided into two separate categories of whether they lean more towards censorship or localization.

3.1. Research in censorship

Close (2017) examined how the English-language adaptation of the Japanese anime in the 1990's called *Sailor Moon* was handled from the perspective of censorship. Her focus is specifically on when *Sailor Moon* was adapted and brought to the US and the controversies this prompted. In her article, she goes over the intent of censorship and the societal backlash it created. She argues that, in television, censorship is applied to the imagined intended audience, which is further impacted by the broadcasting company's interest to make a profit. Close also goes into detail about how dedicated fans created groups to preserve and distribute uncensored versions of *Sailor Moon* as the officially broadcasted one was heavily edited and even gender roles changed to represent a more conservative perspective. As Close is more focused on the reception and repercussions of censoring a widely popular and successful animation series, she does not conduct analysis on how censorship was applied but merely states what was altered or censored such as the sexual orientation of characters or removing blood from certain scenes.

O'Holleran (2010) did a comparative case study comparing the differences and similarities between film and video games regarding censorship. He also discussed how censorship can cause a desensitizing effect on the audience. In the conclusion, he suggested that video games have an image problem due to political influence. He pointed out that stereotypes that video games are violent and a bad influence on children is still an opinion that is even used as a political campaign tool. Similar to Close's article, censorship is discussed from a societal perspective and the history surrounding a specific instance of censorship, which in O'Holleran's case is censorship in the film and video game industry. Once again, there is a lack of analysis or discussion on how the actual censorship happens.

Felini (2015) had a critical look at the current video game rating systems and more specifically the Entertainment Software Rating Board (ESRB) and Pan-European Game Information (PEGI) by highlighting their weaknesses and flaws. These rating systems were evaluated based on their effectiveness and purpose and as a result, he found out

that the current rating systems offer only a broad and negative outline for a game. The ratings are a guideline for parents to know the contents beforehand, but it is ultimately the parents' responsibility what they are willing to expose to their children. While the establishment of the ESRB is directly connected to the censorship laws tightening in the US, Felini is more focused on the functionality of these two systems rather than their intended use. As such this critical approach does not include analysis if these systems are being used as intended.

Dong & Mangiron (2018) provide valuable insights into the role of censorship in video games, specifically in the context of the Chinese market. It highlights the significance of censorship regulations and their impact on the localization process for video games. This information can be relevant as previous research on censorship in video games because it adds to the understanding of how censorship practices operate in a specific region and the challenges faced by game developers in complying with these regulations. By acknowledging the specific types of content that are subject to censorship in China, such as violence, gore, explicit sexual content, politically sensitive topics, religious references, and gambling-related content, this text contributes to existing knowledge about the specific aspects that might be targeted for censorship in video games. This article is relevant to the present study as it also presents tendencies for censorship in video games, albeit in the Chinese market. However, as cultural adaptation was mentioned as a prevailing technique for dealing with censorship, no additional analysis was provided on other potential techniques or specific game examples in which these tendencies were found.

Additionally, the article emphasizes the need for game developers to carefully review and modify their games to ensure compliance with censorship regulations. This sheds light on the practical implications of censorship, highlighting the challenges faced by developers in navigating and adapting to different cultural and regulatory environments. Understanding these challenges can help us analyze the impact of censorship on game development processes, including creative decision-making, resource allocation, and market strategies.

3.2. Research in localization techniques

Costales (2012) examined if different translation techniques are applied to specific genres of video games for example RPGs (role-playing games) or first-person shooters. He did this by analysing several games from different genres and trying to establish patterns that could support his theory. Finally concluding that since video games are becoming more complex in their narrative and gameplay structure, it is difficult to define specific translation techniques that would be identifiable within a certain genre. Narrative-driven games tended to require more transcreation compared to a simulation game that has more technical terminology and hence relies more on literal translation. In his study censorship is listed as one of the subsections in his strategies reviewed section, but he only discusses how censorship is inevitable as a "market-driven activity" (Costales 2012, p. 20). The other subsections such as literal translation and

domestication and foreignization are given concrete examples and much more in-depth discussion on how they are applied in localization.

Mangiron (2021) did three case studies about the specific localisation practices surrounding three different Japanese video games: *Persona* (1996-present), *Phoenix Wright: Ace Attorney* (2005-present), and *Yakuza* (2005-present). In her case studies, she also paid attention to the reception to observe if and how the localisation techniques have changed over time to reflect the expectations of the consumers. The study found that video game localization was more domesticating in its early days and slowly became more foreignizing, in order to satisfy the players and expand their sense of immersion. Due to the internet's accessibility, the voices and opinions of the players are much more visible nowadays, and the developers and localizers have a better understanding of what their target audience wants from their games. Like many other studies, censorship is discussed in terms of change in parallel to domestication as if they are interchangeable terms. While it is true that censorship tends to create a more domesticated text, there are more complex layers that need to be observed to fully understand how censorship is being applied on an individual level.

O'Hagan (2013) offers a comprehensive look at game localization in a wide variety of ways in hopes to establish a solid base for game localization as a legitimate field of translation. She discusses the challenges of game localization, including linguistic and cultural differences, and provide insights into the processes involved in localizing games for different markets. The conclusions chapter states that the localization process of a game is complex and creates entirely new problems concluding that game localization is a complex and important process that involves not only linguistic translation, but also cultural adaptation. This book is intended to serve as a baseline for video game localization as a translation genre and, goes as far as discussing the differences between translation and localization. As the focus of this book is more educational and informative, censorship is brought up only as an example of a potential pitfall for localizers.

4. Material and Methodology

The game that served as the material was designed and directed by Shigesato Itoi, and in Japan, the title is *MOTHER 2: Gīgu no Gyakushū* (*MOTHER 2 ギーグの逆襲*), and was released by Nintendo in 1994. The English localization was carried out by Dan Owsen and Marcus Lindblom and the localized version titled *EarthBound* was released in 1995 by Nintendo of America.

4.1 Material

EarthBound is a series of fantastical and otherworldly adventures following a 13-year-old boy called Ness, who throughout his journeys meets new friends and saves towns and cities from an alien named Giygas who is trying to destroy and enslave humanity into a deep era of darkness. The story unfolds by interacting with characters and cutscenes that the player unlocks by meeting specific conditions such as acquiring a specific item or by defeating a powerful enemy that guards the progress to a new area. The presentation and art style used in *EarthBound* made it an ageless classic among the gaming community, and it is still appreciated today for its creative choices and designs that were ground-breaking at the time of its release as reviewed by Scott Thompson¹ (2013).

One of the reasons for selecting this game specifically is because the original Japanese version of the game touches on many topics and themes that are by Nintendo of America's policies considered unsuitable and need to be changed, in order for it to be released. Secondly, the release of the game in 1995 is important, because by this point Nintendo had published their guidelines and *EarthBound* was one of the earlier releases after that. I consider this to be relevant since these guidelines were publicly released, which must have caused pressure on Nintendo to make sure they follow their own guidelines to avoid consumer backlash. Both versions of the game are available to download digitally as well, which makes them easily accessible as opposed to the physical cartridges for the original console releases.

4.2 Methodology

A comparative analysis of the Japanese and English versions of the game is required to answer my proposed research questions, which are as followed:

1. How often did Nintendo of America's censorship policies go in accordance with the localization?
2. What was the distribution of translation techniques used in the localization?

The data collection consists of cases collected from the estimated first half of the game. *EarthBound* features 8 progression checkpoints called *Your Sanctuary* locations, so the

¹ Scott Thompson is a gaming journalist writing for the prominent American video game and entertainment media website IGN, which offers news and reviews related to video games and other media.

easiest way to mark the halfway point for this study is to collect data between checkpoints 1-4. When a possible censoring case (see the next section for criteria) is encountered in the Japanese version, they were analysed based on the following questions:

1. What translation techniques were used in the localization?
2. Are there any cases where censorship is not removed?
3. What policy does each case violate?
4. Does the translation go in accordance with Nintendo of America's policies?

4.2.1 Criteria

The guidelines spoken by Howard Lincoln (then vice president of Nintendo of America) at the 1993 public congressional hearing were divided into six different groups, ranging from the prohibition of sexually suggestive content to religious stereotypes. However, in 1994, a separate official policy notice was announced that included more precise definitions and additional categories. They are quoted in their entirety by Stephen and Janet Schwartz's *Parent's Guide to Video Games* (1994) and are as follows (Schwartz, p. 33, Nintendo of America's Video Game Content Guidelines):

1. include sexually suggestive or explicit content including rape and/or nudity.
2. contain language or depiction which specifically denigrates members of either sex.
3. depict random, gratuitous, and/or excessive violence.
4. depict graphic illustration of death.
5. depict domestic violence and/or abuse.
6. depict excessive force in a sports game beyond what is inherent in actual contact sports.
7. reflect ethnic, religious, nationalistic, or sexual stereotypes of language; this includes symbols that are related to any type of racial, religious, nationalistic, or ethnic group, such as crosses, pentagrams, God, Gods (Roman mythological gods are acceptable), Satan, hell, Buddha.
8. use profanity or obscenity in any form or incorporate language or gestures that could be offensive by prevailing public standards and tastes.
9. incorporate or encourage the use of illegal drugs, smoking materials, and/or alcohol (Nintendo does not allow a beer or cigarette ad to be placed on an arena, stadium or playing field wall, or fence in a sports game)
10. include subliminal political messages or overt political statements.

While this book is not an academic text, it has been quoted in an academic setting for example by Guay and Arsenault (2012). The present study uses these 1994 guidelines as criteria for a more accurate categorization as these guidelines are essentially a more comprehensive list compared to the guidelines mentioned by Howard Lincoln.

A separate table has been created in the appendix section, containing information on each case's compliance, including which guideline it falls under, the translation technique used, and whether or not it conforms to the guideline. The cases are numbered in the order of appearance, and which checkpoint it was encountered. The source text (ST) and target text (TT) are presented side by side.

4.2.2 Peter Newmark's translation techniques

For the analysis part of this study, translation techniques listed in Newmark's *A Textbook of Translation* (1988) are used. A short description of these techniques is provided and given a brief explanation. The following translation techniques are from Newmark's book except for omission:

- 1.) Modulation: changing the perspective or phrasing that differs from the SL to convey the same idea.
- 2.) Cultural equivalence: replacing a cultural word in ST with a cultural word in TT.
- 3.) Functional equivalence: word or phrase that conveys the same meaning as the original text but is culture neutral.
- 4.) Descriptive equivalence: explaining cultural words in a few words.
- 5.) Synonym: finding a near equivalent word, where a precise equivalent may or may not exist.
- 6.) Couplets: when the translator combines two different techniques.
- 7.) Literal translation: when the SL sentence structure and meaning are converted to the nearest TL equivalent.
- 8.) Adaptation: changing the ST to have a completely different structure and have little to no traces of the ST's meaning.
- 9.) Omission: when elements from the ST are not translated while translating and eliminated in the TT.

Category 9 of translation techniques is omission. As explained by Baker (1992), the omission can be used on words or idioms if there is no close equivalent meaning. She also mentions that information can be changed with omission. When censorship is considered, omission is notable enough to be included within the selected translation techniques.

5. Results

50 cases were identified in total, and out of the 10 guideline categories listed by Nintendo of America, 7 were identified. In table 1 the 50 cases of censorship-triggering sentences, a total of 16 (32%) belonged to category 7, which reflects ethnic, religious, nationalistic, or sexual stereotypes in language. 10 cases (20%) belonged to category 4, which depicts graphic illustrations of death. 8 cases (16%) were in category 3, which depicts random, gratuitous, and/or excessive violence. Category 8 had 4 cases (8%) and category 9 had 5 cases (10%), which relate to the use of profanity or obscenity in any form, and the incorporation or encouragement of illegal drugs, smoking materials, and/or alcohol respectively. 4 cases (8%) from category 1 contained sexually suggestive or explicit content. The remaining 8 cases (16%) belonged to category 2, which depicts domestic violence and/or abuse.

Table 1 *Cases categorized by guideline category*

Guideline category	Number of cases	% of total
Category 1	4	8
Category 3	8	16
Category 4	10	20
Category 5	3	6
Category 7	16	32
Category 8	4	8
Category 9	5	10
Total	50	100

Another point of analysis was to determine if the collected data cases were localized in accordance with Nintendo of America's guidelines (see table 2 below). Out of the 50 cases, a total of 33 (66%) were found to be in accordance, and 17 cases (34%) were found to be not in accordance with the guidelines. For categories 5 and 8, all cases were translated in accordance with the guidelines.

Table 2 *Cases categorized by guideline category*

Guideline category	In accordance	Not in accordance
Category 1	1	3
Category 3	3	5
Category 4	6	4
Category 5	3	0
Category 7	12	4
Category 8	4	0
Category 9	4	1
Total n.	33	17

Table 3 contains the identified translation techniques. When it came to translation techniques, the game's translation favoured modulation and adaptation. This can be seen as modulation was used in 20 cases (40%) and adaptation in 18 cases (36%). This is not surprising considering the fact that following the guidelines requires certain elements in the text to be changed or heavily altered. Modulation and omission combined appeared in 7 cases (14%) and these were often encountered in situations where an insensitive element had to be removed and then rephrased to maintain a natural dialogue. Literal translation, in comparison, appeared less frequently with only 5 cases (10%). This can be explained by the logic that literal translation was always found when a case was not in accordance with the guidelines, thus preserving the original text as closely as possible.

Table 3 *Used translation techniques*

Translation technique	Number of cases	% of total
Adaptation	18	36
Literal translation	5	10
Modulation	20	40
Modulation/omission	7	14
Total	50	100

6. Analysis

In the analysis section, the data is introduced by the guideline category number and a brief explanation of general tendencies. As the overall game text is written in *hiragana*, examples are presented in *hiragana* as well. They are followed by the official English translation, with which bold font is used to indicate the part where a guideline has been triggered. The only modification is made by removing extra spaces between words, as the original text format in the game is limited and spliced due to technical limitations.

Out of the ten guideline categories, three were not found within the scope of the data collection. The first one was category 2 (containing language or depictions that specifically denigrate members of either sex), which could be explained by the fact that despite *EarthBound* having themes such as domestic violence, it is still a game intended for children and such language would not be suitable for them. The second one is category 6 (which depicts excessive force in a sports game beyond what is inherent in actual contact sports), which is easily explained by the fact that *EarthBound* is not a sports game. Cases for Category 10 (including subliminal political messages or overt political statements) were not identifiable within the text. Since the game takes place in a fictional world and is geared towards a younger audience, the absence of political themes was probably intentional as they might not have aligned with the world or narrative that the developer was aiming to convey.

6.1. Category 1: Include sexually suggestive or explicit content including rape and/or nudity

This category ended up being the second lowest in terms of cases found, but what is notable is that 75% of the cases were not in accordance with the guidelines. This is somewhat surprising considering the suggested audience is aimed at young children.

(1) No. 19 (location: after checkpoint 2. Town of Twoson.)

パパとおふろにはいるか？ワハハハハハ！

How about we share a piece of pie like we used to? Ha ha ha!

For added context this dialogue is between a father and her daughter Paula. Here the translation uses adaptation to remove any mention of bathing together. This example shows the cultural differences, where in Japan family bathing is much more common, however, this is not the case in the US. As such, to avoid any misunderstandings and the level of physical contact might be foreign and perhaps even uncomfortable. While it is not sexually suggestive in a Japanese context, if literally translated into English it is potentially suggestive for the US audience.

The Japanese more literally translates to "Shall we take a bath with dad? Wahahahaha!", which is not an unusual statement to make in Japan. However, the English localization conveys a similarly playful and affectionate tone, but the content of the message is different from the original Japanese sentence. Therefore, the translator has adapted the

original sentence to make it more appropriate and understandable for English-speaking audiences, while still preserving the playful and affectionate tone of the original sentence.

(2) No. 21 (location: after checkpoint 2. Town of Twoson.)

プレイボーイのきみに、おれたちからのプレゼントだ。

Then you deserve a present, **playboy**.

Here is an example of not going in accordance with the guidelines and it is a surprising literal translation. This is said to the protagonist who is a child, which would make this a clear violation of the guidelines. Considering the previous example, a bath between family members was deemed inappropriate but, in this case, the word playboy is inherently sexually suggestive, which should be a clear case for censorship.

(3) No. 42 (location: after checkpoint 3. City of Fourside.)

うしろにくっついてヒップをじろじろみないでね。

Quit staring at my hips...why don't you stand somewhere else instead of behind me?

Here adaptation is used to take a more liberal approach to the original text, in which the translator kept the hip-staring sentence but added additional text. Perhaps the added context is an attempt to convey that the player's action is inappropriate and should refrain from doing so. However, considering the guideline says to not include such suggestive content then this translation does not go in accordance with the rule.

6.2. Category 3: Depict random, gratuitous, and/or excessive violence

Examples in this category were the third highest, with a total of seven cases. However, this category is the only one in which more than half of the cases were left with no accordance with the guideline. This puts into question the integrity of the congressional hearing as a whole, as it intended to address the excessive number of violent contents in video games.

(4) No. 5 (location: before checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.)

けつとばしてかみついてツバをひっかけておしっこちびらせて・・・

heads off, spit in their eyes, and made them wet their pants.

On top of excessive violence not being censored, the English translation has taken the liberty to seemingly make it more violent than the original. The phrase *kettobashite* (which means "to kick hard") with the English translation "heads off" conveys the sense of violence and aggression implied by the original text but in a more graphic way.

(5) No. 8 (location: after checkpoint 1. Town of Twoson.)

もうころされてるかもしれねえな。はやく行ってやれ。

You know, **she might be gone already**. You'd better hurry.

The translator has opted to use modulation, that goes in accordance with the guideline while also maintaining the sense of the original more appropriately. Specifically, the translator has used "might be gone already" to convey the sense of "already been killed" in the original.

6.3. Category 4: Depict graphic illustration of death

This category holds the second-highest number of cases at 10. In most cases, either adaptation or literal translation was used. When adaptation was used, it often accompanied ellipses to imply death as a workaround to stay within the guideline while maintaining a sense of the original meaning.

(6) No. 4 (location: before checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.)

ああくるしい。しにそうだ…うううう

Listen to my final words...

The Japanese sentence “*aa kurushii. shini sou da...uuuu*” is a short and dramatic expression that conveys a sense of anguish and impending doom. The English localization "Listen to my final words..." is a longer sentence that does not directly convey the same sense of suffering and despair as the original. The sentence simply implies that the character may be on their last breath. The translator has opted to use adaptation to go in accordance with the guideline to avoid illustrating death but still keeping the essence of the final moment for this passing character.

(7) No. 25 (location: after checkpoint 2. Town of Threed.)

もうしんでもいい…って、あ、おれしんでるんだっけ…ほんとは。

I don't care if I **pass away**... Ha! **I'm dead** already!

For added context, this line is uttered by a zombie that has been captured and holds a grudge against the player. This is a fairly literal translation with a slight change in wording in the first sentence. What is interesting about this case is that the translator has chosen to censor the first instance of “to die”, but then chose to leave the second one in. They could have just as easily similarly changed the second sentence. Perhaps the justification is that the zombie has already died and thus the act of dying has already happened, and this would not count as an illustration of death.

6.4. Category 5: Depict domestic violence and/or abuse

This category is one of two categories in which all found cases have been censored and changed to follow the guidelines. Although there were only three cases in total, it is clear that this was a theme that was carefully censored and heavily adapted to avoid any unwanted interpretations.

(8) No. 1 (location: before checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.)

でもとーちゃんがかえってきたらおれがおこられるだろう。けつたたき100かいだ。

When my dad gets back, **I know I'm gonna get it...**

The translator has taken some creative liberties to translate the sentence in a way that is more natural and idiomatic in English. The original sentence mentions *ketsutataki* which literally means "butt slapping," but the translation has omitted this detail and instead used the phrase "I'm gonna get it," which implies some form of punishment. This is a good use of ellipses to convey to the player that there is something bad beyond the mentioned text, while simultaneously trying to not break the guideline. This proves that the translator wanted to convey the meaning of the original sentence without losing the intended tone.

(9) No. 2 (location: before checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.)

とーちゃんにどえらくどやされちゃった。ああおしりがいたい。

My dad really got after me. **He said I get no dessert for the rest of the decade...**

This is the aftermath dialogue after the previous example, where this character named Pokey has received his punishment. It is heavily adapted to steer away from any suggestions of domestic violence even to the point of it sounding very out of place in English. The severity of being spanked is taken into consideration, but it loses in believability and is harder to take seriously.

(10) No. 23 (location: after checkpoint 2. Snow Wood Boarding House.)

みつかったらしりたたきだよ。

If you get caught, **you'll get punished big time...**

A similar example of using adaptation and ellipses to imply the original message, which is a more general and less graphic way of conveying the same idea.

6.5. Category 7: Reflect ethnic, religious, nationalistic, or sexual stereotypes of language

With 16 cases, they cover roughly a third of all cases found, making this the most frequent example of possible censorship. This is most likely due to the theming in *EarthBound*. The main antagonist is an otherworldly threat that is often called a demon in the Japanese text, which has religious connotations. An interesting observation can be made that the word *kamisama* is used a number of times, but in Japanese, this word is not strictly meant as one God or the Christian God. This can be seen in the examples below, where *kamisama* is translated in different ways and given extra context on a case-by-case basis to make the English translation sound more natural.

(11) No. 9 (location: after checkpoint 1. Town of Twoson.)

あのこにはカミサマがついている。

She has a **guardian angel**, it seems.

In this translation, the main translation technique used is modulation. The translator has replaced the Japanese term *kamisama*, which literally means "god" or "deity," with the English phrase "guardian angel." The use of "guardian angel" in English is a common cultural equivalent, as both phrases refer to a higher being or entity that provides protection or guidance.

(12) No. 11 (location: after checkpoint 1. Happy Happy Village.)

カーペインターさまはいろんなかみさまとこうしんできるんだぜ。

Mr. Carpenter communicates with **the divine**,

The original Japanese text is a bit vague and open to interpretation as to what *ironna kamisama* is referring to. The translator has adapted the text to convey the idea that Mr. Carpenter is capable of communicating with the divine. The phrase *ironna kamisama* could be translated more literally as "various gods and spirits," but the translator chose to use "the divine" to convey the general idea in a more concisely and understandably. It is also notable that the hints of plural "gods" have disappeared in translation.

(13) No. 7 (location: after checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.)

こんなチビスケのおかげでじごくからてんごくだ。

This little nipper took us from a **nightmare to a dream...**

The English localization uses adaptation as a translation technique by changing the metaphor from "hell to heaven" to "nightmare to a dream" to better suit the cultural context and idiomatic expressions in English as well as censoring the biblical elements in the original. Additionally, the use of the phrase "little nipper" is an example of cultural substitution, as it replaces the original word *chibisuke*, which is a diminutive term in Japanese, with an equivalent term that conveys a similar connotation in English.

(14) No. 16 (location: after checkpoint 1. Happy Happy Village.)

ふくめんしてないあやしいやつ！てんごくにいくな！

You strange, unmasked fellow. Don't go to **heaven!**

Here is an example where the word heaven is strangely not censored. The tone of the sentence is also slightly threatening to condemn the player to not go to heaven.

6.6. Category 8: Use profanity or obscenity in any form or incorporate language or gestures that could be offensive by prevailing public standards and tastes
Although some cases might be categorized as either 3 (featuring random, excessive, or gratuitous violence) or the current category 8, the selection process for this particular case was based on the use of inappropriate language or swearing, as demonstrated in example (15) below. Category 8 has no uncensored data examples similar to category 5.

(15) No. 20 (location: after checkpoint 2. Town of Twoson.)

ポーラちゃん、ゆうかいはんにんのキンタマをけりあげたんだってね。

I heard that you, Paula, **beat up the kidnapper.**

The main translation technique used here is adaptation. In the English version of the sentence, where the phrase "beat up" is used instead of "kick in the balls" to avoid using potentially offensive language. This adaptation does not significantly change the meaning of the original sentence, but it does modify the tone and level of violence implied in the action described. Therefore, this example removed the offensive language in order to go in accordance with the guideline.

(16) No. 30 (location: after checkpoint 2. Secret Base.)

ゲハゲハゲハゲハ、わらわせるなあ。こんなくそつたれを…

Heeg! Heeg! Heeg! **You make me laugh so hard...**

This translation can be considered a form of modulation and omission because it does not use a direct word-for-word translation but instead tries to convey the meaning of the original dialogue in a way that is appropriate for English-speaking audiences. The second sentence is omitted completely.

(17) No. 33 (location: after checkpoint 3. Dusty Dunes Desert.)

じゅうたいのケツへヨーコソ！

Welcome to the very end of the world's longest **traffic jam!**

Here the translation is an adaptation of the original sentence that conveys the same meaning but adds more context and flavour to the message. The use of "world's longest" adds a sarcastic and humorous tone, which is in line with the original sentence without using the inappropriate word *ketsu*.

6.7. Category 9: Incorporate or encourage the use of illegal drugs, smoking materials, and/or alcohol

Despite tying with the third lowest number of cases with just 5, this category offers an interesting decision to be included in the localization. When drunkenness or alcohol is mentioned in the Japanese version, they are changed into caffeine-related sentences. From the game's visual perspective, the characters have not been changed and instead are depicted as stereotypical office workers with red cheek marks and a foamy beer in their hands to still convey their drunken state.

(18) No. 34 (location: after checkpoint 3. Dusty Dunes Desert.)

タライ・ジャブさまはただいまだんじきとむげんのぎょうときんしゅ
きんえんをなさっておられる。

Talah Rama is now fasting and practicing silent meditation, he is also abstaining from anything that would make him **sick or smelly** too.

In this example, the translation can be considered an adaptation, as there are some wording changes regarding the mention of alcohol and tobacco from the original Japanese sentence. However, it is interesting to consider that even though the original sentence is a sign of abstaining from these substances and not encouraging them, the translator still deemed it needed to be changed.

(19) No. 37 (location: after checkpoint 3. City of Fourside.)

おれはよっぱらっちゃ、ヒック、いねえよ！

Just leave me here to cry into my cappucino!

Here the translation takes a fascinating turn as drunkenness is changed into a coffee-related sentence. This is a complete adaptation, with no resemblance to the original sentence.

(20) No. 38 (location: after checkpoint 3. City of Fourside.)

よっぱらってたもんで、トイレとまちがえてかべをノックしたんだよ。

I was in the middle of a caffeine buzz, and I had to get to the bathroom fast!

The original Japanese sentence talks about being drunk and accidentally knocking on the wall because the speaker mistook it for the bathroom. The English localization, on

the other hand, uses a completely different context of being under the influence of caffeine and needing to go to the bathroom.

(21) No. 39 (location: after checkpoint 3. City of Fourside.)

あんたらこどもなんだからさけのめないだろ。

Kids shouldn't be drinking espresso!

This translation aims to convey the message of discouraging kids from consuming a substance that may not be appropriate for their age, while substituting the specific alcoholic beverage with a more relatable reference to espresso. However, children are not forbidden to consume espresso, so this translation comes off as an odd translation where the prohibition to drink is kept, but the drink itself has been replaced. One explanation could be that the translator wanted to keep the meaning intact in order for the player to read between censored lines. The translation adhered to the guideline, but since the models and sprites in the game have not been altered, it is fairly easy to see the censoring taking place.

7. Discussion

When examining all of the collected data, the most favoured translation techniques were adaptation and modulation. Adaptation was used in over a third of the cases (36%), while modulation appeared even more frequently in 40% of the cases. Moreover, if modulation is combined with cases of modulation/omission, it leads to a total of 54% of all cases featuring modulation in some form. In total, adaptation and modulation in all forms appeared in 90% of the cases. This exceedingly high percentage could be explained by censorship since it implies that some elements of the text need to be altered to ensure that the localization meets Nintendo of America's standards. However, when compared to the number of cases in accordance with the guidelines, there are some notable inconsistencies. Out of the 50 data examples collected, 17 (34%) were not considered to have been censored in this study. Excluding category 5, which was domestic abuse, and 8, which included profanities, it is not possible to determine what caused such inconsistency in the localization since the purpose of censorship is to remove inappropriate elements. The fact that slightly over a third of the cases did not follow the guidelines raises questions about how much merit the guidelines truly had. As can be seen from the cases in categories 5 and 8, we can at least assume that the translator was stricter with some themes, and in examples (9) and (15-17) with topics like domestic abuse or the use of profanities. They used heavy adaptation or modulation and omission combined. All the other categories had at least one case of not following the guidelines, which undermines attempts to establish patterns for how the judgement was made and what should and should not be censored. Since this study is specific to the analysis of censorship and translation techniques in a video game, it may be difficult to compare the results directly to other studies. However, studies on censorship in other mediums might give some insight. For instance, Close's (2017) study on the censorship in *Sailor Moon* or O'Holleran's (2010) study on the similarities between the censorship of film and video games.

Close (2017) found that censorship in *Sailor Moon* has often happened in the form of adaptation to remove or alter content that is deemed inappropriate or offensive by the censoring authority. The author argues that it reflects the cultural and social differences between Japan and North America. This aligns with the findings of this study, where Nintendo of America's guidelines are used to censor content that is deemed inappropriate or offensive, and adaptation was one of the prevailing techniques used for *EarthBound*'s localization. We can say that censorship as adaptation is not exclusively bound to video games, but it can be found in television as well. Example 1 (bathing together changed to sharing a piece of pie) is a good showcase of cultural differences being potentially deemed inappropriate by the US audiences and the sentence was changed completely with no trace of the original message left in.

O'Holleran (2010) points out that video game censorship has been largely ineffective and that it is unlikely to have a significant impact on the industry as he notes that video game censorship is often driven by moral panic and political posturing, rather than genuine concerns about the impact of video games on society. Perhaps this point can

explain the number of censoring inconsistencies, because while the translator has the guidelines to know what content should be regulated, the translator also retains the freedom of maintaining the original meaning even at the cost of not swearing by the guidelines. One possible explanation might be related to the relevance to the main story. Examples (8-10, these deal with domestic violence) are meant as realistic flavour text but holds no meaning to the overarching story, which makes them easier to remove as a result. It is also important to note that *EarthBound* was released with these apparent guideline violations in place and it did not get pulled from the market as a result, which would lead to the belief that some leeway was acceptable.

Additionally, one study on video game censorship has found similar patterns to those observed in this study, with certain types of content being more likely to be censored than others. For instance, a study on the cultural adaptation of video games for the Chinese market found that violence, sexual content, and political themes were the most censored types of content as observed by Dong & Mangiron (2018). Similarly, this study found that graphic depictions of death, and excessive violence were some of the most identified cases in the study. It is interesting to note that the excessive violence category in *EarthBound* had a higher number of cases not complying with the guidelines. This is despite the establishment of the ESRB to tone down the violence in video games a year prior to the game's release. This fact presents an ironic contrast to the ESRB's aim to reduce violence in video games.

One of the shortcomings of this study is that it only provides us a single point of time when it comes to censorship. We can observe what kind of elements were prone to alteration, but as *EarthBound* was released in 1995, the relevancy can be called to question. This study provides data on how the censorship guidelines were interpreted, but it lacks the potential change that these interpretations may or may not have gone through over the next decades. The value of this study however comes from the fact that it tries to establish an observable point in time from which further research can be compared to. Another perspective this study inadvertently highlights is the restrictions the translator may have when dealing with localization. It is easy to think that the translator is solely responsible for the translation when in reality, the translator may be under guidelines as observed in this study. This can make the translation seem unnatural for seemingly no reason, but in most cases censorship guidelines are not publicly available so the translation itself may be considered to be lower quality, but the translator may not have had much they could have done to mitigate that problem.

EarthBound is a single game and this study only examined until half of the story progression. Every video game has its own theme and narrative, which means that certain elements will appear more frequently than others. Out of the 50 cases, 16 (32%) of them were some kinds of religious themes or used words that are associated with religion. It is safe to say that every game should have a different distribution of categories. Further research on additional publications from Nintendo of America could be valuable to see if comparable results are found. This should also involve examining games from other companies to determine if the industry has any standards for content

that are more prone to censorship than others. The word 'guideline' that Nintendo of America uses seems appropriate as they are guided recommendations and not permanent rules. Perhaps this gives some freedom to the translator to consider the best approach for the localization. It would explain the allowance for exceptions where everything in moderation is seen as acceptable.

8. Conclusion

This study has explored the various forms of censorship guidelines and translation techniques used in the localization of *EarthBound* by Nintendo of America. The most commonly used techniques were adaptation and modulation, which were used in 36% and 40% of the cases, respectively. Modulation/omission and literal translation were also identified in 14% and 10% of the cases, respectively. These techniques were used to comply with Nintendo of America's guidelines for censoring inappropriate or offensive content. However, the study also found inconsistencies in the adherence to these guidelines, with 34% of the cases not considered censored by the study. This raises questions about the effectiveness of censorship in video games and it could also help us understand how the censorship recommendations were interpreted. Censorship by nature is an act of erasing the original message, but a translator may not have a choice but to comply to the censoring guidelines, but through the use of translation techniques it is possible to leave interpretations of the original message remaining.

Further research on censorship in video games and other forms of media could provide a better understanding of the impact of censorship on the localization process, as well as the effectiveness of censorship in regulating inappropriate or offensive content in video games. The study also found that the patterns observed in *EarthBound*'s censorship align with patterns observed in other studies of censorship in media and entertainment, such as the use of adaptation as a prevalent technique. This suggests that the findings of this study may be compared to other forms of media and entertainment.

As for the limitations of this study, there are several points to consider. A comparative analysis of 50 example cases is limiting the generalizability of this study's findings, it is only covering less than half of *EarthBound*'s contents, and the accuracy of category distribution needs to be taken with a grain of salt. The scope of the study only focused on *EarthBound*, so the results here can only be a single example within the wider scale of video game censorship and may not reveal any patterns unless compared with similar studies. For a console game released in the 1990's there was no such thing as updating the game once it was released meaning that no further changes were made unless a separate version was released afterward. This can act as a limitation as this study only focused on the original versions of both releases. Any future subsequent or digital release could potentially have different results from this study so the chance of this study's results becoming outdated is a possibility. The previously mentioned fact should also be considered in any further study, and it should be clarified if a game has gone through updates or other releases which may affect the results.

Overall, the study provides valuable insights into the localization and censorship of *EarthBound* and raises important questions for further research. Future studies could explore other publications from Nintendo of America or other video game companies to see if similar patterns emerge and could also delve deeper into the inconsistencies observed in this study. Additionally, further analysis could be conducted to explore the motivations behind Nintendo of America's censorship guidelines and how they have evolved over time.

References

Primary sources

- Shigesato, I. (1994) *MOTHER 2 ギャグの逆襲* (SNES) [Video game]. Nintendo.
- Shigesato, I. (1995) *EarthBound* (Dan Owsen and Marcus Lindblom, Trans.) (SNES) [Video game]. Nintendo of America.

Secondary sources

- Arsenault, D., & Guay, L.-M. (2012). Thumb-bangers: Exploring the cultural bond between video games and Heavy Metal. *Heavy Metal Generations*, 103–115. Inter-Disciplinary Press.
- Baker, M. (1992). In *Other Words: A Coursebook on Translation*. (1st ed.). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203133590>
- Baker, M., & Saldanha, G. (2019). *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*. Routledge Handbooks Online.
- Chandler, D., & Munday, R. (2011). *A Dictionary of Media and Communication*. Oxford University Press.
- Chandler, H. M. (2005). *The Game Localization Handbook*. Charles River Media.
- Close, S. (2017). Moon Prism Power! Censorship as adaptation in the case of Sailor Moon. *Participations: Journal of Audience & Reception Studies*, 14(1), 313-334.
- Costales, A. F. (2012). Exploring translation strategies in video game localization. *MonTI - Monografías De Traducción E Interpretación*, 4, 385–408. <https://doi.org/10.6035/monti.2012.4.16>
- Di Marco, F. (2007). Cultural Localization: orientation and Disorientation in Japanese Video Games. *Revista Tradumàtica: Traducció I Tecnologies De La Informació I La Comunicació*, 5, 000–0.
- Dong, L., & Mangiron, C. (2018). Journey to the East: Cultural adaptation of video games for the Chinese market. *Journal of Specialised Translation*, (29), 35-51.
- Felini, D. (2015). Beyond Today's Video Game Rating Systems: A Critical Approach to PEGI and ESRB, and Proposed Improvements. *Games and Culture*, 10(1), 106–122. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1555412014560192>
- Freshwater, H. (2004). Towards a Redefinition of Censorship. In *BRILL eBooks* (pp. 217–237). Brill. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789401200950_010

- Kent, S. L. (2001). *The Ultimate History of Video Games, Volume 1: From Pong to Pokemon and Beyond . . . the Story Behind the Craze That Touched Our Lives and Changed the World*. Crown.
- Mandiberg, S. (2017). Fallacies of game localization. *The Journal of Internationalisation and Localisation*, 4(2), 162–182.
<https://doi.org/10.1075/jial.00002.man>
- Mangiron, C. (2012). The localisation of Japanese Video Games: striking the right balance. *Journal of Internationalization and Localization II*: 1-21.
<https://doi.org/10.1075/jial.2.01man>
- Mangiron, C. (2021). Found in translation: Evolving approaches for the localization of Japanese video games. *Arts*, 10(1), 9. <https://doi.org/10.3390/arts10010009>
- NeoGamer - The Video Game Archive. (2019, April 21). *Violence In Video Games - Highlights of the American Senate Committee Hearings in 1993* [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lhwM3ZMTCR0>
- Newmark, P. (1988). *A textbook of translation*. Prentice Hall.
- O'Hagan, M. (2017). Seeking delocalization: fan community and game localization in the age of user empowerment. *Journal of Internationalization and Localization* 4: 183-202.
- O'Hagan, M., & Mangiron, C. (2013). *Game Localization: Translating for the global digital entertainment industry*. John Benjamin's Publishing Company.
<https://doi.org/10.1075/btl.106>
- O'Holleran, J. (2010). Blood Code: The History and Future of Video Game Censorship. *J. Telecommun. High Technol. Law*, 8, 571–612. <https://dblp.uni-trier.de/db/journals/jthtl/jthtl8.html#OHolleran10>
- Schwartz, S. A., & Schwartz, J. (1994). *Parent's Guide to Video Games*. Prima Publishing.
- Thompson, S. (2013). *EarthBound* review. IGN.
<https://www.ign.com/articles/2013/07/24/earthbound-review>

Appendix

Cases of censorship and translation techniques from the video game “*Mother 2*” and the English localized title *EarthBound*:

Shigesato, I. (1994) *MOTHER 2 ギークの逆襲* (SNES) [Video game]. Nintendo.

Shigesato, I. (1995) *EarthBound* (Dan Owsen and Marcus Lindblom, Trans.) (SNES) [Video game]. Nintendo of America.

Includes the first 50 guideline violations in order of appearance in the Japanese original text.

Case #	Game Location	ST	TT	Policy no.	Translation technique	In accordance
1	Before checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.	でも とーちゃんが かえってきたら おれ が おこられるだろ う。けつたたき 10 0かいだ。	When my dad gets back, I know I'm gonna get it...	n.5	Adaptation	yes
2	Before checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.	とーちゃんにどえらく どやされちまった。あ あ おしりがいたい。	My dad really got after me. He said I get no dessert for the rest of the decade...	n.5	Adaptation	yes
3	Before checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.	キイイー！うるさい べんじょバエだよ！し んで じごくへい け！！	Ayaaaaeee! I think it's a dung beetle! I'll smash your guts out!	n.3	Modulation	no
4	Before checkpoint	ああくるしい。しにそ うだ…うううう	Listen to my final words...	n.4	Adaptation	yes

	1. Town of Onett.					
5	Before checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.	けつとばして かみついて ツバをひっかけて おしっこちびらせて・・・	heads off, spit in their eyes, and made them wet their pants.	n.3	Modulation	no
6	Before checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.	ぜったい こんどは じごくがためを キメてやるさ。	Next time, I'll take you out with my nuclear suplex attack!	n.7	Modulation	yes
7	After checkpoint 1. Town of Onett.	だめです！ うままれてくるこどもは…オニのこなんです！	No, no! We can't! This baby is a demon child!	n.7	Modulation	no
8	After checkpoint 1. Town of Twoson.	もうころされてるかもしれないねえな。はやくいってやれ。	You know, she might be gone already. You'd better hurry.	n.3	Modulation	yes
9	After checkpoint 1. Town of Twoson.	あのこには カミサマがついている。	She has a guardian angel , it seems.	n.7	Modulation	no
10	After checkpoint 1. Happy Happy Village.	カーペンターさまはあるひ とつぜん かみさまの けいじをうけたのよ。	One day, Mr. Carpenter received a revelation. He now speaks the real truth.	n.7	Adaptation	yes

11	After checkpoint 1. Happy Happy Village.	カーペインターさまは いろんなかみさまとこ うしんできるんだぜ。 そいでもってお告げを くださるんだ。	Mr.Carpainter communicates with the divine , so he is able to deliver inspired messages.	n.7	Modulation	yes
12	After checkpoint 1. Happy Happy Village.	すべてのしょうひん、 おいのりずみ ブルー ブルーショップ	All of our products are blessed. --Blue-Blue Drugstore	n.9	Modulation	no
13	After checkpoint 1. Happy Happy Village.	あんたみたいな こど もは カミナリにうた れて しんでしまえば いいわ。	You have a lot of nerve! You deserve to be struck by lightning.	n.3	Modulation/Omission	yes
14	After checkpoint 1. Happy Happy Village.	しね！しんでこのゲー ムをここでおわりにし てくれ！ここで終わり にしてくれ！	Defy me, and I'll end your pitiful game!	n.3	Adaptation	yes
15	After checkpoint 1. Happy Happy Village.	しんじないものはすく われぬ！じごくにおち ろ！	Those who aren't believers must not be good ! To eternity with you!	n.7	Modulation	yes

16	After checkpoint 1. Happy Happy Village.	ふくめんしてない あやしいやつ！てんごくにいくな！	You strange, unmasked fellow. Don't go to heaven!	n.7	Literal translation	no
17	After checkpoint 1. Happy Happy Village.	…わたしもちょっとくらいならアブナイちよりのうりよくをつかえるのよ。	I'm able to use a little psychic power that is actually pretty deadly...	n.3	Modulation	no
18	After checkpoint 2. Happy Happy Village.	おれたち、かみさまじゃなくてあくまのおつげをきいていたのかもしれない…。	We might have been listening to evil messages rather than good.	n.7	Modulation/Omission	yes
19	After checkpoint 2. Town of Twoson.	パパとおふろにはいるか？ワハハハハハ！	How about we share a piece of pie like we used to? Ha ha ha!	n.1	Adaptation	yes
20	After checkpoint 2. Town of Twoson.	ポーラちゃん、ゆうかいはんにんのキンタマをけりりあげたんだってね。	I heard that you, Paula, beat up the kidnapper.	n.8	Adaptation	yes
21	After checkpoint 2. Town of Twoson.	プレイボーイのきみに、おれたちからのプレゼントだ。	Then you deserve a present, playboy.	n.1	Literal translation	no

22	After checkpoint 2. Town of Twoson.	こんなチビスケのおかげでじごくからてんごくだ。	This little nipper took us from a nightmare to a dream...	n.7	Modulation	yes
23	After checkpoint 2. Snow Wood Boarding House.	みつかったらしりたたきだよ。	If you get caught, you'll get punished big time...	n.5	Adaptation	yes
24	After checkpoint 2. Town of Threed	わたしはおにとかあくまとかよばれたことさえあるおとこ。	People used to call me evil,	n.7	Modulation	yes
25	After checkpoint 2. Town of Threed	もうしんでもいい…って、あ、おれしんでるんだっけ…ほんとは。	I don't care if I pass away... Ha ! I'm dead already !	n.4	Literal translation	no
26	After checkpoint 2. Town of Threed	むりににげようとするとかからだバラバラになっちゃうんだ…ゾンビだから	If I try to get away, my body will just fall apart. It's because I'm a zombie...	n.3	Literal translation	no
27	After checkpoint 2. Town of Threed	しんでもうらむぞ！	I'll blame you after my " death. "	n.4	Adaptation	no
28	After checkpoint	ゾンビのてき！オニ！ アクマ！	You're the enemy of all zombies! You Monster!	n.7	Modulation/Omission	yes

	2. Town of Threed					
29	After checkpoint 2. Town of Threed	せめてしぬまえに 「はえみつ」をなめ させてほしかったな あ。	You have defeated me... Allow me to eat some Fly Honey for the last time...	n.4	Modulation	yes
30	After checkpoint 2. Secret Base	ゲハゲハゲハゲハ、わ らわせるなあ。こんな くそつたれを…	Heeg ! Heeg ! Heeg ! You make me laugh so hard...	n.8	Modulation/Omission	yes
31	After checkpoint 2. Secret Base	ギーグさまがすこしで もおそれているとした ら…せのなか、おにも あくまもないものか…	If Master Giygas is scared of someone...he would have to be worse than the greatest evil..	n.7	Modulation/Omission	yes
32	After checkpoint 2. Saturn Valley	きみたちにいつも幸運 の 女神 がほほえみかけ てくれるように…。	I wish you luck..	n.7	Adaptation	yes
33	After checkpoint 3. Dusty Dunes Desert	じゅうたいのケツへヨ ーコソ！	Welcome to the very end of the world's longest traffic jam!	n.8	Adaptation	yes

34	After checkpoint 3. Dusty Dunes Desert	タライ・ジャブさまはただいまだんじきとむげんのぎょうときんしゅきんえんをなさっておられる。	Talah Rama is now fasting and practicing silent meditation, he is also abstaining from anything that would make him sick or smelly too.	n.9	Modulation	yes
35	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	あくまととりひきしていまのけんりよくをゆずりうけたとか…ね。	I heard he made a deal with a pure evil entity in exchange for power...	n.7	Modulation	yes
36	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	あいつらはあくまだ。	They are evil incarnate .	n.7	Modulation	yes
37	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	おれはよっばらっちゃ、ヒック、いねえよ！	Just leave me here to cry into my cappucino!	n.9	Adaptation	yes
38	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	よっばらってたもんで、トイレとまちがえてかべをノックしたんだよ。	I was in the middle of a caffeine buzz, and I had to get to the bathroom fast!	n.9	Adaptation	yes
39	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	あんたらこどもなんだからさけのめないだろ。	Kids shouldn't be drinking espresso!	n.9	Adaptation	yes

40	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	ガッデム！そりゃあな いぜ、あんちゃん！	Mod-boy jerk! You can't do me like that	n.8	Modulation	yes
41	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	そこのへいにはりつい てるヤツ…のぞきおと こかもしれないわね。	The boy stuck in the wall...may be a peeping Tom.	n.1	Literal translation	no
42	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	うしろにくっついてヒ ップをじろじろみない でね。	Quit staring at my hips... why don't you stand somewhere else instead of behind me?	n.1	Adaptation	no
43	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	あやしいやつとまちが って…マシンガンでう ちころされてしまうこ とだってあるからね。	Someone might be suspicious of you and take a pot shot at you with a machine gun...	n.3	Modulation/Omission	no
44	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	うたってころして！！ だきしめたい！ビーナ ス！！	Venus! Just sing, and I can die a happy man!... Baby!!	n.4	Adaptation	no
45	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	しんでじごくへ…い や、てんごくへいけ！	You will be gone, and you'll be burning in...Well, you'll go to heaven!	n.7	Modulation/Omission	no
46	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	ひとがたおれているん だけど、しんでるのか なあ。	There's a person lying on the ground. I wonder if he's...he's...	n.4	Modulation	yes

47	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	やあねえ、こんなところでしんでるなんて。	Oooo...I don't like seeing a corpse around here.	n.4	Adaptation	no
48	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	…では、しぬまえにいつく。	... Before I go , here's my last haiku poem:	n.4	Modulation	yes
49	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	あのおとこ、しんじゃうのかしらね。	Is that man going to...to...?	n.4	Adaptation	yes
50	After checkpoint 3. City of Fourside	しんでるわけじゃなかったんだなあ。…でも、しにそうだったな。	He's not dead ...I thought he may have passed on .	n.4	Modulation	yes